

W.L. MORTON'S "BIAS OF PRAIRIE POLITICS" AS AN ANALYTICAL  
APPROACH TO THE STUDY OF WESTERN CANADIAN POLITICAL HISTORY:  
A HISTORIOGRAPHICAL CRITIQUE

by

John Allardyce

A thesis  
presented to the University of Manitoba  
in fulfillment of the  
thesis requirement for the degree of  
Masters Degree  
in  
History

Winnipeg, Manitoba

(c) John Allardyce, 1988

Permission has been granted to the National Library of Canada to microfilm this thesis and to lend or sell copies of the film.

The author (copyright owner) has reserved other publication rights, and neither the thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her written permission.

L'autorisation a été accordée à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de microfilmer cette thèse et de prêter ou de vendre des exemplaires du film.

L'auteur (titulaire du droit d'auteur) se réserve les autres droits de publication; ni la thèse ni de longs extraits de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation écrite.

ISBN 0-315-47866-7

W.L. MORTON'S "BIAS OF PRAIRIE POLITICS" AS AN ANALYTICAL  
APPROACH TO THE STUDY OF WESTERN CANADIAN POLITICAL HISTORY:  
A HISTORIOGRAPHICAL CRITIQUE

BY

JOHN ALLARDYCE

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies of  
the University of Manitoba in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
of the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

© 1988

Permission has been granted to the LIBRARY OF THE UNIVER-  
SITY OF MANITOBA to lend or sell copies of this thesis, to  
the NATIONAL LIBRARY OF CANADA to microfilm this  
thesis and to lend or sell copies of the film, and UNIVERSITY  
MICROFILMS to publish an abstract of this thesis.

The author reserves other publication rights, and neither the  
thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or other-  
wise reproduced without the author's written permission.

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this thesis.

I authorize the University of Manitoba to lend this thesis to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

John Allardyce

I further authorize the University of Manitoba to reproduce this thesis by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

John Allardyce

## PREFACE

The objective of the thesis is to trace the historiographical origins and echoes of W.L. Morton's "Bias of Prairie Politics." In order to understand Morton's theoretical orientation and evaluate the presuppositions of his analysis, the work begins with a survey of his predecessors. Morton's 1955 analysis is then examined through reference to his other works on western politics. Extent of influence and validity of the principal cornerstones are assessed in a survey of post-1955 historical works illuminating the interrelationship of regional discontent and political development in the period that Morton examined, exposing flaws and limitations in his analysis, and exploring the bases and political manifestations of recent western discontent. The process of historiographical critique concludes with an examination of disciplines other than history and of ethnic, class, labour, and social history, where the analysis of political development has not been conducted solely within the limiting confines of hinterland reaction to metropolitan domination, viewed by Morton as the primary catalyst to western political development.

## Chapter I

### INTRODUCTION

In his seminal article, "The Bias of Prairie Politics," W.L. Morton asserted that there had been a unique political development in the prairie provinces which could be divided into colonial, agrarian, and utopian periods, based on the evolution of the western attempt to gain political and economic equity with central Canada.<sup>1</sup> He asserted that the initial incident triggering the western tradition of inequality and discontent was the political subordination of the West under the terms of its entry into Confederation. The grant of provincial status to only a small area and retention by the Dominion of Manitoba's public lands began a struggle for political equity that dominated the "colonial period," 1870-1905, and was not resolved until 1930. The "colonial period" also saw the beginnings of the agrarian element and utopian sentiment that dominated the second and third phases of western political evolution. He concluded that a tradition of "inequality ... grievance ... and special claims" had been firmly established in the West.

---

<sup>1</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Bias of Prairie Politics," Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XLIX Section II (June 1955): 57-66.

Morton then argued that the western tradition of discontent was intensified during the "agrarian period," 1905-25, as increasing agrarian opposition to the protective tariff, eastern based monopolies, and the pro-tariff, business-controlled Conservatives and Liberals "dominated western politics" and climaxed in the formation of the Progressive party. The Progressives won only piecemeal reform, however, due to the inherent limitations of agrarian sectionalism. The failure of the agrarian bloc necessitated, in Morton's opinion, a further evolution of western political discontent.

Morton's last phase of western struggle against the "political and economic controls, but not the institutional foundations, of the nation" was the "utopian period," 1925-55. Defined as a "readiness to adopt untried methods to achieve ideal ends," utopianism culminated in the Social Credit victory in Alberta in 1935. In Morton's opinion, these three stages constituted a unique political development, the result of a "cumulative historical process" acting on the initial "bias."

## Chapter II

### MORTON'S PREDECESSORS: INFLUENCE AND ENLIGHTENMENT

W.L. Morton's works were not the first to examine the effect of the western struggle against metropolitan domination on prairie political development. Analyses of this kind had a tentative beginning in early histories of the new province of Manitoba, though the overall tone of these works remained consistent with the prevailing "optimistic and romantic style of western historiography."<sup>1</sup> The best account of early regional discontent is found in A. Begg's three volume History of the North-West, published in 1894 and 1895. Foreshadowing Morton's analysis of political development in the "colonial period," Begg described the development of regional discontent nurtured by the struggles over public lands, federal subsidies, boundary extensions, federal railway and land policies, freight rates, the protective tariff, and responsible government and noted the influence of the provincial rights movement on the development of party lines in Manitoba.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> T.D. Regehr, "Historiography of the Canadian Plains after 1870," in A Region of the Mind: Interpreting the Western Canadian Plains, ed. R. Allen (Regina: Canadian Plains Studies Center, 1973), pp. 87-89, 94.

<sup>2</sup> A. Begg, History of the North-West, vol. II (Toronto: Hunter, Rose, and Co., 1894), pp. 94-95, 102-6, 113, 149,



Analysis of the western response to metropolitan domination and its ramifications for political development assumed a more prominent place in western historiography in the first sympathetic accounts of western agrarian opposition to federal tariff policy and metropolitan economic and political domination; in essence, the primary grievances of Morton's "agrarian period." Most of these works, exhibiting strong physiocratic sentiments, also noted that the agrarian revolt possessed national dimensions as many eastern farmers also opposed "big business" domination. Early works<sup>3</sup> evidencing these characteristics included A. Macphail's 1909 Essays in Politics, three works published between 1911 and 1920 by E. Porritt, an English free trader, The Revolt in Canada Against the New Feudalism, Sixty Years of Protection

---

194-97, 253-54, 289-90, 313-16, 335-52, 367-85; History of the North-West, Vol. III (Toronto: Hunter, Rose, and Co., 1895), pp. 60-63, 72-78, 85-97, 116-56, 161-74, 301-4, 336, 352-53, 358-92; These themes also appeared in G. Bryce, A History of Manitoba: Its Resources and People (Toronto: The Canada History Co., 1906), pp. 182-87, 215-20, 260-67, 281-82 and C. Martin, "Political History of Manitoba, 1870-1912," in Canada and Its Provinces: A History of the Canadian People and Their Institutions, vol. XIX: The Prairie Provinces, eds. A. Shortt and A.G. Doughty (Toronto: Edinburgh University Press, 1914), pp. 108-39.

<sup>3</sup> A. Macphail, Essays in Politics (London: Longmans, Green and Co. Ltd., 1909); E. Porritt, The Revolt in Canada Against the New Feudalism (London: Cassel and Co. Ltd., 1911); E. Porritt and A.G. Porritt, Sixty Years of Protection in Canada, 1846-1912, 2nd ed. (Winnipeg: Grain Growers' Guide, 1913); E. Porritt, Canada's Protective Tariff (Winnipeg: Grain Growers' Guide, 1920); C.W. Peterson, Wake Up, Canada! Reflections on Vital National Issues (Toronto: The Macmillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1919); W.C. Good, Production and Taxation in Canada From the Farmers' Standpoint (Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1919); C. Ager, The Farmer and the Interests: A Study in Economic Parasitism (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd.,

in Canada 1846-1912, and Canada's Protective Tariff, C.W. Peterson's 1919 Wake Up, Canada! Reflections on Vital National Issues, W.C. Good's 1919 Production and Taxation in Canada From the Farmers' Standpoint, and C. Ager's 1916 The Farmer and the Interests: A Study in Economic Parasitism. Though enlightening in their indictment of metropolitan hegemony, the scope of these works did not include a detailed description of the organizational development of the western agrarian revolt and the effect of regional discontent on western politics.

The first work to partially address this need was H. Moorhouse's Deep Furrows, published in 1918. In a sympathetic account of the western agrarian revolt, Moorhouse examined agrarian economic grievances, the formation of the Grain Growers' Associations and cooperative ventures, and the campaign for favourable legislation.<sup>4</sup> His work, however, ignored many of the early political developments and successes of the agrarian movement, organizational developments before the turn of the century, and parallels with American and Ontario agrarian experiences.

In 1924, these shortcomings were largely redressed in L.A. Wood's more scholarly A History of Farmers' Movements in Canada: The Origins and Development of Agrarian Protest, 1872-1924. Wood elaborated on the evolution and political

---

1916).

<sup>4</sup> H. Moorhouse, Deep Furrows (Winnipeg: G.J. McLeod Ltd., 1918).

and economic successes of cooperative and marketing agencies and agrarian organizations from the Farmers' Protective Union to the Progressive Party, based on the continuity of agrarian opposition to metropolitan economic and political domination.<sup>5</sup> Like many of his contemporaries, Wood argued that the Progressive phenomenon was more than a western agrarian protest. The Grange, which had entered Canada through Ontario in the 1870's, was the "tap-root" from which all other movements developed. Its struggle against "big business" domination of economic and political life foreshadowed the major concern of the later western agrarian organizations. The Patrons of Industry, the Farmers' Association of Ontario, and the U.F.O. inherited and expanded the Grange's tradition of protest while sharing much in common with the western agrarian movement.<sup>6</sup> Despite emphasizing their many shared concerns, never did Wood argue that there existed a complete uniformity of interests and views between eastern and western farmers. But more so than would Morton, Wood placed the western agrarian revolt in a national context. Lastly, Wood noted the American origin of a number of Canadian agrarian organizations<sup>7</sup> but did not devote the same

---

<sup>5</sup> L.A. Wood, A History of Farmers' Movements in Canada: The Origins and Development of Agrarian Protest, 1872-1924 (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1924), pp. 65, 69, 123-28, 143-46, 159-261, 285-301, 311-64; In 1950, in his bibliographical essay appended to The Progressive Party, p. 318, Morton called this work the best "general history of its subject."

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., pp. 13, 41, 45-48, 65, 73-105, 109-54, 205-6, 215, 234-66, 273-84, 291, 301-13, 329-31, 343-51.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., pp. 21-27, 45-46, 73-75, 104-5, 109-10, 124, 159,

attention to this commonality of experience as he did that shared by Canadian farmers.

Among the early writers on the farmers' movement were two of its prominent members, W. Irvine and E.A. Partridge. Their works illustrated the intensity of western opposition to metropolitan political and economic domination and the utopian sentiment prevalent in the western agrarian community at the time. Irvine authored two works, The Farmers in Politics in 1920 and Cooperative Government in 1929, both primarily theoretical and propagandist. Echoing Porritt, Irvine attacked the two-party system and majoritarian democracy as corrupt, unrepresentative, and controlled by the plutocracy. As an alternative, Irvine advocated H.W. Wood's concept of group government based on the principles of organization on economic lines, occupational representation, and cooperation succeeding competition among the various interest groups, culminating in the attainment of the Cooperative Commonwealth.<sup>8</sup> The concept of a Cooperative Commonwealth also figured prominently in Partridge's 1925 A War on Poverty: The One War That Can End War. Partridge attacked the domination of the New Feudalism and called for the replacement of the "capitalist-competitive system" with "communal cooperation" in a new political state to be formed

---

199-201, 285-96.

<sup>8</sup> W. Irvine, The Farmers in Politics (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1920), pp. 9-253; Cooperative Government (Ottawa: Mutual Press Ltd., 1929), pp. 1-246.

in the West.<sup>9</sup>

Turning from general to more specific works, the Dominion government also came under attack in the 1920's for its control of public lands. This issue was addressed by Chester Martin<sup>10</sup> in four works published before the return of public lands in 1930. In "The Natural Resources Question": The Historical Basis of Provincial Claims and "The First 'New Province' of the Dominion," published in 1920, "The Colonial Policy of the Dominion," published in 1922, and "Confederation and the West," published in 1927, Martin conceded that the Dominion had legitimate reasons for alienating public lands but, nonetheless, called its actions an unjustified departure from fundamental British principles that smacked of "colonial subordination." He argued that the resulting impoverishment of the Manitoba government raised the local level of discontent more than any other issue. Of the imminent transfer of public lands to provincial control, Martin observed that the "three Canadian colonies" would finally achieve "full provincial status." In his opinion, the attainment of constitutional maturity represented the principal thrust of Territorial development.<sup>11</sup> After the return

---

<sup>9</sup> E.A. Partridge, A War on Poverty: The One War That Can End War (Winnipeg: Wallingford Press Ltd., 1925), pp. V-XII, 1-225.

<sup>10</sup> Martin was the first professional historian to contribute to the historiography of western Canada; L.G. Thomas, "Historiography of the Fur Trade Era," Alberta Historical Review 17 no. 1 (Winter 1969): 25-26.

<sup>11</sup> C. Martin, "The Natural Resources Question": The Historical Basis of Provincial Claims (Winnipeg: Saults and Pol-

of public lands, Martin, in 1931, in "The Completion of Confederation," repeated his charges against the Dominion government but argued that a Confederation of equal provinces had finally been achieved. He also concluded that no real hostility had ever existed between the West and the Dominion over the public lands issue.<sup>12</sup>

Martin's arguments exhibited serious shortcomings. As well as possessing a strong regional bias, he overemphasized constitutional progress at the expense of social, economic, and political grievances, resulting in his failure to understand that the return of public lands did not ensure full equality in Confederation. Additionally, his assertion in 1931 that no real hostility had been generated by the public lands dispute contradicted his earlier findings. Nonetheless, his work shed light on a contentious issue in "metropolis-hinterland" relations that influenced political development and his claim that the West suffered "colonial subordination" foreshadowed the basis of Morton's first stage of western political evolution.

---

lard Ltd., 1920), pp. 9-131; "The First 'New Province' of the Dominion," Canadian Historical Review 1 no. 4 (December 1920): 354-78; "The Colonial Policy of the Dominion," Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XVI Section II (1922): 46; "Confederation and the West," Canadian Historical Association Report (1927): 20, 24.

<sup>12</sup> C. Martin, "The Completion of Confederation," Queen's Quarterly 38 (Spring 1931): 197-210.

Another aspect of early regional discontent, the grain marketing system and resultant agrarian cooperative response, was examined in a number of works. However, a reading of W.A. Mackintosh's 1924 Agricultural Cooperation in Western Canada, H.S. Patton's 1928 Grain Growers' Cooperation in Western Canada, W.W. Swanson's and P.C. Armstrong's 1930 Wheat, and D.A. MacGibbon's 1932 The Canadian Grain Trade, suggests that western criticism of the shortcomings of the grain marketing system was often more severe than the facts warranted,<sup>13</sup> a conclusion somewhat opposed in spirit to the findings of the works examined above and one that weakens Morton's claim of "economic subordination." A recurring theme in the analysis of the effect of regional discontent on political development also emerges from these works; Westerners' perceptions of their environment have often failed to jibe with the objective reality of their situation, leading to exaggerated claims of metropolitan

---

<sup>13</sup> W.A. Mackintosh, Agricultural Cooperation in Western Canada (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1924), pp. 8-15, 23; H.S. Patton, Grain Growers' Cooperation in Western Canada (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1928), pp. 11-40, 130-37, 397; W.W. Swanson and P.C. Armstrong, Wheat (Toronto: The Macmillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1930), pp. 20-25, 31-35, 76-99, 110-12, 121-69, 244-45, 250-72, 281-82; D.A. MacGibbon, The Canadian Grain Trade (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1932), pp. 37-38, 43-54, 65-67, 88, 95-98, 126-27, 136-39, 150-64, 301-3, 375; In 1952, MacGibbon authored a second work on the same topic; The Canadian Grain Trade, 1931-1951 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1952); Two additional early works shed light on the cooperative and wheat pool movements as a response to metropolitan economic domination; H. Boyd, New Breaking: An Outline of Cooperation Among the Farmers of Western Canada (Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1938); H.A. Innis, ed., The Diary of Alexander James Macphail (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1940).

domination and discrimination.

Still another dimension of metropolitan hegemony and regional discontent was examined in the last work of this genre to be considered, H.A. Innis's A History of the Canadian Pacific Railway, published in 1923. Innis contended that the C.P.R. had charged unreasonably high freight rates in the West and concluded that the West had "paid for the development of Canadian nationality, and it would appear that it must continue to pay."<sup>14</sup> Here was a conclusion closer to the theme of "colonial subordination" and one which taken in conjunction with the findings of these other early works established a tradition of metropolitan domination and western response in western historiography that would culminate in W.L. Morton's works.

Inevitably, studies of the western agrarian revolt produced comparisons with the American frontier experience and evaluations of the applicability of the Turner frontier thesis to the Canadian West. Underlying this historiographical shift were sentiments of nationalism, independence, isolationism, and continentalism in the post-war period, a growing concern with social and economic issues, and a belief that Canadian historiography had overemphasized Canada's European heritage, trivialized regional history, and largely ignored the effect of the North American environment on

---

<sup>14</sup> H.A. Innis, A History of the Canadian Pacific Railway (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1923), pp. 173-96, 269, 293-94.



inherited political institutions.<sup>15</sup> This new school of historians, in their concern with frontierism and continentalism, inevitably downplayed the shared concerns of contemporary Ontario and western farmers noted by L.A. Wood and others and failed to explore the full impact of metropolitan domination on western political development, the beginnings of which had been made in these early works.

The first continental interpretation of western political development appeared in 1928, W.N. Sage's "Some Aspects of the Frontier in Canadian History." Sage argued that Canada and the United States had shared one frontier and a similar debtor status had led to the common response of organization of agrarian political parties and cooperative societies.<sup>16</sup> The concept of a shared frontier was reasserted in 1940 by M.L. Hansen and J.B. Brebner in The Mingling of the Canadian and American Peoples. Like Sage, however, Hansen and Brebner did not pursue the political ramifications of this phenomenon.<sup>17</sup> Another historian whose continental, frontierist interpretation lacked elaboration was F.H. Underhill. In

---

<sup>15</sup> Regehr, "Historiography," pp. 89-90; C. Berger, The Writing of Canadian History : Aspects of English-Canadian Historical Writing: 1900-1970 (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976), pp. 32-55, 61-66, 76-79, 118-20, 137-56, 169, 176, 259-60, 262; J.M.S. Careless, "Frontierism, Metropolitanism, and Canadian History," Canadian Historical Review 35 no. 1 (March 1954): 2-6.

<sup>16</sup> W.N. Sage, "Some Aspects of the Frontier in Canadian History," Canadian Historical Association Report (1928): 62-72.

<sup>17</sup> M.L. Hansen and J.B. Brebner, The Mingling of the Canadian and American Peoples (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1940), pp. 18, 219-35.

1927, in "Some Aspects of Upper Canadian Radical Opinion in the Decade Before Confederation," and 1935, in "The Development of National Political Parties in Canada," Underhill suggested briefly that Progressivism was a revival of Clear Grit frontier radicalism, necessitated by big business control of the national economy and both established political parties,<sup>18</sup> but went no further in his analysis.

Other historians of this era did not unquestioningly accept a continental interpretation of western Canadian development, though none denied the many parallels between Canadian and American experience. W.B. Munro, in 1929, in American Influences on Canadian Government, noted that the West showed the same "liberal, democratic, and progressive" tendencies as the American West. Still, he concluded that Canada should not "lightly cast aside" governmental traditions inherited from England.<sup>19</sup> In 1931, J.B. Brebner, in "Canada and North American History," emphasized the "remarkable analogies" between the Canadian and American political systems. But, he warned, there were differences such as the shorter, less intense, and more orderly and peaceful Canadian frontier period that could only be explained by recogniz-

---

<sup>18</sup> F.H. Underhill, "Some Aspects of Upper Canadian Radical Opinion in the Decade Before Confederation," Canadian Historical Association Report (1927): 48-49, 61; "The Development of National Political Parties in Canada," Canadian Historical Review 16 no. 4 (December 1935): 386.

<sup>19</sup> W.B. Munro, American Influences on Canadian Government (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1929), pp. 57-61, 92-98, 140-43.

ing Canada's metropolitan heritage.<sup>20</sup> In J.W. Dafoe's 1935 work, Canada: An American Nation, Dafoe emphasized Canada's "North Americanness," yet argued that "there was everywhere in Canada an acceptance of the British methods of government."<sup>21</sup>

Nowhere was the balance or contradiction of heredity and environment more apparent than in the writings of A.R.M. Lower. In 1929 and 1930, in "Some Neglected Aspects of Canadian History" and "The Origins of Democracy in Canada," Lower argued that institutional development was the product of tradition and environment, with the latter a largely unexplored field.<sup>22</sup> Referring to western discontent, Lower argued that the campaign for direct legislation and opposition to chartered banks and established political parties were examples of a typical frontier spirit. This spirit was not, however, as "intense and prolonged" as its American counterpart due to a smaller frontier and stronger old world ties.<sup>23</sup>

For a number of reasons suggested in these works, no historian emerged as the Canadian counterpart to Turner. Comparisons of frontier experience were limited due to the

---

<sup>20</sup> J.B. Brebner, "Canadian and North American History," Canadian Historical Association Report (1931): 37-48.

<sup>21</sup> J.W. Dafoe, Canada: An American Nation (New York: Columbia University Press, 1935), pp. 6, 53-54, 73-74.

<sup>22</sup> A.R.M. Lower, "Some Neglected Aspects of Canadian History," Canadian Historical Association Report (1929): 65-71; "The Origins of Democracy in Canada," Canadian Historical Association Report (1930): 65-70.

<sup>23</sup> Lower, "Origins of Democracy," pp. 68-70.

realization that strong British political traditions still existed, the Canadian frontier experience was shorter and more peaceful than the American, and the Canadian metropolis had been far more predominant in western development than its American counterpart. The exposure of the inadequacies of Turner's thesis when applied to the Canadian frontier did not, however, mean a total rejection of continentalism and the formative influence of environmental factors. Recognition of certain shared agrarian experiences and respect for the environment in conjunction with the growing realization that prairie political development could more readily be explained through the study of the interaction of metropolis and hinterland would provide the historiographical backdrop to Morton's analysis of western political development.

The exploration of the political ramifications of the continental agrarian experience was also curtailed by the shifting of academic attention to the immediate and critical problems created by the depression. The result was an outpouring of works, the most important for Westerners being the Frontiers of Settlement Series, produced in conjunction with American authorities between 1934 and 1940. Researched by geographers, economists, sociologists, and historians, the Series' nine studies represented an "examination of the conditions and processes of settlement as exemplified in contemporary Canadian experience."<sup>24</sup> Concentrating on social

---

<sup>24</sup> W.A. Mackintosh, Prairie Settlement: The Geographical Setting, Canadian Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 1 (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1934), p. XV.

and economic issues, they reflected an environmental approach but never a "full endorsement of the Turnerian hypothesis."<sup>25</sup> They contained "very little about the political history of the plains during the settlement period"<sup>26</sup> but, nonetheless, contributed to the evolution of the historiography of prairie political development.

The second volume of the series, composed of two studies and published in 1938, warrants examination for its contribution to understanding regional political discontent. In the first study, History of Prairie Settlement, A.S. Morton briefly described the major concerns of the western agrarian community, including transportation, marketing, the tariff, and public lands, and the organizational development of the Farmers' Union, Settlers' Union, the Patrons, the Grain Growers' Associations, and cooperative societies. Brief mention was also made of the American roots of the Farmers' Union and the Patrons. Morton's emphasis on the farmers' attempt "to organize themselves for the defence of their interests in the face of the overpowering influence of the East"<sup>27</sup> was clearly a reflection of the growing realization by western historians that western political development had to be viewed as a product of the interaction of metropolis

---

<sup>25</sup> Regehr, "Historiography," pp. 91-92.

<sup>26</sup> Ibid., p. 93.

<sup>27</sup> A.S. Morton and C. Martin, History of Prairie Settlement and "Dominion Lands" Policy, Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 2 part 1 (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1938), pp. 66-68, 73, 93-95, 115-18, 128-31, 164-70.

and frontier.

In the second study, "Dominion Lands" Policy, Chester Martin once again examined the issue of public lands; however, he now defended the Dominion's actions in 1870 and 1905, arguing that the "twin problems of railway and settlement" were the key to national expansion, a "national necessity" that could be attained "only by policies truly national in their scope."<sup>28</sup> Martin admitted, however, that Dominion land policy had made the federal government a "veritable empire" and had generated considerable discontent in the West over the issues of public lands, financial compensation, land-lock, and monopoly.<sup>29</sup> Benefitting from hindsight, he realized that despite the return of public lands in 1930, "many of the basic problems of the Prairie Provinces have yet to be solved in permanent or substantial proportions."<sup>30</sup> Overall, both Morton and Martin, in their examination of grievances that constituted the foundation of W.L. Morton's first two stages of western political development, contributed to the growing historiography of regional discontent that provided the background to Morton's writings on the subject.

---

<sup>28</sup> A.S. Morton and C. Martin, History of Prairie Settlement and "Dominion Lands" Policy, part 2, pp. 196, 223-28, 369, 402-3, 433, 466-71, 478-80, 504-5; Martin again stressed the necessity of strong federal government action in Foundations of Canadian Nationhood (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955), pp. 399, 434-69.

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 196, 223, 239, 274, 330, 399-400, 467, 472-78, 505.

<sup>30</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 493-94.

Despite increasing interest in the 1930's in social and economic issues, historical works were still being produced that shed light on western political development. In 1931, covering ground that Morton would later examine, J.W. Dafoe, in Clifford Sifton in Relation To His Times, touched on the major political occurrences of Sifton's era that fostered the growth of provincial rights sentiment and hostility to the federal government in the West.<sup>31</sup> G.F.G. Stanley, in The Birth of Western Canada: A History of the Riel Rebellions, published in 1936, focussed mainly on the Metis rebellions of 1869-70 and 1885 but also provided the most extensive account yet written of the North-West agrarian community's economic and political grievances, its first attempt at organization, the Settlers' Union, and its cooperation with the Metis, prior to the outbreak of violence.<sup>32</sup> Stanley also refuted the frontier thesis, arguing that underlying the conflict between East and West were the natural differences between "an agricultural area forced to sell its produce in a world market and an industrial area disposing of its goods in a protected market." Canada's frontier experience had been peaceful, in sharp contrast to the American experi-

---

<sup>31</sup> J.W. Dafoe, Clifford Sifton in Relation To His Times (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1931), pp. 12-443.

<sup>32</sup> G.F.G. Stanley, The Birth of Western Canada: A History of the Riel Rebellions (Toronto: Longmans, Green and Co. Ltd., 1936; reprint ed., Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1978), pp. 187-91, 253, 261-68, 298-312, 317-20; Stanley touched on these themes again in Louis Riel (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1963), pp. 264-91, 322.

ence.<sup>33</sup> A final work, A.S. Morton's 1939 A History of the Canadian West to 1870-1, reinforced C. Martin's early arguments, asserting that the West had been annexed to Canada, and in retaining public lands, the Dominion government acted "not only out of harmony with the symmetry of the federal scheme but in contravention of the actual terms of the British North America Act."<sup>34</sup> The works of these three historians, and Stanley in particular, kept alive the tradition of regional discontent and furthered the shift in regional historiography from a frontierist orientation to one that acknowledged the impact of the metropolis.

Contrasted with the 1930's, there were fewer works devoted to the West in the 1940's. Historians were turning their attention away from the region, due to the passing of the depression and the outbreak of war and also to pursue a fuller development of the Laurentian thesis. This historiographical approach still contained elements of environmentalism but was the frontier thesis turned upside down, degrading the importance of regional history and the vitality of the frontier and stressing the ongoing importance of the metropolis in national development. Many Laurentianists, including the theory's most famous proponents, H.A. Innis and D.G. Creighton, possessed anti-American sentiments which also contributed to the decline of continentalism as a his-

---

<sup>33</sup> Ibid., p. 214, 263.

<sup>34</sup> A.S. Morton, A History of the Canadian West to 1870-1 (London: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd., 1939), pp. 846, 871-72, 914-16.



toriological approach.<sup>35</sup> In its narrow metropolitan perspective of Canadian history, the Laurentian approach would inevitably produce a regional backlash, of which W.L. Morton's writings were the foremost example. In the 1940's, however, with the field of prairie studies left to western Canadian historians, there was an inevitable decline in the quantity of work produced as western universities struggled under financial limitations caused by depression and war.<sup>36</sup>

Nonetheless, significant contributions were made to western political historiography in the 1940's. R.O. MacFarlane, in 1940, in "Manitoba Politics and Parties After Confederation," expanded on the connection between the nascent provincial rights movement and political party development in Manitoba in the 1880's,<sup>37</sup> one of the first clear examples of the effect of western discontent on political development. Two more important works continued the attack on continentalism and the frontier thesis. G.F.G. Stanley, in 1940, in "Western Canada and the Frontier Thesis," resumed his 1936 argument, asserting that while the frontier envi-

---

<sup>35</sup> Regehr, "Historiography," p. 94; Berger, Canadian History, pp. 92-102, 123, 158, 168-69, 172-80, 191-92, 208-36, 260; J.M.S. Careless, "Frontierism, Metropolitanism, and Canadian History," pp. 14-21; M. Zaslow, "The Frontier Hypothesis in Recent Historiography," Canadian Historical Review 29 no. 2 (June 1948): 159-60.

<sup>36</sup> L.G. Thomas, "The Writing of History in Western Canada," in Eastern and Western Perspectives, eds. D.J. Bercuson and P.A. Buckner (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981), pp. 69-72.

<sup>37</sup> R.O. MacFarlane, "Manitoba Politics and Parties After Confederation," Canadian Historical Association Report (1940): 45-55.

ronment had a significant influence on economic life, political institutions were primarily determined by tradition. Stanley contrasted the development of the Canadian West with the American experience, arguing that its frontier phase had lasted only a few decades and settlement had been largely under Dominion control. There was a similarity in agrarian political responses but Canadian agrarian protest was not as much the product of the frontier as a conjunction of circumstances: geography, climate, metropolitan domination, and the inevitable conflict between primary and secondary producers. Stanley concluded that the West's unique character was determined "not only by our material environment, the frontier, but also by our past experience and the whole body of acquired tradition."<sup>38</sup> Much of Stanley's argument was repeated by M. Zaslow, in 1948, in "The Frontier Hypothesis in Recent Historiography." Zaslow agreed that the Canadian frontier experience was briefer and metropolitan control stronger and concluded that the study of western politics required recognition of the interaction of the frontier and the "political and cultural characteristics of the societies that came into contact with the frontier."<sup>39</sup>

An outstanding example of the shift in regional history from frontierism to an approach more aware of the local impact of metropolitan domination was C.C. Lingard's Terri-

---

<sup>38</sup> G.F.G. Stanley, "Western Canada and the Frontier Thesis," Canadian Historical Association Report (1940): 105-14.

<sup>39</sup> Zaslow, "The Frontier Hypothesis," pp. 162, 165.

territorial Government in Canada: The Autonomy Question in the Old North-West Territories, published in 1946. Showing a full appreciation of the influence of metropolitan domination and regional discontent on political development, Lingard argued that between 1897 and 1905, the North-West, "a creature of the Dominion Parliament," developed a "lusty political self-consciousness" in its campaign for provincehood against a reluctant federal government. Lingard asserted that this struggle greatly influenced local political development; initially, uniting local politicians in the autonomy movement and solidifying party divisions in federal politics, and, finally, providing the basis for the permanent creation of party lines in provincial politics.<sup>40</sup> Lingard concluded that provincial subordination continued after 1905 as the educational clauses of the Autonomy Bills and Dominion retention of public lands created "two inferior provinces."<sup>41</sup> Overall, Lingard's analysis of the progression from responsible government to provincehood foreshadowed Morton's thesis that the western attempt to throw off the yoke of metropolitan domination had shaped a unique politi-

---

<sup>40</sup> C.C. Lingard, Territorial Government in Canada: The Autonomy Question in the Old North-West Territories (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1946), pp. 5-251. See also "Economic Forces Behind the Demand for Provincial Status in the Old North West Territories," Canadian Historical Review 21 no. 3 (September 1940): 254-67. A less critical interpretation of the Dominion's role in the constitutional development of the North-West prior to 1905 is found in E.H. Oliver, "Saskatchewan and Alberta: General History, 1870-1912," in Canada and Its Provinces, Vol. XIX, pp. 189-270.

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 166-251.

cal development. Unfortunately, Lingard's emphasis on constitutional and political issues inevitably pushed to the background many fundamental economic problems inherent in agrarian hinterland relations with an urban, industrial metropolis.

As already noted, the renewed emphasis on the importance of the metropolis in shaping western political development did not spell the end of the environmental and continental approach. In 1948, an American, Paul Sharp, in The Agrarian Revolt in Western Canada: A Survey Showing American Parallels, the first book-length comparison of the experiences of the Canadian and American frontier regions, argued that Progressivism was "far more than an expression of sectionalism." A common environment and similar problems in production, transportation, marketing, credit, and all facets of relations with eastern metropolises and unresponsive federal governments had "produced the same agrarian protests on both sides of the international boundary," facilitated by the easy flow of people and ideas across the border.<sup>42</sup> Sharp,

---

<sup>42</sup> P. Sharp, The Agrarian Revolt in Western Canada: A Survey Showing American Parallels (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1948; reprint ed., New York: Octagon Books, 1971), pp. VII-VIII, 1-5, 16-41, 49-139, 153, 179-86; This had also been Sharp's theme in an earlier article, "The American Farmer and the 'Last Best West'," Agricultural History 21 no. 2 (April 1947): 65-75. Interestingly, Sharp cited W.L. Morton's 1944 "Direct Legislation and the Origins of the Progressive Movement" in stressing the Jeffersonian democratic principles held by both agrarian movements; see next chapter for elaboration. In Morton's bibliographical essay appended to The Progressive Party, p. 317, he called Sharp's book "the best and most finished study of the political unrest in the Canadian West from 1911 to 1930."

nonetheless, recognized differences between the two movements: the Canadian movement was stronger, due basically to the monolithic nature of the western wheat economy; the strategy of the agrarian bloc used by American farmers after the war was incompatible with Canadian parliamentary institutions; the protective tariff was a non-issue in the American mid-west; and inherited traditions from rural Ontario and socialist and Fabian circles in England, as well as American agrarian radicalism, were reshaping western political consciousness.<sup>43</sup>

Two other works published at this time illustrated that continentalism was still in use as a historiographical approach. In 1949, D.F. Warner, in "The Farmers' Alliance and the Farmers' Union: An American-Canadian Parallelism," equated the roots and growth of these two organizations, concluding that in historical perspective, "each was significant as a phase in the persistent agrarian radicalism found on both sides of the line in the West."<sup>44</sup> In the same vein, W.K. Rolph, in Henry Wise Wood of Alberta, published in 1950, also argued that American and Canadian farmers shared "very similar problems, and pursued similar methods in searching for solutions." Nowhere was American agrarian influence more strongly felt than through the personage and philosophies of H.W. Wood, who dominated the Alberta scene

---

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., pp. VIII, 2, 35-37, 41-53, 56, 58-61, 133-38.

<sup>44</sup> D.F. Warner, "The Farmers' Alliance and the Farmers' Union: An American-Canadian Parallelism," Agricultural History 23 no. 1 (January 1949): 9-19.

during the years of U.F.A. ascendancy.<sup>45</sup> Still, like Sharp, Rolph recognized distinct characteristics of the western agrarian movement: the substantial impact of ideas and personalities from rural Ontario and British liberal and cooperative backgrounds and the uniqueness of the Canadian "national and provincial parliamentary systems and the organization and background of Canadian political parties." Further, he recognized that the agrarian revolt in the post-war era was strong in other agrarian areas, especially Ontario.<sup>46</sup> The similarities and differences in agrarian experience noted by Rolph and Sharp, in particular, underscored the realization by most historians that no single theoretical perspective could explain all the dimensions of the western agrarian revolt.

After the drought of the 1940's, the 1950's were witness to an unprecedented boom in regional studies, focussing on "political eccentricity and prairie radicalism."<sup>47</sup> This increased interest was the result of the success and longevity of the C.C.F. and Social Credit and a reaction to the peripheral importance given the West by the Laurentianists.<sup>48</sup> The regional studies of the 1950's also marked the

---

<sup>45</sup> W.K. Rolph, Henry Wise Wood of Alberta (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950), pp. VII, 11-12, 21-22, 29-31, 36-60, 96.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid., pp. VII, 30-31, 61.

<sup>47</sup> Regehr, "Historiography," pp. 87, 94-95.

<sup>48</sup> One classic example of this genre is D. Creighton, Dominion of the North: A History of Canada (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1944).

continued decline of environmentalism and frontierism as historiographical approaches. Events of the war had shown that Canada was far more than a North American nation and, in the study of its institutions, more emphasis must be placed on its trans-Atlantic heritage. Anti-American sentiment in the post-war period further encouraged a renewed interest in British traditions.<sup>49</sup> Still, while more recognition would be accorded the prominent role of the metropolis in shaping western institutions, the frontier thesis and, more specifically, the formative influence of the environment, would never be totally discarded in the writing of regional history.

The growing recognition by regional historians of the impact of metropolitan domination on political development was reflected in one of the early works of the Social Credit in Alberta series. In 1954, in Social Credit and the Federal Power in Canada, J.R. Mallory described Social Credit as a sectional revolt against the vested economic interests of central Canada and the subordinate position of the West.<sup>50</sup> Mallory concluded that "the conflict between the Dominion and the province of Alberta was a significant contributing factor" to a new constitutional "state of equilibrium" in which the federal government had greatly increased its pow-

---

<sup>49</sup> Berger, Canadian History, pp. 151, 156-58, 168, 172-80, 191-93; Regehr, "Historiography," p. 90.

<sup>50</sup> J.R. Mallory, Social Credit and the Federal Power in Canada, Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 5 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1954), pp. 10, 57-152, 168-85, 189, 197-98.

ers and responsibilities<sup>51</sup> and provincialism in Alberta had been weakened. Though Mallory's sectional characterization was not inaccurate, he ignored institutional and socio-psychological factors in Social Credit's initial success that fell outside the scope of "metropolis-hinterland" relations. He did, however, cite factors in the decline of provincialism: the growing orthodoxy of the Social Credit party, the need for cooperation with outside financial and private interests in order to develop Alberta's natural resources, and war-time prosperity,<sup>52</sup> which indicated that the local struggle against metropolitan domination was only one of a number of factors that influenced political development.

While the writing of regional history within the context of "metropolis-hinterland" relations was becoming increasingly popular, its limitations as an analytical framework within which to examine western third parties and political development were also being exposed in the 1950's.<sup>53</sup> They were particularly evident in a number of studies on the C.C.F.<sup>54</sup> For example, in D.E. McHenry's 1950 The Third Force in Canada: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation, 1932-1948, McHenry admitted that the C.C.F. was a "lineal

---

<sup>51</sup> See Mallory's earlier article, "Disallowance and the National Interest: The Alberta Social Credit Legislation of 1937," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 3 (August 1948): 342-57.

<sup>52</sup> J.R. Mallory, Social Credit and the Federal Power in Canada, pp. 3-4, 55-56, 121, 140-68, 189-90, 196-98.

<sup>53</sup> See Chapters 4 and 5.

<sup>54</sup> See Chapters 4 and 5.



descendent of the recurring farmers' movements" but recognized the presence of labour and intellectuals and concluded that the party was "avowedly socialist."<sup>55</sup> He also recognized that with the passage of time the national C.C.F. was losing its agrarian orientation and a potential rift was developing within the party between centralists and provincialists.<sup>56</sup> These observations indicated that the C.C.F. was more than a vehicle of expression of western discontent in federal politics.

Despite these indications of its limitations, the trend in the writing of western Canadian political history from frontierism to a "metropolis-hinterland" framework continued. In 1954, a major historiographical work emphasized the growing disillusionment with frontierism and environmentalism. In "Frontierism, Metropolitanism, and Canadian History," J.M.S. Careless criticized proponents of the frontier thesis for their tendency to portray frontier forces as progressive and enlightened and metropolitan forces as autocratic and reactionary. This viewpoint often distorted the true nature of frontier movements, portraying them too narrowly and ignoring metropolitan influence. W.L. Morton, he asserted, had fallen into this trap in his early portrayal of the Progressives in 1944 in "Direct Legislation and the

---

<sup>55</sup> D.E. McHenry, The Third Force in Canada: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation, 1932-1948 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1950), pp. 4, 23-30, 265-81, 304, 324.

<sup>56</sup> Ibid., pp. 281, 321.

Origins of the Progressive Movement."<sup>57</sup> Careless suggested metropolitanism as a framework to examine political development, in recognition that "frontier protest movements are a natural accompaniment of the extension of metropolitan power into new areas."<sup>58</sup>

As noted in Careless's article and illustrated in the preceding pages, the evolution of western political historiography centered largely on the relative weight to be assigned metropolitan and frontier influences in determining prairie political development. By the time Morton wrote "Bias," the former was in the ascendancy. Morton, particularly in his early works, would never deny the many shared features of the continental agrarian revolt and the influence of the frontier environment, so ably pointed out by Sharp and others, but would develop his three-stage theory within the framework of the constant interaction between the West and central Canada; though whereas Careless emphasized the metropolis, Morton's concern was the hinterland. On the notion of western subordination, firmly established in western historiography by the historians whose works were examined above, the extent of their influence on Morton is hard to determine. If, however, direct influence cannot always be firmly established, it can certainly be stated that Morton's charges of "colonial subordination" and "economic sub-

---

<sup>57</sup> See next chapter.

<sup>58</sup> J.M.S. Careless, "Frontierism, Metropolitanism, and Canadian History," pp. 1-21.

ordination" followed logically from the groundwork they had laid. In the following chapter, Morton's 1955 outline of prairie political development will be expanded by reference to his other works on prairie politics and viewed in the context of the conclusions of his predecessors.

### Chapter III

#### MORTON'S EXPANDED "BIAS" IN HISTORIOGRAPHICAL PERSPECTIVE

Born and raised in Gladstone, Manitoba, W.L. Morton had early in life become aware of the interaction of imported cultural institutions and environmental forces that shaped a unique social and political milieu in the West.<sup>1</sup> Upon entering the academic world, Morton found that the historiographical approaches in vogue were incompatible with the observations of his youth. He first confronted this contradiction in 1946 in "Marginal," attacking the Turnerian frontierists for their overemphasis of the formative influence of the North American frontier environment and failure to recognize the importance of inherited political values and institutions. The Laurentianists, on the other hand, were too imperialistic to do justice to all regions of Canada. The basic facts of the "metropolis-hinterland" thesis could not be denied but in making the St. Lawrence the hub of Canadian development, they had reduced prairie history in status to the description of "economic and political subordination"

---

<sup>1</sup> Margaret Morton Fahrni and W.L. Morton, Third Crossing: A History of the First Quarter Century of the Town and District of Gladstone in the Province of Manitoba (Winnipeg: Advocate Printers Ltd., 1946); "Seeing an Unliterary Landscape," Mosaic III no. 3 (Manitoba Centennial Issue 1970): 1-10.

and denied the impact of environmental forces. Morton's solution was the writing of regional history which would reflect the "relative impress of hereditary culture and physical environment."<sup>2</sup>

In a second 1946 work, "Clio in Canada: The Interpretation of Canadian History," Morton again admitted that the Laurentian thesis was a "correct representation of the actual facts" but asserted that the economic and political domination of a subordinate West by metropolitan Canada coupled with the West's unique environment and sectional character negated any possibility of Westerners accepting a written history that placed the Prairies in an inferior position to central Canada. In Morton's opinion, western history, written from a western viewpoint, was just as worthy of historical attention as the dominance of Ontario or the survival of the French-Canadian nation.<sup>3</sup> Morton's work in the next decade would be devoted to the establishment of regional history as a legitimate pursuit. In 1955, he became the first and only historian to propose an interpretive framework within which the entire span of western political development could be situated, based on the western attempt to end metropolitan domination and achieve economic and political equality.

---

<sup>2</sup> W.L. Morton, "Marginal," Manitoba Arts Review 5 no. 1 (Spring 1946): 26-29.

<sup>3</sup> W.L. Morton, "Clio in Canada: The Interpretation of Canadian History," University of Toronto Quarterly 15 no. 3 (April 1946): 229-34.

### 3.1 THE COLONIAL PERIOD, 1870-1905

In his statement of his thesis in "Bias," Morton's brief account of politics in the "colonial period" left a number of unanswered questions. What was the full extent of the "struggle for political equality in Confederation, not realized until 1930"<sup>4</sup> and did the grievances underlying this struggle justify Morton's charge of "colonial subordination"? What issues fueled early agrarian consciousness and what was the nature and pace of agrarian organizational development? Lastly, how was a nascent regional and utopian sentiment fostered in the West? A reading of a number of Morton's other works fails to provide satisfactory answers to these questions.

In attempting to flesh out and assess Morton's interpretation, the best starting point is his outstanding work on the province of his birth, Manitoba: A History, published in 1957. There, Morton presented his most detailed study of Manitoba's political and economic subordination to central Canada and its response, defining the main concerns of Manitobans beginning in the 1880's as the "struggle to win for the province a tolerable position in Confederation and to knit its new agriculture into the commercial system of the nineteenth century."<sup>5</sup> Boundary extension, control of public

---

<sup>4</sup> W.L. Morton, "Bias," p. 58.

<sup>5</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba: A History, 2nd ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967; reprint ed., Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1979), p. 234.

lands, insufficient federal subsidies, and the right to charter provincial railways, in the process overcoming the monopoly clause of the C.P.R. charter and federal government disallowance, were the main components of the fight for political equity waged by Manitoba governments under the leadership of R.A. Davis, John Norquay, Thomas Greenway, Hugh John Macdonald, and Rodmond Roblin. Reaching the same conclusions as Begg and MacFarlane,<sup>6</sup> Morton argued that the first steps in the formation of party lines in the late 1870's and early 1880's owed much to this struggle; Norquay had temporarily abandoned his nonpartisan stance to defend the concessions he had won from the Conservative government in Ottawa while Greenway, an Ontario Liberal, had transposed the platform of "provincial rights" to the provincial opposition party. Political protest in Manitoba, like its growing institutional infrastructure, reflected the mores of the province's dominant group, immigrants from rural Ontario. This "struggle for better terms and provincial rights," Morton concluded, "hardened the consciousness of identity" that was being formed among the new settlers.<sup>7</sup> Despite a boundary extension, increased subsidies, and termination of the monopoly clause, Morton argued that equality of political status had not been achieved by 1905. Crown lands remained under Dominion control and the struggle for yet further boundary extension and higher subsidies continued.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> See previous chapter.

<sup>7</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, pp. 141-293.

In discussing the issues underlying early regional discontent, Morton did not do justice to the motives of the Dominion government, nor did he justify his 1955 claim of "colonial subordination." His thinly veiled criticism of the Dominion's decision to grant provincial status to only a small area in 1870 ignored the small population of the region and the lack of administrative experience and machinery necessary to govern a province.<sup>9</sup> The Dominion's reasons for retaining public lands<sup>10</sup> and upholding the terms of the C.P.R. charter<sup>11</sup> were presented neither fully nor favourably. Morton also glossed over early federal subsidy increases and implied that failure to meet provincial demands was tantamount to colonial subordination.<sup>12</sup> Despite these shortcomings, Morton had recognized and clearly summarized the birth of a provincial tradition of grievance and protest. Interestingly, Morton focussed more attention on the aforementioned issues as a source of federal-provincial conflict than on the Manitoba school question. He admitted that federal intrusion in the provincial domain stoked the furnace of "provincial rights" but concluded that in the 1896 election, the return of five Conservatives to three Liberals reflected the widespread opinion that the "school

---

<sup>8</sup> Ibid., pp. 290-93.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid., p. 141.

<sup>10</sup> Ibid., pp. 141, 197-198, 211, 214, 292.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., pp. 194, 211, 213-16, 219, 221-22, 230-31.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., pp. 196-98, 213-16, 221, 284.



system was no longer an open issue."<sup>13</sup> Finally, it should be noted that the failure of the evidence Morton presented in Manitoba to substantiate his 1955 charge of "colonial subordination" was reinforced by his concession in his earlier work, The Progressive Party in Canada, published in 1950, that the West had probably not suffered any loss as a result of Dominion retention of public lands.<sup>14</sup>

In Manitoba, Morton also examined the purported economic subordination of the Manitoba agrarian community and its response. Again showing his regional bias, he accepted the traditional belief that the agrarian community had suffered unfairly under the land policy of the federal government and the protective tariff and at the hands of the railways, elevator companies, and the banks. Morton noted but did not fully explore the continuity in the fight to champion agrarian interests of the Grange, the Manitoba Farmers' Protective Union, the Patrons of Industry, and the Grain Growers' Associations in Manitoba and the Territories.<sup>15</sup> He also placed the M.F.P.U. and the Patrons in a national and continental context of agrarian discontent but did not elaborate

---

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., pp. 250, 269-72.

<sup>14</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party in Canada, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 1 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950), p. 8; Here, Morton cited a work showing, if anything, the Dominion perspective, J.A. Maxwell, Federal Subsidies to the Provincial Governments in Canada, Harvard Economic Studies, vol. LVI (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1937).

<sup>15</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, pp. 208-22, 257-58, 287-89, 299-300.

on this commonality of experience.<sup>16</sup>

Nor did Morton in his various works fully explore the regional grievances in the North-West that constituted "colonial subordination," initiated a regional "bias," and shaped political development. In The Progressive Party, he briefly noted that the colonial status of the West and the growth of "sectional sentiment" were rooted in the withholding of public lands, the struggle for provincial status, discriminatory federal fiscal, land, and transportation policies, metropolitan economic domination, and Ottawa's need to placate Quebec in federal legislation pertaining to the West. Citing C.C. Lingard, he argued that Saskatchewan and Alberta entered Confederation in 1905 not as equal provinces in terms of status and power but as "colonies under the form of provinces." Morton, however, only briefly touched on the weakness of the North-West in national politics and the local struggle for provincial status. Neither did he elaborate on early agrarian grievances and the formation of agrarian organizations. Concerning the latter, he recognized but did not expand on their American and Ontario roots.<sup>17</sup> He also ignored these organizations in Manitoba, where he claimed that the Farmers' Union was "Manitoba's counterpart to the rising of Indians and the Metis" in the North-West,<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> Ibid., pp. 210-11, 258.

<sup>17</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 3-14, 293-94. It should be noted in Morton's defense that a chapter in his manuscript examining the farmers' movement in Ontario was deleted from the final work.

thereby overlooking the beginnings of agrarian organization in the North-West in the form of the Settlers' Union.

In his later works, Morton offered no further elaboration. In The Kingdom of Canada: A General History From Earliest Times, published in 1963, he asserted that the North-West had been saddled with a colonial regime in 1870 but mentioned only briefly the struggle for responsible government and provincial status.<sup>19</sup> The organizational response of the Territorial agrarian community in the 1880's to basically the same economic grievances that galvanized Manitoba farmers to action was again ignored and the formation of the Territorial Grain Growers' Association in 1901 received only a brief mention.<sup>20</sup> This lack of attention was in keeping with his growing interest in national rather than regional concerns in the 1960's.<sup>21</sup>

Morton's shifting emphasis in his later writings was also evident in "The West and The Nation, 1870-1970," published in 1973. He admitted that in 1870, "the Territories, until peopled, called for territorial, or Crown Colony, govern-

---

<sup>18</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, p. 213.

<sup>19</sup> W.L. Morton, The Kingdom of Canada: A General History From Earliest Times (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1963), pp. 336, 372, 403.

<sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 365-67, 410-11.

<sup>21</sup> C. Berger, Canadian History, pp. 250-56. This outlook is also found in The Critical Years: The Union of British North America, 1857-1873, The Canadian Centenary Series, vol. 12 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1964), p. 242, in which Morton ignored the growth of regional discontent stemming from the political events of 1869-70.

ment" and was sympathetic to the plight of the Dominion government, acknowledging that it had no experience or established principles to call upon for governing a territory. Quite naturally, its response was to govern pragmatically, handling situations as they arose.<sup>22</sup> It would seem that Morton had partially backed away from his earlier criticisms of Dominion action in 1869-70; thereby casting doubt on the validity of his accusations of "colonial subordination." However, it is this writer's opinion that this seeming moderation in Morton's outlook, a by-product of his belief that regional inequalities had been gradually reduced<sup>23</sup> and his growing concern in the 1960's with a variety of national issues, did not constitute a repudiation of his expressed belief in the historical existence of sectional injustices.

Another later work that shed light on the evolving "bias" throughout the West in the "colonial period" was "A Century of Plain and Parkland," published in 1969. Morton argued that the groundwork for twentieth century political developments had been laid by early settlers seeking a "practical, viable utopia," possessing a "strong disposition ... to try radical measures," and with weak ties to the traditional political parties.<sup>24</sup> This, however, was his only attempt to

---

<sup>22</sup> W.L. Morton, "The West and The Nation, 1870-1970," in Prairie Perspectives 2, eds. A.W. Rasporich and H.C. Klassen (Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1973), pp. 8-9.

<sup>23</sup> See below.

<sup>24</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century of Plain and Parkland," Alberta Historical Review 17 no. 2 (Spring 1969): 2-8.

explain the early presence of utopian sentiment in the West and its ramifications for later political development.

Morton wrote little elsewhere on the development of a "bias" in the North-West prior to 1905. As in his history of Manitoba, gaps remain in the reader's understanding of the growth of the "bias." In concluding this section, it must be stated that, overall, Morton's evidence, judged both on its own merits and in light of the works reviewed in the previous chapter, did not conclusively prove his charge of "colonial subordination." Nonetheless, his writings on the "colonial period" confirmed the existence of grievances sufficiently important to establish a tradition of regional discontent and influence political development in the West.

### 3.2 THE AGRARIAN PERIOD, 1905-1925

The longstanding difficulty of balancing metropolitanism, frontierism, sectionalism, and continentalism as interpretive approaches to the study of western political development, evident to some degree in Morton's discussion of political events in the "colonial period," came to the fore in his analysis of political evolution in the "agrarian period." Morton's attempt to balance these influences can be seen in all his works, including "Bias," where he emphasized the sectional nature of the Progressive movement despite admitting that there was a class aspect to the revolt, many eastern farmers also opposed the protective tariff, and the

American Progressive movement had influenced its Canadian counterpart's attack on eastern business interests and political parties.<sup>25</sup>

Morton's attempt to balance the national and sectional aspects of the Progressive movement was most evident in The Progressive Party. Repeating a well-worn theme in western historiography,<sup>26</sup> Morton argued that the Progressive movement was primarily a regional agrarian revolt against metropolitan economic and political domination and the colonial subordination of the West.<sup>27</sup> Despite emphasizing the sectional nature of the Progressive movement, Morton recognized that there was a class aspect expressed in the philosophy of the Albertan wing of the movement. Citing L.A. Wood, he also noted that agrarian communities in other provinces, particularly Ontario, were also struggling against urban and industrial domination and the commercialization and mechanization of agriculture, providing common ground for united action.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> W.L. Morton, "Bias," p. 61.

<sup>26</sup> In this seminal work, Morton drew on many earlier works on agrarian discontent, including a number that were discussed in Chapter 2. Most often cited was L.A. Wood. Others included E. Porritt, C.W. Peterson, H. Moorhouse, W. Irvine, E.A. Partridge, H.S. Patton, J.W. Dafoe, D.A. MacGibbon, A.S. Morton and C. Martin, H.A. Innis, C.C. Lingard, and P.F. Sharp.

<sup>27</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 6-27, 40-83, 105-6, 116-18, 129, 195, 266-68, 288-94; In describing western opposition to the tariff, Morton relied heavily on L.A. Wood and E. Porritt.

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 14, 20-21, 27, 62-64, 71-77, 82-86, 94-96, 102-3, 106-8, 115-19, 201, 266, 268, 292-93. Again, it should be noted that Morton's chapter on the Ontario movement was deleted.

Morton's acknowledgement that certain aspects of the agrarian revolt were national in scope weakened the validity of his sectional characterization of the movement in western Canada. Morton also erred in downplaying the nonagrarian aspects of the Progressive movement that indicated its support in the West was not based solely on regional grievances. For example, he recognized that the Progressive movement was part of a larger nation-wide general reform movement but, nonetheless, argued that this fact "often served to veil" the essence of western Progressivism, its "agrarian and sectional character."<sup>29</sup>

Another contradictory aspect of Morton's analysis of the Progressive movement was his handling of its relationship to the American agrarian movement, at times stressing and at other times downplaying their commonality of experience. When emphasizing their interrelationship, his early works, in particular, reflected the still widespread use of environmentalism and continentalism in explaining Canadian political development. In "Direct Legislation and the Origins of the Progressive Movement," published in 1944, Morton argued that western Progressivism represented, among other things, a renewal of agrarian and frontier democracy in the Jeffersonian and Clear Grit tradition. In placing the roots of the Progressive movement in the latter, Morton cited F.H. Underhill, clearly illustrating his early frontierist leanings. Morton also noted that many American-born ideas had

---

<sup>29</sup> Ibid., pp. 27-40, 45-46, 52, 168, 267-69.

influenced political development in the Canadian West.<sup>30</sup> In "The Western Progressive Movement and Cabinet Domination," published in 1946, Morton, reiterating his earlier characterization of the Progressive movement, stressed the similarity of political reforms advocated on both sides of the 49th parallel and the strong influence of farmers' organizations founded on American example on western Canadian political development.<sup>31</sup> In "The Social Philosophy of Henry Wise Wood, The Canadian Agrarian Leader," published in 1948, he described the Progressives as a rebirth of the American Populist movement of the 1890's and emphasized the large number of American immigrants, including Wood, who brought to Alberta ideas nurtured in the American farm organizations.<sup>32</sup>

In The Progressive Party, Morton showed his respect for environmental forces when he observed that geography and climate had created conditions that made Westerners "quickly sensitive to economic and political disabilities."<sup>33</sup> He again characterized the western Progressives as a renaiss-

---

<sup>30</sup> W.L. Morton, "Direct Legislation and the Origins of the Progressive Movement," Canadian Historical Review 25 no. 3 (September 1944): 279-88.

<sup>31</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Western Progressive Movement and Cabinet Domination," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 12 no. 2 (May 1946): 137-41, 147.

<sup>32</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Social Philosophy of Henry Wise Wood, The Canadian Agrarian Leader," Agricultural History 22 no. 2 (April 1948): 115-17, 120-21.

<sup>33</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, p. 6.



sance of Clear Grit radical democracy.<sup>34</sup> He also listed numerous examples of western farmers borrowing both organizations and ideas from their American mid-west counterparts and stated that the American Populist and Progressive movements had a significant impact on the Canadian West. Of the latter, Morton wrote, "its influence was immediate and insistent on the growth of the reform movement in the Canadian West."<sup>35</sup> Of the Canadian West in the first two decades of the twentieth century, he stated, it was "never ... more part of the world."<sup>36</sup> Morton again recognized that the American agrarian influence was particularly strong in Alberta, contributing to the popularity of soft money and credit and monetary reform, the strength of the Society of Equity and the Non-Partisan League, and the electoral success of the U.F.A. and Social Credit.<sup>37</sup>

Despite abundant evidence that he himself had presented linking the western Progressive movement with its American counterpart, Morton, as noted, attempted at times to downplay their commonality of experience. In 1946, in "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," for example, he stated that the American Populist influence on western political development was mild; yet he defined the western Progressives as an "authentic expression" of "Jacksonian, Clear-

---

<sup>34</sup> Ibid., p. 14.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid., pp. 10-16, 30, 44-48, 87-92, 120, 185, 285-87.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., p. 15.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., pp. 37-39, 48, 87-92, 168-69, 185, 285-87.

Grit democracy, reinforced by American populism" and discussed the American frontier influence on the Canadian direct legislation movement and the demand for a third party free of business control.<sup>38</sup>

In 1951, in "The Significance of Site in the Settlement of the American and Canadian Wests," Morton noted specific differences in the Canadian and American agrarian experiences. He emphasized that the fight for provincial status and control of natural resources was unique to the West. Economic domination of the agrarian community was stronger in Canada than the United States and the Canadian parliamentary system was less responsive than the American congressional system, necessitating the formation of stronger political and economic organizations in the Canadian West. The early western agrarian organizations founded on American example had little influence or success on the Canadian political scene. Indigenous twentieth century agrarian organizations had a far greater impact.<sup>39</sup>

In forwarding these arguments, Morton seemingly ignored the considerable influence on western political development of the influx of American settlers and the American Populist and Progressive movements, an influence he had readily

---

<sup>38</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," Canadian Historical Association Report (1946): 41-55.

<sup>39</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Significance of Site in the Settlement of the American and Canadian Wests," Agricultural History 25 no. 3 (July 1951): 102-3.

acknowledged in the aforementioned works. Morton also overlooked the fact that the western agrarian community in the 1870-90's was too newly formed and lacking in numbers to mount an effective attack on existing economic and political institutions. Lastly, even when discussing the unique features of the Canadian movement, Morton listed some of the many complaints shared by both agrarian communities.<sup>40</sup>

In his writings in the 1960's and later, Morton was particularly determined to assert the distinctiveness of the Canadian experience as a whole.<sup>41</sup> Yet, even then, he could not escape the continental dimensions of the Progressive movement. In The Kingdom of Canada, he asserted a Canadian distinctiveness based on its northern character, British metropolitan influence, and the persistence of monarchical institutions.<sup>42</sup> Still, he was forced to admit that a common North American environment had led to certain similarities of experience with the United States, particularly in the form of agrarian protest.<sup>43</sup> In "A Century," he acknowledged the American influence on early farmers' organizations and claimed that it was still evident in "the final apolitical

---

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., p. 102.

<sup>41</sup> W.L. Morton, Kingdom; The Canadian Identity (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961); "The Relevance of Canadian History," Canadian Historical Association Report (1960): 1-21; "The 'North' in Canadian Historiography," Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series IV Vol. VIII Symposia (1970): 31-40.

<sup>42</sup> W.L. Morton, Kingdom, p. 273.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., pp. 366, 383-84, 422-23, 443.

outlook of many prairie people."<sup>44</sup>

In the final analysis, Morton's desire to write regional history from a local perspective, his belief that "metropolis-hinterland" relations were the primary determinant of the West's political development, his anti-Americanism, the vehemence and intensity of the western agrarian struggle, unmatched in Canada, and the uniqueness of some of its complaints, led him ultimately to conclude that Progressivism was, at root, a western Canadian wheat growers' protest. While he was correct in pointing out distinct features of the western movement, which even the continentalists had noted, he could not ignore the many elements that bound the different movements together, pointing to a certain commonality of continental agrarian experience and the significant and long-lasting impact of the American agrarian movement on the western Canadian agrarian movement and political scene. As a result, Morton's writing was somewhat confusing and contradictory in its analysis of the continental dimensions of the Progressive movement.

While Morton struggled to balance the national, continental, and sectional aspects of the Progressive movement, he skirted the issue in his limited descriptions of another area of western political development: early class consciousness, labour unrest, and the nascent socialist movement. In the aforementioned works, for example, he recogniz-

---

<sup>44</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century", p. 5.

ed but did not elaborate on the presence of a metropolitan and class influence in the form of British immigrants of Fabian, labour, and socialist backgrounds. Only in Manitoba did he deal at any length with the labour and socialist movements and there, of course, he only described Manitoba developments. Interestingly, he did not stress the aspect of sectional discontent in the labour movement and the Winnipeg General Strike, in particular, to the extent that he did in analyzing the agrarian movement. Neither did Morton dwell in any of his works on the influence of British immigrants and the labour movement in the founding of the C.C.F.<sup>45</sup> In all, the development of working class consciousness was not of great interest to Morton, though he did note that the C.C.F. and Social Credit represented a branching out to encompass class politics.<sup>46</sup> The struggle of the working class for economic advancement was always overshadowed by the struggle of the agrarian community against the eastern metropolis. In this light, it must be realized that Morton's thesis that the response to metropolitan domination shaped political development was one-dimensional, based almost exclusively on the beliefs and actions of the agrarian community.

---

<sup>45</sup> W.L. Morton, "Direct Legislation and the Origins of the Progressive Movement," pp. 281-82; "The Western Progressive Movement and Cabinet Domination," p. 137; "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," pp. 41-54; The Progressive Party, pp. 14-15, 32-33, 37-39, 104-5, 117-18, 185-86, 193, 218, 226-28, 242-43, 271-85; "Bias," pp. 57-66; Manitoba, pp. 264, 304-5, 316-18, 333, 348, 360-75, 378-79, 383, 397, 400, 414-15, 427.

<sup>46</sup> See below.

The fallacy of viewing western political development as solely the product of local discontent directed against central Canada is evident again in Morton's study of western provincial politics. In the three provinces, political development was determined by what Morton called their "historical complexes."<sup>47</sup> This seemingly referred to the interaction of the many diverse factors that had shaped the unique provincial societies and political milieus into which Progressivism was introduced, surely an implied recognition that the presence of a regional "bias" did not alone determine the political choices made in the West. A survey of Morton's analyses of prairie provincial politics confirms that he recognized the diversity of influences involved.

For example, Morton, in a number of works, stressed that opposition to the party system greatly influenced political developments in Manitoba but noted that other factors played a role as well. In "Winnipeg and Manitoba, 1874-1922: A Study in Representative Democracy," published in 1939, Morton argued that the old two-party system had failed in Manitoba by 1922 for a number of reasons, both practical and moral. Conservative scandals, the federal Liberal party break-up in 1917, stresses caused by war-time pressures, and the growth of radical democracy weakened party ties. The Liberals and Conservatives, lacking clear-cut political principles and faced by mature agrarian and labour elements desirous of a separate representation in the provincial leg-

---

<sup>47</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, p. 235.

islature, were unable to continue in their brokerage party tradition.<sup>48</sup> In "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921" and The Progressive Party, Morton asserted that distrust of the old party system with its partisanship, patronage, and machine politics defeated the Roblin government and adversely affected the popularity of the Norris government, despite that administration's progressive record.<sup>49</sup> He emphasized that the U.F.M.'s triumph was also an agrarian rebellion against urban domination and, to a lesser degree, a rejection of the Norris government for its lack of economy in administration and its ties with an unpopular federal Liberal party.<sup>50</sup> In Manitoba, Morton stressed that the election results of 1920 and 1922 represented the dissolution of the party system by an electorate sick of corruption and partisanship.<sup>51</sup> Weak personnel, a dearth of new ideas, and unrest caused by post-war depression conditions, in addition to the aforementioned factors, contributed to Norris's defeat and the U.F.M. victory.<sup>52</sup>

---

<sup>48</sup> W.L. Morton, "Winnipeg and Manitoba, 1874-1922: A Study in Representative Democracy," Manitoba Arts Review 1 no. 4 (Winter 1939): 29-41.

<sup>49</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," pp. 49-50; The Progressive Party, pp. 31-33, 97-99, 225-30.

<sup>50</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 225-30.

<sup>51</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, pp. 281, 290, 294-95, 316-18, 333-37, 341-58, 361, 374-85.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 373-81.

Morton also noted that many different factors influenced political development in Saskatchewan where, unlike Manitoba and Alberta, the Liberals held off the farmers' political movement. In "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921" and The Progressive Party, Morton attributed their success to: effective leadership, efficient government administration, adept use of patronage, a strong party machine,<sup>53</sup> the dominance of agriculture with no pronounced rural-urban conflict, agrarian oriented legislation, the inclusion of agrarian leaders in the government, the Liberals' careful disassociation at times from their federal counterparts, and a Progressive movement preoccupied with economic concerns and undecided as to whether it should enter politics to fight what was essentially a farmers' government. A snap election in 1921 also stalled a growing movement for agrarian political action. Morton made it clear, however, that resentment against the metropolis was not weaker in Saskatchewan than Manitoba. The difference was that in the former, the Liberals had successfully maintained the mantle of champion of agrarian interests.<sup>54</sup> Morton also suggested that a consequence of the Liberal success in Saskatchewan and other political factors was the inability of the Conservatives or any other group to provide a viable opposition for signifi-

---

<sup>53</sup> The first examination of the Liberal party machine was E. Reid's "The Saskatchewan Liberal Machine Before 1929," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 2 no. 1 (February 1936): 27-40.

<sup>54</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," pp. 50-51; The Progressive Party, pp. 34-36, 82, 97-98, 110, 210-11, 231-35.



cant periods of time.<sup>55</sup>

In Alberta, the farmers' political movement, in the form of the U.F.A., scored its strongest victory. In "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921" and The Progressive Party, Morton again cited a combination of contributing factors: the considerable influence of the American populist, nonpartisan movement, indicated by the Non-Partisan League forcing the U.F.A. into politics, the debilitating effect of scandals on the Liberal government, the government's inefficiency as compared to the Liberal government in Saskatchewan, its failure to entice farm leaders into the fold, the weakness of the Tory opposition and their entry into the U.F.A. camp, the desire of the farmers to have their own representation in the legislature, the organizational strength and unity of the U.F.A. under the charismatic H.W. Wood, the U.F.A. willingness to cooperate with Labour, and the fact that Alberta was the newest frontier and not yet possessed of an inherent conservatism. These factors combined to produce a stronger sectional and nonpartisan sentiment in Alberta than in its prairie neighbours.<sup>56</sup> Again Morton emphasized that political opposition to, first, the Liberals, and, then, the U.F.A., was weak in provincial politics; in the latter case to the extent that there was an

---

<sup>55</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 3, 34, 111, 230-35.

<sup>56</sup> W.L. Morton, "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921," pp. 51-52; The Progressive Party, pp. 36-40, 48, 87-94, 97, 111-12, 168-69, 218, 235, 242-43.

"elimination of party politics from the public affairs of Alberta."<sup>57</sup>

Morton's analysis of provincial politics indicated that there existed in each province, in varying degrees, a combination of the traditional western nonpartisan opposition to the structure, ethics, practises, and policies of the party system imported from eastern Canada and a revolt against the Conservatives and Liberals for failing to represent agrarian interests. Yet Morton realized that each prairie province was in the process of embarking on its own unique political evolution.<sup>58</sup> The differing nature of their political development, as Morton had well shown, was attributable to a combination of factors, many of which were not rooted in regional discontent and the "metropolis-hinterland" dichotomy.

Perhaps the strongest area of Morton's analysis of the Progressive movement was his recognition of the many interrelated reasons for its decline. His best account of the Progressive demise is found in The Progressive Party. Morton suggested that the Progressives' shunning of responsibility by their refusal to accept the role of official opposition, the rift between the Manitoban and Albertan factions, restrictive parliamentary procedures and traditions, Liberal concessions and the return of many Progressives to

---

<sup>57</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 112, 217-18, 225, 230, 235, 264, 286.

<sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 37, 235.

the Liberal fold, a lack of central leadership and organization, weak provincial organizations outside Alberta and Manitoba, the Progressives' failure to widen their support base, the prosperity of the mid-1920's, a negative post-war reaction to radicalism, the passing of the general reform movement, of which the Progressives had been a part, the fulfillment of some basic Progressive objectives at the provincial and federal levels, and the growing agrarian concern with economic issues weakened the movement and reduced it to a small rump in Parliament.<sup>59</sup>

Morton concluded that an inevitable result of the Progressives' failure to dominate Parliament and their subsequent demise was their inability to redress fundamental western grievances. In The Progressive Party, Morton did acknowledge that the Progressives hastened the end of "colonial subordination and the achievement of equality of status" through the return of natural resources to provincial jurisdiction in 1930. However, metropolitan economic domination continued undeterred by the Progressive movement and the winning of tariff, freight rate, and other concessions. Political domination was eased somewhat by the growing political maturity of the West, the increasing responsiveness of the Liberal government to hinterland aspirations, the winning of parliamentary reforms, the easing of rigid party loyalties, and the formation of new political group-

---

<sup>59</sup> Ibid., pp. 25, 86-95, 106-9, 117-224, 239-40, 244-72, 276-77, 289-92.

ings. Nonetheless, the Liberals and Conservatives continued to dominate the national political scene. In Morton's opinion, limited concessions were all a sectional party based on agrarian support could hope to achieve. The alternatives were class warfare, secession from Confederation, or, as it developed, a return to the status quo of composite, brokerage parties.<sup>60</sup> In "Bias," Morton concluded that the concept of the agrarian bloc had won only piecemeal reform and had weakened the West's voice in the two parties capable of governing the country. Relative to the evolving "bias," the movement was a failure.<sup>61</sup>

Morton's judgement seems harsh in light of his recognition of the impossibility of the Progressives altering the basic economic and political institutions of the country. Within the realm of the feasible, ie., their representing a minority region in a "majority-rules" system, their accomplishments were not insignificant. And while the western voice may have been weakened in the caucuses of the old parties, western influence on government policy formation was not lessened. If anything, the opposite would seem to be true. Though the Progressives would, undoubtedly, have accomplished more had they not been internally divided, their failure to end the western "bias" should not detract from the fact that they increased national awareness of the

---

<sup>60</sup> Ibid., pp. 155-57, 190, 208, 246-52, 259-66, 270-72, 289-95.

<sup>61</sup> W.L. Morton, "Bias," pp. 62-63.

West and won reforms of significant benefit. Finally, it should be noted again that Morton's analysis of post-war political development in the prairie provinces clearly revealed, but more often ignored, dimensions that could not be explained solely in the context of regional discontent or "metropolis-hinterland" relations.

### 3.3 THE UTOPIAN PERIOD, 1925-1955

In "Bias," Morton argued that the failure of the "agrarian bloc" to win equality for the West had necessitated a further evolution in political development, the "utopian period," 1925-55. Morton suggested that Social Credit was the outstanding example of western utopian sentiment and listed a number of conditions that made Albertans susceptible to its appeal: the tradition of "bias" and dislike of the economic and political status quo, impoverished conditions created by drought and depression, the traditional belief of western settlers in the possibility of new beginnings, the failure of traditional institutions, the popularity of evangelical sects, the millenarian aspects of the Progressive movement, and the absence of inherent conservatism in the West. The concrete political experiences of Albertans also aided Social Credit. The U.F.A. had shattered traditional party ties but, essentially a movement dedicated to improving the farmers' position in the existent social structure, was incapable of formulating a response to

the depression that could win public support. The C.C.F. was feared by the agrarian community and small businessmen for the threat that socialism held to their ownership of property. Drawing the conclusion from C.B. Macpherson's analysis in Democracy in Alberta: The Theory and Practise of a Quasi-Party System that the basic desire of the agrarian community was the achievement of independence,<sup>62</sup> though not enamored of his theoretical orientation, Morton viewed Social Credit as the logical choice of the agrarian community. It did not threaten agrarian independence and satisfied the desire for a solution to depression problems.<sup>63</sup> Clearly, regional discontent played a role in Social Credit's success but Morton also listed other factors that fell outside the purview of sectional discontent and "metropolis-hinterland" relations.

Morton had also elaborated on the reasons why Social Credit and not the C.C.F. won power in Alberta in The Progressive Party. He suggested that Albertans, in their desperation, desired new solutions untarnished by time. The U.F.A. offered no such remedy and because of its association with the newly formed C.C.F., caused the latter to suffer in popularity. Social Credit, on the other hand, offered an

---

<sup>62</sup> See Chapter 5 for an elaboration of Macpherson's argument in Democracy in Alberta: The Theory and Practise of a Quasi-Party System, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 4 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1953).

<sup>63</sup> W.L. Morton, "Bias," pp. 63-65; Morton noted J.R. Malloy's sectional characterization of Social Credit in his footnotes to "Bias," p. 65.

untried panacea and possessed a charismatic leader in William Aberhart whose brilliant propaganda techniques and evangelical and fundamentalist approach found a receptive audience in the province. Social Credit was the "heir and successor" to the U.F.A. and the Progressives, though not a direct continuation, as it represented a "revolutionary break," a branching out to class politics and urban dominance, reflecting the passing of the agricultural frontier. Social Credit, nonetheless, capitalized on the existing agrarian organizations and the familiarity of Albertans with soft money beliefs and credit and monetary reform.<sup>64</sup> Morton's fleeting recognition of Social Credit's class basis and Aberhart's personal charisma and religious appeal seem to indicate again a recognition that regional discontent could not by itself explain Social Credit's political success in Alberta.

In The Kingdom of Canada, Morton reiterated that Social Credit represented a cure to the myriad problems of Albertan society that could be safely supported by a populace radical in its rejection of the party system but conservative in its acceptance of free enterprise and private property. He also tied in the concept of nonpartisanship by stressing that Social Credit's nonpolitical appearance appealed to a population profoundly unhappy with the established political parties.<sup>65</sup> He restated this argument in "A Century," claim-

---

<sup>64</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 185-88, 285-87.

<sup>65</sup> W.L. Morton, Kingdom, p. 461.

ing that the Social Credit victory was a triumph of western apoliticalism.<sup>66</sup> Clearly, western antipathy to central Canada, its party system, and its economic hegemony played a role in Social Credit's victory; what is left unclear in Morton's analysis is the importance of this sentiment balanced against the many other factors in Alberta's historical complex that contributed to the Social Credit victory.

And what of the C.C.F. victory in Saskatchewan in 1944? In "Bias," Morton argued that the "bleak and scientific" socialism of the C.C.F. was not a utopian solution, though, like many other reforms of that era, it was garbed in a cloak of millenarianism and "presented idealistically as a creed of social justice."<sup>67</sup> How then did Morton view the C.C.F.? In "Bias," he stated that it was a political party in form and purpose, representing the fruition of the economic and political thought of both the agrarian and labour movements and a direct attack on the capitalist system.<sup>68</sup>

In The Progressive Party, Morton stated that, like Social Credit, the C.C.F. was a successor to, but not a continuation of, the Progressive movement, representing a branching out to class politics and urban and labour involvement. The C.C.F. was a composite and federal party, a coalition of fragmented agrarian, labour, and socialist groups that had

---

<sup>66</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century," pp. 8-10.

<sup>67</sup> W.L. Morton, "Bias," p. 64.

<sup>68</sup> Ibid., p. 65.



been in existence in the Prairies and Ontario for a number of years. Its birth was due to a coincidence of factors including the crisis conditions of the depression, the cooperation of U.F.A. members with labour representatives federally and provincially, the growing cooperation of agrarian and labour groups in Saskatchewan, and the resignation of H.W. Wood, the U.F.A. leader who had always opposed branching out from a purely agrarian movement.<sup>69</sup> From Morton's description of the origins of the C.C.F., once again it is obvious that regional discontent does not suffice as an explanation of an important political development in the West.

There were also many gaps in Morton's analysis of the C.C.F., one having particular relevance here. Morton had left unaddressed the nature of the C.C.F. triumph in 1944: was it a victory for socialism? for social democracy? for the prairie nonpartisan movement? or merely a long-delayed victory for a farmers' party promising greater returns to the agrarian community? In his only attempt to grapple with this issue, Morton, in "A Century," argued that the C.C.F.'s 1944 victory was "not so much a victory for a socialist or even a radical party as of prairie apoliticalism."<sup>70</sup> Here, it would seem that Morton was emphasizing the western "bias" over class politics and the party's agrarian element over its urban and labour base. Yet, Morton's brief analyses in

---

<sup>69</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 242, 271-85, 287.

<sup>70</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century," pp. 8-9.

"Bias" and The Progressive Party had made it clear that the C.C.F. could not be viewed only in the restricted framework of agrarian sectional discontent.

Turning to Manitoba, the primary political phenomenon in the "utopian period" was the survival of the Bracken government and its corollary, the failure of the C.C.F. or Social Credit to achieve power. Not addressed by Morton in "Bias," these developments were partially examined elsewhere. In The Progressive Party, Morton argued that political savvy preserved Bracken's administration. He also noted that Manitoba was an older and more conservative society than its prairie neighbours. The predominance of transplanted Ontarians in its social and political life, Winnipeg's function as a metropolis of the West, and its location on the east-west trade axis made Manitobans more tolerant and supportive of central Canadian views.<sup>71</sup> Though Morton did not make the connection, it is reasonable to assume that this conservative and nationalist sentiment hindered the local development of the utopian parties.

Again, in Manitoba, Morton emphasized Manitoba's "solid rural conservatism" and national outlook based on its integral role in the east-west economic axis.<sup>72</sup> Morton noted that the Manitoba government's reaction to the formation of

---

<sup>71</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 23, 31, 225, 230, 235.

<sup>72</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, pp. VIII, 148-50, 156-59, 166-73, 177-79, 183, 187-89, 195-96, 203, 222-29, 252, 300-1, 324-25, 396-97, 408, 420.

the Royal Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations was to argue for a strengthening of Dominion powers to alleviate the financial burdens of the province.<sup>73</sup> He also established that the Liberals and Conservatives had a long history in the province<sup>74</sup> and, again, while he never explicitly made the connection, strong old-party loyalties, which had not disappeared with the U.F.M. victory, obviously made it difficult for the new parties to win a substantial following. Not all Morton's reasons for the failure of the utopian parties need be made by inference. He stated that the C.C.F. cause was hurt by the refusal of the U.F.M. to align itself with the newly created provincial party in 1933.<sup>75</sup> And both parties were confronted by an administration adept in the use of alliances and coalitions to preserve its pragmatic and nonpartisan style of governing.<sup>76</sup> Not until 1958 did party politics return with the election of Duff Roblin's Conservatives, reflecting the desire for progress prevalent in a modernized and urbanized post-war society.<sup>77</sup> Morton omitted other possible reasons for the failure of the utopian parties; to name but two obvious oversights, the nature of their leadership and organization and the extent of rural agrarian organizational development.

---

<sup>73</sup> Ibid., pp. 428-33, 441-43, 460-62.

<sup>74</sup> See above.

<sup>75</sup> Ibid., p. 427.

<sup>76</sup> Ibid., pp. 405, 424-28, 442, 449-50, 459-66, 478-85.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid., pp. 459-60, 463-65, 474-85, 491-92.

In conclusion, Morton's analysis of Manitoba politics indicated that Manitoba society was significantly different than its prairie neighbours. In a number of ways, Manitobans shared a community of interests with central Canadians. These shared interests often inhibited the development of regional grievances and sentiment and, consequently, political expressions of regional discontent. There was regional discontent in Manitoba and it did effect political development, but its strength was weaker and its manifestations less obvious than elsewhere in the West.

In searching for a common denominator in the political development of the prairie provinces during the "utopian period," Morton, particularly in his later writings, fastened upon the related concepts of apoliticalism and plebiscitarianism. In "A Century," he argued that the Social Credit and C.C.F. victories in Alberta and Saskatchewan and the continuation of the Bracken-style system of governing in Manitoba demonstrated that "from 1935 to 1958, the West was largely an antipolitical community."<sup>78</sup> In a number of works,<sup>79</sup> he argued that provincial governments had become semi-plebiscitary: cabinets dominated government, legislatures and opposition parties had declined in importance, and governments appealed for support directly to the masses.

---

<sup>78</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century," pp. 7-10.

<sup>79</sup> W.L. Morton, Manitoba, p. 464; "The Western Progressive Movement and Cabinet Domination," p. 139; Kingdom, pp. 506-7.

Morton's emphasis on apoliticalism must be questioned, particularly his belief that partisan politics had been largely rejected in the prairie provinces and that opposition to the prairie ruling parties had declined. Certainly, in Alberta, nonpartisan sentiment was strong and the old two-party system had disappeared. Yet, the popular vote in provincial elections showed that opposition, though fragmented, did exist to the ruling U.F.A. and Social Credit.<sup>80</sup> In Saskatchewan, Morton had noted in The Progressive Party that in federal politics agrarianism was quickly reconciled with Liberalism.<sup>81</sup> Provincially, Morton's thesis must be questioned because politics had been partisan since 1905 and subsequent governments had never been without a significant opposition, though at times it was fragmented and appeared largely in the popular vote. In the 1930's, the Liberals and C.C.F. formed a viable two-party system.<sup>82</sup> In Manitoba, Morton had noted in a number of works the Liberal coalition with Bracken, even going so far as to conclude that after 1942 the government became essentially a Liberal administration, the meaningful opposition to the government provided by the provincial Conservatives, the continuing presence on the political scene of the C.C.F., and the alliance of Lib-

---

<sup>80</sup> See Chapter 5 for works by S.M. Lipset, Denis Smith, and T. Flanagan pertaining to this point.

<sup>81</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 210-11, 225-26, 231-35, 263-64, 271-72.

<sup>82</sup> This argument forms the basis of a work examined in Chapter 4: D.E. Smith, Prairie Liberalism: The Liberal Party in Saskatchewan, 1905-71, Canadian Government Series, no. 18 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975).

erals and Progressives in the federal election in 1926.<sup>83</sup> In surveying Morton's "utopian period," it is suggested that western politics was not as nonpartisan and apolitical as Morton posited. It is also apparent from a survey of Morton's own works that the western struggle against metropolitan domination played an important but by no means exclusive role in political development.

The last issue to be examined in this chapter is Morton's assessment of the effect of the "utopian period" on the western "bias." It would seem that Morton saw equity on the verge of realization but acknowledged that the "bias" had lingering effects. He had argued in The Progressive Party that as the hinterland grew in numbers and wealth an accommodation with the urban, industrial metropolis would have to be reached in the direction of freer trade or the undertaking by the metropolis of the subsidization of disadvantaged hinterland areas. Some concessions were won by the Progressive movement but, unfortunately, whatever progress had been made was halted by the forces of the depression. Yet, in Morton's opinion, this catastrophe forced the federal government to take steps, embodied in the report of the Rowell-Sirois Commission, that represented an acceptance of the basic theme of the Progressive movement, that "in a federal union of free citizens and equal communities, there must be such equality of economic opportunity and such equality of

---

<sup>83</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 225-31, 264, 271-72; Manitoba, pp. 380-484; "A Century," p. 8.

political status as human ingenuity may contrive and goodwill advance."<sup>84</sup>

The reaction of the federal government to the depression was the culmination of what Morton, in a later work, termed its policy of "offset." In "Canada: The One and the Many," published in 1977, Morton, again showing a stronger nationalist sentiment than he had in his early works, argued that the federal government had refined a procedure for balancing the natural advantages enjoyed by the metropolis. Debt allowance, federal transfer payments, and the Crow's Nest Pass rates were early examples of "offset." The federal government's use of credit to sustain provincial governments during the depression and its later assumption of the costs of unemployment insurance and, more importantly, equalization payments, represented the fruition of this policy.<sup>85</sup> In "A Century," Morton called equalization payments "the long delayed national answer to the West's protest against the unequal incidence of National Policy of east-west transportation and the protective tariff." Prosperity in and after the war had improved conditions to the point that "the West ceased to be an economic colony of Europe in political subordination to Eastern Canada."<sup>86</sup> Thus, it would seem that Morton acknowledged that the underlying basis of the "bias"

---

<sup>84</sup> W.L. Morton, The Progressive Party, pp. 288-89, 294-95.

<sup>85</sup> W.L. Morton, "Canada: The One and the Many," in Divided We Stand, ed. G. Geddes (Toronto: Peter Martin Associates Ltd., 1977), p. 128.

<sup>86</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century," pp. 7-9.

had been removed.

Still, Morton realized that the "bias" had lingering effects. In The Kingdom of Canada, he stressed the nonpartisan nature of Diefenbaker's support in the West in 1958.<sup>87</sup> In "A Century," he argued that the West remained a "distinctive civilization," set apart by the "apolitical, or even antipolitical, character of its public life," among other factors.<sup>88</sup> In "The West and the Nation, 1870-1970," he concluded that the West was the "third element in the political nationality of Canada," distinguished by its "positive, populist and provisionally a-political" political institutions.<sup>89</sup> In 1973, in "Some Thoughts on Understanding Canadian History," Morton concluded that regionalism continued to exist as "a state of mind, founded on geographical location and set in historical experience."<sup>90</sup>

Other than making these observations, Morton did not examine the contemporary political manifestations of regional discontent as his interest had shifted to other matters. It would fall to other historians to trace the continuing evolution of western politics as a function of the struggle to achieve political and economic equality. The most impor-

---

<sup>87</sup> W.L. Morton, Kingdom, p. 515.

<sup>88</sup> W.L. Morton, "A Century," p. 10.

<sup>89</sup> W.L. Morton, "The West and the Nation, 1870-1970," pp. 20-21.

<sup>90</sup> W.L. Morton, "Some Thoughts on Understanding Canadian History," Acadiensis 2 no. 2 (Spring 1973): 105-7.



tant of these works will be reviewed in the next chapter. Other historians, writing on the same period as Morton in his seminal article, "Bias," would explore different aspects of regional discontent and their relationship to specific political developments and the western political milieu. Leading works in this category will also be examined. Additionally, some political historians have exposed flaws and limitations in Morton's thesis. An analysis of their works will be the third function of the next chapter.

## Chapter IV

### CONTEMPORARY AND POST-MORTON HISTORIANS: ECHOES, IMITATIONS, AND REVISION

While Morton had proposed a general interpretive framework for analyzing western political evolution, he had not fully explored political development in the three prairie provinces as a function of western discontent directed at the central Canadian metropolis. Attention will now be turned to other historians whose works on various aspects of prairie politics not fully explored by Morton recognized the impact of regional discontent on western politics, though most did not indicate an acceptance of Morton's thesis in whole or even in part, suggesting their recognition of its limitations. A survey of the most important works in this category will contribute to the evaluation of Morton's thesis.

The first such work worthy of examination was L.H. Thomas's The Struggle for Responsible Government in the North-West Territories, 1870-1897, published in 1956. In his description of the attainment of responsible government, Thomas, echoing C.C. Lingard, asserted that the Territories' "peaceful struggle" against its "imperial-colonial" status and Dominion inertia, indifference, and conservatism

fostered a local "vigorous self-assertion."<sup>1</sup> As had Lingard, Thomas's concentration on political and constitutional development, including the tradition of nonpartisanship in local politics and the formation of federal party lines, caused him to depreciate other aspects of regional discontent, though he did not totally overlook the various economic grievances related to land and settlement, the tariff, grain marketing, and transportation.<sup>2</sup> Though Thomas, like Morton in Manitoba, may have been shortsighted in not recognizing that a large, sparsely populated region might not have the necessary administrative infrastructure and experience to establish representative and responsible government when it was first requested, his criticism of Dominion apathy rang true and his description of the resentment and reaction it engendered provided a good example of the influence of regional discontent on political development.

A second work acknowledging the effect of metropolitan domination on local political development, while again not directly citing Morton, was L.G. Thomas's The Liberal Party in Alberta: A History of Politics in the Province of Alberta, 1905-1921, published in 1959.<sup>3</sup> It was Thomas's opinion that the introduction of the two-party system in Alberta in

---

<sup>1</sup> L.H. Thomas, The Struggle for Responsible Government in the North-West Territories, 1870-1897 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1956), pp. 3-5, 9-20, 44-263.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid., pp. 103-4, 121-28, 140-41, 235, 246, 252.

<sup>3</sup> Thomas first presented these themes in "The Liberal Party in Alberta, 1905-21," Canadian Historical Review 28 no. 4 (December 1947): 411-27.

1905 was the result of federal interference in Territorial politics, which to that time had been more nonpartisan than not.<sup>4</sup> After sixteen years of Liberal rule, Thomas argued, the tradition of nonpartisanship and opposition to the party system, intensified by the Alberta Great Waterways Railway scandal, divisions within the Liberal party, unpopular policies, the general discontent of the times, and the weakness of the Conservatives, brought a strong U.F.A. organization to power. His conclusion that their victory was a nonpartisan triumph that spelled the end of the two-party system lent weight both to Morton's argument that regional discontent influenced political development and claim that nonpartisan sentiment was stronger in Alberta than Saskatchewan or Manitoba.<sup>5</sup> Yet, Thomas listed a number of causative factors in Alberta's political evolution that fell outside the domain of regional discontent. Like L.H. Thomas, he acknowledged that local discontent with certain aspects of metropolitan domination influenced political development but stopped short of elevating this observation to the level of general theory. Interestingly, Thomas, if anything, underestimated the effect of national events on local political development.

---

<sup>4</sup> L.G. Thomas, The Liberal Party in Alberta: A History of Politics in the Province of Alberta, 1905-1921, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 8 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959), pp. 3-33, 205-7.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid., pp. XI-XII, 23-27, 58, 68-95, 108-20, 130-37, 142-47, 153-56, 163, 171-99, 203-7.

With the passing of the 1950's, the attention of the academic community shifted noticeably away from the study of western political development and third parties within a "metropolis-hinterland" framework. Consequently, few works were produced in the next decade possessing the theoretical orientation that Morton's works had evidenced. In the 1970's, the increasing intensity of regional discontent inspired a renewal of interest in western political culture. Those historians who reviewed the history of western discontent acknowledged its impact on prairie politics. Only a few, however, favourably noted Morton's three-stage thesis<sup>6</sup> and none addressed the task of expanding Morton's analysis. Similarly, only a few historical works explored aspects of the interrelationship of early regional discontent and political development neglected by Morton and, therefore, merit appraisal.

As noted in Chapter 3, Morton had not fully explored the continuity in agrarian unrest expressed by the early farmers' organizations in Manitoba and their contributions to later political evolution. In 1965, in "The Patrons of Industry in Manitoba, 1890-1898," and 1976, in "The Birth of Agrarianism in the Prairie West," B.R. McCutcheon, recognizing that a historiographical gap existed, described the agrarian frontier response of the Farmers' Union and the Patrons of Industry to an unchanging economic and political milieu. He asserted that in their initiation of the strug-

---

<sup>6</sup> See below.

gle against metropolitan tariff, land, banking, and railway policy, monopolies, the grain marketing system, and national political institutions, they "indicated the direction that farmers would take in attempting to solve the persistent problems of Prairie agriculture."<sup>7</sup>

Another area of the growth of western discontent which Morton had not fully explored was its relationship to the western press, though in The Progressive Party, he had acknowledged the impact of the Grain Growers' Guide and editorials in the Manitoba Free Press on the evolution of political discontent.<sup>8</sup> The linkage of the western press and regional sentiment in the early period of western settlement was partially examined in 1971 by P.F.W. Rutherford in "The Western Press and Regionalism, 1870-96." Rutherford defined regionalism as a "species of rhetoric" fostered by the western press which, in the late 1800's and early 1900's, singled out the federal government and eastern business interests as scapegoats for the West's failure to expand as rapidly as its inhabitants expected.<sup>9</sup> While McCutcheon had

---

<sup>7</sup> B.R. McCutcheon, "The Patrons of Industry in Manitoba, 1890-1898," Transactions of the Historical and Scientific Society of Manitoba Series III no. 22 (1965-66): 7-25; "The Birth of Agrarianism in the Prairie West," Prairie Forum 1 no. 2 (November 1976): 79-94.

<sup>8</sup> The influence of the Guide and the Free Press editorials of J.W. Dafoe is apparent throughout the book.

<sup>9</sup> P.F.W. Rutherford, "The Western Press and Regionalism, 1870-96," Canadian Historical Review 52 no. 3 (September 1971): 287-305; A specific example of the western press leading and shaping western discontent is found in R. Cook, The Politics of John W. Dafoe and the Free Press (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963).

stressed that the early agrarian organizations were vehicles for the propagation and perpetuation of western discontent, Rutherford cited the role of the regional press. Their works, taken together, provided insight into the process by which the western "bias" became deeply implanted in regional consciousness.

Another work that enhanced understanding of the effect of regional discontent on early western political development was J.H. Thompson's 1978 The Harvests of War: The Prairie West, 1914-1918. Throughout, Thompson accepted Morton's description in The Progressive Party of the intensification of agrarian discontent from 1911 to 1918,<sup>10</sup> but went beyond Morton in dealing with aspects of western discontent that extended beyond the bounds of the agrarian community. Specifically, Thompson argued that despite its substantial contribution to the war effort, the West received little benefit in terms of increased industrialization, spurring resentment against the "profiteering" East. He stressed that inflation, labour problems, over-dependence on a one-crop economy, indebtedness, and the failure of the Union government to enact desired economic, political, and social reforms ensured that the West faced in 1919 "many of the same problems that had confronted it in the summer of 1914." As had Morton, Thompson concluded that heightened regionalism inevitably turned the West against the Union govern-

---

<sup>10</sup> J.H. Thompson, The Harvests of War: The Prairie West, 1914-1918 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1978), pp. 14, 71-72, 121, 152-53.

ment.<sup>11</sup>

The final work to be considered and the only one to actually indicate general support of Morton's thesis was D. Owram's 1980 Promise of Eden: The Canadian Expansionist Movement and the Idea of the West, 1856-1900. Owram called Morton's three stages of "bias" an "astute and perceptive explanation of the nature of western politics" but questioned his view that the 1869-70 uprising was its catalyst. He, instead, singled out the unfulfilled expectations of western settlers, attributable to the unrealistic propaganda of the hinterland-seeking Canadian expansionist movement. Owram argued that unfulfilled expectations became endemic to the western experience, ensuring that metropolitan Canada and the federal government remained the scapegoats of western alienation.<sup>12</sup> Westerners also turned their hostility against the histories of the West produced by expansionist historians. Western historians sought a rewritten history reflecting the West's unique features and historical development. The birth of a regional historiography was part of a general rejection of metropolitan control, formation of a "general sense of grievance," and development of regional sentiment.<sup>13</sup> Owram undoubtedly overemphasized the effect of

---

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., pp. 46-72, 95-172.

<sup>12</sup> D. Owram, Promise of Eden: The Canadian Expansionist Movement and the Idea of the West, 1856-1900 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. 5, 37-78, 101-24, 134-224.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., pp. 170-216.



expansionist propaganda on the growth of regional discontent, yet his themes of unfulfilled expectations and cultural subordination offered a new perspective on the growth of a regional "bias."

Though only Owram's among the preceding works openly acknowledged Morton's thesis and three stages of western political development, their combined effect reinforced the supposition that regional discontent was important in shaping western political development. The fact, however, that Morton's three-stage model was not widely used by later historians would seemingly indicate that it possessed widely recognized fundamental flaws. Attention will now be turned to historical works whose findings have exposed these flaws, though, admittedly, this was not, in almost all cases, their *raison d'etre*.

One of the weakest areas of Morton's argument concerned the C.C.F. As noted in the preceding chapter, he had recognized that the C.C.F. was not a "utopian" party and that it represented class as well as regional politics. Clearly then, the party's formation, growth, and eventual triumph in Saskatchewan could not be described solely in terms of Morton's interpretive framework. An examination of works on the C.C.F. after 1955 confirms what Morton had realized, but downplayed, and D.E. McHenry had suggested: the weakness of regional discontent and western apoliticalism as analytical tools for the study of the party's formation and development

in Saskatchewan and the West. For example, K. McNaught's A Prophet in Politics: A Biography of J.S. Woodsworth, published in 1959, placed the C.C.F. in a wider perspective than McHenry, one that diminished even further the role of western agrarian discontent in the party's formation. McNaught emphasized that the C.C.F. was far more than a "prairie farm protest." Its distinct socialist element and platform "sprang from the urban labour movement, from the social gospel of the churches, and from radical intellectuals, as well as from the soil of the wheat belt."<sup>14</sup>

In the 1960's, works on the C.C.F. continued to illustrate that western discontent did not suffice as an explanation of the party's origin and growth. The most important of these works was W.D. Young's 1969 The Anatomy of a Party: The National C.C.F. 1932-61, the most detailed history of the party to date. Young, following the basic theme of movement to party progression first enunciated by L. Zakuta in 1964 in A Protest Movement Becalmed: A Study of Change in the C.C.F., argued that the C.C.F. national movement moved away from its agrarian roots and leanings to become an urban and labour oriented, eastern dominated, centralized and institutionalized party in the British Labour Party tradi-

---

<sup>14</sup> K. McNaught, A Prophet in Politics: A Biography of J.S. Woodsworth (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959), pp. 53, 88-89, 165-66, 186-92, 204-14, 255-65. For the contribution of radical intellectuals to the early program and organization of the C.C.F., see M. Horn, The League for Social Reconstruction: Intellectual Origins of the Democratic Left in Canada, 1930-1942 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. 36-216.

tion. These urban and labour elements had been present in the movement from the beginning.<sup>15</sup> Young, however, did not deny that regional discontent had played a role in the party's formation, admitting that to many farmers the C.C.F. represented an "indigenous prairie party ... set up to oppose the 'old line' parties of the East and their backers, the 'vested interests'."<sup>16</sup> The same year, in Democracy and Discontent: Progressivism, Socialism and Social Credit in the Canadian West, Young argued that the N.D.P. was less concerned with agrarian problems than the C.C.F. had been, due to its increasing labour orientation.<sup>17</sup> Though the "protest movement becalmed" and "movement-party" analytical approach was open to criticism,<sup>18</sup> the work of Young and others<sup>19</sup> showed clearly that the national C.C.F./N.D.P. owed its birth to more than regional discontent and had moved

---

<sup>15</sup> W.D. Young, The Anatomy of a Party: The National C.C.F., 1932-61 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969), pp. 3-302; L. Zakuta, A Protest Movement Becalmed: A Study of Change in the C.C.F. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1964).

<sup>16</sup> W.D. Young, The Anatomy of a Party, pp. 14-15, 75, 287.

<sup>17</sup> W.D. Young, Democracy and Discontent: Progressivism, Socialism and Social Credit in the Canadian West (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1969), pp. 71-78.

<sup>18</sup> A. Whitehorn, "An Analysis of the Historiography of the C.C.F.-N.D.P.: The Protest Movement Becalmed Tradition," in Building the Cooperative Commonwealth: Essays on the Democratic Socialist Tradition in Canada, ed. J.W. Brennan (Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, 1984), pp. 1-24.

<sup>19</sup> See, for example: D. Morton, N.D.P.: The Dream of Power (Toronto: A.M. Hakkert Ltd., 1974); I. Avakumovic, Socialism in Canada: A Study of the C.C.F.-N.D.P. in Federal and Provincial Politics (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1978).

away from its sectional agrarian roots in an attempt to win power federally. This analytical framework provided insight into the party's declining support in the West and the inappropriateness of its characterization as solely a vehicle of western protest.

Further works on the C.C.F. cast doubt on Morton's conclusion that the Saskatchewan provincial party's 1944 victory represented a triumph, not of a socialist or a radical alternative, but of western apoliticalism. Beginning in the late 1960's, a historiographical debate ensued over the degree of socialism present in the Saskatchewan C.C.F. from its formation to its 1944 victory. This issue was not conclusively resolved,<sup>20</sup> but the debate had two consequences

---

<sup>20</sup> Articles addressing this historiographical debate included: E. Eager, "The Conservatism of the Saskatchewan Electorate," in Politics in Saskatchewan, eds. N. Ward and D. Spafford (Toronto: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1968), pp. 1-19; E. Eager, Saskatchewan Government: Politics and Pragmatism (Saskatoon: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1980), pp. 1-12, 18-25, 43-67; D. Spafford, "The Origin of the Farmers' Union of Canada," Saskatchewan History 18 no. 3 (Autumn 1965): 89-98; D. Spafford, "The 'Left Wing', 1921-1931," in Politics in Saskatchewan, pp. 44-58; P.R. Sinclair, "The Saskatchewan C.C.F.: Ascent to Power and the Decline of Socialism," Canadian Historical Review 54 no.4 (December 1973): 419-33; L.D. Courville, "The Conservatism of the Saskatchewan Progressives," Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1974): 157-81; G. Hoffman, "The Saskatchewan Farmer-Labor Party, 1932-1934: How Radical Was It At Its Origins," Saskatchewan History 28 no. 2 (Spring 1975): 52-64; G. Hoffman, "The Entry of the United Farmers of Canada, Saskatchewan Section into Politics: A Reassessment," Saskatchewan History 30 no. 3 (Autumn 1977): 99-109; L.H. Thomas, "The C.C.F. Victory in Saskatchewan, 1944," Saskatchewan History 34 no. 1 (Winter 1981): 1-16; J.W. Bennett and C. Krueger, "Agrarian Pragmatism and Radical Politics," in Agrarian Socialism: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan: A Study in Political Sociology,

for Morton's thesis. First, no participant claimed that the C.C.F.'s 1944 victory was only a triumph of western apoliticalism. On the other hand, never was it claimed that western antipathy to metropolitan domination did not play a key role in the C.C.F.'s initial popularity and success in Saskatchewan, a conclusion shared by all historians of the party.

Turning from the C.C.F. to the fate of the Liberals and Conservatives in the West, one finds that not all historians have accepted Morton's belief that Westerners had rejected the old political order in their quest for equality. That this was not entirely the case in federal politics was pointed out by Denis Smith, in 1970, in "Liberals and Conservatives on the Prairies, 1917-1968."<sup>21</sup> Smith argued that the Liberals and Conservatives had always maintained a "substantial presence" in the West. Excepting 1921, their combined vote in the three provinces in every federal election was over 50% of the total cast. Only the nature of the electoral system "tended to obscure" the strength of their support.<sup>22</sup>

---

updated ed., ed. S.M. Lipset (New York: Doubleday and Co. Inc., 1968), pp. 347-63.

<sup>21</sup> Smith's work was one of a number of papers presented at the first Western Canadian Studies Conference in 1969. From this conference and its successors would emerge many useful works on western political development.

<sup>22</sup> Denis Smith, "Liberals and Conservatives on the Prairies, 1917-1968," in Prairie Perspectives, ed. D.P. Gagan (Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970), pp. 31-43; D.E. Smith made this same point in a number of works.

Other historians have presented evidence contradicting Morton's belief that the West was largely apolitical at the provincial level. The fallacy of this argument for Saskatchewan politics is apparent from a reading of D.E. Smith's 1975 Prairie Liberalism. Smith argued that Saskatchewan had experienced partisan politics since 1905. Political opposition had been present in the province since then and, particularly so, after the emergence of a new two-party system in the 1930's.<sup>23</sup>

While Smith's work demonstrated the partisan and competitive nature of Saskatchewan politics during the "utopian period," a close reading of J. Kendle's 1979 John Bracken: A Political Biography suggests that political opposition was a constant and significant, if divided, factor in the elections of the Bracken era,<sup>24</sup> thereby casting doubt on the applicability of Morton's apolitical thesis in Manitoba. Contrarily, if "apoliticalism" was too strong a description,

---

<sup>23</sup> D.E. Smith, Prairie Liberalism, pp. 3-334. In 1969, Smith had acknowledged the advent of political partisanship in Saskatchewan after 1905 in "A Comparison of Prairie Political Developments in Saskatchewan and Alberta," Journal of Canadian Studies 4 no. 1 (February 1969): 17-26. In 1972, Smith concluded that after 1934, "the absence of single-party dominance and the continued existence of competitive party politics have been traditional characteristics and must now be regarded as essential components of the party system of Saskatchewan," in D.E. Smith and J.C. Courtney, "Parties in a Politically Competitive Province," in Canadian Provincial Politics: The Party Systems of the Ten Provinces, ed. M. Robin (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1972), pp. 290-318.

<sup>24</sup> J. Kendle, John Bracken: A Political Biography (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1979), pp. 27-32, 41, 65-66, 125-26, 141-46.

there is no doubt that as Kendle argued, citing Morton, there was in Manitoba during the Bracken years a fairly widespread "disinterest in partisan politics."<sup>25</sup>

In addition to the continuing presence of party opposition, Kendle's analysis of Bracken's political motives also contradicted Morton's apolitical thesis. While constantly asserting Bracken's belief in the "primarily administrative" role of government and his dislike of the "narrow exactitudes of party politics," Kendle admitted that Bracken was an "astute political realist" who excelled in "political gamesmanship." Coalition invitations extended to opposition parties in 1931, 1936, and 1940 were a means of preserving political power and discrediting opponents who refused to join or support his government. In the same vein, Kendle also admitted that parties receptive to Bracken's overtures were not motivated as much by a nonpartisan spirit as concrete political concerns.<sup>26</sup>

Lastly, Kendle, echoing Morton, noted that Bracken believed the end to discrimination by the National Policy and an unfair division of powers and revenue lay in increased federal powers. He was a forceful proponent of the strengthening of the Dominion government as recommended by

---

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., pp. 27-31, 37, 41, 140-41, 173-76, 181, 248.

<sup>26</sup> Ibid., pp. 30-31, 39-46, 63-64, 68, 94-98, 115-22, 125-26, 141-46, 173-76, 248. See also N. Wiseman, Social Democracy in Manitoba: A History of the C.C.F.-N.D.P. (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1983), pp. 24-36.

the Rowell-Sirois Commission.<sup>27</sup> Again, the point is made that the Bracken government was no champion of provincial rights, in stark contrast to Aberhart's Social Credit.

The final historical work to be considered for its implicit critique of Morton's "bias" is M.S. Donnelly's 1963 The Government of Manitoba. Donnelly, in studying the political institutions of the province, covered the familiar ground of early local political and economic grievances and the formation of political parties, but took a more pragmatic stance than Morton, accepting the wisdom of Dominion retention of public lands and judging as premature the grant of provincial status. He also put greater emphasis on the school question as a source of federal-provincial discord.<sup>28</sup> Finally, he noted, as did Morton and Kendle, that after the return of natural resources in 1930, the Manitoba government lost interest in "provincial rights" and became a cooperative partner in Canadian federalism.<sup>29</sup>

This brief survey of historical works, while not refuting Morton's belief that western discontent had influenced regional political development, suggested weaknesses in the other main underpinnings of his thesis. Works examining the C.C.F. clearly illustrated that not all prairie political

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., pp. 157-80, 249.

<sup>28</sup> M.S. Donnelly, The Government of Manitoba, Canadian Government Series, no. 14 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963), pp. 12-71.

<sup>29</sup> Ibid., p. 45.



developments could be placed entirely within a framework of metropolitan domination and hinterland response. Other works cast doubt on the level of nonpartisanship and apoliticalism in prairie politics, suggesting that the C.C.F. was clearly more than an expression of western apoliticalism, the Liberals and Conservatives had not been rejected as decisively as suggested, partisan politics and political opposition existed in Saskatchewan and, to a lesser degree, in Manitoba, and the Manitoba government, unlike its Alberta counterpart, was not averse to working with the Dominion. Finally, Donnelly's support of Dominion land policy contradicted one of Morton's foundations of "colonial subordination."

Attention will now be turned to recent historical works tracing the evolution of western discontent after 1955 and illustrating its continuing impact on western political development. A common theme found in most of these works was the assertion that a reciprocal relationship existed between the perpetuation of discontent and the continuing existence of sentiments of regionalism in the three prairie provinces. A number of noted Canadian historians even suggested that in modern Canadian society, regionalism was not only a continuing factor but an integral part of Canadian identity; a conclusion that reinforced Morton's contention in "A Century" that the West remained a "distinctive civilization."<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>30</sup> See Chapter 3.

One of the earliest works of this nature appeared in 1959. G.F.G. Stanley, in "Regionalism in Canadian History," argued that regionalism was a dominant force in Canada and the Prairies were a distinct region based on history, geography, economics, and a "state of mind."<sup>31</sup> In 1970, Stanley, in "The Western Canadian Mystique," repeated this argument, asserting that despite increased urbanization and industrialization, progressivism and regionalism were still vital forces in the West, fueled by the "repeated note of protest against the semi-colonial domination of the West by Eastern interests, financial, economic and political."<sup>32</sup>

Stanley's assertion of the vitality of regionalism was reinforced by many other historians; two of the most prominent being R. Cook and J.M.S. Careless. Cook, in 1967, in "Canadian Centennial Cerebrations," argued that Canadianism was to be found in the "regional, ethnic and class identities" of Canadian life.<sup>33</sup> In 1969, Careless, in "'Limited Identities' in Canada," accepted Cook's argument that the true nature of Canada lay in its "limited identities" and argued that regionalism was a growing force in Canadian life due to historical, geographic, economic, social, and political factors.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>31</sup> G.F.G. Stanley, "Regionalism in Canadian History," Ontario History 51 no. 3 (Summer 1959): 163-71.

<sup>32</sup> G.F.G. Stanley, "The Western Canadian Mystique," in Prairie Perspectives, pp. 8-25.

<sup>33</sup> R. Cook, "Canadian Centennial Cerebrations," International Journal 22 no. 4 (Autumn 1967): 662-63.

In the 1960's, 1970's, and 1980's, the evidence pointing to the continuation of a distinct western identity was strengthened by the increasingly high level of discontent generated in the West by the policies of the federal Liberal government and the continuing electoral rejection of the Liberals. As already noted, these developments drew a considerable amount of academic attention. However, the resultant studies only occasionally categorized contemporary manifestations of discontent as further evolutions of Morton's three-stage model. More importantly, most, if not all, did acknowledge the continuing presence of a pervasive sentiment of regional discontent and its effect on political development.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>34</sup> J.M.S. Careless, "'Limited Identities' in Canada," Canadian Historical Review 50 no. 1 (March 1969): 1-10.

<sup>35</sup> See, for example: D.J. Bercuson, Introduction to Canada and the Burden of Unity, ed. D.J. Bercuson (Toronto: MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1977), pp. 1-18; D.J. Bercuson, "Regionalism and 'Unlimited Identity' in Western Canada," Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 121-26; E. Eager, Saskatchewan Government, pp. 184-92; J.F. Conway, The West: The History of a Region in Confederation (Toronto: James Lorimer and Co., 1983); D.P. Gagan, Introduction to Prairie Perspectives, pp. 1-3; Denis Smith, "Liberals and Conservatives on the Prairies, 1917-1968," pp. 30-31, 41-43; D. Swainson, "Canada Annexes the West: Colonial Status Confirmed," in Federalism in Canada and Australia: The Early Years, eds. B.W. Hodgins, D. Wright, and W.H. Heick (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1978), pp. 137-57; J.A. Archer, "The Prairie Perspective," in One Country or Two?, ed. R.M. Burns (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1971), pp. 231-52; J.A. Archer, "The Prairie Perspective in 1977," in Must Canada Fail?, ed. R. Simeon (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1977), pp. 73-84; B. Cooper, "Western Political Consciousness," in Political Thought in Canada: Contemporary Perspectives, ed. S. Brook (Toronto: Irwin Publishing, 1984), pp.

Nowhere was the modern evolution of western discontent discussed as thoroughly as in the writings of D.E. Smith; necessitating a comprehensive survey of his works. In Prairie Perspectives, in 1970, Smith argued that prairie culture was distinguished by themes of "protest, disillusionment, and separatism."<sup>36</sup> While the first two themes were certainly in accord with Morton's findings, that of separatism was contrary to his belief that Westerners sought integration with the rest of Canada. Smith also observed that in finding a vehicle for their radicalism, Westerners were "eminently practical, supporting different parties at different times."<sup>37</sup>

In 1974, in "Liberalism in Saskatchewan: The Evolution of a Provincial Party," Smith presented a specific instance of regional discontent effecting western political development, claiming that despite the Saskatchewan provincial party's severance of ties with the federal Liberals, the latter's unpopular agricultural policies were the cause of the pro-

---

213-38; J.J. Barr, "Beyond Bitterness: The New Western Radicalism," in The Unfinished Revolt: Some Views on Western Independence, eds. J.J. Barr and O. Anderson (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1971), pp. 11-32; O. Anderson, "The Unfinished Revolt," in The Unfinished Revolt, pp. 35-59.

<sup>36</sup> D.E. Smith, Conclusion to Prairie Perspectives, pp. 92-94.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., p. 93.

<sup>38</sup> D.E. Smith, "Liberalism in Saskatchewan: The Evolution of a Provincial Party," in Western Perspectives I, ed. D.J. Bercuson (Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada

vincial Liberal defeat in 1971.<sup>38</sup> There were other causes,<sup>39</sup> but Smith's conclusion illustrated that there was a continuing western sensitivity to metropolitan domination. In 1976, in "The Prairie Provinces," Smith argued that the West was a unique region based in its "geography, economy, and people." These factors had contributed to the distinct political development of each of the three prairie provinces.<sup>40</sup> In 1977, in "Western Politics and National Unity," Smith again argued that the three provinces shared "a regional political culture," though each province had distinctive characteristics. He also noted a modern example of the "floating protest vote": Westerners had rejected the Liberals and Morton's utopian parties had become "provincialized," resulting in strong support for the Conservatives in federal politics. Ironically, this new evolution in the "continuation of the tradition of prairie political protest" further alienated Westerners from the federal government.<sup>41</sup>

---

Ltd., 1974), pp. 101-9.

<sup>39</sup> B. Wilson blamed weak leadership and organization and vague ideology more than ties with an unpopular federal Liberal party for the decline of the provincial Liberals in Saskatchewan in Politics of Defeat: The Decline of the Liberal Party in Saskatchewan (Saskatoon: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1980), pp. 2-165. E. Eager suggested that local unhappiness with the federal Liberals was just one of many factors contributing to Thatcher's defeat in Saskatchewan Government, pp. 60-61, 185.

<sup>40</sup> D.E. Smith, "The Prairie Provinces," in The Provincial Political Systems: Comparative Essays, eds. D.J. Bellamy, J.H. Pammett, and D.C. Rowat (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1976), pp. 46-61.

<sup>41</sup> D.E. Smith, "Western Politics and National Unity," in Canada and the Burden of Unity, pp. 142-68.

In 1981, in "Political Culture in the West," Smith, using as a starting point W.L. Morton's belief that the West retained distinct political characteristics, defined the main features of the "common heritage of western political culture" as the long-standing rejection of cultural dualism and its political champions, the ongoing fight against central Canadian economic and political domination, and the struggle to gain greater control over federal policy making. He also examined recent western attempts to redress contemporary grievances: constitutional reform, greater representation in the cabinet and bureaucracy, pressure group activity, and regional autonomy; the latter, in his opinion, being the most effective means of protecting western interests.<sup>42</sup> He concluded that the Prairies were less integrated than they once were but certain historical experiences had given them a common political outlook in regional-federal relations.<sup>43</sup>

Again, in 1981, in The Regional Decline of a National Party: Liberals On the Prairies, Smith argued that western discontent had not decreased in strength despite the passage of time and growing intraregional heterogeneity. Recent grievances "played against a backdrop of memory" and reinforced the "regional perspective that geography and history have helped create." Discontent would continue as long as

---

<sup>42</sup> D.E. Smith, "Political Culture in the West," in Eastern and Western Perspectives, pp. 170-79.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 179.

did the western perception that the "center maintains its dominance."<sup>44</sup>

In this work, Smith presented his most extensive examination of the decline of the federal Liberal party. He attributed their demise in the West dating from the late 1950's to unpopular agriculture, transportation, tax reform, language, constitutional, and natural resource policies. Disputes over these policies had alienated the provincial Liberals in the West from their federal counterparts. Jurisdictional and organizational disputes stemming from the structural reorganization of the federal party in the 1960's and ideological, patronage, and personality conflicts exacerbated this split, further weakening both federal and provincial Liberals.<sup>45</sup> Repeating his 1977 article verbatim, Smith again noted that Westerners had turned to a new political champion, the federal Conservatives. At the same time, Smith observed a growing provincialism in the West and a concurrent decentralization of federalism.<sup>46</sup>

Finally, in 1985, in "Grits and Tories on the Prairies," Smith again observed the popularity of the Conservatives federally, concluding that "as long as the Liberals continue to rule, the region will find satisfaction in aligning

---

<sup>44</sup> D.E. Smith, The Regional Decline of a National Party: Liberals on the Prairies, Canadian Government Series, no. 21 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981), pp. XVI-XVII, 20, 41, 111, 116, 145, 150.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., pp. XV-XVII, 17-32, 51-111, 129-49.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid., pp. 28-32, 40-41, 46-47, 115-34, 149-50.

itself with the principal opposition party."<sup>47</sup> More than any other contemporary western historian, Smith continued in Morton's tradition; examining the continuing distinctiveness of the West, writing western political history from a local viewpoint, asserting the presence of central Canadian dominance, and touching on all the major manifestations of regional discontent. Smith's work, of course, also shared a weakness of Morton's, in that his analysis, although enlightening, ignored the many other factors that influenced political development in the West.

One of the contemporary political manifestations of regional discontent noted by Smith, support of the federal Conservatives, was analyzed in a number of works that merit examination. In 1963, P.C. Newman, in Renegade in Power: The Diefenbaker Years, noted the strength of Diefenbaker's personal popularity in the West, particularly his populist, anti-establishment, anti-Bay Street appeal, and the popularity of his government's agricultural and regional equalization policies.<sup>48</sup> Newman recognized, however, that despite Diefenbaker's anti-eastern appeal, his 1958 election campaign aroused a "pan-Canadian" sentiment in the West.<sup>49</sup> New-

---

<sup>47</sup> D.E. Smith, "Grits and Tories on the Prairies," in Party Politics in Canada, 5th ed., ed. H.G. Thorburn (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Inc., 1985), pp. 260-77.

<sup>48</sup> P.C. Newman, Renegade in Power: The Diefenbaker Years (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1963), pp. XIII, XIV, 12, 24-26, 36-43, 46-48, 52, 55, 63-64, 73-74, 81, 101, 134-37, 142-45, 179-95, 292, 331, 399.

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 73.



man's observation, reflecting Morton's belief that Westerners sought full integration into the Canadian mainstream, was reinforced by P. Regenstreif in The Diefenbaker Interlude: Parties and Voting in Canada: An Interpretation, published in 1965, and Denis Smith in "Liberals and Conservatives on the Prairies, 1917-1968," published in 1970, who agreed that Westerners saw in Diefenbaker their chance to play an integral role in nation-building.<sup>50</sup> In totality, these works on the Diefenbaker phenomenon showed that western discontent continued to effect political development in the late 1950's and early 1960's.

Provincialism and support of the federal Conservative party were not the only contemporary political manifestations of western discontent. This reality was recognized by D. Ooram in "Reluctant Hinterland," published in 1981. After accepting Morton's stages of "bias" and posing a fourth stage, western provincialism, the latter a product of the moderation in office of the utopian parties and the realization that fundamental reform at the national level was impossible given the inevitable differences in regional interests and the minority position of the West,<sup>51</sup> Ooram

---

<sup>50</sup> P. Regenstreif, The Diefenbaker Interlude: Parties and Voting in Canada: An Interpretation (Toronto: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1965), pp. 32-33, 36, 39, 55, 133-53; Denis Smith, "Liberals and Conservatives," pp. 40-41.

<sup>51</sup> D. Ooram, "Reluctant Hinterland," in Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, eds. L. Pratt and G. Stevenson (Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981), pp. 49-60, 63. B. Cooper also suggested a fourth stage, "province building," in "Western Political Consciousness," p. 229.

noted a further evolution in the "bias" with the emergence of separatism as a political alternative, made feasible by the prospect of resource-based prosperity. He expressed fear that future regional grievances might lead to separatism becoming a legitimate option, a definite concern because western grievances based in "the nature of democracy itself and especially ... the 'tyranny of the majority'" were too deep-rooted to be alleviated by the mere passage of legislation. The "bias," in Owram's opinion, would continue into the foreseeable future.<sup>52</sup>

In the same collection of works, R. Gibbins, in "American Influence on Western Separatism," also examined the rise of western separatism. After noting that provincial governments had failed to redress western grievances because too many key powers remained under Dominion control,<sup>53</sup> Gibbins argued that separatism--espousing traditional grievances and, more importantly, populist right-wing reforms echoing those of the American right-wing--was the inevitable next step. This solution, Gibbins argued, was a break from traditional alienation in that it was not integrative and it attacked, on an ideological level, the existing political and economic order. Gibbins concluded that separatism, despite certain favourable conditions, would be held in check by a number of factors: Canadian nationalism, opposi-

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., pp. 45-64.

<sup>53</sup> R. Gibbins, "American Influence on Western Separatism," in Western Separatism, pp. 193-98, 202.

tion from provincial governments, strong provincial and weakening regional identities, and widespread opposition to the movement's extreme right-wing ideology.<sup>54</sup>

Neither Gibbins nor Ooram examined the separatist movement in depth. A clearer picture is gained from a reading of two more works in the same collection, D. Harrington's "Who are the Separatists?" and L. McKinsey's "Watching the Separatists." Harrington noted their populism, strident right-wing ideology, and espousal of traditional western grievances. She concluded, however, that they were only a temporary phenomenon, fueled by a profound dislike for Pierre Trudeau and discontent over his 1980 electoral victory and subsequent energy and constitutional policies. The passage of time and the fading of grievances coupled with the separatists' internal divisions, lack of concrete policies, and limited popularity, confined basically to Alberta, doomed the movement. Only another extreme "federal government act of aggression" could revive it.<sup>55</sup> These observations, in general, were shared by McKinsey. McKinsey, however, put more emphasis on the separatists as a right-wing group who used separatism as a bargaining tool to achieve their right-wing utopia.<sup>56</sup> McKinsey's observations, in particular, sug-

---

<sup>54</sup> Ibid., pp. 193, 196-98, 200-8.

<sup>55</sup> D. Harrington, "Who are the Separatists?," in Western Separatism, pp. 23-44.

<sup>56</sup> L. McKinsey, "Watching the Separatists," in Western Separatism, pp. 209-27; McKinsey's description of the separatist movement showed a striking similarity to M.B. Stein's conclusion that "Right-wing protest movements

gested that despite the obvious influence of regional discontent, the western separatist movement could not be analyzed in a strictly "metropolis-hinterland" framework.

In concluding this section on the contemporary political manifestations of regional discontent, one more aspect of its perpetuation must be noted. Numerous historians of prairie politics have argued, to varying degrees, that western discontent no longer possesses a verifiable factual basis and has become part of a regional mythology. In this belief, they have indirectly reinforced W.L. Morton's assertion that regionalism is a "state of mind."<sup>57</sup> For example, W.D. Young, in 1969, in Democracy and Discontent, argued that post-war prosperity had caused western discontent to become "more and more a myth perpetuated largely for partisan reasons." G. Friesen, in 1973, in "The Western Canadian Identity," suggested that "myth and interest were the constituents of western regional consciousness." To note but one more example, D.J. Bercuson, in 1980, in "Regionalism and 'Unlimited Identity' in Western Canada," argued that a number of grievances underlying the persistence of western alienation had evolved from a factual basis to "exist in the

---

tend to arise in modern industrialized societies among those segments of the population that wish to cling to traditional attitudes and beliefs in the face of socioeconomic change." M.B. Stein, The Dynamics of Right-Wing Protest: A Political Analysis of Social Credit in Quebec (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973), pp. 12, 234.

<sup>57</sup> See Chapter 3.

mind only."<sup>58</sup> These observations have great significance for Morton's thesis. Concrete regional concerns can perhaps be materially redressed but grievances that have entered the realm of mythology are not as eradicable and would seem to indicate that sentiments of regionalism and local grievance will probably always be present in the political milieu of the three prairie provinces to influence political choice.

This, then, concludes the third function of this chapter. At this point, it must be noted again that the limited number of contemporary historians using Morton's three-stage theory as an analytical approach suggests that the limitations of its applicability to contemporary western politics were quite evident in the historical community. The impact of regional discontent on political development was readily acknowledged but never raised to the level of an all-encompassing theory.

These sentiments were expressed as well as anywhere in G. Friesen's massive 1984 undertaking, The Canadian Prairies: A History. Friesen acknowledged the continuing presence of Morton's western "bias," rooted in perceived inequities dating from 1869-70, defining it as a tradition of "western regional dissatisfaction and grievance." He also noted contemporary western grievances and political expressions of

---

<sup>58</sup> W.D. Young, Democracy and Discontent, pp. 101-4; G. Friesen, "The Western Canadian Identity," Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1973): 13-19; D.J. Bercuson, "Regionalism and 'Unlimited Identity' in Western Canada," pp. 121-26.

discontent.<sup>59</sup> Yet, Friesen showed a keen awareness of some of the shortcomings of Morton's analysis. He was more aware than Morton of other influences on political development than regional discontent, such as class and ethnic factors, personality, and even historical accident.<sup>60</sup> He also asserted that the Progressive movement was far more than a regional protest of wheat producers and did not judge the movement a failure.<sup>61</sup> Lastly, he argued that politics in Manitoba and Saskatchewan were not as apolitical and nonpartisan as historians such as Morton had believed.<sup>62</sup> Throughout his work, Friesen grasped the essence of the western "bias"; western political discontent continued to be one of a number of influences on western politics, even though the legitimacy of many specific complaints could be questioned. The process of evaluation of Morton's thesis begun in this chapter will now be continued through an analysis of work in disciplines other than history and in ethnic, class, labour, and social history.

---

<sup>59</sup> G. Friesen, The Canadian Prairies: A History (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984), pp. 126-28, 162-63, 176-94, 211-29, 239-40, 327, 332-44, 349, 366-81, 385-86, 400-17, 426-29, 444-53, 460.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 242-300, 316, 324-25, 345-64, 374-81, 401-27, 453, 460, 464.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 364-81.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 341, 400-9.

## Chapter V

### INTERDISCIPLINARY PERSPECTIVES AND A REVISED "BIAS"

In continuing the evaluation of Morton's thesis as an analytical approach to the study of western political development, much insight can be gained from a survey of works in economics, sociology, socio-psychology, political science, and ethnic, class, labour, and social history. The first discipline to be examined is economic history. During the 1930's, the end of the expansionary phase of western development, the inability of the economic structure of the West to withstand the devastating effects of the depression,<sup>1</sup> and the formation of new political movements espousing economic reform directed the attention of the academic community to an examination of the regional impact of the various elements of the National Policy. This examination extended beyond the shallow critical assessments of Dominion tariff, land, and transportation policy made by the early historians

---

<sup>1</sup> For a survey of economic conditions in the West in the 1930's which will increase understanding of western susceptibility to new economic and political solutions, see: W.A. Mackintosh, Economic Problems of the Prairie Provinces, Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 4 (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1935), pp. IX, 3-5, 9-11, 33-54, 87, 258-59, 263-76; G. Britnell, The Wheat Economy (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1939), pp. XV-XVI, 1-241; A.E. Safarian, The Canadian Economy in the Great Depression, The Carleton Library, no. 54 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1970), pp. 40-42, 194-200, 237.

of the farmers' movement. A representative sampling of the ensuing historiographical debate is in order for two reasons. First, the widespread belief in the existence of discriminatory federal policies and metropolitan business practices was one of the foundations of Morton's charge of "colonial subordination," and secondly, charges of economic domination and discrimination have persisted to the present, ensuring the perpetuation of regional discontent.

Despite the propitious circumstances, no concerted attack was launched on the National Policy in the 1930's and 1940's. One major deterrent was the influence of the Laurentianists who had sanctified the National Policy.<sup>2</sup> Yet even amongst national historians, there was criticism of the National Policy; A.R.M. Lower, in 1946, in Colony to Nation: A History of Canada, argued that the National Policy had created "vested manufacturing interests living on the bounty of government."<sup>3</sup>

Reflecting this more critical climate, even the Royal Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations questioned the regional benefits of the National Policy. The first book of the Commission, published in 1940, praised the Policy's impact during the formative years of the Canadian West<sup>4</sup> but

---

<sup>2</sup> A prominent example of this genre is D. Creighton, Dominion of the North: A History of Canada, pp. 329-76, 387-94, 430-36, 456-65.

<sup>3</sup> A.R.M. Lower, Colony To Nation: A History of Canada, 4th ed., rev. (Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1964; reprint ed., Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1969), p. 379.



concluded that "during the twenties and thirties the national economic policies ceased to produce their former expansionary and cohesive effects and gave rise to a set of difficult national problems and responsibilities." Changing conditions and circumstances necessitated an adaptation of national economic policies.<sup>5</sup> W.A. Mackintosh, in The Economic Background of Dominion-Provincial Relations, Appendix III of the Royal Commission Report, published in 1939, argued that the tariff lessened the real income of western resource owners, curbing the "growth of exports and population and the rise of land values." Tariff increases in the 1930's had "increased the economic pressure" on the West. Conversely, tariff reductions would have increased real income per capita.<sup>6</sup> Still, Mackintosh argued that because the tariff preceded western expansion its effects were known to western settlers and "discounted in the prices of land from the outset." If anything, the general tariff level had decreased during the years of western expansion and therefore "could not be said to result in a regional loss." In addition, the tariff was offset by the Crow's Nest Pass rates and the interregional mobility of labour.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> Canada, Report of the Royal Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations, Book I: Canada: 1867-1939 (Ottawa: Kings Printer, 1940), pp. 48-77, 87, 183-85.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid., pp. 151-60, 183-85.

<sup>6</sup> W.A. Mackintosh, The Economic Background of Dominion-Provincial Relations, Appendix III of the Royal Commission Report on Dominion-Provincial Relations (Ottawa: Kings Printer, 1939; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd, 1964), pp. 141-46, 151-53, 168-69.

Mild critiques of Dominion railway policy and freight rates also appeared at this time. In 1938, G. Glazebrook, in A History of Transportation in Canada, summarized western discontent over monopoly, disallowance, and freight rates and admitted no surprise that Manitobans had revolted against high transportation costs.<sup>8</sup> In 1940, A.W. Currie, in "Freight Rates on Grain in Western Canada," argued that pre-Crow's Nest Pass rates were "higher than the traffic could bear" and "tended to retard development."<sup>9</sup> On the other hand, the permanent institution of the Crow's Nest Pass agreement instituted rates lower than those that would have been obtained "on clear economic principles."<sup>10</sup>

A more vociferous early critic of the National Policy was V.C. Fowke. In 1946,<sup>11</sup> in Canadian Agricultural Policy: The Historical Pattern, Fowke argued that agriculture from 1850 to 1930 served as the "provider of investment opportunities" for Canada's commercial interests, first in Upper Canada and

---

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., pp. 62, 140-46, 151-54, 172.

<sup>8</sup> G.P. deT. Glazebrook, A History of Transportation in Canada, Volume II: National Economy, 1867-1936, The Carleton Library, no. 12 (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1938; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1964), pp. 109-16.

<sup>9</sup> A.W. Currie, "Freight Rates on Grain in Western Canada," Canadian Historical Review 21 no. 1 (March 1940): 40.

<sup>10</sup> Ibid., pp. 40-55.

<sup>11</sup> This work was an expansion of an argument presented in "An Introduction to Canadian Agricultural History," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 8 no. 1 (February 1942): 56-68.

then in the new West.<sup>12</sup> In surveying national agricultural policy in the new West, Fowke noted that when commerce and agriculture shared concerns reforms were quick to follow; but when their interests differed, the most obvious example being the protective tariff, the farming community could not influence federal policy.<sup>13</sup> Continuing in the same critical vein, Fowke, in 1952, in "The National Policy--Old and New," criticized the imperialism of the old National Policy for its concern with agricultural development as an end in itself. Not until the 1930's when the objectives of the first National Policy had been attained did the Dominion government concern itself with problems such as agricultural price support and crop failure legislation.<sup>14</sup>

Fowke's most detailed challenge to the Laurentian interpretation of the National Policy was his 1957 book in the Social Credit series, The National Policy and the Wheat Economy. Fowke concluded that Dominion land policy had resulted in the withholding of some of the best lands by private interests to the detriment of efficient settlement.<sup>15</sup> The C.P.R., before 1888, had been "prepared to dis-

---

<sup>12</sup> V.C. Fowke, Canadian Agricultural Policy: The Historical Pattern (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1946), pp. 4, 110, 118, 137-42, 145, 158-59, 275-77.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., pp. 9, 241-72; This inability was also the theme of a 1948 work, V.C. Fowke, "Royal Commissions and Canadian Agricultural Policy," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 2 (May 1948): 163-75.

<sup>14</sup> V.C. Fowke, "The National Policy--Old and New," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 18 no. 3 (August 1952): 271-86.

courage western expansion rather than have it take place at a rate or in directions that would threaten the Company's control and ability to secure whatever profit there might be."<sup>16</sup> Central Canada had received most of the benefit of the tariff in terms of expansion of industry, though it did enjoy certain natural advantages. The West, as an exporting region, suffered from higher "costs of production and living," and its lack of industrialization was "due in part to the impossibility of achieving competitive competence as against eastern industries long since firmly established with the aid of protection."<sup>17</sup> Finally, Fowke repeated his earlier charge that Dominion agricultural policy before 1930 had shown a "persistent disregard of the competitive inferiority of agriculture within the price system."<sup>18</sup>

Criticism of the National Policy, and the protective tariff in particular, was taken a step further by J.H. Dales between 1964 and 1979. In a series of works,<sup>19</sup> "Some Histor-

---

<sup>15</sup> V.C. Fowke, The National Policy and the Wheat Economy, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 7 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1957), pp. 59, 284-86.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid., p. 92. A sympathetic account of the C.P.R.'s land and colonization policies is found in J.B. Hedges, Building the Canadian West: The Land and Colonization Policies of the Canadian Pacific Railway (New York: The MacMillan Co., 1939).

<sup>17</sup> Ibid., pp. 66-68.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., pp. 93-254, 290, 294-95.

<sup>19</sup> J.H. Dales, "Some Historical and Theoretical Comment on Canada's National Policies," Queen's Quarterly 71 no. 3 (Autumn 1964): 297-316; "Protection, Immigration and Canadian Nationalism," in Nationalism in Canada, ed. P. Russell (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Co. of Canada Ltd., 1966), pp.

ical and Theoretical Comment on Canada's National Policies," "Protection, Immigration and Canadian Nationalism," The Protective Tariff in Canada's Development, and "'National Policy' Myths, Past and Present," Dales went beyond Fowke's criticism to argue that the various elements of the National Policy had not benefitted any region in Canada. The tariff had lowered G.N.P. per capita, i.e., real wages and the standard of living. Pertaining to the West, it's negative effects had intensified regional animosity and provincialism. Dales also criticized Dominion land policies. They had been a failure before 1900, and after, the land giveaway encouraged oversettlement and undesirable settlers.

In addition to criticism of the tariff, federal transportation policies remained under attack in the 1970's. A leader in this assault was T.D. Regehr, whose viewpoint was best expressed in 1977 in "Western Canada and the Burden of National Transportation Policies." Regehr argued that the West had long been victimized by discriminatory freight rates due to a lack of transportation competition in the region. Equality in freight rates had not yet been achieved as recent horizontal rate hikes were still discriminatory. Even that supposed benefactor of the West, the Crow's Nest Pass rates, had limited western economic diversification while benefitting only a shrinking grain exporting communi-

---

164-77; The Protective Tariff in Canada's Development (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1966); "'National Policy' Myths, Past and Present," Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 92-94.

ty. Regehr concluded that national transportation policies remained "unduly burdensome" to the West.<sup>20</sup> Regehr was also critical of early commercial bank policy in the West. In "Bankers and Farmers in Western Canada, 1900-1939," published in 1983, he argued that the chartered banks were not as responsive to the credit needs of western farmers in the first four decades of the century as they could or should have been.<sup>21</sup>

Standing in stark contrast to Regehr's conclusion about the discriminatory nature of freight rates was the findings of H. Darling in The Politics of Freight Rates: The Railway Freight Rate Issue in Canada, published in 1980. Darling argued that the original substance of freight rate grievances had been largely redressed over the years. Yet he realized that the rhetoric of grievance persisted as part of a regional folklore of protest directed against central Canada, accepted by the western general public, and used to partisan advantage by western politicians.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>20</sup> T.D. Regehr, "Western Canada and the Burden of National Transportation Policies," in Canada and the Burden of Unity, pp. 115-41.

<sup>21</sup> T.D. Regehr, "Bankers and Farmers in Western Canada, 1900-1939," in The Developing West: Essays on Canadian History in Honour of Lewis H. Thomas, ed. J.E. Foster (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1983), pp. 303-36.

<sup>22</sup> H. Darling, The Politics of Freight Rates: The Railway Freight Rate Issue in Canada (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1980), pp. 4-241.

Turning from the specific to the general, a wide ranging response to the critical assessments of the National Policy made by the preceding authors can be found in the works of K.H. Norrie. In 1976, in "Some Comments on Prairie Economic Alienation," Norrie argued that regional grievances against the tariff, freight rates, and monetary and commercial banking policy were not the result of discriminatory federal policies but, rather, the product of natural market forces which benefitted the metropolis at the expense of the hinterland. Some commonly proposed reforms such as lower tariffs and restructured freight rates had hidden costs. The adoption of these and other reforms would actually represent interference in the market economy and subsidization of western interests at the expense of other regions. Norrie concluded that only federal taxation of western natural resources fit his criteria of deliberate discrimination, though even there certain extenuating circumstances existed.<sup>23</sup>

Norrie continued to assail the shibboleth of "economic discrimination" in 1978 in "The National Policy and Prairie Economic Discrimination, 1870-1930." His examination of the effect of various elements of the National Policy led him to conclude that there was no evidence of deliberate discrimination or unnecessary hardship. The West was better off with

---

<sup>23</sup> K.H. Norrie, "Some Comments on Prairie Economic Alienation," Canadian Public Policy 2 no. 2 (Spring 1976): 211-44. Norrie restated these findings in K.H. Norrie and M. Percy, "The Economics of a Separate West," in Western Separatism, pp. 173-91.

the C.P.R. and its freight rate structure than any hypothetical alternative. The tariff had not discouraged western industrial development relative to central Canada or a free trade scenario. Neither had it placed an undue burden on the West in terms of regional loss of income as immigrants discounted the tariff in their decision to settle. A gradually reduced tariff actually increased the real income of western farmers as had reduced freight rates. Lastly, there was no indication that the prairie provinces would have been financially better off had the Dominion not alienated public lands. Still, Norrie admitted that it was only natural that farmers lobbied for lower tariffs and freight rates and increased compensation for crown lands.<sup>24</sup> In a more critical vein, in two articles in 1975 and 1979, "The Rate of Settlement of the Canadian Prairies, 1870-1911" and "The National Policy and the Rate of Prairie Settlement: A Review," Norrie contributed to the debunking of the myth that the National Policy directly stimulated the wheat boom. He believed that there was no link between the occurrence of the two.<sup>25</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> K.H. Norrie, "The National Policy and Prairie Economic Discrimination, 1870-1930," in Canadian Papers in Rural History, vol. I., ed. D.H. Akenson (Gananoque: Langdale Press, 1978), pp. 13-32.

<sup>25</sup> K.H. Norrie, "The Rate of Settlement of the Canadian Prairies, 1870-1911," Journal of Economic History 35 no. 2 (June 1975): 410-27; K.H. Norrie, "The National Policy and the Rate of Prairie Settlement: A Review," Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 63-76.



From this brief and somewhat tangential review, admittedly overloaded on the side of regional claims, it is clear that no consensus has been reached on a number of murky questions concerning the charge of economic subordination. Did the protective tariff discriminate against western economic development to the advantage of central Canada? Had freight rates been unfairly high? Was the C.P.R. monopoly an unfair burden or a necessary stimulant to the establishment of a national railroad? Similarly, had the retention of public lands been necessary to the growth of a transcontinental nation? Had Dominion land policies aided or inhibited the efficient settlement of the West? Despite the inevitability that these issues will never be satisfactorily settled, it is clear that the West has suffered hardships, if sometimes Westerners have wrongfully singled out the Dominion government rather than the market economy as a scapegoat. It is also clear that in the minds of many Westerners the charges of economic subordination and deliberate discrimination have attained a somewhat mythical quality. Given these circumstances, the use of metropolitan Canada as a scapegoat is eminently understandable and likely to continue as long as economic inequalities persist or are perceived to persist on a regional basis. The perpetuation of this source of regional conflict is even more likely given the partisan advantages to which it can be turned by western politicians. In relation to Morton's thesis, it can be safely stated that regional discontent rooted in economic factors will in all likelihood continue to influence western politics.

Leaving economics behind, a survey of leading works in the last forty years in political sociology, socio-psychology, and political science reinforces the argument that regional discontent has played a major role in western political development. At the same time, some of these works pinpointed limitations in Morton's thesis, indicating that regional grievances were not the only catalysts to political action and the West had not rejected partisan politics for an apolitical state of affairs. The first important works in these disciplines began to appear in the late 1940's and early 1950's, reflecting the realization by the academic community that the success of the western third parties could not be fully analyzed by traditional means.

The first works of interest are those of sociologist S.D. Clark, the general editor of the Social Credit series. Clark, in his Foreword to Morton's The Progressive Party, concurred with Morton's emphasis on the sectional nature of the Progressive and Social Credit movements but placed them in a frontierist context that had its roots in early opposition at Red River to agrarian settlement.<sup>26</sup> In 1954 and 1959, in "The Frontier and Democratic Theory" and Movements of Political Protest in Canada, 1640-1840, he repeated this frontierist argument, asserting that the Canadian and American frontiers shared similar grievances and solutions to metropolitan control. However, like Morton and most other

---

<sup>26</sup> S.D. Clark, Foreword to The Progressive Party, by W.L. Morton, pp. VII-X.

western Canadian historians, he realized that the Canadian metropolis had played a larger role in western development than its American counterpart, concluding that stronger forces of centralism had stifled Canadian frontier influence.<sup>27</sup>

An area where Clark differed more significantly from Morton was his belief that Westerners had "sought not so much to make over the outside world as to withdraw from it."<sup>28</sup> However, this particular claim needed more substantiation than Clark provided, given the attempts of western political parties to reform national political and economic institutions. Clark also noted that all the frontier movements possessed a reactionary side and inevitably moderated within the Canadian institutional framework.<sup>29</sup> Here, Clark seemed to contradict his belief in the strength of western separatist sentiment, while illuminating the necessity of Westerners forming new vehicles to express regional grievances.

Lastly, Clark, in his Foreword to Sect, Cult, and Church in Alberta, emphasized the failure of traditional institutions such as the churches to satisfy the needs of Alber-

---

<sup>27</sup> S.D. Clark, "The Frontier and Democratic Theory," Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XLVIII Section II (June 1954): 66, 69-71; Movements of Political Protest in Canada, 1640-1840, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 9 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959), pp. 4, 6, 8-10, 502-5.

<sup>28</sup> S.D. Clark, Foreword to The Progressive Party, pp. VIII-IX.

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*, p. IX; "The Frontier and Democratic Theory," pp. 73-75.

tans. In the 1920's and 1930's, the farmers and then Aberhart and Social Credit filled the void. Clark, in fact, suggested that Albertans voted for "Aberhart, the man of God" and not "Aberhart, the expounder of a new economic doctrine."<sup>30</sup> Here, Clark's interpretation cast doubt on Morton's "bias" as the sole or primary determinant of Social Credit's success. This particular aspect of his argument, the failure of traditional institutions, also noted by Morton,<sup>31</sup> and the ability of Aberhart and Social Credit to fill the void, was the theme of three important works in the Social Credit series.

The first two works were J. Burnet's 1951 Next-Year Country: A Study of Rural Social Organization in Alberta and D.E. Mann's 1955 Sect, Cult, and Church in Alberta. Burnet's examination of the Hanna area of Alberta during the depression described the failure of social institutions and social disintegration which created a climate conducive to the appeal of Social Credit.<sup>32</sup> Mann's argument followed logically from Burnet's. During the depression, disadvantaged and dislocated Albertans were susceptible to evangelical religious organizations. Aberhart and Social Credit, combining a religious with an economic appeal, offered themselves

---

<sup>30</sup> S.D. Clark, Foreword to Sect, Cult, and Church in Alberta, by W.E. Mann (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955), pp. VIII-X.

<sup>31</sup> See Chapter 3.

<sup>32</sup> J. Burnet, Next-Year Country: A Study of Rural Social Organization in Alberta, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 3 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1951), pp. 3-157.

as the champions of the downtrodden, focussing their hostility on outside agents and offering a simple and effective solution which replaced despair with hope.<sup>33</sup>

The third work<sup>34</sup> was J.A. Irving's 1959 The Social Credit Movement in Alberta, in which Irving defined the Social Credit movement from 1932 to 1935 as a "phenomenon of mass psychology," exhibiting the traditional phases and mechanisms of a mass social movement. The psychological appeal of Social Credit philosophy, leadership, and organization, given the conditions of susceptibility in Alberta society, brought the movement to power in 1935. Though Irving, Burnet, and Mann, like Clark, noted the appeal of Social Credit based on sectional resentment against the political and economic domination of the West,<sup>35</sup> their work illustrated that political development, particularly in a time of social instability, depended, among many variables, on the institutional and socio-psychological factors they had described.

---

<sup>33</sup> W.E. Mann, Sect, Cult and Church in Alberta, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 6. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955), pp. 5-6, 29-32, 36, 113-28, 153-57.

<sup>34</sup> J.A. Irving, The Social Credit Movement in Alberta, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 10 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959), pp. 4-345. This work was an expansion of two earlier works, "Psychological Aspects of the Social Credit Movement in Alberta," Canadian Journal of Psychology 1 no. 1 (March 1947): 17-27; 1 no. 2 (June 1947): 75-86; 1 no. 3 (September 1947): 127-40; "The Evolution of the Social Credit Movement," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 3 (August 1948): 321-41.

<sup>35</sup> Irving, "Psychological Aspects," pp. 76-78; Irving, The Social Credit Movement in Alberta, pp. 146-47, 233-41; J. Burnet, Next-Year Country, p. 95; D.E. Mann, Sect, Cult, and Church in Alberta, p. 156.

Their socio-psychological approach explained the political choice made by Albertans in 1935 in a way that historians using Morton's thesis could not.

Another important early work<sup>36</sup> of historical sociology was S.M. Lipset's 1950 classic Agrarian Socialism: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan: A Study in Political Sociology. Lipset described the C.C.F. as "an endemic movement" rooted in the advanced rural organizational structure of the province.<sup>37</sup> The C.C.F. was both class politics and an expression of traditional western collective frontier protest against metropolitan domination "in the direct tradition of the Populists, the Non-Partisan League, and the Progressives."<sup>38</sup> Clearly, in Lipset's view, western discontent played a central role in the origin of the C.C.F. but was not the only factor. Like the other early historians of the party, he recognized the class aspects of its birth that could not be compartmentalized on regional lines.

---

<sup>36</sup> Most of the conclusions reached by Lipset in this work first appeared in two earlier articles: "The Rural Community and Political Leadership in Saskatchewan," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 13 no. 3 (August 1947): 410-28; "Political Participation and the Organization of the Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 2 (May 1948): 191-208.

<sup>37</sup> S.M. Lipset, Agrarian Socialism: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan: A Study in Political Sociology (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1950), pp. 1-125, 186-87, 199-219.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 1-178, 209-19.

Lipset also argued that many farmers saw little difference between Social Credit and the C.C.F. Both singled out eastern "big business" as a scapegoat for western problems and addressed issues of immediate concern to the farming community, notably debt and foreclosure. This led to talk of coalition among less dedicated agrarian C.C.F.ers who felt the parties' similarities were more important than their differences. Lipset concluded that leftist and rightist ideologies, consistent with the historical development of their respective societies and addressing the primary problems of a destitute population, could fulfill the same functional role in neighbouring provinces.<sup>39</sup> Here, Lipset went a step beyond Morton's analysis, presaging the populist reinterpretation of the 1970's.

Lipset's findings also differed from Morton's in his assessment of the nature of the C.C.F.'s 1944 victory in Saskatchewan. Despite admitting that the C.C.F. had moderated its rhetoric and platform in the 1930's, moving from socialism to social reform, Lipset stated that the C.C.F. was the first "socialist" government in North America and "the government remains socialist."<sup>40</sup> Its victory was clearly, in Lipset's opinion, more than a triumph of apolitical sentiment. Lipset also recognized that moderating influences were at work on the C.C.F.: its position in a capitalist economy, prosperity, the conservatism of the established

---

<sup>39</sup> Ibid., pp. 108-9, 114-15, 121-24, 151-53.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., pp. 73-87, 103-57, 278.

bureaucracy, and bureaucratic moderation and orthodoxy within the party itself.<sup>41</sup> These factors, while somewhat blunting the C.C.F.'s radicalism, also curtailed its effectiveness as a voice of regional discontent.

While Lipset's was the outstanding early study of the C.C.F. in Saskatchewan, the most well known and controversial interpretation of Alberta political development was found in the Social Credit series, C.B. Macpherson's 1953 Democracy in Alberta: The Theory and Practise of a Quasi-Party System. A political theorist with a Marxist bent, Macpherson argued that in Alberta in 1921 a "quasi-party" system was established, based in the province's "quasi-colonial" subordination to central Canada<sup>42</sup> and the homogeneous nature of its population, composed mainly of independent commodity producers, the agrarian "petit-bourgeoisie." Combined with a local tradition of political nonpartisanship, these factors led to a diminution of intraprovincial issues, a rejection of the alternate party system, and strong support for the U.F.A. in its opposition to central Canadian domination, with a subsequent disappearance of legislative opposition to the ruling party.<sup>43</sup> The delegate democracy and group government of the U.F.A. was replaced by the plebisc-

---

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., pp. 16, 70, 122, 124, 134, 152-57, 223, 226, 229, 245-86.

<sup>42</sup> Macpherson's charge of "quasi-colonialism" was largely based on the works of V.C. Fowke examined above.

<sup>43</sup> C.B. Macpherson, Democracy in Alberta, pp. 3-27, 34, 40-44, 93-97, 148, 205, 212-30, 237-39, 246.



itarianism of Social Credit in 1935.<sup>44</sup> In Saskatchewan and Manitoba, the alternate party system had been rejected but a "quasi-party" system had not yet taken hold.<sup>45</sup> Macpherson's analysis shared three important themes with Morton's. Both acknowledged that the West was in a struggle to escape the bonds of colonial subordination, both argued that the party system had been rejected in the West, and both saw a lessening of opposition to the ruling parties at the provincial level.

Like Clark and Lipset, Macpherson found that radical parties moderated in office. The U.F.A. government became conservative due to the traditional oscillation of the "petit-bourgeoisie" between radicalism, in its rejection of the old parties, and conservatism, in its acceptance of the property system. The need for outside financial support and the U.F.A.'s acceptance of the conventions of cabinet government furthered its moderation. This conservatism contributed to the U.F.A.'s electoral defeat in 1935. Inevitably, Social Credit also became conservative in office, influenced by the need for outside financing and post-war prosperity. The latter, however, helped keep Social Credit in power and the "quasi-party" system in existence.<sup>46</sup> Clearly, the moderation

---

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., pp. 4-6, 29-30, 39, 46-48, 62-97, 126-30, 135, 142-60, 212-20, 232-37.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., pp. 4-5, 26-27, 215, 236-39, 246, 248.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid., pp. 4, 62-97, 144-45, 148-49, 163-68, 193-98, 201-37, 248. The moderation of Social Credit was also described by J.J. Barr in The Dynasty: The Rise and Fall of Social Credit in Alberta (Toronto: McClelland and

in the platforms and rhetoric of the C.C.F. and Social Credit described by Lipset and Macpherson indicated that regional discontent diminished as a factor in their political success and if western grievances directed at the central Canadian metropolis were intensified in the future, further political manifestations of western protest would in all likelihood appear.

The success of third parties in the West, the continuing dominance of the Liberals in federal politics, and the appearance of Macpherson's controversial thesis triggered a substantial amount of theorizing on the roots and nature of the Canadian party system. Of interest here are only the ramifications of this debate for Morton's thesis. The first work of interest was S.M. Lipset's 1954 "Democracy in Alberta" which, in disputing Macpherson's argument that there was no significant opposition to the ruling parties in the West, also cast doubts on Morton's later claims of an apolitical West. Lipset noted that there was, in fact, a substantial popular vote consistently opposed to the ruling parties, but a fragmented opposition, single-member constituencies, and, in Alberta in particular, the homogeneity of electoral divisions in provincial constituencies<sup>47</sup> had left the legislative opposition weak and divided.<sup>48</sup>

---

Stewart Ltd., 1974), pp. 83-248.

<sup>47</sup> This is not the same as Macpherson's homogeneous population thesis.

<sup>48</sup> S.M. Lipset, "Democracy in Alberta," in Voting in Canada, ed. J.C. Courtney (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada

Lipset proposed an alternative explanation of political development in the West not incompatible with Morton's thesis. He argued that British parliamentary traditions had failed in Canada; the two old parties had inadequately represented western interests and caucus solidarity had precluded adequate expression of regional dissent on contentious issues. The West's only alternative was to form third parties and support "different parties on a provincial level than those which they back nationally."<sup>49</sup> Despite their obvious differences, Lipset and Macpherson both shared Morton's belief that metropolitan domination of the West had played a large role in shaping western political development.

---

Ltd., 1967), p. 182; Reprint from Canadian Forum 34 (November 1954): 175-77; (December 1954): 196-98.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., pp. 182-85. The historical failure of the Liberals and Conservatives to perform their brokerage functions, thereby encouraging the formation of regional parties, has been the focus of many works since 1954. See, for example, D.H. Wrong, "Parties and Voting in Canada: A Backward and Forward Glance in the Light of the Last Election," Political Science Quarterly 73 no. 3 (September 1958): 400-7; J. Meisel, "The Stalled Omnibus: Canadian Parties in the 1960's," Social Research 30 no. 3 (Autumn 1963): 367-86; J.R. Mallory, "The Structure of Canadian Politics," in Party Politics in Canada, 2nd ed., ed. H.G. Thorburn (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967), pp. 24-28; F.C. Engelmann and M.A. Schwartz, Political Parties and the Canadian Social Structure (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967), pp. 8-12, 16, 39, 42, 52-55, 67-68, 223-50; H.G. Thorburn, "The Development of Political Parties in Canada," in Party Politics in Canada, 5th ed., ed. H.G. Thorburn (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Inc., 1985), pp. 4-10.

Lipset's theory was echoed in 1955 in "Canadian Liberal Democracy in 1955" by F.H. Underhill. Underhill noted that the Liberals, monopolizing the center of the political spectrum, had stolen enough support from the left and the right to ensure their continuing dominance on the national political scene. In an "instinctive, subconscious" reaction to the fragmented and weak opposition in Ottawa, the Canadian electorate sought to establish an "effective countervailing power, not in Ottawa but in the provincial capitals." Many Liberal voters in federal elections began cross-voting, switching their support to Social Credit and the C.C.F. in Alberta and Saskatchewan.<sup>50</sup> It would seem that Underhill, like Lipset, agreed with Morton that national political parties had not upheld western interests. However, their belief that Westerners had turned to provincial political parties to champion their cause was somewhat incompatible with Morton's three-stage thesis.

---

<sup>50</sup> F.H. Underhill, "Canadian Liberal Democracy in 1955," in Press and Party in Canada, eds. F.H. Underhill and G.V. Ferguson (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1955), pp. 27-46; Underhill's thesis was accepted by other observers of the Canadian party system; to name but two, D.H. Wrong, "The Pattern of Party Voting in Canada," Public Opinion Quarterly 21 no. 2 (Summer 1957): 252-64; L. Lipson, "Party Systems in The United Kingdom and the Older Commonwealth: Causes, Resemblances, and Variations," Political Studies 7 no. 1 (1959): 27-28. The argument that Canadian politics was dominated for long stretches by single parties facing a weak opposition was a common observation of political scientists in the 1950's. One such observer was D.V. Smiley. See D.V. Smiley, "The Two-Party System and One-Party Dominance in the Liberal Democratic State," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 24 no. 3 (August 1958): 312-22; "One-Partyism and Canadian Democracy," Canadian Forum 38 (July 1958): 79-80.

Another work that had repercussions for Morton's thesis was Denis Smith's 1963 "Prairie Revolt, Federalism and the Party System." Echoing Lipset, Smith argued that the federal party and parliamentary systems prohibited adequate expression of regional discontent. However, contradicting Underhill, he argued that provincial governments were not the main focus of opposition to the federal government and cross-voting was more complex than its interpretation by Underhill. Yet, Smith conceded the impact of regional discontent on provincial politics when he admitted that the provinces were viewed by many Westerners as the only level of government to which they could elect the party of their choice in their attempt to seek redress of local grievances.<sup>51</sup>

Conversely, in attacking some of the assumptions of Macpherson's theory, Smith illustrated weaknesses in Morton's argument that the western struggle for equality was the principal determinant of political development. Smith noted that not all western provincial governments were unconditionally opposed to the federal government, in particular the Saskatchewan Liberals and Manitoba Liberal-Progressives. In addition, the "petit-bourgeoisie" revolt against colonial

---

<sup>51</sup> Denis Smith, "Prairie Revolt, Federalism and the Party System," in Party Politics in Canada, 2nd. ed., ed. H.G. Thorburn (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967), pp. 193-97; Reprint from Party Politics in Canada, 1st ed., ed. H.G. Thorburn (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1963). Similar criticisms of Underhill had been made by H.A. Scarrow, "Federal-Provincial Voting Patterns in Canada," Canadian Journal of Economic and Political Science 26 no. 2 (May 1960): 289-98.

domination was but one determinant of political development. Apparent one-party dominance could be attributed to the dynamic personalities of Wood, Aberhart, Manning, Douglas, and Diefenbaker as well as a general sentiment of nonpartisanship, extending across class lines and fostered by the western rejection of privilege, partisan excesses of the old parties, and metropolitan domination.<sup>52</sup>

Two of Smith's observations also cast doubt on Morton's view of an apolitical West. As noted, he had cited the sometimes cordial, if not close, relations between the Manitoba and Saskatchewan governments and the federal government. In addition, he argued that one-party dominance was a misleading term, evidenced by the substantial, if divided, opposition to ruling parties in the popular vote.<sup>53</sup> Smith argued that the West possessed, not a "quasi-party" system, but a "restrained plebiscitary" democracy. Parliamentary traditions had never caught hold and electoral battles were fought in direct appeals to the people. Change, when it occurred, came in dramatic fashion sweeping governments out of office.<sup>54</sup>

Yet another party theory recognized the impact of western discontent on local political development though nowhere did it endorse Morton's thesis. Forwarded by M. Pinard, this

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., pp. 194-95, 198-99.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid., p. 199.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid., pp. 199-200.

theory, like Underhill's, was based on the seeming weakness of opposition parties in the Canadian political system. In 1967 and 1971, in "One-Party Dominance and Third Parties" and The Rise of a Third Party: A Study in Crisis Politics, Pinard argued that a "system of one-party dominance ... creates a situation which is highly favourable, given the existence of discontents, to the rise of third parties." Specifically, if a leading opposition party consistently polled less than 33% of the popular vote, there would be "third party outbursts of varying magnitudes and occasional third party victories." This model was based on the Social Credit success in the Quebec election of 1962,<sup>55</sup> but Pinard also applied it to political developments in the West.

While an evaluation of Pinard's application of his thesis to the three prairie provinces is beyond the scope of this work,<sup>56</sup> it is worth noting that his findings were relevant to Morton's thesis in two key areas. First, he cited Morton in The Progressive Party on the weakness of opposition parties in Saskatchewan and Alberta,<sup>57</sup> thereby seemingly adding

---

<sup>55</sup> M. Pinard, "One-Party Dominance and Third Parties," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 33 no. 3 (August 1967): 358-73; The Rise of a Third Party: A Study in Crisis Politics (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1971), pp. V-VI, 15, 21-39, 63-71, 86, 91, 245-47.

<sup>56</sup> For a critical analysis of Pinard's theory, see A. Blais, "Third Parties in Canadian Provincial Politics," Canadian Journal of Political Science 6 no. 3 (September 1973): 422-38; G. White, "One-Party Dominance and Third Parties: The Pinard Theory Reconsidered," Canadian Journal of Political Science 6 no. 3 (September 1973): 399-421.

<sup>57</sup> M. Pinard, "One-Party Dominance," pp. 369-73; Third Party, pp. 42-45, 66-71.

credence to the notion of an apolitical West. Yet, somewhat contradictorily, Pinard took exception with Macpherson's argument, and consequently with Morton's, that the West had rejected partisanship and the party system, citing Denis Smith in "Prairie Revolt, Federalism and the Party System."<sup>58</sup> Secondly, Pinard accepted Macpherson's argument, and therefore Morton's, that "quasi-colonial" status had contributed to political development in Alberta. He, however, listed other contributing factors that fell outside the domain of regional grievance and discontent.<sup>59</sup>

Pinard also accepted Lipset's explanation of the seemingly contradictory success of left and right wing parties in Saskatchewan and Alberta. He argued that "in the absence of strong organizations based on a well-developed class consciousness, the lower classes when faced with an acute crisis, are likely to follow the first available political movement." Both Social Credit and the C.C.F. were dedicated to the protection of agrarian and western interests and singled out the same culprits, eastern finance and big business. Ideology did not matter as much as discontent with the status quo and the desire for change.<sup>60</sup> In accepting Lipset's analysis, Pinard foreshadowed the populist attempt to revise the analytical framework within which the western

---

<sup>58</sup> M. Pinard, "One-Party Dominance," pp. 372-73; Third Party, pp. 66-71.

<sup>59</sup> M. Pinard, "One-Party Dominance," pp. 369-71; Third Party, pp. 67-71.

<sup>60</sup> Pinard, Third Party, pp. 94-97.



agrarian revolt would be viewed; a revision that accepted "metropolis-hinterland" antipathy but sought a wider context for its development.

The use of a populist framework to examine the western agrarian revolt, foreshadowed in the works of Lipset and Pinard, received more attention in the 1970's and later. Advocates of this analytical approach included P.R. Sinclair, in 1975, in "Class Structure and Populist Protest: The Case of Western Canada," J.F. Conway, in 1978 and 1979, in "Populism in the United States, Russia, and Canada: Explaining the Roots of Canada's Third Parties" and "The Prairie Populist Resistance to the National Policy: Some Reconsiderations," J. Richards and L. Pratt, in 1979, in Prairie Capitalism: Power and Influence in the New West, and J. Richards, in 1981, in "Populism and the West."<sup>61</sup> They sought to explain a development that they believed historians had not yet adequately explained; namely, the rise of seemingly contradictory political movements in neighbouring provinces, each appealing to essentially the same class, Macpherson's "petit-bourgeoisie." They argued that the Pro-

---

<sup>61</sup> P.R. Sinclair, "Class Structure and Populist Protest: The Case of Western Canada," Canadian Journal of Sociology 1 (1975): 1-17; J.F. Conway, "Populism in the United States, Russia, and Canada: Explaining the Roots of Canada's Third Parties," Canadian Journal of Political Science 11 no. 1 (March 1978): 99-124; J.F. Conway, "The Prairie Populist Resistance to the National Policy: Some Reconsiderations," Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 77-91; J. Richards and L. Pratt, Prairie Capitalism: Power and Influence in the New West (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1979); J. Richards, "Populism and the West," in Western Separatism, pp. 65-83.

gressives, Social Credit, and C.C.F. represented the continuing western opposition, and particularly that of the "petit-bourgeoisie," to capitalist modernization and metropolitan economic control, personified in the National Policy, and belief in the political supremacy of the people, personified in the attack on the party system. Social Credit and the C.C.F., having similar roots and much in common, were usually categorized as left and right variants of the same phenomenon, differing in their organizational structure, critiques of the existing economic order, remedies to the depression, and attitude to public ownership. It was also noted that both drew support from different elements outside the "petit-bourgeoisie" and both ruling provincial and national parties evolved in quite different directions.<sup>62</sup> The populists essentially presented a modern adaptation of Lipset's contention that a left and right ideology could fulfill the same functional role in Alberta and Saskatchewan.

---

<sup>62</sup> See the Sinclair and Richards articles for the best explanation of the differences between the two from the populist perspective. One further fact about the apparent similarities of the C.C.F. and Social Credit should be noted. In fact, all political parties in the 1930's were seeking to ease debt and credit hardships, gain relief for the agrarian community, and were moving to the left in their belief in extended social welfare and health benefits. This point was made by K. Andrews in his study of the 1938 Saskatchewan provincial election in "'Progressive' Counterparts of the C.C.F.: Social Credit and the Conservative Party in Saskatchewan, 1935-1938," Journal of Canadian Studies 17 no. 3 (Autumn 1982): 58-74.

The populist reinterpretation of the western agrarian revolt had significant consequences for Morton's thesis. First, his downplaying of the populist aspects of the C.C.F. and Social Credit and the elements of continuity inherited from their predecessor, the Progressives, was taken to task by Conway.<sup>63</sup> Of course, the populist approach can be overdone, resulting in the mistaken assertion that Social Credit and the C.C.F. were virtually identical. Such was not the case, as W.L. Morton and most of the populist theoreticians, except perhaps Conway, realized. Secondly, the populist model placed the western agrarian revolt in a national and international framework that challenged Morton's belief in its uniqueness. On the other hand, the impact of the western struggle against metropolitan domination on local political development was not denied. The lowest common denominator for all parties was, in fact, the regional "bias." Lastly, the populist revisionists realized that the "petit-bourgeoisie" population and populism had been declining in the West in the post-war period, representing a contributing factor to the moderation in office of the C.C.F. and Social Credit.

Two of these populist revisionist works merit individual attention for their enlightenment of the evolution of western discontent and its political manifestations in recent years. In 1979, in Prairie Capitalism: Power and Influence

---

<sup>63</sup> J.F. Conway, "Populism in the United States, Russia, and Canada," pp. 99, 121, 124; "The Prairie Populist Resistance," pp. 77-78.

in the New West, Richards and Pratt argued that the "passive rentier" philosophy of the Saskatchewan and Alberta governments in the post-war period was replaced in the 1970's by the political, legal, and constitutional<sup>64</sup> struggles of the Lougheed and Blakeney governments for control and ownership of natural resources and their royalties, needed to diversify the provincial economies through linkages and the establishment of secondary industry.<sup>65</sup> In both provinces, "province-building" received support from "broad alliances across indigenous classes." In Alberta, the authors argued, regional alienation was effectively used by Lougheed in 1975 to destroy his electoral opposition and inaugurate a new period of one-party rule.<sup>66</sup> In Saskatchewan, class conflict did not allow the electorate to unite behind one party, thereby lessening the influence of "metropolis-hinterland" relations on political development. There was, however, a revival of populism in the province, particularly among smaller and poorer farmers.<sup>67</sup> In this linking of the battle

---

<sup>64</sup> For further reading on the constitutional struggle for resource control waged by the Alberta and Saskatchewan governments within the context of the struggle of two divergent views of federalism, see D. Milne, The New Canadian Constitution (Toronto: James Lorimer and Co., 1982); R. Romanow, J. Whyte, and H. Leeson, Canada ... Nonwithstanding: The Making of the Constitution, 1976:1982 (Toronto: Carswell/Methuen, 1984).

<sup>65</sup> J. Richards and L. Pratt, Prairie Capitalism, pp. VI-VIII, 10-328.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 166, 287.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 11, 263-64, 315-16. Blakeney's successful use of an anti-Ottawa campaign in 1975 and 1978 was noted by B. Wilson in Politics of Defeat, pp. 87-90, 147, 150 and E. Eager in Saskatchewan Government, pp. 62-64, 185-87.

for resource control waged in the 1970's to regional discontent and political development, Richards and Pratt contributed to the understanding of the recent evolution of Morton's "bias," though they never directly cited his thesis. However, the differing developments in each province again illustrated that other factors than regional discontent influenced political development.

The second populist work that shed light on recent western political discontent was J. Richards's "Populism and the West." Richards argued that Trudeau's constitutional initiative had exacerbated the split between provincialists and centralists in the N.D.P., rendering the party ineffective as a spokesman for the western interest in decentralization and resource control. This, in turn, left room for the formation of right-wing populist parties opposing centralization. Separatist support in 1980-81 marked the resurgence of western populism, but Richards suggested that this sentiment could only survive in a decentralized state where governments with real power would be brought closer to the people.<sup>68</sup> Relative to Morton's "bias," regional discontent had provoked a certain element of the population to support a new vehicle of western protest, separatism.

The continuing influence of regional discontent on politics in Alberta in the 1970's, noted by Richards and Pratt, was also acknowledged in a series of studies assessing the

---

<sup>68</sup> J. Richards, "Populism and the West," pp. 80-83.

applicability of Macpherson's thesis to modern Alberta in light of the defeat of the Social Credit government and the electoral dominance of the Conservatives.<sup>69</sup> Emerging from this debate was the near unanimous conclusion that continuing resentment against Alberta's "quasi-colonial" status, nurtured by the battle over natural resources, played a significant role in the Conservative's 1975 triumph and the return to one-party rule, though it was noted that other factors than regional discontent also influenced Alberta political development in the 1970's. It was also contended by one author, T. Flanagan, that opposition to the U.F.A. and Social Credit governments had been greater than commonly believed, thereby contradicting Macpherson's "quasi-party"

---

<sup>69</sup> See, for example: T. Flanagan, "Ethnic Voting in Alberta Provincial Elections, 1921-1971," Canadian Ethnic Studies 3 no. 2 (December 1971): 139-64; T. Flanagan, "Political Geography and the United Farmers of Alberta," in The Twenties in Western Canada, ed. S.M. Trofimenkoff (Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1972), pp. 138-69; T. Flanagan, "Stability and Change in Alberta Provincial Elections," Alberta Historical Review 21 no. 4 (Autumn 1973): 1-8; J.A. Long and F.Q. Quo, "Alberta: One Party Dominance," in Canadian Provincial Politics, pp. 1-2, 24-26; H. Palmer and T. Palmer, "The 1971 Election and the Fall of Social Credit in Alberta," Prairie Forum 1 no. 2 (November 1976): 123-34; K.H. Norrie and T.J. Levesque, "Overwhelming Majorities in the Legislature of Alberta," Canadian Journal of Political Science 12 no. 3 (September 1979): 451-70; D.K. Elton and A.M. Goddard, "The Conservative Takeover, 1971-," in Society and Politics in Alberta, ed. C. Caldarola (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1979), pp. 49-70; D.M. Poetschke and R.E. McKown, "Perception of Class in Alberta," in Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 193-204; P. McCormick, "Voting Behaviour in Alberta: The Quasi-Party System Revisited," Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 3 (Autumn 1980): 85-97; H. Palmer and T. Palmer, "The Alberta Experience," Journal of Canadian Studies 17 no. 3 (Autumn 1982): 20-34; G. Stevenson, "Quasi-Democracy in Alberta," Can-

thesis and W.L. Morton's theory of an apolitical West.<sup>70</sup>

The phenomenon of regional discontent in the West, and Alberta in particular, was extensively explored by a number of academics in the 1970's and 1980's. The work of R. Gibbins stands out in the field for his reaffirmation of the impact of western discontent on western political development, though he did not directly cite Morton's "bias," and for his socio-psychological analysis of western alienation. In 1977, in "Models of Nationalism: A Case Study of Political Ideologies in the Canadian West," Gibbins argued, based on a 1974 opinion poll conducted in Calgary, that western alienation toward the East, the federal government, and Quebec continued as a measurable attitudinal outlook.<sup>71</sup> Gibbins expanded on this theme in a 1979 work co-authored with D.K. Elton, "Western Alienation and Political Culture." They argued that a continuing distinct western political culture was rooted primarily in western alienation which they defined as "a regional political ideology of discontent." Based in both traditional and recent grievances, this alienation played a significant role in regional political development and, the authors predicted, would continue into the

---

dian Forum LXII no. 725 (February 1983): 14-15, 24.

<sup>70</sup> For elaboration of this argument, see the three Flanagan articles cited above. See also McCormick's article.

<sup>71</sup> R. Gibbins, "Models of Nationalism: A Case Study of Political Ideologies in the Canadian West," Canadian Journal of Political Science 10 no. 2 (June 1977): 342, 357-61, 370.

foreseeable future.<sup>72</sup> Gibbins repeated these assertions in another 1979 work, "Western Alienation and the Alberta Political Culture," arguing that western alienation differed from the usual type of political alienation in that it was not primarily a psychological phenomenon characterized by political apathy and withdrawal and limited to lower class support. It was, rather, a "political creed of regional discontent" which played a "prominent role" in Alberta political culture. In its multi-faceted origins and characteristics, western alienation extended beyond partisan dislike of the federal Liberal government and persisted as an attitudinal outlook despite the assimilation of prairie society to that of the rest of Canada.<sup>73</sup>

A year later, in Prairie Politics and Society: Regionalism in Decline, Gibbins refined his earlier themes.<sup>74</sup>

<sup>72</sup> R. Gibbins and D.K. Elton, "Western Alienation and Political Culture," in The Canadian Political Process, 3rd ed., eds. O.M. Kruhlak, R. Schultz, and J.C. Terry (Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1979), pp. 82-97. In 1984, Elton authored another work on western alienation, "Contemporary Western Alienation: An Opinion Profile," in The Making of the Modern West: Western Canada Since 1945, ed. A.W. Rasporich (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1984), pp. 47-54.

<sup>73</sup> R. Gibbins, "Western Alienation and the Alberta Political Culture," in Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 143-67. Gibbins's definition of the characteristics of western political alienation would be somewhat challenged by R.R. Gilsdorf in "Western Alienation, Political Alienation, and the Federal System: Subjective Perceptions," in Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 168-89. Other observers have argued that "alienation" was too strong a term to apply to western regional discontent. See, for example, G. Friesen, The Canadian Prairies, p. 446.

<sup>74</sup> Yet another work by Gibbins covering the same general themes appeared in 1984, "Political Change in the 'New



Returning to the assimilation of prairie society, he disputed the use of the concept of regionalism in assessing the contemporary interrelationship of the three prairie provinces. Relying heavily on W.L. Morton as a source, he asserted that before 1940 the West had been a "relatively distinct and homogeneous socio-economic region" possessing a distinct political culture. After 1940, however, there had been a growing intraregional heterogeneity and declining regional socio-economic and political distinctiveness, attributable to a number of factors: the decline of ethnic distinctiveness, the lack of religious based political issues, the decline in rural population and the importance of agriculture, increasing diversity in the rural community, urbanization and industrialization, and cultural assimilation to the North American norm. The primary characteristic of early western political regionalism, the rejection of both established parties and formation and support of third parties, disappeared after the 1958 election.<sup>75</sup>

Yet, despite increasing assimilation, Gibbins argued that the western "political ideology of regional discontent" continued as the "distinguishing core of a prairie political culture," based in political, economic, and cultural

---

West'," in The Making of the Modern West, pp. 37-46.

<sup>75</sup> R. Gibbins, Prairie Politics and Society: Regionalism in Decline (Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1980), pp. 2-8, 12, 15-59, 65-108, 112-17, 137-38, 191-98. Like many other contemporary historians, Gibbins disputed the belief that the Progressives were solely an expression of regional discontent, pp. 47-51.

estrangement, and possessing, to some degree, most, if not all, the characteristics of an ideology. Echoing D.E. Smith, he concluded that western alienation continued to find expression in support of the Conservatives federally and the growth in strength and popularity of provincial governments. Gibbins argued that the latter had "emerged as the principal spokesmen for regional interests" and provincial politicians would continue to make use of western alienation for political purposes. He stressed, citing Morton in "Bias," that Westerners sought, not separation, but greater integration into the Canadian mainstream. Finally, Gibbins again foresaw the continuation of regional discontent as many of its underlying causes were rooted in the West's minority, hinterland status and, therefore, incapable of remedy.<sup>76</sup>

Two interrelated aspects of Gibbins's findings merit particular attention for their relevance to western discontent and political development: declining regionalism and a resurgent provincialism. Regarding the former, Gibbins, himself, in an earlier work had argued that the West was still a distinct region.<sup>77</sup> As had W.L. Morton and the historians whose works were examined in the preceding chapter, many other social scientists in their studies in the 1970's and 1980's concluded that regionalism was still a signifi-

---

<sup>76</sup> Ibid., pp. 3-8, 93-108, 112-17, 162, 167-92, 197-214.

<sup>77</sup> R. Gibbins and D.K. Elton, "Western Alienation and Political Culture," p. 82.

cant cleavage in Canadian political life, rooted in distinct geographical, ecological, economic, demographic, ethnic, cultural, social, political, and historical factors, most of the very characteristics that Gibbins had claimed were in decline. Regionalism was also rooted in a unique attitudinal outlook and orientation in political life, a phenomenon that Gibbins had realized persisted in contemporary society. Regionalism was further exacerbated by a host of institutional factors.<sup>78</sup> Even if one does not accept that the three prairie provinces still form a distinct region, and the question is certainly open to debate, the fact remains that a common hostility in each province directed at central Canada continues to influence the contemporary political milieu.

---

<sup>78</sup> J.E. Hodgetts, "Regional Interests and Policy in a Federal Structure," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 32 no. 1 (February 1966): 3-14; A.C. Cairns, "The Electoral System and the Party System in Canada, 1921-1965," Canadian Journal of Political Science 1 no. 1 (March 1968): 55-80; R. Simeon and D.J. Elkins, "Regional Political Cultures in Canada," Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 397-437; R. Simeon, "Regionalism and Canadian Political Institutions," Queens Quarterly 82 no. 4 (Winter 1975): 499-511; R. Matthews, "The Significance and Explanation of Regional Divisions in Canada: Toward a Canadian Sociology," Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 43-61; L. Driedger, "Multicultural Regionalism: Toward Understanding the Canadian West," in The Making of the Modern West, pp. 167-82; M.A. Schwartz, Politics and Territory: The Sociology of Regional Persistence in Canada (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1974), pp. 5-336; R. Johnston, "Federal and Provincial Voting: Contemporary Patterns and Historical Evolution," in Small Worlds: Provinces and Parties in Canadian Political Life, eds. D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1980), pp. 131-78; D.J. Elkins, "The Structure of Provincial Party Systems," in Small Worlds, pp. 211-41; D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon, "Province, Nation, Country and Confederation," in Small Worlds, pp. 285-312; G. Friesen,

The second of Gibbins's observations warranting special attention was the growth of provincialism as a champion of regional interests; again, a development noted by a number of historians whose works were examined in Chapter 4 and one studied by many other social scientists. In their analyses, they singled out a wide variety of causative factors, many of which also contributed to the perpetuation of regionalism in the West. They noted that Canadians had been province building, as well as nation building, since 1867. They suggested that, beginning in the late 1950's and early 1960's, provincialism was aided by: the return to post-war normalcy; the emergence of the new Quebec; the failure of national political institutions--the House of Commons, the cabinet, the Senate, the public service, political parties and caucuses, and the single-member constituency electoral system--to represent regional interests; the decline in importance of powers under Dominion jurisdiction and increase in those under provincial control; federalism itself through the providing of dual allegiances, the separation of federal and provincial parties, the advantages of "fed bashing," and the

---

The Canadian Prairies, pp. 3-5, 453-60, 466. A number of historical geographers have recently linked the geographical characteristics of the West, its physical and political isolation, and its concomitant economic activities to the continuation of regional sentiment. They are J.H. Richards, "The Prairie Region," in Canada: A Geographical Interpretation, ed. J. Warkentin (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1968), pp. 396-437; G. Merrill, "Regionalism and Nationalism," in Canada: A Geographical Interpretation, pp. 556-68; B. Kaye and D.W. Moodie, "Geographical Perspectives on the Canadian Plains," in A Region of the Mind, pp. 28-32; J.W. Watson, "Canada's Geography and Geographies of Canada," The Canadian Cartographer 5 no. 1 (June 1968): 28.

opportunity for provincialized third parties; the continued existence of provincial and regional economies and socio-political communities; an increase in power and confidence of provincial bureaucracies and elites; an international economic and even political role for some of the provinces; continental integration; the decentralization of federal government institutions on a regional and provincial basis; increasing federal-provincial contacts and interdependence; and the failure of federal economic policies to ensure full employment and significantly reduce regional disparities. The general consensus was that provincialism was a powerful sentiment and identity in contemporary society. Cooperative and executive federalism, most evident in the increased importance of federal-provincial and First-Ministers' conferences, were testament to the power and status of the provinces.<sup>79</sup>

---

<sup>79</sup> E.R. Black and A.C. Cairns, "A Different Perspective on Canadian Federalism," Canadian Public Administration 9 no. 1 (March 1966): 27-45; A.C. Cairns, "The Electoral System and the Party System in Canada, 1921-1965," pp. 55-80; A.C. Cairns, "The Governments and Societies of Canadian Federalism," Canadian Journal of Political Science 10 no. 4 (December 1977): 695-725; J.E. Hodgetts, "Regional Interests and Policy in a Federal Structure," pp. 3-14; R. Simeon, "Regionalism and Canadian Political Institutions," pp. 499-511; G. Stevenson, Unfulfilled Union: Canadian Federalism and National Unity (Toronto: MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1979), pp. 79-102, 195-203; G. Stevenson, "Canadian Regionalism in Continental Perspective," Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 16-28; R. Gibbins, "American Influence on Western Separatism," in Western Separatism, pp. 193-208; R. Gibbins, Regionalism: Territorial Politics in Canada and the United States (Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1982), pp. 32-194; D.V. Smiley, The Canadian Political Nationality (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1967), pp. 48-106; D.V. Smiley, "The Structural Problem of Canadian Federalism," Canadian Public Administration 14 no. 3 (Fall

It must, of course, be noted that the growth of provincialism was not just a western phenomenon, and, certainly, not all the reasons cited above can be tied to regional discontent. Nor were these observers of the political system necessarily interested in asserting the continuation of this sentiment. Yet, all the factors noted, in one way or another, contributed to the increased power and prestige of provincial governments which, in turn, made them more attractive as vehicles to champion the local discontent in each province directed at central Canada.

In totality, the works on contemporary western politics examined above reinforced the argument that discontent directed at central Canada was still a vital force in the politics of the three prairie provinces, if regional distinctiveness had somewhat declined. It was shown that contemporary western alienation was manifested in the rejection of unresponsive federal parties, continuing formation of

---

1971): 326-43; D.V. Smiley, Canada in Question: Federalism in the Seventies, 2nd ed. (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1976), pp. 27, 54-123, 193-210; D.V. Smiley, "Federal-Provincial Conflict in Canada," in Canadian Federalism: Myth or Reality, 3rd ed., ed. J. P. Meekison (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1977), pp. 2-18; D.V. Smiley, Canada in Question: Federalism in the Eighties, 3rd ed. (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1980), pp. 13-14, 101-2, 135, 207, 274-79; D.V.J. Bell, "Regionalism in the Canadian Political Community," in Politics: Canada, 4th ed., ed. P.W. Fox (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1977), pp. 78-89; D.J. Elkins, "The Sense of Place," in Small Worlds, pp. 1-30; D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon, "Province, Nation, Country and Confederation," pp. 285-312; M.A. Schwartz, Politics and Territory, pp. 5-336; D.M. Cameron, "Whither Canadian Federalism? The Challenge of Regional Diversity and Maturity," in Canadian Federalism: Myth or Reality, pp. 304-24.

fringe political parties to champion regional interests, the rise of provincialism and opportune use of federal scapegoats by provincial politicians, and the demand for reform of central institutions and further decentralization of power.

Clearly, from a survey of the relevant historiography it can be concluded that western discontent has played an ongoing role in determining political development. However, this survey also indicates that regional discontent has never been the sole determinant of political evolution. This limitation was recognized by J.E. Rea, in 1974, in "Images of the West," when he argued that a fault of western historiography, in general, and W.L. Morton's works, in particular, was a "one-dimensional" preoccupation with the development of agriculture and the struggle of the agrarian community against central Canadian domination. Rea did not dispute the validity of these themes but argued that Morton's viewpoint was limited. Rea noted that only in the 1960's had historians turned "away from the agrarian-oriented, traditional approach to grapple, in depth, with matters of class and ethnicity."<sup>80</sup> Representing a new departure in western political historiography, a number of recent broad-based class and ethnic analyses of western politics will now be considered for the light they shed on Morton's thesis.

---

<sup>80</sup> J.E. Rea, "Images of the West," in Western Perspectives I, pp. 4-8.

Rea, himself, helped lay the foundations of an alternate approach to the study of political development in 1970 in "The Roots of Prairie Society." Adapting the Hartzian fragment theory to western settlement, Rea argued that the dominant culture in Manitoba after the 1880's was an Anglo-Saxon fragment from Ontario. Essential political, social, and cultural institutions were shaped to their requirements. This influence had, of course, been noted by Morton; in fact, Rea cited Morton's Manitoba in making his point. Further west, Rea noted, the Ontario fragment's influence was weaker but still important. He then suggested that as the Ontario fragment and other immigrants centered themselves in their new environment, they increasingly came to view the world from a western perspective.<sup>81</sup> The implication for Morton's thesis was obvious. Political development and regional protest in Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Alberta would be channelled into vehicles acceptable to the predominant immigrant fragment in local society. Regional discontent, not alone, but in conjunction with ethnic, cultural, and societal factors shaped political development.

Rea's Hartzian approach was expanded to a full-blown theory in a 1981 article by N. Wiseman, "The Pattern of Prairie Politics." Wiseman, while not directly citing Morton, attacked the essence of his thesis in arguing that the use of a "metropolis-hinterland" framework within which

---

<sup>81</sup> J.E. Rea, "The Roots of Prairie Society," in Prairie Perspectives, pp. 46-55.



western politics were viewed as "essentially a response, a reaction, to externally imposed conditions," revealed "little about diversity of political traditions on the prairies."<sup>82</sup> His solution lay in understanding the relationships between "ideology and ethnicity" and "ideological-cultural heritage and party." Wiseman noted that four distinct immigration waves had settled the West: Ontario settlers with a primarily liberal-grit political tradition, British settlers with a largely labour-socialist background, American settlers steeped in populist ideology, and continental Europeans who had a limited political impact in their first generation of settlement. He then described how the interaction and relative strengths and weaknesses of these groups in each province determined local political development. The Ontario fragment had initially dominated politics in the three prairie provinces. In Manitoba, that domination had lasted until 1969 when the N.D.P., the inheritor of the British labour-socialist tradition, won power supported by non-Anglo-Saxon farmers and workers of multi-ethnic origins.<sup>83</sup> In Saskatchewan, the Ontario fragment's defeat at the hands of the British labour-agrarian-socialist element came in 1944, aided by the strength of the continental vote. In Alberta, where the Ontario fragment was weakest, the

---

<sup>82</sup> N. Wiseman, "The Pattern of Prairie Politics," Queen's Quarterly 88 no. 2 (Summer 1981): 298.

<sup>83</sup> There has been a considerable quantity of work generated on the influence of class and ethnicity on Manitoba politics, particularly in recent elections. See, for example, N. Wiseman, Social Democracy in Manitoba.

American populist influence dominated politics, supporting the U.F.A. and then Social Credit. The Conservatives inherited this voting base in 1971.<sup>84</sup>

Moreso than had W.L. Morton, Wiseman emphasized that these immigrant groups played a key role in political development, though he conceded that none were monolithic in their ideological beliefs and political action.<sup>85</sup> Even considering his concession, Wiseman had dangerously oversimplified the interrelationship of ethnicity and ideology. In addition, in formulating an all-encompassing theory of political evolution, he eliminated the many other factors that influenced political development; in particular, western discontent with metropolitan domination and factors of class, personality, socio-psychological conditions, and even historical accident. His approach shed light on western political development but, like Morton's, was too narrow in its scope.

In recent analyses of political development in the West, the ethnicity/ideology approach was often fruitfully combined with class study, further illuminating dimensions of political development neglected by W.L. Morton. Yet the same problems remained evident. A good example can be found in the best class and ethnic based study of political development in Manitoba, T. Peterson's 1972 "Ethnic and Class Poli-

---

<sup>84</sup> Ibid., pp. 298-315.

<sup>85</sup> Ibid., p. 301.

tics in Manitoba." Peterson argued that the 1922 election had not altered the political balance of power which remained in the hands of "farmers of British origin from the southwest of the province supported by businessmen of British origin in south Winnipeg."<sup>86</sup> Potential opposition in the ethnic working class to the Ontario fragment and the Bracken government never developed, primarily because of the widely held belief that electoral support of the political party with the best chance of winning power and rejection of radical alternatives, including British-led labour organizations, was the best means of overcoming racial antipathies and accusations of disloyalty fostered by the General Strike, the depression, two wars, and the Cold War. The party most hurt by this conformity was the C.C.F. which, therefore, remained a mainly British working class organization.<sup>87</sup> The weakness of the C.C.F. combined with the alignment of the Liberals with the Progressives and the weakness of the Conservatives ensured the continuation of the Bracken style of governing and reduced politics to a state of inertia, evidenced by small voter turnouts and a fragmented opposition.<sup>88</sup>

---

<sup>86</sup> T. Peterson, "Ethnic and Class Politics in Manitoba," in Canadian Provincial Politics, pp. 69-87, 95-96, 113-15.

<sup>87</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 78-98, 114-15.

<sup>88</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 92-96, 114-15.

Peterson argued that in 1958 this inertia ended as the Winnipeg business class deserted the Campbell administration for Duff Roblin's Conservatives and the lower classes slowly began to demonstrate a class consciousness through support of the C.C.F./N.D.P. This increasing consciousness, a product of material advancement, the loosening of ethnic ties, and a cooling of racial hostilities, culminated in the 1969 N.D.P. victory and the polarization of politics on class lines between the N.D.P. and the Conservatives with the Liberals, indistinguishable from the Conservatives and deprived of the ethnic vote, in danger of extinction.<sup>89</sup>

Peterson's ethnic/class analysis added much to the understanding of political development in the province. He, however, missed the significance of the 1922 election for its overtones of rejection of the party system, downplayed the extent of electoral opposition to the Bracken government, and overlooked the effect of the "bias" on the downfall of the provincial Liberal party, through its association with an increasingly unpopular federal counterpart. His ethnic/class approach was subject to the same reservations as Wiseman's; it downplayed the importance of western discontent within the framework of "metropolis-hinterland" relations, just one of a number of other factors that influenced political choice.

---

<sup>89</sup> Ibid., pp. 69, 98-115.

Both the strengths and weaknesses of a strictly class oriented analysis of western politics were evident again in two articles by J. Wilson, "The Canadian Political Cultures: Towards a Redefinition of the Nature of the Canadian Political System" and "The Decline of the Liberal Party in Manitoba Politics," published in 1974 and 1975. Noting that Canadian provinces were in different stages of development from pre-industrial to advanced industrial society, Wilson argued that political development was also at different stages of evolution. He described a general overriding pattern in which the old pre-industrial two-party system was replaced by a transitory three-party system and, finally, a return to a new two-party system based on class divisions. The new system could take various shapes: both old parties if they proved sufficiently adaptable; one old party, the more adaptable of the two, on the right and a labour party on the left; or two new parties if both old ones failed to satisfy conservative as well as labour elements in society.<sup>90</sup>

Wilson placed Manitoba in the transitory stage with the Liberals doomed to extinction as the electorate polarized around the N.D.P. and Conservatives.<sup>91</sup> Saskatchewan's electorate had already polarized and returned to a two-party

---

<sup>90</sup> J. Wilson, "The Canadian Political Cultures: Towards a Redefinition of the Nature of the Canadian Political System," Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 438-83.

<sup>91</sup> Ibid., pp. 459, 471, 479; "The Decline of the Liberal Party in Manitoba Politics," Journal of Canadian Studies 10 no. 1 (February 1975): 24-41.

system.<sup>92</sup> Alberta was a special case. Both old parties had initially failed to adapt, the "left" had been rejected, and a new two-party system was in the process of being formed in which Social Credit was the party of the right and an accommodation with labour had been reached.<sup>93</sup> Wilson's analysis, while obviously possessing much merit, has since been partially discredited by political developments in Manitoba and Alberta. More importantly, as a general analytical approach, his class-based analysis was flawed because it failed to incorporate the effect of Canadian federalism and regional discontent on western political development. However, he indirectly conceded the force of regionalism when he noted that because the provinces were at different stages of political evolution, national political parties were unable to perform their integrating functions, particularly on a class basis. In effect, Wilson concluded, Canadian reality was to be found in Careless's "limited identities."<sup>94</sup>

Wilson's analysis suggested that even scholars investigating the relationship of class and political development have usually recognized the impact of regionalism. Further proof of this assertion can be found in the writings of R. Alford and G. Horowitz who, while differing greatly in their assessment of the effect of class on political development, acknowledged that regionalism was a more important determi-

---

<sup>92</sup> Wilson, "Political Cultures," pp. 457, 459-64.

<sup>93</sup> Ibid., pp. 459, 468-71, 478.

<sup>94</sup> Ibid., p. 483.

nant. Alford, in 1963, in Party and Society: The Anglo-American Democracies, recognized a left-right cleavage in Canadian political parties but argued that ideological differences were often murky.<sup>95</sup> More importantly, Alford concluded that "regional and religious cleavages supercede class almost entirely as factors differentiating the support for national parties." The Progressives, C.C.F., and Social Credit were expressions of this cleavage.<sup>96</sup> Horowitz, in his analysis of the Canadian party system, put greater emphasis on class influence on political development than Alford. In "Conservatism, Liberalism, and Socialism in Canada: An Interpretation" and Canadian Labour in Politics, published in 1966 and 1968, Horowitz delineated tory, liberal, and socialist strains in Canadian society and politics, with the party of the center, the Liberals, dominating the parties of the peripheries. But he echoed Alford in conceding that class divisions were not as prominent in voting patterns as "regional-religious-ethnic" factors.<sup>97</sup> Alford and Horowitz realized that in explaining the Canadian party system a balance must be struck between class and regional inputs.

---

<sup>95</sup> R. Alford, Party and Society: The Anglo-American Democracies (Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1963), pp. 11-18, 260.

<sup>96</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. X-XI, 43, 46-47, 94-109, 120, 250-92.

<sup>97</sup> G. Horowitz, "Conservatism, Liberalism, and Socialism in Canada: An Interpretation," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 32 no. 2 (May 1966): 143-71; Canadian Labour in Politics, Studies in the Structure of Power: Decision-Making in Canada, vol. 4 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968), pp. 3-57.

The need for this balance was also noted by D.J. Elkins in 1974 in "The Perceived Structure of the Canadian Party Systems." Elkins admitted that a left-right continuum did not adequately explain Canadian party structure; the element of "center-periphery," at the very least, must be added to the model.<sup>98</sup> These political analysts astutely realized that class analysis, by itself, was lacking. Regionalism and "metropolis-hinterland" relations, the core of Morton's thesis, must also be incorporated in any model of Canadian political development. It must also be noted, of course, that, by implication, Morton's "bias" and "metropolis-hinterland" were also inadequate as analytical approaches without the inclusion of class and other factors.

The attempt to balance class, ethnic, and regional factors in the analysis of political development is again evident in a survey of historical works examining the growth of the western labour movement and its political involvement, particularly in the period culminating in the Winnipeg General Strike, the rise and fall of the One Big Union, and their immediate aftermath. While all historians acknowledged the overriding class nature of the western labour movement, most also noted its regional aspects. For example, in D.C. Masters's 1950 The Winnipeg General Strike, the second volume in the Social Credit series, Masters argued that "both the labour and agrarian movements were phases of

---

<sup>98</sup> D.J. Elkins, "The Perceived Structure of the Canadian Party Systems," Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 502-24.



the revolt of western regionalism against eastern dominance"; the former was a reaction to the "conservatism and supposedly outmoded policies of eastern labour" before 1919.<sup>99</sup> After the strike, as the Winnipeg labour movement moderated, Masters noted that "farmer and labour developed the same bogey-man, eastern business interests." This shared concern eventually brought the two together in the C.C.F.<sup>100</sup>

S.D. Clark, in his Foreword to Masters's work, was even more emphatic in stressing the regional aspect of the western labour movement. It was a "protest against eastern dominance" of political, economic, and cultural life, control of the Trades and Labour Congress by eastern craft unions, and an "expression of the West's urge to build a better world in which to live."<sup>101</sup> Examining a development that Morton had virtually ignored, Masters's and Clark's analyses reflected the "metropolis-hinterland" orientation evident in Morton's work and prevalent in the 1950's.

A good example of a later work stressing the "metropolis-hinterland" aspect of the early labour movement was P. Phillips's 1973 "The National Policy and the Development of the Western Canadian Labour Movement." Phillips argued that the imperialist National Policy had a direct influence on "the

---

<sup>99</sup> D.C. Masters, The Winnipeg General Strike, Social Credit in Alberta, vol. 2 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950), pp. 5, 11, 18, 27, 30-39, 148.

<sup>100</sup> Ibid., pp. 135, 138-50.

<sup>101</sup> S.D. Clark, Foreword to The Winnipeg General Strike, pp. VII-X.

structure and course of western labour organization." Deriving no benefits from protection, western labour stood opposed to eastern labour which benefitted, to a degree, and, therefore, shared a community of interest with big business and espoused a conservatism that dominated the T.L.C. The solutions of the western labour movement: industrial unionism, the O.B.U., labour and socialist parties, and the general strike, were all opposed by eastern labour.<sup>102</sup>

While virtually all historians examining the early western movement noted the presence of "metropolis-hinterland" conflict, they emphasized that class consciousness and relations, ethnicity, management-labour relations, and local working and living conditions, admittedly at variance in each province and industrialized region, determined, in conjunction with regional discontent, the particular course of action followed. At the risk of grouping together works possessing different interpretations on a number of contentious issues, none of which, however, are directly related to the subject at hand, the conclusion may again be safely drawn that no single theoretical construct can alone explain political development. "Metropolis-hinterland," class consciousness, and ethnicity-ideology must all be used in the

---

<sup>102</sup> P. Phillips, "The National Policy and the Development of the Western Canadian Labour Movement," in Prairie Perspectives 2, pp. 41-62. Other works have also stressed the regional aspect of the western labour revolt. See, for example: G. Friesen, "'Yours in Revolt': The Socialist Party of Canada and the Western Canadian Labour Movement," Labour 1 (1976): 139-57.

study of the early western labour movement and its impact on political development.<sup>103</sup>

Clearly, the study of ethnicity and class illuminate dimensions of political development left unexplored by analytical approaches such as Morton's which were too firmly embedded in a "metropolis-hinterland" framework. In addition, the growing popularity of social history in western historiography can provide another perspective to western political development. To name two prominent examples, recent works by R. Allen and J.H. Thompson expanded on a development that W.L. Morton had noted,<sup>104</sup> but not closely examined; the presence of a general reform movement in the West, and nation-wide as well, of which the Progressive

---

<sup>103</sup> See, for example, M. Robin, Radical Politics and Canadian Labour, 1880-1930 (Kingston: Industrial Relations Center, 1968), pp. 131-218; A.R. McCormack, Reformers, Rebels, and Revolutionaries: The Western Canadian Radical Movement, 1899-1919 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1977), pp. 9-171; D.J. Bercuson, "The Winnipeg General Strike, Collective Bargaining, and the One Big Union Issue," Canadian Historical Review 51 no. 2 (June 1970): 164-76; D.J. Bercuson, Confrontation at Winnipeg: Labour, Industrial Relations, and the General Strike (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1974), pp. 4-195; D.J. Bercuson, "The Winnipeg General Strike," in On Strike: Six Key Labour Struggles in Canada, 1919-1949, ed. I. Abella (Toronto: James Lewis and Samuel, 1974), pp. 1-32; D.J. Bercuson, Fools and Wise Men: The Rise and Fall of the One Big Union (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1978), pp. 28-264; I. Abella, "The Canadian Labour Movement, 1902-1960," Canadian Historical Association Historical Booklet 28 (1975): 3-14; D. Avery, "The Radical Alien and the Winnipeg General Strike of 1919," in The West and the Nation: Essays in Honour of W.L. Morton, eds. C. Berger and R. Cook (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1976), pp. 209-31; D. Avery, "Dangerous Foreigners": European Immigrant Workers and Labour Radicalism in Canada, 1896-1932 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1979);

movement was just one manifestation.<sup>105</sup> Three works by Allen on the social gospel movement, published in 1968, 1971, and 1976, "The Social Gospel and the Reform Tradition in Canada, 1890-1928," The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-28, and "The Social Gospel as the Religion of the Agrarian Revolt," indicated that the western Progressive movement was not merely a secular regional movement addressing economic and political grievances.<sup>106</sup> Noting that W.L. Morton had "never fully explored" their association, Allen argued that the the social gospel was the "religion of the agrarian revolt" and shared in the triumphs of the Progressive party. The decline of the social gospel movement contributed to the decline of the Progressives. Social gossellers also played an important role in the formation and

---

reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1983), pp. 48-141; S. Jamieson, Times of Trouble: Labour Unrest and Industrial Conflict in Canada, 1900-66, Task Force on Labour Relations, no. 22 (Ottawa: Information Canada, 1968), pp. 170-82, 186-88; C. Lipton, The Trade Union Movement of Canada, 1827-1959, 3rd ed. (Montreal: Canadian Social Publications Ltd., 1967; reprint ed., Toronto: New Canada Press Ltd., 1973), pp. 185-222, 234-36, 348; H.A. Logan, Trade Unions in Canada: Their Development and Functioning (Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1948), pp. 301-30, 437; K. McNaught, A Prophet in Politics, pp. 96, 99-131; K. McNaught and D.J. Bercuson, The Winnipeg Strike: 1919 (Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1974), pp. 2-97; B.D. Palmer, Working-Class Experience: The Rise and Reconstitution of Canadian Labour, 1800-1980 (Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1983), pp. 142, 165-84; N. Penner, ed., Winnipeg, 1919: The Strikers' Own History of the Winnipeg General Strike (Toronto: James Lewis and Samuel, 1973), pp. IX-XXIII; J.E. Rea, "The Politics of Conscience: Winnipeg after the Strike," Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1971): 276-88; J.E. Rea, "The Politics of Class: Winnipeg City Council, 1919-1945," in The West and the Nation, pp. 232-49. Though the Communist party was not a major force in early western political development, major works on the history of the party

growth of the labour movement in the post-war West and in the later formation of the C.C.F. These political phenomena obviously possessed religious elements in which the struggle was for a better world for all and not just for western Canadians in Confederation. Allen's study of the social gospel movement again illustrated that the Canadian Progressive movement cannot be viewed solely in a narrow regional context as many of the reforms sought by the Progressives had little to do with regional discontent.

In this same light, J.H. Thompson, in The Harvests of War, elaborated on other important manifestations of the general reform movement, particularly the demand for prohibition and women's suffrage,<sup>107</sup> which were linked with the

---

indicate the centrality of class and ethnicity in its development. See I. Avakumovic, The Communist Party in Canada: A History (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1975), pp. 1-21, 35-38, 275; D. Avery, "Ethnic Loyalties and the Proletarian Revolution: A Case Study of Communist Political Activity in Winnipeg, 1923-1936," in Ethnicity, Power and Politics in Canada, eds. J. Dahlie and T. Fernando (Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1981), pp. 68-93; W. Rodney, Soldiers of the International: A History of the Communist Party of Canada, 1919-1929, Canadian Studies in History and Government, no. 10 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968), pp. 7-27.

<sup>104</sup> See Chapter 3.

<sup>105</sup> Allen and Thompson were not the first historians to explore the relationship of the social gospel and general reform movement to western-born third parties, but they explored this relationship to a greater extent than their predecessors. For earlier works touching on the subject, see P.F. Sharp, The Agrarian Revolt in Western Canada, pp. 60-61; K. McNaught, A Prophet in Politics, pp. 30-57, 139.

<sup>106</sup> R. Allen, "The Social Gospel and the Reform Tradition in Canada, 1890-1928," Canadian Historical Review 49 no. 4

agrarian revolt but were also distinct movements in their own right. Again, the conclusion drawn from the work of Allen and Thompson is that there were other motives behind the support of the Progressive movement than the redress of regional grievances. Too narrow a theoretical construct can only serve to disguise this fact. In applying this conclusion to a broader critique of Morton's thesis, once again it is evident that a wide complex of factors determined political development in the West, not all of which fell within the domain of regional discontent and "metropolis-hinterland" relations.

---

(December 1968): 381-99; The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-28 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971), pp. 10, 14, 42-43, 61-67, 71-75, 81-132, 173, 197-218, 282-83, 347-56; "The Social Gospel as the Religion of the Agrarian Revolt," in The West and the Nation, pp. 174-86.

<sup>107</sup> J.H. Thompson, The Harvests of War, pp. 95-114.

## Chapter VI

### CONCLUSION

In 1955, in "The Bias of Prairie Politics," W.L. Morton presented his theory that the western struggle for economic and political equality had shaped a unique regional political development. Underlying Morton's assertion were a number of important observations. Central to his thesis was his assumption that the West was a relatively homogeneous region whose inhabitants shared important common interests. Another cornerstone was his charge of metropolitan political and economic subordination of the West, attributable to the shortcomings of Canadian political institutions, discriminatory policies and neglect by the federal government, and exploitation by metropolitan business interests. A third underlying observation was that the western struggle to overcome metropolitan domination was the primary catalyst to political development in the West. In this light, all western-based political movements were to be viewed as manifestations of the western struggle for equality. Lastly, Morton, particularly in his later writings, observed that Westerners prior to 1958, in their attempt to gain equality, had largely rejected partisan politics and lapsed into an apolitical torpor.

These pillars of Morton's thesis are extremely broad generalizations that do not all stand up to close analysis, as the preceding historiographical review has shown. Least susceptible to criticism is Morton's belief in a unique western identity, though it should be noted that western interests have never been as monolithic or homogeneous as Morton believed, even during the expansionary years of the West when there was a prevailing agrarian outlook. In the modern post-war West, provincial interests have diverged significantly though there is still a strong case for defining the West as a distinct region. Relative to Morton's thesis, it may be said that there still exists a common western hostility to central Canada based on a perception of regional discrimination.

The other underlying bases of Morton's thesis are more open to criticism. The validity of Morton's charges of "colonial subordination" and "economic subordination" have been questioned; in particular the controversies over public lands, the grants of provincial status, federal subsidies, the C.P.R. monopoly, early banking policy, freight rates, the grain marketing system, and the various elements of the National Policy have never been conclusively shown to constitute deliberate regional discrimination or colonial subordination, though, admittedly, the West suffered certain hardships. In assessing the third cornerstone of Morton's thesis, his reliance on the "metropolis-hinterland" con-



struct clearly resulted in an inadequate analysis of the complex phenomenon of western political behaviour. Specific developments that fostered claims of uniqueness and the entire panorama of western political evolution required full analysis of the unique historical complex of each province, including political traditions, ethnicity and ideology, class consciousness, personality, socio-psychological factors, religious, social, and institutional conditions, and even historical accident. National and continental commonalities of experience had also to be explained. Western antipathy to central Canada and attempts to address regional grievances was only one of many factors influencing the political milieu. The last foundation of Morton's thesis, an apolitical West, also does not stand up to close scrutiny; the demise of the two old parties was not as severe as depicted; partisan politics and political opposition to western ruling parties had not disappeared; not all western provincial governments consistently opposed the federal government; and ideological debate was becoming more prominent in provincial politics. Finally, the political victories of Social Credit in Alberta and the C.C.F. in Saskatchewan could not be described as victories of western apolitical sentiment.

Clearly, Morton's approach, confined within the bounds of the "metropolis-hinterland" framework, had its limitations for the analysis of western political development. Within

the context of an evolving Canadian historiography, Morton's writings in the 1950's, particularly The Progressive Party, "Bias," and Manitoba, represented the climax of the use of "metropolis-hinterland" relations as an analytical approach to the study of western political development. In the 1960's, other approaches, ie., class, labour, ethnic, and social history, became popular, which enabled the complex historical and political developments of the three prairie provinces to be analyzed more extensively than was possible using Morton's orientation.

Despite these criticisms, Morton's thesis had and still has its usefulness. First, it was part of Morton's attempt to redress a historiographical shortcoming, the relegation of regional history to secondary status by the advocates of the Laurentian thesis. Secondly, the fundamental belief that the regional attempt to overcome metropolitan domination has played a significant role in shaping political development has been accepted by regional historians and political scientists from A. Begg to D.E. Smith and R. Gibbins. As an approach to the study of political development in the prairie provinces, it continues to provide useful insight. At the federal level, regional discontent has on a number of occasions led to the rejection of political parties viewed as unsympathetic or hostile to western grievances and aspirations. Examples include the rejection of the Liberals and Conservatives in 1921 and the Trudeau Liberals

in more recent years. At the other end of the spectrum, parties viewed as champions of western interests have usually received strong support; for example, the Progressives in 1921 and Diefenbaker's Conservatives.

The influence of regional discontent has also been prominent in provincial politics. Many provincial parties have suffered due to their ties to an unpopular federal affiliate. Conversely, many political parties in the western provinces have successfully harnessed the emotions aroused by western discontent; to name but one prominent recent example, Lougheed's Conservatives in Alberta. Regional discontent has also contributed to the rise of provincialism as a counterbalance to a powerful, central Canadian dominated federal government, the continuing calls for decentralization of federal institutions and power, the quest for constitutional reform, and the formation of fringe political parties in the West. In surveying western politics since 1870, the effect of regional discontent has been a constant factor and, given the West's continuing hinterland status vis-a-vis central Canada, remains worthy of academic attention.

What must be understood about the persistence of regional discontent during and after the time period with which Morton was concerned is that people's perceptions are as important, if not more so, than objective reality. For over one hundred years Westerners have acted in a manner consistent

with their belief that they have been the victims of neglect, discrimination, and exploitation. Studies challenging the foundation of this tradition do not alter the reality of their response. As M. Schwartz so accurately stated in "Attachments to Province and Region in the Prairie Provinces," published in 1970, "it is perceptions of reality, rather than the reality itself, which are closely tied to the emergence of group consciousness and to political action based on perceived group interests."<sup>108</sup>

In this light, it must be recognized that the western "bias" is ingrained in many Westerners' perceptions of national political, economic, and cultural life and is a part of the folklore of the three prairie provinces. Hostility generated in the 1970's natural resource disputes, local reaction to the awarding of government contracts in the aerospace industry, the continuing presence of fringe political parties, the recurrent though admittedly poorly supported threats of western separatism, and calls for an elective Senate are but five of a host of examples that illustrate how close to the surface of western consciousness the western "bias" lies.

In concluding, it is suggested that national political parties must acknowledge the presence of the "bias" and direct their efforts, as best they can in a federal state,

---

<sup>108</sup> M.A. Schwartz, "Attachments to Province and Region in the Prairie Provinces," in One Prairie Province? A Question for Canada, ed. D.K. Elton (Lethbridge: Lethbridge Herald, 1970), pp. 101-5.

to the pacification of the sentiments it engenders. The bitter pills the West is often forced to swallow must be administered in a manner cognizant of the inevitable reaction. The art of governing includes, after all, the constant pacification of minorities in a majority-rules system. This looms as the best prescription to alleviate the symptoms of the western headache as it appears exceedingly unlikely that the causes will ever be eradicated.

## SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Works of W.L. Morton

#### Books

- Morton, W.L. The Progressive Party in Canada. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 1. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Manitoba: A History. 2nd ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967; reprint ed., Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Canadian Identity. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Kingdom of Canada: A General History From Earliest Times Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1963.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Critical Years: The Union of British North America, 1857-1873. The Canadian Centenary Series, vol. 12. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1964.
- Morton Fahrni, Margaret, and Morton, W.L. Third Crossing: A History of the First Quarter Century of the Town and District of Gladstone in the Province of Manitoba. Winnipeg: Advocate Printers, 1946.

#### Articles

- Morton, W.L. "Winnipeg and Manitoba, 1874-1922: A Study in Representative Democracy." Manitoba Arts Review 1 no. 4 (Winter 1939): 29-41.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Direct Legislation and the Origins of the Progressive Movement." Canadian Historical Review 25 no. 3 (September 1944): 279-88.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Marginal." Manitoba Arts Review 5 no. 1 (Spring 1946): 26-31.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Clio in Canada: The Interpretation of Canadian History." University of Toronto Quarterly 15 no. 3 (April 1946): 227-34.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Western Progressive Movement and Cabinet Domination." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 12 no. 2 (May 1946): 136-47.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Western Progressive Movement, 1919-1921." Canadian Historical Association Report (1946): 41-55.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Social Philosophy of Henry Wise Wood, The Canadian Agrarian Leader." Agricultural History 22 no. 2 (April 1948): 114-123.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Significance of Site in the Settlement of the American and Canadian Wests." Agricultural History 25 no. 3 (July 1951): 97-104.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Bias of Prairie Politics." Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XLIX Section II (June 1955): 57-66.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Relevance of Canadian History." Canadian Historical Association Report (1960): 1-21.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "A Century of Plain and Parkland." Alberta Historical Review 17 no. 2 (Spring 1969): 1-10.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Seeing an Unliterary Landscape." Mosaic III no. 3 (Manitoba Centennial Issue 1970): 1-10.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The 'North' in Canadian Historiography." Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series IV Vol. VIII Symposia (1970): 31-40.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Some Thoughts on Understanding Canadian History." Acadiensis 2 no. 2 (Spring 1973): 100-7.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The West and the Nation, 1870-1970." In Prairie Perspectives 2, pp. 8-24. Edited by A.W. Rasporich and H.C. Klassen. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Canada: The One and the Many." In Divided We Stand, pp. 124-29. Edited by G. Geddes. Toronto: Peter Martin Associates Ltd., 1977.

#### Works By Other Authors

##### Books

- Ager, C. The Farmer and the Interests: A Study in Economic Parasitism. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1916.
- Alford, R. Party and Society: The Anglo-American Democracies. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1963.
- Allen, R. The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-28. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971.

- Avakumovic, I. The Communist Party in Canada: A History. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1975.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Socialism in Canada: A Study of the C.C.F.-N.D.P. in Federal and Provincial Politics. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1978.
- Avery, D. "Dangerous Foreigners": European Immigrant Workers and Labour Radicalism in Canada, 1896-1932. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1979; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1983.
- Barr, J.J. The Dynasty: The Rise and Fall of Social Credit in Alberta. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1974.
- Begg, A. History of the North-West. vol. II. Toronto: Hunter, Rose, and Co., 1894.
- \_\_\_\_\_. History of the North-West. vol. III. Toronto: Hunter, Rose, and Co., 1895.
- Bercuson, D.J. Confrontation at Winnipeg: Labour, Industrial Relations, and the General Strike. Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1974.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Fools and Wise Men: The Rise and Fall of the One Big Union. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1978.
- Berger, C. The Writing of Canadian History: Aspects of English-Canadian Historical Writing: 1900-1970. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976.
- Boyd, H. New Breaking: An Outline of Cooperation Among the Farmers of Western Canada. Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1938.
- Britnell, G.E. The Wheat Economy. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1939.
- Bryce, G. A History of Manitoba: Its Resources and People. Toronto: The Canada History Co., 1906.
- Burnet, J. Next-Year Country: A Study of Rural Social Organization in Alberta. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 3. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1951.
- Canada, Report of the Royal Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations. Book I: Canada: 1867-1939. Ottawa: Kings Printer, 1940.
- Clark, S.D. Movements of Political Protest in Canada, 1640-1840. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 9. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959.



- Conway, J.F. The West: The History of a Region in Confederation. Toronto: James Lorimer and Co., 1983.
- Cook, R. The Politics of John W. Dafoe and the Free Press. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963.
- Creighton, D. Dominion of the North: A History of Canada. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1944.
- Dafoe, J.W. Clifford Sifton in Relation to His Times. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1931.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Canada: An American Nation. New York: Columbia University Press, 1935.
- Dales, J.H. The Protective Tariff in Canada's Development. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1966.
- Darling, H. The Politics of Freight Rates: The Railway Freight Rate Issue in Canada. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1980.
- Donnelly, M.S. The Government of Manitoba. Canadian Government Series, no. 14. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963.
- Eager, E. Saskatchewan Government: Politics and Pragmatism. Saskatoon: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1980.
- Engelmann, F.C. and Schwartz, M.A. Political Parties and the Canadian Social Structure. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967.
- Fowke, V.C. Canadian Agricultural Policy: The Historical Pattern. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1946.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The National Policy and the Wheat Economy. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 7. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1957.
- Friesen, G. The Canadian Prairies: A History. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984.
- Gibbins, R. Prairie Politics and Society: Regionalism in Decline. Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1980.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Regionalism: Territorial Politics in Canada and the United States. Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1982.
- Glazebrook, G. P. deT. A History of Transportation in Canada. Volume II: National Economy, 1867-1936. The Carleton Library, no. 12. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1938; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1964.

- Good, W.C. Production and Taxation in Canada From the Farmers' Standpoint. Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1919.
- Hansen, M.L., and Brebner, J.B. The Mingling of the Canadian and American Peoples. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1940.
- Hedges, J.B. Building the Canadian West: The Land and Colonization Policies of the Canadian Pacific Railway. New York: The MacMillan Co., 1939.
- Horn, M. The League for Social Reconstruction: Intellectual Origins of the Democratic Left in Canada, 1930-1942. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980.
- Horowitz, G. Canadian Labour in Politics. Studies in the Structure of Power: Decision-Making in Canada, vol. 4. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968.
- Innis, H.A. A History of the Canadian Pacific Railway. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1923.
- \_\_\_\_\_, ed. The Diary of Alexander James McPhail. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1940.
- Irvine, W. The Farmers in Politics. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1920.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Cooperative Government. Ottawa: Mutual Press Ltd., 1929.
- Irving, J.A. The Social Credit Movement in Alberta. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 10. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959.
- Jamieson, S. Times of Trouble: Labour Unrest and Industrial Conflict in Canada, 1900-66. Task Force on Labour Relations, no. 22. Ottawa: Information Canada, 1968.
- Kendle, J. John Bracken: A Political Biography. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1979.
- Lingard, C.C. Territorial Government in Canada: The Autonomy Question in the Old North-West Territories. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1946.
- Lipset, S.M. Agrarian Socialism: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan: A Study in Political Sociology. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1950.
- Lipton, C. The Trade Union Movement of Canada, 1827-1959. 3rd ed. Montreal: Canadian Social Publications Ltd., 1967; reprint ed., Toronto: New Canada Press Ltd., 1973.

- Logan, H.A. Trade Unions in Canada: Their Development and Functioning. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1948.
- Lower, A.R.M. Colony to Nation: A History of Canada. 4th ed., revised. Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1964; reprint ed., Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1969.
- McCormack, A.R. Reformers, Rebels, and Revolutionaries: The Western Canadian Radical Movement, 1899-1919. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1977.
- MacGibbon, D.A. The Canadian Grain Trade. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1932.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Canadian Grain Trade, 1931-1951. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1952.
- McHenry, D.E. The Third Force in Canada: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation, 1932-1948. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1950.
- Mackintosh, W.A. Agricultural Cooperation in Western Canada. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1924.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Prairie Settlement: The Geographical Setting. Canadian Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 1. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1934.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Economic Problems of the Prairie Provinces. Canadian Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 4. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1935.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Economic Background of Dominion-Provincial Relations. Appendix III of the Royal Commission Report on Dominion-Provincial Relations. Ottawa: King's Printer, 1939; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1964.
- McNaught, K. A Prophet in Politics: A Biography of J.S. Woodsworth. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959.
- McNaught, K., and Bercuson, D.J. The Winnipeg Strike: 1919. Don Mills: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1974.
- Macphail, A. Essays in Politics. London: Longmans, Green and Co. Ltd., 1909.
- Macpherson, C.B. Democracy in Alberta: The Theory and Practise of a Quasi-Party System. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 4. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1953.

- Mallory, J.R. Social Credit and the Federal Power in Canada. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 5. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1954.
- Mann, W.E. Sect, Cult and Church in Alberta. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 6. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955.
- Martin, C. "The Natural Resources Question": The Historical Basis of Provincial Claims. Winnipeg: Saults and Pollard Ltd., 1920.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Foundations of Canadian Nationhood. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955.
- Masters, D.C. The Winnipeg General Strike. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 2. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- Maxwell, J.A. Federal Subsidies to the Provincial Governments in Canada. Harvard Economic Studies, vol. LVI. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1937.
- Milne, D. The New Canadian Constitution. Toronto: James Lorimer and Co., 1982.
- Moorhouse, H. Deep Furrows. Winnipeg: G.J. McLeod Ltd., 1918.
- Morton, A.S. A History of the Canadian West to 1870-71. London: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd., 1939.
- Morton, A.S., and Martin, C. History of Prairie Settlement and "Dominion Lands" Policy. Canadian Frontiers of Settlement, vol. 2. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1938.
- Morton, D. N.D.P.: The Dream of Power. Toronto: A.M. Hakkert Ltd., 1974.
- Munro, W.B. American Influences on Canadian Government. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1929.
- Newman, P.C. Renegade in Power: The Diefenbaker Years. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1963.
- Owram, D. Promise of Eden: The Canadian Expansionist Movement and the Idea of the West, 1856-1900. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980.
- Palmer, B.D. Working-Class Experience: The Rise and Reconstitution of Canadian Labour, 1800-1980. Toronto: Butterworth and Co. Ltd., 1983.

- Partridge, E.A. A War on Poverty: The One War That Can End War. Winnipeg: Wallingford Press Ltd., 1925.
- Patton, H.S. Grain Growers' Cooperation in Western Canada. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1928.
- Penner, N., ed. Winnipeg, 1919: The Strikers' Own History of the Winnipeg General Strike. Toronto: James Lewis and Samuel, 1973.
- Peterson, C.W. Wake Up, Canada! Reflections on Vital National Issues. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1919.
- Pinard, M. The Rise of a Third Party: A Study in Crisis Politics. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1971.
- Porritt, E. The Revolt in Canada Against the New Feudalism. London: Cassell and Co. Ltd., 1911.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Canada's Protective Tariff. Winnipeg: Grain Growers' Guide, 1920.
- Porritt, E., and Porritt, A.G. Sixty Years of Protection in Canada, 1846-1912. 2nd ed. Winnipeg: Grain Growers' Guide, 1913.
- Regenstreif, P. The Diefenbaker Interlude: Parties and Voting in Canada: An Interpretation. Toronto: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1965.
- Richards, J., and Pratt, L. Prairie Capitalism: Power and Influence in the New West. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1979.
- Robin, M. Radical Politics and Canadian Labour, 1880-1930. Kingston: Industrial Relations Center, 1968.
- Rodney, W. Soldiers of the International: A History of the Communist Party of Canada, 1919-1929. Canadian Studies in History and Government, no. 10. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968.
- Rolph, W.K. Henry Wise Wood of Alberta. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- Romanow, R.; Whyte, J.; and Leeson, H. Canada ... Nonwithstanding: The Making of the Constitution, 1976-1982. Toronto: Carswell/Methuen, 1984.
- Safarian, A.E. The Canadian Economy in the Great Depression. The Carleton Library, no. 54. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959; reprint ed., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1970.

- Schwartz, M.A. Politics and Territory: The Sociology of Regional Persistence in Canada. Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1974.
- Sharp, P. The Agrarian Revolt in Western Canada: A Survey Showing American Parallels. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1948; reprint ed., New York: Octagon Books, 1971.
- Smiley, D.V. The Canadian Political Nationality. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1967.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Canada in Question: Federalism in the Seventies. 2nd ed. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Canada in Question: Federalism in the Eighties. 3rd ed. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1980.
- Smith, D.E. Prairie Liberalism: The Liberal Party in Saskatchewan, 1905-71. Canadian Government Series, no. 18. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Regional Decline of a National Party: Liberals on the Prairies. Canadian Government Series, no. 21. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981.
- Stanley, G.F.G. The Birth of Western Canada: A History of the Riel Rebellions. Toronto: Longmans, Green and Co. Ltd., 1936; reprint ed., Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1978.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Louis Riel. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1963.
- Stein, M.B. The Dynamics of Right-Wing Protest: A Political Analysis of Social Credit in Quebec. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973.
- Stevenson, G. Unfulfilled Union: Canadian Federalism and National Unity. Toronto: MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1979.
- Swanson, W.W., and Armstrong, P.C. Wheat. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1930.
- Thomas, L.G. The Liberal Party in Alberta: A History of Politics in the Province of Alberta, 1905-1921. Social Credit in Alberta: Its Background and Development, vol. 8. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1959.
- Thomas, L.H. The Struggle for Responsible Government in the North-West Territories, 1870-1897. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1956.
- Thompson, J.H. The Harvests of War: The Prairie West, 1914-1918. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1978.

- Wilson, B. Politics of Defeat: The Decline of the Liberal Party in Saskatchewan. Saskatoon: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1980.
- Wiseman, N. Social Democracy in Manitoba: A History of the C.C.F.-N.D.P. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1983.
- Wood, L.A. A History of Farmers' Movements in Canada: The Origins and Development of Agrarian Protest, 1872-1924. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1924.
- Young, W.D. The Anatomy of a Party: The National C.C.F., 1932-61. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Democracy and Discontent: Progressivism, Socialism and Social Credit in the Canadian West. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1969.
- Zakuta, L. A Protest Movement Becalmed: A Study of Change in the C.C.F. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1964.

#### Articles

- Abella, I. "The Canadian Labour Movement, 1902-1960." Canadian Historical Association Historical Booklet 28 (1975).
- Allen, R. "The Social Gospel and the Reform Tradition in Canada, 1890-1928." Canadian Historical Review 49 no. 4 (December 1968): 381-99.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Social Gospel as the Religion of the Agrarian Revolt." In The West and the Nation: Essays in Honour of W.L. Morton, pp. 174-86. Edited by C. Berger and R. Cook. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1976.
- Anderson, O. "The Unfinished Revolt." In The Unfinished Revolt: Some Views on Western Independence, pp. 35-59. Edited by J.J. Barr and O. Anderson. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1971.
- Andrews, K. "'Progressive' Counterparts of the C.C.F.: Social Credit and the Conservative Party in Saskatchewan, 1935-1938." Journal of Canadian Studies 17 no. 3 (Autumn 1982): 58-74.
- Archer, J.A. "The Prairie Perspective." In One Country or Two?, pp. 231-52. Edited by R.M. Burns. Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1971.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Prairie Perspective in 1977." In Must Canada Fail?, pp. 73-84. Edited by R. Simeon. Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1977.
- Avery, D. "The Radical Alien and the Winnipeg General Strike of 1919." In The West and the Nation: Essays in Honour of W.L. Morton, pp. 209-31. Edited by C. Berger and R. Cook. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Ethnic Loyalties and the Proletarian Revolution: A Case Study of Communist Political Activity in Winnipeg, 1923-1936." In Ethnicity, Power and Politics in Canada, pp. 68-93. Edited by J. Dahlie and T. Fernando. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1981.
- Barr, J.J. "Beyond Bitterness: The New Western Radicalism." In The Unfinished Revolt: Some Views on Western Independence, pp. 11-32. Edited by J.J. Barr and O. Anderson. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1971.
- Bell, D.V.J. "Regionalism in the Canadian Political Community." In Politics: Canada. 4th ed., pp. 78-89. Edited by P.W. Fox. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1977.
- Bennett, J.W., and Krueger, C. "Agrarian Pragmatism and Radical Politics." In Agrarian Socialism: The Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan: A Study in Political Sociology. updated ed., pp. 347-63. Edited by S.M. Lipset. New York: Doubleday and Co. Inc., 1968.
- Bercuson, D.J. "The Winnipeg General Strike, Collective Bargaining, and the One Big Union Issue." Canadian Historical Review 51 no. 2 (June 1970): 164-76.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Winnipeg General Strike." In On Strike: Six Key Labour Struggles in Canada, 1919-1949, pp. 1-32. Edited by I. Abella. Toronto: James Lewis and Samuel, 1974.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Introduction to Canada and the Burden of Unity, pp. 1-18. Edited by D.J. Bercuson. Toronto: MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Regionalism and 'Unlimited Identity' in Western Canada." Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 121-26.
- Black, E.R., and Cairns, A.C. "A Different Perspective on Canadian Federalism." Canadian Public Administration 9 no. 1 (March 1966): 27-45.



- Blais, A. "Third Parties in Canadian Provincial Politics." Canadian Journal of Political Science 6 no. 3 (September 1973): 422-38.
- Brebner, J.B. "Canadian and North American History." Canadian Historical Association Report (1931): 37-48.
- Cairns, A.C. "The Electoral System and the Party System in Canada, 1921-1965." Canadian Journal of Political Science 1 no. 1 (March 1968): 55-80.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Governments and Societies of Canadian Federalism." Canadian Journal of Political Science 10 no. 4 (December 1977): 695-725.
- Cameron, D.M. "Whither Canadian Federalism? The Challenge of Regional Diversity and Maturity." In Canadian Federalism: Myth or Reality. 3rd ed., pp. 304-24. Edited by J.P. Meekison. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1977.
- Careless, J.M.S. "Frontierism, Metropolitanism, and Canadian History." Canadian Historical Review 35 no. 1 (March 1954): 1-21.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "'Limited Identities' in Canada." Canadian Historical Review 50 no. 1 (March 1969): 1-10.
- Clark, S.D. Foreword to The Progressive Party in Canada, by W.L. Morton. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Foreword to The Winnipeg General Strike, by D.C. Masters. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Frontier and Democratic Theory." Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XLVIII Section II (June 1954): 65-75.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Foreword to Sect, Cult, and Church in Alberta, by W.E. Mann. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1955.
- Conway, J.F. "Populism in the United States, Russia, and Canada: Explaining the Roots of Canada's Third Parties." Canadian Journal of Political Science 11 no. 1 (March 1978): 99-124.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Prairie Populist Resistance to the National Policy: Some Reconsiderations." Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 77-91.
- Cook, R. "Canadian Centennial Celebrations." International Journal 22 no. 4 (Autumn 1967): 659-63.

- Cooper, B. "Western Political Consciousness." In Political Thought in Canada: Contemporary Perspectives, pp. 213-38. Edited by S. Brook. Toronto: Irwin Publishing, 1984.
- Courville, L.D. "The Conservatism of the Saskatchewan Progressives." Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1974): 157-81.
- Currie, A.W. "Freight Rates on Grain in Western Canada." Canadian Historical Review 21 no. 1 (March 1940): 40-55.
- Dales, J.H. "Some Historical and Theoretical Comment on Canada's National Policies." Queen's Quarterly 71 no. 3 (Autumn 1964): 297-316.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Protection, Immigration and Canadian Nationalism." In Nationalism in Canada, pp. 164-77. Edited by P. Russell. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Co. of Canada Ltd., 1966.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "'National Policy' Myths, Past and Present." Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 92-94.
- Driedger, L. "Multicultural Regionalism: Toward Understanding the Canadian West." In The Making of the Modern West: Western Canada Since 1945, pp. 167-82. Edited by A.W. Rasporich. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1984.
- Eager, E. "The Conservatism of the Saskatchewan Electorate." In Politics in Saskatchewan, pp. 1-19. Edited by N. Ward and D. Spafford. Toronto: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1968.
- Elkins, D.J. "The Perceived Structure of the Canadian Party Systems." Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 502-24.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Sense of Place." In Small Worlds: Provinces and Parties in Canadian Political Life, pp. 1-30. Edited by D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1980.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Structure of Provincial Party Systems." In Small Worlds: Provinces and Parties in Canadian Political Life, pp. 211-41. Edited by D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1980.
- Elkins, D.J., and Simeon, R. "Province, Nation, Country and Confederation." In Small Worlds: Provinces and Parties in Canadian Political Life, pp. 285-312. Edited by D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1980.

- Elton, D.K. "Contemporary Western Alienation: An Opinion Profile." In The Making of the Modern West: Western Canada Since 1945, pp. 47-54. Edited by A.W. Rasporich. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1984.
- Elton, D.K., and Goddard, A.M. "The Conservative Takeover, 1971-." In Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 49-70. Edited by C. Caldarola. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1979.
- Flanagan T. "Ethnic Voting in Alberta Provincial Elections, 1921-1971." Canadian Ethnic Studies 3 no. 2 (December 1971): 139-64.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Political Geography and the United Farmers of Alberta." In The Twenties in Western Canada, pp. 138-69. Edited by S.M. Trofimenkoff. Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1972.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Stability and Change in Alberta Provincial Elections." Alberta Historical Review 21 no. 4 (Autumn 1973): 1-8.
- Fowke, V.C. "An Introduction to Canadian Agricultural History." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 8 no. 1 (February 1942): 56-68.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Royal Commissions and Canadian Agricultural Policy." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 2 (May 1948): 163-75.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The National Policy-- Old and New." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 18 no. 3 (August 1952): 271-86.
- Friesen, G. "The Western Canadian Identity." Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1973): 13-19.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "'Yours in Revolt': The Socialist Party of Canada and the Western Canadian Labour Movement." Labour 1 (1976): 139-57.
- Gagan, D.P. Introduction to Prairie Perspectives, pp. 1-3. Edited by D.P. Gagan. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970.
- Gibbins, R. "Models of Nationalism: A Case Study of Political Ideologies in the Canadian West." Canadian Journal of Political Science 10 no. 2 (June 1977): 341-73.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Western Alienation and the Alberta Political Culture." In Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 143-67. Edited by C. Caldarola. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1979.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "American Influence on Western Separatism." In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 193-208. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Political Change in the 'New West'." In The Making of the Modern West: Western Canada Since 1945, pp. 37-46. Edited by A.W. Rasporich. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1984.
- Gibbins, R., and Elton, D.K. "Western Alienation and Political Culture." In The Canadian Political Process. 3rd ed., pp. 82-97. Edited by O.M. Kruhlak, R. Schultz, and J.C. Terry. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1979.
- Gilsdorf, R.R. "Western Alienation, Political Alienation, and the Federal System: Subjective Perceptions." In Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 168-89. Edited by C. Caldarola. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1979.
- Harrington, D. "Who Are the Separatists?" In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 23-44. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.
- Hodgetts, J.E. "Regional Interests and Policy in a Federal Structure." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 32 no. 1 (February 1966): 3-14.
- Hoffman, G. "The Saskatchewan Farmer-Labor Party, 1932-1934: How Radical Was It at Its Origins." Saskatchewan History 28 no. 2 (Spring 1975): 52-64.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Entry of the United Farmers of Canada, Saskatchewan Section into Politics: A Reassessment." Saskatchewan History 30 no. 3 (Autumn 1977): 99-109.
- Horowitz, G. "Conservatism, Liberalism, and Socialism in Canada: An Interpretation." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 32 no. 2 (May 1966): 143-71.
- Irving, J.A. "Psychological Aspects of the Social Credit Movement in Alberta." Canadian Journal of Psychology 1 no. 1 (March 1947): 17-27; 1 no. 2 (June 1947): 75-86; 1 no. 3 (September 1947): 127-40.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Evolution of the Social Credit Movement." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 3 (August 1948): 321-41.

- Johnston, R. "Federal and Provincial Voting: Contemporary Patterns and Historical Evolution." In Small Worlds: Provinces and Parties in Canadian Political Life, pp. 131-78. Edited by D.J. Elkins and R. Simeon. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1980.
- Kaye, B., and Moodie, D.W. "Geographical Perspectives on the Canadian Plains." In A Region of the Mind: Interpreting the Western Canadian Plains, pp. 17-46. Edited by R. Allen. Regina: Canadian Plains Studies Center, 1973.
- Lingard, C.C. "Economic Forces Behind the Demand for Provincial Status in the Old North West Territories." Canadian Historical Review 21 no. 3 (September 1940): 254-67.
- Lipset, S.M. "The Rural Community and Political Leadership in Saskatchewan." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 13 no. 3 (August 1947): 410-28.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Political Participation and the Organization of the Cooperative Commonwealth Federation in Saskatchewan." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 2 (May 1948): 191-208.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Democracy in Alberta." In Voting in Canada, pp. 182-85. Edited by J.C. Courtney. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967. Reprint from Canadian Forum 34 (November 1954), 34 (December 1954).
- Lipson, L. "Party Systems in the United Kingdom and the Older Commonwealth: Causes, Resemblances, and Variations." Political Studies 7 no. 1 (1959): 12-31.
- Long, J.A., and Quo, F.Q. "Alberta: One Party Dominance." In Canadian Provincial Politics: The Party Systems of the Ten Provinces, pp. 1-26. Edited by M. Robin. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1972.
- Lower, A.R.M. "Some Neglected Aspects of Canadian History." Canadian Historical Association Report (1929): 65-71.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Origins of Democracy in Canada." Canadian Historical Association Report (1930): 65-70.
- McCormick, P. "Voting Behaviour in Alberta: The Quasi-Party System Revisited." Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 3 (Autumn 1980): 85-97.
- McCutcheon, B. "The Patrons of Industry in Manitoba, 1890-1898." Transactions of the Historical and Scientific Society of Manitoba Series III no. 22 (1965-66): 7-25.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Birth of Agrarianism in the Prairie West." Prairie Forum 1 no. 2 (November 1976): 79-94.
- MacFarlane, R.O. "Manitoba Politics and Parties after Confederation." Canadian Historical Association Report (1940): 45-55.
- McKinsey, L. "Watching the Separatists." In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 209-27. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.
- Mallory, J.R. "Disallowance and the National Interest: The Alberta Social Credit Legislation of 1937." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 14 no. 3 (August 1948): 342-57.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Structure of Canadian Politics." In Party Politics in Canada. 2nd ed., pp. 24-32. Edited by H.G. Thorburn. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967.
- Martin, C. "Political History of Manitoba, 1870-1912." In Canada and Its Provinces: A History of the Canadian People and Their Institutions. Vol. XIX: The Prairie Provinces, pp. 97-143. Edited by A. Shortt and A.G. Doughty. Toronto: University of Edinburgh Press, 1914.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The First 'New Province' of the Dominion." Canadian Historical Review 1 no. 4 (December 1920): 354-78.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Colonial Policy of the Dominion." Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada Series III Vol. XVI Section II (1922): 35-47.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Confederation and the West." Canadian Historical Association Report (1927): 20-28.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Completion of Confederation." Queen's Quarterly 38 (Spring 1931): 197-210.
- Matthews, R. "The Significance and Explanation of Regional Divisions in Canada: Toward a Canadian Sociology." Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 43-61.
- Meisel, J. "The Stalled Omnibus: Canadian Parties in the 1960's." Social Research 30 no. 3 (Autumn 1963): 367-90.
- Merrill, G. "Regionalism and Nationalism." In Canada: A Geographical Interpretation, pp. 556-68. Edited by J. Warkentin. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1968.

Norrie, K.H. "The Rate of Settlement of the Canadian Prairies, 1870-1911." Journal of Economic History 35 no. 2 (June 1975): 410-27.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Some Comments on Prairie Economic Alienation." Canadian Public Policy 2 no. 2 (Spring 1976): 211-44.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The National Policy and Prairie Economic Discrimination, 1870-1930." In Canadian Papers in Rural History. vol. 1., pp. 13-32. Edited by D.H. Akenson. Gananoque: Langdale Press, 1978.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The National Policy and the Rate of Prairie Settlement: A Review." Journal of Canadian Studies 14 no. 3 (Autumn 1979): 63-76.

Norrie, K.H., and Levesque, T.J. "Overwhelming Majorities in the Legislature of Alberta." Canadian Journal of Political Science 12 no. 3 (September 1979): 451-70.

Norrie, K.H. and Percy, M. "The Economics of a Separate West." In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 173-91. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.

Oliver, E.H. "Saskatchewan and Alberta: General History, 1870-1912." In Canada and Its Provinces: A History of the Canadian People and Their Institutions. Vol. XIX: The Prairie Provinces, pp. 147-280. Edited by A. Shortt and A.G. Doughty. Toronto: Edinburgh University Press, 1914.

Owram, D. "Reluctant Hinterland." In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 45-64. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.

Palmer, H., and Palmer, T. "The 1971 Election and the Fall of Social Credit in Alberta." Prairie Forum 1 no. 2 (November 1976): 123-34.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Alberta Experience." Journal of Canadian Studies 17 no. 3 (Autumn 1982): 20-34.

Peterson, T. "Ethnic and Class Politics in Manitoba." In Canadian Provincial Politics: The Party Systems of the Ten Provinces, pp. 69-115. Edited by M. Robin. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1972.

Phillips, P. "The National Policy and the Development of the Western Canadian Labour Movement." In Prairie Perspectives 2, pp. 41-62. Edited by A.W. Rasporich and H.C. Klassen. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1973.

- Pinard, M. "One-Party Dominance and Third Parties." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 33 no. 3 (August 1967): 358-73.
- Poetschke, D.M., and McKown, R.E. "Perception of Class in Alberta." In Society and Politics in Alberta, pp. 193-204. Edited by C. Caldarola. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1979.
- Rea, J.E. "The Roots of Prairie Society." In Prairie Perspectives, pp. 46-55. Edited by D.P. Gagan. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Politics of Conscience: Winnipeg after the Strike." Canadian Historical Association Historical Papers (1971): 276-88.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Images of the West." In Western Perspectives I, pp. 4-9. Edited by D.J. Bercuson. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1974.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Politics of Class: Winnipeg City Council, 1919-1945." In The West and the Nation: Essays in Honour of W.L. Morton, pp. 232-49. Edited by C. Berger and R. Cook. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Ltd., 1976.
- Regehr, T.D. "Historiography of the Canadian Plains after 1870." In A Region of the Mind: Interpreting the Western Canadian Plains, pp. 87-101. Edited by R. Allen. Regina: Canadian Plains Studies Center, 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Western Canada and the Burden of National Transportation Policies." In Canada and the Burden of Unity, pp. 115-41. Edited by D.J. Bercuson. Toronto: The MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Bankers and Farmers in Western Canada, 1900-1939." In The Developing West: Essays on Canadian History in Honour of Lewis H. Thomas, pp. 303-36. Edited by J.E. Foster. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1983.
- Reid, E. "The Saskatchewan Liberal Machine Before 1929." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 2 no. 1 (February 1936): 27-40.
- Richards, J. "Populism and the West." In Western Separatism: The Myths, Realities and Dangers, pp. 65-83. Edited by L. Pratt and G. Stevenson. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1981.
- Richards, J.H. "The Prairie Region." In Canada: A Geographical Interpretation, pp. 396-437. Edited by J. Warkentin. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1968.



- Rutherford, P.F.W. "The Western Press and Regionalism, 1870-96." Canadian Historical Review 52 no. 3 (September 1971): 287-305.
- Sage, W.N. "Some Aspects of the Frontier in Canadian History." Canadian Historical Association Report (1928): 62-72.
- Scarrow, H.A. "Federal-Provincial Voting Patterns in Canada." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 26 no. 2 (May 1960): 289-98.
- Schwartz, M.A. "Attachments to Province and Region in the Prairie Provinces." In One Prairie Province? A Question for Canada, pp. 101-5. Edited by D.K. Elton. Lethbridge: Lethbridge Herald, 1970.
- Sharp, P. "The American Farmer and the 'Last Best West'." Agricultural History 21 no. 2 (April 1947): 65-75.
- Simeon, R. "Regionalism and Canadian Political Institutions." Queen's Quarterly 82 no. 4 (Winter 1975): 499-511.
- Simeon, R., and Elkins, D.J. "Regional Political Cultures in Canada." Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 397-437.
- Sinclair, P.R. "The Saskatchewan C.C.F.: Ascent to Power and the Decline of Socialism." Canadian Historical Review 54 no. 4 (December 1973): 419-33.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Class Structure and Populist Protest: The Case of Western Canada." Canadian Journal of Sociology 1 (1975): 1-17.
- Smiley, D.V. "One-Partyism and Canadian Democracy." Canadian Forum 38 (July 1958): 79-80.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Two-Party System and One-Party Dominance in the Liberal Democratic State." Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science 24 no. 3 (August 1958): 312-22.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Structural Problem of Canadian Federalism." Canadian Public Administration 14 no. 3 (Fall 1971): 326-43.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Federal-Provincial Conflict in Canada." In Canadian Federalism: Myth or Reality. 3rd ed., pp. 2-18. Edited by J.P. Meekison. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1977.

- Smith, D.E. "A Comparison of Prairie Political Developments in Saskatchewan and Alberta." Journal of Canadian Studies 4 no. 1 (February 1969): 17-26.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Conclusion to Prairie Perspectives, pp. 92-95. Edited by D.P. Gagan. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Liberalism in Saskatchewan: The Evolution of a Provincial Party." In Western Perspectives I, pp. 101-9. Edited by D.J. Bercuson. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1974.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Prairie Provinces." In The Provincial Political Systems: Comparative Essays, pp. 46-61. Edited by D.J. Bellamy, J.H. Pammett, and D.C. Rowat. Toronto: Methuen Publications, 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Western Politics and National Unity." In Canada and the Burden of Unity, pp. 142-68. Edited by D.J. Bercuson. Toronto: MacMillan Co. of Canada Ltd., 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Political Culture in the West." In Eastern and Western Perspectives, pp. 169-82. Edited by D.J. Bercuson and P.A. Buckner. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Grits and Tories on the Prairies." In Party Politics in Canada. 5th ed., pp. 260-77. Edited by H.G. Thorburn. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Inc., 1985.
- Smith D.E., and Courtney, J.C. "Parties in a Politically Competitive Province." In Canadian Provincial Politics: The Party Systems of the Ten Provinces, pp. 290-318. Edited by M. Robin. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1972.
- Smith, Denis. "Prairie Revolt, Federalism and the Party System." In Party Politics in Canada. 2nd ed., pp. 189-200. Edited by H.G. Thorburn. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Ltd., 1967.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Liberals and Conservatives on the Prairies, 1917-1968." In Prairie Perspectives, pp. 30-44. Edited by D.P. Gagan. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970.
- Spafford, D. "The Origin of the Farmers' Union of Canada." Saskatchewan History 18 no. 3 (Autumn 1965): 89-98.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The 'Left Wing', 1921-1931." In Politics in Saskatchewan, pp. 44-58. Edited by N. Ward and D. Spafford. Toronto: Longmans Canada Ltd., 1968.

- Stanley, G.F.G. "Western Canada and the Frontier Thesis." Canadian Historical Association Report (1940): 105-17.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Regionalism in Canadian History." Ontario History 51 no. 3 (Summer 1959): 163-71.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Western Canadian Mystique." In Prairie Perspectives, pp. 6-27. Edited by D.P. Gagan. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston of Canada Ltd., 1970.
- Stevenson, G. "Canadian Regionalism in Continental Perspective." Journal of Canadian Studies 15 no. 2 (Summer 1980): 16-28.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Quasi-Democracy in Alberta." Canadian Forum LXII no. 725 (February 1983): 14-15, 24.
- Swainson, D. "Canada Annexes the West: Colonial Status Confirmed." In Federalism in Canada and Australia: The Early Years, pp. 137-57. Edited by B.W. Hodgins, D. Wright, and W.H. Heick. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1978.
- Thomas, L.G. "The Liberal Party in Alberta, 1905-21." Canadian Historical Review 28 no. 4 (December 1947): 411-27.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Historiography of the Fur Trade Era." Alberta Historical Review 17 no. 1 (Winter 1969): 21-27.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Writing of History in Western Canada." In Eastern and Western Perspectives, pp. 69-83. Edited by D.J. Bercuson and P.A. Buckner. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981.
- Thomas, L.H. "The C.C.F. Victory in Saskatchewan, 1944." Saskatchewan History 34 no. 1 (Winter 1981): 1-16.
- Thorburn, H.G. "The Development of Political Parties in Canada." In Party Politics in Canada, 5th ed., pp. 2-10. Edited by H.G. Thorburn. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall of Canada Inc., 1985.
- Underhill, F.H. "Some Aspects of Upper Canadian Radical Opinion in the Decade Before Confederation." Canadian Historical Association Report (1927): 46-61.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Development of National Political Parties in Canada." Canadian Historical Review 16 no. 4 (December 1935): 367-87.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Canadian Liberal Democracy in 1955." In Press and Party in Canada, pp. 27-46. Edited by F.H. Underhill and G.V. Ferguson. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1955.

- Warner, D.F. "The Farmers' Alliance and the Farmers' Union: An American-Canadian Parallelism." Agricultural History 23 no. 1 (January 1949): 9-19.
- Watson, J.W. "Canada's Geography and Geographies of Canada." The Canadian Cartographer 5 no. 1 (June 1968): 25-36.
- White, G. "One-Party Dominance and Third Parties: The Pinard Theory Reconsidered." Canadian Journal of Political Science 6 no. 3 (September 1973): 399-421.
- Whitehorn, A. "An Analysis of the Historiography of the C.C.F.-N.D.P.: The Protest Movement Becalmed Tradition." In Building the Cooperative Commonwealth: Essays on the Democratic Socialist Tradition in Canada, pp. 1-24. Edited by J.W. Brennan. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, 1984.
- Wilson, J. "The Canadian Political Cultures: Towards a Redefinition of the Nature of the Canadian Political System." Canadian Journal of Political Science 7 no. 3 (September 1974): 438-83.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Decline of the Liberal Party in Manitoba Politics." Journal of Canadian Studies 10 no. 1 (February 1975): 24-41.
- Wiseman, N. "The Pattern of Prairie Politics." Queen's Quarterly 88 no. 2 (Summer 1981): 298-315.
- Wrong, D.H. "The Pattern of Party Voting in Canada." Public Opinion Quarterly 21 no. 2 (Summer 1957): 252-64.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Parties and Voting in Canada: A Backward and Forward Glance in the Light of the Last Election." Political Science Quarterly 73 no. 3 (September 1958): 397-412.
- Zaslow, M. "The Frontier Hypothesis in Recent Historiography." Canadian Historical Review 29 no. 2 (June 1948): 153-67.