

THE DEVELOPMENT  
OF A SET OF CRITERIA FOR  
THE EVALUATION OF HIGH SCHOOL  
CHORAL PROGRAMMES

BY

ETHEL JOHNSTON

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY  
OF GRADUATE STUDIES OF THE UNIVERSITY  
OF MANITOBA IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT  
OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF  
MASTER OF EDUCATION

OCTOBER 1986



FACULTY OF EDUCATION

UNIVERSITY OF MANITOBA

Permission has been granted to the National Library of Canada to microfilm this thesis and to lend or sell copies of the film.

The author (copyright owner) has reserved other publication rights, and neither the thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her written permission.

L'autorisation a été accordée à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de microfilmer cette thèse et de prêter ou de vendre des exemplaires du film.

L'auteur (titulaire du droit d'auteur) se réserve les autres droits de publication; ni la thèse ni de longs extraits de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation écrite.

ISBN 0-315-37203-6

**THE DEVELOPMENT OF A SET OF CRITERIA FOR THE  
EVALUATION OF HIGH SCHOOL CHORAL PROGRAMMES**

**BY**

**ETHEL JOHNSTON**

**A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies of  
the University of Manitoba in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
of the degree of**

**MASTER OF EDUCATION**

**© 1987**

**Permission has been granted to the LIBRARY OF THE UNIVER-  
SITY OF MANITOBA to lend or sell copies of this thesis, to  
the NATIONAL LIBRARY OF CANADA to microfilm this  
thesis and to lend or sell copies of the film, and UNIVERSITY  
MICROFILMS to publish an abstract of this thesis.**

**The author reserves other publication rights, and neither the  
thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or other-  
wise reproduced without the author's written permission.**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	iii
List of Tables	iv
CHAPTER	
1. Introduction	1
Statement of Purpose	10
Theoretical Assumptions	11
Statement of Limitations	11
Statement of Delimitations	12
Definitions	12
2. Review of the Literature	14
Summary	28
3. Research Procedures and Methodology	31
4. Results and Interpretations	36
Rating of Criteria	37
Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design	37
Instructional Objectives	47
Choral Skills (Expressive)	49
Choral Skills (Technical)	49
Theory/Aural Skills	52
History	54
General Information	54
School Size and Programme Enrollment	54
Class Size	57
Time Allotment	59
Public Performances	60
Choral Groups	60
Summary	65
5. Conclusions and Implications	67
Criteria for the Evaluation of High School Choral Programs	70
Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design	71
Evaluation	73
Programme Success	73
Programme Content	74
Instructional Objectives	74
Choral Skills (Expressive)	74
Choral Skills (Technical)	75
Theory/Aural Skills	76
History	76
Recommendations for Further Research	78
Summation	79

Bibliography		81
Appendix A	The Jury	89
Appendix B	The Teachers	90
Appendix C	Letter to the Jury	91
Appendix D	The Jury's Questionnaire and Responses	92
Appendix E	Letters to the Teachers	99
Appendix F	The Teachers' Questionnaire and Responses	101

**ABSTRACT**

The purpose of this study was to develop a set of criteria for the evaluation of high school choral programmes.

Two main areas were addressed--philosophical considerations and programme design and instructional objectives. Criteria were based on an aesthetic philosophy formulated from the professional literature. Instructional objectives were derived from those listed in the existing Manitoba Curriculum Guide.

A questionnaire, based on these proposed criteria, was sent to five experts in the field of choral music education. Their responses served as a means of validating the criteria, based on a rating index score assigned to each--where 1 was considered to be "very important" and 4 was "of no importance." Criteria that received a rating of 2.6 or higher were eliminated from a second questionnaire sent to high school choral directors. Data received was presented in table form and was listed in rank order as a valid set of criteria for evaluation of high school choral programmes.

The use of this evaluative tool could be useful to high school choral directors and to school divisions. Additional information gathered by this study provided a clearer picture of high school choral programmes in Manitoba, including the relationship between actual and optimum

conditions. Comparisons and conclusions were drawn from responses given by the experts and the teachers, which led to conclusions and implications for teacher training.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The writer wishes to thank Dr. Larry Patterson for his assistance in the development of this study and for his valuable suggestions concerning procedure and analysis. Comments offered by Dr. Colin Walley and Professor Henry Engbrecht provided further focus for this study.

The writer also wishes to acknowledge the contribution of the Curriculum Development Branch of the Department of Education and the Manitoba Choral Association in locating the choral directors.

Special thanks go to Brenda Silver and Gabi Vamos for their moral support during the writing of this thesis.

The writer is especially grateful to her husband, Barry, for his encouragement, optimism and support.



## LIST OF TABLES

1. The Jury - Section B Responses
2. The Teachers - Section B Responses
3. Range of Rating Index Scores
4. Comparison of Section B Responses
5. Ranking of Programme Components
6. Choral Skills (Expressive)
  - a. The Jury
  - b. The Teachers
7. Choral Skills (Technical)
  - a. The Jury
  - b. The Teachers
8. Theory/Aural Skills
  - a. The Jury
  - b. The Teachers
9. History
  - a. The Jury
  - b. The Teachers
10. School Size and Enrollment in Choral Option
11. Number of Students Reported in Choral Option by Grade
12. Class Size - Actual and Optimum
13. Time Allotment - Actual and Optimum
14. Time Allotment - Comparison of Responses - Actual -  
Optimum
15. Public Performances - Actual and Optimum
16. Public Performances - Comparison of Responses - Actual  
- Optimum
17. Types of Choral Groups with Numbers of Participants
18. Choral Groups - Summary

## CHAPTER 1

## INTRODUCTION

Music has been a part of school activities since the early years of the nineteenth century. In England, the introduction of singing into the schools was seen as a means "to bring light and joy into . . . the rather serious, and dreary existence of nineteenth century Board School children."<sup>1</sup> In Manitoba, early evidence exists for inclusion of music in school activities. In the City of Winnipeg, as early as 1890, "the teaching of singing was introduced as a regular and obligatory part of the daily programme,"<sup>2</sup> according to an account cited at length by Glinz.

In 1932, the work of Miss Day had made itself felt throughout the schools, so that . . . it was found possible to give a public demonstration . . . in which some 500 children took part. The Free Press report commented favorably on the fact that the children are learning to read music, and praised the volume and sweetness of tone.<sup>3</sup>

The presence of music in schools outside Winnipeg varied greatly. According to Inspector A. L. Young's report to the Minister of Education for the South East Inspectoral Division in 1897, "vocal music is being much more generally

---

<sup>1</sup>Arnold Bentley, Music in Education: A Point of View (Windsor, England: NFER Publishing Co. Ltd., 1975), p. 10.

<sup>2</sup>Leslie Albert Glinz, The Development of Public Secondary Education in Manitoba (Doctoral Thesis, Leland Stanford Junior University, 1931), p. 230.

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., p. 230.

taught than formally, and with satisfactory results."<sup>4</sup> In the South West Inspectoral Division, H. S. MacLean reported that in about fifty percent of the schools, music and drawing were neglected or "presented in an unsatisfactory manner."<sup>5</sup>

It is not the purpose of this study to examine the history of music education in Manitoba, suffice to say that by 1929, music was included as a required subject in the high schools in Manitoba.<sup>6</sup> "The Music Syllabus for Grade IX, X, and XI, in particular, affords a valuable contribution to a liberal education."<sup>7</sup> Through the good work of such notable music educators as Ethel Kinley and Lola MacQuarrie, the music programme, a choral tradition, flourished in Manitoba.<sup>8</sup> In his report to the Minister of Education, J. A. Pincock said, "the standard of music in the Winnipeg schools is very high."<sup>9</sup>

Since the earliest days of the choral programme, the

---

<sup>4</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Annual Report 1897 (Winnipeg: Queen's Printer), p. 36.

<sup>5</sup>Ibid., p. 45.

<sup>6</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Programme of Studies (1929-30), pp. 37-75.

<sup>7</sup>Glinz, op. cit., p. 277.

<sup>8</sup>Ann Elizabeth Koop, The History of the Manitoba Music Educators Association (Master of Music Thesis, University of Western Ontario, 1983), pp. 11-12.

<sup>9</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Annual Report 1943-44, p. 70.

emphasis has not been only on performance. School inspectors encouraged the development of music appreciation, although this was not always realized.<sup>10</sup> J. A. Pincock in 1943-44 wrote that he hoped more teachers would enter groups into the Music Festival to reduce competition among the groups who always entered. "Enjoyment of music must always be preferred to excellence in performance. A high degree of both is the goal."<sup>11</sup> Evidence in Department of Education Annual reports indicates a growing commitment to the development of a choral music tradition based on principles which would encourage development of music literacy and comprehensive musicianship during the 1950s and 1960s.<sup>12</sup>

Forty years have gone by since these early reports and the high school choral programme continues to be included in the school curricula. As John Mann says, "the curriculum is a symbolic commentary upon life,"<sup>13</sup> that is, what we value or consider to be important in society, we include in the curriculum. Music and the other expressive arts are important in culture due to man's uniqueness in the world. The human ability for abstract thought and the desire for

---

<sup>10</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Annual Report 1930-31, p. 16.

<sup>11</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Annual Report 1943-44, p. 70.

<sup>12</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Annual Reports.

<sup>13</sup>John Mann, "Curriculum Criticism," Teacher's College Record 71(1) (September 1969):28.

more than mere existence, has led to the awareness of various modes of thought and the discovery of the sciences, mathematics and the arts. "Art is the . . . spearhead of human development, social and individual,"<sup>14</sup> as can be seen through the importance ascribed to it in the history of man. Art is characteristic of the human race and is actively pursued for its own sake. The creation and contemplation of works of art are kinds of play in which man can be free and fully human. Susanne Langer believes that the arts are necessary because of their relationship to human feelings. The dynamic nature of feelings and their infinite range of combinations and permutations find formal expression through the arts. Aspin concurs and applies this to music. "The world of organized sound and our entrance into it is one of the fundamental bases of any autonomy in the world."<sup>16</sup>

Our ability to understand and fully appreciate the expressive quality of music must, however, come from without--through our educational system. Experts agree that the way to develop man's capacity for expression in and

---

<sup>14</sup>Susanne Langer, "The Cultural Importance of the Arts," in Aesthetics and Problems of Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, n.d.), p. 86.

<sup>15</sup>Ibid., p. 90.

<sup>16</sup>David N. Aspin, "The Place of Music in the Curriculum: A Justification," Journal of Aesthetic Education 16(1) (Spring 1982):49.

sensitivity to the arts is through aesthetic education.<sup>17</sup>  
 "The primary purpose of the music education program is to develop the aesthetic potential, possessed by human beings to its highest possible level."<sup>18</sup>

In recent years, a growing number of music educators have focused their efforts towards the improvement of music programmes. In elementary schools throughout the Province of Manitoba, evidence of innovation can be seen through inclusion of methodologies such as Orff and Kodaly in the curriculum. While these techniques, whose emphasis is on the development of musicianship may not provide the final solution to educational problems in music education, at least there has been an effort to examine the music curriculum at this level.

In 1983, the Province of Manitoba performed a curriculum assessment of the music program by administering tests to students in Grade 5, the results to be used by "classroom teachers in forming judgments about the instructional program."<sup>19</sup> An ERIC computer search has

---

<sup>17</sup>Gerard Knieter, "The Nature of Aesthetic Education," in MENC and CEMRL, Toward an Aesthetic Education (Music Educator's National Conference and Central Midwestern Regional Laboratory, Inc., 1971), p. 7.

<sup>18</sup>Charles Leonhard and Robert W. House, Foundations and Principles of Music Education (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1971), p. 3.

<sup>19</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Curriculum Development and Implementation Branch, Manitoba Music Assessment Program, 1983, Preliminary Report: Test Data (December 1983), p. 3.

revealed a substantial number of curriculum assessments based on psychometric testing. In recent years, this traditional approach to evaluation of curriculum has given way to serious questioning about its ability to reveal program effectiveness. Stufflebeam and Webster have suggested that the tests reinforce socio-economic levels, not teaching and learning and are poor indicators of what teachers teach.<sup>20</sup>

A number of educational scholars feel there has been too much emphasis on the testing or scientific approach to educational program evaluation. As Stenhouse puts it, "the product testing model deploys educational scholarship and research procedures to criticize his product and assess its merit."<sup>21</sup> This objectives model assessment does little to explain programs, "yields data about gross total program effects,"<sup>22</sup> and "is not adequate to assist educators in the initial planning and in the actual carrying through of

---

<sup>20</sup>Daniel L. Stufflebeam and William J. Webster, "An Analysis of Alternative Approaches to Evaluation," in Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation (Boston: Klierer-Nighoff Publishing, 1983), p. 30.

<sup>21</sup>Lawrence Stenhouse, An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development, an Open University Set Book (London: Heinemann, n.d.), p. 120.

<sup>22</sup>Lee Cronbach, "Course Improvement through Evaluation," in Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation, ed. George F. Madeus, Michael S. Scriven and Daniel L. Stufflebeam (Boston: Klierer-Nighoff Publishing, 1983), p. 105.

programs."<sup>23</sup> This is particularly true in the area of arts. As Rob Morrison points out, "experience has shown us that the measurement of education achievement is more reliable in areas such as mathematics and the physical sciences than in art."<sup>24</sup> The Manitoba Assessment Committee also recognizes this point. In Conclusion number 21 of the Final Report they state,

Some of the most fundamental objectives of the musical or aesthetic education are the least amenable to measurement. This observation in no way diminishes the significance of those aspects of music learning which have been assessed here, but the ultimate goals of the musical education will always elude formal assessment; the enhancement of perceptual sensitivity to expressive beauty; the stimulation of the creating imagination; the development and refinement of human values.<sup>25</sup>

Hylton does not agree that these ultimate objectives of music education cannot be measured. Perhaps, he suggests, a different kind of evaluation would perform this function. His study of students revealed a number of underlying dimensions which he felt could be useful in programme planning. His belief that, in order for students to attain true learning, they must know why they are doing a task leads him to the conclusion that "the recent emphasis in

---

<sup>23</sup>Ibid., p. 105.

<sup>24</sup>Rob Morrison, "Measurement in Education," in Values and Evaluation in Education, ed. Roger Straughan and Jack Wrigley (London: Harper & Row, n.d.), p. 28.

<sup>25</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Curriculum Development and Implementation Branch, Manitoba Music Assessment Program, 1983), Final Report, p. 25.



the professional literature of music education on the power of music to enhance students' affective development is well-founded."<sup>26</sup>

Arthur Bromley, in his doctoral dissertation, developed an evaluative checklist to determine the extent that curricular objectives in music education were being achieved. His survey sample included music teachers from elementary, junior and senior high schools. The survey itself concentrated on what the teachers were actually doing in the classroom. When results were tallied and compared to those conclusions drawn by the State Music Inspector, the findings showed a close correlation between what the teachers reported and what the inspector found for the elementary and junior high programmes. This did not hold true for the senior high sample. He attributed this to the fact that "secondary school teachers were generally performance-oriented and often less able to respond to categories outside of performance."<sup>27</sup> An examination of the survey distributed, reveals a high concentration on the development of musical literacy through study of musical elements. It appears that secondary teachers could not

---

<sup>26</sup>John Hylton, "Dimensionality in High School Students Participants' Perceptions of the Meaning of Choral Singing Experience," Journal of Research in Music Education 29(4) (Winter 1981):302.

<sup>27</sup>Arthur Barry Bromley, The Development and Testing of Evaluative Checklists for Determining the Degree of Attainment of Objectives in Music Education (Doctor of Musical Arts Thesis, University of Oregon, June 1972), p. 96.

identify with the breakdown used in the survey, although in reality, they may be accomplishing this kind of teaching in their rehearsals. Bromley's recommendations for future research included the development of a different kind of checklist to evaluate high school performance-oriented programmes.

The writer believes that music education should be aesthetic education. Evaluations must therefore encompass "the fundamental ability of music programs to facilitate progressive, qualitative and man-music interactions leading to personal caring and social sharing."<sup>28</sup> There is a need for systematic evaluation of music programs.

The function of arts education and the aesthetic needs of our students have been defined in the basic goal statements of education in Manitoba. Yet, present curriculum practises and instrumental systems designed for arts education in our province are evidence that we are not always achieving this goal.<sup>29</sup>

Although there is a strong commitment on the part of the Department of Education and educational scholars to an aesthetic music education, there remains a gap between reality and theory.

---

<sup>28</sup>Malcolm Tait and Paul Haack, Principles and Process of Music Education: New Perspectives (New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University, 1983), p. 171.

<sup>29</sup>Francine Lee Morin, Aesthetic Education: A Curriculum Model and Curriculum Plan for Arts Programming in Manitoba Schools (Masters of Education Thesis, University of Manitoba, November 1983), pp. 14-15.

## STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

In 1983, a new senior high music curriculum was introduced, reflecting a "balance between performance and other areas of music."<sup>30</sup> "The guide incorporates activities designed to increase students' knowledge and understanding of a wider, more varied repertoire, and also develops aspects of a practical musicianship which are essential to a sensitive, music performance."<sup>31</sup> There are four components to the high school curriculum-choral, band, guitar and orchestra. The focus of this study will be on the choral component. The purpose of this study is to develop a set of criteria for evaluating high school choral programmes, which could be useful to high school choral directors in evaluating their own programmes. Stenhouse believes that there is a need for "a research tradition which is accessible to teachers and which feeds teaching . . . if education is to be significantly improved."<sup>32</sup> The music programme, in order to be considered basic to education must be able to undergo evaluation on a basis much more comprehensive than one of performance rating or number of enrollees."<sup>33</sup> Richard Colwell concurs. "Failure to show

---

<sup>30</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Music 105, 205, 305 (Choral) Interim Guide, p. 3.

<sup>31</sup>Ibid., p. 7.

<sup>32</sup>Stenhouse, op. cit., p. 165.

<sup>33</sup>Tait, op. cit., p. 171.

evaluation as an integrated on-going part of the teaching-learning process has resulted in inferior research as well as in a complacency born of ignorance."<sup>34</sup>

#### THEORETICAL ASSUMPTIONS

This study assumes that music has an important role in society, as a basic indicator of human development. It also assumes that the educational system provides the means for teaching about music and its expressive qualities and that the choral music option is a legitimate vehicle for this purpose. As music education is a process, one involving teaching and learning, it is assumed that programme evaluation would serve as a means of ensuring curricular goals are achieved.

#### STATEMENT OF LIMITATIONS

Distance and financial constraints indicated a survey questionnaire to be the most practical way of gathering data.

The number of choral teachers, that is, those currently involved in the Credit Choral option, also proved to be a limiting factor. Greater validity would exist if a larger sample were available.

Time proved to be a major constraint in this study as the final survey to high school teachers was sent May 29th and classes were only scheduled until the end of June. Follow-up phone calls were made and letters sent only two

---

<sup>34</sup>Richard Colwell, The Evaluation of Music Teaching and Learning (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1981), p. 21.

weeks following the original mailing.

#### STATEMENT OF DELIMITATIONS

As information was gathered from only those high school teachers involved in the Choral option, course numbers 105, 205, 305, as designated by the Manitoba Department of Education, a substantial number of choral directors, that is, those with extracurricular choirs only, were not eligible to respond. The most current list of high school choral directors available from the Department of Education was from 1983/84, therefore, certain directors may have been missed.

Although this study is based on an aesthetic philosophy, the literature review reflects only aesthetics as it applies to education. In Manitoba, no studies exist which reflect the kinds of programmes which are in existence.

#### DEFINITIONS

Music programme refers to those classes which are regularly scheduled courses in the curriculum, for which students receive credit on their transcripts.

Curriculum is defined as the programme of study for which students receive credit on their transcripts.

Choral option or choral programme is used interchangeably and refers to that component of the high school curriculum designated as course number 105, 205, or 305 by the Manitoba Department of Education.

Aesthetics is that branch of philosophy which is concerned with the perception and reaction to the beautiful, especially in the arts.

Aesthetic education is the process for developing students' aesthetic potential, through the attainment of skills enabling them to conceptualize, analyze and judge the expressive qualities of the art object.

Expressive or aesthetic qualities are the basic elements from which art is formed and used in expressive ways.

Art objects are objects which possess aesthetic qualities.

Performance refers to public performance.

## CHAPTER 2

## REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Several aspects of the literature were examined. An aesthetic philosophy as it applies to music education was discussed briefly as a means of putting this study into perspective. The tenets of aesthetic education were applied in operational terms to music education, and specifically, to choral music education.

Professing a philosophy, marks the end of a search for truth and a new beginning. The literature indicated that having a philosophy of education provided teachers with the sense of direction necessary to deal with the problems of educating the masses, both as individuals and as members of a professional group. Charles Leonhard stated that a philosophy of music education was a "system of basic beliefs which underlies and provides a basis for the operation of the music enterprise in an educational setting."<sup>35</sup> These basic beliefs provided clues to problem-solving and decision-making, that is, what to teach and how to teach it. Bennett Reimer believed that, "it is largely because no synthetic view of the art of music has permeated the teaching of music that so much random ineffective unconvincing activity has taken place."<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup>Charles Leonhard, op. cit., p. 83.

<sup>36</sup>Bennett Reimer, "Building Curricula for Music Education," in Aesthetics and Problems of Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 380.

Various educational philosophies existed and were reflected through teaching methods employed in music classes. For example, school programmes reflected referentialism, the belief that the worth of music was extra-musical or non-aesthetic. Plato was a referentialist who was concerned with the impact of certain music on society.

Now when a man abandons himself to music to play upon him and pour into his soul . . . the first result is that the principle of high spirit . . . is softened like iron and is made useful . . . But when he continues the practise without remission . . . the effect begins to be that he melts and liquefies till he completely dissolves away his spirit . . . and makes of himself a 'feeble warrior'.<sup>37</sup>

In schools, this was illustrated when students were assigned picture-drawing and paragraph-writing as a means of describing music. This type of activity "insures that attention to the sound itself will be at a very gross level."<sup>38</sup> Another form of referentialism occurred when music programmes were justified on a non-musical or non-aesthetic basis, such as the importance of music for a democratic society or good health.

At the opposite end of the philosophical spectrum was

---

<sup>37</sup>Oliver Strunk, Antiquity and the Middle Ages. Source Readings in Music History (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, n.d.), pp. 11-12.

<sup>38</sup>Bennett Reimer, A Philosophy of Music Education, Contemporary Perspectives in Music Education Series, ed. Charles Leonhard (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1970), p. 54.



formalism, the belief that art was only an intellectual experience. In music teaching, this took the form of emphasis on analysis purely for analysis' sake, in other words, pure theory. This was also evident when only the talented students were taught in a serious and coherent fashion, while the masses were provided with a superficial music education.

The view proposed in this study could best be described as absolute expressionism, that is, "the meaning and value of art are to be found in the aesthetic qualities of art works."<sup>39</sup> Other terminology has been utilized in the literature to describe this philosophy and its relationship to music education, such as education for comprehensive musicianship or aesthetic education. For the purposes of this study, aesthetic education will be used to describe the writer's educational rationale. Aesthetic education is consistent with the overall aim of education, which is to improve the quality of consciousness. It offers "examples of better, richer, more worthwhile forms of experience in the hope that persons will come genuinely to prefer what they have come to know as being better."<sup>40</sup> As John Dewey wrote, "they (the arts) are not luxuries of education, but emphatic expressions of that which makes education

---

<sup>39</sup>Ibid., p. 24.

<sup>40</sup>R. A. Smith and C. M. Smith, "Justifying Aesthetic Education," in Aesthetics and Problems of Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 143.

worthwhile."<sup>41</sup>

Arnstine saw aesthetic education as a means of ensuring true learning occurred. In many schools this change, or learning or knowing persisted only for a short period of time, for example, only long enough to pass a test. True learning, according to Arnstine, should affect students' future actions through "the acquisition of a new disposition."<sup>42</sup> Music, as aesthetic education, is a means of personal enrichment and a way of passing on aesthetic values which "will form part of their (students) preferred life options."<sup>43</sup> In other words, the overall aim of music education as aesthetic education should be to develop a love for the best in music through intelligent appreciation. In this sense, appreciation should be considered an active verb.

Aesthetic education could be approached through three avenues--creation, performance, and response. The literature indicated that these areas were handled fairly well in the kindergarten and elementary levels, however "aesthetic activity for most people is arrested at the

---

<sup>41</sup>John Dewey, Democracy and Education (New York: Mac-Millan Co., 1916), p.

<sup>42</sup>Donald Arnstine, "Aesthetic Qualities in Experience and Learning," in Aesthetic Concepts and Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970), pp. 27-28.

<sup>43</sup>David N. Aspin, "The Place of Music in the Curriculum: A Justification," Journal of Aesthetic Education 16(1) (Spring 1982):51.

intellectual and emotional level of adolescence."<sup>44</sup> Bessom concurred. "Too often, music in the later phase of secondary education emphasizes the acquisition of performance skills to the exclusion of all else."<sup>45</sup> The writer believes that aesthetic education is an important means of educating future music consumers, as only a small percentage of high school students choose a musical career. This emphasis on skill development to the exclusion of all else is irresponsible.

The major function of art is to make objective, and therefore conceivable, the subjective realm of human responsiveness. Art does this by capturing and presenting in its aesthetic qualities the patterns and forms of human feelingfulness. The major function of aesthetic education is to make accessible, the insights into human feelingfulness contained in the aesthetic qualities of things.<sup>46</sup>

One might ask what the above statements implied in operational terms. How do teachers plan programmes to ensure students receive an aesthetic education. The answer lies in the nature of the experience involved. The literature stated the characteristics of aesthetic experiences. An aesthetic experience is a human experience

---

<sup>44</sup>Harry S. Broudy, "Some Duties of a Theory of Educational Aesthetics," in Aesthetics and Problems of Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 110.

<sup>45</sup>Malcom E. Bessom, Alphonse M. Tatrunic, and Samuel L. Forcucci, Teaching Music in Today's Secondary Schools: A Creative Approach to Contemporary Music Education (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1980), p. 59.

<sup>46</sup>Reimer, op. cit., p 39.

involving perception, response, values, feelings, invention, articulation, creation, integration and synthesis to name only a few of the processes. An aesthetic experience is a process, a sharing between the artist and the perceiver through the medium of the art object. "It is precisely in this sharing of insight into the common nature of humanity that art exercises its humanistic effects."<sup>47</sup> An aesthetic experience occurs "when resistance, tension, excitement, and emotion are transformed into a movement towards fulfillment and completion,"<sup>48</sup> and "leaves us with the freedom and responsibility needed for the creation of a differentiated but integrated society."<sup>49</sup>

Being aware of the characteristics of aesthetic experiences provided an important link between the theoretical and the practical in operational terms. An aesthetic experience has intrinsic value. It is an end in itself and is valued for the enjoyment and insight it brings.<sup>50</sup> An aesthetic experience involves focus on the aesthetic object through perception or as Broudy calls it, through knowing. In order for perception to occur the sensa

---

<sup>47</sup>Ibid., p. 50.

<sup>48</sup>Charles Leonhard, op. cit., p. 93.

<sup>49</sup>Joseph Kupfer, "Aesthetic Experience and Moral Education," Journal of Aesthetic Education 12(3) (July 1978):13.

<sup>50</sup>Harold F Abeles, Charles Hoffer, and Robert H. Klotman, Foundations of Music Education (London: Collier Macmillan Publishers, 1984), p. 62.

must be in some Gestalt or pattern, that is, the aesthetic object must display certain formal and sensory properties.<sup>51</sup> These properties are then "transmuted by a person into an event in his own life world."<sup>52</sup> Deeper perception is achieved through conscious thought and became a creative process in itself. Hence, an aesthetic experience also involves an awareness of affect or impact on the senses. Such terms as tension, release, beauty, wit, value and others describe affect. When focused on an aesthetic object we try to discover how it makes us feel. "The quality of musical experience is dependent upon the nature of the linkage that develops between the perception of the musical phenomena and the human response to that phenomena."<sup>53</sup>

Critics of aesthetic education said it could not effectively be implemented in schools because of its ethereal nature. Feelings could not be taught and certainly could not be tested. Michael Polanyi's theory of tacit knowing responded to this criticism. In order for students to develop aesthetically certain basic knowledge must be learned. For example, when listening to a piece of music,

---

<sup>51</sup>Harry S. Broudy, "The Structure of Knowledge in the Arts," in Aesthetics and Criticism in Art Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 27.

<sup>52</sup>Maxine Greene, "Teaching for Aesthetic Experience," in MENC and CEMRL, Toward an Aesthetic Education, p. 24.

<sup>53</sup>Tait, op. cit., p. 150.

one could only be aware of its expressive or aesthetic qualities if one had tacit knowledge of musical elements and style. To use Polanyi's terminology, our focal awareness of the aesthetic qualities was based on our tacit knowledge of its subsidiaries or elements. Knowing, then, is "an integrating process whereby items of experience become clues"<sup>54</sup> to understanding.

We were aware of the functional relationship of the subsidiaries to the focus, that is, of the relationship of musical elements to the piece of music. We were also aware that the focal target gave meaning to the subsidiaries.<sup>55</sup> The expressive or aesthetic qualities of a piece of music then, emerged from the integration of the musical elements, and the knowledge of the listener. This knowledge, 'indwells' the listener. Broudy defined the concept in this way. "Indwelling . . . would be the identification of ourselves with the multiplicity of meanings, isomorphisms of sense, feeling and language that are the subsidiaries by which the aesthetic object is focally perceived."<sup>56</sup> Another concept involved in tacit knowing was emergence. This occurred when "something new in kind emerges from the integration of the particulars that cannot be accounted for

---

<sup>54</sup>Harry S. Broudy, "Tacit Knowing and Aesthetic Education," in Aesthetic Concepts and Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 84.

<sup>55</sup>Ibid., p. 87.

<sup>56</sup>Ibid., p. 93.

by examining the subsidiaries alone."<sup>57</sup> This writer argues this emergence is the aesthetic experience,--it is mystical and is more than the sum of its parts. In other words, focus on the art object and perception of the interplay of elements could affect us in ways we could not describe in words.

Polanyi's theory provided justification for the inclusion of aesthetic education in the curriculum. "Even the cognitive or conceptual portion of formal music study can still effect the quality of the aesthetic experience of music if it is dwelling in and tacitly integrated into attending focally to the piece of music."<sup>58</sup> Only through awareness of the subsidiary elements could perception of aesthetic or expressive qualities be possible. Aesthetic education through music could focus on these subsidiaries or musical elements as a means of developing perception.

The choral programme could provide the proper medium for aesthetic education. Singing was one of the most important methods to teaching music as a "personalized medium of expression."<sup>59</sup> It allowed students the means to develop their own musicianship as well as the valuable experience of being able to learn and perform music "in its

---

<sup>57</sup>Sam Reese, "Polanyi's Tacit Knowing and Music Education," Journal of Aesthetic Education 14(1) (January 1980):82.

<sup>58</sup>Ibid., p. 88.

<sup>59</sup>Charles Leonhard, op. cit., p. 260.

authentic form from all periods of cultural epochs."<sup>60</sup>

All too often, however, choral programmes have functioned only as performance-programmes and have served extra musical purposes.<sup>61</sup> "The current choral program is performance-oriented and does not, in many cases, reflect a concern for developing the musical understanding of the child."<sup>62</sup> As Broudy has said, "relying exclusively on performance courses, the fact remains that for people without talent such training rapidly reaches the point of diminishing returns."<sup>63</sup> Samuel Miller suggested, "we have been amiss [that] in our high school choral class for reliance too much on stimulus-response and rote techniques in our rehearsals to the detriment of development, continuity and real learning."<sup>64</sup> School rehearsals were too often confused with the rehearsals of professional

---

<sup>60</sup>American Choral Directors Association, Guide for the Beginning Choral Director (National Committee on High School Choral music, 1972), p. 10.

<sup>61</sup>Stanley Linton, "The Development of a Planned Program for Teaching Musicianship in the High School Choral Class," Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #10 (Summer 1967):9.

<sup>62</sup>Carroll Gonzo, "Research in Choral Music: A Perspective," Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #33 (Summer 1973):30.

<sup>63</sup>Harry S. Broudy, "Enlightened Preference and Justification," in Aesthetics and Problems of Education, ed. Ralph A. Smith, p. 318.

<sup>64</sup>Samuel Miller, "Comprehensive Musicianship for Students in the High School Choral Ensemble," The Choral Journal 17(1) (September 1976):5.



organizations. Professional groups were concerned with the product of their labours; school groups must be concerned with the process or the educational benefit of the activities to the students involved. Music educators "cannot serve the goal of perfect performance in concert above all other concerns and be morally right in education."<sup>65</sup> The testing ground of the worth of a program must be the rehearsal classroom, not the concert hall. Performances should occur as an outgrowth of what is being learned in the classroom. Performance classes were an integral part of aesthetic education. Students gained many benefits by performing, ranging from the value of active learning to extra-musical advantages such as the development of poise, self-confidence and a sense of purpose.

Experts in the field have suggested certain techniques to assist teachers plan programmes for aesthetic experiences.<sup>66</sup> Careful sequencing and planning of choral activities could lead to aesthetic awareness. "Traditionally music teachers have taught performing skills and a bit of information about the music."<sup>67</sup> The chorus

---

<sup>65</sup>Meyer M. Cahn, "More than Performance: Toward Human Interaction," Music Educators Journal 5(6) (February 1969):37.

<sup>66</sup>Harold F. Abeles, Charles Hoffer, and Robert H. Klotman, Foundations of Music Education (London: Collier Macmillan Publishers, 1984),

<sup>67</sup>Charles Hoffer, Introduction to Music Education (Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth Publishing Company, 1983), p. 44.

could become a laboratory "in which students have the opportunity to analyze how composers have manipulated the materials to produce a particular composition."<sup>68</sup>

Aesthetic education involved a degree of skill training, but always in context with the repertoire being studied. "The person who cannot read music [is] deprived of active participation in any music that he has not memorized by listening to others. The musically illiterate member of a choral group has to depend on those around him."<sup>69</sup> Students must learn how to interpret notation, recognize meter, form, understand rhythm and how to interpret conductors' gestures. They must also learn how to use the vocal instrument.

Paul Haack saw a danger in too much emphasis in skill development.

It is considered entirely possible that great amounts of drill on parts and isolated technical problems without consciously pointing out the musical relationships . . . which make the music more sensible and worthwhile, may eventually bring about an intellectual inhibition to the perception of such poetic aspects of music.<sup>70</sup>

Other studies have shown that choral students score lower than students in band or orchestral programmes in

<sup>68</sup>Malcolm Bessom, op. cit., p. 57.

<sup>69</sup>Arnold Bentley, Music in Education: A Point of View (Windsor, England: NFER Publishing Co. Ltd., 1975), p. 48.

<sup>70</sup>Paul Haack, "A Study in the Development of Music Listening Skills in Secondary School Students," Journal of Research in Music Education 17(1) (Spring 1969):200.

tests to determine pitch, rhythm, and melodic recognition,<sup>71</sup> those elements of music whose recognition led to aesthetic sensitivity. Research of this nature led to the conclusion that students in choral programmes were not receiving the same kind of music education as students in these other programmes.

Critical or aesthetic thinking is developmental and involves teaching students to understand music "as a series of malleable and interpretive events."<sup>72</sup> The choral programme offered an excellent milieu for this type of learning. Through a varied programme of study, students could be exposed to the spectrum of styles, composers and their interrelationships. Students could be involved in creating, analyzing and discussing. Experimentation with interpretation and the use of student conductors would reinforce the aesthetic qualities of the music. Repertoire should always be chosen with great care. "Insidious in structure and vapid in expressiveness the musical diet of thousands upon thousands of children has led to an inevitable aesthetic malnourishment."<sup>73</sup> In operational

---

<sup>71</sup>Kevin Joseph McCarthy, Effects of Participation in School Music Performance Organizations on the Ability to Perceive Aesthetic Elements in Recorded Music (Doctor of Philosophy Thesis, Case Western Reserve University, January 1969), p. 115.

<sup>72</sup>Malcolm Tait, "Musical Experiences in the Choral Program," The Choral Journal 15(7):23.

<sup>73</sup>Bennett Reimer, op. cit., p. 133.

terms, repertoire should be selected on the basis of its genuine expressiveness and to the extent that it provided the opportunity for developmental learning experiences. Choral literature should provide good examples of what can be considered art of value.

For among the finest creations of the mind and hand of man are those pieces of music that have been seen to be of enduring value and to provide paradigms of the highest class of what counts as novel, uplifting and elevated in the world of human artistic creation and performance.<sup>74</sup>

Scholars suggested the use of a conceptual approach would lead to intellectual understanding of the expressive qualities of music. Through other activities, the qualitative features of music would be discovered. As Winking has stated, "the predisposition for which we are striving is willingness to pay attention to the music itself in order to gather internal evidence for later descriptive or evaluation statements"<sup>75</sup> Students would learn to describe patterns of sound, musical syntax and their arousal properties. This description or analysis could be likened to the process of criticism or critical evaluation and must involve the use of objective terminology. It was very important that students acquire the vocabulary needed to analyze "vital musical matters that ultimately can take use

---

<sup>74</sup>David N. Aspin, op. cit., p. 47.

<sup>75</sup>John T. Winking, "Beardsley's Aesthetics, Musical Analysis and Musical Listening," Journal of Aesthetic Education 14(1) January 1980):95.

beyond words."<sup>76</sup> Criticism involved evaluation of sensuous materials, the technique used, the formal design and the expressive qualities and the degree to which the artist/composer has achieved the desired goal. Inherent in criticism, then, was the ability to perceive theoretical and expressive concepts, to discriminate between good and bad performance and to be able to articulate criteria for evaluation.

The goal of the school music program in Manitoba is to develop a musically literate society which recognizes and values the contribution that music, as with all forms of artistic expression, makes to the development and quality of life for the individual and for society.<sup>77</sup>

Through class discussion and by providing aesthetic experiences for students the role of the arts in society and in the curriculum could be examined. The choral programme, if presented in a manner consistent with principles of aesthetic education would achieve this goal.

#### SUMMARY

Certain ideas emerged from the literature. Of importance was the inclusion of music in the school curriculum as a reflection of the role of the arts in culture. The professional literature pointed out the need

---

<sup>76</sup>Malcolm Tait and Paul Haack, Principles and Processes of Music Education: New Perspectives (New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University, 1983), p. 37.

<sup>77</sup>Manitoba Department of Education, Music 105, 205, 305 (Choral) Interim Guide, 1983, p. 4.

for teachers to develop an educational philosophy as a means of providing a sense of direction for their teaching. The view proposed in this study was an aesthetic philosophy of choral music education. It was based on the deeper belief that the function or purpose of education was to improve one's consciousness through the development of a way of thinking.

In operational terms, the development of aesthetic programming for choral options was linked to the types of experiences that were planned, and the scheduling of programmes so all students would be able to participate. Activities should be varied and developmental and should include opportunities for students to attend concerts of professional and amateur groups as well as opportunities to perform themselves, as individuals, as part of ensembles and in school music productions.

The choral class should be a laboratory where students would be exposed to a wide variety of musics. By emphasizing process instead of product, by using objective, not subjective language to critically analyze how composers utilize musical elements and by using student conductors and compositions, teachers could provide an aesthetic education for their students.

The literature also pointed to the need for a comprehensive evaluative tool, based on more than enrollment or festival ratings, in order for music to be seen as basic in education. As the purpose of this study was to develop a set of criteria for evaluating high school choral

programmes, the writer believed that it was necessary to link philosophical considerations to programme design and instructional objectives. An evaluative tool must encompass theory and practise.

## CHAPTER 3

## RESEARCH PROCEDURES AND METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this chapter is to describe the research procedures utilized in this study. The rationale for the methodology employed can be found in previous studies.

Patterson, in his doctoral dissertation formulated a set of criteria which could be used to evaluate undergraduate music education programmes in Canadian colleges and universities.<sup>78</sup> These criteria were based on the professional literature and through personal discussions with experts in the field. A rating scale was established as a means of indicating the importance of each criteria. Following initial scrutiny by five professors at the University of Illinois, the set of criteria was sent to a jury of 10 eminent music educators as a means of further validating the relative importance of each criteria. A final questionnaire, based on these results, was then sent to administrators and teachers in forty institutions. Not only were these respondents asked to rate the importance of each criteria, but they were also asked to rate their own programs according to the criteria. Results of this study indicated "a gap between the desirable attributes of a quality music education program and the present

---

<sup>78</sup>Lawrence W. A. Patterson, Undergraduate Programs for Music Teacher Preparation in Canadian Colleges and Universities (D. Ed. Thesis, University of Illinois, 1972).



programmes."<sup>79</sup>

Paulson utilized a similar methodology in his study which was concerned with evaluating senior high music programs.<sup>80</sup> His criteria or principles were developed from the literature and reviewed and rated by experts. He then evaluated music programs in sixteen schools using this validated criteria. As a means of further determining the validity of his study, two experts evaluated two of the schools at different times, using an established evaluation tool. Paulson's results were then compared with the experts' results.

Bartel<sup>81</sup> established nine dimensions of a junior high guitar program and questioned eleven "experts" as a means of determining a set of criteria for the evaluation of such a program. Those criteria, determined to be valid, were then included in a questionnaire sent to junior high guitar teachers in Manitoba. The emphasis of this study on the "identification, formulation and validation of objectives . . . would provide the criteria to evaluate that program with all the consequent benefits resulting from that

---

<sup>79</sup>Ibid., p. 169.

<sup>80</sup>Leonard Evert Paulson, Evaluation of Music Programs in Selected Secondary Schools in Nebraska (Ed. D. Music Thesis, University of Nebraska, 1963).

<sup>81</sup>Lee Roy Bartel, The Identification of Criteria for the Evaluation of Junior High School Guitar Programs (Master of Education Thesis, University of Manitoba, 1983),

evaluation."<sup>82</sup>

The research method employed in the present study is related to the above studies. Information for this study was gathered initially from the relevant professional literature. Sources included books, reports and articles by well-known authorities on the topics of music education, choral music education, aesthetic education and curriculum development. The need for a tool for programme evaluation and on-going research into music education became evident.

From the literature, common ideas about the goals of choral music education as aesthetic education began to emerge. These statements or criteria formed the first section of a questionnaire. As this study is based on the idea that choral music education should be aesthetic education, analysis of the responses in this section should reveal whether choral music educators support this view.

The second section of the survey was based on the instructional objectives listed in the Manitoba Department of Education 1983 Interim Guide (Choral).

The initial survey was then distributed to a jury of five educators with expertise in choral music on May 12, 1986 (Appendix A). The jury was asked to rate the importance of the statements to the high school choral programme. (See Appendix for questionnaire.)

A forced choice scale was utilized in the survey--1)

---

<sup>82</sup>Ibid., p. 6.

indicated the statement to be very important; 2) important; 3) of little importance; 4) of no importance. Answers were then assigned the numeric value associated with the response, totalled, then divided by the number of respondents, to establish a rating index. This data was tabulated manually due to the small sample size. As the purpose of this initial survey was to determine the validity of this set of criteria, it was decided that any criteria in the first section, with a rating index greater than 2.5, would not be included in the final survey to be sent to high school choral directors. As the second section of this initial survey was taken directly from the Curriculum Guide, it was determined that although the same scoring would be employed, all items would be included in the final survey. A comparison of responses between the jury and high school directors would be analyzed when all responses were received.

As the writer believes that teachers' experience and intimate knowledge of what happens in the classroom reveals much about the curriculum, their input into the development of meaningful criteria to evaluate choral programmes is invaluable. The final questionnaire was sent on May 29, 1986, to 35 high school choral directors, based on a list supplied by the Manitoba Department of Education Curriculum Development Branch and the Manitoba Choral Association. This survey differed from the survey sent to the jury in that there were three parts, the first set to determine what kinds of programmes existed and whether these reflected the

overall needs of the respondents. The following two sections were determined as previously discussed.

On June 17, 1986, follow-up phone calls were made to those respondents who had not yet returned their surveys. Several of those teachers were unavailable and therefore the next day were sent letters requesting returns. Of a total of 35 questionnaires sent out, 23 were returned for a response rate of 65.7%. Survey results, when analyzed should reveal what qualities choral instructors value in their programmes and will serve as a final validation of proposed criteria.

## CHAPTER 4

## RESULTS AND INTERPRETATIONS

The purpose of this study was to develop a set of criteria for the evaluation of high school choral programmes. The proposed set of criteria, based on an aesthetic philosophy of choral music education, was identified from the relevant professional literature. As the Manitoba Department of Education provides a Curriculum Guide for the high school choral option, it was decided that an assessment of the proposed instructional objectives would provide a clear picture of what choral teachers thought should be in their programmes.

These proposed criteria were set in questionnaire form and sent to a group of five experts in the field of music education as a test of validity. (See Appendix A for a list of the jurors.) On the basis of their responses, a second questionnaire was formulated and sent to 35 high school choral directors, whose responses would further validate the proposed criteria.

The Manitoba Department of Education Curriculum Implementation Branch provided a 1983/84 list of high school choral directors of which two were immediately eliminated--one being a junior high school, and the other an elementary school. The Manitoba Choral Association provided a supplementary list of those members who were involved in choral programmes at the high school level. (See Appendix B for a list of respondents.) The total number of surveys sent out was 35, of which 23 were returned, for a response

rate of 65.7%. As this study was concerned only with credit programmes, 10 or 43.4% teachers indicated their schools were not involved in the credit 105, 205, and 305 Choral Programme. Of these, three respondents indicated that they do have school choir, but students do not receive credit for their participation. The researcher suggests that this is probably the case for other respondents, but as a question of this nature was not included in the survey or requested in the covering letter, the need for such a response was not indicated. The total number of eligible respondents was 13 or 56.5%.

Although it appears that there has been a considerable reduction in the number of credit choral programmes, a loss of 40% from the 83/84 list, new programmes are always being instituted.

#### RATING OF CRITERIA

##### Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design

A proposed set of criteria for evaluating high school choral programmes was sent to five experts in the field of choral music education. They were asked to rate the importance of a number of statements as they related to high school choral programmes, as a means of determining their validity. The first set of statements, hereafter known as Section B, was related to the philosophy behind choral music programmes. The review of the literature supported the view that choral programmes based on an aesthetic philosophy would result in meaningful musical and learning experiences

for students.

Criteria were assessed as 1) Very Important; 2) Important; 3) Of Little Importance; or 4) Of No Importance. A rating index was determined by assigning the numerical value corresponding to the response selected, by adding these together and by dividing by the number of responses. Therefore, a rating index of 1.00 is considered to be the highest possible, while 4.00 is the lowest.

For the purposes of this study a rating index of 1.00-2.5 indicates a positive response; from 2.6-3.00 indicates a significant disagreement among respondents and a rating index above 3.00 indicates a negative response. As this initial questionnaire was to serve as a means of validating criteria, any statement with a rating index above 2.5 in Section B was not included in the final survey. Appendix D shows the responses of the jury to the proposed criteria in Section B of the questionnaire. Table 1 indicates the rank order of each of these statements. When two numbers were circled, the response indicating the greatest degree of agreement or importance was selected. When two statements received the same rating index, they were assigned the same rank number. Those items marked with an asterisk had a rating index greater than 2.5 and were not included in the final survey. (Numbers 6, 14, and 24 f, g, k received high rating scores and were not included therefore in the teachers' survey.) Exceptions to this included questions 10(c) and 11(b). These items were included for the purpose of comparing the responses of the

TABLE 1

## The Jury

## Section B Responses

Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design	Rating Index	Rank
1. The expressive arts are important in the culture of man as a means of communicating innermost thoughts.	1.2	2
2. The high school music programme should be considered as an avenue for aesthetic education, that is, education in the expressive nature of the world of sound.	1.2	2
3. Choral programs should provide the environment for students to develop an understanding of the role of the arts in society.	1.4	3
4. Choral options should be open to all students.	1.2	2
5. Choral options should be scheduled so that all students are able to participate.	1	1
6. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an interview to establish their personal suitability.	2.6	10
7. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an audition to establish vocal qualities.	1.8	5
8. Choral class should be a laboratory for the development of musical awareness and aesthetic sensitivity.	1.8	5
9. Choral class should include the following components:		
a) history	1.4	2
b) aural training	1.2	2
c) theory	1.4	2
d) sight reading	1.2	2
e) vocal training	1.2	2



	Rating Index	Rank
10. Students should be evaluated by the following means:		
a) on an individual basis to assess vocal independence	2.2	7
b) in a small ensemble	2.2	7
c) on the basis of written work	3.6	14*
d) on attendance	1.8	5
11. Students should be assigned:		
a) a letter grade	2.2	7
b) pass or fail	3.3	12*
12. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme.	2.0	6
13. Students electing the choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.	2.4	8
14. The use of a rote process in technical drill is an appropriate methodology to use when learning repertoire in all cases.	3.4	13*
15. Public performances are an important aspect of choral options.	1.0	1
16. Public performances should be an outgrowth of what is being studied in the classroom.	1.2	2
17. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.	2.4	8
18. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.	2.2	7
19. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups.	1.6	4
20. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.	1.4	3
21. Repertoire should be selected to provide for sequential music learning to suit curricular needs.	1.3	3

	Rating Index	Rank
22. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to study a wide variety of musics, representing different styles and cultures.	1	1
23. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussions, aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.	1.4	3
24. Please rate the importance of each of the following indicators of programme success:		
a) evaluation by peers	2.2	7
b) administrative support	1.4	3
c) audience and community support	1.4	3
d) number of students enrolled	2.4	8
e) number of choral groups in programme	2.5	9
f) number of students continuing in university music programmes	2.6	10*
g) student marks	2.5	9
h) student attitudes	1.4	3
i) kinds of concerts students attend	2.4	8
j) kinds of records students buy	2.0	11*
k) festival rating	2.6	10*

jurors and the teachers in the next chapter. The jurors offered a number of alternative points for question 10 (e) and these were therefore added to the teachers' survey, becoming 10 (e) and 10 (f).

It is interesting to note that the jurors agreed that items 5, 15, and 22 were very important to choral programmes, as can be seen by their rating index of 1.0 thus reinforcing the ideals that the choral option should be scheduled so all students may participate, should include an aspect of public performance and should provide the opportunity for the study of a wide variety of musics. There was also close agreement on the importance of statements 1, 2, 4, and 16, further supporting the aesthetic ideals inherent in these items.

Results of this survey served as a validation of proposed criteria for evaluating high school choral programmes. The validated criteria formed part of the survey sent to high school choral directors, (Appendix F). Table 2 shows the teachers' responses with assigned rating index and rank order.

The teachers indicated that the most important aspect of choral programmes should be the scheduling of programmes so all students could participate. The teachers supported those statements concerning the importance of choral programmes as a means for aesthetic education. Their responses also indicated strong support for more traditional activities in the choral class, such as performing and listening experiences.

TABLE 2  
The Teachers  
Section B Responses

Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design	Rating Index	Rank
1. The expressive arts are important in the culture of man as a means of communicating innermost thoughts.	1.3	3
2. The high school music programme should be considered as an avenue for aesthetic education, that is, education in the expressive nature of sound.	1.3	3
3. Choral programmes should provide the environment for students to develop an understanding of the role of the arts in society.	1.3	3
4. Choral options should be open to all students.	1.15	2
5. Choral options should be scheduled so that all students are able to participate.	1.08	1
6. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an audition to establish vocal qualities.	2.15	14
7. Choral class should be a laboratory for the development of musical awareness and aesthetic sensitivity.	1.3	3
8. Choral class should include the following components:		
a) history	2.38	17
b) aural training	1.46	6
c) theory	2.0	12
d) sight reading	1.61	9
e) vocal training	1.15	2
9. Students should be evaluated by the following means:		
a) on an individual basis to assess vocal independence	1.76	10
b) in a small ensemble	1.92	11
c) on the basis of written work	2.83	19
d) on attendance	1.61	9
e) on rehearsal behaviour	1.46	6
f) on musicianship	1.38	4

	Rating Index	Rank
10. Students should be assigned:		
a) a letter grade	1.34	5
b) pass/fail	2.07	13
11. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme.	2.07	13
12. Students electing the choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.	2.38	17
13. A variety of methodologies should be employed during rehearsal so that students understand the expressive nature of the repertoire.	1.76	10
14. Public performances are an important aspect of choral options.	1.30	3
15. Public performances should be an outgrowth of what is being studied in the classroom.	1.38	4
16. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.	2.53	17
17. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.	3.23	20
18. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups.	1.76	10
19. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.	1.61	9
20. Repertoire should be selected to provide the sequential music learning to suit curricular needs.	1.5	7
21. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to study a wide variety of musics, representing different styles and cultures.	1.15	2

	Rating Index	Rank
22. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussions, aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.	2.07	13
23. Please rate the importance of each of the following indicators of programme success:		
a) evaluation by peers	2.18	15
b) administrative support	1.53	8
c) audience and community support	1.53	8
d) number of students enrolled	1.61	9
e) number of choral groups in programme	2.38	17
f) student marks	2.6	18
g) student attitudes	1.15	2
h) kinds of concerts students attend	2.38	17

Analysis of the data revealed that the experts displayed more unanimity than the teachers. For example, the teachers tabulated a total of 20 different ratings out of a total of 40 criteria, while the jury tabulated only 10.

Table 3 shows that the jury had a wider range of rating index scores. This could be due to their confidence in their own opinions and perhaps due to their stronger theoretical backgrounds.

Table 3  
Range of Rating Index Scores

<u>The Jury</u>	<u>The Teachers</u>
1-3.3	1.08-3.23

The ranking of items by the jury is considerably different than that of the teachers. This is largely due to the fact that there were only 5 jurors while there were 13 teachers.

Certain items remained part of the teachers' survey even though the jury's rating scores were higher than 2.6. Item 10 (c) concerned with student evaluation based on written work received a score of 3.6 by the jury, its rank being fourteenth. The teachers also agreed this component was not important, ranking it nineteenth. It is interesting to note that statements 10 (e) and (f), suggested by the jury, received the greatest support by the teachers regarding evaluation of students. The two groups agreed that students should be assigned a letter grade, not pass/fail on their transcripts.

However, the researcher contends that certain of these differences must be mentioned. Both groups agreed on the general philosophical statements concerning the importance of the choral option as a means of teaching music. However, responses about what choral programmes should include revealed divergent opinions. Table 4 compares the selected responses.

Responses from the jury appeared to support the inclusion of varied activities, such as student conductors, performance of student compositions, concert attendance, inclusion of music productions in the programme and development of critical skills. This could be due to their stronger theoretical backgrounds.

On the whole, the teachers' responses to these specific statements crossed the spectrum of choices available. The writer suggests that the teachers may have responded according to "what is" happening in their own choral programmes, as opposed to "what ought" to happen in choral class.

### **Instructional Objectives**

The Manitoba Department of Education provides a Curriculum Guide for the use of high school choral teachers. In it are listed four areas of study history, theory/aural skills, technical skills and expressive skills, with relevant instructional objectives for each. As these objectives are considered to be valid, it was determined that all the statements would be included in the final



TABLE 4  
Comparison of Selected Responses  
Section B

Statement	The Jury Rating Index	Rank	The Teachers Rating Index	Rank
11. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme.	2.0	6	2.07	14
12. Students electing the choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.	2.4	8	2.38	17
16. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.	2.4	8	2.53	18
17. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.	2.2	7	3.23	20
18. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups	1.6	4	1.76	10
19. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.	1.4	3	1.61	9
20. Repertoire should be selected to provide for sequential music learning to suit curricular needs.	1.4	3	1.5	7
22. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussion aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.	1.4	3	2.07	14

survey no matter what the jurors indicated. The data is being treated differently for comparative purposes. In other words, Section C of this questionnaire was the same for both the experts and the teachers.

As both groups agreed on the order of importance of the four components--1. Expressive Skills, 2. Technical Skills, 3. Theory/Aural Skills, and 4. History--the survey results will be reported in this order. (Table 5). For the purposes of comparison of data, each of the four components will be dealt with separately. Respondents were asked to rate the importance of a number of instructional objectives. A rating index above 2.5 indicates a strong disagreement with the statement, thereby reducing its importance as an evaluative tool. Conversely, a rating index of 1-2.5 indicates a positive value for a criterion.

Choral Skills (Expressive). It is interesting to note that both groups ranked the objectives in the expressive skills component in a similar manner, with the first three being the most important and the fifth being last. The rating index of the jurors' responses to statements 4, 6, and 7 was the same, 2.2; thereby indicating that each of these objectives had a similar degree of importance, while the teachers ranked these third, fourth, and fifth, respectively. The responses reported are indicated in Table 6 a & b. Those items marked with an asterisk have a rating above 2.5.

Choral Skills (Technical). There is again agreement between the two groups regarding the first and second ranked items,

TABLE 5

## Ranking of Programme Components

Component	The Jury n=5	
	Rating Index	Rank
1. History	4.0	4
2. Theory/Aural Skills	2.5	3
3. Technical Skills	2.2	2
4. Expressive Skills	1.6	1
	The Teachers n=12	
1. History	3.6	4
2. Theory/Aural Skills	2.41	3
3. Technical Skills	1.83	2
4. Expressive Skills	1.66	1

TABLE 6a

## The Jury

## Choral Skills (Expressive)

Instructional Objectives	Rating Index	Rank
1. Demonstrate ability to change dynamic level.	1.0	1
2. Demonstrate ability to analyze a melody in terms of phrasing, form and climax.	1.6	3
3. Demonstrate a positive group spirit and display proper rehearsal behavior.	1.2	2
4. Demonstrate ability to lead sections or conduct indicating interpretive skills.	2.2	4
5. Write a melody to a given text with simple bass line.	3.0	5*
6. Perform music in different languages.	2.2	4
7. Demonstrate ability to describe, in objective terms, how composers utilize musical elements to achieve expressive qualities.	2.2	4

TABLE 6b

## The Teachers

## Choral Skills (Expressive)

1. Demonstrate ability to change dynamic level.	1.15	1
2. Demonstrate ability to analyze a melody in terms of phrasing, form and climax.	1.84	2
3. Demonstrate a positive group spirit and display proper rehearsal behavior.	1.15	1
4. Demonstrate ability to lead sections or conduct indicating interpretive skills.	2.23	3
5. Write a melody to a given text with simple bass line.	2.92	6*
6. Perform music in different languages.	2.5	4
7. Demonstrate ability to describe, in objective terms, how composers utilize musical elements to achieve expressive qualities.	2.84	5*

these items being 2 and 8 respectively, both stressing the importance of students being able to demonstrate correct vocal technique. The teachers felt it was more important than did the jurors for students to be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism. Items, 3, 4, 6, and 7 were considered by the jury to be of the same relative importance, the rating index only varying by .2 in the case of item 4, while the other objectives received the same rate. The teachers indicated similar perceptions and ranked these items, fifth, fourth, seventh, and sixth, respectively. The greatest difference between the jury and the teachers lay in the ranking of item 5. The jurors felt that students should be able to sing in languages other than English, the rating index being 1.8, while the teachers ranked this as the least important objective with a rating index of 2.66. These findings are reported in Table 7 a & b. This could be due to the fact that the teachers themselves might feel uncomfortable in languages other than English. Class time available and ability of students could also be factors.

Theory/Aural Skills. The teachers and jurors agreed that item 8, ability to sight read a given piece of music, is the most important objective of this component. Items 1, understanding musical notation, and 7, identifying musical terminology and how these are utilized to express mood, follow in importance by both groups.

There appears to be a degree of agreement between the two groups regarding the relative ranking of the rest of the

TABLE 7a  
The Jury  
Choral Skills (Technical)

Instructional Objectives	Rating Index	Rank
1. Be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism.	2.2	5
2. Be able to produce a supported, focused sound when singing, and to solve common problems of tone quality.	1.2	1
3. Be able to explain why pitch problems occur and be able to offer solutions.	2.0	4
4. Be able to sing a difficult melody or part.	1.8	3
5. Be able to sing in languages other than English.	1.8	3
6. Be able to follow conductors' beat patterns in 5 and 7.	2.0	4
7. Be able to conduct choirs in meters of 2, 3 & 4.	2.0	4
8. Demonstrate vocal independence.	1.4	2

TABLE 7b  
The Teachers  
Choral Skills (Technical)

1. Be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism.	1.76	3
2. Be able to produce a supported, focused sound when singing, and to solve common problems of tone quality.	1.15	1
3. Be able to explain why pitch problems occur and be able to offer solutions.	2.0	5
4. Be able to sing a difficult melody or part.	1.83	4
5. Be able to sing in languages other than English.	2.66	8
6. Be able to follow conductors' beat patterns in 5 and 7.	2.25	7
7. Be able to conduct choir in meters of 2, 3 & 4.	2.15	6
8. Demonstrate vocal independence.	1.30	2

objectives, while items 6 and 4 rank fourth and fifth. The teachers' rating index varies for items 2, 3, and 5; however, only by a margin of .33 and items 6 and 4 are ranked in the last places respectively. The results are reported in Tables 8 a & b.

**History.** The jurors ranked items 1 and 7 as the most important objectives in this component, followed closely by item 8 in second place, and item 4 in third, thereby linking the ability to understand the implications of historical era with the ability to demonstrate, classify and recognize proper performance practise. The teachers concur with item 7 on the ability to demonstrate proper performance practise as being the most important objective. They rank items 1 and 8 in fourth position, thus representing a significant difference in focus from the jurors. Both groups hold items 3 and 5 in the last places, thus showing that these are of the least relevance to this component. Tables 9 a & b indicate these responses in greater detail.

#### General Information

As part of their questionnaire, the teachers were also asked to report information regarding their choral programmes and whether their programmes reflected the optimum situation. The following data was collected.

**School size and programme enrollment.** In questions 3 and 4, teachers were requested to indicate the total population of Grades 10, 11, and 12 and the class size of choral programmes 105, 205, and 305 respectively. This question

TABLE 8a  
The Jury  
Theory/Aural Skills

Instructional Objectives	Rating Index	Rank
1. Be able to understand musical notation, including traditional and non-traditional means.	1.6	1
2. Interpret, write and perform all time signatures in simple, compound, or irregular meters.	2.0	3
3. Identify and be able to write all major and minor keys.	2.6	3
4. Identify modulations to dominant or relative minor.	2.6	5*
5. Understand intervals, chords and cadences.	2.0	3
6. Understand musical form and be able to identify these from written and aural examples.	2.2	4
7. Be able to identify musical terminology and how composers use these to express mood.	1.8	2
8. Be able to sight-read a given piece of music.	1.6	1

TABLE 8b  
The Teachers  
Theory/Aural Skills

1. Be able to understand musical notation, including traditional and non-traditional means.	1.6	2
2. Interpret, write and perform all time signatures in simple, compound or irregular meters.	2.07	5
3. Identify and be able to write all major and minor keys.	2.33	6
4. Identify modulations to dominant or relative minor.	2.66	8*
5. Understand intervals, chords and cadences.	2.0	4
6. Understand musical form and be able to identify these from written and aural examples.	2.5	7
7. Be able to identify musical terminology and how composers use these to express mood.	1.83	3
8. Be able to sight-read a given piece of music.	1.58	1



TABLE 9a  
The Jury  
History

Instructional Objectives	Rating Index	Rank
1. Understand the meaning of historical era and the implications concerning composing and performance practice.	1.4	1
2. Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.	2.0	4
3. Know the chronological order and dates of music eras.	2.2	5
4. Be able to relate studied repertoire to historical era and performance practice.	1.8	3
5. Describe the development of the orchestra.	2.8	6*
6. Have a knowledge of several composers of each era and be able to discuss their contribution.	1.8	3
7. Demonstrate proper performance practise through singing.	1.4	1
8. Classify representative repertoire by era after listening to it.	1.6	2

TABLE 9b  
The Teachers  
History

1. Understand the meaning of historical era and the implications concerning composing and performance practise.	2.25	4
2. Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.	2.27	3
3. Know the chronological order and dates of music eras.	2.7	6*
4. Be able to relate studied repertoire to historical era and performance practise.	1.91	2
5. Describe the development of the orchestra.	3.09	3
6. Have a knowledge of several composers of each era and be able to discuss their contribution.	2.1	3
7. Demonstrate proper performance practise through singing.	1.5	1
8. Classify representative repertoire by era after listening to it.	2.25	4

was asked in order to determine the percentage of students enrolled in choral programmes. The responses to question number 3 were incomplete and therefore it is difficult to glean any sort of comparative information from the data. Of those who responded to both questions 3 and 4, it became evident that only a small percentage of students were enrolled in choral programmes. See Table 10. It does appear, however, that the percentage of students enrolled diminishes as the grade decreases. The poor response rate could be attributed to the wording of the question, that is respondents did not realize the total number of students were requested. Question 4 had a better response rate than question 3.

Table 11, shows the number of students in choral programmes by grade. One respondent indicated a class of 30 students with students from each of the grades. This was not indicated in Table 11. According to the data presented, it appears that enrollment by grade varies from school to school. In some schools, each grade has a choral programme, in others, only one grade level is represented.

Class size. Questions 5 and 6 attempted to determine the number of students in an average choral class and whether this number reflected the optimum class size. Table 12 shows that 8 or 61.5% of the total respondents reported an average class size of more than 35 students, 3 or 23% with an average class size of 20-34 students and 2 or 15.38% with less than 20 students.

TABLE 10

## School Size and Enrollment in Choral Option

Total Grade 10 Population	Enrollment in 105 Choral	Percentage of Total Population
350	56	16
375	75	20
260	63	24
160	28	17
Total Grade 11 Population	Enrollment in 205 Choral	Percentage of Total Population
350	35	10
375	60	16
160	21	13
Total Grade 12 Population	Enrollment in 305 Choral	Percentage of Total Population
350	30	8
375	60	16
112	10	8

TABLE 11

## Number of Students in Choral Option by Grade

Grade 10	Grade 11	Grade 12
56	35	30
75	60	60
63	-	-
28	21	10
39	31	8
23	7	-
41	28	20
36	-	-
5	11	11
21	9	11
40	15	19
22	23	20

TABLE 12

CLASS SIZE - ACTUAL & OPTIMUM

Number of Students	Actual Class Size	% of Respondents	Optimum Class Size	% of Respondents
under 20	2	15.38	-	-
20 - 34	3	23	6	50
35 and over	8	61.5	6	50

The significance of these responses becomes evident when compared to the answers to question six on optimum class size. Respondents were evenly split on the optimum class size. 50% or six teachers indicated an optimum class size of 20-34 students, while the same numbers felt class size should be 35 or greater. Four respondents or 33.3% indicated that their programmes reflected the optimum class size. Five teachers, or 41.6% reported that class sizes should be increased. One teacher in this category also reported the largest actual class size. Three respondents or 25% felt a reduction in class size was required. This group indicated their average class size as being greater than 35 students. Had actual numbers been reported, more information regarding actual and optimum class size would be available.

Time allotment. Teachers were asked to report the actual number and the optimum number of minutes per week spent in choral programmes in questions 7 and 8. Table 13 shows the actual time and the optimum time allotments reported. Of the respondents, 6 or 46.15% indicated the number of minutes

per week they spent in the choral class was optimum, 4 or 30.76% felt the time should be increased, while 3 or 23% felt the time allotment should be decreased. Table 14 shows a comparison between actual class times and optimum class times reported. It does not include responses from those teachers who stated only that their class time was 'more' than 120 minutes per week.

Public performances. Questions 9 and 10 were asked to determine the actual and optimum number of public performances scheduled in a school year for the average choral class. Table 15 shows the responses received. For question 9, one respondent did not know how many actual performances had been scheduled as he/she was new to the school. In response to question 10, one teacher suggested that the optimum number of performances should be dependent on abilities and time available, without overtaxing students or teachers. Of 11 respondents, 8 or 72.7% reported that the number of public performances should remain the same; 3 or 27.2% reported that the number of public performances should be reduced. Table 16 shows a comparison of the actual and optimum number of performances by respondent. Again, had the actual numbers been indicated, more information about what teachers feel should be the optimum number of performances could have been gleaned.

Choral groups. In questions 11 and 12, the teachers were requested to report the kinds of choral groups included in their choral programmes and the numbers of students involved in each of these. Table 17 indicates the responses

TABLE 13

Time Allotment - Actual & Optimum

Number of Minutes per week	Actual	% of Respondents	Optimum	% of Respondents
100	1	7.69		
120	3	23.07	3	23.07
more	9	69.23	10	76.92

TABLE 14

Time Allotment - Actual & Optimum  
Comparison of Responses

Actual	Optimum
100	120
120	120
120	120
180	225
200	400
225	225
280	200
315	315
325	300
450	150

TABLE 15

## Public Performances - Actual &amp; Optimum

Number of Performances	Actual - % of Responses	Optimum - % of Responses
4	1 8.3	1 8.3
5	2 16.6	1 8.3
6	- -	- -
7	1 8.3	1 8.3
8	- -	- -
9	- -	- -
more	8 66.6	9 7.5

TABLE 16

## Public Performances - Comparison of Responses

## Actual &amp; Optimum

Actual number of performances	Optimum number of performances
5	5
4	4
14	10
15	15
14	13
7	7
more than 9	more than 9 *
more than 15	15

\*four teachers indicated this response.

received. One respondent checked only the kinds of groups included, while two others indicated an overlapping of students in different groups. Table 18 shows the kinds of groups included in a choral programmes with the percentage numbers of responses for each category. In response to question 12 regarding increasing the number of choral groups, 8 or 61.5% of the respondents answered yes; 3 or 23% reported no, while 2 or 15.3% did not respond.



TABLE 17

Types of Choral Groups  
With Number of Participants  
by School

Types of Groups	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
Concert		x	50		78		55	60	49	29	75	21
Jazz/Show		x			21*	16	21	16	15	7	10	19
Chamber			12			18						16
Girls Choir	78	x						18	15*			
Madrigal				12	*				15*			
Mixed octet						*						
Mixed chorus	65	x		60		90	36					
Boys choir	41	x		28					15			
Barbershop	8											
Choral class			13									

\* indicates students take part in more than one group  
x one teacher only indicated type of group, not number of participants

TABLE 18

Choral Groups - Summary

Types of Groups	# of Responses	% of Total Responses	Rank
Concert groups	9	69.23	1
Jazz/Show	8	61.53	2
Chamber groups	4	30.76	4
Octet	1	7.69	6
Girls choir	4	30.76	4
Madrigal group	2	15.38	5
Mixed chorus	5	38.46	3
Boys choir	4	30.76	4
Barbershop	1	7.69	6
Choral class	1	7.69	6

### SUMMARY

This chapter has presented the results of two surveys. The first was sent to a jury of five music education specialists as a means of validating philosophical and design criteria. The second survey, constructed on the basis of the results of the first, was sent to a group who were asked to rate the importance of instructional objectives as a means of establishing criteria for the evaluation of high school choral programmes. The data presented in this chapter will lead to the development of such an evaluative tool.

This chapter also presented information about existing programmes including information on actual and optimum class sizes, time allotment, number of performances and kinds of choral groups.

Some items revealed close agreement. Both groups supported the basic philosophical statements concerning the importance of the choral music programmes as a means of aesthetic music education, and the order of importance of the four components of such a programme. Substantive differences were evident in the ranking of the proposed criteria in Section B, philosophical considerations of programme design, as previously discussed. In fact, the teachers and the jurors generally ranked the instructional objectives in a similar manner. Divergent opinions were indicated in such items as ability to sing in languages other than English, and in the focus of the history component.

The following chapter will offer conclusions and make recommendations for further research in this area.

## CHAPTER 5

## CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATION

The purpose of this study was to develop a set of criteria which could be used to evaluate high school choral programmes. Information identified in the professional literature pointed to the importance of an educational philosophy in order for a consistent and meaningful curriculum to be developed.

The aesthetic philosophy adopted for use in this study is based on the belief that students' choral experience should be developmental, varied and of an objective or critical nature which could ultimately lead to a greater understanding and appreciation of the world of music and the role of the arts in society. A number of statements reflecting this philosophy were proposed to a group of five experts in the field of music education, by means of a questionnaire. They were asked to rate the importance of each statement as a means of validating these criteria.

Validated statements then served as the basis for a second survey sent to high school choral directors. As part of the survey, teachers were asked to describe their programmes and what they considered to be optimum programme conditions, thereby relating the reality to the ideal. Both groups, the jurors and the teachers, were asked to rate the instructional objectives of the choral option as presented in the 1983 Curriculum Guide distributed by the Manitoba Department of Education. It was believed that the

assessment of this information would answer the question of "what ought" to be included in the choral option. Too often in educational research the opinions and values of the teachers have been ignored, yet their experiences can provide valuable insight into current practice.

This chapter will present conclusions which may be drawn and implications for programme development. The various types of choral programmes in existence will be described. The criteria which was considered valid for the evaluation of choral programmes can then be identified.

Of 35 questionnaires mailed to high school choral directors, 23 were returned. Of these, ten respondents indicated that their schools were not currently involved in the credit choral programme. Therefore, the sample population includes thirteen or 56.5% of the total respondents. Of course, other credit choral programmes do exist in the province, but either responses were not received from those schools involved or the programmes were not identified by the list sources.

The researcher wanted to determine what percentage of the total school population was enrolled in the choral programme. However, only four of the respondents reported total Grade 10 population, while three respondents indicated Grade 11 and 12 populations. It appears that only a small percentage of high school students are involved in the choral option. On the average, 19% of Grade 10 students are enrolled in the Choral Option 105, 13% in 205 Choral Music

and 10% in 305 Choral Music. It seems, then, that as the grade level increases the percentage of students enrolled in Choral Music decreases. This could be due to the availability of other course options as the grade level increases or the attitude of students to choral singing. Analysis of the actual enrollment did reveal the great variety of programmes offered.

The largest percentage of teachers, 61.5%, reported an average class size of more than 35 students, while 50% indicated this to be the optimum class size. The other 50% felt that optimum class size was between 20-34 students. 41.6% of the teachers wanted their class size to be increased and 33.3% felt their classes to be the optimum size. 25%, whose classes were greater than 35 students, felt a reduction in number of students would represent the optimum class size.

Teachers reported a great variety in time spent per week in the choral class, from 100 to 450 minutes per week. Analysis of the responses showed a great diversity in the choral programmes offered. Time allotment can be dependent on the importance ascribed to choral programmes by administrators in school divisions and by the ability of the choral teacher to influence timetabling.

Most teachers felt that the optimum number of public performances should be greater than nine with an average number of ten reflecting the average response. In general, the teachers' answers reflected satisfaction with the number of scheduled performances. The writer suggests this is due

to the teachers' control over the number of performances per year.

The most popular kind of choral group was the concert choir. The number of students involved varied greatly, from 21 to 78 members. A close second was the jazz/show choir, with an average of 15 students participating. The largest percentage of teachers would change their programmes, if it were possible, by adding a variety of groups, small ensembles, or by dividing existing groups into junior and senior choirs. One teacher even commented on the need for another choral director to help in the school's well-developed choral programme.

The information that can be gleaned from this portion of the questionnaire is somewhat sketchy due to the irregularity of responses. Perhaps if actual numbers, rather than general groupings, had been requested a more complete picture of existing and optimum programmes could be drawn. What this data does reveal is an educational option that varies considerably from school to school.

### **Criteria for the Evaluation of High School Choral Programmes**

The following statements are considered to be valid criteria for use by teachers in evaluating their high school choral programmes. In presenting the first set of criteria, those statements which requested rating of options will be listed separately at the end of this section.

The researcher's intent is that these criteria serve as

a checklist for teachers in evaluating their choral programmes. The statements are listed in order of importance based on their assigned rating index score and reflect the respondents' beliefs concerning 'what ought' to be happening in high school choral class.

Teachers could use the checklist in two ways. First, it could be used as a means of assessing what individuals feel 'ought' to be happening in choral class. Then, criteria could be applied to reflect 'what is' happening in choral class. Secondly, those valid criteria could be taken at face value and teachers could apply them to 'what is' happening in their classes. In either case, programme planning would be based on the disparity between 'what ought' to be happening and 'what is' happening.

### Philosophical Considerations of Programme Design

1. Choral options should be scheduled so that all students are able to participate.

2. Choral options should be open to all students.

Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to study a wide variety of musics, representing different styles and cultures.

3. The expressive arts are important in the culture of man as a means of communicating innermost thoughts.

The high school music programme should be considered as an avenue for aesthetic education, that is, education in the expressive nature of sound.

Choral class should be a laboratory for the development of musical awareness and aesthetic sensitivity.



Public performances are an important aspect of choral options.

4. Public performances should be an outgrowth of what is being studied in the classroom.
5. Repertoire should be selected to provide for sequential music learning to meet curriculum needs.
6. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.
7. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups.  
A variety of methodologies should be employed during rehearsal so that students understand the expressive nature of the repertoire.
8. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussions, aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.
9. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an audition to establish vocal qualities.
10. Students electing to take choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.
11. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.

12. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.

Of these 12 criteria, items 11 and 12 received rating indexes of 2.53 and 3.23 respectively. They were listed, however, due to the wide acceptance in the professional literature for including these activities in choral programmes. The jury also ascribed a greater degree of importance to these criteria. There appears to be an inconsistency in the teachers' responses. Although they ranked the philosophical statements linking the choral programme to aesthetic education highly, they did not follow through in the programme design.

**Evaluation.** Students should be assigned a letter grade and evaluated by the following means:

1. on musicianship
2. on rehearsal behavior
3. on attendance
4. on an individual basis to assess vocal independence
5. in a small ensemble

**Programme success can be determined by the following means:**

1. student attitudes
2. administrative and community support
3. numbers of students enrolled
4. evaluation by peers
5. number of choral groups in the programmes and by the kinds of concert students attend

Programme content. Choral classes should include the following components:

- a. vocal training
- b. aural training
- c. sight reading
- d. theory
- e. history

Instructional objectives. Programme components are listed in order of importance with their relevant objectives. By the end of three years, students will be able to accomplish the following tasks.

**Choral Skills (expressive)**

1. Demonstrate ability to change dynamic level.  
Demonstrate a positive group spirit and display proper rehearsal behavior.
2. Demonstrate ability to analyze a melody in terms of phrasing, form and climax.
3. Demonstrate ability to lead sections or conduct indicating interpretive skills.
4. Perform music in different languages.
5. Demonstrate ability to describe, in objective terms, how composers utilize musical elements to achieve expressive qualities.

This final item has been included due to the importance ascribed to it in the professional literature, even though the rating index was 2.84. According to the literature, one of the main goals of aesthetic music education is the development of an objective vocabulary which can be used to

evaluate or critically analyze the materials of music. The researcher suggests that this aspect has been largely neglected in high school choral programmes to date. If the purpose of the choral option is to educate students musically, the development of vocabulary will result in a population able to assess what they hear, or sing in an intelligent fashion. One item, "write a melody to a given text with simple bass line" was not included due to its high score of 2.92. The jurors agreed with the teachers on this point.

#### **Choral Skills (technical)**

1. Be able to produce a supported, focused sound when singing and to solve common problems of tone quality.
2. Demonstrate vocal independence.
3. Be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism.
4. Be able to sing a difficult melody or part.
5. Be able to explain why pitch problems occur and be able to offer solutions.
6. Be able to conduct choir in meter 2, 3, and 4.
7. Be able to follow conductors beat patterns in 5 and 7.
8. Be able to sing in languages other than English.

Item number 8 was included even though it received a rating index of 2.6 due to the references made in the literature, as well as by the importance ascribed to it by the group of jurors. In rating this criterion, the teachers may be reflecting the abilities of their students or their own lack of fluency in other languages.

### Theory/Aural Skills

1. Be able to sight-read a given piece of music.
2. Be able to understand musical notation, including traditional and non-traditional means.
3. Be able to identify musical terminology and how composers use these to express mood.
4. Understand intervals, chords and cadences.
5. Interpret, write and perform all time signatures in simple, compound or irregular meter.
6. Identify and be able to write all major and minor keys.
7. Understand musical form and be able to identify these from written and aural examples.

One item, ability to "identify modulations to dominant or relative minor" was not included as both groups rated this objective above 2.6, thereby, invalidating its relative importance.

### History

1. Demonstrate proper performance practise through singing.
2. Be able to relate studied repertoire to historical era and performance practise.
3. Have a knowledge of several composers of each era and be able to discuss their contribution.
4. Classify representative repertoire by era after listening to it.
5. Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.
6. Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.

7. Know the chronological order and dates of music eras.

Criteria number 7 was included, although it received a rating index of 2.7, due to the importance attributed to it by the group of experts. The researcher suggests that the teachers may have rated this criteria as being of little or no importance in view of the class time constraints or the focus of programmes on the practical, not the theoretical. The knowledge of chronological order of musical eras is important, however, in understanding style and performance practise. Both the teachers and the experts invalidated the importance of students' ability to describe the development of the orchestra, therefore, it was not included.

### RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This study has addressed certain questions while opening the doors to others. The purpose of this study was to develop criteria for evaluation of high school choral programmes by surveying a jury of experts and teachers to discover what ought to be included in these programmes. A natural outgrowth of this study would be to apply these criteria to choral programmes, thus determining what actually is being done in the choral class. The degree of congruence between theory and practise would provide valuable data which could be used in future curriculum development or in improving existing programmes.

Another survey of all junior and senior high schools throughout the Province should be carried out as a means of determining actual numbers of students in choral programmes and of obtaining a detailed profile of existing programmes.

A critical result of this study was the divergent opinions of the jurors and the teachers concerning programme design and philosophical considerations. As philosophy underlies how and why programmes are developed, it is important that further research in this area be undertaken in order that students involved in choral options receive a quality music education. Results of such research would impact teacher training and in-service workshops which should be aimed at providing a stronger link between philosophy and programme design.

The most frequent comment made by the teachers was the lack of time to accomplish the proposed criteria. This

indicates the need for further research to determine optimum class time allotment. Scheduling and class size and how to evaluate students are also factors which could be examined in detail.

#### SUMMATION

The purpose of this study was to establish a set of criteria for the evaluation of high school choral programmes. A survey sent to a list of 1983/84 high school choral directors revealed that 40% of the choral programmes being offered in high schools had been eliminated. The writer realizes new programmes have been offered in the interim two years, but it is important to realize that research into choral programmes would increase knowledge about the choral option, would lead to an increased profile for the option and could result in more programme development. The researcher concluded there was a need for an evaluative tool which could reveal 'what ought' to be happening in choral class, as a basis for programme design.

The importance of developing an educational philosophy as a means of determining programme content was identified. An aesthetic philosophy of choral music education was offered and criteria were validated by a jury of music education experts, and a group of high school choral directors. Instructional objectives, taken from the Curriculum Guide were assessed and provided further criteria for programme evaluation.

The criteria identified in this study could be used by teachers to evaluate their own programmes or by a school



division in developing new programmes. They should serve, however, as a means of bringing greater uniformity to choral programmes in the Province. It is hoped that this study will benefit choral programmes throughout the Province and will lead to further research in this field. More knowledge about programmes can only lead to improvement in their quality, which in the long run will benefit the recipients.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BOOKS

- Abeles, Harold F., Charles Hoffer, and Robert H. Klotman. Foundations of Music Education. London: Collier Macmillan Publishers, 1984.
- American Choral Directors Association. Guide for the Beginning Choral Director. National Committee on High School Choral Music, 1972, 41 p.
- Beatty, Walcott. Music in Education: A Point of View. Windsor, England: NFER Publishing Co. Ltd., 1975, 125 p.
- Bessom, Malcolm E., Alphonse M. Tatarunis, Samuel L. Forucci. Teaching Music in Today's Secondary Schools: A Creative Approach to Contemporary Music Education. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1980.
- Bruner, Jerome S. The Process of Education. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1960.
- Choksy, Lois. The Kodaly Context: Creating an Environment for Musical Learning. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1981, 281 p.
- Christy, Van. A. Expressive Singing. Volumes 1 and 2. 3rd edition. Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown Company Publishers, 1975.
- Colwell, Richard. The Evaluation of Music Teaching and Learning. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1970.
- Decker, Harold A. and Julius Herford. Choral Conducting: A Symposium. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1973, 251 p.
- Dewey, John. Democracy and Education. New York: Macmillan Co., 1916.
- Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation. Edited by George F. Madeus, Michael S. Scriven, Daniel L. Stufflebean. Boston: Klierer-Nighoff Publishing, 1983.
- Fink, Arlene and Jacqueline Kosecoff. How to Conduct Surveys: A Step-By-Step Guide. Beverly-Hills: SAGE Publications, 1985, 119 p.
- Garretson, Robert L. Conducting Choral Music. Boston: Allyn and Bacon Inc., 1981, 416 p.

- Gordon, Edwin. The Psychology of Music Teaching.  
Contemporary Perspectives in Music Education Series.  
Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1971, 138  
p.
- Hoffer, Charles R. Introduction to Music Education.  
Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company,  
1983, 237 p.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Teaching Music in Secondary Schools. 2nd edition.  
Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company,  
Inc., 1973, 496 p.
- Lamb, Gordon. Choral Techniques. 2nd edition. Dubuque,  
Iowa: W. C. Brown Co. Pub., n.d.
- Langer, Susanne. Mind: An Essay on Human Feeling. Vol. 1.  
Baltimore: The John Hopkins Press, n.d.
- Leonhard, Charles and Robert W. House. Foundations and  
Principles of Music Education. New York: McGraw-Hill  
Book Company, 1972, 432 p.
- Manitoba Department of Education. Annual Report. 1897,  
1910, 1925, 1928, 1931, 1939, 1940, 1943, 1945, 1947.  
Winnipeg: Queen's Printer.
- Manitoba Department of Education. Curriculum Development and  
Implementation Branch. Manitoba Music Assessment  
Program. 1983. Final Report. December 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Preliminary Report: Test Data. December 1983.
- Manitoba Department of Education. Music 105, 205, 305  
( Choral ) Interim Guide, 1983, 88 p.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Secondary School. Report of the Core Committee  
on the Re-organization of the Secondary School, 1973,  
55 p.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Programme of Studies. 1929-1930. Winnipeg: Queen's  
Printer.
- Mark, Michael L. Source Readings in Music Education History.  
New York; Schirmer Books, 1982, 274 p.
- Moss, Orlando. Complete Handbook for Teaching Small Vocal  
Ensembles. West Nyack, N.Y.: Parker Publishing  
Company, Inc., 1978, 228 p.
- Music Educators' National Conference and Central Midwestern  
Regional Laboratory, Inc. Toward an Aesthetic  
Education. 1971.
- Regelski, Thomas. Principles and Problems of Music  
Education. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall,  
Inc., 1975.

- Reimer, Bennett. A Philosophy of Music Education.  
Contemporary Perspectives in Music Education Series.  
edited by Charles Leonhard. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.:  
Prentice-Hall Inc., 1970.
- Roe, Paul F. Choral Music Education. 2nd edition.  
Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1983.
- Smith, Ralph A., ed. Aesthetic Concepts and Education.  
Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970, 455 p.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Aesthetics and Criticism in Art Education: Problems  
in Defining, Explaining and Evaluating Art. Chicago:  
Rand McNally and Co., 1966, 513 p.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Aesthetics and Problems of Education. Readings in  
the Philosophy of Education. Urbana: University of  
Illinois Press, 1971, 581 p.
- Stenhouse, Lawrence. An Introduction to Curriculum Research  
and Development. An Open University Set Book. London:  
Heinemann, 1975, 248 p.
- Straughan, Roger and Jack Wrigley, eds. Values and  
Evaluation in Education. London: Harper & Row, n.d.
- Strunk, Oliver. Antiquity and the Middle Ages. Source  
Readings in Music History. New York: W.W. Norton and  
Company, n.d., 193 p.
- Tait, Malcolm and Paul Haack. Principles and Processes of  
Music Education: New Perspectives. New York: Teachers  
College Press, Columbia University, 1983, 179 p.
- Thompson, Mark. Decision Analysis for Program Evaluation.  
Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger Publishing Co., 1982.

#### ARTICLES

- Arnstine, Donald. "Aesthetic Qualities in Experience and  
Learning." In Aesthetic Concepts and Education, pp.  
21-44. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University  
of Illinois Press, 1970.
- Aspin, David N. "The Place of Music in the Curriculum: A  
Justification." Journal of Aesthetic Education 16(1)  
(Spring 1982):41-56.
- Ball, Charles H. "Thoughts on Music as Aesthetic Education."  
In MENC and CEMRL. Toward an Aesthetic Education.  
1971. pp. 57-62.

- Bauer, David A. "Teaching Music for Aesthetic Growth." The Choral Journal 17(8) (April 1977):15-16.
- Beardsley, Monroe C. "Aesthetic Theory and Educational Theory." In Aesthetic Concepts and Education, pp. 3-20. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970.
- Broudy, Harry S. "Enlightened Preference and Justification." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 305-319. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1971.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Some Duties of a Theory of Educational Aesthetics." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 103-116. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1971.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Tacit Knowing and Aesthetic Education." In Aesthetic Concepts and Education, pp. 77-106. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Arts as Basic Education." Journal of Aesthetic Education 12(4) (October 1978):21-29.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Structure of Knowledge in the Arts." In Aesthetics and Criticism in Art Education: Problems in Defining, Explaining and Evaluating Art, pp. 23-34. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Chicago: Rand McNally & Co., n.d.
- Cahn, Meyer M. "More Than Performance: Toward Human Interaction." Music Educators Journal 5(6) (February 1969):36-38.
- Cappers, Paul K. "Sightsinging Makes Middle School Singers into High School Musicians." Music Educators Journal 72(2) (October 1985):46.
- Colwell, Richard. "An Approach to Aesthetic Education." Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #17 (Summer 1979):1-8.
- Cronbach, Lee. "Course Improvement through Evaluation." In Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation, pp. 105-116. Edited by George F. Madeus, Michael S. Scriven, and Daniel L. Stufflebeam. Boston: Klierer-Nighoff Publishing, 1983.
- Duerksen, George L. "A Study of the Relationship between the Perception of Musical Processes and the Enjoyment of Music." Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #12 (Winter 1968):1-8.

- Fexter, Mary. "More than Performance: A Sequel and a Plea." Music Educators Journal 55(6) (February 1968):39-41.
- Gonzo, Carroll. "Research in Choral Music: A Perspective." Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #33 (Summer 1973):21-33.
- Greene, Maxine. "Teaching for Aesthetic Experience." In MENC and CEMRL, Toward an Aesthetic Education, pp.21-43.
- Haack, Paul. "A Study in the Development of Music Listening Skills in Secondary School Students." Journal of Research in Music Education 17(1) (Spring 1969):193-201.
- Hausman, Jerome J. "A Contemporary Aesthetics Curriculum." In MENC and CEMRL, Toward and Aesthetic Education, pp. 45-55.
- Hylton, John B. "Dimensionality in High School Student Participants' Perceptions of the Meaning of Choral Singing Experience." Journal of Research in Music Education 29(4) (Winter 1981):287-303.
- Knieter, Gerard. "The Nature of Aesthetic Education." In MENC and CEMRL, Toward an Aesthetic Education, pp. 3-19.
- Krister, Gloria J. "Total Education: Arts Balance the Analytical with the Aesthetic." Music Educators Journal, 72(2) (October 1985):24-27.
- Kupfer, Joseph. "Aesthetic Experience and Moral Education." Journal of Aesthetic Education 12(3) (July 1978):13-22.
- Langer, Susanne. "The Cultural Importance of the Arts." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 86-94. Edited by Ralph A. Smith. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970.
- Larson, LeRoy. "More than Performance: It Can Be Done." Music Educators Journal 55(6) (February 1969)
- Lee, Robert T. "The Expanding Role of the Arts in Education." Music Educators Journal 72(2) (October 1985):28.
- Linton, Stanley. "The Development of a Planned Program for Teaching Musicianship in the High School Choral Class." Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #10 (Summer 1967):7-14.
- Mann, John. "Curriculum Criticism." Teacher's College Record 71(1) (September 1969):27-40.

- Miller, Samuel D. "Comprehensive Musicianship for Students in the High School Chorale Ensemble." The Choral Journal 17(1) (September 1976):5,7.
- Morrison, Rob. "Measurement in Education." In Values and Evaluation in Education, pp. 28-32. Edited by Roger Straughan and Jack Wrigley. London: Harper & Row, n.d.
- Mursell, James and Mabelle Glenn. "The Psychology of School Music Teaching: The Aims of School Music." In Source Readings in Music Education History pp. 200-203. Edited by Michael L. Mark. New York: Schirmer Books, 1982.
- Peed, John. "The Interpretive Process in Choral Music." The Choral Journal 21(1) (September 1980):17:19.
- Reahm, Douglas E. "Developing Critical Thinking Through Rehearsal Techniques." Music Educators Journal 72(7) (March 1986):29-31.
- Reese, Sam. "Polanyi's Tacit Knowing and Music Education." Journal of Aesthetic Education 14(1) (January 1980):75-90.
- Reimer, Bennett. "Building Curricula for Music Education." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 373-386. Edited by Ralph A. Smith, n.d.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Aesthetic Behaviors in Music." In MENC and CEMRL Toward an Aesthetic Education, pp. 65-87, n.d.
- Schwadron, Abraham A. "Philosophy in Music Education: State of the Research." Council for Research in Music Education, Bulletin #34 (Fall 1973):41-53.
- Smith, James G. "Da Capo." The Choral Journal 15(7):23.
- Smith, C.M. "The Aesthetics of John Dewey and Aesthetic Education." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 126-143. Edited by Ralph A. Smith, n.d.
- Smith, R.A., and Smith, C.M. "Justifying Aesthetic Education." In Aesthetics and Problems of Education, pp. 126-143. Edited by Ralph A. Smith, n.d.
- Somary, Johannes. "Does Music Education Belong in Our Schools." The Choral Journal 7(1) (September-October 1966):16-17.
- Sparshott, F.E. "The Case for Aesthetics." In Aesthetics and Criticism in Art Education, pp. 6-22. Edited by Ralph A. Smith, n.d.
- Stacker, David. "The Large Choral Ensemble and Social Loafing." The Choral Journal 21(9) (May 1981):9-10.

- Stake, Robert. "To Evaluate an Arts Program." Journal of Aesthetic Education 10(3-4) (July-October 1976):115-113.
- Stufflebeam, Daniel L. and William J. Webster. "An Analysis of Alternative Approaches to Evaluation." Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation, pp. 30-, n.d.
- Summers, Ruth. "Music History in the Choral Rehearsal." The Choral Journal 7(1) (September-October 1966):15.
- Tait, Malcolm. "Musical Experiences in the Choral Program." The Choral Journal 15(7) (n.d.):22-23.
- Winking, John T. "Beardsley's Aesthetics, Musical Analysis and Musical Listening." Journal of Aesthetic Education 14(1) (January 1980):91-103.

#### THESES

- Ball, Louis O. A Study of the Effectiveness of Three Methods of Teaching Choral Music as Evaluated Through Musical Performance. Thesis. University of Tennessee. December 1953.
- Bartel, Lee Roy. The Identification of Criteria for the Evaluation of Junior High School Guitar Programs. Thesis. Masters of Education. University of Manitoba. December 1983.
- Bromley, Arthur Barry. The Development and Testing of Evaluative Checklists for Determining the Degree of Attainment of Objectives in Music Education. Thesis. Doctor of Musical Arts. University of Oregon. June 1972.
- Dunfield, Howard Melville. The First Sixty Years of Public Secondary Education in Manitoba. Thesis. Master of Arts. McMaster University. 1941.
- Freedman, Albert M. Implications with Suggested Applications of Selected Educational Theories and Taxonomic Models for the Development of Productive Thinking in the General Music Class in the Secondary School. Thesis. Doctor of Music Education. Indiana University. 1972.
- Glinz, Leslie Albert. The Development of Public Secondary Education in Manitoba. Thesis. Doctoral. Leland Stanford Junior University. 1931.
- Janzen, Alan. A Survey of Junior High Music Programs in the Public Schools of Manitoba. Thesis. Masters of Education. University of Manitoba. 1980.



- Koop, Ann Elizabeth. The History of the Manitoba Music Educators' Association. Thesis. Master of Music. University of Western Ontario. 1983.
- McCarthy, Kevin Joseph. Effects of Participation in School Music Performance Organizations on the Ability to Perceive Aesthetic Elements in Recorded Music. Thesis. Doctor of Philosophy. Case Western Reserve University. January 1969. 173 p.
- Moore, Patrick S. Teaching Musical Improvisation Utilizing the Guitar. Thesis. Masters of Education. University of Manitoba. August 1985.
- Morin, Francine Lee. Aesthetic Education: A Curriculum Model and Curriculum Plan for Arts Programming in Manitoba Schools. Thesis. Masters of Education. University of Manitoba. November 1983.
- Morrow, Morna-June. A Report Developing an Elementary Music Education Course Dealing with Classroom Musical Instrument Experiences for Students Electing to Take an Undergraduate Music Education Major. Thesis. Masters of Education. University of Manitoba. 1977.
- Patterson, Lawrence W.A. Undergraduate Programs for Music Teacher Preparation in Canadian Colleges and Universities. Thesis. D. Ed. University of Illinois. 1972.
- Paulson, Leonard Evert. Evaluation of Music Programs in Selected Secondary Schools in Nebraska. Thesis. Ed. D. Music. University of Nebraska. 1963.

## APPENDIX A

## The Jury

Reynold Krueger  
University of North Dakota  
Department of Music  
Box 8124, University Station  
GRAND FORKS, NORTH DAKOTA  
58202

John Standing  
Kelvin High School  
155 Kingsway  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R3M 0G3

Alan Janzen  
Department of Education  
Curriculum Development and  
Education Branch  
1181 Portage Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB

Pat Stefanchuk  
Music Supervisor  
Seven Oaks School Division  
375 Jefferson Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2V 0N4

Garry Froese  
School of Music  
Brandon University  
BRANDON, MB  
R7A 6A9

## APPENDIX B

## The Teachers

Anderson, G. B.  
Daniel McIntyre Collegiate  
720 Alverstone Street  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R3E 2H1

Askholm, D. W.  
Elmwood High School  
505 Chalmers Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2L 0G4

Hart, Marion  
Maples Collegiate  
1330 Jefferson Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2P 1L3

Hildebrand, E. P.  
Steinbach Regional  
Secondary School  
Box 2380  
STEINBACH, MB  
R0A 2A0

Kristjanson, Liz  
Fort Richmond Collegiate  
99 Killarney Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R3T 3B3

Morphy, Derek  
Glenlawn Collegiate  
770 St. Mary's  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2M 3N7

O'Hara, Sharon  
Frontier Collegiate  
CRANBERRY PORTAGE, MB  
R0B 0H0

Orchard, Pat  
Margaret Barbour  
Collegiate  
Box 1169  
THE PAS, MB

Perry, K. V.  
Peguis Central  
Box 220  
HODGSON, MB  
R0C 1N0

Shaw, Grant D.  
Tech-Vocational  
High School  
1555 Wall Street  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R3E 2S2

Stewart, J. J.  
John Taylor Collegiate  
470 Hanilton Avenue  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2Y 0H4

Waldie, Bruce  
College Louis-Riel  
585 St. Jean Baptiste St.  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R2H 2Y2

Wiebe, Gayle  
Westgate Mennonite  
Collegiate  
86 Westgate  
WINNIPEG, MB  
R3C 2E1

## APPENDIX C

## Letter to the Jury

Ethel Johnston  
Box 1132  
THE PAS, MB  
R9A 1L1  
May 13, 1986

Dear

I am writing to ask for your assistance with a study I am completing for the Masters of Education program at the University of Manitoba. It is entitled "The development of a set of criteria for evaluating high school choral programmes."

You have been chosen as a member of a select group of five experts, based on your professional expertise. As a means of establishing a set of criteria for this study, I have gathered materials from recognized relevant literature, my thesis advisor and committee. I submit this preliminary survey to you for your assessment. Analysis of the results will then be used to develop a final survey to be sent to high school choral directors in the Province of Manitoba.

I realize that your professional commitments are numerous and I am hesitant to add to your busy schedule. However, I feel that your response will add considerable validity to this study. In appreciation for your involvement, I will be pleased to forward a summary of findings to you once the study has been completed.

Due to the small sample population and the preliminary nature of this survey, I would request that you complete and return the enclosed survey by May 23, 1986 in the envelope provided. I would appreciate any comments or opinions you may have concerning this study.

Yours sincerely,

Ethel Johnston

## APPENDIX D

The Jury's Questionnaire  
and Responses

Please rate the importance of the following statements as they relate to the high school choral programme. Please circle the appropriate number.

PHILOSOPHICAL CONSIDERATIONS OF PROGRAMME DESIGN	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
1. The expressive arts are important in the culture of man as a means of communicating innermost thoughts.	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
2. The high school music programme should be considered as an avenue for aesthetic education, that is, education in the expressive nature of the world of sound.	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
3. Choral programmes should provide the environment for students to develop an understanding of the role of the arts in society.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
4. Choral options should be open to all students.	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
5. Choral options should be scheduled so that all students are able to participate.	5	0	0	0	5	1	1
6. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an interview to establish their personal suitability.	0	0	4	1	5	2.6	10*
7. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an audition to establish vocal qualities.	1	4	0	0	5	1.8	5
8. Choral class should be a laboratory for the development of musical awareness and aesthetic sensitivity.	2	2	1	0	5	1.8	5

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
9. Choral class should include the following components:							
a) history	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
b) aural training	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
c) theory	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
d) sight reading	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
e) vocal training	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
10. Students should be evaluated by the following means:							
a) on an individual basis to assess vocal independence	1	2	2	0	5	2.2	7
b) in a small ensemble	0	4	1	0	5	2.2	7
c) on the basis of written work	0	2	2	1	5	3.6	14*
d) on attendance	2	2	1	0	5	1.8	5
e) other (specify)							
11. Students should be assigned:							
a) a letter grade	3	2	0	0	5	2.2	7
b) pass or fail	0	0	2	1	3	3.3	12*
12. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme.	1	2	1	0	4	2.0	6
13. Students electing the choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.	0	0	3	2	5	2.4	8
14. The use of a rote process in technical drill is an appropriate methodology to use when learning repertoire in all cases.	0	1	1	3	5	3.4	13*

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
15. Public performances are an important aspect of choral options.	5	0	0	0	5	1.0	1
16. Public performances should be an outgrowth of what is being studied in the classroom.	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
17. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.	0	3	2	0	5	2.4	8
18. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.	0	4	1	0	5	2.2	7
19. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups.	2	3	0	0	5	1.6	4
20. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
21. Repertoire should be selected to provide for sequential music learning to suit curricular needs.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
22. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to study a wide variety of musics, representing different styles and cultures.	5	0	0	0	5	1	1
23. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussions, aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
24. Please rate the importance of each of the following indicators of programme success:							
a) evaluation of peers	1	2	2	0	5	2.2	7
b) administrative support	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
c) audience and community support	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
d) number of students enrolled	0	4	1	0	5	2.4	8
e) number of choral groups in programme	0	2	2	0	4	2.5	9
f) number of students continuing in university music programmes	0	2	3	0	5	2.6	10*
g) student marks	0	3	0	1	4	2.5	9
h) student attitudes	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	3
i) kinds of concerts students attend	0	3	2	0	5	2.4	8
j) kinds of records students buy	0	0	5	0	5	3.0	11*
k) festival rating	0	2	3	0	5	2.6	10*



## Instructional Objectives

The curriculum guide lists instructional objectives under each of the above categories. Rate the importance of the following objectives by circling the appropriate number. Please consider these objectives to be applied to a student who has completed the three-year choral programme.

- 1 very important  
 2 important  
 3 of little importance  
 4 of no importance

**Choral Skills (Expressive) -  
 Instructional Objectives**

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
1. Demonstrate ability to change dynamic level.	5	0	0	0	5	1.0	1
2. Demonstrate ability to analyze a melody in terms of phrasing, form and climax.	2	3	0	0	5	1.6	3
3. Demonstrate a positive group spirit and display proper rehearsal behavior,	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	2
4. Demonstrate ability to lead sections or conduct indicating interpretive skills.	0	4	1	0	5	2.2	4
5. Write a melody to a given text with simple bass lines.	0	1	3	1	5	3.0	5*
6. Perform music in different languages.	1	2	2	0	5	2.2	4
7. Demonstrate ability to describe, in objective terms, how composers utilize musical elements to achieve expressive qualities.	1	2	2	0	5	2.2	4

**Choral Skills (Technical)**

1. Be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism.	2	0	3	0	5	2.2	5
2. Be able to produce a supported, focused sound when singing, and to solve common problems of tone quality.	4	1	0	0	5	1.2	1

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
3. Be able to explain why pitch problems occur and be able to offer solutions.	1	3	1	0	5	2.0	4
4. Be able to sing a difficult melody or part.	2	2	1	0	5	1.8	3
5. Be able to sing in languages other than English.	1	4	0	0	5	1.8	3
6. Be able to follow conductors beat patterns in 5 and 7.	0	5	0	0	5	2.0	4
7. Be able to conduct choir in meters of 2, 3 and 4.	0	5	0	0	5	2.0	4
8. Demonstrate vocal independence.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	2

#### Theory/Aural Skills -

1. Be able to understand musical notation, including traditional and non-traditional means.	2	3	0	0	5	1.6	1
2. Interpret, write and perform all time signatures in simple, compound, or irregular meters.	1	3	1	0	5	2.0	3
3. Identify and be able to write all major and minor keys.	2	2	0	1	5	2.0	3
4. Identify modulations to dominant or relative minor.	0	3	1	1	5	2.6	5*
5. Understand intervals, chords and cadences.	1	3	1	0	5	2.0	3
6. Understand musical form and be able to identify these from written and aural examples.	1	3	0	1	5	2.2	4

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
7. Be able to identify musical terminology and how composers use these to express mood.	1	4	0	0	5	1.8	2
8. Be able to sight-read a given piece of music.	2	3	0	0	5	1.6	1

### History

1. Understand the meaning of historical era and the implications concerning composing and performance practice.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	1
2. Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.	0	5	0	0	5	2.0	4
3. Know the chronological order and dates of music eras.	0	4	1	0	5	2.2	5
4. Be able to relate studied repertoire to historical era and performance practise.	2	2	1	0	5	1.8	3
5. Describe the development of the orchestra.	0	1	4	0	5	2.8	6*
6. Have a knowledge of several composers of each era and be able to discuss their contribution.	2	2	1	0	5	1.8	3
7. Demonstrate proper performance practise through singing.	3	2	0	0	5	1.4	1
8. Classify representative repertoire by era after listening to it.	2	3	0	0	5	1.6	2

## APPENDIX E

## Letters to the Teachers

Ethel Johnston  
Box 1132  
THE PAS, MB  
R9A 1L1  
May 29, 1986

Dear Colleague:

I am writing to ask for your assistance with a study I am completing for the Masters of Education programme at the University of Manitoba. It is entitled, "The development of a set of criteria for evaluating high school choral programmes."

The sample population for this survey is relatively small and is composed of those music directors involved with the Choral Music option, course numbers 105, 205, 305. If by chance you are not involved in this credit programme, please indicate on the survey and return in the envelope provided. If you are teaching this option, please complete the enclosed questionnaire and return it in the envelope provided by June 18, 1986.

I realize that your professional commitments are numerous, especially at this time of year and I am hesitant to add to your busy schedule. However, your responses are critical to the success of this study.

In appreciation for your involvement, I will be pleased to forward a summary of findings to you once the study has been completed.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Yours sincerely

---

ETHEL JOHNSTON

Box 1132  
The Pas, Manitoba  
R9A 1L1

June 18, 1986

Dear Colleague:

Approximately two weeks ago you were sent a survey regarding high school choral programmes. Although the initial response has been very positive, a higher percentage of returns is required in order to ensure the success of this study.

Please take the time to complete and return the questionnaire in the envelope provided. If you have already done so please accept my thanks and disregard this notice.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Yours sincerely,

Ethel Johnston

## APPENDIX F

The Teachers' Questionnaire  
and ResponsesSection A General Information

1. Name of School \_\_\_\_\_
2. Name of Division \_\_\_\_\_
3. Number of students enrolled in Grade 10 \_\_\_\_\_  
Grade 11 \_\_\_\_\_  
Grade 12 \_\_\_\_\_
4. Number of students enrolled in Music 105 Choral \_\_\_\_\_  
Music 205 Choral \_\_\_\_\_  
Music 305 Choral \_\_\_\_\_
5. Circle the number that best describes the average size of a choral class:  
10-14    15-19    20-24    25-29    30-35    more \_\_\_\_\_
6. Circle the number that best describes the optimum size of a choral class:  
10-14    15-10    20-24    25-29    30-35    more \_\_\_\_\_
7. Circle the number of minutes per week that comes closest to the actual class time spent in choral programmes in your school:  
35-40    60    80    100    120    more \_\_\_\_\_
8. Circle the number of minutes per week which would reflect the optimum class time:  
35-40    60    80    100    120    more \_\_\_\_\_
9. Circle the actual number of public performances scheduled for a choral group in a school year:  
0    1    2    3    4    5    6    7    8    9    more \_\_\_\_\_
10. Circle the optimum number of public performances a choral group should give in a school year:  
0    1    2    3    4    5    6    7    8    9    more \_\_\_\_\_

11. Circle the kinds of choral groups included in your choral programme and please indicate the numbers in each group:

concert group \_\_\_\_\_

jazz/show choir \_\_\_\_\_

chamber group \_\_\_\_\_

boys octet \_\_\_\_\_

girls choir \_\_\_\_\_

madrigal group \_\_\_\_\_

mixed octet \_\_\_\_\_

mixed chorus \_\_\_\_\_

girls sextet \_\_\_\_\_

boys choir \_\_\_\_\_

other \_\_\_\_\_

12. If you had the chance would you increase the number of choral groups in your programme? yes/no

If yes, how (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

If no, why (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

Please rate the importance of the following statements as they relate to the high school choral programme.

PHILOSOPHICAL CONSIDERATIONS OF PROGRAMME DESIGN	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
1. The expressive arts are important in the culture of man as a means of communicating innermost thoughts.	10	2	1	0	13	1.3	3
2. The high school music programme should be considered as an avenue for aesthetic education, that is, education in the expressive nature of sound.	10	2	1	0	13	1.3	3
3. Choral programmes should provide the environment for students to develop an understanding of the role of the arts in society.	9	4	0	0	13	1.3	3
4. Choral options should be open to all students.	11	2	0	0	13	1.15	2
5. Choral options should be scheduled so that all students are able to participate.	11	1	0	0	12	1.08	1
6. Students electing to take choral options should be required to attend an audition to establish vocal qualities.	4	5	2	2	13	2.15	14
7. Choral class should be a laboratory for the development of musical awareness and aesthetic sensitivity.	10	2	1	0	13	1.3	3
8. Choral class should include the following components:							
a) history	2	6	3	2	13	2.38	17
b) aural training	7	6	0	0	13	1.46	6
c) theory	3	7	3	0	13	2.0	12
d) sight reading	5	8	0	0	13	1.61	9
e) vocal training	12	0	1	0	13	1.15	2



	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
9. Students should be evaluated by the following means:							
a) on an individual basis to assess vocal independence	1	6	2	0	13	1.76	10
b) in a small ensemble	5	7	1	0	13	1.92	11
c) on the basis of written work	2	2	4	4	12	2.83	19
d) on attendance	6	6	1	0	13	1.61	9
e) on rehearsal behavior	7	6	0	0	13	1.46	6
f) on musicianship	8	5	0	0	13	1.38	4
10. Students should be assigned:							
a) a letter grade	6	5	0	0	11	1.45	5
b) pass/fail	4	1	0	3	8	2.25	16
11. School music productions should be a part of the choral programme.	3	7	2	1	13	2.07	13
12. Students electing the choral option should be encouraged to study voice privately.	2	5	5	1	13	2.38	17
13. A variety of methodologies should be employed during rehearsal so that students understand the expressive nature of the repertoire.	5	6	2	0	13	1.76	10
14. Public performances are an important aspect of choral options.	11	1	0	1	13	1.30	3
15. Public performances should be an outgrowth of what is being studied in the classroom.	10	2	0	1	13	1.38	4

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
16. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to learn basic conducting skills as a means of feeling the music and experimenting with interpretation.	0	7	5	1	13	2.53	17
17. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to create their own compositions.	0	1	10	2	13	3.23	20
18. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music formally through attendance at concerts of amateur and professional groups.	4	8	1	0	13	1.76	10
19. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity to experience music informally through in-class student performances and through listening experiences.	4	8	1	0	13	1.61	9
20. Repertoire should be selected to provide for sequential music learning to suit curricular needs.	7	4	1	0	12	1.5	7
21. Choral programmes should provide the opportunity for students to study a wide variety of musics, representing different styles and culture.	11	2	0	0	13	1.15	2
22. Choral programmes should provide the opportunities for student discussions, aimed at developing critical or discriminatory skills.	2	9	1	1	13	2.07	13

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
23. Please rate the importance of each of the following indicators of programme success:							
a) evaluation by peers	3	4	3	1	11	2.18	15
b) administrative support	8	3	2	0	13	1.53	8
c) audience and community support	8	2	3	0	13	1.53	8
d) number of students enrolled	5	6	2	0	13	1.61	9
e) number of choral groups in programme	2	5	5	1	13	2.38	17
f) student marks	0	5	8	0	13	2.6	18
g) student attitudes	11	2	0	0	13	1.15	2
h) kinds of concerts students attend	1	7	4	1	13	2.38	17

## Instructional Objectives

The curriculum guide lists instructional objectives under each of the above categories. Rate the importance of the following objectives by circling the appropriate number. Please consider these objectives to be applied to a student who has completed the three-year choral programme.

- 1 very important  
 2 important  
 3 of little importance  
 4 of no importance

**Choral Skills (Expressive) -**  
 Instructional Objectives

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
1. Demonstrate ability to change dynamic level.	11	2	0	0	13	1.15	1
2. Demonstrate ability to analyze a melody in terms of phrasing, form and climax.	3	9	1	0	13	1.84	2
3. Demonstrate a positive group spirit and display proper rehearsal behavior.	12	0	1	0	13	1.15	1
4. Demonstrate ability to lead sections or conduct indicating interpretive skills	2	6	5	0	13	2.23	3
5. Write a melody to a given text with simple bass lines.	1	0	8	4	13	2.92	6*
6. Perform music in different languages.	2	3	6	1	12	2.5	4
7. Demonstrate ability to describe, in objective terms, how composers utilize musical elements to achieve expressive qualities.	1	4	4	4	13	2.84	5*

**Choral Skills (Technical)**

1. Be able to explain the physiology of the breathing mechanism.	5	6	2	0	13	1.76	3
2. Be able to produce a supported, focused sound when singing, and to solve common problems of tone quality.	11	2	0	0	13	1.15	1

	very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
3. Be able to explain why pitch problems occur and be able to offer solutions.	4	5	4	0	13	2.0	5
4. Be able to sing a difficult melody or part.	4	9	0	0	13	1.83	4
5. Be able to sing in languages other than English.	1	6	5	1	13	2.66	8
6. Be able to follow conductors beat patterns in 5 and 7.	4	5	3	1	13	2.25	7
7. Be able to conduct choir in meters of 2, 3 and 4.	2	7	4	0	13	2.15	6
8. Demonstrate vocal independence.	10	2	1	0	13	1.30	2

#### Theory/Aural Skills

1. Be able to understand musical notation, including traditional and non-traditional means.	5	6	1	0	12	1.6	2
2. Interpret, write and perform all time signatures in simple, compound, or irregular meters.	3	4	4	1	12	2.07	5
3. Identify and be able to write all major and minor keys.	1	3	8	0	12	2.33	6
4. Identify modulations to dominant or relative minor.	0	4	8	0	12	2.66	8*
5. Understand intervals, chords and cadences.	1	10	1	0	12	2.0	4
6. Understand musical form and be able to identify these from written and aural examples.	2	4	4	2	12	2.5	7

		very important	important	of little importance	of no importance	Total Responses	Rating Index	Rank
7.	Be able to identify musical terminology and how composers use these to express mood.	4	7	0	1	12	1.83	3
8.	Be able to sight-read a given piece of music.	5	7	0	0	12	1.58	1

### History

1.	Understand the meaning of historical era and the implications concerning composing and performance practice.	2	6	3	1	12	2.25	4
2.	Understand the impact of society and the other arts on music.	2	6	1	2	11	2.27	3
3.	Know the chronological order and dates of music eras.	0	6	2	3	11	2.7	6*
4.	Be able to relate studied repertoire to historical era and performance practice.	2	6	3	0	11	1.91	2
5.	Describe the development of the orchestra.	0	4	2	5	11	3.09	3
6.	Have a knowledge of several composers of each era and be able to discuss their contribution.	1	6	3	1	12	2.1	3
7.	Demonstrate proper performance practice through singing.	6	6	0	0	12	1.5	1
8.	Classify representative repertoire by era after listening to it.	2	6	3	1	12	2.25	4