

**Modern Day Slavery and the Sex Industry: Raising the Voices of
Survivors and Collaborators While Confronting Sex Trafficking
and Exploitation in Manitoba, Canada**

By

ROBERT W. CHRISMAS

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies of The University of Manitoba in partial
fulfillment of the requirements of the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Faculty of Peace and Conflict Studies University of Manitoba Winnipeg

COPYRIGHT © 2017 BY ROBERT W. CHRISMAS

Abstract

Sexual exploitation and human sex trafficking are a multi-billion-dollar international industry in which many Canadian women and children are trafficked and exploited, hurt and sometimes murdered by predators. Previous studies have often overlooked significant voices including police, political leaders and prosecutors who also work to protect sex industry survivors. This research widens the net and includes interviews with 61 experts across Manitoba, including police, First Nations and other political leaders, government and non-government service providers and sex trafficking survivors, who collectively represent over 1,000 years of experience combatting victimization in the sex industry.

Through a grounded approach, this study gathers the stories and experiences of survivors, relevant practitioners and community leaders in Manitoba, and contributes to theory and practice around reducing sex trafficking and exploitation. The findings include the following: (1) Early risk factors for youth may be identified and addressed to reduce vulnerability to being trafficked and exploited; (2) More flexible ongoing supports can empower sex industry survivors and assist them to escape sex slavery; (3) Greater coordination and collaboration are needed between the broad spectrum of enforcement and support agencies; (4) New resources, such as more and better equipped safe houses and local and regional coordination hubs can provide a safety net for people who are being exploited in the sex industry; (5) Increased counter-exploitation education can potentially improve youth resilience and affect the public discourse around the issue.

Acknowledgements

If I have seen further it is by standing on the shoulders of giants (Isaac Newton, 1676)

I am grateful to the many participants who agreed to take the time to be interviewed for this research. Sexual exploitation and human trafficking are not easy matters to discuss, particularly for survivors and practitioners who are survivors, many of whom have dedicated their lives to helping others to escape exploitation and abuse. I thank these people for opening their hearts and exposing their compelling stories for the greater good of preventing others from being exploited and assisting others to escape the sex industry.

I appreciate the generous guidance given to me by my committee, Dr. Sean Byrne, Dr. Jessica Senehi and Dr. Rick Linden, and my external reviewer, Dr. Laura Huey of University of Western Ontario. In particular, I thank my advisor, Dr. Sean Byrne, who has been a great role model, mentor, teacher and source of inspiration and guidance through this educational journey. My fellow students have also been an endless source of support and encouragement. I miss our lively seminar discussions.

I also acknowledge the administrative support of the University of Manitoba Faculty of Graduate Studies, the University of Manitoba Graduate Students Association, the Winnipeg Police Service and the Manitoba Department of Justice.

Thank you to Ali Millar, Amanda Kerr, Chelsea, Brandi, Crystal and Barb Christmas for your help with the daunting task of transcribing interviews and editing. Also, thank you to Michele Lemonius, Sandra Hodzic, and Maureen Musgrove for your feedback on this thesis.

I also acknowledge the influence that the discipline of Peace and Conflict Studies (PACS) has had on my work. As a police officer, and throughout my doctoral studies, I have come to appreciate PACS for its focus on social justice, human rights and peace building, which is consistent with the focus of my adult life's work, striving to contribute to community safety and reduced victimization. The transdisciplinary nature of the PACS field allows students to draw in their strengths and be their best. The Arthur V. Mauro Center for Peace and Justice trains over 84 PhD and Masters students from about 30 different countries at any time, and many who are from war zones and areas of protracted ethno political conflict. They bring many rich lessons from their diverse origins. Studying in this environment has allowed me to flourish as a student and it inspired this thesis.

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my children, Crystal, Chelsea, Brandi, and Bobby, and to my ever-encouraging and supportive wife, Barb. Thank you for your years of support and encouragement through my graduate studies and now my PhD work. Without the support and encouragement of my family and friends, the years of work that culminates in this thesis and degree would not be possible.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Dedication	iv
Table of Contents	v
Chapter 1 - Introduction	
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Researcher background.....	2
1.3 Statement of purpose.....	7
1.4 Guiding questions and objectives.....	7
1.5 Significance of this research.....	8
1.6 Limitations of the study.....	9
1.7 Chapter overviews.....	10
1.8 Conclusion.....	14
Chapter 2 - The Sex Industry in the Present Day	
2.1 Introduction	16
2.2 Language is important.....	18
2.2.1 <i>Glossary of terms</i>	23
2.2.2 <i>Abbreviations</i>	24
2.3 The global picture.....	25
2.3.1 <i>The National Action Plan</i>	26
2.4 Modern day slavery and the sex industry.....	28
2.5 The sex industry in contemporary Canada.....	32
2.6 Missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls.....	35
2.7 Conclusion.....	37
Chapter 3 - The Literature Review	
3.1 Introduction	38
3.2 Vulnerability and prevention of sexual exploitation.....	39
3.2.1 <i>Early child abuse and later involvement in the sex industry</i>	44

3.2.2 <i>The violent reality of Canadian Indigenous women</i>	47
3.2.3 <i>Gender and violence</i>	49
3.2.4 <i>Intersecting challenges of youth in the sex industry</i>	52
3.3 The sex trafficking market.....	53
3.3.1 <i>Laws affecting sexual exploitation and human trafficking</i>	55
3.4 Peace building theories that can help us work together.....	61
3.4.1 <i>Conflict analysis</i>	63
3.4.2 <i>Getting the right people to the table</i>	65
3.4.3 <i>Changing the outcomes through mediation</i>	69
3.5 Achieving change and overcoming organizational culture.....	71
3.6 Changing outcomes through collaboration and collective impact.....	73
3.6.1 <i>Engaging the public to change the story</i>	77
3.7 Conclusion.....	78
Chapter 4 - Research Methodology	
4.1 Introduction	80
4.2 Qualitative research strategy.....	80
4.2.1 <i>Grounded inductive method</i>	82
4.3 Geographic location of the study.....	83
4.3.1 <i>Demography and gender of the research participants</i>	84
4.3.2 <i>Participant selection</i>	85
4.3.3 <i>Participant payment and costs</i>	86
4.4 Role and position of the researcher.....	87
4.4.1 <i>Stakeholders</i>	91
4.5 Research instruments and gathering techniques.....	91
4.5.1 <i>Ethics approval</i>	92
4.5.2 <i>Informed consent and confidentiality</i>	92
4.5.3 <i>Protection of subjects</i>	93
4.5.4 <i>Challenges encountered</i>	96
4.5.5 <i>Data analysis, validity and reliability</i>	97
4.6 Conclusion.....	99

Chapter 5 - Vulnerability and Prevention of Sexual Industry Exploitation

5.1 Introduction 100

 5.1.1 *Counter-exploitation in Manitoba*..... 101

5.2 No one freely chooses to be a prostitute 109

 5.2.1 *Sex industry slavery*..... 116

 5.2.2 *Grooming for sex slavery*..... 117

5.3 Abuse history as a predictor of sexual exploitation..... 125

 5.3.1 *Love conquers all* 130

5.4 End child poverty: They all end up in CFS 133

5.5 Every child is unique 141

5.6 Poverty and lack of opportunities links with exploitation..... 146

5.7 Prevention of sex trafficking and exploitation..... 158

5.8 Key findings..... 164

5.9 Conclusion..... 172

Chapter 6 – Violence Against Canadian Indigenous Women and Girls

6.1 Introduction..... 176

6.2 Indigenous overrepresentation in the sex industry..... 177

6.3 Urban migration and pipeline of rural people trafficked into the city..... 179

6.4 Are programs and services culturally sensitive? 184

6.5 Key findings..... 196

6.6 Conclusion..... 202

Chapter 7 – Awareness and Education

7.1 Introduction..... 203

7.2 They need to talk about this stuff in schools..... 203

7.3 The johns don’t realize the pain they are causing 208

7.4 Bringing sex trafficking out of the shadows into the light..... 211

7.5 I was working with exploited kids and didn’t know it..... 221

7.6 Key findings..... 227

7.7 Conclusion..... 234

Chapter 8 - The Laws

8.1 Introduction..... 236

8.2 Global trafficking and the relevance of international laws..... 237

8.3 People’s perceptions of Canadian laws..... 239

8.4 Attack the market..... 248

8.5 Helping people who don’t want help..... 251

8.6 Intelligence - we need to ask the right questions..... 258

8.7 Key findings..... 263

8.8 Conclusion..... 270

Chapter 9 - Getting Out is Harder Than it Looks

9.1 Introduction..... 275

9.2 Trauma and hope: I don’t think I wanted to escape 277

 9.2.1 *Exiting takes a critical event*..... 281

 9.2.2 *Heal thyself: The journey from your mind to your heart*..... 286

9.3 Meet survivors where they are at..... 294

 9.3.1 Supporters are important..... 298

9.4 The need for an adaptive system:..... 301

9.5 Key findings..... 305

9.6 Conclusion..... 311

Chapter 10 - Challenges and Opportunities

10.1 Introduction..... 313

10.2 Virtuous circles of collaboration..... 313

10.3 Transience and coordinating a piece-meal system 324

 10.3.1 *Aging out: Less resources for adults*..... 331

 10.3.2 *Knowledge of resources and program availability*..... 334

10.4 It’s a rock and a hard place: There are no shelters..... 339

 10.4.1 *Secure or open youth facilities*..... 346

 10.4.2 *Dream Catcher Village*..... 350

10.5 The growing threat and opportunity of advancing technology..... 353

10.6 Key findings..... 357

10.7 Conclusion..... 363

Chapter 11 - Overall Key Findings and Recommendations

11.1 Introduction..... 365
 11.2 Overall key findings and new knowledg..... 365
 11.3 Recommendations for a multi-track peacebuilding intervention strategy 378
 11.4 Community building and change..... 386
 11.5 Future research..... 387
 11.6 Concluding comment..... 391

References..... 394

Appendices:

Appendix A: Service provider consent form..... 424
 Appendix B: Survivor consent form..... 428
 Appendix C: Service provider interview script..... 432
 Appendix D: Survivor’s interview script..... 434
 Appendix E: Participant referral letter..... 436
 Appendix F: Transcriptionist agreement..... 438
 Appendix G: Ethics Board approval certificate..... 439
 Appendix H: Two Year Missing Persons Plan..... 440
 Appendix I: Briefing note on Harboursing Initiative..... 441
 Appendix J: List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives..... 443

Tables:

Table 1: Missing persons audit table..... 454
 Table 2: Categorical breakdown of participants..... 455
 Table 3: WPS survivor contacts and charges laid..... 456
 Table 4: Boston Gun Project assumptions and realities..... 458
 Table 5: Overall key empirical findings..... 459

Illustrations:

Illustration 1: Photo 1 from MMIW march..... 464
 Illustration 2: Photo 2 from MMIW march..... 464

Chapter 1 – Introduction

1.1 Introduction

Despite having one of the most comprehensive, robust and well-funded provincial counter-exploitation strategies in Canada, women and children in Manitoba are still sexually exploited and oppressed. Manitoba has many experts with deep exposure to the related issues. The subjects of this study collectively represent over 1,000 years of experience, either as survivors of or working with survivors of the sex industry. My research takes advantage of this extensive pool of insights and expertise, to reduce the criminal exploitation and predation of women and children in Canada's sex industry; a scourge that has persisted throughout history and in many countries. I identify trends in sex trafficking and sexual exploitation, and tools that may reduce its prevalence, through an exploratory examination of the situation in Manitoba in 2016/17.

Gathering the stories of survivors and practitioners who work to assist those in the sex industry, I ask how the systems of programs and services are working and if there are ways they could be improved to reduce exploitation. While the focus is on Manitoba, the results are also relevant to other areas of Canada. A local focus was required to make the best sense and meaning from the data because the problem of sexual exploitation differs slightly in every region.

A 21st century perspective includes new understanding about sexual exploitation, power disparity and the affront to human dignity and social justice that characterize it. Boys and men are also sexually exploited; however, most sex industry survivors in Canada are female (Smith, 2014a). Historically, prostitution has been viewed as acceptable entertainment with little consideration in the public discourse about its exploitive nature (Fundación Solidaridad Democrática, 1988). It is now commonly understood that many women and children who are coerced into oppressive relationships in the sex industry, often starting in childhood, find it

extremely difficult to escape due to limited alternative options in life (Farley et al, 2003). This modern narrative is radically different from historical eras wherein prostitution, exploitive disparate relationships, human slavery and torture were less understood or recognized, and were more acceptable in many societies.

There are numerous barriers and challenges for children who are vulnerable to exploitation as well as for survivors striving to leave the sex industry. There are also many opportunities for improvements. This research illustrates that exploited women and children are among our most vulnerable citizens. Those who escape demonstrate extreme resilience, often going on to dedicate themselves to helping others from the oppression that they experienced in the sex industry. My hope is that this research is a catalyst for change, building upon the work that has already been undertaken, and taking advantage of the growing awareness and momentum in the public discourse to compassionately intervene in this growing social problem. Giving voice to the people who have survived and to those who are dedicated to helping survivors taps into the wisdom of their experience, and perhaps will close some of the persisting systemic gaps.

1.2 Researcher background

Well into my fourth decade of service as a law enforcement officer in Manitoba, I am acutely aware of the risks to children and vulnerable people in the community. The latter 28 years of my career, with the Winnipeg Police Service (WPS), has taken a path of working in roles that are concerned with developing strategies to protect the vulnerable. As a constable and later as a patrol sergeant, in the first half of my career, I had several assignments that saw me working as a uniform patrol officer in Winnipeg's North End where a lot of street level prostitution has historically been situated. During those times I developed a passion for protecting young girls

from exploitation, setting up enforcement projects, working the “low track” and patrolling the areas that were notorious for street level prostitution.

Moving into detective work for several years I developed investigative skills and a reputation for tenacity and innovation. For several years in the district detectives I developed general investigative skills, then moving into the Anti-Crime Tactical Unit where, for three years, I worked in team investigating and taking down organized crime groups. During Winnipeg’s Arson crisis in 1999-2000 I volunteered and was selected as a founding member of the Arson Strike Force. This joint task force was made up of personnel from the Winnipeg Police, Winnipeg Fire Paramedic Service and Manitoba Fire Commissioners. We were later recognized nationally for effectively ending an arson crisis in Winnipeg. Here I started to appreciate the value of multi-disciplinary collaborative approaches.

When the first Integrated Child Exploitation Unit (ICE Unit) was established to investigate Internet based child exploitation, I was invited to join within the first year. This unit was made up of police officers from the Brandon Police Service, the WPS and the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP). The ICE Unit was so successful that it became a template for units that were later established across Canada. In that role I learned and practiced innovation and utilizing cutting-edge technology, global collaboration, and innovation in investigating and intervening in Internet based child sexual exploitation. In that role I developed a passion for thwarting sexual exploitation and human trafficking.

In a later assignment as a team leader in the Child Abuse Unit I supervised a specialized detective team investigating child abuse, child exploitation, Internet luring, child homicide, child death and historical sexual assaults. Here I learned the nuances of vulnerable person victimization and investigations, as well as human vulnerability and how predators can take

advantage of human frailty and trust. From that role I trained in behavioral science and profiling, and tactical intelligence use through self-directed study and mentorship, online courses, and several training programs at the Canadian Police College in Ottawa. I became a resource for intelligence, major case management, and intelligence use for units investigating crimes against the vulnerable, including Sex Crimes, Child Abuse, High Risk Offenders, Vulnerable Persons, Domestic Violence Coordination, Child Exploitation, and others. While in this role, 18 years into my policing career, I returned to University to complete my Master of Public Administration Degree through the joint program at the University of Winnipeg and University of Manitoba.

Drawing on the awareness from my previous experience, and new skills I was developing through my graduate studies—such as environmental scanning—policy and budget analysis—program evaluation and understanding government and bureaucracy better, I began to see more risks and opportunities for the Police Service. For one thing, the serial murders in British Columbia, around the Pickton pig farm were unfolding. Cool (2004) later wrote about the disappearance of 63 women from Vancouver from the 1990s until approximately 2004. Many of these women were murdered. It took over 10 years for the police to begin a formal investigation, ultimately leading to the arrest of Robert Pickton in connection with the murder of 22 women (Cool, 2004). Meanwhile, the Edmonton Police Service was investigating the slaying of nine sex industry workers over a period of seven years. They announced in June 2004 that a serial killer might be preying on sex workers there as well.

Justice Wally Oppal was commissioner of the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry into the serial killing of prostitutes by Robert Pickton in British Columbia (Oppal, 2012). He found there was likely close to 150 women murdered around the time Pickton was operating, and Pickton may have been involved in many more than he was prosecuted for. Oppal found that

Pickton could have been stopped earlier if information had been better shared between police agencies in adjacent communities. I recognized these dynamics early on, and identified the issue in the WPS where we had only a small staff assigned to missing person cases and we had over 100 “cold cases” that were unsolved long term missing persons, many of whom might very well have met with foul play.

As an analyst, I started looking at the issues and ultimately took charge of the Missing Persons Unit, successfully defending business cases to increase the operation from three civilian staff to include up to eight full time detectives. Working with partners in the Provincial Child Protection Branch (CPB) and other government and non-government organizations (NGOs), we started partnering the police with social workers to implement strategies to intervene with high risk youth and prevent them from becoming the next “missing and murdered.” I received calls from senior social workers who said that, while it is difficult to measure, we were saving lives through this collaborative approach. This further inspired my passion for collaboration and multi-disciplinary approaches to social problems. Manitoba became a leader in Canada in the area of counter-exploitation; these efforts will be explained more fully later in the thesis. They are mentioned here only to highlight my background experience in counter exploitation, and my professional and social position with respect to researching the topic.

In 2012 I was working as a Duty Officer, overseeing frontline police operations for the WPS, when Devon Clunis took office as Chief of Police, with a platform of “crime prevention through social development.” I had published one journal article (Christmas, 2012) and had my first book in press at McGill-Queens University Press (Christmas, 2013) focusing largely on crime prevention, community trust-building, and collaborative, multi-disciplinary approaches to community safety. Chief Clunis assigned me to work full-time on community engagement. For

the next several years I participated in numerous community partnership activities, often looking for opportunities to engage Police resources in collaborative crime prevention and public safety initiatives.

When it came time in 2015 to select a thesis topic, choosing sexual exploitation and sex trafficking came naturally due to my earlier experience working in that area, coupled with my ongoing experience in multi-disciplinary collaboration. I am inclined to hypothesize, based on my personal experiences, that most systems and processes can be improved through finding efficiencies and in having agencies collaborate to reduce service gaps and duplication. However, I chose a grounded approach for this research rather than testing existing theories on collaboration as I wanted to go into this with an open mind. My thought process in this decision was simple. I want to hear from survivors and experts in the field what their perceptions and experiences are on the issues.

My position as a serving police officer was an advantage because it gave me easier access to police officers, prosecutors, some government and non-government employees and some survivors. Executives in the WPS, the RCMP, Manitoba Justice and Social Services all expressed support for the research. I advised these senior officials, particularly within the Police Service where I was employed, that the results of this research will hold more weight because it is done within the rigours of University sanctioned research for a graduate degree, and that this required me to work ethically and independently as a researcher. They agreed and understood, and no official throughout this entire research process attempted to influence me or my findings in any way. Most were encouraging and supportive, stating they are eager for the results.

1.3 Statement of purpose

The main goals of this research are to empirically analyze the experiences and perceptions of survivors and practitioners in Manitoba, and contribute to theory and practice with respect to sex trafficking and sexual exploitation. Another goal of this research is to provide the opportunity for survivors and practitioners at all levels to have a voice and contribute to the solutions by outlining their ideas about how to tackle this growing problem.

1.4 Guiding questions and objectives

The main question behind this research is what can we learn from those working around sexual exploitation, and from those most affected by it? Some broad questions were asked of several distinct stakeholder groups with more specific questions that were more relevant to each of the two broad categories of participants, namely survivors and practitioners. The subject groups included: (1) survivors who have been sexually exploited or trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation, (2) workers from government agencies that are mandated with public safety including police, prosecutors and social workers, health care system workers and politicians, and (3) people involved with NGOs working with issues around exploitation and human trafficking in the sex industry. The questions used, as suggested by Cederborg and Lamb (2008), were open-ended, so as to allow respondents to provide subjective observations and impressions about the issues.

Questions asked of survivors were similar to those posed to practitioners; however, the wording was changed slightly. For instance, practitioners were asked in the first question to describe their work around the sex industry where survivors were asked to describe their experiences in the sex industry. The informed consent forms used for the semi-structured

interviews are attached as Appendix A (service provider consent) and B (survivor consent), and the scripts with the questions used are attached as Appendix C (service provider interview script), and Appendix D (survivor interview script).

The questions elicited answers to the following broad issues: (1) What makes people vulnerable to being exploited and is there something we could do to reduce this phenomenon and prevent exploitation, (2) What could assist people to exit the sex industry, (3) What strategies have been effective and what should be done going forward, (4) What barriers and opportunities exist within and between organizations to improve service and collaboration, and (5) What effect do laws have and what should the police be doing? To assist people thinking “outside the box,” participants were asked, what is the best thing that could happen in Canada around the sex industry (see Appendix C & D)?

1.5 Significance of this research

Sexual exploitation of youth in Canada is worsening, according to many respondents in this study, and requires urgent attention. In speaking with police, child welfare and health officials in preliminary preparation for this study, I found a consistent and loud call for action. Dedicated professionals in many service sectors reported the lack of resources and frustration with the fragmented isolation of agencies that could be cooperating better on these serious social problems. The evidence that opportunities exist to improve systemic approaches is the fact that children and youth are still being victimized, and even murdered (Paperney, 2009; Dehn, 2009). This study identifies and seeks to close some of these critical gaps.

Practitioners working in core service agencies including police, justice, child welfare, education and health tend, out of necessity, to view social problems such as trafficking and

exploitation as part of one agency's mandate or another, rather than as everyone's collective responsibility. The fundamental challenge, it seems, is to move the locus of responsibility for these serious issues into the center to be shared by all stakeholders. While previous research has explored this issue, many of my respondents said that new investigation is needed, and many thanked me for taking it on.

The significance of this research is that it will improve or even save the lives of some youth who are vulnerable to exploitation, and assist others in escaping the sex industry, through the practical recommendations that it makes. At the least, it will give voice to some who have not been heard and will raise awareness around a serious social problem. It will also contribute to the PACS discipline by highlighting how PACS multi-disciplinary, multi-modal and multi-level interventions can be utilized to address such social problems or issues (Byrne & Keashly, 2000).

1.6 Limitations of the study

Participants were asked about their perceptions of the effectiveness of existing systems, resources and service providers. These views are limited and differ according to the experience, education, personal attributes and professional orientation of the participants. Care was taken to consider and include participants with deep experience, either having participated in the sex industry or having worked with survivors of the sex industry. Interviews continued until saturation of the themes was achieved. About 40 interviews were anticipated. In the end, 61 were completed until no substantially new ideas were coming forward. The salience of the themes became clearer in my mind as the study progressed. For example, most participants mentioned the need for more resources, greater collaboration between agencies and more education and awareness regarding sexual exploitation.

Taking a grounded theory approach reduced researcher bias as themes emerged inductively from the data. By completing all the interviews myself, I was able to compare and contrast the opinions, observations and stories that the participants offered me. I believe that the findings of this study provide insights that are nuanced and informative. Another limitation is in the dynamic nature of the problem being studied. This study represents observations of a specific time period and region, and would likely not be exactly duplicated in another time and place.

1.7 Chapter overviews

This research explores the complex topic of the sex industry, sexual exploitation and human sex trafficking in Manitoba, Canada. The framework attempts to follow a logical flow with the introductory chapter outlining the scope and focus through sections on researcher positionality, statement of purpose, guiding questions and objectives, significance, and limitations of the study. Chapters 2, 3 and 4 outline the context, a review of the relevant literature and methodology utilized in the study. Chapters 5 to 9 feature the themes that emerged from the interview data, and Chapter 10 focuses on specific challenges and opportunities that were identified. Chapter 11 summarizes the findings as well as key recommendations and topics for future research.

Chapter 2 - The Sex Industry in the Present Day

Language around this issue is important and is constantly changing. In this chapter, terms such as sexual exploitation, sex trafficking, and prostitution are discussed. The international, national, and provincial Manitoba contexts are reviewed and the growing social movement in Canada around Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls is detailed. Modern-day slavery is also discussed in relation to the nature of sexual exploitation along with the phenomenon of denial of this issue in modern society.

Chapter 3 - The Literature Review

This chapter reviews previous research and theory around structural and direct violence related to sex trafficking and exploitation, correlations between childhood abuse and later sexual exploitation, Indigenous marginalization, gender violence and intersectionality. Approaches to reducing sexual exploitation, what has worked and what has failed are explored. Then, a section on peace building theories highlights the evolution of the PACS field and how peace building and conflict resolution theories and practices are relevant in this thesis. Several segments focus on organizational culture and change, interagency collaboration and collective impact approaches and how public discourse and engagement might affect efforts around the sex industry.

Chapter 4 - Research Methodology

This chapter describes the research design, including why a qualitative research strategy and a grounded, inductive analysis approach were employed. Sections on ethics outline the rigour and standards applied as well as ethical issues and challenges that arose during the field research. Sections are also dedicated to the research instruments utilized, participant selection and analysis of the data.

Chapter 5 - Vulnerability and Prevention of Sexual Industry Exploitation

This is the first of five empirical chapters that focus on the themes that emerged from the interviews. The first section addresses the current Manitoba context and how counter-exploitation work has evolved there. The next section explores voluntariness, as many of the participants highlighted that most women and children do not freely choose to sell sex as a profession; rather, they are almost universally manipulated and coerced into it by men who are in positions of power over them. My respondents characterized the sex industry as modern day

slavery. Many people involved in the sex industry were abused as children. I explored abuse history as a predictor of later exploitation. Then a segment examines foster and group home placements and their correlation with young people's vulnerability to exploitation. Poverty and lack of opportunities was another substantial theme that emerged as a correlate leading to a lack of resilience and vulnerability to being sexually exploited by predators.

Chapter 6 - Violence Against Canadian Indigenous Women and Girls

In the initial context chapter I highlighted regional differences and how exploitation differs with changing social issues and demographics. Manitoba's sex industry is characterized by over-representation of First Nations and Metis women. This chapter describes some of the history and the lasting transgenerational impacts of colonization affecting Indigenous people's current day vulnerability to sexual exploitation. I describe my findings with respect to rural First Nations people migrating into urban centers and their susceptibility to being victimized in the sex industry. The final section in this chapter outlines this study's findings with respect to culturally appropriate awareness and programming.

Chapter 7 - Awareness and Education

This chapter describes findings of my respondents' emphatic suggestions on the need for more public education and awareness in Canada around sexual exploitation and sex trafficking. The chapter is separated into sections on educating youth as well as the purchasers of sex as to the physical and psychological damage John activities cause to youth, and to raising awareness among the general public about the whole sphere of the sex industry and all its manifestations. A final section describes how my respondents are calling for specialized training for practitioners across the broad spectrum of the relevant service agencies.

Chapter 8 - The Laws

This chapter explores the history and evolution of the laws around sexual exploitation and sex trafficking. It includes sections on international treaties and laws, Canadian history and the contemporary Canadian context as well as recent Supreme Court decisions that forced the Canadian justice system and the law enforcement establishment to devise new approaches going forward. My respondents stressed the need for the justice system to prosecute and deter sex purchasers more aggressively. I then explore whether incarceration is a deterrent and how the law may most effectively be utilized to deter sex purchasers. As my research brings the police voice to the forefront of the discourse, the final section in this chapter outlines findings around what affect the laws have on the sex industry and what the police should be doing.

Chapter 9 - Getting Out Is Harder Than It Looks

My participant's highlighted factors that keep survivors from escaping the sex industry. Most indicate that it takes numerous attempts and relapses to finally get out, and these are often tied to multi-layered and complex problems such as severe substance abuse, trauma and challenges navigating bureaucratic processes that are inaccessible for various reasons including limited hours of operation. Many survivors never fully escape from the sex industry or do not have the will to finally escape until they have a purpose, such as a child to look after a major life crisis like seeing a friend die. Another section examines the high incidence of survivors who have left the sex industry and then devote their lives to helping others in similar need. In the final section I describe the importance of system flexibility to meet people's varied needs.

Chapter 10 - Challenges and Opportunities

This chapter examines some of the challenges and opportunities that my interviewees identified and provides some background to the recommendations in the final chapter. Sections on

collaboration, and coordination highlight the importance of agencies working together. Some participants identified the problem of “aging out” of the child welfare system, whereby youth are suddenly cut off from certain supports and resources on the day they turn 18 years of age.

Another section highlights the fact that survivors and practitioners alike are often not aware of the resources that exist and thus are unable to optimally assist themselves or others.

Many of my respondents identified the need to provide more safe refuges to help survivors to escape the street and/or transition out of the sex industry. The section on safe houses highlights this need. Technological challenges and opportunities are highlighted as much of the sex industry is moving into the Internet and becoming less visible to investigators. We, as a society, need to keep up with changing technologies and the new strategies that traffickers utilize. Finally, the section on trust building outlines how a large proportion of exploited people historically do not trust social workers, police or other supporters fearing that they will be charged with crimes. Relationship and trust building must be a priority for supporters and practitioners of exploited young women.

Chapter 11 – Overall Key Findings and Recommendations

This chapter provides a summary of the key findings with a section also dedicated to recommendations for a collaborative intervention strategy to address the issue. Finally, potential future research possibilities are identified.

1.8 Conclusion

While attending a forum once on sex trafficking and sexual exploitation, I spoke with a knowledgeable professor about the potential of this research endeavor. She advised me that I should take advantage of my police position and resulting access to police officers, and from that

focus alone the research would be feasible. I then realized that the police, prosecutors, political and community leaders were often largely overlooked in previous research on this topic. I decided to develop this study with those deficiencies in mind, and to seek a fuller picture of how the system could be improved by talking with survivors and the whole spectrum of stakeholders in one region. Manitoba was a suitable place to study this phenomenon as sexual exploitation issues there are as challenging as any place in Canada. This research project sought to identify challenges and opportunities that might be addressed by the community of stakeholders that work to reduce sexual exploitation and trafficking and assist those who are trying to escape it.

Chapter 2 - The Sex Industry in the Present Day

2.1 Introduction

Significant efforts have been made worldwide to curb sexual exploitation and human trafficking. However, according to the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2014* (UNODC, 2014), and others, the problem in many, if not most regions of the world is evolving and getting worse (UNODC, 2014; Nelson, 2014; Canadian Women's Foundation [CWF], 2014). Social media platforms are now globalizing and collapsing the universe almost to the point that conventional paradigms of space and time are becoming obsolete. People are now so closely connected through social media that groups with a common purpose, such as organized crime and the police have the capacity to potentially communicate worldwide in real time.

People selling items, or themselves, now have social media platforms to advertise themselves discretely and more broadly than could ever have been imagined decades ago. To understand the importance of further research and better methods exploring globalization, one only needs to pick up almost any morning paper. The threat of international terrorism and globally organized crime is looming, imminent and constantly changing. Through the mail accounts I utilize personally, I receive fraudulent requests daily from all corners of the globe, and I know from my policing experience that these organized groups are difficult to investigate. Human exploitation is also facilitated through the Internet and this growing platform demands further research and attention by intervention and prevention strategists (CWF, 2014; Richardson, 2015; CISC, 2008).

Threats related to social disparity and victimization of marginalized people, including sexual exploitation and human trafficking, are also dominating much of the public discourse. In

Manitoba, for instance, there is a growing sense of the urgency and need for answers and effective strategies. The discourse around missing and murdered Indigenous women and children (Welch, 2014), with over 10,000 children in the care of Manitoba's child protection agencies (Puxley, 2014), and children who are continuing to be exploited and hurt is compelling change. It is imperative that government and non-government service agencies find more effective ways to respond (Smith, 2014 a,b,c). These issues has been at the top of the agenda for most police agencies, as well as leaders in the broad spectrum of partnering agencies for over two decades. For example, at the December 5, 2014 meeting of the Winnipeg Police Board (the civilian oversight board of the WPS), then Police Chief Devon Clunis was directed to make the protection of Indigenous women and girls a priority for the city's police service (Friesen, 2014).

Many people are working diligently within their respective communities as well as government and non-government organizations (NGOs) to curb child victimization, yet the tragic murder of 15-year-old Tina Fontaine, who was in the care of child protective services, a chronic runaway who was known to have been sexually exploited, serves as a stark reminder that there is much more work to be done (CBC, 2014a). Tina Fontaine's murder was no anomaly. The circumstances are strikingly similar to several previous Manitoba homicide cases including 17-year old Cherisse Houle and 18-year-old Hillary Angel Wilson, who were murdered and left in different locations outside Winnipeg's city limits in the summer of 2009 (Paperny, 2009).

What is even more disturbing than young people being murdered while a vast array of service agencies and dedicated people watch, almost helplessly, is the common knowledge that the clear majority of victims are not ultimately murdered. Many are exploited, abused, beaten, neglected, and suffer in silence amid a sea of fragmented resources and programs that may or may not ever touch or empower them in their troubled lives. Some elements in the system work

well together while others work in isolation, and some work against each other, sometimes due to opposing outlooks on how issues should be addressed, and sometimes due to competition over limited funding dollars. This thesis identifies areas where we could improve, for instance by making existing assets work better together and by adding resources where there are gaps.

2.2 Language is important

The definition of terms such as ‘sexual exploitation’, ‘human trafficking’, and ‘prostitution’ differ between people in terms of common usage and application. Also, it was important at the outset of this research to determine how people who are exploited in the sex industry should be referred to, in order to best respect their dignity and most accurately depict the phenomenon being examined. An insightful source of expertise for defining these terms is the group of participants I interviewed in this research, as they are in the field and are sensitive to the evolving discourse around the way that language is used. Therefore, their perspectives are considered in defining terms used in this thesis.

Important distinctions must be understood, for example, between sexual child abuse, sexual exploitation, prostitution, and human trafficking. Sexual abuse and rape involve violence and are generally done against a person’s will, whereas sexual exploitation and trafficking also include elements of manipulation that often cause exploited persons to feel complicit in their own victimization (Richardson, 2015). This complicity and psychological manipulation has implications for the effectiveness of prevention, intervention and support for victims (ibid.).

Cook and Courchene (2006) highlight that a ‘prostitute’ is someone who sells her/his body as a sexual service in exchange for money or drugs. Sexual exploitation, on the other hand, involves the act of coercing, luring, or engaging a child (under the age of 18), into a sexual act,

and involvement in the sex industry or pornography, with or without the child's consent, in exchange for money, drugs, shelter, food, protection, or other necessities (Cook & Courchene, 2006). This thesis extends the definition of exploitation further, defining any persons, including adults, who are manipulated, coerced, or otherwise conscripted into the sex industry as exploited.

My rationale is simple. I take the position that a person does not change on the day s/he turns 18. Age of consent is a legal construct that does not always reflect a person's social reality. A 20-year-old person with mental health issues may be operating as a 12-year-old; as such they could be manipulated and exploited by unscrupulous predators.

Rose, a senior Crown Attorney with Manitoba Public Prosecutions, succinctly summed up the basic definitions in the following manner;

ROSE: Prostitution is a form of exploitation. It is any payment for any kind of sexual act. Sexual exploitation is very broad and covers any form of sexual abuse including prostitution. Trafficking is a specific form of prostitution, involving controlling someone.

The term human trafficking is defined differently in different contexts. For example, O'Brien, Hayes and Carpenter (2013), and Lee (2011) provide in-depth discussions on the nuances of the term, the differences between trafficking and human smuggling, and the value-laden debate over whether women can willingly consent to be exploited. Human smuggling differs from trafficking in that smuggling involves people willingly seeking and gaining assistance to cross national borders, often with the hope of gaining meaningful employment and a better life (Schauer & Wheaton, 2006). Trafficking differs from smuggling in that it is characterized by "deception, fraud, coercion, force or exploitation" of persons by traffickers (Kluber, 2003). Often people engage in the smuggling process, thinking they are going to a job opportunity and a better life, only to wind up being trafficked by predators.

For the purposes of this thesis, the terms are to be understood in the simplest forms.

Trafficking is any circumstance wherein a person is socially isolated, manipulated, or forced into acts of selling sex, whether s/he is forcibly moved from one place to another or not. For the purposes of this thesis, the terms ‘sexual exploitation’ and ‘human trafficking’ are used in the general sense of human beings exploited sexually through forced labour for others’ gain, by people who are in positions of greater power than those who are exploited. In this way, sex trafficking and exploitation results in oppression and social injustice for sex industry survivors.

An ongoing debate exists over the legitimacy of the ‘sex trade’ as a freely chosen profession rather than as the victimization and exploitation of vulnerable young women (Meyers, 2014). The term ‘sex trade’ is used by some to indicate their view that selling sex is a legitimate occupation that is freely chosen by some. Others argue that no one freely chooses it, but rather they are forced into it.

Wendy Sheirich recently retired after serving as the coordinator of Manitoba’s counter (sexual) exploitation program for 10 years. In my interview with her, she defined what the terms sexual exploitation, prostitution, and trafficking mean to her.

WENDY SHEIRICH: In Manitoba, we tend to refer to the issue of “sexual exploitation” across the board because we’ve gotten used to doing that.

In other jurisdictions across Canada, they don’t use “sexual exploitation.” They say “trafficking.”

So, we’ve had people come to Manitoba—some stake holders—and tell us about “trafficking” in Manitoba, and initially we don’t know what they’re asking because we’re used to referring to it as “sexual exploitation.”

But there is more awareness now about “trafficking.” It is sort of the up and coming more politically correct term, and everybody is getting on the trafficking band wagon these days.

The terms trafficking, and sexual exploitation are used differently across Canada, as Sheirich points out. Therefore, throughout the thesis I most often refer to the two together, as sex trafficking and sexual exploitation. In essence they are similar and largely interchangeable.

The term “sex trade” is deliberately avoided in this thesis as it infers a willingness on the

part of women and children participating in selling sex. Diane Redsky is the Executive Director of *Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre* in Winnipeg, and also coordinated a research project entitled, “Stories and Strategies to End Sex Trafficking in Canada.” That project was funded with \$2 million dollars from the Canadian Women’s Foundation (CWF, 2014). It was an 18-month task force that ran from January 2013 to May 2014, interviewing experts from across Canada and resulting in 34 recommendations on how to end sex trafficking in Canada. When I interviewed Ms. Redsky for this research, she advised me that she and her team struggled with the terminology related to what has historically been commonly termed the “sex trade” as the term “trade” wrongly infers that it is a legitimate occupation that one may choose as a profession. She describes the debate as follows.

DIANE REDSKY: The first thing that stands out when I look at these [interview] questions is one of the key learnings we figured out with the National Task Force. One of the things we felt was important as we did our work was common definitions and common phrases to describe exactly what we’re taking about because it was very different across the country. And it’s even very different in Manitoba here. So, we concluded on some key words.

One of them is to describe the sex industry as a “sex industry.” So, you won’t hear me say “sex trade” or “sex work” because we decided that the best way is to—because it is an industry. There are so many people who profit from the sexual exploitation of women, and [“sex industry”] just describes it all.

“Sex trade” and “sex work” kind of personalizes it, individualizes it into a consenting woman and a consenting man when it’s not as simple as that when you actually un-peel what the sex industry really looks like. So, I struggle when I see words like “sex trade.” But I can get through this.

The other thing is that we also don’t call them “sex trade workers” or “sex workers.” We call them “sexually exploited women.” And that’s another language shift that we felt was important because then it really was describing the victimization of it all. And that was really important to us.

Ms. Redsky advised me that after much debate, she and her team settled on the term “sex industry” as it better captures the true nature of the issue, as an organized crime “industry” that exploits people, rather than as a legitimate occupation that people might freely choose. This

resonates with the insight of several participants I interviewed for this research; therefore, the term “sex industry” is used throughout this thesis to denote the social phenomenon of selling sex.

The existing academic literature has also documented the shift in language referencing the sex industry. For example, Cook and Courchene (2006) have analyzed prostitution in Canada, with a focus on Manitoba. They argued that the terms “child prostitute” and “juvenile prostitute” are now outdated, stressing that the new way of looking at prostitution views involved youth as victims, rather than as criminals or business people, as the term ‘prostitute’ implies. There is now a general agreement among professionals working in the justice and social work professions that youth involved in the sex industry are sexually exploited and preyed upon as opposed to being willing actors who are simply making a business decision to be a prostitute.

Another term that is important to define at the outset is how we refer to people who are engaged in the sex industry, being trafficked and exploited, and those who have left or escaped the sex industry. The term used is crucial as the wrong one could offend and re-victimize women. The term also stands to infer the essence of this thesis, answering the question of whether people engage in the sex industry willingly or are generally manipulated and coerced into it. Here again I defer to Diane Redsky and others including Jennifer Richardson, the coordinator of Ontario’s counter exploitation strategy, who have wrestled with these definitions and are unquestionably sensitive to the impact that they can have on exploited people, funders and officials, practitioners working in this area, and the general public discourse.

Diane Redsky advised me that she and her team refer to exploited and trafficked people as ‘survivors.’ This made sense to me at the outset and then in the light of my completed interviews it was the only term that seemed to fit the people we are talking about. Ms. Redsky points out that the term ‘victim’ is very disrespectful as it takes away from the person’s agency and sense of

self-determination. The term ‘experiential’ has been used in social work circles, but comes across as somewhat vague in meaning. In this study the terms exploited, and trafficked are used to refer to people who are actively participating in the sex industry or have left it as survivors, as this term seems to best describe them in the context of the thesis. In reading a completed draft of the thesis, one of my advisors asked the question if it is appropriate to refer to someone as a ‘survivor’ if the person is still engaged in the sex industry and has not yet survived the ordeal. I posed this question to Diane Redsky and she responded with the following observation.

DIANE REDSKY: Experiential women/survivors will always refer to themselves as “survivors” if they are in it or not. Referring to them as victims is very disrespectful.

That being said, there is no consensus in the experiential person's committee (a group of over 100 sex industry survivors) on this.

“Women with lived experience” is the best way to describe them and I only use “victim” when I am talking about law enforcement/justice system where they qualify for benefits.

My intention is for this thesis to respect people who have endured the sex industry and provide recommendations that may help them. Therefore, I have chosen to use the term they prefer; they are referred to as ‘survivors’ whether they have or are currently engaged in the sex industry or have escaped active participation in it. For the purposes of this thesis, some commonly used terms are defined as follows.

2.2.1 Glossary of terms

Prostitution: This term is avoided as it infers a legitimate freely chosen professional vocation, however some interview participants and the academic literature do refer to it; it is generally the act of selling sex for remuneration, usually for money.

Sex Trade: This term is avoided as it infers a legitimate freely chosen professional vocation or ‘trade’, however some interview participants and the academic literature do refer to it; generally, the term sex industry is used where the term sex trade often has been used in the past.

Sexual exploitation: Any case wherein another, for any other reason other than love and human intimacy, where there is not complete free will and choice, obtains sex from a person.

Trafficking: Trafficking or sex trafficking is meant to describe any situation wherein one person is controlled or manipulated by another for the purposes of using them for sexual services.

Sex industry: This term is preferred as it infers an organized market driven business wherein people are exploited for sex.

Survivor: A person who has been or is actively engaged in selling her/his body in the sex industry for someone's gain.

2.2.2 Abbreviations

Some terms that are used throughout the thesis are reduced to the following abbreviations.

AFM	Addictions Foundation of Manitoba
AMC	Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs
CBC	Canadian Broadcast Corporation
CCCP	Canadian Child Protection Centre
CFS	Child and Family Services
CISC	Criminal Intelligence Service of Canada
CPB	Crime Prevention Branch
CSU	Crisis Stabilization Unit
CWF	Canadian Women's Foundation
EDVIP	Emergency Department Violence Intervention Program
EIA	Employment Income Assistance
EPPS	Exploited Persons Proactive Strategy
HRV	High Risk Victim
INTERPOL	Police organization supporting 190 member countries
NGO	Non-Government Organization
MYS	Macdonald Youth Services
MMIWG	Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls
NWAC	Native Women's Association of Canada
POP	Prostitution Offender Program
PTSD	Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder
RCMP	Royal Canadian Mounted Police
SEU	Sexual Exploitation Unit
TERF	Transition Education and Resources for Females
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Scientific, and Cultural Organization
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
ViCLAS	Violent Crime Linkage Analysis System

WPS	Winnipeg Police Service
WRHA	Winnipeg Regional Health Authority
YASU	Youth Addictions Stabilization Unit

2.3 The global picture

The United Nations *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons* (2014), describes how sexual exploitation and trafficking affects people in, “virtually every country in every region of the world” (UNODC, 2014). The same report highlights that while increasing numbers of people are being trafficked for forced labour, sexual exploitation remains the primary reason (ibid.).

Worldwide profits from sexual exploitation are estimated at over \$99 billion (USD) per year (Nelson, 2014, UNODC, 2014).

Significant efforts have been made globally to curb the incidence of sexual exploitation and human trafficking. However, according to the United Nations and others, the problem in many, if not most, regions of the world is evolving and getting worse (UNODC, 2014; Nelson, 2014; CWF, 2014). Buttigieg (2014) points out that The Palermo Convention brought together 147 member states to acknowledge the seriousness of sexual exploitation and human trafficking and the need to collaborate at the international level to eradicate it (also see UNODC, 2008). Yet, the global nature of trafficking and people’s increasing mobility makes it a difficult and complex crime to investigate (Buttigieg, 2014). Buttigieg (2014) wrote about the challenges that numerous countries have in devising strategies to identify, legislate against, prosecute or prevent human trafficking.

Cullen-DuPont (2009) described sex trafficking as so widespread that it affects some national economies, for example, accounting for up to 14 percent of South-East Asia’s gross national product (ibid.). The sex industry is a massive and growing international enterprise

(Wheaton, Schauer & Galli, 2010; Schauer & Wheaton, 2006; Mizus et al., 2003). Cullen-DuPont (2009) found that approximately 800,000 people are taken across national borders each year for trafficking in the sex industry, and of those 80 percent are female and 50 percent are children. In addition, Mizus et al. (2003) estimated that of the 18,000 persons trafficked into the United States each year, 96 percent were females, and almost half were children.

Schauer and Wheaton (2006), and Venkatraman (2003) have both argued that sex trafficking in the United States is more of a domestic issue that often does not involve international smuggling of people. Research has repeatedly and consistently confirmed that most sexual exploitation occurs in local contexts (Estes & Wiener, 2001; Venkatraman, 2003). Yet, sexual exploitation is often difficult to detect or measure (Cullen-DuPont, 2009). Canadian survivors I interviewed, repeatedly described how they were recruited and trafficked locally within Manitoba, never leaving the Province. In more rare cases they were moved across Canada, and sometimes briefly into the United States and then returned to Manitoba. None of the participants I interviewed spoke of people being taken off the continent; however, it is entirely possible, and it is likely that this does in fact occur.

While boys and men are also sexually exploited, most sex industry survivors in Canada are female (Smith, 2014a). In 2006, the Canadian Parliamentary Subcommittee on Solicitation Laws reported that 75 to 80 percent of people involved in selling sex are female (Smith, 2014a). While boys and men are exploited in similar ways, most victims are girls and women, both globally and in Manitoba. Therefore, this research focuses mainly on female victims.

2.3.1 The National Action Plan

Many challenges are involved in developing strategies to address sexual exploitation and human trafficking. The environment is continually changing, as are the perpetrators' tactics. Law

enforcement and the broad spectrum of other services and agencies must be flexible and responsive to meet those changing demands. For example, changes in Canadian laws over recent years caused trickle-down affects wherein police and partner agencies were required to develop new approaches. The sex industry has moved substantially from the street into the Internet as a sales and delivery platform, which requires entirely different tools and approaches to identify victims, intervene with survivors, and prosecute or otherwise deter offenders.

One challenge encountered by law enforcement is the flexible nature of criminal activity. Organized crime adapts quickly to changing pressures from law enforcement. Parrot and Cummings (2008) wrote, for example, that “sexual slavery and human trafficking are highly lucrative and secretive businesses; the likelihood of perpetrators being caught is very small; the conditions that make women vulnerable are constantly being created; and the cultural assumptions that minimize women’s worth persist” (p. 99). These cultural assumptions such as viewing women as perpetrators or willing participants have started to change and are addressed throughout this thesis.

The “4P” approach of the United Nations “Global Action Plan” in 2010 (in Buttigieg, 2014) included the following four pillars: (1) prevention of trafficking, (2) protection of and assistance to victims of trafficking, (3) prosecuting crimes of trafficking, and (4) strengthening of partnerships against human trafficking. In 2002, the Canadian federal government ratified the United Nations “Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children,” and adopted the internationally accepted “4P” approach of the United Nations “Global Action Plan” (Buttigieg, 2014).

Canada still does not have a comprehensive national strategy. Diane Redsky describes the need for national coordination that was identified through her study (CWF, 2014).

DIANE REDSKY: The national task force has now become an advisory committee to a national coordination center. We raised the first year of funding from the private sector, and we hired an executive director just in late December. And so we hope by April or the fall to launch our national coordination center that will coordinate much of what's happening across the country on the issue of sexual exploitation and sex trafficking.

Ms. Redsky continues to be a Manitoba leader in advocacy around interrupting the sex industry.

Manitoba has a plan that is framed within *Tracia's Trust* and guides groups including the Sexually Exploited Youth Coalition (MB Family Services & Housing, 2008). There is much debate, however, within Manitoba about how to proceed. This is highlighted throughout the thesis through the perspectives offered by my study participants.

Canada has a newly minted National Action Plan, as noted by Diane Redsky; however, it is just now in development and its implementation time will tell how it evolves. Joy Smith (Joy Smith Foundation) talked about her role in implementing the National Action Plan.

JOY SMITH: At a national level we have the National Action Plan, which I was a part of. We have the human trafficking unit that is in Ottawa, which I helped to put together for all of Canada. There are cross-border committees and organizations through some meeting on March 23rd [2016] that encompasses all these stakeholders to talk about human trafficking Canada-wide and that impacts in Manitoba.

Both Ms. Redsky and Ms. Smith explained that Canada is in a time of change around addressing the sex industry problem; the coordination of a national strategy is only now starting to take shape. The plan guiding national level strategies appears to be sound, covering the multiple broad pillars. The laws have also changed on a federal level, and, as Joy Smith points out, systems are being worked on to improve cross-jurisdictional communication. The impacts of the new developing federal strategies are yet to be seen as work on the project commenced in 2016.

2.4 Modern day slavery and the sex industry

Sexual exploitation and human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation are a global

concern and is considered by many to be a modern-day form of slavery (Bales, 2004). This research sheds light on the distinction between the perception of prostitution as a legitimate profession of choice, and the other side of the debate, which holds that all people involved in prostitution, in any context, are generally exploited and victimized. O'Brien, Hayes, and Carpenter (2013) point out that contemporary activists, scholars, and policy-makers broadly define sex trafficking as modern day slavery. Lee (2011) also highlights that despite the debate over what constitutes slavery, it comes down to the degree of coercion, evidence of abuse and measures taken to prevent the escape of people selling their bodies.

In her book, *Walking Prey: How America's Youth are Vulnerable to Sex Slavery*, Holly Austin Smith (2014) further highlights the degree of coercion and manipulation mentioned by Lee (2011). She describes in detail, and from her own first-hand experience of being trafficked in the sex industry, how young girls are manipulated and coerced, often with little chance of escaping the power and control of pimps and traffickers. The reality of victims' unwillingness to testify against their pimps, due to manipulation, makes intervention in this form of slavery very difficult (Smith, 2014).

The sex industry commonly involves the forcible conscription and manipulation of vulnerable individuals into relationships in which people profit from their exploitation. The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons (United Nations, 2014, UNESCO, 2014) defines slavery as,

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation.

This UN definition fits with what we see happening to youth in the sex industry in Manitoba.

Venkatraman (2003) further argues that modern-day trafficking is slavery because it is an “assault on fundamental human dignity” (p. 2). Debt bondage is the most common form of modern day slavery in the sex industry (Bales, 2000 a,b).

Cullen-DuPont (2009) wrote, “Since slavery is no longer a legally recognized institution, enslaved people are often hidden from sight or closely monitored to prevent disclosure of their situation” (p. 7). Having worked in law enforcement this makes sense to me as I have seen first-hand how difficult it is to detect and infiltrate the sex industry with law enforcement tools, and this point was reinforced by the respondents I interviewed for this research. While working with sexually exploited youth, I observed the way predators use debt bondage, psychological manipulation, social isolation, and threats of violence to groom and exploit young girls into prostitution. The police officers I interviewed also confirmed how difficult it is to enforce the law. Street-level activity is relatively easy to enforce and prosecute; however, arresting people who are exploited does not solve the problem. The real challenges are in prosecuting traffickers. There are no complainants; the victims won’t report and most of the activity is now hidden in the Internet.

Ham and Gerard (2014) interviewed 55 sex industry workers who work mainly indoors in Melbourne, Australia, and learned that they are strategically invisible, despite the need to be somewhat visible in order to gain clients. This planned invisibility is similar in most places, including Nepal where Anuradha Koirala has dedicated her life to rescuing young girls from brothels (Wrede & Stiftung, 2013). Ms. Koirala has taken on the role that governments should be doing, intervening on behalf of exploited and trafficked youth and rescuing them from slavery. Strategic invisibility creates challenges for law enforcement to detect, infiltrate, and prosecute or to intervene and assist youth to exit the sex industry. My participants expressed this point

consistently, and it is described in the empirical chapters (see Chapter 5 to 10).

Parrot and Cummings (2008) point out that prostitution in and of itself does not constitute slavery unless certain conditions exist, such as “debt bondage and involuntary sexual servitude.” Sex trafficking, according to Lee (2011), involves strip clubs, bars, massage services, Internet based pornography, forced marriages, and mail-order bride schemes. Most of these scenarios, writes Lee (2011), include debt bondage, wherein women or their families have incurred some form of debt and then are made to “work it off” through sexual services. This use of indebtedness as a manipulative tool by pimps and traffickers against survivors in the sex industry is a very common theme in the interviews I conducted. Most survivors described how indebtedness for clothing, food, shelter, street drugs, and protection was used quickly by traffickers, sometimes within two days of being introduced to a new victim, for oppressive manipulation of young girls.

The design and enforcement of laws to prevent and control sexual exploitation have been a challenge worldwide. For example, recent analysis of human trafficking trends in 150 different countries concluded that legalizing prostitution tends to increase human trafficking (Cho, 2012). This may occur because legalization pushes the sex industry further underground, denying protections and resources that might be afforded to ‘legalize’ sex industry survivors. Those who are deemed to be ‘illegal’ may be made more vulnerable to exploitation by predators and pushed further from the grasp of people wishing to assist them.

Some women do go voluntarily to work in brothels and massage parlors. However, the degree of their voluntariness is debatable, as some argue that in most cases they are manipulated or coerced and have little chance for escape or have limited alternative choices to earn money to survive (Farley, 2003). While some adults freely choose to engage in prostitution, many youth and young women are in fact forced into modern day slavery as a means of survival. A young

child certainly cannot give informed consent to embark on a life in the sex industry, as she would be oblivious to all of the anguish that it entails for most of those who are involved. Basic human rights and human dignity are defined in the 1948 United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights. By these definitions, young women involved in the sex industry are in fact enchained in modern day slavery.

2.5 The sex industry in contemporary Canada

The Criminal Intelligence Service of Canada (CISC) has estimated that the average annual profit from each female trafficked in Canada is \$280,800, with profits of up to \$1,000 per day from each trafficked woman (CISC, 2008). The RCMP reports that a pimp in Canada can earn \$168,000 to \$336,000 per year from a single girl (Grant, 2016). It is easy to see the attraction for organized crime as the risks both of prosecution and of danger in the streets to the trafficker are much lower in the sex industry than in other criminal enterprises, such as drug trafficking.

The RCMP “Human Trafficking in Canada Fact Sheet,” (RCMP, 2014), highlights that trafficking doesn’t necessarily mean being taken across borders; it means being socially isolated and used for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Over 90 percent of Canadian trafficking victims are originally from Canada. The U.S. Department of State (2014) estimates that about 800 people are trafficked into Canada and 1,500-2,200 people are brought from other countries through Canada into the United States each year.

The defining factor in trafficking is not travel; it is coercion and control (RCMP, 2014). Manitoba’s sexually exploited youth are normally from within the province. They are physically and socially isolated, coerced, controlled, and manipulated by people known to them, often by their own family members and legal guardians (CWF, 2014). All of the survivors I interviewed

for this research were from Manitoba and were trafficked in Manitoba, although some were moved away to other provinces, by their traffickers, for short periods. Many move from rural areas in Manitoba to larger centers such as Winnipeg and Thompson, often relocating out of necessity for high school, which is not available in their home community. Traffickers know this and they exploit vulnerable youth who are in transit from their home communities.

The financial costs of sexual exploitation and trafficking to Canadians, and the risks to people involved in the sex industry are substantial. A recent study of sexual exploitation and human trafficking by the Canadian Women's Foundation (CWF, 2014) found that 70 percent of 200 victims studied used hospital services at least once for assaults, rapes, and other injuries resulting from their participation in the sex industry (p. 22). They reported the following other medical costs related to the sex industry can include, emergency room visits (\$212 - \$820 per visit), ambulance trips (\$690 - \$785 each), and hospital stays (\$720 - \$1,115.15 per day). One quarter of women reported not using condoms regularly (high risk activity). The average lifetime treatment for HIV/AIDS costs \$181,129 and treatment for Hepatitis C costs \$29,526.16. Other significant sex industry related costs that are more difficult to quantify include legal counsel, complex national or international criminal investigations, social assistance and other services, intergenerational impacts, lost income and foregone education (CWF, 2014). Other human costs, which are substantial, include the physical and psychological suffering that survivors endure.

John Lowman (2000), a criminologist who has extensively researched sex industry issues, describes the sex industry in the Canadian context as characteristically involving "survival sex" that includes impoverished women selling sex as they struggle to eat and get a roof over their heads (also see Cool, 2004). The argument that most women in the sex industry are exploited has been growing in popularity, especially over the past decade as awareness of the victims'

perspectives has grown. It has influenced changes in Canadian law and perspectives on the best approaches for eradication of the exploitation of girls and young women.

The sex industry in Canada has changed over recent decades. Richardson (2015) wrote that children now have sex for as little as five dollars, while they are controlled by traffickers who first get them addicted to street drugs in order to keep them vulnerable. They often recruit via the Internet. The RCMP's 2010 human trafficking threat assessment reported that, "technological advances allow individuals or criminal networks involved in sex trafficking to recruit and advertise victims, particularly underage girls, remotely and discreetly via the Internet" (in CWF, 2014, p. 24). The unbounded growing and relatively under-policed Internet is shrinking the universe and will be a major challenge to policing and collective responses to sexual exploitation and other social problems in the coming decades (Council of Canadian Academies, 2014; UNODC, 2014).

One Internet-based service, "Backpage.com" received 3,994,261 unique visitors in March 2013 alone (CWF, 2014). These numbers would be from North America, but it is difficult to say where the subscribers reside. From 2012 to 2013 revenue from sex adds increased 43.8 percent, recording monthly profits of \$4.41 million (CWF, 2014). The president of Backpage.com reported himself that as many as 400 posts each month may involve minors selling sex (ibid.). A substantial number of the participants in this research highlighted that the sex industry in 2016 is continuing to move more off of the street and increasingly into the Internet.

Some significant events have driven issues around the sex industry more into the Canadian public discourse in recent years. The Pickton mass murder case in British Columbia was a wakeup call for Canada (Oppal, 2012). The start of Canada's Missing and Murdered Indigenous

Women and Children Inquiry in September 2016 also provides a great catalyst for change in the narrative around this issue.

2.6 Missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls

Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Children (MMIW) has become a social movement in Canada around the growing public discourse over the marginalization and violent oppression of Indigenous women and girls. The Native Women's Association of Canada (NWAC) coined the term "Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women," in a funded study carried out over several years, in reference to Indigenous women and girls who are missing and/or have been murdered across Canada over recent decades (NWAC, 2010).

As of 2009 NWAC was reporting 520 cases of missing or murdered Indigenous women and girls. Of those 520 women and girls, 24 percent were identified as missing and 67 percent were identified as "having died as a result of homicide or negligence" (NWAC, 2009). In 2016 NWAC reported more than 1,000 missing or murdered Indigenous women in Canada. NWAC has played an important role in raising awareness and feeding the public discourse around the marginalization of Indigenous people in Canada.

The MMIW movement has raised awareness of situations including the victims of the serial killer, Robert Pickton in British Columbia (Oppal, 2012), and the Highway of Tears in British Columbia. It is believed that between 1989 and 2006 nine women were murdered, or missing and believed murdered, along a 700-kilometer stretch of Highway 16 in the interior of British Columbia. That stretch of highway is commonly referred to as the Highway of Tears (Highway of Tears, 2016). I once attended a seminar in which the coordinators described how the Highway of Tears actually runs through the impoverished neighbourhoods that are inhabited

by Indigenous people across Canada.

The RCMP conducted research, based on case files gathered from police agencies across Canada. They concluded that between 1980 and 2012 there were 20,313 homicides across Canada (about 5 per year); including 6,551 female homicide victims (32 percent), 1,017 (16 percent) who were Indigenous (RCMP, 2013, p. 9). The number of Indigenous female victims climbed from eight percent in 1984 to 23 percent in 2012, while the number of non-Indigenous female victims remained constant (*ibid.*).

Indigenous victims were also found more likely to be involved in illegal activities for financial support (18 percent for Indigenous vs. 8 percent for non-Indigenous); more likely to be unemployed (12 percent for Indigenous vs. 8 percent for non-Indigenous); more likely to be on social assistance or disability insurance (23 percent for Indigenous vs. 9 percent for non-Indigenous); more likely to have substance abuse problems and to be under the influence of intoxicants at the time they were murdered (63 percent for Indigenous vs. 20 percent of non-Indigenous); and, 12 percent of female homicide victims had known involvement in the sex industry (RCMP, 2013). This is occurring in the context of ongoing unresolved economic and social disparity issues for Indigenous people, and an ongoing movement around the related issue of missing and murdered Indigenous women (Welch, 2014; Oppal, 2012). The urgency of this issue is exacerbated by the tragic murders of several sexually exploited youth in Manitoba (CBC, 2014 a, b), and ongoing challenges in Manitoba's child-welfare system to fulfill its mandate to protect over 10,000 children in care of the state (Puxley, 2014).

Research by Farley et al. (2003) found that 52 percent of women in the sex industry in Vancouver were Indigenous. The proportion is much higher in some areas including Manitoba. Cook and Courchene (2006) found that 70 percent of sexually exploited children and youth in

Manitoba had Indigenous ancestry. This is a massive overrepresentation of Indigenous victims, considering they make up about four percent of Canada's population (McCracken & Mitchell, 2006). Rabson (2013) wrote, based on the 2011 census that First Nations people make up 10 percent of Manitoba's population, and 60 percent of those live on reserves. About 6.7 percent of Manitoba's population is Métis (Rabson, 2013).

2.7 Conclusion

This chapter creates a picture for the reader of the state of sex trafficking and sexual exploitation in Canada. The Manitoba context and a picture of counter-exploitation work that has taken place in Manitoba is presented in Section 5.1.1, at the start of the first empirical findings chapter. This was done because Section 5.1.1 presents findings based upon interviews I conducted, and therefore it should follow the methodology chapter. Section 5.1.1 was also presented at the start of the findings section of the thesis because it provides context for the comments of my respondents about counter-exploitation in Manitoba.

The main theme that emerges is that a lot of good work has taken place, yet there is room for a great deal more to be done. There is a need for the government to provide further resources, enhance coordination and collaboration, as well as increasing public awareness about the issue. This research hopes to contribute to breaking the culture of silence on the exploitation and trafficking of women and children in Manitoba.

Chapter 3 – The Literature Review

3.1 Introduction

This chapter provides an overview of the literature and previous research on sex trafficking and exploitation, with a focus on Manitoba. Information on the topic of sex trafficking and sexual exploitation comes from a wide array of sources and disciplines. Some scholars have reported that peer reviewed journals contain relatively little literature on human sex trafficking, and that much of the information on this topic is found in the media, law enforcement records and government and NGO reports (Muftic & Finn, 2013; Clawson et al., 2009). This research is informed by scholarly literature as well as reports published by government agencies such as the RCMP and the governments of Canada and Manitoba, and from studies and reports from organizations such as the NWAC and CWF.

Sexual exploitation and human trafficking are complex topics crossing multiple disciplines. Therefore, to gain the fullest picture possible, this research takes what Galtung termed a “transdisciplinary” approach (Galtung, 1996, in Sandole, Byrne, Sandole-Staroste & Senehi, 2009). Wheaton, Schauer and Galli (2010) have also defined the need for different theoretical perspectives in understanding complex subjects. For example, Schauer and Wheaton (2006) point out that the criminal justice and sociology fields have historically dominated the literature on human trafficking. This study intends to bring in other perspectives, examining the sex industry as organized crime and as a social justice issue, including the literature on direct and structural violence, economics, law, gender and feminist perspectives as well as intersectionality. I also include literature from the PACS field, which ultimately provides tools that can assist in understanding and reducing conflict, and improving collaboration in society’s response to sexual

exploitation. In this chapter I describe the existing literature on patterns of abuse and violence, including a focus on challenges that are more specific to Indigenous people. Laws and approaches to preventing sexual exploitation are outlined, followed by sections on making effective and sustainable changes through collective impact strategies, affecting the public discourse, and community engagement.

3.2 Vulnerability and prevention of sexual exploitation

The experience of people who are trafficked or otherwise involved in selling sex for money is rife with physical and emotional pain and related behavioral outcomes including trauma and substance abuse. The environment this happens in can be partially explained in terms of social structures and dynamics that result in what Galtung (1996) describes as “structural violence” or invisible violence, such as poverty and the lack of educational and employment opportunities. The oppression of women and children in the sex industry also takes the form of direct physical and psychological assaults perpetrated by pimps, traffickers, and johns. This oppression often starts long before entering the sex industry, as most women involved in the sex industry were previously abused as children.

Vulnerability and victimization are tied, at least in part, to the structural violence of impoverishment (Reimer et al., 2015). It occurs when societal institutions are arranged in such a way that people are systematically discriminated against and have less economic and educational opportunities than others. This disparity is apparent in Canada as many Indigenous people live in poor conditions on reserves and impoverished city cores, in stark contrast with the relatively high living standards enjoyed by most people in mainstream Canada (see Chapter 6).

Galtung (1996) contends that positive peace extends far beyond the mere end of active

warfare (negative peace) to social justice (positive peace), which is only possible in the absence of structural violence. Positive peace should be a social justice goal in modern day, first-world society. In examining structural violence and exploited youth, it is crucial to consider the dynamics and structures that correlate between vulnerability to sexual exploitation and the structural violence of impoverishment.

One case in which structural violence was addressed to improve public safety occurred in Boston. Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) presented a paradigm shift with respect to severe ongoing violence in and around Boston in the late 1980s and early 1990s against African American males, by declaring street violence to be a medical health crisis. They engaged multiple systems in cross-sectorial violence intervention and prevention strategies, eventually reducing violence against African American males substantially. Historically, this medical science-based cause and affect paradigm has not often been applied to crime and public safety issues. This research into sex trafficking and exploitation connects in some ways with the Boston case. For example, women are viewed as survivors of the impoverished social milieus they were born into, just as violence afflicted gang members in Boston area became viewed as victims of their life circumstances rather than only as criminals. Prothrow-Stith and Spivak highlighted that the children are not to blame for the circumstances they are born into in life, and they therefore should not be punished for it (ibid.).

In a similar vein, Muftic and Finn (2013) present human trafficking as a “heinous crime and a public health issue” (p. 1860), highlighting the health implications as severe, affecting hundreds of thousands [in the US] annually (also see Siskin & Sun Wyler, 2010; Winterdyk & Reichel, 2010). Despite increasing public awareness of human trafficking as a growing global issue, Muftic and Finn (2013) point out that there is still relatively little primary research

published on it. Zimmerman, Hossain, and Watts (2011) also noted from a health perspective that “health is a subject that has been largely neglected in anti-trafficking work” (p. 237).

Impoverishment and lack of opportunities seems to correlate with being victimized, whether it is through gangs in Boston or young women in the sex industry in Winnipeg. Therefore, economic disparity is an important element to understand in relation to analyzing who is vulnerable to exploitation. Sixty-seven percent of Canada’s wealth is held by a small number of elites and, “the poorest fifth of Canadians own no share at all” (Broadbent, 2014). The aphorism, “the rich get richer” seems true historically, and it reverberates today with our everyday observations that wealth gaps in the world are ever widening (Rugaber & Boak, 2014), and the tragic outcome is that disadvantaged people become further oppressed. People tend to blame sex industry survivors for their plights, seeing their involvement as a matter of free will (Bishop, 1994); however, what we sometimes overlook is the fact that people do not have a choice over the conditions they are born into.

Burton (1997) argues that beyond financial material needs, social institutions and structures can suppress one’s identity, personal status, and security, and can become a source of conflict at all social levels from the interpersonal to the international. It seems clear that there is psychological oppression involved, and that financial control is part of the overall manipulation that occurs when someone is trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation. Foucault (2010) describes power as diffuse, reinforced, and perpetuated through societal structures and social reproduction. My research sheds light on these persisting social structures and the impacts they have on exploited women and children.

Structural violence of impoverishment is difficult to overcome. It is like the vivid memories I have of being stuck while playing in the mud when I was a child. The harder I would

pull, the more my feet would be sucked down until I could not escape without help. While we all know of individuals from disadvantaged environments who later became successful, the fate for most people is to live and die as members of the same socioeconomic classes they were born into (Macleod, 1995). Macleod (1995) found that “social reproduction processes” tend to keep people locked in their place in the social economic order. Following people in one urban neighbourhood, longitudinally over several decades from childhood on, Macleod (1995) found that social structures create a destiny for each of us that is difficult to escape. The same dynamics seem to be at play with respect to sex industry survivors. Impoverishment and the related lack of opportunities are clearly linked to people resorting to survival sex.

Cullen-DuPont (2009) described how traffickers identify people who are desperate to escape lives of poverty by luring them with lies, such as the promise of legitimate work. In some cases, parents sell their children in the hopes for a better life for them. Tragically, however, the hope of legitimate work often turns out to be torture and servitude in the sex industry (ibid.).

Previous research has revealed that women involved in sexual exploitation tend to experience alarming levels of direct physical violence and abuse. Farley (2003), for example, found that most women and youth involved in sexual exploitation are trapped in violent exploitative relationships, experiencing, and fearing violence resulting in mental health, and substance abuse problems. Her study of 854 survivors in nine countries revealed that violence is a common experience in the sex industry. Women and youth reported being routinely subjected to various forms of oppression and violence, including sexual harassment, verbal abuse, stalking, rape, battering, and torture (Farley, 2003, p. 35).

In her study focused in Canada, Farley (2003) interviewed 100 women involved in the sex industry in Vancouver’s Downtown East Side, a historically central prostitution area. She found

that over 91 percent of her sample had been assaulted repeatedly during acts of prostitution. The assaults included stabbings, beatings, concussions, and broken jaws, ribs, collarbones, fingers, spines, and skulls. Fifty percent of the women had experienced serious head injuries from assaults with baseball bats or crowbars or from having their heads slammed against walls or against the car dashboards. Farley (2003) found that 67 percent of the women she interviewed had been raped five times or more and 74 percent were diagnosed with Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD).

The psychological effects of being exploited have even deeper impacts than those associated with other forms of physical violence (Yuen et al., 2014). There is a growing body of literature reporting the high incidence of psychopathologies such as anxiety, PTSD, depression, and other psychological problems among people involved in prostitution (Yuen et al., 2014; Rössler et al., 2010). For example, Lau et al. (2010) studied the sex industry in Hong Kong and found that 53.9 percent of sex workers were notably depressed. Wong et al. (2008) found that female sex workers experienced a significantly diminished quality of life in almost every measure.

Many female sex industry survivors struggle with negative self-views and emotionally tormenting guilt and shame (Gorry, Roen & Reilly, 2010; Wong et al., 2008; Holroyd et al., 2008; Vanwesenbeeck, 2005). Jennifer Richardson is a recognized Canadian expert on sexual exploitation. She highlights that sex trafficking survivors are often seen as responsible for their own fate. Richardson stresses that being trafficked is different from other kinds of abuse; people often see it as the survivor's fault, viewing them more as complicit perpetrators than as victims (CWF, 2014).

Sex industry survivors are exposed to the stress of negative social stigmas and often live in

the constant fear of being discovered by their family or friends (Wong, Holroyd & Bingham, 2011). When combined with the personal reasons and life circumstances that lead to entering the sex industry, some women might perceive the emotional risks to be out of their control (Sanders, 2004). This may contribute, as some researchers have found, to severe substance abuse and dangerous risk-taking behaviours such as inconsistent condom use, increasing their chances of contracting sexually transmitted infections and HIV Aides (Lau et al., 2010; Hong et al, 2007).

Many children inherit a legacy that places them on the track towards exploitation. For example, Indigenous children often live with the trauma that is passed on from their parents and grandparents. It is easy to understand the concept of “the transgenerational transmission of trauma,” which was first identified by Volkan (1997). This phenomenon is illustrated broadly in Canadian Indigenous populations wherein many are suffering from the lingering impacts of Canada’s aggressive assimilation programs that sought to extinguish their traditional culture and integrate them into Western settler society (Younging, 2009). Many from impoverished backgrounds seem fated to wind up being exploited. Helping people to break these trajectories, build resilience and achieve better lives will require an understanding of structural or invisible violence and ways to empower people to overcome it.

3.2.1 Early child abuse and later involvement in the sex industry

Literature on the connection between childhood conditions and later sex industry involvement is relatively lean. Some research occurred in the late 1980s when the Canadian government responded to growing concerns about prostitution and sexual abuse of Canadian youth. The Badgley Committee was commissioned and subsequently conducted multiple mass surveys and interviewed 229 juvenile prostitutes across Canada (Badgley, 1984). Prior to the Badgley study, Weisberg (1985) wrote that American-based research and literature were the main sources of information about adolescent prostitution. According to Brock (1998) the Badgley Report was,

for many years, the definitive source of information about child and youth sexual abuse in Canada. Findings of the Badgely report connect with my research, exploring correlations between troubled family situations, runaway behavior, and later sex industry involvement.

Badgely (1984) found that youth being exploited in the sex industry reported running away from home as a way of immediately escaping from environments they could not cope with. The Badgely Report highlighted that social services available to youth, once they ran away and were in the streets, were “ineffective and had provided inadequate protection and assistance” (Badgely, 1984, p. 986). The committee made recommendations for the development of specialized services for youth prostitutes that were ahead of their time; such services were not developed in earnest until recently.

The Badgely Committee (Badgely, 1984) recommended that policies for intervening in and preventing youth prostitution should include (1) specific legislation aimed at the consumers (the johns), (2) sexual procurement of youth prostitution should be an indictable offence, and (3) that young prostitutes need to be criminalized for their own protection through enactment of specific offences for people under 18 who sell sexual services (p. 1046-56). The first two recommendations were consistent with current day attitudes with respect to sexual exploitation. However, the recommendation to ‘criminalize’ youth for their own protection later raised criticisms of the Badgely Report on the following two counts: (1) it contradicted the Committee’s stated commitment not to re-victimize young prostitutes by labeling them as criminals, and (2) criminalization goes against a growing school of thought that criminal charges further challenge, traumatize, and shame youth who have already been victimized (Brock, 1998; Appleford, 1986; Lowman et al., 1986). These debates, even after the extensive Badgely research, highlight the complexity and varied opinions on the complex issue of sexual

exploitation and sex trafficking.

In the mid 1980s, the “Fraser Committee” (Fraser, 1985) was commissioned with a mandate to conduct “sociolegal” research on prostitution and pornography (Lowman et al., 1986). Their mandate included: (1) studies of the prostitution business across Canada, (2) a national population study gathering opinions about prostitution, and (3) comparative studies of approaches to prostitution in Europe, Asia, Arabia, South America, and the United States (Sansfaçon, 1984). The Fraser Committee report emphasized that existing Canadian laws around prostitution, “operated in a way which victimizes and dehumanizes the prostitute” (Fraser, 1985, p. 533). The Fraser Committee recommended the government to develop “long-term programs to address the social and economic conditions faced by women involved in prostitution” (Fraser, 1985, p. 525-6). These earlier studies accurately reflect the findings of current day discourse around the social conditions that create vulnerability, and as the key to reducing exploitation of children and youth.

Some researchers have found correlations between childhood sexual abuse and later sexual exploitation (Klatt, Cavnerb, & Eganc, 2014; Kaestle, 2012; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010). For example, Klatt, Cavnerb and Eganc (2014) studied records of 175 youth receiving treatment for sexual exploitation in Leicester, United Kingdom. They reported that childhood sexual abuse correlates highly with high risk sexual activity and trading for sex. General physical abuse has also been associated with later sexual exploitation (Roe-Sepowitz et al., 2011; Greene, Ennett & Ringwalt, 1999).

McIntyre (2012), for example, examined 41 females and nine males involved in prostitution in Alberta, Canada, and found that 82 percent experienced sexual abuse prior to entering the sex industry. The average age of entry into the sex industry in Canada was 13 years

old (ibid.). These findings indicate possibilities for intervention measures to prevent victims of child abuse from later becoming involved in the sex industry.

Historically, numerous other factors have also been found to correlate with later sex industry involvement including: family dysfunction, educational difficulties, poverty, drug, and alcohol abuse, involvement with child protective services, friends or family members involved in trading sex, running away from home, homelessness, school delinquency, and sexual activity (McIntyre, 2012). Research has also found that sexual exploitation, harassment and sexual violence is often correlated with homelessness among women (Huey & Quirouette, 2010; Huey & Berndt, 2008). None of these factors on their own raise flags for youth vulnerability to exploitation, but taken together they hold much more meaning. Early childhood abuse and lack of opportunities seem to indicate a higher likelihood of later participation in survival sex.

A contemporary trend in research recognizes the importance of early investment in youth to prevent their later criminal involvement. Heckman et al. (2010) found that every dollar spent on children under five to improve their education can potentially save up to seventeen dollars in their later usage of health, welfare, and justice dollars. This economic based argument is a strong impetus for directing more money into early childhood development and education programs. Clearly there is potential for developing early warning systems, based upon known correlates such as child abuse, to identify and intervene with high risk youth and prevent their exploitation in the sex industry.

3.2.2 The violent reality of Canadian Indigenous women

There is a growing awareness of the oppression that Indigenous women and children have suffered historically, and continue to endure in the present day. Recent research by the government of Canada found that First Nations women and girls are four times more likely than

mainstream Canadians to live in crowded conditions, in homes that are in a state of ill repair (Mandel, 2016). A substantial body of research has confirmed that Indigenous communities in Canada are still suffering the impacts of colonization (Ham, 2014; Younging, 2009). The strong discourse in the community about continuing marginalization of Indigenous people has also been long-established in the literature, exposing their experience of higher crime, lower employment rates and overall poor education completion in relation to Canada's mainstream population (Hallett, Thornton & Stewart, 2006).

Canada's residential school system ran from the early 1880s and the last school was not closed until 1996. The residential schools and mass government adoption (seizure) of Indigenous infants in the 1960s were aggressive assimilation programs that have resulted in tragic disconnects in parental skills for multiple generations in many families (CBC, 2011/2008; Galley, 2009; Comack et al., 2009; McCracken & Michell, 2006). Similar systemic oppression is occurring in the United States among large African-American and Hispanic populations with massive incarceration rates and broken families (Nebbitt et al., 2013).

Many of Canada's Indigenous people continue to live in marginalized conditions on reserves with inadequate drinking water and unreliable electricity sources (Lauwers, 2012; Goar, 2006). Indigenous youth are engaging more in suicide and violence than any other Canadian ethnic group, especially on reserves, and some scholars report that the problem will likely increase and possibly double in the next two decades (Paul, 2012; Totten, 2009). Lauwers (2012) attributes tragically increasing suicide rates, on the reserves, to a lack of emotional resilience, poor physical and social conditions, and the absence of perceived opportunities and hope among Indigenous youth.

McCracken and Michell (2006) explore the contemporary challenges of Indigenous people

and find that they simultaneously face low-incomes and poverty, as well as the persisting impacts of colonization and racism. Additionally, Volkan (1997) outlines how traumas such as these can carry forward and affect the psyche of successive generations. A higher birthrate compared with any other Canadian ethnic group also exacerbates Indigenous people's social challenges leading into the future (Comack et al., 2009; Hallet, Thornton & Stewart, 2006).

Indigenous people are migrating in increasing numbers from impoverished reserves into poor neighbourhoods of Canadian cities (Norris et al., 2000; Norris, Kerr & Nault, 1995). Street gangs often provide the identity and structure that children need and are not finding at home (Comack et al., 2009; Totten, 2009). My research participants confirmed that the same dynamic applies to the sex industry. The need for a sense of belonging and access to life's basic necessities of food, clothing, a bed to sleep in, and social interaction are often an acceptable tradeoff for children who succumb to being sexually exploited. Intervention and exit strategies for sexually exploited Indigenous girls must consider these deep-rooted transgenerational impacts, and culturally appropriate interventions.

3.2.3 Gender and violence

Holly Austin Smith (2014) highlights how any child is a potential victim, even from 'normal' middle class families. In the forward to Ms. Smith's book on the subject, Mira Sorvino, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Goodwill Ambassador to Combat Human Trafficking, writes that Smith "systematically builds her case that just by being a child in America, in this culture obsessed with consumerism, sex and objectification of women, anyone is potentially vulnerable to being trafficked for sex or falling prey to commercial sexual exploitation of children" (Smith, 2014, p. iv). Through her own story, Smith details the vulnerability that teenagers have and how pimps expertly take advantage of them. Young girls in

Canada are vulnerable in similar ways.

Understanding gender related vulnerability is important in the analysis of sexual exploitation. Amahazion (2014) notes that society and the literature on sex workers, often tends to pigeonhole or label victims as socially deviant and as undesirable to others. This is a form of oppression that applies primarily to women. The fear of being labeled a “prostitute” is so strong that it can silence and prevent them from seeking help.

Sociologist Patricia Hill Collins wrote about the overlapping forms of oppression that many women face in society (Collins, 2009). This research examines how these multiple oppressive forces affect young women, making them vulnerable to exploitation. Women involved in the sex industry continually face judgments in society (Amahazion, 2014; Lozano, 2010; Doezema, 1998). They are often denied protection and security in their work and lives that others take for granted (Kempadoo & Doezema, 1998). The five vulnerability factors most often mentioned in the CWF (2014) research were: (1) being female (2) being poor, (3) having a history of violence or neglect, (4) a history of child sexual abuse, and (5) a low education level.

Sally Engle Merry (2009) suggests that gender violence is rooted in local cultural perceptions of power and gender. Therefore, according to Engle Merry, human rights should be thought of in terms of local contexts, and universal reforms should consider specific regional perspectives. Regional differences are increasingly salient as Canada has growing pockets of newcomers, and each of these local contexts and ethnic groups have unique cultures. For example, genital mutilation is more common among certain cultural groups. Transgenerational trauma is another social dynamic that is more common among some cultural groups.

Boulding (2000) suggests that peace building should be done in local contexts, transforming oppressive structures through “feminist analysis” emphasizing empowerment,

replacing “power-over” with “power-with” structures. These perspectives relate to sexual exploitation as dynamics in exploitation are relevant in all oppressive relationships, and most sexual exploitation victims across Canada are female, Indigenous, Canadians (Canada, Department of Justice, 2014). Paterson (2010) has further highlighted that it is important to consider the context of power relationships in the analysis of domestic violence. These same power relationships are relevant in any exploitive scenario.

Labeling is a significant factor in gender specific violence. Kempadoo and Doezema (1998) point out that the mere fact that a “prostitute” is distinguished as belonging to a specific group, “perpetuates her exclusion from rights to freedom from violence at work” (p. 65). Social labels and categories negatively stigmatize women (Lozano, 2010). Lozano (2010) wrote “othering” occurs in the way modern-day prostitutes are identified as such. They are labeled as bad women as opposed to virtuous, distinguishing them along other dichotomies such as normal vs. abnormal, wife vs. prostitute, and virgin vs. whore (Kempadoo & Doezema, 1998; Bell, 1994). These labels can ruin people’s lives in numerous ways.

Lozano (2010) highlights that prostitution exists because of power differentials through which women are objectified and dehumanized. Moreover, Delacoste and Alexander (1987) wrote, “In virtually all countries, men earn more for the same or equivalent work than do women” (p. 190). In most cases all of the money earned by sex industry survivors goes to pimps and other people exploiting them, and any money the survivor can keep for herself goes toward buying alcohol and street drugs for self-medication to numb the psychological distress of living with the previously noted social stigmas (Greene, Ennett & Ringwalt, 1999). Much has been written on the perspective that prostitution keeps women oppressed in society (Lozano, 2010; Murray 1998; Barry, 1995; Delacoste & Alexander, 1988).

3.2.4 Intersecting challenges of youth in the sex industry

The sociological term ‘intersectionality’ refers to multiple disadvantages and challenges that some face in society (Grace, 2014; Hankivsky, 2011; McCall, 2005). Grace (2014) highlights that intersectionality researchers, “consider complex interactions between structures of power and oppression and interconnected aspects of individual and group identity and social location” (p. 1). All of the sexually exploited/trafficked survivors interviewed for this study fit this definition of intersectionality. Children and women in the sex industry face multiple compounded challenges, thus explaining the difficulty they have in escaping it.

Grace (2014) wrote that the intersectional perspective, “allows for richer understandings of inequity in the social world...to illuminate and interpret complex systems of power, penalty, and privilege” (p. 161). Robertson and Sgoutas (2012) have further highlighted that “intersectional analysis,” or “intersectionality,” has been used in different academic disciplines to describe the challenges that people face as result of being marginalized due to their sex, gender, sexuality, race, class and national identities (also see Vidal-Ortiz, 2006). These authors caution that there is a danger in applying labels, such as prostitute, as they oversimplify the complex interplay of gender, sex and sexuality.

Robertson and Sgoutas (2012) also argue that, “social science research that relies on normative identity categories can lead to incomplete intersectional analyses” (p. 420-23). Such incomplete analysis could result from labels being assigned by “dominant members of society” (ibid.). Biases could enter research as well. For example, some scholars have determined that stereotypes held by social science researchers can affect their interpretations of data (Robertson & Sgouta, 2012; Valentine, 2007; Vidal-Ortiz, 2006).

An intersectional perspective is applicable to this issue of sexual exploitation. Ferguson

(2005) wrote, “In the intersections is where we fashion languages against coherence. Intersections are necessarily messy, chaotic, and heterodox. Why necessarily so? Because intersections are not about identity; they are about social dynamics” (p. 66). Intersectionality theory seems to fit this subject as it is clear that people are vulnerable and exploited, both in the grooming and introduction to the sex industry and in the socialization, manipulation, power imbalances and outright physical force that keeps them there.

Hooks (2000) also argues that intersectionality that attributes to “sexist oppression, economic oppression, and racial oppression can intertwine to create different realities for women based on their particular location in society” (p. 40). Therefore, exploring interventions and strategies around sexual exploitation requires consideration of the effects and interplay of gender, economic disparity and the social psychology of manipulation. Intervention and eradication of sexual exploitation requires collective approaches addressing root problems, many of which are correlated with transgenerational traumas related to colonization, early childhood sexual abuse, poverty, and its related effects on lost educational and job opportunities for victims of sexual exploitation, gender and general vulnerabilities that allow children and women to be victimized.

3.3 The sex trafficking market

Research on the customer side of the sex industry is limited, and yet this aspect is particularly significant as we consider deterrence and effectiveness of existing and new laws and strategies. McIntyre (2012) wrote that during her research with sex industry survivors she realized that, “If we were ever going to successfully disrupt and adjust the supply of young persons involved in the sexual exploitation field we needed to address the demand” (p. 64). She reported, “If we were

to disrupt, decrease or alter the demand by consumers for sexually exploited youth it would result in a decrease in the supply” (ibid.). Linden (2012) also points out that deterrence is an important element in any crime reduction strategy. New research must examine both the supply and the demand side of the equation, and the effect of evolving laws and strategies on the sex industry.

An economics, supply-and-demand perspective can gain insights by exploring how the market and social conditions such as poverty affect victimization. For example, Becker (1995, cited in Schauer & Wheaten, 2006) was a pioneer of the economic perspective on crime. Becker highlights how people weigh the potential benefits of committing crimes against the potential costs of being caught. The potential risks include loss of liberty (prison), fines and social embarrassment. Sexual exploitation and trafficking are relatively low risk crimes with little startup cost, and large potential profits, so it explains the appeal as a criminal enterprise (Schauer & Wheaten, 2006). What is left to be determined, however, is which punishments, if any, are effective deterrents.

Schloenhardt (1999) describes how increasing consumer demand creates opportunities for organized crime. The startling numbers described earlier in this thesis certainly indicate an increasing demand for the sex industry, worldwide as well as in Canada. Trafficking occurs because there is money to be made, and the risk of getting caught is acceptable for many traffickers (Hughes, 2002, 2003). From an economist’s perspective, the market and how to affect and reduce it is a salient factor to consider (DeRiviere, 2005). McIntyre (2012) found that 85 percent of johns purchased sex for over five years, while only half of the johns surveyed were ever charged. This indicates that purchasing sex tends to be a long-term activity, not a one-time-only event and very few get caught; therefore, the perceived risk of being caught is likely low.

Many offenders are not deterred by the threat of a first arrest. McIntyre (2012) found that many reported that they felt continual guilt and tried unsuccessfully to quit numerous times (ibid.). She also found that many purchasers of sex reported feeling compelled by their sex drive to take professional and personal risks they did not want to take. Many tried repeatedly to quit, and reported that the laws were confusing to them. New research should explore if Canada's new laws are clear and if new strategies are effective.

Linden (2012) wrote, "The most effective way to reduce crime is to implement comprehensive crime prevention programs that focus on reducing the number of motivated offenders, increasing guardianship, and reducing target suitability" (p. 486). This indicates that future research should examine the perpetrators purchasing sex, and the ones who are making the most money from it. We need to ask what leads men to purchase sex and what might help prevent it, and what might deter people from participating in the sex industry.

One intervention, according to the existing academic literature, is to reduce the availability of sex for purchase by finding ways to prevent girls from becoming involved in the sex industry. Another significant factor is to reduce target suitability through the deterrent effect of laws and punishments (Linden, 2012). Linden has found that simply increasing the severity of laws and prison sentences does not necessarily correlate with deterrence. Therefore, we must determine the point of diminishing returns on criminal sentences and balance it with other factors, such as reducing the availability of children and women in the sex industry market.

3.3.1 Laws affecting sexual exploitation and human trafficking

Over recent decades the nature of prostitution and how laws in society should respond has been under constant debate in Canada. The three broad approaches under debate are over whether it should be prohibited, legalized entirely or partially legalized (Lozano, 2010). This sub-section

provides a brief overview of Canada's legal history around sex trafficking and exploitation.

The 1979 "United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women" urged countries around the world to take measures and create laws against trafficking, sexual exploitation and prostitution of women (United Nations, 1979). In 2005, Canada adopted the United Nations "Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children" (United Nations, 2014). Signing these declarations signaled an intention by the Canadian government to act; however, real changes did not come until much later.

Canadian laws historically treated prostitution more as a nuisance than as oppression and violence against women. Vagrancy and bawdyhouse laws enacted in 1892 were intended to maintain order and keep prostitution from being a public nuisance. Solicitation laws enacted in 1972 and the communication laws legislated in 1985 were designed to discourage prostitution by keeping it out of public view. Section 213 of the Criminal Code of Canada prohibited communicating for the purpose of prostitution in any place open to public view, indicating that the intent of that law was to keep the activity hidden from public sight, and from being a public nuisance, not for the safety of people performing the sex acts (Smith, 2014).

A significant change came as a result of the relatively recent Supreme Court of Canada 'Bedford' Decision that resulted from an appeal by three women who were charged with prostitution-related offences (Canada vs. Bedford, 2013). Their appeal argued that the existing laws were unconstitutional in that they impeded their ability to safely earn a living through selling sex for money. Lawyers argued on behalf of the three women that the laws against communicating for the purpose of prostitution prevented them from lawfully talking with customers to determine if they were safe to perform sex acts with them for money. The Supreme

Court agreed with that position, stating that the existing laws prevented them from safely performing prostitution. In December 2013, the Supreme Court of Canada ruled that several prostitution related offences as they stood in the Criminal Code of Canada, Sections 210 “bawdy house”, 212(1)(j) “living off the avails of prostitution” and 213(1)(c) “communication for the purpose of prostitution”, were unconstitutional and were to be struck down (Canada vs. Bedford, 2013). The existing laws were to remain in effect for one year, until December 2014, allowing government time to create new laws and strategies to go with them.

The court decision also explained that the laws were struck down because they treated prostitution as a nuisance, rather than as the serious victimization of women and children that it is. To recapitulate both sides of this fundamental debate, one camp argues that women should have a right to choose selling sex as a means of livelihood and the laws should protect them in doing so. The other side holds the view that no child or woman chooses freely to participate in selling sex, unless they have no other choices; it is the position that all sellers of sex are victims whether they know or admit it or not.

Joy Smith (2014a) reported in 2014 that Canada was at a crossroad at which critical decisions were required about how Canada would create laws and strategies around this issue. Three basic approaches were under debate during 2013-2014. One approach was to prohibit prostitution altogether (i.e., the abolitionist approach) for both the seller and the buyer. This approach would tend to criminalize women and children who participate in the sex industry. Many argue that this approach victimizes sexually exploited people with criminal records that exacerbate their already formidable social challenges.

The second broad approach was complete legalization, making neither purchasing nor providing sex for money illegal. In some places, such as Germany, Australia, and the

Netherlands, prostitution has been legalized and thus the exploitation and trafficking of girls and young women increased (Smith, 2014; Kelly, Coy & Davenport, 2009). This may be in part because legalization brings licensing and bureaucratic oversight, and what happens to prostitutes who do not meet the legal requirements? They may be further marginalized and more vulnerable because of being deemed “illegal” (Smith, 2014). At a June 2016 forum on sex trafficking and sexual exploitation at the Global College, University of Winnipeg, Gunilla Ekberg, a widely published Swedish-Canadian lawyer and advocate for victims of sex trafficking, explained how legalized prostitution in Amsterdam has failed. Ms. Ekberg explained that the famed legalized prostitution district of Amsterdam was recently closed as it was learned that most of the women working there were being trafficked against their will by organized crime. A study of human trafficking trends in 150 different countries recently concluded that legalizing prostitution generally correlates with increased human trafficking (Cho, 2012).

A third broad approach was limited legalization, which recognizes sex sellers as victims of exploitation. This third approach favours anti-prostitution laws targeting traffickers and pimps, and the johns, arresting, and sentencing the purchasers of sex and not the victims. This is known as the “Nordic Model” employed in Norway and Sweden with some reported success (Smith, 2014). The Nordic Model, enacted in 1999, has three major aspects as follows: (1) a national public education campaign, raising awareness about the harms of sexual exploitation, (2) programs with enhanced support for people exiting the sex industry, and (3) stringent laws attacking the market (traffickers and johns) and not the prostitutes (Smith, 2014). Prostitution reportedly dropped by 30 to 50 percent between 1999 and 2004 in Sweden (Eckberg, 2004).

Several other countries including Iceland in 2009, Israel in 2012 and France in 2013, subsequently adopted the Nordic Model. In April 2014, the European Parliament endorsed the

Nordic Model and the Council of Europe recommended other countries, including Canada, adopt approaches that make purchasing of sex illegal, with less focus on the sellers (Department of Justice, Canada, 2014). The United Nations has also endorsed this approach, and in October 2014 Northern Ireland also passed bills criminalizing the purchasing of sex (ibid.).

The Swedish Committee of Inquiry was established in 2008 to evaluate the impacts of the Nordic Model since 1999, and subsequently reported that prostitution, sexual exploitation, and human trafficking had decreased. In July of 2014, the Norwegian Government released a similar report evaluating the impact of the ban on the purchasing of sexual services that they had implemented in 2009 (Department of Justice, Canada, 2014). The Norwegian report stated, in addition to reduced demand for sexual services, that no increased violence against street prostitutes had been observed (ibid.). Some have argued that legalizing the selling, and criminalizing the purchasing of sex would push the industry further underground, thus making regulation even more difficult and placing survivors in greater danger (Levy & Jacobsson, 2013). Laws related to the sex industry are increasingly difficult to monitor and enforce with the advancement of the Internet.

In December 2014, Canada's new laws around sexual exploitation came into effect. Bill C-36, the *Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act* (Department of Justice, Canada, 2014) received Royal Assent in 2014. It is a version of the Nordic Model, targeting the market, making the purchasing or profiting from the sale of sex from a person illegal, and providing immunity from prosecution to the sellers of sex. In their technical paper, analyzing the decision, the Department of Justice states, "Bill C-36 reflects a significant paradigm shift away from the treatment of prostitution as 'nuisance,' as found by the Supreme Court of Canada in *Bedford*, toward treatment of prostitution as a form of sexual exploitation that disproportionately

and negatively impacts women and girls” (Canada, Department of Justice, 2014, p. 3). The Department of Justice report on the Supreme Court Bedford decision (2014) provides the conclusions of the Court, based on the evidence presented during the appeal. It highlights that most affected victims in Canada are women and children from marginalized groups, many of whom are Indigenous (ibid.).

Criticisms flowed immediately following the implementation of the *Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act* (Department of Justice, Canada, 2014). Some alleged that legalizing, selling, and criminalizing the purchasing of sex places women in danger. Emily Symons, the chair of POWER (Prostitutes of Ottawa-Gatineau Work Educate and Resist), issued statements that prostitution should be outright legalized. Symons stated the new measures will “absolutely put sex workers in Canada at greater risk of violence, and that is totally unacceptable” (Winnipeg Sun, 2014).

Several agencies, including the John Howard Society and the Canadian AIDS Society called for repeal of the new laws and full decriminalization of sex work in Canada. In a joint statement they wrote, "Bill C-36 views all sex workers as victims of violence rather than understanding that it is criminalization, isolation and denial of rights and freedoms that breed violence and exploitation against sex workers" (ibid.). On the other hand, Kirkup (2014) wrote, “Across Canada, sex workers and their allies are already mourning the passage of the *Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act*. They know it will make their working conditions even more dangerous than they already are” (p. 1). How to most effectively use the laws and find the balance that has the outcome of reduced sex industry activity and victimization is a subject for further study.

3.4 Peace building theories that can help us work together

Human relationships can be understood essentially in terms of the interplay of power between individuals and groups (Matyok, Senehi & Byrne, 2011). This thesis explores conflict and power disparities in relation to sexual exploitation and human trafficking. A broad overview of the PACS field reveals a problem-solving perspective, with a broad overarching goal of improving social justice for oppressed people. Concepts such as ‘structural violence,’ ‘culture’ and ‘peace’ are clarified in order to analyze and to understand social disparity and socially constructed divisions such as race, socio-economic class, gender and sexuality, identity and power.

This research examines sex trafficking and exploitation through a PACS lens. Therefore, a brief history of how the field has evolved will provide context. The PACS field has grown over the past 40 years (Wiberg, 2005), through three distinct periods in the 1970s, 1980s, and 1990s. The 1970s, saw the study of interstate war and security give way to a new era focusing on concepts such as peace and structural violence (see Galtung, 1996). In the 1980s PACS became a multi-disciplinary field so broad that no single institute or scholar could possibly grasp the entire discipline (Wiberg, 2005). Thus, some institutes focused on the broad multi-disciplinary study of PACS while others concentrated on specific skill building in conflict analysis, conflict resolution, negotiation and mediation (Wiberg, 2005). The third major change in PACS occurred after the end of the Cold War, in the 1990s, when considerable debate occurred around what the future focus of the PACS field should be.

While PACS studies involve examination of countries and nations that have been torn apart by war, my research approach has been somewhat unique in that I am applying the tools and knowledge of peace building to the community of Winnipeg, which has been in a relative state of peace. The issues read and talked about in seminars around structural violence, conflict, and

colonial oppression also apply to local contexts and community safety initiatives in Winnipeg, not only in places that are or were recently at war (Volkan (1997). For example, PACS scholars often apply the descriptions of positive vs. negative peace that were developed by Johan Galtung (1996) in relation to post war societies. Galtung points out that ‘positive peace’ includes the lack of fighting and improving standards of living beyond the mere absence of war (negative peace). These ideas extend to the phenomenon of crime reduction and victimization in modern day Canada, linking Galtung’s concept of positive peace to the phenomenon of sex trafficking in Manitoba. While people in mainstream Canada enjoy a high standard of living and positive peace, survivors in the sex industry do not. This disparity represents structural violence (Reimer et al., 2015; Galtung, 1996).

A great benefit of working in a multi-disciplinary field is being able to draw on the best tools from multiple approaches. In this research, I draw on the concept of intersectionality from the sociology field, and community building collective impact models (Chrislip, 2002) that are successful in creating social change, augmenting them with PACS conflict analysis and conflict resolution techniques and theories (Byrne & Senehi, 2012, Sandole et al., 2009; Kriesberg, 1998; Byrne, Carter & Senehi, 2003), and conflict transformation models (Saunders, 2003; Lowry & Littlejohn, 2003; Rothman & Olson, 2001). These were also combined with a multi-track intervention and peace building processes for making inclusive political change (Diamond & McDonald, 1996; Byrne & Keashly, 2000).

Theory and perspectives from the public administration field are also used with regards to political analysis, organizational culture, and change management (Lawson, 2004; Greene et al., 1999; Bishop, 1994). The study of politics is the exploration of power and how it is used; in this way, the discipline is closely aligned with PACS, which is largely the analysis of power and

conflict. Multidisciplinary approaches build upon the strengths of individual theories and practices and have the potential to forge *gestalts* in which the whole becomes greater than the sum of its parts.

Another important framework for analyzing conflict is story or narrative-based peace-building, which is an intervention approach that has also developed within PACS (Senehi, 2002, 2009; Reimer, 2015). The narrative, story-based approach of this qualitative research draws upon this growing field of inquiry. By gathering a mass of personal stories from a broad range of actors, this study provides a deeper understanding of a complex and multi-faceted issue. Tying together impactful statements and observations from survivors and a broad range of other actors, the thesis creates a tapestry of insights that form a community narrative around the issue. Built into the research is a feedback loop in which I've stayed in contact with my 61 participants, advising them of the progress and the literature that flows from the research. This initiative intends to contribute to the growing public discourse and momentum for change around a challenging social issue.

3.4.1 *Conflict analysis*

Byrne and Senehi (2009) note that conflict arises “in different contexts, and occurs at the intrapersonal, interpersonal, intergroup, organizational, and international levels” (p. 3). It exists when incompatible goals develop between persons, groups, or nations (Deutsch & Coleman, 2000). Byrne and Senehi (2009) emphasize that analyzing conflicts requires understanding of how they originated, escalated or reduced, as well as the characteristics and values of the parties or groups involved. Transforming conflict requires an understanding of the root causes and numerous factors that might include the conflicted parties' goals, intervention styles and preferred problem solving strategies (Byrne & Senehi, 2009). They provide a valuable overview

of conflict elements that interplay to varying degrees and how they are resolved, including theory, agency, rationality, structure, systems, group dynamics, practice, prenegotiation, negotiation, mediation, facilitative collaborative problem solving, and the importance of hearing other voices (ibid.). Examining these components can help us understand conflict in terms of how individuals and groups interact, and can form a framework for analysis and resolution (Sandole, 2003).

The core of conflict analysis and resolution (CAR) “is pulling together all of these multiple perspectives, diverse opinions, and interdisciplinary lenses by, in part, understanding the history of the field, its transdisciplinary origins, and the contribution to theory, practice, and methods to strengthen our knowledge and to acknowledge the field’s deep roots” (Byrne & Senehi 2009, p. 12). We must be able to analyze conflict effectively in order to understand the relevant dynamics and to find solutions that work. The “social cube” construct created by Byrne, Carter, and Senehi (2003) provides a structured rubric through which conflicts can be analyzed, ensuring consideration of multiple elements with varying weight and significance, yet all having some effect as they interrelate and affect the dynamics of a relationship. Byrne, Carter, and Senehi (2003) describe the application of the social cube in exploring the following six interrelated dynamics: (1) history, (2) religion, (3) demographics, (4) political institutions and non-institutional behavior, (5) economics, and (6) psychocultural factors.

These six facets or social forces of the conflict system described by Byrne, Carter and Senehi (2003) can be looked at together to identify patterns of behavior between groups. This construct can ensure that multiple significant dynamics are considered in conflict analysis and can help to overcome more shallow two-dimensional or even one dimensional approaches that scholars have often historically relied upon (ibid.). Seeking shared goals for multiple stakeholder

agencies addressing sexual exploitation, we likely fail if we attempt to analyze the conflicts in terms of only one dimension; we need to consider numerous aspects in order to understand such complex social issues (Byrne, Carter & Senehi, 2003).

Conflicts are not static; they are dynamic and ever changing. Kriesberg (1998) points out that people undergo changes in identity in response to conflicts they are involved in. He emphasizes the importance of constructive dialogue addressing concerns and grievances of conflicted parties so that they do not become more entrenched in their positions (Kriesberg, 1998). Service agencies, such as the police, child welfare, health, justice, and political leaders all have vested interests in the protection and safety of sexually exploited children and adults, yet they all have different mandates for achieving them. Knowledge of dynamics such as those that Kriesberg points out can allow participants or mediators to avoid making conflicts worse.

3.4.2 Getting the right people to the table

Identity and positionality are key elements in conflicts. Rothman and Olson (2001) have contributed significantly to understanding the role of identity in conflicts and how to manage and resolve them. Fisher (1996) has described interactive conflict resolution (ICR) models as effective. These are facilitated face-to-face activities in communication, training, education, or consultation that promote collaborative conflict analysis and problem solving among parties engaged in protracted conflict in a manner that addresses basic human needs and promotes the building of peace, justice, and equality (Fisher, 1996, p. 8). “ICR-type efforts that occurred between Israelis and Palestinians for many years prior are judged to have played a direct, significant, and successful role in this particular case (Rothman & Olson, 2001, p. 299).

Rothman and Olson’s ARIA (Antagonistic, Reflexive, Integrative, Action) ICR model delineates key stages of conflicts and their resolution, including (1) the antagonistic frame, in

which the conflicted parties' positions are drawn out, (2) the reflexive frame, in which both parties' desired outcomes are discovered, (3) the integrative frame, in which common ground is discovered, and (4) the action plan, in which creative problem solving seeks to achieve shared goals that were discovered in the earlier stages. This approach offers structured and workable tools that could be used to address even the most intractable conflicts. In the case of sexually exploited women and youth, their positions (antagonistic frame) may reveal distrust for the authorities as well as the lack of perceived ways to escape their exploitative relationships.

Police, child welfare, and NGO workers often describe frustration with the lack of collaboration and fragmented interagency resource systems. These antagonistic perspectives need to be brought out honestly, yet respectfully, if the truth about stakeholders' positions is to be known and addressed. It is only from an honest starting position that sustainable conflict resolution can be achieved. The ARIA process provides this starting position by having parties lay bare their strongest feelings about the root causes of a conflict.

We also must be careful about labelling or assigning positionality to people. For example, early childhood sexual abuse is a potential precursor to later involvement in the sex industry, but not all abuse is the same. For example, Richardson (2015) has described how sexually exploited youth are different from youth who are sexually abused yet not exploited. Sexually exploited youth are often complicit in that they are manipulated into willingly going along with being sexually exploited, while people who are subject to child abuse or rape are victimized violently against their will. As a result of this forced complicity and their unique experiences, often having been let down by police, social workers, and other adults who failed to intervene in their forced participation in survival sex, exploited women and girls, may have unique issues of guilt, shame, and the absence of trust in authorities and supporters.

Examining the actors involved in the sex industry, conflict between groups including race (Indigenous vs. Europeans), age (young vs. older), mandate (government vs. non-government), and service providers vs. clients can be delineated. Understanding the effects of identity, position—and process can assist in the analysis and resolutions of such conflicts. Factors such as position, identity and cultural values are critical in peace building. Care was taken to identify people with unique experience and perspectives to interview for this research at all levels.

Mediators should be aware of cultural values that prohibit working towards shared goals. For example, face-saving is important in high context cultures such as Canadian Indigenous people (Tuso, 2013; Rice, 2011). Sexually exploited people could be embarrassed due to the social stigmas. They may be distrustful and feel insecure about leaving the entrenched environment of the sex industry where they are confident and competent, albeit manipulated and abused. Face saving is a critical factor to consider in involving survivors in strategic planning and work around the sex industry. It is counterproductive to engage survivors in program development and other work around anti-trafficking, if the process is judgmental and embarrassing for them.

Sensitivity to and understanding of cultural norms can give local people advantages as mediators. For this reason, one model of conflict mediation cannot be designed to fit all cultural contexts (Lederach, 1996). Every event or process should be approached with sensitivity to diversity and cultural differences and nuances within each group (Tuso, 2013). Jeong (2000) also highlights the significance of group identities in conflict, stating identity can be used, “instrumentally to promote individual or collective interests” (Jeong, 2000, p. 72). Group identity is significant with respect to sexual exploitation, as the sex industry culture that children and women become entrenched in is powerful and exclusive (Richardson, 2015). Different elements

affect conflicts; therefore, analysis is critical to determining which dynamics are significant and how they may best be addressed.

Othering is another important concept related to understanding positions and perceptions in conflict. Said (1979) described the process by which people develop perceptions of the ‘other.’ This could hamper any conflict resolution process, and could also be a barrier to collaboration. It can be an obstacle to people on the fringes, such as sex industry workers, coming forward, and accepting assistance for fear of being labelled and ostracized.

Lederach (1995) has taught us that the answers to deep-rooted social problems, such as sexual exploitation, are already in the community and we must rely on local actors who understand the context and nuances of the culture to identify the solutions. This reverberates strongly for me, as it is common sense that people doing the work and people who have been exploited and trafficked in the sex industry will have insights into the barriers and opportunities that they experienced. They are likely well positioned to identify where improvements are needed. It is probable that successful strategies that are informed by the input of grassroots stakeholders “envisioning a shared future” are most effective (Lederach, 1997, p. 27). As Cook and Courchene have highlighted, this will require looking for answers within the Indigenous community (Cook & Courchene, 2006, p. 4-6). They will truly understand the impacts that our colonial history is having on Indigenous youth and how these impacts are playing forward transgenerationally, as Volkan might say, in the form of making youth vulnerable to sexual exploitation (Volkan, 1997).

Lederach describes the “moral imagination” in which participants view themselves as a part of the social web that will bring all the relevant parts together for greater peace. He describes how interventions must “work with the existing social geography, relational networks,

and be flexible enough to adapt to challenges that will emerge during the process” (Lederach, 2005, p.84). My research considers identity, social position, and culture in relating community actors to potential solutions.

3.4.3 Changing the outcomes through mediation

Analyzing conflicts and getting the right people to the table, we now need to consider how to resolve the conflict. This can involve several tools, most of which are designed to find common goals and reduce people’s inability or unwillingness to work together. Saunders highlights the importance of “sustained dialogue,” getting the right people in the discussion, and then keeping them engaged long enough to work through a five-stage problem-solving process including the following: (1) deciding to reach out and create a space for dialogue, (2) coming together and mapping out the problems to be resolved, (3) probing the specific problem, (4) planning interactions, and (5) devising ways to empower people to act on the plans created (Saunders, 2003, p. 86). He describes the importance of connecting people from diverse groups in the process, and not just high-level negotiators. Saunders (2003) has described how sustained dialogue has helped bring together two sides of an intractable conflict in the newly formed nation state of Tajikistan, since 1993. While it is a multi-stage process, the fundamental idea is in creating a space for dialogue and then keeping parties involved until they start to see the others’ side. Sustained dialogue is a process that was originally born out of Saunders’ experiences facilitating dialogue in the protracted Arab-Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

Saunders (2003) also notes that conflict can occur within and between identity groups. Therefore, one should avoid the tendency to think of any group as homogenous. People involved in agencies, communities and groups, including those who have been trafficked and sexually exploited, all have different experiences and perspectives. When analyzing policies, strategies

and approaches to issues such as sexual exploitation, we must avoid the inclination to think that all people in any organization or group are the same. For instance, the police may have a policy, yet unless all officers in the agency believe in the approach, it will lose effectiveness, as everyone will not be rowing in the same direction. Processes must ensure that all actors within an organization will buy-in and abide by policies that are implemented.

Sustained dialogue is one potential tool for achieving this outcome (Saunders, 2003). Sustained dialogue might be a key strategy for developing trust and finding shared goals among stakeholders, including relationships between victims and service providers, and between all of the various stakeholder agencies (Saunders, 2003). Unpacking and understanding the nature of the positions of all the various stakeholders who work together to help exploited youth, might be discovered through the exercise of the antagonistic frame of Rothman and Olson's ARIA model described earlier (Rothman & Olson, 2001, p. 92-97).

The enduring tension between social work and policing professionals could also potentially be addressed utilizing these CAR/PACS techniques. Both professions have a stake and a responsibility in addressing sexual exploitation, and both stand to gain from more effective collaboration, yet there is a persistent counter-productive tension that could potentially be reduced with effective techniques and processes. Inter-agency conflict between NGOs can also be addressed in this same way. Interpersonal conflict is common between people in the same organizations and between people from different organizations. While inter-agency partnerships require people to work together, they often have serious conflict between one another. These conflicts can potentially be overcome through appropriate interventions.

Moving now to the 50,000-foot view, how do we consider reducing conflict to make the whole interagency system work better? Diamond and McDonald (1996) provide a framework of

multi-track diplomacy that we may follow to achieve these aims. Their nine-track model for achieving peacebuilding objectives, considers all of the stakeholders that play significant roles in resolving conflicts and achieving systemic change. The nine-track model engages combinations of people from the following sectors of society: (1) official government diplomats, (2) unofficial, non-governmental experienced or skilled citizens, (3) private business, (4) citizen-to-citizen cultural or educational exchanges, (5) media, (6) activism or advocacy, (7) faith based organizations, (8) philanthropy, and (9) peacemaking through information sharing such as through media and social movements.

Improved coordination of multi-track intervention approaches may be the key to achieving resolution of some of society's most challenging conflicts and social problems. This multi-sectorial approach could effectively coordinate all the key elements required to change the public discourse and impact the sex industry (Byrne & Keashly, 2000). Multi-modal approaches hold great promise for social change as they can affect the public discourse, which I suspect, is key in achieving significant progress. For example, disparity persists for Canada's Indigenous people and the way forward may lie in bringing the stakeholders together to find shared goals, through multi-track intervention (Diamond & McDonald, 1996; Christmas, 2014). Similarly, the right stakeholders must be brought together around the issue of sexual exploitation and trafficking, for sustainable reform and efficient use of existing resources.

3.5 Achieving change and overcoming organizational culture

The significance of organizational culture is underrepresented in the literature on sexual exploitation, yet understanding and respecting culture is likely the key to finding common ground (Engle Merry, 2009). For example, Avruch (1998) notes that there are 150 or more

known definitions of culture, and some elements are more salient than others as sources of conflict. If mediators can ascertain which cultural issues are truly relevant to conflicted parties, they may have a better chance of resolving the disagreement.

Culture, according to Avruch (1998), is “a learned shared system of actions, meanings and practices, which are socially and psychologically distributed within a group, and is transmitted laterally and intergenerationally” (p. 17). While individuals embrace culture, it is also shared within groups and communities (ibid.). Conflict exists in every human group, whether between individuals, communities, agencies or states. Understanding what is important in these cultures might assist in finding shared ground for conflict transformation.

Most government and non-government organizations have some natural resistance to organizational change. Some research has found that as much as ninety percent of corporate strategy changes fail because administrators did not plan to mitigate the psychological impacts that the changes would have on people (Cameron & Green, 2004). For example, Schein (1985) found that preparing people psychologically for changes in their workplace reduces anxiety, making new policies and practices easier and less painful to integrate. In Schein’s change management model, management first creates awareness of the need for change among employees (the ‘unfreezing’ stage). Changes are then implemented, after which ‘refreezing’ occurs in the final phase and then the changes are internalized over time (Schein, 1985, cited in Cameron & Green, 2004). If police, social workers, and people affected by sexual exploitation report that all the stakeholders need to work in different ways together, then recommendations from this research may include change management processes, such as Schein’s change management model to implement the changes effectively.

Identity is another significant issue in conflict resolution and change. Jeong (2000)

highlighted the significance of group identities in conflict, stating that identity can be used, “instrumentally to promote individual or collective interests” (Jeong, 2000, p. 72). Agencies that could be working collectively together on sexual exploitation, such as the police and social work agencies, also have strong group and professional cultures. Change in these environments can be problematic and requires careful planning. Effective conflict analysis and change management processes could identify the cultural values of these individual actors and groups and assist in finding common goals and values, allowing for more effective collaboration.

3.6 Changing outcomes through collaboration and collective impact

Collective impact is a contemporary term for collaborative cross-agency team building with a goal of affecting social issues. Chrislip (2002), a pioneer in collective impact work, writes how collaboration is now a means for “building social capital” and “transforming civic culture” around social problems. Multi-agency systemic change will require work to find a shared vision and goals, and change may be achieved using some combination of conflict analysis and resolution strategies. On collective impact work, Chrislip (2002) wrote, “If you bring the appropriate people together in constructive ways with good information, they will create authentic visions and strategies for addressing the shared concerns of the organizations and the community” (in Christmas & Ponce-Joly, 2015, p. 25). My research identifies opportunities for improved collaborative, multidisciplinary, cross-sectoral approaches to intervene in sexual exploitation and human trafficking.

A broad spectrum of services affect sex industry survivors, yet those services do not always work well together; sometimes they needlessly work against each other. In a study that was characterized as the first Canadian attempt at analyzing the response to human trafficking in

a large urban center, Kaye, Winterdyk, and Quarterman (2014) surveyed 53 respondents from various agencies involved in anti-trafficking. They found that, “while a criminal justice framework is important for addressing human trafficking, local strategies will benefit from an emphasis on cross-sector collaboration that emphasizes the rights of the trafficked persons above the needs of law enforcement” (p. 36).

New solutions might involve stakeholders envisioning themselves as equal participants in collective community-based approaches. For instance, Lederach (2005) describes how interventions can work at the community level and must be flexible so that they can adapt to changing needs that occur during the peace-building process. The same principles apply to community-based collaborative interventions to address sexual exploitation. People in government and non-government agencies alike are continually asked to do more with less. Collaborative, multidisciplinary, collective approaches may gain efficiency from systems of existing resources, by reducing policy gaps and redundancy between service providers, and by finding shared goals that multi-agency systems can strive for together.

The Boston Gun Project (also known as Operation Ceasefire) is a relevant case study for this collective impact work. In the late 1980s, the city of Boston and surrounding municipalities experienced a crisis of shootings in which every month an African American youth (under 18) was shot, killed or injured. Many of these young men were gang involved and most were from impoverished neighbourhoods. Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) saw these youth as an endangered species. They framed violence prevention strategies on the premise that violence is a health issue; they were innovative in that: (1) they involved the medical community (and later other disciplines) in preventative rather than reactive approaches, and (2) they motivated collaboration between all of the various stakeholders, changing the culture and the public

discourse to one in which violence was generally not acceptable. The Boston Gun Project brought police resources together with other agencies and groups, resulting in a 63 percent decline in youth homicides over three years (Linden, 2012; Kennedy et al., 2001). It involved aggressive enforcement and prosecution strategies along with increased community partnership that brought multiple service sectors together with a common goal of reducing violence.

Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) challenged common assumptions about violence afflicted youth—and provided alternative answers to them. Their findings are illustrated in Table 4, which I created from their book. They found that (1) the answers are in the community and people need empowerment to solve problems themselves or with the support of government, not prescribed solutions imposed by government, (2) there is no single best practice, (3) problems that took a long time to develop will take a long time to solve, (4) punishing offenders alone does not fix the problem, they need intervention, (5) violence is not inevitable, it results from social conditions, and (6) poverty in itself does not cause violence, even if it correlates with it (see Table 4). Declaring youth violence as a health problem challenged traditional healthcare paradigms that historically tolerated high violence rates among African Americans and those in low socio-economic groups (Prothrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004). These findings support the importance of seeing sexually exploited youth as victims rather than as perpetrators.

Understanding the root causes of violence and how vulnerability leads to victimization can lead to potential solutions for these conflicted exploitive relationships. Assumptions about social dynamics, such as increased crowding in poor neighbourhoods correlating with higher violence rates have been challenged. For example, in Hong Kong there is more crowding and less violence than in the U.S. (Prothrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004). Physiological, biological, genetic and chemical connections with violence have also failed to provide reliable explanations for it (ibid.).

Textbooks focusing on the study of violence have agreed with Prothrow-Stith and Spivak's finding. For example, Englander (2006) emphasized in her book about violence, that high correlations do not necessarily provide causal explanations.

The violence reduction programs undertaken in the Boston area focused on interrupting the cycle of violence by humanizing youth, shifting attention away from punitively fixing blame and more into supporting the needs of the involved youth (Prothrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004). Pulling relevant disciplines together for better collaboration, and viewing violent perpetrators also as victims achieved astounding results (ibid.). Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) advocate multiple systems approaches, as they wrote, "In an avalanche, not one snowflake feels responsible" (p. 61). They also highlight the need not only for multidisciplinary collaboration, but also for multiple systems to all have a shared vision of intervention and violence prevention. They underlined the significance of context and how youth are all different, pointing out that "how children approach problems and tasks is as important as learning to read and add" (ibid.).

The case study presented by the CWF (2014) also illustrates that youth who have been sexually exploited or trafficked have experiences most youth and adults will never have. Therefore, they need unique approaches for intervention and treatment (Richardson, 2015). Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) highlight that "demonizing youth" or criminalizing them only exacerbates their problems (p. 144-45). This also makes sense with respect to sexually exploited young women. Punishing them with stiffer penalties only causes further oppression.

Canada's laws were recently changed to better reflect the perspective that exploited children, youth, and women are victims rather than criminals. While effective in the short-term, Linden (2012) points out the positive violence reductions achieved in Boston were not sustained in the long-term as priorities eventually shifted among partnering agencies. Police, and

community groups eventually became less engaged, placing resources on other priorities.

Nonetheless, valuable lessons from the Boston experience hold promise of informing aspects of successful interventions for children and women being exploited in the sex industry.

3.6.1 Engaging the public to change the story

In the 21st century, there is growing sensitivity and understanding across society about how selling sex involves power disparity and assaults universal values of basic human rights and dignity. The public discourse in Canada has seen increased awareness and debate, in recent years, over economic disparity, the impacts of colonization on Indigenous people, and a completely different view of sex industry workers as victims and not criminals.

Sexual exploitation is a global as well as a Canadian social problem, highlighting disparity and broad social and power divisions along intersecting lines including gender, race, and economic class. Dissecting power disparities at the root of such conflicts can shed light on how the oppression of people happens and may be reduced. Some scholars have focused their research on this growing discourse, and a “world culture” agrees universally that enslavement and sexual exploitation breaches basic global human rights (Amahazion, 2014). Yet, large segments of society are still blind to the extent that sexual exploitation and trafficking goes on.

A significant aspect of public engagement and discourse is often not so much the wrong story, but that no story is even acknowledged. It seems that if public apathy is reduced and all of the significant elements in society are engaged, any problem is more solvable (Klatt, Caverner & Eganc, 2014). Lederach (1996) emphasized the need for citizen empowerment so that people can participate more in solving society’s problems. The public discourse should engage the whole of society working together to address community wide challenges.

The public narrative seems critical in motivating agencies in all aspects, from funding to

goal setting. The Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls movement described previously is a case in point. Advocacy over the past decade has moved the issue of violence against Indigenous women into the public eye, to the point that in September, 2016 a \$58 million national inquiry was initiated by the federal government.

3.7 Conclusion

The themes arising from this research highlight the need for multidisciplinary partnership, collaboration and coordination of resources for exploited and trafficked young women who currently co-exist in a fragmented system. There are a lot of good services, yet no one can access them all or even know what exactly exists. There are also gaps in the various systems.

Participants in this research highlight resources and programs that could be added, some of which were recommended in existing literature.

Shared goals and better overall collaboration are required, and could be achieved by getting the right people to the table for conflict transformation processes such as “sustained dialogue” (Saunders, 2003; Lowry & Littlejohn, 2003). For example, Rothman and Olson (2001) pointed out the importance of bringing out the issues that are at the root cause of conflicts. This requires honesty and, sometimes, expert mediation. This research explores the issues underlying sexual exploitation, and attempts to bring out ideas on how true collaboration is better achieved.

Unraveling the complex interacting elements that form the “social cube” (Byrne, Carter & Senehi, 2003) around multi-faceted social issues, such as sexual exploitation, requires careful analysis of all the interconnected elements. The interviews from this research reveal some contradictory goals and visions between service providers, government and non-government actors and victims. In unraveling some of these contrary positions, we reveal the tension points

that could be resolved between groups, and multi-track diplomacy might help in that process (Diamond & McDonald, 1996). The significance of culture has been underrepresented in the literature on sexual exploitation, yet understanding culture is key in finding common ground among service providers for solutions (Avruch, 1998). This research highlights survivors' and experts' stories describing the sex industry culture and how difficult it is to escape from it.

Change resistance, groupthink, and the difficulties of making organizational changes are well documented (Janis, 1982; Lawson, 2004; Bishop, 1994). For example, Lawson (2004) described how collaboration between stakeholders, whether they are individuals, groups, families, professions, organizations, governmental systems, or nations, must have a "stake in the action" to develop effective working relationships. I have seen the impacts of differing corporate cultures not only on preventing internal change within organizations, but also in counteracting multi-agency collaboration. This research also seeks to understand and address conflicts that arise in organizational cultures.

Chapter 4 - Research Methodology

4.1 Introduction

In this qualitative research study, I interviewed relevant stakeholders in Manitoba to ascertain their experiences, perceptions, and ideas about what can be done to prevent, reduce and interrupt sexual exploitation. Open-ended questions were used in semi-structured interviews to gather the stories of people directly involved, either as survivors of the sex industry or as practitioners helping survivors or preventing sexual exploitation. Analyzing those stories inductively, allowed for rich insights. This chapter describes how the research was completed, including who was interviewed and how the interviews were handled, ethical considerations and how the data was analyzed and ultimately used.

At a conference of justice practitioners, on evidence based policing (coordinated by the WPS, 2016-09-09 at the Can Add Inn Polo Park Winnipeg) Dr. Laura Huey, Director of the Canadian Society of Evidence Based Policing, mentioned that scholars recommend that you must first ask the question and then match the appropriate method for the research to the question. This thesis seeks to ascertain the subjective observations, impressions and descriptions of the current state of sexual exploitation and sex trafficking in Manitoba in 2016. Therefore, a qualitative approach was deemed early on as the best approach.

4.2 Qualitative research strategy

This thesis sought to ascertain people's subjective observations and descriptions of the current state of sexual exploitation and sex trafficking in Manitoba in 2016, and what interventions could stop it. A qualitative approach was selected as the best approach to complete the study. Semi-

structured interviews sought to gather insights and perspectives from experiential survivors of the sex industry, police officers, councilors, and social workers working for government and non-government organizations working with sex industry survivors. I also interviewed prosecutors, policy and lawmakers and leaders in the provincial and federal governments and the Indigenous community, with the intention of gaining a full picture of the social phenomenon of sex trafficking, as well as how all the stakeholders interact with each other when addressing the sexual exploitation of young women in Manitoba.

This study draws on a social integrationist view of the environment, meaning the subjective interpretations of my research subjects is considered. Social integrationists view human experience as a reflective, subjective, and reactive journey in which interactions are interpreted and understood subjectively (Blumer, 1969). While dated, this perspective by Blumer is relevant today. My research sought to gather my participants' stories, observations and recommendations.

The approach for this research was inspired in part by previous studies, such as Wiseman's *Stations of the Lost: The Treatment of Skid Row Alcoholics* (1970). In that book, Wiseman reported on her in-depth study of alcoholic men and a broad spectrum of services in an area of Los Angeles known as "skid row." She wrote, "to study human beings in any area of their social life it is necessary to view that area of life in terms of their experience and from their point of view" (p. xii). Through qualitative, story-based narrative interviews Wiseman created an insightful and rich picture for the reader of the social situation around skid row. My intent was to conduct a similar type of a multi-perspective study around sexual exploitation and human sex trafficking. This research is a similarly broad exploratory case study, proposing to share the same kind of rich insights into the world of human sex trafficking and sexual exploitation in Manitoba.

A qualitative research approach has been found to be effective in examining local conceptions of coordination in peace building (Ripsman & Blanchard, 2003). Qualitative research is “human centered,” phenomenological, and highlights the perceptions and human agency of research participants (Palys & Atchison, 2008). Mac Ginty and Williams (2009), for example, have written that person-centered qualitative approaches can better capture “local voices and Indigenous solutions” (Mac Ginty & Williams, 2009, p. 8).

It was clear from the onset that women and children in the sex industry face numerous intersectional challenges, which were expected to come out in the interviews. Scholars have suggested that qualitative research is ideal for the study of intersectionality because it allows us to explore and capture the rich multidimensional nature of humanity and people in their unique contexts (Hunting, 2014; Hankivsky, 2011; McCall, 2005). Qualitative research is said to be suited to research that has a goal, as this study does, of informing improved social justice (Hankivsky et al., 2011; Rogers & Kelly, 2011).

Hunting (2014) characterizes qualitative, “intersectionality-informed” research as allowing for “nuanced understandings of health and social issues, providing a foundation for more effective and relevant public policies that advance social justice. Consequently, interest in and uptake of intersectionality-informed qualitative research has increased across academia, community settings, and governments” (p. 16). My research explores intersectional challenges that women and youth face in the sex industry in Manitoba.

4.2.1 *Grounded inductive method*

This study was intended to highlight people’s subjective perceptions; therefore, a grounded approach was taken, utilizing inductive analysis of the observations gathered from the participants (Creswell, 2007; Charmaz, 2005; Glaser, 1992; Glaser & Strauss, 1967). Patton

(1980) wrote that grounded theory uses, “inductive analysis, which means patterns, themes and categories of analysis come from the data; they emerge out of the data rather than being imposed on them prior to collection and analysis” (p. 306). I asked some structured questions, to gain specific detail on relevant issues that I wanted to explore. The questions were open ended, allowing interviewees the opportunity to provide a story, offering rich subjective insights that could not be obtained in any other way (Senehi, 2009). The questions asked are outlined in a script that I used for every interview (see Appendix C & D).

My conception of a grounded approach is that I am an empty receptacle, gathering the perceptions, stories, experiences, and comments of participants, and then analyzing them later with an open mind to ascertain themes. Further, it involves listening to and reading the interviews and reflecting on the stories provided. I was careful to retain the intent and meaning in them. For example, throughout the thesis I preferred to use the subjects’ words with direct quotations rather than interpreting and paraphrasing the answers myself. This way, the reader can see for him/herself the story that was told and apply his/her own interpretation of the meaning.

4.3 Geographic location of the study

The sex industry exists everywhere, yet it differs from region to region. Manitoba is unique within Canada with issues and challenges that differ from other regions. For example, the history, demographics, and economic conditions are slightly different within every province and territory, and, therefore, should be studied regionally as opposed to nationally (CBC, 2014a; Welch, 2014; RCMP, 2013; Paperny, 2009). The service providers I interviewed all have geographic jurisdictions, some are municipal and some are provincial, yet all are within Manitoba. Some political and RCMP leaders technically have a federal jurisdiction, yet their

insights and experiences were explored within the context of their work within Manitoba. The RCMP, for instance, have programs that are unique to Manitoba, such as Project Devote, the Exploited Persons Pro-active Strategy (EPPS), and a provincial Counter Exploitation Coordinator. A former federal Member of Parliament, Joy Smith (Joy Smith Foundation) offered insights on federal programs. However, a finding of this research was the importance and need for broad federal programs to be responsive to unique local dynamics. Therefore, this research focused on the geographic region of Manitoba.

About 80 percent of the practitioners I interviewed work in and around Winnipeg. About 20 percent work (or worked) mainly in rural parts of Manitoba. About 20 percent had provincial jurisdiction, operating across Manitoba. All the interviews were physically conducted in Winnipeg.

4.3.1 Demography and gender of the research participants

This research focused on the exploitation of women and girls in the sex industry. While boys and men are clearly also victimized, the incidence is much lower and different in some ways, as highlighted in the context chapter. Eighty percent or more of sex industry survivors are female (Smith, 2014a; McIntyre, 2012; Cullen-DuPont, 2009; Badgley, 1984).

The Task Force on Sex Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada (CWF, 2014) concluded that the number one risk factor to being exploited in the sex industry is “being female.” Some research has been done on sexual exploitation and trafficking of males and LGBTQ2S (Lesbian, Gay, Bi-sexual, Transgendered, Queer, 2-Spirited) people in the sex industry; however, it is limited and is clearly an area for future research (McIntyre, 2012). Practitioners and survivors I talked to in planning this research mentioned that men and boys are victimized as well as women and girls, but to a much lesser extent. The demographics of those

who have been victimized in the sex industry in Manitoba are primarily female, and a large percentage of these survivors are Indigenous.

Only subjects who were over the age of consent (18) and who were out of the sex industry were interviewed. I chose to limit the scope to people who are not currently involved actively in the sex industry as youth and women who are actively involved in the sex industry could be exposed to significant risks by cooperating with research that aims to reduce sex trafficking.

While this research did not focus specifically on Indigenous people, most survivors and many of the practitioners interviewed were of Indigenous ancestry. This is consistent with previous research findings. Cook and Courchene (2006), for example, found that 70 percent or more of sexually exploited youth/women in Manitoba have Indigenous ancestry. This thesis contains substantial sections dedicated to gender related violence and the intersectional challenges faced by females, as well as structural challenges that are unique to Indigenous people.

4.3.2 Participant selection

For this research, I explore relationships between individuals and groups including (1) political and Indigenous leaders, (2) government and non-government organization (NGO) service providers, and (3) experiential survivors of the sex industry. I sought out practitioners through research and word of mouth. As the interviews progressed most subjects mentioned people who are knowledgeable and experienced that I should interview. My ethics approval allowed me to seek out and approach people who are known to be working as practitioners, but not people who are sex industry survivors or who are private citizens and not widely known public advocates. I did not directly approach any survivor to request an interview. A referral letter (see Appendix E) was given to interview participants to pass on to survivors who they felt might wish to provide

an interview. Several survivors contacted me requesting to participate in the study after receiving the referral letter.

As a policy, I offered to interview all survivors who contacted me wishing to participate in the research. I did this partly because I felt, as the research progressed, that the survivors' perspectives are most critical. I did this also because participating in the research was important for survivors who reached out, and I wanted to facilitate the potential therapeutic catharsis and sense of contribution and community engagement on the issue for them. The survivors who reached out expressed sincere appreciation for the research and for the opportunity to participate, and some of them contacted me several times after they were interviewed. Their engagement felt increasingly important, both from a community-building and a therapeutic aspect, as the research went on.

Participants were selected based on their positions as well as by referral (snowball sampling). For instance, in policing I spoke with police officers who currently work or in the past worked in assignments related to counter-sexual exploitation and human trafficking. I interviewed people who are known to be knowledgeable and experienced in the field, and in some cases they referred me to others who are articulate and insightful in the field. Saturation of themes was reached naturally. Of the 61 interviews, 6 were political leaders, 23 were social workers, 24 were police, and 8 were survivors, although some of the practitioners are also survivors. See Table 2 for a break down.

4.3.3 Participant payment and costs

No benefits, financial or otherwise, were provided to the participants. They were offered a feeling of inclusion, as I highlighted that their insights would become part of the final product and that, in cases where they consented, their contributions would be attributed to them in the

resulting published literature. Costs of the research project were approximately \$4,000, including a high-quality microphone (\$100), storage devices (\$150), editing software (\$200), transcription software (\$50 x 5 = \$250), labour for transcription (\$2,000), stationery (\$500), gas and parking (\$550), ceremonial tobacco for offerings to Indigenous elders (\$50) and other miscellaneous expenses (\$200). I applied for several awards, yet I received no funding to cover any of these costs.

4.4 Role and position of the researcher

Scholars have highlighted that the position and relative power of the interviewer/researcher and the participants is significant in any study (Hunting, 2014; Jootun, McGhee & Marland, 2009; Karneili-Miller, Strier & Pessach, 2009). My research required that I remain cognizant of my own positionality and white male privilege. At the time of the interviews I was a sworn police officer and the people I proposed to interview had potential preconceived feelings as a result of their individual previous experiences with the police. Survivors often have either good or bad preconceptions about the police as most report having been prosecuted, harassed, apprehended or helped by police officers. For these reasons, I was careful to consider positionality and the way I influenced the interviews with questions, body language, demeanor, and context.

Ensuring I was cognizant of the dynamics of positionality that might influence the interview process, I consulted the existing literature on interview methods (Morris, 2009). For example, Hunting (2014) highlights the importance in qualitative research, of considering intersectionality, and situating the researcher in relation to the subject. One must carefully analyze the intersections and power relationships that might affect the interview. I was careful to consider these dynamics of the interview process, respecting the participants' wishes regarding

the place and time for the interviews, my dress and demeanor, and ensuring they did not feel intimidated.

This research involved two main categories of participants: (1) experiential survivors of the sex industry, and (2) practitioners and community leaders at all levels. These lines became somewhat blurred in some cases as the interviews unfolded because I learned that practitioners that work directly with survivors in treatment programs, often are sex trafficking survivors themselves. This did not create any problems that I am aware of. In some cases, my participants and I negotiated and agreed upon issues that they would wish to be identified with and which aspects they wished to be anonymized in the resulting published literature. For example, some practitioners advised that they would like to be attributed with their comments in subsequent literature, but not with the parts in which they were talking about their own previous involvement as a victim/survivor of the sex industry. In some cases, people had put that part of their life behind them and had no wish for people to know about this aspect of their past. I carefully respected these wishes.

Some of the participants are highly respected and have status in their workplaces based upon their experience and having survived the sex industry. Some of these people might feel disempowered or even subtly shamed if they were interviewed in a government office or outside of their normal workplace, which is often a context where they are comfortable and powerful. Most survivors and survivor/practitioners suggested that the interviews take place in their workplace; I suspect the previously described dynamic was at play, and I accommodated their requests every time. All interviews were conducted at times and places suggested by the participants.

The interviewer must be aware of his/her own biases as well as the social and historical

contexts in which the interviews take place (Tickner, 2006; Lal, 1999). Researchers must also be aware of the generalization they may place on participants. For example, Phillips (1996) found that feminist researchers must guard against the tendency to “essentialize” the perspective of women being interviewed. Indigenous subject interviews also require sensitivity to our colonial past, and the reality that many Indigenous people may see the interviewer as privileged and/or biased from Western views (Wilson, 2008). At the same time, this Indigenous participant perspective must not be assumed as every individual is different.

One other significant issue was the fact that I am a sworn police officer. As such, I am duty-bound and legally bound by the Criminal Code of Canada to act on information about serious crimes that may be disclosed to me. I addressed this concern in my application to the Ethics Review Board (REB), by explaining that if an interview subject were to disclose involvement in serious prosecutable crimes, I would stop them and advise them of their constitutional rights to not self-incriminate. While I did not anticipate this happening, it was remotely possible and the REB office advised that it is not uncommon for criminal activity to be divulged during research and that adding a caution about my background and position to the consent form would account for this ethical issue (see Appendix A & B).

No interview subject was cautioned regarding their legal rights with respect to criminal admissions, or arrested as a result of the interviews s/he provided. I personally conducted all of the interviews. There were no cases in which participants declined to sign the consent form. One interview was conducted by telephone and therefore the consent was done verbally.

My positionality as a serving police officer was addressed in my research proposal and human ethics research application with respect to managing possible real or perceived power imbalances between my subjects and I during the interview process. I anticipated that most

people would perceive me as being in a position of influence, or being neutral in the system because I was a police officer. I believe that people were forthcoming and open with me because of my position, and perhaps more so because of my reputation in the community for seeking social justice and improving services to the vulnerable. I was cognizant of these dynamics and careful to be objective and fair.

No one is purely neutral and objective. Victor Frankl was a psychiatrist and a World War Two concentration camp survivor. He wrote about his experiences and how people survived extreme oppression in the concentration camps. Frankl addressed positionality in his seminal work, *Man's Search for Meaning*, in which he states the following (Frankl, 1959, p. 24).

To attempt a methodological presentation of the subject is very difficult, as psychology requires certain scientific detachment. But does a man who makes his observations while he himself is a prisoner possess the necessary detachment? Such detachment is granted to the outsider, but he is too far removed to make any statements of real value. Only the man inside knows. His judgements may not be objective; his evaluations may be out of proportion. This is inevitable. An attempt must be made to avoid any personal bias.

A researcher with no background what-so-ever in the phenomenon being studied might be able to claim a more neutral position. However, the person might also miss the nuance of certain components of the subject under examination. At the same time, it is important to acknowledge potential biases and ensure that they do not influence one's interpretation of the data. The point here is to acknowledge and remain aware of positionality in the conduct of interviews, analysis of the data and the conclusions drawn from it. I was well situated to conduct this research, and cognizant of my own potential biases in analyzing and reporting the results.

My background and graduate education prepared me to be sensitive to feminist, Indigenous and social issues, as well as power dynamics around interviews. The interview process has been a significant part of my work throughout my policing career. My intention was to be sensitive to potential biases and dynamics and account for them in my interactions with subjects, and I

believe this was achieved. I advised study participants that my goals in the research are to raise awareness and make recommendations, and to include and share the voice of a broad range of people. Most of the participants expressed appreciation for this approach. This was also evidenced by the 100 percent positive response by subjects when I asked them if they would like to be advised of the publications that result from the study.

4.4.1 Stakeholders

As this research aims to highlight prevention, intervention and support for people victimized in the sex industry, the stakeholders are many. They include families and young girls who might be saved from sexual exploitation through prevention strategies. It involves children and women involved in the sex industry and all of the government and non-government agencies that provide services to sex industry survivors, as well as those that are engaged in prevention strategies.

4.5 Research instruments and gathering techniques

The instrument utilized in this research is semi-structured interviews recorded with audio equipment. In researching issues to consider around interviewing, I found that there is literature defining the importance of considering how interviews are conducted (Morris, 2009; Chase, 2005). I gave careful consideration to how my interviews would take place.

All interviews were conducted at a place and time arranged by the participants, with consideration of my own convenience never entering into it. I further ensured, as much as possible, that interviews were conducted in private and in such a way that the subjects' privacy was protected. In several cases, when interviewing Indigenous elders, a gift of tobacco was offered so as to respect their cultural position and tradition.

4.5.1 Ethics approval

The research proposal was successfully defended in September of 2015, and approved by an esteemed panel of University of Manitoba professors comprised of Dr. Sean Byrne and Dr. Jessica Senehi of the Peace and Conflict Studies program, Arthur V. Mauro Center for Peace and Justice, and Dr. Rick Linden, Professor of Sociology at the University of Manitoba. The University's Research Ethics Board approved the research within guidelines established in the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Human Subjects established in 2001 by Canada's three main federal research agencies: (1) the Canadian Institute of Health Research, (2) the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and (3) the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. Appendix G is the Ethics approval certificate from the Human Ethics Research Board of the University of Manitoba.

4.5.2 Informed consent and confidentiality

An informed consent process was applied with every subject including questions about anonymity and whether or not they consented to be identified and quoted in the literature that will flow from the research. Most service providers were eager to weigh in and be identified in the research findings; however, some did choose to remain anonymous. Pseudonyms were attached to all experiential survivors' interviews to protect them from any potential impacts from their participation in this study. Survivors who are not practitioners in the field of helping sex industry survivors were not offered the choice of being attributed with their responses. They were all made anonymous through the use of pseudonyms and in my deleting identifying information from their transcripts.

Some of the service providers are also experiential survivors who now work to help people to exit the sex industry. In these cases, they were offered the choice of anonymity or of being

named in the research if they are publicly known as advocates and experiential survivors. All participants were over the age of 18 and no one who is actively engaged in the sex industry was interviewed. The consent forms are attached as Appendix A. The informed consent form for survivors (Appendix B) is slightly different from the form used for practitioners (Appendix A). It does not offer the interviewee the choice of being named and attributed with direct quotations in the thesis or in other publications arising from the study. No deception was used in conducting the research. Information was not deliberately withheld from the participants and the participants were not deliberately misled in the research.

4.5.3 Protection of subjects

The potential risks and benefits of participating in the interviews were laid out in the consent form (Appendix A & B), along with a list of trauma counseling resources that are available in the community for free, should participants wish to seek assistance in dealing with any negative effects from the interviews. I also went to great lengths, both in the informed consent process prior to each interview, and then again on tape, to emphasize the voluntary nature of the interviews. I stressed, until I was satisfied in each case that every participant understood that s/he could stop or withdraw from the study at any time either before or after the interview.

The interview process respected all of the interviewee's time schedules. They were treated with respect and sensitivity, and their privacy was protected. Participants were accommodated, for example, allowing them to have support persons with them during the interview if they requested it. Only one participant chose to do so. Some of the participants were people who have chosen to become involved in public advocacy and support work and, therefore, have been speaking publicly about their experiences. As such, this research posed no significant further threat of traumatization to these people. Informed consent was ensured, as I read a prepared

script and provided copies of the consent form to each subject after we went through them together (Appendix A and B). They were reviewed verbally with each subject to remove any feeling of obligation or compulsion to participate in or be identified in the research. The survivors are not identified in this study, even if they consented to be, if there was any perceived risk of embarrassment, danger or any negative repercussions from being identified.

There was a risk that participants would be ordered by their organizations to participate, or feel compelled to participate because of my positionality. I took steps to ensure that every subject understood that participation was voluntary, even if their employers approved their participation. In some cases I sought permission from their supervisors or executives before the interviews took place. For instance, in the police services I spoke to senior commanders, so that I could advise interview participants that their commanders were fine with their participation in the study and there would be no repercussions for not participating. In the RCMP, the Commissioner in charge of the RCMP in Manitoba sent a message out advising members that it was perfectly fine to participate in the research. Further details are outlined in the package submitted to the University of Manitoba Research Ethics Board.

Practitioners, as well as survivors, were cautioned regarding traumatization potentially resulting from the interview process. There is growing research and awareness of the increasing Post Traumatic Stress found among service providers (Christmas, 2013; Bonokoski, 2012; Freeze & Baily, 2011; Gillis & MacQueen, 2011). Social science researchers are necessarily concerned with the potential impact of trauma-related research on participants. For example, Legerski and Bunnell (2010) reviewed the contemporary literature on the potential of the traumatization of research participants when they are interviewed about their stressful experiences, how to reduce the impacts, and consider whether the benefits of such research outweigh the potential harms.

The general finding was that a very small number of research participants of trauma-focused research experience distress as a result, and those that do, only experience the negative feelings for a short period of time after being interviewed. Most participants in previous research have described their experience of participating in research on their traumatic experiences as “positive, rewarding, and beneficial to society” (Legerski & Bunnell, 2010, p. 429; also see Jorm, Kelly & Morgan, 2007; Runeson & Beskow, 1991).

Legerski and Bunnell (2010) also reported that while negative effects of participation in trauma-focused research appear to dissipate, conversely, the positive rewards reportedly increase with time. They reported that some studies have found that most participants experience some level of distress as well as positive benefits from their involvement in the research (Legerski & Bunnell, 2010; Hale, Murdock & Fortier, 2005). In addition, Yuen et al. (2014) interviewed 23 sex industry workers in Hong Kong and found positive psychology was used to maintain resilience among them. They rationalized their role and the power over their situations, and thus could stay optimistic about the future. The findings of this research were explored for resilience-building strategies that might inform policy recommendations.

During the interviews some mild emotional reactions did arise for some of the respondents, but none appeared traumatic. Some participants did mention that talking about their experiences is sometimes emotionally triggering, but none mentioned an intention to seek assistance from the resources provided with the consent forms. Several participants also mentioned that contributing to research like this, as in their work, is part of their healing journey and that they were glad to participate.

Confidentiality was protected by physically securing the digital and paper files in a safe in my home and with instructions that in the case of my death or serious illness that the records be

turned over to my advisor, Dr. Sean Byrne of the Arthur V. Mauro Center for Peace and Conflict Studies. The transcript files and digital voice recordings of the interviews were stored on a computer with a password protected hard-drive. Several transcriptionists were used to transcribe digitally obtained interviews into text. Each transcriptionist signed a confidentiality agreement (see Appendix F). As a further measure, only first names, and often no names were referred to during the recording of the interviews, so the transcriptionists in many cases would not know who the interview subject was.

4.5.4 Challenges encountered

One issue arose in selecting and contacting participants. In my ethics application, I spelled out that I would not directly contact potential participants who are survivors. The REB specified that I should not directly approach survivors, but rather they should be provided a referral letter third hand (Appendix E is the referral letter). This was strictly adhered to, even though the participants often advised me that I should talk to certain people. In some cases they provided information for potential participants. I strictly adhered to this ethical standard and asked people to pass on the referral letter and have them contact me if they wished to participate in the study. The uptake was good, in that I anticipated about 40 interviews and ended up successfully completing 61.

In some cases I intended to conduct an interview with a practitioner and then learned that she in fact was also a survivor. In most of these cases I treated the person as a practitioner as her previous experience as a survivor is known in their workplaces and to the public. In fact practitioners often use this previous experience in the sex industry as a credential for their work.

In some cases survivor participants, did not show up for appointments or were otherwise not available, even though they had reached out to me. I worked hard to accommodate them and in some cases it took up to five times for me to schedule meetings with them when they would

not attend. I learned that one effect of being a survivor, for some, is difficulty with routine things like keeping appointments due to difficulties finding transportation, childcare and other reasons. These intersectional challenges are also a significant finding that I will describe later.

4.5.5 Data analysis, validity and reliability

Feingold (2010) has described how difficult it is to estimate the extent of ‘underground trades,’ such as the sex industry, and that care should be taken to not accept statistics as facts, as they can be misleading. This observation was made by several of the research participants in this study, who emphasized that much of the sex industry is invisible and difficult to measure. Ferris (2015) points out that there are no statistics on how many people are involved in Canada’s sex industry. Several researchers have described how qualitative research provides depth beyond the interpretation of purely quantitative data such as statistics (Rogers & Kelly, 2011; Hankivsky, 2011; McCall, 2005; Druckman, 2005). Feingold (2010) describes how statistics could be misleading with respect to phenomena such as the sex industry, which are difficult to measure.

Working with the narrative data, a process naturally evolved for organizing and analyzing it. I inductively looked for themes, ideas, and recommendations, placing each transcribed interview text into one (searchable) Word document that was over 900 pages in the end (not counting my own words). I then studied every word starting at the beginning, and separated all of it into themes. I analyzed all 61 interviews in this way, resulting in about 38 distinct themes that were organized as sections and into the thematic chapters of the thesis (Chapters 5 to 10).

Scholars have pointed out that the validity of the conclusions drawn from data is a subjective matter in a qualitative study such as this, and the researcher must be aware and sensitive to his/her own biases and positionality (Creswell, 2007). Whittemore, Chase, and Mandle (2001) have pointed out that qualitative analysis can be contentious for these reasons.

However, that does not mean the conclusions are weak or invalid. It can also be valid and powerful if the researcher captures the meaning of the interview subject, much of which could be lost if one attempted to attribute numerical values to themes for statistical analysis. As I was transcribing and reviewing the interview transcripts, in most cases, it was very clear to me how passionate the interview participants were about their observations and how significant their reflections were for them. In editing the quotations in the body of the thesis, I took every effort to retain the intended meaning of the interviewed subject, respecting that they were asked to spontaneously answer questions about complex subjects—and that extraneous word whiskers such as “um” are a manner of speaking that would be removed if they were providing written responses. In doing this, I respected the extensive experience and dignity of my subjects.

Druckman (2005) points out that the analysis in qualitative research involves validating the accuracy and authenticity of the interview participants’ comments, keeping in mind how they are represented by the researcher. Additionally, Creswell (2007) described several strategies for validation that I was able to employ. First, I am very familiar with the landscape and context of this subject matter; if someone were to make outlandish or completely inaccurate observations, I would recognize them as such and flag them. On the other hand, the participants suggested several groundbreaking ideas and I immediately recognized them as such. For example, one subject suggested the “Dream Catcher Village” (see section 10.4.2), which was a unique idea and I recognized it immediately as an innovation that seems to make sense, at least to consider in the Manitoba context.

Remaining consistent with Creswell’s recommendations, the ideas were triangulated between subjects; very often participants talked about similar or identical issues that immediately connected with me as accurate. For example, all of the participants talked about the need for

more education and awareness across society. If one said the opposite, I would immediately recognize it as peculiar and examine it carefully. My research participants are all highly credible, and many are recognized experts in the field.

I interviewed people with unique knowledge in the world that cannot be found any other way, other than through qualitative interviews. Bogdan and Biklen (2007) point out that qualitative researchers do not generally seek to find results, as in scientific experiments. Rather, they are looking for the nuances of human perception. The complexity of the social phenomena involved around sex trafficking and exploitation are illuminated through the rich language of participants describing their own experiences, telling their stories from the heart.

4.6 Conclusion

Overall, I was satisfied with the outcomes that resulted from using this methodology. I was impressed by the clarity that I was able to gain on some issues, by asking the same questions of all participants. One observation that I made was in the form that the stories took. I found that in almost all cases, in looking at the data, I did not need to refer to the question being asked to make sense of the narratives. For example, if the subject was commenting about a theme, the meaning came through clearly without me having to know the question being asked. In fact some similar themes that were raised by the participants arose under different questions. This clarity is an added measure of the veracity of the data as the ideas were articulated powerfully and clearly.

Chapter 5 - Vulnerability and Prevention of Sexual Industry Exploitation

5.1 Introduction

This, the first of the thematic empirical findings chapters, examines who is vulnerable to sexual exploitation and sex trafficking and how it happens. My respondents identified strong ideas around children's vulnerability. The first section explores the debate around prostitution as a legitimate profession that women should have a choice and a right to participate in if they so choose. A theme emerged from virtually all of my participants that no one makes a conscious choice to enter the sex industry unless they are under duress and being manipulated and have no other choice. Other sections look more closely at the choices people have and how poverty and lack of opportunities play into children's vulnerability to being exploited.

Several participants mentioned that a child's vulnerability is tied to her/his basic human need for love, and that predators understand and take advantage of that need. My interviews, consistent with the existing literature, show connections between childhood sexual abuse and a high likelihood of vulnerability to later involvement in the sex industry. This is significant, because identifying predictors of later involvement in the sex industry also presents possible opportunities for early intervention.

Another strong connection was identified between children in care of child protective services and sexual exploitation. While this is a known phenomenon, my research unearthed important insights into the child welfare system and potential opportunities for improvement. Sections of this chapter show how people are preyed upon and groomed and what makes them vulnerable to being exploited.

Another section is dedicated to prevention and what participants said about the need to

intervene early and prevent exploitation, rather than trying later to fix something that is already broken. This chapter alone is probably broad enough in scope for a thesis, yet it is only intended to identify vulnerability issues that were highlighted by the participants in this study. It is not meant to be exhaustive or conclusive, but rather to set the stage for later discussions around interventions and responses, and what we can do as a society to reduce sexual exploitation.

5.1.1 Counter-exploitation in Manitoba

Manitoba is a fitting place to examine sexual exploitation. For one, it is the home of a troubled past that was exposed by the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry (AJI) of 1990 (Hamilton & Sinclair, 1991). The AJI exposed historic racism and tension between government agencies and First Nations and Metis people.

Manitoba has a long-standing problem with exploitation, punctuated by the tragic murders of several youths including Cherisse Houle, Hillary Wilson, and Tina Fontaine (CBC, 2014a; Paperny, 2009). The province, situated in the centre of Canada, has over 10,000 children seized by and in care of government agencies, the highest per capita in Canada (Puxley, 2014). It is also the seat of much activism around the national ‘Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women’ movement (Welch, 2014; RCMP; 2013). Both children in care and the Missing and Murdered movement are closely connected with the sexual exploitation issue.

In 2002, Manitoba’s provincial government established a multidisciplinary team to develop and implement a strategy to address the sexual exploitation of children and youth. The Multi-Jurisdictional Implementation Team (MIT) is comprised of numerous organizations involved in serving sexually exploited youth. Several initiatives involving prevention, intervention, legislation, coordination and research/evaluation were implemented between 2002 and 2008. Then, in 2008, Tracia’s Trust (Manitoba Family Services & Housing, 2008) was established as

phase two of Manitoba's Sexual Exploitation strategy.

Rebecca Cook is Manitoba's Child Exploitation program coordinator. She describes how Manitoba is unique in Canada with regards to this issue.

REBECCA COOK: So, in Manitoba we are the only Province right now that has a provincial strategy to address exploitation. It was mandated by the Healthy Child Committee of cabinet in 2002, actually also a push from the community at the time saying there is lots of children and youth being exploited on the streets and we need to do something about it. At the same time the government was developing these policies to address child sexual exploitation, hence the whole shift from children prostitutes or even I was watching the news the other day with Ontario; they still speak in that language through the news that it's child prostitution, so they're also developing a strategy to address it—.

My area of focus through work has been more of a prevention awareness piece not necessarily something that's intervention.

Street Reach is more service delivery front line intervention; mine is awareness prevention.

Rebecca Cook highlights that Manitoba has had some original solutions, yet it is also unique in its ongoing challenges. She emphasizes the importance of language around the issue, and not identifying high risk youth as “prostitutes” or criminals.

As a result of leaders like Gord Mackintosh and Jane Runner, Diane Redsky, Dianna Bussey and others, Manitoba has been a national leader in developing approaches to intervene in victimization through sexual exploitation and human trafficking, and should naturally be a national leader in evaluating lessons learned, and in moving forward. Former Attorney General (and also former CFS Minister), Gord Mackintosh, outlined how the formal counter exploitation strategy started in Manitoba.

GORD MACKINTOSH: By December 2008, Tracia's Trust really all came together from a lot of that experience from the Sexually Exploited Youth Coalition, people that were on the front lines and leaders and so many NGOs that came to us and said “here are the pieces that we have to focus on: we have to have more beds, we have to have some better coordination of all the work on the street by all the agencies, which led to Street Reach.

We had to do better in terms of some civil laws to deal with this one. And so that's where it went to and now it's a \$10 million dollar a year investment and growing.

So that's how I came to it. It was like, it wasn't a light switch, you know that went on and all of a sudden I could see the way—.

It was really like I say the product of so many people bringing their insights to bear, inherent with all the conflicts.

Mr. Mackintosh highlights, as did my other research contributors, that Manitoba is a leader in Canada with respect to funding and strategizing to reduce sexual exploitation, yet there is room for improvement.

Tracia's Trust was named after Tracia Owen, a 14-year-old girl who committed suicide while in care of Child and Family Services (CFS). It was a defining event in Manitoba's counter-exploitation strategy. Judge John Guy presided over Tracia's inquest (Guy, 2008). His report highlighted the need for greater cooperation between all agencies involved in child welfare in Manitoba. He called for round tables to create a comprehensive provincial counter sexual exploitation strategy. Then Family Services and Housing Minister, Gord Mackintosh, hosted a two-day summit in 2008, based on Judge Guy's recommendations, which 65 people in Northern Manitoba and 130 people in Southern Manitoba attended.

Police and justice officials, community groups, educators, Indigenous groups, elders, and other stakeholders discussed strategies to support sexually exploited children and how to help prevent other children and youth from being exploited. The Front Line Voices summit workshops produced four main recommendation themes: (1) legislation and law enforcement; (2) continuum of services, (3) raising awareness, and (4) child, youth, family and community empowerment.

The subsequent report outlined that in Manitoba most sexually exploited children and youth are Indigenous females, although there is growing awareness of the exploitation of boys and transgendered youth. They also reported that a large proportion of exploited youth are wards of the child welfare system, having experienced childhood sexual/physical abuse, and many have been homeless at some point and exchanged sex for the necessities of life including food and

shelter. That report cited the underlying factors that contribute to children's vulnerability to sexual exploitation as including the following: poverty, racism, colonization and the legacy of residential school experiences, social and cultural isolation, marginalization, peer pressure, past abuse or trauma, sex-based discrimination, mental health or developmental disorders, system gaps or inaccessible services and other social and financial inequalities (Manitoba Family Services & Housing, 2008).

A prosecutor was assigned to specialize and focus on sexual exploitation related charges. Some existing sections in Manitoba's *Child and Family Services Act* (CFS Act, 2016) were seen as potential tools for addressing exploitation. These included failing to report a child in need of protection (section 18) and interference with a child in care (CFS Act, 2016, section 52). As the coordinator of the WPS Missing Persons Unit, my team took the lead seeking legal tools, and started enforcing CFS (section 52) "Harbouring" sections. The Act allows for a mandated social worker to serve a warning letter on any person who harbours or allows a runaway to hide in their home, thus interfering with their lawful placement in a foster care home or other facility.

No prosecutions had ever been pursued under this legislation; however social workers and our police detectives saw real value. Working with the Justice Department, we clarified the elements of the offence and requirements for prosecuting cases. The process was prolonged and we decided to take the initiative to drive it from the bottom as well as from the top, laying charges to expedite the use of the Act for protecting at-risk youth.

Some experienced social workers were thrilled at the police interest and actual use of the harbouring legislation, which until that time were not enforced. Much positive press ensued. Social work and police partners appreciated this police—social work collaboration and viewed the use of the harbouring legislation as ground-breaking. However, it met some resistance in the

Justice department and sentences on conviction were small, despite the maximum penalty having been raised to \$50,000 in fines and up to two years in prison (Giroday, 2009). The enforcement of anti-harboring legislation was a useful tool for bringing runaways to safety, yet ultimately one of the smaller implements on the tool belts of people working in the counter-exploitation field (see Appendix I).

From 2006 to the present, the WPS Missing Persons Unit implemented several strategies, including teaming police investigators with social workers to intervene with high risk youth who were being groomed and exploited in the sex industry. We realized that marginalization was at the root of this growing social problem. Vulnerable girls were being identified and preyed upon, and many were in the care of child protection services.

The following are some initiatives that began after 2006 and have continued to this day: (1) continually returning runaway youth home to safety, always seeking to build trust with them, (2) partnering with social workers and participating in care plans for high risk youth, (3) seeking to use and change laws, such as CFS sec. 52 Harboring for use in protecting children, (4) unique new media partnerships to provide stories on intervention innovations as well as on daily urgent public appeals for help, and (5) challenging the systems of service providers on issues such as the lack of secure facilities that could keep high risk youth from running away and becoming vulnerable to predators.

By 2008 WPS Missing Persons Unit members realized that more data was needed to make arguments for change in the child welfare system, and policies around police and social worker responses to high risk exploited youth. Anecdotally, it was clear to everyone involved that children in foster homes, group homes and CFS facilities were being preyed upon. In January of 2009 we audited all missing person investigations in Winnipeg for the three-month period of

October to December 2008. We found that of the 1,275 investigations examined (425 per month), about 70 percent were children running away from CFS placements (see Table 1).

This finding sent shockwaves through government and the Department of Child and Family Services (later the Department of Families). However, senior bureaucrats and social workers were happy that we finally confirmed the reality that everyone already understood that is that children in care made up the bulk of children at risk. Many were repeat chronic runaways, some with over 100 police contacts (runaway and other crime reports), and as many child welfare contacts attached to their names. This chronic runaway behavior led to dangerous complacency in the system. Police and social workers get tired of repeatedly returning runaway youth to group homes after they've run away, only to see them reported missing again hours later. It becomes a nuisance; yet, ironically those children are often at highest risk (Hedges, 2002). We now know that when youth are out on the run, they are often being groomed and exploited into the sex industry (Dedel, 2006; Lanning, 2001).

One place where the vulnerability of runaway youth to sexual exploitation was first observed and prioritized is Dallas Texas. The Dallas Police Department is renowned for its leading edge strategies around sex trafficking. It based its strategy around tracking runaway reports and sending detectives to meet and build relationships with chronic runaways, eventually gaining their trust and receiving disclosures from runaway youth about who was exploiting them. This information would then be used to build cases and prosecute traffickers. In 2009, I travelled to Dallas to learn from the Dallas Police and we later had Dallas detectives come to Canada to teach our multi-disciplinary teams how to intervene with high risk youth.

Missing persons are a difficult challenge for contemporary Canadian policing. Investigations are complex, labor-intensive and politically sensitive (Hedges, 2002). Serial

homicides and public inquiries across Canada over the past decade have highlighted the need for deeper sensitivity to vulnerable people, in particular women and children who are often reported as missing and are at risk of sexual exploitation (Stittle, 2007; DeRiviere, 2005; Outshoorn, 2004; Klaine, 1999; Lanning, 2001). The tragic deaths of several Winnipeg youth have created deep concern in government and other service agencies and throughout our communities over the need for greater focus and collaboration between agencies that are mandated to protect vulnerable people, including high risk youth (Guy, 2008).

Diane Redsky, Executive Director of *Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*, described how some of Manitoba's strategy and youth intervention programs evolved.

DIANE REDSKY: In Manitoba here, we're a unique province that has the only provincial strategy in Canada, called Tracia's Trust, so Manitoba does more for sexually exploited girls under the age of 18, well even in their 20s a bit, than any other province in Canada.

We have everything from prevention programs in schools and youth-serving organizations.

We have intervention programs—Street Reach is one of them. Also, we have other outreach workers that are part of that, that are actually going on the street, building relationships with sexually exploited youth.

Then we have locked facilities to lock them up. We [some service providers] don't agree with that, but we have our rural healing lodge which is secure by location.

Then there is helping women rebuild their lives. And one of the key programs is run by *Ndinawe* and it's a child and youth care diploma program.

Ms. Redsky outlines how Manitoba has become a leader in collaboration and effective programming assisting and supporting women to escape the sex industry. She also highlights the importance of having experiential survivors at the table guiding programming and working within programs. Appendix J is a list of most counter-exploitation initiatives that have been undertaken in Manitoba to this date.

Some of the current contention in Manitoba is over how to get more upstream to prevent at-risk youth from becoming victimized and exploited. This involves a debate about how we work with the high numbers of children who are in care. Some argue for approaches that leave

the child in their familial home and remove the problem adult rather than the child (Ostroff, 2015). The Northern Misipawistik Cree Nation is trying this new approach in certain circumstances (ibid.).

Manitoba's Child Advocate, Darlene MacDonald, examined the deaths of 166 Manitoba children (under 18-years old) between April 2013 and March 2014. She reported that improvements are required in three different areas to address children's needs in Manitoba, as follows: (1) better access to mental health services, (2) protection from sexual exploitation, and (3) better protection of children's rights (Canadian Press, 2014). Research to date has created a fairly clear picture of the ways that troubled youth get recruited and involved in sexual exploitation; however, the literature on effective interventions is lacking (Richardson, 2015; Berckamns et al., 2012).

In Manitoba, we have faced significant problems with missing person-related issues. The WPS was experiencing intense difficulties with missing person cases tying up massive amounts of uniform patrol unit resources, a problem it is still facing in 2016. Generally, any missing person event that presents risk factors, such as gang involvement, risk of exploitation, substance abuse, or suicide results in a uniform crew continuing to look for the missing youth for many hours, sometimes handing off the investigation to the incoming shifts to continue around the clock for days at a time. Vulnerable people, such as young children and the elderly, are also given high priority and searched for continuously until they are found.

In 2008-2009, sexually exploited youth were added to the list, which is continuously being updated, for higher priority investigations due to their vulnerability. In my current role as a WPS Duty Officer overseeing police operations, I can say that these cases still are given high priority. In 2009-2010 the WPS Missing Person Unit was responsible for over 5,000 short-term, emergent

investigations per year, and carrying over 100 unsolved long-term missing person ‘cold-cases.’ This number climbed to over 7,000 by 2016. Every case is urgent to the loved ones reporting a person missing, yet the police have the difficult task of prioritizing cases with limited resources.

In 2006 the WPS had a team of two detectives working on urgent missing person cases, which included investigating unidentified human remains, interprovincial and international abductions, amber alerts, and missing persons who could include despondent suicidal people, suspicious disappearances, and runaways. Runaway youth have been a significant challenge for police agencies across Canada because they present as low-risk cases, yet there is growing awareness that these youth are being preyed upon by sexual predators, pedophiles, gangs, traffickers, and organized crime.

Girls exploited in the sex industry in Winnipeg are often ‘trafficked’ in the sense that they are socially isolated and marginalized, forced to perform sex acts in exchange for basic human needs, or the bare necessities of shelter and refuge from Winnipeg’s often frigid temperatures for food or to feed addictions to street drugs (Giroday, 2010). Those who work in government and non-government agencies and the community in 2016-2017, say that sexual exploitation, disparity, and all its related problems are as bad as they ever were. The police have come to understand that they are only a small part of the larger spectrum of resources required to address these issues. In the following sections and chapters I outline my findings based on interviews with service providers and survivors.

5.2 No one freely chooses to be a prostitute

Most participants I interviewed for this study articulated strongly that no one voluntarily chooses to live and participate in the sex industry. While selling sex is often referred to as “work,” it is a

distasteful characterization for most, as it infers willingness and a legitimate business transaction whereas most see it more clearly as exploitation of one human being by another. One of my research participants, Kelsie, is a sex trafficking survivor. She described the importance of language around the issue as follows.

KELSIE: Average age of entry into the sex work is 14 for women involved with our program at [—] whether that's runaways through CFS, their mom sold them into the sex trade, or who knows.

All of their stories are different. But for many reasons, multiple systems have failed them, and they end up doing sex.

So some of our women don't even use "sex trade" because that indicates a choice, and we never had choices. And then, on the flip side, some of our women say, "Yes, we have no choices but we still have agency to make choices, despite our choicelessness."

So, we want to empower our women to not feel like they're choiceless even though they are in many aspects.

But they still have agency. They still have resiliency. They still have validity to survive despite those choiceless options.

So, that's why we talk about "sex work." Because it is work for them. Even if it's a choice or no choice, they still see it as work—work that they didn't necessarily choose or that they necessarily like. But some of our women feel like only using "sexual exploitation" takes away their ability to make agency.

So we navigate that process very carefully. And we're constantly talking about language and talking about how we can improve around language, knowing that all of the labels that we use are patriarchal and based on a colonial system.

Kelsie makes the important distinction between "work" and exploitation, while also highlighting how people need a sense of agency and control even while they are "choiceless." While Kelsie mentions the term "sex trade", her intent is more in line with the majority of my respondents who stressed that it is not a trade, but rather women participating in selling sex generally do not have a choice in it.

Ashley, another survivor, describes the typical life cycle of a trafficked life. Her striking story illustrates that being trafficked in the sex industry is more like torture and slavery than a career choice for most women.

ASHLEY: From a survivor's view, I was first victimized at the age of 15. I was groomed and coerced into entering the sex trade, and then to selling myself on Ellice and Home.

All the money I made went to drugs.

I was then introduced to an older man who pretended he was my boyfriend. He had me working out of an older girl's apartment who was out of town. I was advertised on the Internet and I would see many men a day there. He said he was keeping all the money and that I would get a car, my own condo, clothes. He bought me jewelry, but I didn't see any of the money.

Then I ended up moving from Winnipeg to Vancouver, and back to Winnipeg to an abusive dangerous predator, and then to Toronto where I was with a very controlling abusive predator who actually sold me. I was in jail and I had a surety, and I guess he had had enough of me so he essentially sold me to another predator who ended up being murdered. He was shot in the head after which I returned to Winnipeg.

Then when I came back to Winnipeg, I was trying to get help for my addictions and I had ended up getting a big settlement from a lawsuit I had in Vancouver. And I wasn't able to manage the money, and I felt so hopeless, so much guilt, and so much shame that I jumped off of the Maryland Bridge.

I landed on the ice. I broke my back and my legs, and my feet were crushed. So I spent six months in the hospital rehabilitating from that.

And from then I still was entrenched in the sex trade. That's all I had known my whole teens and adult life. I had been brainwashed by these men into thinking that I needed them.

So, I had a son and I lost him to CFS.

The turning point really wasn't for me until I was pregnant with my daughter.

Ashley describes her story matter-of-factly, as though she is used to telling it and, perhaps it is therapeutic, to have yet one more person acknowledge what happened to her.

In the following excerpt from her interview, Ashley describes how she came to realize that she was being sexually exploited.

ASHLEY: I think to me it's all the same really. In my opinion, "prostitution" is "sexual exploitation" and a form of violence against women.

No child says, "When I grow up I want to be a prostitute. I want to be in the sex trade."

I was a victim and like I didn't even identify—and this is what I think is a crucial point—I didn't identify as a victim because I didn't know what sex trafficking was. I didn't know what sexual exploitation was. I didn't know what grooming was. And think maybe if I'd known about those things—

And it wasn't until I heard about Joy Smith and the work that she was doing that I was able to identify that I was just one of many, many, girls.

Ashley noted that children are exploited and victimized, often not realizing it, and therefore, not identifying as a victim. Consistent with Ashley's account, my respondents saw survivors as

victims, rather than as willing participants in the sex industry. This is similar to the paradigm shift that occurred in Boston in the 1990s, whereby gang and violence afflicted youth began to be seen as victims of life's circumstances rather than as criminals (Prothrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004).

Constable Rejeanne Caron (WPS), who has worked extensively with youth and women in the sex industry, further described her position on whether sex industry survivors are victims: "I've always viewed prostitutes as victims, for example, a 13-year-old girl I worked with was exploited by her own father; why would we criminalize these girls; now we, the Police Service and society, view them as victims." Ms. Caron's observations are consistent with previous research, linking early childhood mistreatments to later involvement in the sex industry (Klatt, Cavanaugh & Eganc, 2014; Kaestle, 2012; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010).

Most of my participants described youth's involvement in the sex industry not as a free choice, but rather as a choice that is made under duress. For example, WPS Superintendent Liz Pilcher, who has over 25 years in policing and has worked for a large part of her career in sex crimes and counter exploitation related work elaborated on this coercion issue as follows.

LIZ PILCHER: I really believe that we have a lot of victims out there who don't choose to live this life. And I think there is a misnomer that it's something that, you know, is luxurious that this is the life that people want.

But most of them are drug-addicted and, you know, dealing with drugs and gangs. And it's not a good lifestyle.

And I think it's important to deal with the youth before they enter the sex trade. And I think that has to do with the education system, our whole child and family services system.

There has to be something,—programming, resources—better to help these kids out because I don't think they're choosing to do that.

And included in that is the violence. I mean I think sometimes all these things we forget about the violence, the coercion, you know, the threats to family and harm. Those are all things that really mentally take away from a person's humanity.

Ms. Pilcher highlighted, as Ashley did earlier, that children do not choose to enter the sex industry; it is put upon them. She suggested that programming should be put in place in schools

to raise children's awareness about the dangers of trafficking.

Wendy Sheirich brings a different perspective about the legitimacy of prostitution as a profession. While she sees the vast majority of sex sellers as victims of the sex industry, she mentions the more rare view that some people hold, that it is a free choice made by some women.

WENDY SHEIRICH: I'm really at a loss of thoughts when it comes to legislation. I do not know—, I really do not know what needs to happen.

I think that it's really important to identify the role that people have when they're involved in sexual exploitation or prostitution or sex trafficking—and in order to determine then what needs to happen to deal with the problems associated with those issues.

I don't know whether you can just paint the whole situation with one brush and say that all of those involved in selling sex are victims because I don't know if that is true.

In my experience, the vast majority of people that I know that are involved in the sex industry are being victimized. But there is a very small group of people that are involved in the sex industry that I know that I do not think are victims. They are, for whatever reason, choosing to be involved in the sex industry.

Ms. Sheirich mentions a perspective that there are people who freely participate in the sex industry. For example, the Supreme Court of Canada Bedford appeal and subsequent decision was started by three sex industry workers who challenged the laws based on how the laws prevented them from performing their chosen professions safely (Canada vs. Bedford, 2013). However, the vast majority of the people I interviewed for this research weighed in on the side of viewing all sex industry survivors as victims rather than as willing participants in prostitution.

Hennes Doltze has run the "John School" at Salvation Army Winnipeg for several years. This is a one-day program that men who have been charged with criminal communication for the purpose of prostitution can attend and have the charges stayed, after proof of completion of the program. Mr. Doltze highlights that there are only a small number of people who feel that they are, or were, participating freely in the sex industry.

HENNES DOLTZE: Often [prostitution] is happening through some sort of force by another person or coercion or even life circumstances that people get in. So for the most part people who are involved in prostitution are being sexually exploited.

However, I would say there is a small number of people that are involved by their own choice where they feel this is something that they like to do, that this is their choice. They fully understand the consequences—they choose to be in it.

I would personally say, given my background, it's a small number. But it does happen that people choose to be in it.

It is important to point out, as Mr. Doltze has, that there are a small number of people working in the sex industry who view it as a right and a free choice that women (and men) should have.

However, this perception seems to be held by a relatively small segment of the community that is involved in the sex industry.

The case of Ashley, the survivor who described how she did not realize she was being exploited until years later, might explain some of these perspectives. Some people may be led to believe that they are acting of their own free will, while people who are earning profits from their work are manipulating them. It should be noted, however, that there might well be people who enjoy their profession in the sex industry. It was not, however, a finding within my subject pool. Further exploration of this dynamic is beyond the scope of this study.

The public view, by people who are not experiential survivors of sex trafficking and exploitation or practitioners working in the field, is more mixed. Andrew Swan (MLA) has represented the district of Minto in Winnipeg's West End for many years and for several years he was Manitoba's Attorney General. Mr. Swan has been in the forefront leading much of Manitoba's Counter Exploitation Strategy. He described the public perspective as follows.

ANDREW SWAN: Frankly, although you can always find examples, I suppose, and I received a couple of emails from people who consider themselves call girls or high class hookers from Vancouver and Toronto telling me how wonderful their lives are, that's not the reality in Manitoba. It just isn't.

And I do think more and more people are understanding that, which is why I'm going to be fascinated to see what your dissertation looks like.

I guess the one thing we've always wondered about, both as the MLA and being involved in the Department of Justice: How do you motivate communities to get change?

The clear majority of people interviewed for this research described strong positions, as Mr. Swan does as well, that most people involved in the sex industry are not there by choice, but rather are victims of exploitation. Pimps and family members often manipulate and coerce them, due to their lack of opportunities and alternative choices as well as an absence of the resilience to resist the pressure of being exploited. Yet, some in the public discourse have taken a position that there are a small number of women who choose this profession willingly and should have a right to do so. The public has mixed opinions, as MLA Swan points out, and a certain level of indifference to the subject unless it is happening in their own back yards.

The fact remains that in Canada, most sex industry survivors are from impoverished living conditions, and many are living with multiple traumas associated with their Indigenous heritage (Lauwers, 2012, Goar, 2006). Survivors often become involved in the sex industry as a result of their vulnerability to gangs and predators (Comack et al., 2009; Totten, 2009). Some feminists have argued that women should be free to choose prostitution as a legitimate profession, while others argue that any time a woman sells her body for money, she is being exploited (Meyers, 2014; Lozano, 2010). Regardless of the perspective taken, research has revealed the degree of oppression and victimization that does occur against people in this vulnerable group (Farley, 2003). We can debate whether a small percentage of women who say they should have the right to be a professional prostitute, are exercising free will or not. However, a contribution of this research is the clarification from my 61 interviewees that most survivors and practitioners alike are of the strong opinion that almost no one chooses freely to participate in the sex industry. Youth wind up in it due to the lack of educational and employment opportunities that would allow them other choices.

5.2.1 Sex industry slavery

My interviews with survivors and practitioners alike maintained a strong theme characterizing the sex industry as slavery. While most did not use the word ‘slavery,’ what they described fit the working definitions that I previously outlined. The following account by Kaitlin, who was trafficked in the sex industry for many years, graphically describes the type of degrading and oppressive experience that is a typical experience of the survivors I interviewed.

KAITLIN: Usually with the gang members, they—, you know, they scare you up. And I remember I had one biker tell me that “You know what? I’m gonna fuckin’ have you locked in the basement. And no one’s gonna know your down there. Guys are gonna be coming from all over just to fuck you. And they’re gonna be paying me not you. They’ll do whatever they want to you. Shit on you. Piss on you. Make you eat their shit.”

And I remember I was crying I was so scared, “I’ll do whatever you want.”

“They’ll do whatever they want, but they’ll pay me not you.”

And then I was just, “Okay, I’ll give you your money.”

It really scared me. I paid, doing what I had to do. And I just gave them all the money.

Then it was just like. “Here, chill, relax, have a beer.”

I remember, too, thinking once I don’t owe any of these guys any money. I am outta here. So I laughed.

li It was ke they tricked me. They said, “You don’t have to worry about food. You don’t have to worry about clothes.” Like a pimp. But they didn’t come out and say, “I’m gonna pimp you out.” They basically sugar coated it.

I remember that there was a couple of girls sitting there with a bunch of gold and jewelry. And they had a bunch of crack. And they were saying, “We never go out on the street.” And little did I know these guys were pimping them out like escorts or something like that. And they made more money, I guess. It was degrading.

And when I just look back, I just think, “Oh my god! It was so fucking stupid.”

I look at my sons and think, “Wow, I wasn’t even developed yet. How could someone sleep with someone like that?” It sickens me. These guys are animals.

I honestly think that prostitution would probably go away if there was less drug dealers and gang members. But I don’t think that’ll ever happen.

By all measures, this account by Kaitlin depicts slavery and torture, and it dismisses any argument that one might voluntarily choose out of one’s own free will to do this as a chosen profession. While voluntary sex-selling occurs, involuntariness due to physical threats and psychological fear and manipulation was consistent in the stories of all of the survivors I

interviewed for this research. This description by Kaitlin of what she endured clearly meets the definitions of slavery laid out by The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons (United Nations, 2014, UNESCO, 2014).

5.2.2 Grooming for sex slavery

In policing and social work circles and among people who work with sexually exploited youth and women, the term “grooming” is commonly used. Grooming occurs when an exploitive person psychologically manipulates a person into participating in the sex industry. The approach can be subtle and convincing, and people are often unaware that they are being manipulated until it is too late and they are already indebted to the pimp and are engaged in being exploited.

Member of Parliament Joy Smith (retired in 2016) of Manitoba has worked with sexual exploitation and trafficking survivors across Canada. She articulates here the dynamics of psychological manipulation, often called “grooming” used by sex traffickers.

JOY SMITH: The criminal is to blame. Nobody else.

And for parents to understand that their kids can make mistakes, parents can make mistakes. It's called life.

But when a criminal targets your kid and makes sure they're gang-raped and makes sure they make money off them—. And how they do it is they hang out where kids hang out. And what they do is target someone who they think is vulnerable.

They prefer virgins. They get a higher price. They prefer the younger the better. They prefer someone who is very vulnerable and needy. And every child fits that description at some point in their life. Why? Because they're children.

So let's say a young child doesn't fit in at school for whatever reason, they would be a target, particularly if they're beautiful because beauty means a lot.

But it's both a heinous and insidious crime because the perpetrators come on as friends to their potential victims and they gain their trust and often they become their boyfriends. The young girls get gold necklaces, get nice clothes, and they get taken to parties.

Gradually they introduce them to a drug. Many are introduced to drugs that they don't even know how bad they are because they're told, “Oh, it's nothing. You'll just enjoy the feeling. I do it. You do it, too.” And so they have a sense of belonging.

The tragic thing is once they have them hooked then they start moving them. It can be from different parts of town. It can be into the country. It can be into another city. And they have routes all across the country.

And, these traffickers then work very hard to make a lot of money out of these girls.

Ms. Smith describes how vulnerable children are deliberately targeted and manipulated or groomed into the sex industry.

Smith's description collaborates Diane Redsky's description of the whole life cycle of grooming that she has seen, based on 20 years of working with women in the sex industry and the 160 survivor's interviewed in her study (CWF, 2014). Ms. Redsky describes the life cycle of a sex industry career as follows.

DIANE REDSKY: This is a very general description of what we learned with the task force on the stories that we heard from women—and we met with over 160 survivors of sex trafficking and heard their stories.

And so what we learned is at the very beginning, as a child, there is some form of trauma happens. And this is not in all cases, but there is a consistent theme that something happened when they were little, some kind of trauma—whether sexual, emotional, physical, spiritual—some kind of trauma.

Then when they get to the age of 13, that made them vulnerable to exploiters or traffickers or pimps to recruit and lure them, and they do that in a variety of ways. But there's a certain point in time it moves from the honeymoon to the, you know, really reeling them in, to now you are going out. And the relationship changes to fear and shame.

And so, you're 13. You are then considered a victim of child abuse under our current laws. Then when you turn 18, it is, you know, your society will often say these are now consensual prostitutes whereas they don't recognize all of this abuse that happened before then. And that's a very a common story of women that are in the sex industry that they started—13 is the average age.

When I first started doing this 20 years ago—working on the issue—the average age was 16. And so where it's younger and younger today. It's 13. Then they're trafficked from 13 till about that they're 23-ish, and 23 to 25. And then they become of no value to a trafficker any more.

They become of no value because they are most likely drug addicted. Or they are too old because the demand wants younger and younger girls.

So they try to get girls to look younger and younger. And when they can't anymore then they become of no value.

Four things can happen to her at that point. She can become a partner with the trafficker. And women referred to that role as “the bottom bitch.” She would be the one that would—. Now, it's not being forced to have sex with men and hand over money. She is now cleaning the house, recruiting girls, getting the food, and doing all the errands—like the errand girl essentially, running the house and cleaning up after everyone. That becomes her role and she stays with the trafficker, especially if she's been there since she's 13. She doesn't really know anybody else.

Then, the second thing that can happen if she hasn't already committed suicide or gone missing and murdered, those are three things that could have happened by then [is

that they become vulnerable] because now, the rejection from the trafficker can be too overwhelming for women.

The third thing that can happen is that they end up in the survival sex industry where there's nobody forcing anymore. There's no—. You don't have to hand over your money anymore. So, that part is sexual exploitation where you're exchanging sex acts literally for basic needs—for food, for drugs, for alcohol, for a ride, for a place to stay, you know, very basic, what they need to survive day-to-day. And so that's a survival sex industry.

We heard all too often women from—particularly in western Canada—talking about going to downtown east side because that's where they're going to go to die because they have harm reduction there. It doesn't get too cold, and, you know, and people will help you there. So many women in the survival sex industry will migrate to the downtown east side.

Then the fourth thing that can happen is that the exploitation stops. And that stops in a couple of ways. One, we met families that paid an exit fee to a trafficker for to get their daughter back. Or she has left. She has figured out a way to get out of the situation, and there's a variety of ways that that could happen. The majority, the biggest key factor is always that she's pregnant. And then she is like—, she wants out. And she figures out a way to get away.

Ms. Redsky also reports that in her 20 years of exposure in this area, she has seen the average age of recruitment in the sex industry in Canada drop from 16 to 13 years old, and it is still dropping. This is Redsky's observation, as well as others including Jennifer Richardson, but is not yet confirmed through other empirical research. These processes and life cycles of sexual abuse provided by Redsky are significant in that they highlight opportunities for intervention and prevention.

Here, Diane Redsky describes how a young girl can be trafficked into the sex industry in a period as short as two days.

DIANE REDSKY: If you're a child in care, you are fighting with your parents. You are dealing with some kind of past trauma.

And these people who are exploiting and trafficking, recruiting girls, they are really good at picking out—it's almost like these girls glow in the dark or something. Where they are, they can pick out vulnerability and latch onto that in such a, like, it is so organized, methodical. And they're good. Like many of them are really, really good at it.

If you are a kid in care, and if you have some kind of past trauma or you are low self-esteem, not a lot of friends, depression, some guy comes walking along and promising you too big to be true, and you believe it.

Traffickers, also—. What we learned is that it's getting younger and younger. And the younger you get, then the more naive you are. And it's easier for them when you're younger.

We heard stories of one of the girls from Winnipeg here. Hers happened over a weekend. Friday. By Sunday night she was in Calgary on the street.

Like, that's how fast she went from fighting with her parents and being too embarrassed to go home because she was sexually assaulted that night to Sunday now being forced to be on the street in Calgary.

So all of that can happen really fast, and to any girl. And as I said, but there are other risk factors that can make them more vulnerable. And those exploiters and pimps are just good at picking out the vulnerability.

Ms. Redsky identifies the risk factors for youth and the skill that predators have in seeking out vulnerable children to exploit (see CWF, 2014). Ashley is a survivor whose story illustrates how traffickers often identify vulnerable people and exploit their weakness while manipulating them into the sex industry.

ASHLEY: I think the critical moment when I entered the sex trade was when I was 15.

Like I had been bullied in school. I was vulnerable. I felt a need to belong and feel accepted.

I had been going to community centers and spending time with friends. A couple of the girls and myself met some guys there, and they introduced us to crack. And we wanted more. And then that was the point where I was on the streets.

Ashley describes the starting point where she was vulnerable and a point at which someone might have intervened to help her avoid taking her life on tragic trajectory.

Mandy Fraser works with sex industry survivors in the Dream Catcher Program at Klinik Community Health. She talked about the substance abuse that was mentioned by both Diane Redsky and Joy Smith, describing the cycles of substance abuse and selling sex, and some of the dynamics of why it happens and how it starts. Ms. Fraser describes the typical patterns in the following way.

MANDY FRASER: What I've heard from a handful of women that I've worked with in person is that a family member has introduced them to crack, for a classic example, at like 12, 13, 14 years old.

And I mean I make the connection between their childhood sexual abuse and their experiences of rape before that. But I don't know that they do, or if they can even go there because to open that up might just be too painful.

I think if you've been introduced to numbing at a very young age, when you're still a child—. When you're 14, 15, 16, you're a youth, but you're a child. You're a minor. Your

brain is still developing. You don't know the consequences of your actions, and you don't know how to regulate your emotions. People don't have coping skills—when they're teenagers—developed yet. So when you learn that at a young age it becomes the easy way to live, you know. And no judgment there whatsoever. I can totally appreciate that.

So, I think getting introduced to drugs and then being addicted to drugs and then needing to support it and get fast money. It also can be part of the culture of street life or of gang involvement where it's just normal to buy and sell hard drugs and sex trade is just there as an option.

And then it's a cycle. So, you're going out and blowing these strange men. And then you can't do that sober. And you need to get high to get that out of your head, the smells, the tastes, all the memories, and let alone the violence that you know. You know what, I'm going to turn that around—the violence that men are inflicting on these women.

And those women are trying to survive. That doesn't just go away. It's a cycle of numbing and coping, and just trying to avoid the reality of what you've been through.

Ms. Fraser highlights that traffickers do not necessarily pluck girls off the street. They are made vulnerable by the absence of support structures at home, physical and substance abuse, and lack of resilience. These human needs and being vulnerable to predators were described earlier (see Comack et al. 2009; Totten, 2009).

Here is how Kaitlin, a survivor, describes her experience in the sex industry.

KAITLIN: The very first guy I remember—. We were standing on Higgins. And I remember I was asking [another girl], “How do I stand?”

She told me, “Stick your head forward and your leg, and hold your hip.” And I remember I was doing that.

And all of a sudden this guy came driving by. I know he was Italian. he was this old Italian guy. And he told us to jump in. And she jumped in the front, and I jumped in the back.

He goes, “How old is she?”

And she was looking at him, and, I don't know, she was playing him, rubbing his leg. And she was like, “Why? What do you like?”

He said, “How young is she?”

And she told him I was 12.

And he looked at me and said, “Is she bald?”

She said, “Ya.”

And he said, “Okay, ya, I'll take her.” Like I was a piece of lunchmeat or something.

He asked her, “How much do you want?”

She said, “Just give me \$80.” So he gave her \$80. But she said, “I'm coming with you guys.” Cause I guess he thought she was gonna get out of the car.

I was wondering—. I wondered if they knew each other? Like if he'd done this with her before, like with another younger girl?

So, I remember we went to the Holiday Inn on McPhillips. It used to be there. And we went there.

And he gave me \$240, and he told me, “Don’t tell her.” He said, “Here, keep this to yourself.”

And I remember like, you know, what happened in the hotel. And she was sitting outside in the hallway. And then after, he just dropped us off.

I remember that it was gross. And I remember I didn’t like the way it made me feel after. And I remember that we ended up getting high and drinking. And that was the first guy, the very first John.

In Kaitlin’s case the traffickers recognized and took advantage of a vulnerable child, knowing she had no familial support and would be susceptible to substance abuse. They took advantage of that and got her addicted to crack cocaine, which can happen rapidly, after only a few uses. They made her feel like she belonged, gave her promises of money and made her feel ashamed ensuring she quickly became entrenched in the sex industry sub-culture. This is a very common path and one that was repeatedly described by survivors interviewed for this research. It is significant because embedded in these stories are the turning points where intervention and prevention might have occurred. They also indicate the structural oppression that might have been reduced to make the victims more resistant and less vulnerable to being exploited by malevolent persons. Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) describe the importance of building resilience in youth.

Some youth are recruited and groomed right out of group homes. Grace, another survivor, describes how critical it is for social workers to be trained and aware of indicators of sexual exploitation. She describes being vulnerable and then suddenly being sexually exploited.

GRACE: OK, so I was raped at age of 11. And it caused me to be really erratic, and I started drinking a lot.

My Mom was unable to cope with that and so placed me in the care of CFS under a VPA agreement in hopes that I would change focus and go back to being how I was prior to that rape that I experienced.

I was really young. I didn’t know what to do. I had nobody to talk to about it.

Rape wasn't really something that was even in my mind to understand or comprehend. And my Mom didn't have the supports. And I didn't have any knowledge about where to go and how to get help. It was just very shaming and dirty.

So I was placed into a short-term group home. And I was angry. And it didn't matter who tried to help me and support me, I was mad. And it just kind of spiraled out of control.

I was living in a group home just up on Margaret and Salter over by Kildonan Park. And there was another youth there who AWOL'ed, so unplanned absences.

It started off as very harmless. Like we were hanging out downtown, drinking Stone Cold two-litre beers, right?

At this point I'm 12, and then there was this about 16-year-old youth. I can't even recall her name, but I remember what she looks like. We were standing on the corner of Ellice and Spence right by the University. There is a restaurant right there on the corner. And she was like, "I'll be right back, guys." And she hopped in a car, and then came back with \$80.

I was like, "How do you do that?"

And she said, "Oh, you just go with them and have sex."

And so I thought at that point, "I've already been promiscuous and abusing substances so I didn't have any care." So I jumped in the next car that came.

And then it just kind of escalated for years until I was really badly beaten by a young adolescent female who was pregnant.

So, I guess, from the age of 12 to 15, I was exploited in street work. So standing on the corner of Ellice/Toronto was a major kiddy corner for me.

I had frequent johns that I kind of kept when I moved back to my parents' house. But that slowly kind of fizzles off because then I was at an age when I could get a job.

I was very motivated. Like I went back to school. But I mean I still suffered addictions.

And maybe I wasn't being exploited, but I still exchanged sex and like, I mean, when it's your job you develop—.

It wasn't a job. I've got to stop saying that because I was so young. But you do, for a source of money, you get talented with that, right?

Then when you move back to a community where everybody has rumours or knows, sometimes you are subjected to sexual violence because that's what you used to do. And so it took a long time for me in my community.

Grace describes a theme that was raised by many of the survivors I interviewed, that no one understood what she was going through and therefore, no one intervened to help her. If people around her understood Grace's situation and resources were accessed, she could have been helped without placing her in a group home where she became more vulnerable to exploitation.

Patricia Haberman, the manager of Rose Hall, a group home run by Marymount for high risk teenage girls, describes similar themes as Grace, but from the social worker's point of view.

PATRICIA HABERMAN: This is just from my experience and what I've seen. And I'll just give you an example. That young lady I was talking about being entrenched, we're attempting to have discussions with her to kind of change her thinking because right now she's glorifying it.

You know, "Look at these nice boots I got. And I got my nails done at this fancy salon." And, "Look at all my fancy makeup and my new bras and panties," and whatever. Coming home and bragging to staff and to the girls. She actually calls me "mom" in the group home, so "Mom, come and see all my new stuff."

We're very sensitive and gentle around it, and we have our own sort of guidelines around that. Like we know where this stuff is coming from, and she's not listening to any of it.

This is awesome that she's getting all these new things—that's what's in her mind. So we're trying to help her to switch that mentality—that what you're doing is hurting you, inside and out. Just from that instance, I think that's the turning point, and having the supports in place for someone.

Ms. Haberman highlights the difficulties of dealing with children who are entrenched because they are being groomed and led to believe it is a glamorous life with many rewards.

Jane Runner, executive director of the TERF program (Transition, Education and Resources for Females) for over 20 years, is a leading advocate across Canada in developing resources for young women exiting the sex industry. She describes the grooming process further.

JANE RUNNER: So that turning point can be different for everybody, but it's usually at a point where they need to belong somewhere.

And predators know that, right? You know, predators will look for that, and they know what to look for. They're quite well trained and educate themselves in how to look for the vulnerable people, right?

So that's whether kids coming from up North to the city and just not having the right supports. It's for maybe one person who's got maybe everything—good supportive family—but something traumatic happens, and their life is just in chaos, and it can happen like that. Or we've seen situations where it takes a few months, where someone's getting groomed, someone's getting them ready, and turns them out.

That's where you have the ability to maybe help stop it. So when it comes to preventing it, the more aware everybody is in a community that if they see something, you don't let it go.

This observation by Ms. Runner, about the need for training among teachers and other professionals, ties in with the need for more education and awareness. Deborah Prothrow-Stith and Howard Spivak (2004) made the same finding in Boston, emphasizing the need for

practitioners to be trained to see and act on the early warning signs of youth vulnerability.

Jay Rogers is Deputy Minister of the Manitoba Department of Families (formerly Child and Family Services [CFS]). At the time of this research he was the Executive Director of Marymount, formerly Executive Director of the General Authority of CFS. He highlights how children age out of the child welfare system. He emphasized that the system should create real hope, stronger than the false hope traffickers create while luring youth into the sex industry. If they have hope for their future, they are less vulnerable to being groomed and exploited in the sex industry.

JAY ROGERS: Some of the guys who recruit these women offer them lots of nice things, offer them a better life, better lifestyle.

And so we have to find ways of creating that kind of hope without them having a need to go into the sex trade.

That's a big challenge. And, for the child welfare system, seems to me that we've really got to be a lot better at two things.

We've got to be a lot better at supporting kids who turn 18 because the system just abandons them when they're 18. They're going to end up homeless or in jail and be drawn into those types of lifestyles.

And we need to find ways as a system when kids are in care, and we know that they're not going back to their parents, to find permanent families for them—either through adoption or legal guardian incentives or custom care for Indigenous agencies.

If we can get kids into families and make a lifelong commitment to them, that's where they're going to get the hope, the optimism, and the support that hopefully would prevent them from getting drawn into those lifestyles.

Mr. Rogers' points out that the system needs to create better long-term stability for youth. This research corroborates existing literature on youth vulnerability (see Chapter 3). Its larger contribution is in highlighting the voices and reiterating the stories of people with decades of experience to identify what is lacking in the system and how it might be improved.

5.3 Abuse history as a predictor of later sexual exploitation

Abuse in early childhood seems to be a strong indicator of later involvement in the sex industry.

A majority of participants I interviewed for this study reported an episode of sexual abuse at a young age. For example, Mandy Fraser (Klinic) commented on the high incidence of child sexual abuse as a precursor to later involvement in the sex industry.

MANDY FRASER: You're working with beautiful people who have survived God awful life circumstances since day one, and have every odd stacked against them. And you fall in love with them.

If people knew the percentages of child abuse and childhood sexual abuse—. It's—you know, what I've seen—numbers between 80 to 95 percent. And I would say 100 percent of people who end up in survival sex work have had child abuse or child neglect. And I know that it's over three quarter, for sure. And every woman that I've worked with in the Dream Catchers group has been raped at a very young age—mostly by someone in their community—like eight years old, five years old, you know, “my sister's boyfriend,” whoever—violently raped at a young age.

So if people knew about those things, then I think they'd be less likely to buy sex from people and to—I don't know—just maybe shifting social attitudes about survival sex workers.

And, you know, I constantly hear dead hooker jokes and, “Oh, it was just a prostitute. It doesn't count.”

It's pervasive in pop culture, in you know, like adult cartoon shows like Archer, for example. It's a guilty pleasure. And it—

I can't. I can't. I have to turn it off sometimes because they're joking about dead hookers or joking about rape and sexual violence. You know, *Family Guy*. Ridiculous, like, awful.

And I think that we need to keep challenging those things because we're dehumanizing. And if you dehumanize somebody then you can buy and sell and rape and murder them. So, public awareness across the board.

Ms. Fraser states that from her experience, between 75 and 100 percent of survivors she has worked with were victims of child abuse or neglect.

A survivor, Marie, tells her story that highlights poverty, lack of opportunity and exposure to the sex industry in conjunction with having been sexually abused as a child by her father, as factors in later being “put into” the sex industry.

MARIE: “Human trafficking,” for me, it's a globalized word. For me, I feel like when you are human trafficking somebody, you are not just putting somebody out on the street. You're selling somebody for the profit of money.

Me and my friends, we all came from poor backgrounds. We all lived in the North End.

My mom had severe addictions issues so a lot of the times there wasn't the basic needs at home.

So when I found out my friends were doing it, it just kind of seemed to happen I guess. For me I think it was a lot easier for me because my dad was a pedophile so I already had that experience of being with older men.

So when I made the— Well, I didn't really make a decision. When I was put into the sex, it just seemed right at the moment because there was no other way to support myself. I wasn't old enough for welfare so that was my only means of obtaining clothing and stuff.

The survival sex that Marie talked about is a theme that threads through the stories in this thesis, illustrating the direct relationship between poverty and lack of opportunities that have a higher likelihood of making children vulnerable, especially when coupled with traumatic childhood abuse. Marie's story highlights the fact that survivors of the sex industry are unique and intersectionally challenged, and how their worldviews often differ from the norm (Grace, 2014; Hankivsky, 2011). Robertson and Sgoutas (2012) also stress the importance of not comparing intersectionally challenged people, such as sex industry survivors, with the norm; they have unique challenges.

Constable Anna Janzen of the WPS highlights that in all the years she has investigated issues related to prostitution, all of the survivors were previously sexually abused as children.

ANNA JANZEN: I have found in my 15 plus years of policing, I have yet to come across anybody that is involved in the sex trade that has not been a victim of either child abuse or sexual exploitation at a very young age. So it's just a huge problem.

And for me, I'm just very passionate about it. And if there's something that police or any of the social services can do to minimize it or to not pass judgment on people that are involved in that lifestyle, that's important to me.

Ms. Janzen also highlighted the importance of practitioners being non-judgmental when dealing with survivors. She describes here, how survivors have their childhoods stolen from them.

ANNA JANZEN: I truly think each is on a case-by-case situation and the dynamics of the family or what's happening in the child's home.

Like I've spoken with sex trade workers that—. One girl, in particular. I clearly remember the conversation. She has said to me, like, she doesn't ever remember being a child.

Like her earliest memory ever was her mother's boyfriend coming into her room at

age four and abusing her.

Like she doesn't ever remember playing on a swing set or going to the park. She just remembers like always being abused. She didn't even know she was being abused back then. She had no concept of that and that stems from a very early age.

Ms. Janzen points out the opportunity to intervene, possibly in schools, to educate young people about the perils of predators in the sex industry, and by using risk factors as indicators for intervention to assist young people caught up in the sex industry.

Similarly, Constable Liz Kaulk who is with the RCMP Exploited Persons Pro-active Strategy (EPPS) team, attached with Project Devote, Manitoba's Missing and Murdered Task Force, highlights that family dynamics are important and there are opportunities to intervene to prevent trafficking of young girls.

LIZ KAULK: Like the girls I've spoken to on the street level in Winnipeg do say—when I asked them when they began working in the sex trade—when they were youth at 13 years old, 14 years old some of them. Some of them have been there for 10 years or more and it's kind of shocking, what has happened. Why can't something be done in that time or any time in the continuum? But it starts young, and they see no way out of it.

It starts with families. And you see a lot of the niche or pros screens [the RCMP records/reporting system] come up with domestic violence in their youth. You'd go to that home for domestic violence. And then you go to that home for a runaway youth. You go to that home for all the criminal activity. And then, of course, addictions are huge.

And that is a huge issue from youth. It starts way back when they're young as well, and just continues on the whole way. So it's complicated for a lot of people. But it certainly starts young.

The services are different I think when they're youth. And it depends on their situation. Are they in care? Are they not in care? Is there abuse? Is there not abuse?—because sometimes there isn't.

It's very individual sometimes. But the kids in care, they're troubled there, too. So it would be nice to do something there and then maybe prevent half of that from going on so that they don't spend the next 10 years working on the street.

Rejeanne Caron also described the family dynamic in her story that was emphasized by Liz Kaulk. She described one survivor's story that illustrates how these vulnerable children are victims of the circumstances they are born into, often neglected and/or abused by the ones who they rely on to care for them.

REJEANNE CARON: I've always viewed them as victims of circumstance of life that put them in that position.

For example, when I worked in the prostitution diversion camp, I had a young girl who was hepatitis A, B, and C, was a sex trade worker, was addicted to drugs, and managed to get herself out of it.

And she explained her story. And her story was such that she was a 13-year-old girl, Dad had criminal associations to a major gang in Winnipeg. And dad—this young girl who expected dad to take care of her—exploited her and basically had all his friends have sex with her. So it was a gang rape.

So you hear stories like that.

Why are we criminalizing these girls? And I think the approach now is the view that girls should not be victimized. And we as a society, and we as a police service, and all those collaborative efforts are to help girls get out of those situations.

The days of criminalizing prostitution—I feel that shouldn't be. And I know the [Winnipeg Police Service] is moving in a direction that we are not criminalizing them, and obviously throughout Canada as well.

The fact that one's own parents could allow this to happen to their child, as Ms. Caron points out in the previous selection from her interview, is difficult to comprehend, yet it is important to acknowledge if we are to make enduring and sustainable change. The stories of participants I interviewed seem to support previous research, but in a visceral way. They are gut-wrenching and hard to hear, but it is this type of honesty that might result in real change.

Previous research on the connection between childhood abuse conditions and later sex industry involvement is relatively dated and sparse. The Badgley Committee (Badgley, 1984) found correlations between poor home conditions, lack of support systems and later sex industry participation. More recently, McIntyre's (2012) examination of 41 females and nine males involved in the sex industry in Alberta, Canada, found that 82 percent of the sample experienced sexual abuse prior to entering the sex industry.

Other scholars have also found correlations between childhood sexual abuse and later sexual exploitation (see Chapter 3, Klatt, Cavanaugh & Eganc, 2014; McIntyre, 2012; Roe-Sepowitz et al., 2011; Kaestle, 2012; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010). General physical abuse has also been associated with later sexual exploitation (Roe-Sepowitz et al., 2011;

Greene, Ennett & Ringwalt, 1999). These findings indicate possibilities for constructive intervention measures to prevent children from later becoming involved in the sex industry. For example, as several of my research participants pointed out in this section, the necessity of training to identify and act appropriately on seeing signs of early sexual abuse for teachers, social workers and police who could prevent young people being exploited by family members, predators and pimps.

This study enhances our understanding of previous findings that there is a connection between early childhood general abuse and sexual abuse, and later involvement of the child in the sex industry. Yet it highlights more directly, through the stories of survivors, the connection between early traumatic sex abuse and the likelihood of later sex industry involvement. The stories recounted by the survivors and practitioners showed a strong feeling among all of the participants that there are opportunities for intervention where early childhood sexual abuse has occurred. Perhaps one of the most significant contributions of this research is to highlight that we need further research specifically into the early warning signs and indicators of later vulnerability to exploitation, in all of its various forms, and how to intervene to prevent it.

5.3.1 Love conquers all

A significant theme that arose during this research was the need youth have to feel loved and to belong, and how that increases their vulnerability to exploitation. Sex traffickers are very aware of these human needs and dynamics and how to take advantage of them (see section 5.2.2). In plain English, we all need love, and so particularly do teenagers who are finding their way in the world and feeling a strong need to belong. Ashley, one of the survivors I interviewed describes how she was vulnerable and hanging around, looking to belong when she was targeted and introduced to crack cocaine by some ‘guys’ who were either traffickers or who passed her to

traffickers once she was hooked on crack.

Another survivor, Elizabeth, had a similar story to Ashley, having been trafficked in the sex industry for many years. She now works helping other women to escape the sex industry. She describes the importance of family dynamics, as Constable Anna Janzen and others had, and specifically mentions the need for the love of a father.

ELIZABETH: You know, the peer support model is so crucial because it gives hope and encouragement of others who have made the journey ahead of them, and also a reminder of where they have come. So I think just having that connection and that model is really, really important. But I don't know if there is a true answer because I still think it stems from family of origin and those issues.

If I could say one thing that would have prevented me [from entering the sex industry], it would have been father love, you know. That having the love and support of a father that is present. You know my dad provided financially, but he wasn't there emotionally, so that—I hear it over and over again,

And when women are transitioning, it's—they get hooked up with johns that are safer than the regulars. So they will start their transition out that way, and it's convoluted.

Elizabeth described the need that predators fulfill for young girls, namely providing them with attention and being emotionally present.

Jane Runner (ED TERF) also highlights our human need for love and belonging and how it makes us vulnerable. She describes the need for hope.

JANE RUNNER: We need to interact non-judgmentally. Love, conquers all.

I think every woman or man that's out there selling themselves does not feel very good about themselves, and for them to be put down further is the worst we can do.

I think basically for me right now working in the field I'm working is—you can come across myself or even Dianna [Bussey, from the Salvation Army]—it's just meeting girls where they're at and being there and just encouraging them, believing in them when they're unable to believe in themselves.

We can't do it for them, but we sure encourage to do it. Give them hope.

Ms. Runner emphasizes that the sense of being loved is critical for youth. She also came back to the point mentioned earlier about the importance of practitioners being non-judgmental. Based on the comments that my 61 participants made with respect to vulnerability, my sense is that love means that youth need to sense that someone cares about them if they are to be resilient.

Similarly, RCMP Deputy Commissioner Kevin Brosseau describes the significance of love for young people and the need for the child's positive attachment with family from his years of experience working with various components of the sex industry.

KEVIN BROSSÉAU: I can tell you of a couple other situations where young women who for real, perhaps started as teenage rebellion, got themselves connected with older guys—who out of a misplaced loyalty and/or feelings of love or relationship, ended up on the street having to work.

Where it started, and if you tracked it back either through the parents or through them, it started as, “This guy told me all the things I wanted to hear and I wasn’t getting from anyone else, that I was beautiful, that I was cared for, that nobody else said. My parents were saying, you know, things they said didn’t make any sense. They were dumb. They didn’t need to be listened to. “Come with me. I’ll give you all you need.”

And you’ll feel all that self-esteem is built up through that way. And it makes them feel good at the beginning. And then, you know, before they know it, it’s like that frog in the hot water. Before they know it, they find themselves in the situation where they’re having to turn tricks, to use that language, and, you know, to make someone happy.

It is clear, from the participants in this research, that teenage girls need a sense of belonging and predators are experts in identifying youth who have that need lacking in their lives. Mr. Brosseau describes how predators are filling a void for young women who feel vulnerable due to their need for a sense of belonging. As Patricia Haberman mentions, vulnerable youth are first made by predators to feel like they belong, with gifts and attention, then they are suddenly indebted and made to sell sex to pay their debts.

Hennes Doltze of the Salvation Army talks further about the vulnerability that results for youth from their lack of family connections.

HENNES DOLTZE: The average age of entry into the sex trade I think is between 13, some studies indicate, 14.

But I think it always is a lack of connection that people have at that age where they do not have a close connection to people that they love, that are supportive of them.

So they’re very vulnerable at that point, and especially in the teenage years that are challenging to begin with. And then if things are not well at home or if children or youth are involved in CFS care, I think there is little or no secure relationships that people experience.

And I think that’s the most vulnerable point where predators really use those vulnerabilities to make that connection and they offer that support and that—and I hate to

say it but that love—which isn't really love but they make it sound like it is.

And they accept. And they buy them nice things, but then in return it's a grooming phase, right? And I think that's the focus that should be given, is how can we make sure and protect youth that are vulnerable at that point.

And I think that's one of the main concerns of why youth enter into the sex trade is because of those vulnerabilities.

Mr. Doltze points out that predators know how to offer what appears like love to gain the acceptance and trust of vulnerable young girls so they can manipulate them.

The perspectives obtained from interviews with survivors and practitioners alike have a similar theme, namely that youth are vulnerable because they have a need for love and a sense of belonging. This corresponds with the previous research findings of Cullen-DuPont (2009).

Predators understand and act on these basic needs. This research contributes to the knowledge about basic human needs and vulnerability. It highlights the necessity for more research about how to increase youth resistance and resilience against predators.

5.4 End child poverty: They all end up in CFS

My research participants consistently reported a direct relationship between being placed in the care of CFS and later being exploited in the sex industry. This makes sense as children are taken into care for reasons. That being said, this research contributes to a deeper awareness of some dynamics that endanger children and make them vulnerable, and how we may better protect them.

Michael Richardson of Marymount has worked with sexually exploited youth in Manitoba for over 20 years. He comments on the risks to children both at home and those who reside in group home settings.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: There is a critical point at the very beginning of kids not being protected, kids being exposed to abuse. I think that's the critical point.

But how we deal with that afterwards becomes the evolution of who the child is

going to become or who they're going to be.

So, a lot of kids that have been abused or have been identified as sexually abused or physically abused or neglected come into care, come into a fragmented system. I'll say that that's a turning point because there's really no continuum.

Once they get in, you're protected from your abuser, but it can introduce more abuse just by not having the all-around full service of parenting and guidance and supervision and things of that nature. I think that when kids get into the system, there are so many gaps. We lose the child so we wind up doing the child more harm. It's damaging and I hate to see—

I see kids come into care, and how can we do more or how to keep kids out of care but also protecting them at the same time.

This theme of children coming into care and being vulnerable to exploitation came up consistently throughout the interviews, including with former CFS Minister Kerri Irvin-Ross.

Kerri Irvin-Ross was asked what the turning point for youth is when they enter the sex industry and what could be done to prevent it. Ms. Irvin-Ross is also a trained social worker who worked in social services before entering politics. Like Michael Richardson she said that a turning point for youth is when they come into the care of CFS.

KERRI IRVIN-ROSS: Well, I think the turning point for some youth that I am familiar with was the day that they were apprehended and removed from their family. And they might have been a year old. And then moved from foster home to foster home. That's kind of the context that I will answer this question in. That's kind of the turning point.

I believe the sense or the lack of belonging and identity and how that manifests itself in individuals and children and youth around mental health and addictions. And no coping skills because they haven't had that unconditional support and love and stability because of multiple moves in the foster care system.

I think that we have to do a way better job of preventing kids from coming into care. And that when they come into care, we need to be able to provide them with more stable opportunities.

Ms. Irvin-Ross pointed out that coming into care at a very young age often removes the opportunity for children to have a supportive family network that is so important in their resistance to exploitation. As such, coming into care is often a turning point for youth becoming vulnerable to predators and getting coaxed into the sex industry.

Marie, a survivor of sex trafficking who now works in an NGO assisting others to leave the

sex industry, draws a more direct connection between being in CFS care and being vulnerable to sex trafficking and exploitation. She also agrees with Ms. Irvin-Ross that removing children from their familial home for protection causes much damage. Marie suggests that the threat should be removed from family homes when possible, rather than the child who is threatened.

MARIE: End child poverty. All these kids are ending up in CFS.

Seventy six percent of all females in CFS care end up being prostituted or exploited after they enter the system.

Why? Because they are being taken from their home and placed in a stranger's home and being treated as such. There's no sense of belonging there.

CFS should be putting resources in the home and not the support worker that comes in once a week. If the parent has issues with addiction. then remove the parent, keep the kids in the home and add a support worker instead of removing the kids and putting them in a locked facility or a group home which is just a pre-institution to a bigger one like jail.

I don't know. End child poverty. Give people more money. Help them get into school. Make more treatment centres even so there's not such a long waiting list. People who are addicts obviously aren't going to wait two months or they'll just keep using, and then we can find them two months later where they end up dead.

Marie states that vulnerability occurs when young girls are placed in CFS care, because removing family structure and supports can exacerbate their problems. She describes, as did several participants, how children with issues are often placed into a situation wherein people who fully understand their vulnerability prey on them. Marie stresses that resources should be put into the home, rather than the child being removed from it.

Similarly, another survivor, Grace, talks about the placements within CFS and how the root causes of youth's underlying issues are often not understood by the people around them.

GRACE: Yeah, I really honestly feel that Child and Family Services needs to be a little bit more fucking mindful of where they place children, right?

Like, no, first of all no one ever asked why I was misbehaving. No one ever said, "Why are you so angry?"

Maybe you should ask the kids that are having a fucking temper tantrum. Like I wasn't acting out because I wanted to be a rude kid. I was traumatized with being raped at the age of eleven.

I don't know. I just feel like if my child right now at the age of 12 or 11 started smoking pot and drinking alcohol in excess, I would think, what is wrong? That is not a normal behavioral development for children, and no one ever asked, what was wrong? I

was called a “slut,” an “ungrateful kid,” “good for nothing.” “What the fuck did I ever deserve to have a child like you?”

Yeah, placement. And that speaks volumes even for me being Métis appearance of Caucasian. I can’t imagine what it would look like if I came from a rural reserve community and grown up on reserve. I can’t imagine being uprooted and brought to Winnipeg, then raped, and placed in a group home. Sometimes people don’t think when they place kids. We need to ask them what is good for them.

My mother did the best she could, but could not handle me. She called Mobile Crisis and got me out, and I was placed in the [Crisis Stabilization Unit]. She called me a couple of days later, and I told her to go fuck herself.

No one asked me why I was angry.

Now I’ve worked with kids in the system and all kids who act like that there is something wrong. We need to stop and ask them what is going on.

Survivors like Grace and Marie point out important gaps in the system such as the need for more training for staff and social workers to ensure they recognize the indicators of sexual exploitation and have the tools to intervene appropriately.

Chelsea Jarosiewicz is the manager of the Girls Crisis Stabilization Unit (CSU) at Marymount, and formerly a placement social worker with Child and Family Services. She shares similar views clearly indicating that sometimes the removal of the child from the home and her placement in a facility creates new problems. Ms. Jarosiewicz stressed that young people wind up in crisis and are vulnerable due to lacking a sense of belonging, or feeling alienation, peer pressure, and problems at home. She contends that taking these children out of the family home and placing them into a strange environment with new pressures does not help them.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: The youth that I worked with have been anywhere from—the youngest I can remember was 11 up to 17. So I’m trying to think of the young ones. For me, from my knowledge, what’s mostly gotten them into it has been that lack of belonging, peer pressure, problems at home, unhappy with the system, and CFS and their placement, and frequently getting involved in gangs, and to me that’s sort of the turning point unfortunately.

It happens a lot in CFS, which is really sad to think. A lot of our kids get put into a place and don’t see their family, lack of a sense of belonging, and you know they need to be with somebody. They easily get preyed on at that point, the most vulnerable.

I think what needs to change, needs to happen within the field of Social Work: looking at our apprehensions. Can we focus more on prevention of that?

Family. Keeping families together. Can we put resources in to ensure kids can stay at home with their families? What I see a lot is that kids get taken away from their homes. And they just don't understand why and they run away to go back to their homes. And at that point they get really lost. So I think prevention is key in keeping families together and even educating young girls and young families from a young age.

Ms. Jarosiewicz strongly suggests, as does Marie, that it is more effective to place resources into the home to improve the family support system rather than taking children out of the home away from their kinship network. She further added that keeping a child in the home environment might reduce runaway behavior that leads to increased risk of exploitation by sexual predators.

Constable Andrea Scott is a member of the WPS Missing Persons Unit, working with exploited and high risk youth with a high incidence of runaway behaviour. This excerpt from Ms. Scott's interview illustrates the increased dangers of runaway behaviour that often accompany the process of the child who is taken out of the home and placed in foster care or group homes.

ANDREA SCOTT: I think once you start getting bounced around in CFS—and I'm going to say CFS because that's the majority of the people that we deal with—some do go missing from home.

But the majority we have are from group homes, from shelters, used to be from the hotels. Once they start being more inclined to be on the street, they get more involved in addictions, and the people that they hang out with.

And I think once they really get into CFS and into different homes, multiple different homes with kind of no stability and no sense of home, that's a really big turning point, I think.

You know what? Education, I think, is huge.

Availability of treatment. Because a lot of the girls that we deal with have huge addictions issues. And sometimes, I mean, it's only a seven-day treatment centre that they can go into, and it's not long enough. We need long-term treatment facilities that I think would be beneficial. And really remove them because seven days is nothing. So a longer-term treatment facility would definitely be helpful, especially for the young ones.

Ms. Scott makes an important point that placements often lead to other placements and even more instability, resulting in higher risk behaviours such as drug and alcohol abuse for youth.

Trevor Bagnalo also describes how the same dynamics described by Ms. Scott occur in

the rural North. Trevor Bragnalo was an RCMP Officer for several years in Thompson, Manitoba, doing counter exploitation work, and he now works with the WPS. Mr. Bragnalo highlights challenges in the CFS system, wherein it has few resources for runaway and exploited youth, as it constantly defers to the police to look for missing children.

TREVOR BRAGNALO: When I called Winnipeg Police, they're like, "Oh, yeah? We have 110 missing kids tonight.?"

I'm, like, "How's that even possible?" Like that's crazy. Then I thought, "Wait a second, Winnipeg's a city of 800,000, right? But do you have police officers looking for every single kid every single second?" You can't. It's not logistically possible to do it, you know?

But then why are these kids running away? Like, because they hate their group homes. So yeah, that needs to be rectified.

And then you have kids living in hotels down here, and kids getting murdered. There was that one just downtown here. Did that child deserve to be murdered? Or the fact that they're in care?

And, you know, there are many issues, and I know they're not going to be fixed overnight, and probably it will take a very long time, but it'd just be nice to see, you know?

Sometimes these girls, when they are taken into the CFS system, if there's something that could be done to sit down educate them. Say, "Look, like Winnipeg isn't Pukatawagan. Winnipeg is a dangerous city, and there's people here that are going to pretend to be your friend. They're going to befriend you—."

Mr. Bragnalo discussed the high demands that are placed on the police by group homes and CFS facilities when the police are continually asked to look for runaway youth. He described how there is a lack of resources in the CFS system for high risk youth in care. As a result, group homes and foster parents call the police, placing a significant strain on police resources.

Kelly Dennison is a WPS Inspector with many years of experience working with exploited women and youth. He describes, as did Mr. Bragnalo, the demands that are placed on the police by child welfare systems.

KELLY DENNISON: One thing that comes out loud and clear to me is the relationship with Child and Family Services and missing persons and sexually exploited youth.

I think there's a direct relationship between those youths that are constantly missing and reported to a police service as missing and those youths that are involved in being sexually exploited. And to look at them as two different things, I think is a mistake, because it's the same issue.

We've got girls right now, Bob, I can tell you—. And you know. You've seen the queue [that is, the backlog of pending Police service calls]. You've got five missing persons calls. Four of them are for habitual runaway kids. And those habitual runaway kids are all at very high risk of being exploited. Four out of five.

So there's a direct correlation, a direct relationship, I believe, between missing and sexually exploited youth in our city.

Mr. Dennison, like Ms. Scott and Mr. Bragnalo, all highlights the high correlation between runaway behaviour and the child's vulnerability to exploitation.

WPS Superintendent Liz Pilcher was a former commander of the same division Mr. Dennison now oversees; it includes the Missing Persons, Sex Crimes, Child Abuse, and Counter Exploitation units. She reiterates the vulnerability that Mr. Dennison mentions of children in care, the need for greater interagency collaboration and the importance of schools participating in preventing children and vulnerable youth from being exploited by predators and pimps. Ms. Pilcher also added that there is a lack of accountability in the child welfare system over the people who are charged with vulnerable youth's care.

LIZ PILCHER: I think that if we've talked to many of the missing kids that they're delving into this [sex industry] as young as 11 and 12.

Some of them—in talking to them later on, some of the things that we found, and this is again through Missing Persons Unit—is that a lot of them were in Child and Family Services care, and there's nothing really to account for them going to school or having any parental roles. And I think that's really in the system if you look at prevention.

I think that attending school is huge for these kids. A lot of them, once they get into care, aren't attending school. There's really nothing done to cause them to go to school.

There's talk that we do have truancy officers, but I'm really not sure what they do.

So the educational system, I think, can play into this and it's again that collaborative effort among a number of systems to really start getting engaged when these kids are young because that's when they're going to start delving into drugs and alcohol. It's not when they're 16/17. It's really at those crucial time periods.

They have a lack of family support. I mentioned in care—and I think that's critical—is there's number of kids in care and I think they're really looking for some direction and some parental guidance. And there's a lack of that for them.

So, through my experience, I would say it's younger than we think. And I think we really need to do something through—whether it's the educational system. Something has to be done.

And I know as well a lot of these kids as well are dealing with mental health issues. And that's something that has been sort of talked about in terms of a lack of mental health

resources for these kids' addictions.

Ms. Pilcher stresses that part of the reason youth become vulnerable in CFS care is the lack of accountability for their not attending school. She emphasized that youth are more vulnerable when they are younger and that children as young as 11 years old are being preyed on in the sex industry. Her observation of the need for more accountability among agencies highlights the need for all of the stakeholders to be part of the solution. This is consistent with the findings of Prothrow-Stith and Spivak (2004) in Boston, where they found great success by engaging multiple sectors in working together to combat violence among young African American men.

WPS Sergeant Cam MacKid asserts that resources should be placed on incorporating more collaborative and multi-disciplinary approaches to protect children. He articulates some of the challenges of working with multiple agencies and limited resources.

CAM MACKID: There's no barriers within our service, whatsoever. We've got phenomenal support from our street level guys, through our unit and right to the executive. Whatever we want to try—if we think it's going to help—we've got support in our organization. Absolutely no barriers.

Within other organizations—I mentioned a little bit, there, with our partnership with child protection—there are different cultures. A lot of it comes back to liability.

There might be a 17-year-old girl on back page for child protection. That's a child. She's under 18. That's a child needing protection. That's an emergency for them.

For us, if we've engaged with that same woman 15 to 20 times and she's basically told us to fuck off every time, at some point that can't be a priority for us because we do have other priorities. And our priorities don't match with other agencies. That's just one example that by and large were all after the same thing

We've got very good relationships with child protection. They always want a little bit more from us. They'd like us to sit in the car with them and drive around. Child protection would love full-time officers.

It comes down to resources. And it's probably above my pay scale as to plan resources for different inhibitors. But, yeah, everyone would like school police to be there. Everyone would like police in a tight working relationship. And I get that.

But in a small unit like this, I have to designate my resources where I see fit. So that's sometimes where we have issues with other agencies.

Mr. MacKid describes some of the challenges that result from agencies with different organizational cultures and perspectives trying to work together (see Chapter 10).

Mr. MacKid asks an important question, namely, who is responsible for protecting a high-risk youth? Child welfare agencies point fingers at the police and say it is a legal issue of people breaking the law. Police point fingers at child welfare and say these are child protection issues and not legal ones. No one is pointing fingers at the health and education systems, yet they surely have a stake in the outcome of these issues. Ultimately, it becomes a question of how we can collectively share responsibility for high risk youth, rather than deferring risk and assigning blame. As the African proverb states, “it takes a village to raise a child” (author unknown).

This research contributes to understanding how we might manage the dynamics around responsibility to protect vulnerable youth. One of the survivors quoted above agrees with the former Minister of Child and Family Services that much damage is done when we remove children from their family environment needlessly. Perhaps in some cases resources could be injected into the home rather than taking the child out of it. The narrative among police officers has often revolved around the question, who is responsible for these high-risk youths? From the survivors’ perspectives, more training for social workers and police is required, and we need more careful consideration and accountability in CFS placements.

5.5 Every child is unique

Participants were asked if there is a critical turning point for youth when they enter the sex industry and if so, what could be done to prevent it. The stories were insightful, and contributed to our knowledge about youth vulnerability to exploitation. Generally, participants stressed that there is not one specific risk factor, but rather that every case is different. For example, Daphne Penrose is the Acting Executive Director of Winnipeg CFS. She articulates how youth vulnerability to predators and pimps manifests itself.

DAPHNE PENROSE: So I think that there's no way to answer this question—Is there a critical event or turning point for youth?—because what I've come to learn is that every single child is unique and every single child's entry into the sex trade for them is unique.

And what you would consider to be a turning point for each child is going to be very different. And it can, again, look like Mom allowing uncle to have sex with her child for drugs, and the child may not even know that's the turning point for them. They may see the turning point as coming into care, but that's not the turning point.

I think that every story I've heard from experiential folks has been different about what's worked for them to exit the sex trade.

I think going back to the coordinated response is that there isn't a one-size-fits-all. There is no one answer because if one of us had the one answer there's not one of these organizations that wouldn't do it. But we don't have one answer for every child or adult that's exploited or in the sex trade. We don't have one answer and for those folks who think they have the answer they are becoming part of the problem.

Ms. Penrose highlights that every child is different; therefore, it is impossible to identify a specific turning point where all youth are forced to enter the sex industry.

Kelly Dennison's story is consistent with Ms. Penrose's ideas. However, he did feel that a common starting point is when a child hits rock bottom, when s/he feels helpless and thinks that they have no other options. Inspector Dennison points out that youth often have no place else to go. He makes an important point, one that was raised in several ways throughout this research, that a young girl does not make a conscious decision to engage in the sex industry; it normally results from the lack of opportunities to do something else.

KELLY DENNISON: I guess from my experience going back—. You know what, Bob?—the critical event or turning point was nowhere else to go. That's what we saw so much.

The girls that I dealt with in my career that are on the street, they never intended to be there. They didn't wake up and go, "I'm going to be a prostitute today." That never happened.

They may have woken up one morning and didn't know where they were. They may be having a drug problem or an addictions issue, with no money, no way to feed that addiction, and they found themselves on the street. Whether they were exploited by an individual—which is what we see now—for drugs or alcohol or whatever. So I think their turning point was, it was almost rock bottom. These girls had nowhere else to go, nothing else to do.

Well, they need help. Exiting the sex trade, to me, I liken it to somebody who's an alcoholic, or drug addicted, or a lot of other situations they find themselves in, that they don't have the ability—once they've gotten to that point, whether they've been exploited to that point or not—to get out of that vicious circle. They need some interventions.

Cam MacKid describes children's vulnerability to sexual predators in a similar way to Mr. Dennison. He also stresses that a child's rock bottom is impacted by a large number of variables. He outlined the typical scenario as follows.

CAM MACKID: I think that it's almost like the death by a thousand needles.

It starts at a young age in a vast majority of cases. The parents, from a young age, they aren't doing what they should be doing. And the kids either end up in a house that there's abuse, there's addiction issues, there's abandonment there, either in that environment.

Or, taken from that environment or put into another environment where now you don't have that parental care there. There's still someone who's well intended in most cases, trying to guide this child, but without that parental structure there, they're not going to get the same attention.

I think the kids understand that, and it leads to running away and a lack of barriers.

And I don't think there's a single defining moment where this happens, especially if you're being groomed by one of these predators that I mentioned. It happens very slowly. And a lot of girls, even once they're being exploited for several years, they won't even realize that it's even happening. And they'll think they've had control this whole time. So they don't really even see the big picture.

Similarly, Constable Andrea Scott of the Missing Persons Unit also highlighted the importance of family connections in keeping young people off the streets. Ms. Scott stressed how these youth need attention and something to keep them busy and engaged that is consistent with Liz Pilcher's comments about the need to have youth actively involved in school.

ANDREA SCOTT: I believe it needs to start at home. If kids were at home with, you know, ideal parents and structure and school—

I'd say probably 95 percent of kids we deal with aren't in school. And if you're not in school, you're out at night, you know. No good is happening.

If we can get them into school and get them in a stable environment—. These kids don't have structure. They need a good stable home life. And if that can't be at home, that needs to be in a foster home.

But they can't be bounced around in group homes, basically because they're meeting other kids that are showing them how to get into this lifestyle.

There needs to be more foster home and more foster homes out of town because most of these kids all their triggers are into drugs and things like that. If we had foster homes out of town or a good school out in the country, work on a farm, do something right other than—

A lot of kids, when we talk to them, they're bored. So you know have them get into a sport, have them get into school, give them something to do that they can be successful at and keep them busy.

The whole question and debate around what type of facilities could help, and if they should be secure or open, or whether the rural-urban dichotomy makes a difference all shed light on the complexity of the issue and the need to tackle it in a multi-modal and multilevel intervention process.

Superintendent Bill Fogg (ret.) was commander of the WPS Missing Persons Unit, Counter Exploitation Unit and numerous other related units specializing in the investigation of issues related to vulnerable persons. He describes family stability and resilience, youth vulnerability and how the child welfare system might be improved.

BILL FOGG: Well, I think people get to that, get to the sex trade by different routes. I don't think there's one particular way.

But I think for a lot of kids, you know, they get themselves into the Child and Family Services system. They get on the run. And while they're on the run, they're vulnerable to predators.

I do think there's times—where kids have become involved in the sex trade—every time they come in contact with the police or the various different NGOs, you have to be prepared that maybe that's the opportunity for them to be ready to take a step. So it's knowing what resources are potentially available for kids that are regularly involved with, say, the police.

Mr. Fogg points out the missed or potential opportunities to intervene when service providers come into contact with exploited youth. Training for police and social workers might improve this lack of coordination.

Kelly Holmes is the Executive Director of Resource Assistance for Youth, a non-profit organization that works with youth in Winnipeg. She highlights how homelessness makes youths vulnerable to being exploited and trafficked by unsavory characters.

KELLY HOLMES: Well, again, my framework from which I work is homelessness.

And so, I see anything that happens on the street as dangerous. Sex trade is part of that. Gangs are another part of that. Violence is part of that. You know, drug dealing and getting involved in serious kinds of addictions or people or whatever. It's all part of that.

And it's always been my understanding that we have about two years from the time they exit a place of support to hitting the street where they get into real trouble.

Often in this world that we know, Bob, kids are being discharged from jail, from child welfare and jail, on the same day. They're leaving to nothing, without a plan.

And so they show up to places like mine, that is only really open until 10PM at night. And they don't have a clue about where to begin. And so these types of kids in scenarios are all the breeding ground for future exploitation of any kind. They're that vulnerable.

And it could be, "Look, I'm hungry. I will give you a blowjob for a Subway sandwich. I will do whatever. I will bargain with you because I'm that bloody desperate." And then they're marked. And they're set up to, you know, continue on and fail.

So I think the other thing is to—and again, this is more societal—but youth and children born into abject poverty often are set up from the get go. And, I mean, in this city, as you're well aware, we're talking about three generations of welfare, maybe third-generation gang members.

And this is all rooted in our colonial history and poverty. So how does that stop? How do we make things more equitable and resource the heck out of people so they don't feel the need to turn to crime to have a fruitful life, or the ability to survive in a different way, right?

Ms. Holmes makes the connection among sexual exploitation, poverty, and lack of opportunities.

Ed Riglin is a RCMP Sergeant who has dedicated much of his professional career to counter-exploitation work. He described mental health issues as a major correlate of a child's vulnerability to exploitation. Most people did not mention this issue in the interviews. Perhaps it is the result of the fact that the question was not asked of the interviewees. Mental health issues with many exploited youth is a well-known phenomenon among practitioners, yet is under represented in the literature on youth well-being. In the following extract from his interview, Ed Riglin describes this phenomenon in detail.

ED RIGLIN: In child abuse cases, child exploitation cases, often I'm dealing with a girl that is 15 or 16 years old, but is only functioning as an eight-year-old and not that wise in their concepts. Sometimes 12 years old, but only functioning as a five- or six-year-old.

They are exploiting them because of that. They're exploiting these girls, knowing they have that mental deficiency.

They're not stupid. these guys know what they're doing.

We need that component at the table so anytime we're going to put together say they say, "Okay, Bob, you guys are going to put together a unit and a strategy to deal with

Winnipeg. You guys create a HUB.”

If we had a HUB around the table here, we would have probation services, social services. We would have the abuse investigator and abuse teams from the social network represented, the abuse units. We would have mental health services from the province and/or private, whatever. We would have them all sitting around that table and we would actually put a case on that table and look at from all aspects.

Mr. Riglin points out that many of the youth involved in the sex industry are suffering from various mental health issues so that for example a 13-year-old might function at a five-year-old level, and the health system must be involved in multi-disciplinary work around the issue.

This research contributes insights into the existing system of resources and agencies related to youth vulnerability in Manitoba. Most my interview participants could not identify one critical issue or turning point wherein youth enter the sex industry. However, they did highlight that young people become vulnerable for a number of varied reasons. These include a loss of resilience, dysfunctional family ties and supports, and mental health issues. When a youth, for whatever reason, loses his/her sense of place and connection with a family, it seems s/he will desperately seek it elsewhere, and this is where the gangs and exploiters step in. The key, it seems is in identifying vulnerable youth and getting them appropriate resources early on before they are trafficked.

5.6 Poverty and lack of opportunities links with exploitation

Most of my research participants highlighted that one of the main underlying factors that results in people's exploitation in the sex industry is the lack of opportunities to do something else. A search of the 61 transcripts of the participant's interviews found 97 incidences of the word “poverty.” Poverty was identified as a root cause underlying young people's lack of opportunities. This is the type of oppression that represents structural violence as defined by Galtung (1996). Reimer, et al. (2015) also describe how people's vulnerability and victimization

are tied, at least in part, to the structural violence of marginalization that flows from poverty and economic disparity.

One survivor of 15 years of exploitation in the sex industry, Marie, now assists people striving to escape the sex industry. She describes the significance of poverty and the lack of proper housing as key factors contributing to the vulnerability of young people to sexual predators.

MARIE: Some people want to legalize [the sex industry]. Some people want to create safe houses. Some people think that the perp should be more accountable.

I really think that if people were given equal opportunity in the world. If people had self-esteem and motivation to get upgrading and to go to school and bigger EIA [that is, employment income assistance] benefits, or working well on EIA, you know. Because people who live on social assistance are living more than 50 percent under the LICO guideline, which is obscenely low.

So I feel if people had maybe a guaranteed income to maintain their home, it would help them to maintain their home, it would help them to feed their kids so they're stressed less.

And when people are stressed, they look to addiction to ease their stress.

If people are stressed, CFS should be able to intervene without having to have an open case file.

I believe the relationship between CFS and people in the community is not a good one. People see them as kidnappers. And ultimately it's just a breakdown, right? So, which leads to the parent losing their home. So if a parent loses their home, they lose their benefits, they're going to turn to the street, or they're going to turn to crime if it's a guy.

Kids are the same way. They're going to model what their parents do. So, then you're just creating a second generation of [sex] workers and guys getting involved in crime or gangs even.

So, is there anything that works right now? I don't know. I think everything right now is a Band-Aid solution to a bigger problem.

Marie describes the lack of opportunities and the environment as paramount in making youth vulnerable and susceptible to dangerous outside influences in the sex industry. Chief Ron Evans echoed this point by Marie, describing poverty and lack of opportunities as the root cause that results in young women and children being vulnerable to exploitation by sexual predators.

Chief Ron Evans, a leader in Manitoba's counter sexual exploitation planning, describes

poor housing as the main issue that leads to all manner of social ills, including the exploitation of youth in the sex industry.

RON EVANS: At a young age, teenagers, that's when there needs to be family supports.

There used to be access to education and training and recreational opportunities, strong family support and family unit health, and social stability. Now those are words that are too easy to say.

Now I've been in leadership for 26 consecutive years. I first became a leader back in 1980, which would be 36 years ago, so I've seen it you know. I've seen the challenges. I've seen governments. I've seen how things were.

There's been progress, but I've seen where there isn't. If there was true progress, the numbers would have declined, you know, from the number of people in jails, the number of murdered and missing women, the number of, you know, how people that are impacted by the healthcare system.

And so governments over the years have made every effort to say, "Okay education is the key. Education is the key so that you can get yourself out of poverty." Or, "education is the key so that you can you know make a contribution to your community, to society." Or, they'll throw money at economic development so that you can have jobs, you know, and begin to make your life better. Or they'll throw money at social programs. They'll throw money to the front-line workers.

But nobody is dealing with the root cause. The root cause is, as you have probably read in the paper now last week, where Manitoba needs \$1.9 billion for housing. In my community alone we have 8,000 people and we have a birth rate of 200 a year, and so in the last eight years we have not been able to build a house for that 1,600. We've grown by 1,600. So, where do people live when there is no housing? We've not been able to build a house.

But we've been able to build other infrastructure like an entertainment center, and we're going to build a baseball field. We've got other economic initiatives because we've partnered with others so our community grows in that regard.

So then we talk about the number of inmates. You know, the jails are bursting at the seams. The healthcare system, the healthcare cost and future [costs] rise because of the illnesses—whether it's illness caused by mold in the home or there's just not enough services to meet the needs.

And, many of the patients that come to the clinic or to the hospital is a result of violence through the social problems that overcrowding creates. So, overcrowding and shortage of housing that is the absolute root problem in First Nation communities.

If you have a home that's designed for a family of four or five but you've got double or triple that number living in that house, there's going to be problems. There's going to be problems because everybody wants their space. The appliances in those homes are not designed—. They're not commercial appliances but they're used as commercial appliances because there's just so many people living in there.

There is not enough storage space for food for that number of people.

There's only so many TVs and so it creates frustration.

People get frustrated. There's lots of tension that comes from that

They start fighting and so they seek a way out. And many times, you know, it's

alcohol or drugs just to get that sense of release to deal with the environment that they find themselves in.

And of course, many people are forced to relocate.

Then if it leads to alcohol or drugs and then leads to other violent behaviours, now they're going to jail. Now the justice system becomes involved. And then all of a sudden there's fighting. People are driving around impaired. There's violent behaviour. People end up in the hospital.

All of a sudden people in the hospital are dealing with people that they shouldn't have been dealing with in the first place. But now they're dealing with people that are crippled.

And then we need to equip these people with wheel chairs and ramps and the costs continue to escalate. And then people are forced to find other ways of coping.

At the same time, government is prepared to give money to the front-line workers. They're prepared to build another jail. They're prepared to fund another clinic.

But what good is education if you don't have a place to study? What good is a recreational program if you don't have means to buy the hockey equipment that is very expensive these days, or the sporting equipment that you need if you're going to create more recreational programs?

You're not dealing with the issue. Just to say we're going to create another agency over here so we can deal with these people that need help, but in the meantime there's more people coming behind those people. Now why don't we just deal with these issues that are creating all these problems?

Chief Evans goes on to describe in detail the problems that First Nations people have getting mortgages and buying homes. He describes how these root causes of social issues could be solved with better income and housing. This is an example of the hidden, "structural" violence described by Galtung (1996) and Reimer et al. (2015).

Similarly, Kerri Irvin-Ross (Former MLA and CFS Minister) also highlights the point that adequate housing and opportunities are key in reducing the sexual exploitation of young people.

KERRI IRVIN-ROSS: It's education, making sure that we're building awareness for all Manitobans because it's all of our responsibility. It's just not an Indigenous issue. It's just an issue of people living in poverty. It can happen to many people. So, I think that's really important.

I think that making sure we have strong interventions and those interventions include the basic needs, making sure that we have adequate housing and food and support for the families, whether that's childcare for their children and what have you. But also provide this unconditional therapeutic environment for them to help them heal because they're victims, and I think that it's really important.

It has to be community based I believe. I think for young people and I also think for the adults when we are able to develop safe houses outside of the larger urban settings or

where they're being victimized. That's really key.

But I think getting them and providing them with the addictions and mental health services that they need.

But then also being aware of the importance of employment and education because that's the way that—if it's a financial issue for some people that are being sexually exploited—that they have other alternatives and the healing that has to happen is crucial.

We need education, awareness, and training for front-line staff so they can be very aware and identify and develop appropriate approaches to working with the women and the men and the children and doing it in a way that's non-judgmental because that's the only way that's going to make a difference.

Irvin-Ross used the unique term, “unconditional therapeutic environment” as she described the wrap around multi-sectorial services that are needed to support sex industry survivors.

Darryl Ramkisson is a WPS Sergeant who has worked in counter exploitation for over 15 years. He also describes, as do Chief Evans and Ms. Irvin-Ross, that poverty is a key factor in making children vulnerable to exploitation.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: Based on my experience, poverty makes them more prone to be exploited. We have a huge problem with child poverty, and it makes them vulnerable. Eliminating that would help prevent exploitation. Just based on my own experience with these youths and kids, poverty in this city is huge.

The demographics—because we have a higher percentage of Indigenous people who are prone to a lower social economic lifestyle—they're more prone to being exploited. These are people that are usually targeted because of their vulnerability.

And what we're noticing, these kids, because of their situation they turn to drugs. They turn to people who realize they're vulnerable and exploit them.

Now, how can you take that out of the way?

I noticed recently, Canada's cited as studying the homeless, poverty, child poverty we have in this country. I think we're starting to eliminate that. That would slowly eliminate these vulnerable kids or youths that get into this situation.

Kelly Holmes also noted that poverty was a cause of vulnerability. Yet she adds that the combination of youth homelessness and poverty contributes the greatest risk and challenge to at risk youth.

KELLY HOLMES: I think 24/7 opportunities and safe spaces can help them exit. If they know that they have somewhere to go. I think that, you know more services, even if they are daytime services, that they are steeped in harm reduction and the understanding of what we're dealing with.

I think less systemic barriers. Like minimum wage should be increased, and the EIA rate should be increased because it's really hard to make \$100 in a night in the sex trade, and then not being able to make that after four days of work at Tim Horton's. It doesn't make any good financial sense. And you don't have to be a genius to figure that out.

I mean, we've had kids here that, you know, "Why would I want to work at McDonald's when I have to work five hours, when all I have to do is run down the street to unload this pot, and I'm making \$50?" We're setting up kids to go towards crime because it's more lucrative. So, we have to look at that.

So, equitable jobs—. We have look at EIA increases. Minimum wage.

I mean, the other piece to that is wait times for treatment, counseling services, and supported transitions from off the street into mainstream society. All of the kids that I've come across in the last 14 years all have skills. And they may be using it for the powers of evil, but they're still skills. If we can take those skills and turn it into mainstream economy skills, we've won.

I mean, I think it's about having the people in place, or the community in place to be able to say, "You're no idiot! And yes, it's against the law, but, I mean, do you see your ability to figure things out, your organizational ability, your networking ability?"

You know, there's a whole bunch of skills that I don't think that we've framed right as a society. So, it's important for the kids to have an opportunity to sort of recalibrate what they know so that they can go forward in a different way. Because there are great skills in survivalhood, you know. And many of these kids, they're—.

I think, when someone wants to walk out, we better be ready. And a part of being ready is not having long line-ups and waitlists with huge requirements of IDs and filling out forms and all of that kind of bureaucracy. I think that they should be able to slide to help as immediate as possible. I think that bureaucracy can always be a deterrent.

Of all the participants in this study, Ms. Holmes most clearly articulated the missed opportunities that exist to assist young people develop skills for making a living outside of the sex industry.

Friedereke Von Aweden is a medical nurse who works with women involved in the sex industry, through anti-trafficking programs and Klinik Community Health and New Directions and TERF [Transition, Education & Resources for Females]. Like Ms. Holmes, Ms. Von Aweden identified housing and poverty as critical risk factors for children and women.

FRIEDEREKE VON AWEDEN: What could be done to prevent it is to end child poverty, to end unplanned pregnancies, too.

We can't change history but we could change inequalities. Those are things that are long-term. They're very upstream.

But I think, really, by the time we see youth, there's usually something—even though we don't know the women by the time they enter the TERF program—there is usually something very obvious why they are so vulnerable, such as a learning disability.

Housing is huge. I would say 60 to 70 percent of women at TERF have problems with housing and that issue is the springboard for re-engaging in behaviours because it's so difficult to cope with living with someone who exploits you or being offered drugs or trauma, anything like that.

I'm not convinced that money is what will make a difference. I think it's childcare, not separating women from their children. Putting a lot of support into places like the mothering project that provides very unstructured support that's not, you know—. We often have programs that you only qualify if you meet these criteria, right? But if we have very flexible open programs that help women where they want to go—.

Education is huge. I think we undercapitalize on [it].

Ms. Von Aweden said “housing is huge,” indicating that up to 70 percent of the survivors she works with have housing troubles.

Like most of the other respondents, Shannon McCorry who is a social worker with Project Devote also emphasized how the lack of opportunities for children resulting from their poverty has a direct link with their exploitation in the sex industry.

SHANNON MCCORRY: I think that definitively trying to address poverty would be a big issue. Because I think part of that is being people with money issues and people living in poverty and not having other ways, other means of money, or just addiction issues and struggling.

People staying on social assistance don't even have enough money for rent or groceries sometimes. So those sorts of things, living in poverty. All sorts of things I think are contributing factors. I think poverty is one piece of it.

I think also addressing colonization so, as a whole, if we want to look at Indigenous peoples in Canada, we need to look at the impact that colonization has had on them.

Then we also need to look at the impact of colonization on our society as a whole and how society in general looks at the role of women and women's violence and all those sorts of things because I think those are all roots. And if we can look and try to address those roots—and they all interconnect, right? and intertwine—that I think those are big issues that we need to look at and then address those.

Ms. McCorry stressed, as did Chief Ron Evans, that it is important to intervene creatively to address poverty and the lack of opportunities available for young people to thrive in. She also highlighted the importance and impact of people's personal histories on their current conditions. For example, Ms. McCorry stipulates that the impacts of colonization are a clear-cut example of historical abuses that are significant root causes of youth vulnerability to sexual predators.

Rosemarie Gjerek of Klinic also emphasizes the role that service providers can play in helping people who are struggling against the challenges of escaping the sex industry where those barriers are compounded by poverty and the lack of hope for the future. She emphasizes that people enter the sex industry because they see no other options for them to survive and to succeed in life.

ROSEMARIE GJEREK: I think poverty is the root of all evil. It's people making money off of other people.

If you have a choice, if you have options, if you have that, then, you know, if I need to have a place to sleep, if I need food, I need to take care of my kids—. When you look at those kinds of—. Those things on—. Minimum wage is not going to necessarily make that happen.

I think things like, just again, helping families be those environments that help kids develop. To have trauma-informed care providers and councilors and recognizing those cycles that can continue because of that pain that we can carry. I think it's absolutely looking at—I don't know the question about if you had enough support services—but if you had enough resources to really support people in their journey out. And so hearing from women who talk about the fifth, sixth, and seventh time they tried to get out was just how difficult it is.

We need to understand this better and provide resources in a different way. Not in a way that's comfortable for us, but in way that reflects the needs of the individual.

And then you see these as occurring—if I have an addictions problem, if I have this and that—you treat me as a whole person. Then there's an expectation to be clean for a month. If I can be clean on a month on my own? That's a miracle. There's understanding and recognizing that. And I think more resources around outreach, education. It's all about money.

Ms. Gjerek highlights, as did the other participants, that poverty is linked to the lack of opportunities that young people encounter in their communities. She also stressed that services need to be provided in a way that is useful for the survivors. This might mean that service providers need to be client-centered in providing services in such a way that are convenient for the recipient and not necessarily convenient for the service provider.

Jane Runner of TERF also talked about the importance of youth having access to a safe place to live, and how the fundamental element in improving their lives is money.

JANE RUNNER: Drug trafficking and all that kind of activity comes out of oppression

and people struggling and people needing to find a way to get money. So, if there was money to really focus in on poverty and helping build strong communities, and, certainly for Indigenous communities, have a good chunk of that, to get them back to land that's going to work for them.

And where they have opportunities for economic growth, you know, for their kids to be educated. We really do have to deal with that kind of poverty.

And not all sex trade and that stems from that because, again, there's a lot of, you know, middle-class, different types of families that get involved.

I don't know. It's never going to stop. You know, that's such a big question.

But as long as we keep educating and people understand and people stop judging and stop racism, and those "-isms," right? As a country, we just really need to keep at it. Maybe with our new Prime Minister we'll get a little further ahead.

For example, one survivor, Grace, stated that what is needed is "equal opportunities for women to not have to use their vagina to support their families." Kevin Brosseau (RCMP Deputy Commissioner) also stresses that in his experience the lack of viable options to earn money is the fundamental issue for young people who are forced to enter the sex industry.

KEVIN BROUSSEAU: It has been very rare in my experience that someone has [sold sex] completely by choice.

It's a cognitive exercise—informed decision being made by anyone, that despite all the risks associated thereto, that they choose to, in fact, engage in this type of behaviour or this type of conduct.

For the most part they're either being abused at home. They're being left without any other choice but to go somewhere where they otherwise wouldn't go.

I can tell you of a couple other situations where young women, who, for real—perhaps it started as teenage rebellion—got themselves connected with older guys who, out of a misplaced loyalty and/or feelings of love or relationship, ended up on the street having to work.

Where it started, and if you tracked it back either through the parents or through them, it started as, "This guy told me all the things I wanted to hear, and I wasn't getting from anyone else—that I was beautiful, that I was cared for—that nobody else, my parents were saying. You know, things they said didn't make any sense. They were dumb. They didn't need to be listened to."

"Come with me. I'll give you all you need"—and you'll feel all that self-esteem is built up through that way. And it makes them feel good at the beginning.

And then, you know, before they know it, it's like that frog in the hot water. Before they know it, they find themselves in the situation where they're having to turn tricks, to use that language. And you know, to make someone happy. Again, it's that power imbalance that they're being groomed and then used, largely, and I tend to use this and I don't mean to be gender-specific but it tends to manifest itself that way, as a man versus a woman, but where the guy will use, and then abuse that young girl to do things they otherwise wouldn't do.

Mr. Brosseau's point about the lack of opportunities young people need to do something positive and empowering with their lives is a theme that occurs in several of my research interviews.

In addition, MLA Andrew Swan describes how we need to provide better job creation to give people better opportunities. He described how jobs might be created around the limited skills and experience that many people have in the sex industry, and that we should not limit people to childcare work. I found that *Ndinawe's* Child and Youth Care program run in coordination with Red River Community College (RRCC) is successful; however, it is the only job preparedness program in the Province that my respondents described as effectively helping sex industry survivors prepare for job placements.

Ndinawe's program basically surrounds people with resources so they can successfully complete the existing Child Care Certificate program in RRCC. The question remains, why couldn't this be done with other programs? Swan partially responded to this question, as follows.

ANDREW SWAN: In many cases, if women who are being sexually exploited have kids, what do they know how to do? Well, we wouldn't agree with all their parenting choices, but they know how to look after kids.

If you were to tell somebody that we would help them get to a place where they could go and be a childcare worker. "You're not going to make a ton of money. It's going to be \$13, \$14 an hour. But how much money are you making if you're out on the street? And you've got to give money to your pimp and you're using drugs. Your take home pay is not going to be much different from that if at all." That's one example.

You think, "Well if somebody hasn't had a lot of formal education, they've suffered all these traumas, they have all these issues, what can they do?" I mean, frankly, most of them do a decent job looking after their own kids. Maybe we find a way to help them look after other people's kids in a field where we always need more workers, where there is a fairly short and basic way to train people up. That's just, that's one example of something maybe people can do.

But you talk to some experiential people who've gone on to do all kinds of things, they would say, "Well, why are you just limiting people to being childcare workers?" I'm not. I think we've got to be practical though, and if we're trying to turn people around and get them back doing something positive, we want to be able to give them a clear path to do that.

Mr. Swan touched on the theme that Kelly Holmes initially brought up, namely that society is

not recognizing and expanding on the skills and talents that sex industry survivors might have. Not everyone wants to become a childcare worker. Levasseur and Paterson (2016) found that governments in Canada tend to provide gender biased support for skilled trade education and development, continuing to favour men for several trades. For example, the 2017 Canadian federal budget still does not reflect a priority on creating a broader range of career options for women. Cattapan, Hanson, Stinson, Levac and Paterson (2017) analyzed the current federal budget and found that it fails to address the unpaid work that falls mostly on women, as well as the structural social conditions that continue to exclude the female half of Canada's population from many occupations.

Jay Rogers is the Deputy Minister of Manitoba's Department of Families, and at the time of his interview was the Executive Director of Marymount, which provides services for exploited youth. He highlights how poverty contributes to reduced opportunities for young people. He stresses how guaranteed minimum income might help to alleviate the situation by giving young people employment opportunities outside of the sex industry.

JAY ROGERS: From my perspective, the best thing that could happen in Canada wouldn't necessarily be specific to this issue but would just be something that would address a lot of the issues that we end up seeing, and I think there's two things.

I've always believed in things like guaranteed annual income because so many of the problems that we see here are related to families not being able to have enough resources to care for themselves. I'm a big believer that there are very few really bad parents. They're just parents who don't have the skills or resources to care for their kids. So, if we were able to have greater redistribution of the wealth that this country has, there's lots of research to show that families, if they have access to resources are healthier, there is better outcomes for their kids.

And I think we also need to look at sort of recreating the concept behind the Boldness Project, where youth got networks and services are located right in the communities.

I always believed that schools could be hubs of services. They are to a certain extent, but not to the extent that they could be.

The Province has done a good thing by creating these access centers where you get health and social services throughout the community, that's a good thing. I think we could continue to expand on those and create multi-disciplinary hubs that service neighbourhoods and really target young groups of kids, making sure kids are healthy when they're younger

because we know from the research again that ages 0 to 5 are critical. So if kids are growing up in healthy families, they're not going to be going into the sex trade as much as they are now. This would be if money were no object. That's the direction I would like to see it go.

Early childhood investment mentioned by Mr. Rogers is a theme that came up repeatedly in the interviews; ideally it would set children up to be resilient, less vulnerable to exploitation, and successful in their career choices.

This research contributes to our understanding that poverty and lack of opportunities are a root cause of people selling themselves in the sex industry for survival. My participants referred to "survival sex," as performing sex acts in exchange for basic necessities of food and shelter. These basic needs literally mean survival in Northern climates, such as in Winnipeg, where cold winter conditions could badly injure or kill an improperly dressed person within minutes.

Inadequate housing or no housing at all often results in women and girls falling back into the only outlet that is available for them to survive, performing sex acts for money. Therefore, it often takes multiple attempts for women to escape, if they make it out at all. While the complexity of poverty reduction economics is beyond the scope of this thesis, the fundamental idea of reducing poverty and providing opportunities for young people to have a different way of earning a living and safe housing seems to be at the root of any solution to the problem. Some have pushed for a minimum guaranteed income for all Canadians, which might alleviate some social problems related to poverty (Canadian Press, 2014).

Chief Ron Evans spoke eloquently about the destitution and the marginalization of Indigenous people in Canada. His observations are also consistent with the literature confirming that Canada's Indigenous people are more socially and economically disadvantaged than the mainstream settler society, suffering more impoverishment and lack of opportunities for

education and jobs (Ham, 2014; Younging, 2009). However, poverty affects people of all groups when they are challenged by it.

Rosemarie Gjerek stated, “poverty is the root of all evil”, and alleviating it would likely impact social problems, including people who are exploited in the sex industry. Poverty is an important factor to consider in the complex multi-layered social cube that Byrne, Carter and Senehi (2003) describe, and could assist in understanding complex conflicts.

5.7 Prevention of sex trafficking and exploitation

The idea of getting upstream and addressing the root causes of sex trafficking early is critical if it is to be prevented. It is also a profound idea that was specifically suggested by several contributors to my study. Some of the more substantial quotes are presented here, as a contribution to deeper understanding of the need and means to address the root causes of problems. They emphasize the need to invest in prevention, in healthy families and in creating a safer healthier start for all children.

Claudia Ponce-Joly, former Manitoba Director of Child Welfare, for example, describes how every child wants to feel significant and valued in our society.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: There are many thousands of children who are lost and unattached and do not know there is help. And these children are vulnerable to being sexually exploited.

I believe that making each child feel that they count and that they’re valued and that they deserve respect, dignity, and a place in our community makes a difference. It may sound like a soft approach, but in my view it’s not.

If children and youth don’t receive that type of constant and consistent communication from people in their lives, that’s when their risk level will increase and somebody else will have ulterior motives that will take place in that child’s life because that child is being pulled into sexual exploitation. The messages, the actions, and involvement of those around the child need to be stronger, much stronger than from those who may harm your child.

Children need to know that they have somebody to go to for unconditional affection and love. And many children do not have that. And the same is true for children inside the

child welfare system, as well. As we know, children in mainstream society are exploited sexually, but I do want to decide that children involved with multiple sectors like child welfare and corrections, criminal justice are absolutely at risk.

And the challenge in coming up a strategy is also impacted by the fact that because these are complex issues. There are many fractures to address. There could be mental health issues in the child. There could be a lack of family. The child has also likely already experienced harm in their life whether it be physical, mental, or emotional. There also may be issues with domestic violence.

Ms. Ponce-Joly emphasizes how many children feel unattached, which goes back to previous participants' comments about the significance of family dynamics and having a home with a support structure and role models.

Similarly, Police Superintendent (ret.) Bill Fogg also stresses the need to not only invest in families early on, he also pointed out necessity for greater collaboration and information and resource sharing between agencies in their daily work.

BILL FOGG: I really do believe we need to invest in that front end, trying to make those healthy families and help those people all the way through. And prevention is the right way to do this.

But we have a bunch of people right now who are already struggling—whether it's through addictions, or mental health problems, or gang affiliations, or involvement in the sex trade either as an exploiter or as an exploited person.

But that can't come by redirecting other existing resources or existing money, because police departments, despite what people think, are basically minimally funded in the sense that there's structure and function that are sent out by the courts and collective agreements and things. And we're already doing reasonably as much as we can do with what we have.

So, to take on something like that takes on additional resources. And in my mind, that's one of the most important things that we could possibly do as society. We're talking about the future of this country and the ability to sustain our systems and population. And we need to get that right and we need to get it right now.

And to not invest in this right now is a far greater crime than not investing in climate change or any of those other things. This is about our future and the future of our children in this country.

Mr. Fogg emphasizes the need for well thought out early prevention strategies that infuse resources to support healthy families.

Shannon McCorry is a social worker/family liaison with Project Devote. She also

describes, as did others, the need to identify families needing resources and to intervene earlier.

SHANNON MCCORRY: I think there is a critical point I think that part of what happens for children—it's just when families are struggling.

I think we need to put the resources in right at the very beginning. So when families are identifying that they're having problems and issues, we have to find a way to kind of be really support-heavy, and offering those families support.

And I think sometimes that happens is there's—not necessarily in all cases—but when there is a breakdown within the family, and there's issues happening and maybe parents don't have the right resources to work with their kids to help to support them, then they're going out and becoming involved in the street gangs and all the different things that can lead down the path to sexual exploitation.

So, I think that if we can catch kids when they're young and when parents are struggling and really put in resources. That could be a turning point for kids.

Ms. McCorry emphasizes the need to intervene early with resources for youth to have strong beginnings in their lives. She also highlighted that parents sometimes need support to work with their children, so they don't get lost to gangs or to the sex industry.

Rose, a senior Crown Attorney with Manitoba Public Prosecutions (who wished to remain anonymous), with extensive experience in cases involving the sex industry, also states the need for prevention, as it is more difficult to fix something that is already broken.

ROSE: Manitoba is a front-runner, looking at it from a social services perspective.

Street Reach has been effective.

The difficulty, I think, though with this area is that we're trying to fix something that is already broken. So, in my experience dealing with victims who are sexually exploited in the sex trade, typically they have escaped from somewhere else, right?

So, in one of the cases that I prosecuted, the woman—. My case involved her being procured at the age of 18, but she had been working sex trade since she was 11 years old.

She started doing that because she had fled her home where she was being abused by an uncle who was abusing her. So by the time people are trying to reach out to her, she'd already been exploited for a long time.

Of course, once you're on the street at 11, what happens—you get a drug addiction. And then you need things to feed that drug addiction. So, the efforts have to be at strengthening families and early intervention with children. That's to me where we really need to focus on as a society.

Rose highlights that better value can be achieved through prevention oriented resources as opposed to reactive strategies later on.

For example, Christine Kun of the WPS has worked with sex industry survivors for years. She elaborates on the need to support families by providing resources for youth at younger ages.

CHRISTINE KUN: That's the hard part, right? Because, again, does it come down to, you know, as a police service, is it our responsibility to support families to provide them with the supports that they need in the community?

That's where we say we work with agencies because we can't do it all, you know? So I think that there is a role for social agencies, but it comes down to how do you stop that?

How do you teach people to be good parents?

The people who have been good parents have had someone in their life—it doesn't mean their parents—but they've had someone in their life who has pointed them in the right direction, or who has placed value on them, or shown them that they can be more than what they were. And I know that, you know, based on my own experience and my own upbringing, and my own successes.

So, I really think placing value on youth and giving them opportunities and broadening their horizons and, you know, opportunities, but supports that follow them because it's a life-long, you know, character trait.

It's letting people know that that isn't normal, that that isn't okay, that you do have supports, and I think it's a difficult challenge.

I don't know how you start that, and I really don't know as a Police Service that it's something that we can achieve. We can strive to work with agencies in support of it, you know?

I would say supports for families. I do think that a lot of this issue stems from how people are raised, like I said, and showing those supports. And that doesn't mean, necessarily poor inner city children. I mean just family supports. And we do have some, but I think that, marketing those, making them available is a good move.

Ms. Kun notes that there is a challenge in determining whose role it is to support healthy families. This question is similar to the one mentioned earlier, of whose responsibility child welfare is. It must be everyone's, rather than one particular agency.

Chelsea Jarosiewicz of Marymount also stresses the need for more prevention and investment in early childhood resilience to thwart the trafficking of children.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: In terms of opportunities, there's a lot of services out there. We just need to work together.

And it would be nice if there was almost a centralized list or at least knowledge of the programs that are out there and what we can do for the kids. I think if money was no object, then I think we would need to focus a lot more on intervention, starting at a young age to having classes for young girls on healthy relationships and how to spot somebody who is luring or grooming them and show them what a good trustworthy relationship looks like.

Teach them healthy sexual education, self-esteem, self-worth stuff, and also trying to lessen the demand for sex for children unfortunately. Prevention is the number one thing, I think.

More policing in terms of gang violence and the gangs. And, I mean, most girls that I've worked with that are sexually exploited are involved in gangs and are recruiting others, unfortunately.

So I think all of those factors—poverty, family life at home, all of those things need to be addressed.

Ms. Jarosiewicz states that prevention should be the number one priority, and that if money was no object, more should be invested in early childhood training and support to holistic family supports for at-risk girls.

Similarly, Ed Riglin (RCMP Sergeant) talked about the need to do more prevention early on, including multi-sector collaboration and in-school programming involving the whole spectrum of stakeholder agencies in a multi-modal and multi-level intervention process.

ED RIGLIN: Organized crime don't pick on the strong. They pick on the weak. They pick on the mentally challenged. They pick on those that are separated or falling out from their family, all those things.

We have to tie these things together and go back to the thing that has to be a multi-agency, for lack of a better term, approach for them. We have to be in and educating at the school level. I think, is the best start because for the most part most kids have to go to school.

But we need to be in there with teachers, the police, the social services, the NGOs, and putting into these children that "You're not alone. We are here. If there's a breakdown in your family, you can call us." Give them that information.

All these kids, they don't have that information because you can't go into somebody's home and deliver that. But in the school system, you can. And it's our strongest starting point to implement it into the schools, that we make it part of the health, history, social studies—whatever you want to make it a part of, you can do it.

Human trafficking can be part of history. We need to start that part early because I think you look at kids nowadays and they're socially conscious, the 20-, 30-, 40-year-olds, the 20-year-olds that are coming. And take a quick look at the U.S. election and people that are socialist, how much traction they're getting because these young people want to stand up and save their environment and make the whole world, you know, sit around the fire and sing kumbaya. The kids tend to be a lot more that way.

So I think our first approach—I can't emphasize this strong enough—has to be started in the schools by implementing a multi-faceted approach with family services, police, NGOs—all of these services coming into the schools and saying, "Hey, this is what trafficking is. This is what exploitation is. This can happen. And if there's a breakdown in your family, don't be afraid to reach out to us."

I think if we start that, we'll have impact if we start there.

Mr. Riglin stresses the need for early education and a collaborative multi-sectorial approach to early prevention, bringing in the police, social work, education providers and others.

Gord Perrier is Deputy Chief of the WPS, and has worked in several policing roles focused on counter-exploitation. He outlines the need for more prevention efforts in relation to offenders as well.

GORD PERRIER: So I'm going to talk about the offender now, rather than the victim. And I, personally, like to talk about victimology a lot more, but you can't talk about victims unless you talk about offenders. I really believe that as well.

So, about interrupting that, that often is about, to me, it's about a number of things.

One is it's about providing security and health to individuals so they can move past if they're victimized, or the person that's doing the victimizing. For instance, if the person is suffering from severe substance abuse and they're offending, they may have a sexual interest in children that they would not have acted on if they were not high, for instance, or high on drugs or alcohol, where in that case their inhibitions have been lessened and now they're offending.

I'm not saying that's an excuse. I'm not discounting sexual interest in children, for instance, and not that this sexual interest in children would go away. But the event in itself may not actually happen. And that's where this gets to be a really complicated topic, if we're talking about offending and coming to it from that end. Or, are we talking about people that have sexual interest in children and making that end disappear. Those are very different conversations and one may not actually even be possible. So I don't want to go that far.

But in familial settings, it's about providing security. It's about providing education. It's providing substantive employment. And it might be treating those illnesses to treat the others. And then when those events occurred, now that family unit needs to heal.

Mr. Perrier underlines the fact that offenders' behavior also need to be addressed by an intervention process. This discovery supports the findings of the Boston Gun Project in which they recognized the need to help offenders with their issues and reduce criminal violent behaviour (Prothrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004).

Consistent with other participants' points of view, Jane Runner (ED TERF) emphasized the need for awareness education and in providing resources at all levels, with the intent of preventing the trafficking and exploitation of young people.

JANE RUNNER: We certainly need whatever we can to get after the offenders, but in providing support for people who've been exploited. Again, there's a continuum of services and strategies that need to happen at all the different levels through all the different services and departments. We certainly need to do a lot more where the least amount of focus is on—in educating kids more, in supporting families more, so they don't get to that point of breakdown where kids are running away.

That in itself is reducing the amount of time that kids are running around the streets, getting either involved in drugs, or guys running around and luring them with money to get in their car and do whatever.

So, those are the types of approaches that work where you can spend a lot of time either keeping kids in school plus keeping them active—sports, right? All those initiatives. They work, right?—if you're keeping kids busy and healthy and supporting the family.

Ms. Runner's comments were consistent with those of Mr. Perrier as they both stressed the point that the offenders must also be considered and offered resources.

DeRiviere (2005) studied the economic impacts of the sex industry in Manitoba and found that financial investments in preventive measures are far more effective than strategies that only respond reactively. Unfortunately, the stories of a significant number of my research participants substantiate the fact that we are still generally reactive. Prevention is a theme that threads throughout this thesis. Most if not all of the participants I interviewed noted that we need to intervene earlier and invest more resources upstream to prevent children from finding themselves in a position where they are vulnerable to exploitation. This finding supports the previous findings that were highlighted in the literature review regarding early childhood development and upstream prevention (for example, see Heckman et al., 2010).

5.8 Key findings

The following nine salient and significant findings emerged from the analysis of my interviews of experts, practitioners and survivors, of how young children become vulnerable to, and are trafficked and exploited in the sex industry.

First, no child aspires to grow up and join the sex industry. My 61 research participants

unanimously asserted that no child makes a conscious decision and plans to become involved in the sex industry. The survivors and practitioners I interviewed all emphasized that, at least in Manitoba, entering the sex industry is imposed upon a person rather than that person making a rational decision to start selling sex on the streets. A child becomes a sex seller usually as a last resort when other options are not available, and when a lack of basic human needs creates the need for survival at any cost. For example, one survivor, Ashley stated that, “No child says when I grow up I want to be a prostitute.” Most of the participants who now work as practitioners in various agencies assisting and supporting survivors involved in the sex industry, also universally saw the survivors as victims rather than as criminals.

Some advocacy groups have argued that women should have the choice to participate in the sex industry if they choose to do so. My participants emphasized that it is a choice a girl or young woman only makes under duress, rather than as willing participants. They termed the largest extent of young women’s involvement in the sex industry as “survival sex” in which people resort to selling sex in desperation, in exchange for food shelter and other basic necessities. Some feminists have argued that women should be free to choose the sex industry as a legitimate profession, while in contrast, others argue that any time a woman sells her body for money, she is being exploited (Meyers, 2014; Lozano, 2010). Regardless of the perspective taken, previous studies and my research highlight the degree of oppression and victimization of young women that continues in our society (see Farley, 2003).

Previous research has found correlations between early childhood sexual abuse and a person’s later involvement in the sex industry (Klatt, Cavnerb & Eganc, 2014; Kaestle, 2012; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010). My research also paints a picture of the average young woman in the sex industry as a victim, with abusive or unsupportive families and

unfulfilled needs that predators are all too happy to step in and take advantage of. The survivors I interviewed all described similar images of a youth with desires for love and attention that was groomed and taken advantage of by predatory pimps.

Second, children are being targeted at younger ages. Several of my participants pointed out that pimps are targeting children at younger and younger ages. For example, Diane Redsky (CWF, 2014) found that the age of recruitment in the sex industry in Canada has dropped over the past 10 years from 16 to 13 years-of-age and she stresses that the ages are still dropping. Several of the survivors I interviewed, described their personal experiences of being introduced to the sex industry, and in many cases targeted by traffickers and their helpers by 11 or 12 years-of-age.

This has important implications for future intervention and prevention strategies that must include building resilience and support for families of youth at younger ages. For example, some of my respondents proposed that sex exploitation education programs should be introduced in earlier grades in schools. Similarly, several interviewees emphasized that sex predator awareness training should target younger parents and families, and public awareness campaigns about the perils and dangers of the sex industry and should alert people of the younger ages that are at risk. For example, the parent of a child who has been abused should be aware of the added vulnerability to exploitation and risks of later involvement in the sex industry. Parents need to be able to recognize the signs of abuse and how to intervene or get the right resources involved. This finding also has important implications for Indigenous communities where children's risks of exploitation and being trafficked increase when they are forced to move into larger urban centers for high school.

The children of new immigrant families, where English is not their first language, are at

risk from gangs who know the culture and languages, and target young girls for sexual exploitation. More resources are required to educate these families about the risks that their children will encounter online, in the schools, and in the community.

Third, early childhood abuse often correlates with later sexual exploitation. My research participants echoed resoundingly that nearly all survivors in the sex industry were previously victims of childhood sexual assault and/or abuse. For example, Mandy Fraser (Klinic) said, “I would say 100 percent of people who end up in survival sex work have had child abuse or child neglect.” Other practitioners made similar observations. This is consistent with findings of previous research that has found correlations between early childhood sexual abuse and greater likelihood in later sex industry involvement (see Klatt, Cavnerb & Eganc, 2014; Kaestle, 2012; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010; Klatt, Cavnerb & Eganc, 2014; Roe-Sepowitz et al., 2011; Greene, Ennett, & Ringwalt, 1999). While it seems these factors relate generally to all children, in Manitoba the large majority of sex industry victims are of Indigenous descent, further illustrating the high incidence of child abuse in that community, likely related to impoverishment and lack of opportunities.

This finding has important implications for anti-sexual exploitation intervention and prevention strategies that might include follow-up with child abuse victims and their families. For example, in cases where the police investigate child abuse, an accused is often released with a court date on judicial interim release, including conditions such as to have no contact with the victim, and there is rarely any follow-up with the child victim until the court case, sometimes a year or two down the road. Perhaps, given the relationship between early abuse and later sex industry involvement, child victims should be tracked and followed up with by social services.

Fourth, children need to belong somewhere, even if it is in the sex industry. Children

will seek the love they are missing in their families in the sex industry. My interviewees raised a strong theme around childhood needs and how gangs and traffickers often fill the void that is created when a child perceives s/he is not getting the love and attention that they need at home. For example, Elizabeth, a survivor, said, “If I could say one thing that would have prevented me [from entering the sex industry] it would have been father love, you know.” It is clear, from my research participants that teenage girls need a sense of belonging and a strong male role model, and predators are often experts in identifying youth who are alienated and are missing strong family connections and positive role models in their lives. This finding has implications for potential intervention and prevention strategies, in particular around building stronger and more supportive and resilient families.

Fifth, children in care are at higher risk. Children in care of the state are at high risk of exploitation. My participants stressed that coming into the care of child protective services is perhaps the strongest warning sign of a child’s vulnerability to exploitation. Some survivors even described how traffickers targeted them while they were living in a group home, and also sometimes they are recruited and preyed upon by the people they are living with, who are also connected with the sex industry. Survivors and practitioners that I interviewed stressed that more care must be given to how children are placed within group homes and foster placements. One survivor, Grace, did not mince any words describing how she was targeted by other youth that she was placed with in a group home. Grace recalled, “Yeah I really honestly feel that Child and Family Services needs to be a little bit more fucking mindful of where they place children, right?”

My respondents highlighted that placing sex industry survivors with other survivors is a recipe for disaster as they may groom each other for traffickers. This is a bureaucratic challenge

for agencies that are inclined to develop and house survivor oriented programming all in one place, and then place everyone with similar requirements there for efficiency. Several of my participants also advised that it is dangerous placing numerous sex industry survivors together in one place as it increases the likelihood of the traffickers and pimps finding them and trying to get them re-involved in the sex industry. This makes perfect sense as the traffickers would likely not only seek to re-employ their lost sex slaves, but also seek to recruit new ones if they knew that they are congregated together in a certain facility. That being said, there are limited specialist resources in the system and my respondents clearly highlighted that special training and expertise is required for people working with sex industry survivors. This issue is addressed in the recommendations.

Sixth, vulnerable youth are lost in the system. Vulnerable youth are often lost between service sectors. My participants described how youth are often lost in the cracks and gaps between service sectors. For example, when youth chronically run away from foster and group home placements they are at high risk of sexual exploitation by pimps. However, it is often unclear who has responsibility for their safety. Often, group home staff call the police to report that a youth has run away, yet the group homes and CFS have no resources to look for them so they defer responsibility onto the police to search for them and bring them to safety. My police interviewees affirmed that police resources are stretched beyond capacity and they point out that CFS should also be looking for runaway youth.

While all this finger pointing is going on, the youth is out on the streets being exploited by traffickers and pimps. One survivor told me that there were many occasions when the police or social workers could have taken her to safety; however, they let her walk away because they didn't recognize that she was in danger. One survivor, Julia, stated, "I remember having contact

with lots of social workers that just let me walk away. And yeah, I walked right around the corner and, you know, the guy who was trafficking me was right there” (see Section 7.5).

The implication is that the elements of the system are deferring liability and accountability when they could be sharing responsibility to act collaboratively to solve the problem. This lack of ownership also overlays and corresponds with the lack of coordination and collaboration among all of the agencies that form the system around sexual exploitation.

Seventh, structural violence of poverty leads to vulnerability. A lack of educational and economic opportunities due to poverty often leaves young people vulnerable to exploitation. A strong theme emerged from my participants who emphasized that poverty often leads to a lack of economic and educational opportunities, and that in turn can lead to young people becoming vulnerable to sexual exploitation by pimps and predators. As Rosmemarie Gjerek stated, “poverty is the root of all evil”, and alleviating it would likely impact social problems, including people being exploited in the sex industry. The survivors I interviewed talked about performing “survival sex” out of necessity when they had children to feed or no place to sleep or were desperate for cash for their next hit of crack.

Some survivors described how, at some point, they became more selective with their johns, preferring to perform paid sex acts for people they knew not to be violent. However, even this was couched as a luxury and when they were desperate they would do what it took to earn some cash. The implications are powerful in terms of providing information for policymakers to base funding decisions on. The findings indicate the need to reduce poverty and directly improve the quality of lives for children, making them more resilient and resistant to victimization.

A substantial element of the grooming process in which predators psychologically manipulate vulnerable youth preparing them to be exploited, involves buying trinkets and

clothing and making empty promises that they will receive great rewards for selling their bodies on the streets to strangers. People who are financially disadvantaged are more susceptible to being exploited through promises of money. Several survivors described how they were promised rewards and then basically were enslaved, performing sex acts under duress, and never receiving any of the money they were promised by the pimps. Chief Ron Evans, Jay Rogers and others attributed poor housing and lack of opportunities to all manner of problems with young female runaways, including sex trafficking and exploitation. This disparity represents structural violence as defined by Galtung (1996; also see Reimer, et al., 2015).

Eighth, mental health issues and the sex industry needs further research. Several of my research participants emphasized that many sex industry survivors are struggling with mental health challenges. This issue is underrepresented in the literature and previous empirical research, and clearly is an important topic for future research. Future research on this topic could have tremendous influence on collaborative agency policies and strategies to identify vulnerable at risk youth and intervene before predators get to them.

These research findings also connect with the reality of youth “aging out” of the child welfare system in which people, including sex industry survivors, are suddenly denied access to services that are only available to youth, on the day they turn 18-years old. Many youth, according to my interviewees, are developmentally delayed and challenged. Therefore, an 18-year-old person might actually be functioning cognitively at 12 or 15-years of age. Agencies have the ability to continue providing services for all youth up to 25 years-of-age. However, most choose not to exercise this option. Thus, it is critical to shed light on the developmental vulnerability of some young people to stimulate further research on mental health challenges among youth in general and youth in care. Also, my respondents emphasize that it is important to

encourage continuing services where it is beneficial for survivors to remain in particular programs.

Ninth, early childhood intervention and prevention is needed. There is a need for more early childhood investment in families and violence prevention. My participants emphasized the need for commitment to invest more resources in violence prevention by supporting healthier families, and in creating safer healthier milieus for children. Most of my respondents stressed the need for committal of more resources to be placed into intervening in and providing support to families where violence and abuse has occurred.

Several of my research participants strongly emphasized that removing a child from a home where a problem occurs can damage the child and the family unit. In these cases several of my interviewees said that, whenever possible, the problem or the problem person should be removed from the home, and not the child. For example, an abusive addicted adult should be relocated elsewhere, if possible, so that the child remains securely in the family home. Some of my interviewees indicated that when problems occur in the home, resources should be brought in to assist children, rather than taking the children away from the home to external resources. Thus, the child is not removed from her/his normal supportive and integrated cohesive network.

5.9 Conclusion

There has been some debate around the degree of free will vs. exploitation that really exists with respect to women who continue for years in the sex industry. Some feminists have argued that women should be free to choose the sex industry as a legitimate profession and have their rights to do so protected in the law (Meyers, 2014; Canada vs. Bedford, 2013; Lozano, 2010). Others argue that any time a woman sells her body for money, she is likely being exploited and

manipulated by pimps and sex predators (Meyers, 2014; Lozano, 2010). Regardless of the perspective one takes, some key research highlights that a high degree of oppression and victimization does go on against most people engaged in the sex industry (Farley, 2003). My research supports these earlier findings.

It can be debated whether a small percentage of women who say they should have the right to be professionals in the sex industry are actually exercising their free will or if they are doing it for survival because they don't have any other choice. The majority of my research participants unanimously stated that children and young women who are preyed upon and coerced into the sex industry by pimps are indeed exploited by them. Further, my respondents also emphasized that while a small number of people choose freely to work in the sex industry, the vast majority are only there as a result of a lack of positive and constructive educational and employment opportunities to do something different.

This chapter highlights the main themes that emerged from the interviews, on what makes people vulnerable to sexual exploitation and potential anti-sexual exploitation intervention and prevention strategies. Poverty and lack of family support systems seem to be critical problems that drive young people into the arms of predators. Hence it is no surprise that my research participants described the danger that many youth experience as they enter group homes.

Predators know where to find vulnerable youth and take advantage of the situation.

My findings are consistent with those of the Canadian Women's Foundation study, which reported that factors correlated with youth vulnerability to sexual exploitation include: (1) being female (2) being poor, (3) having a history of violence or neglect, (4) having a history of child sexual abuse, and (5) having a low level of education (CWF, 2014, p. 27). My respondents emphasized that sex education is critical for children to make them aware of how predators and

pimps operate. Parents and service providers can only intervene if they can recognize the warning signs early. My findings partially parallel the research by McIntyre (2012), who reported that the average age of recruitment in the sex industry in Canada is 13 years old, and 82 percent of women in the sex industry have experienced sexual abuse prior to being recruited into it. Others have previously found correlations between childhood sexual abuse and later childhood sexual exploitation (Klatt, Cavnerb & Eganc, 2014; Kaestle, 2012; Roe-Sepowitz et al., 2011; Lavoie et al., 2010; Lalor & McElvaney, 2010). My findings also agree with previous research that correlates run-away behavior with children who are vulnerable to targeting by predators and being recruited by them into the sex industry (Brock, 1998; Lowman, 1987).

Several survivors that I interviewed, such as Marie, Grace and Ashley, shared their soul-wrenching stories, driving home the point that people involved in the sex industry are most often intersectionally challenged with multiple complex, overlapping, issues. These findings potentially indicate possibilities for noticing early warning signs and designing appropriate and constructive intervention measures to prevent children from later becoming recruited into the sex industry. For example, several of my participants pointed out that it is vital to create new training for teachers, social workers and the police to identify and act appropriately on seeing signs of early sexual abuse so that a child who is at risk can be protected from sexual exploitation.

This research enhances our understanding of the connection between early childhood abuse and sexual abuse, and later involvement in the sex industry. It highlights more directly, through the stories of survivors, the connection between early traumatic sex abuse and the likelihood of later sex industry trafficking of the abused child. The stories recounted by the survivors and practitioners I interviewed showed strong feelings among them that there are opportunities for intervention where early childhood sexual abuse has occurred. Perhaps a significant contribution

of my study is to highlight that we need further research specifically with regards to the early warning signs and indicators of abused youth's later vulnerability to sexual exploitation, in all its various forms, and how we can intervene earlier to prevent it.

Chapter 6 - Violence Against Canadian Indigenous Women and Girls

6.1 Introduction

This chapter is dedicated to examining issues related to Canada's First Nations and Metis people in Manitoba. A growing body of literature describes the marginalization that Indigenous people have endured in Canada. The first section explores overrepresentation of Indigenous people exploited in the sex industry. Significant themes arose, from my participants, around vulnerabilities that are created by the conditions on reserves and rural communities and the migration of large numbers of Indigenous people into larger urban centers. I also asked each of the participants if existing programs are culturally sensitive. The stories were diverse, and contribute new knowledge on this topic.

Gord Mackintosh, former MLA and Attorney General of Manitoba (also former Minister of Child and Family Services) has been a leader in creating strategies to combat sex trafficking and sexual exploitation in Manitoba. He describes the reality for many Indigenous girls, and his involvement and government's engagement in the issues as follows.

GORD MACKINTOSH: Well, the initial involvement in this area was as Attorney General. And before I came into government, and I was the Justice Critic in the 1990s, and we put together a caucus task force on violence against women to find out how we could develop stronger policies in that area.

We traveled across the province. I was struck by the information we were getting. I remember, for example, up north a girl came to speak to us and we offered off-the-record opportunities, and [she] said that of the 14 girls in her group she was the only one who hadn't been raped or molested in her community. And she said that a man in the community said, "Well that's just the way it is, it happens to everyone, all the girls."

I couldn't believe my naiveté, first of all, but I was infuriated by that. And then, with that task force, I learned about the challenges that the young women on the street were facing.

One of the people I met was Jane Runner. She was an early, vocal, you know, publicly vocal person to raise awareness about the risks inherent in it and how vulnerable they were, and how they had to be protected. You know, she kept giving the message that just because of the work didn't mean that their lives weren't as valuable as anyone else's;

so those were early lessons.

This context is important in understanding the social situation and background that many Indigenous youth come from. It sheds some light on the high overrepresentation of Indigenous girls in the sex industry, particularly in Manitoba.

6.2 Indigenous overrepresentation in the sex industry

Violence against Indigenous women and girls is central to the issue of sex trafficking and sexual exploitation. Grace describes the jeopardy that many Indigenous children face.

GRACE: I was recruited out of child welfare. I had been adopted, and things were not going well so I was put into “care.”

I was sexually abused at the age of eight.

I am Native and no one liked natives where I lived in Thunder Bay. So I hid my identity. I was 11 years old when this happened, and I was first exploited at age 12.

Grace’s point that she was abused as a child is consistent with the experiences of my study participants. The high incidence of early childhood abuse correlates with the high number of Indigenous young women who end up trafficked by predators.

McCracken and Michell (2006) highlight low-income and poverty, as well as the impacts of colonization and racism on people. Those designing intervention and exit strategies for sexually exploited Indigenous females must consider these deep transgenerational impacts, and culturally appropriate resources and structures (Volkan, 1997). For example, Andrew Swan (MLA and former Attorney General) commented on the high numbers of Indigenous girls who are exploited in the sex industry that operates on the streets in his constituency, which is Winnipeg’s downtown West End.

ANDREW SWAN: Anecdotally the great majority of young women who you’ll see on the street in this part of town are Indigenous. That matches with every study I have seen, every piece of research. There was one study out of British Columbia that said even though only

four percent of the population of British Columbia is Indigenous, some 60 or 70 percent of sexually exploited individuals are Indigenous.

Historically, I don't think there's been a really wide range of agencies and services that have focused on the cultural issues.

Right now, I mean, some of the agencies I have the most respect for—Salvation Army, they do really good work with the Prostitution Diversion program, they also run the John School. Diane Bussey is tremendous. I can't speak for how the services are viewed by Indigenous people.

Sage House, a tremendous organization that's provided front line services and a safe place. Again, I can't actually speak to how culturally appropriate they are. And I know they provide service to Indigenous people. I don't know if there's the appropriate level—I think other people would be better placed to deal with that.

Mr. Swan has done considerable work in the political arena around curbing the sex industry. His observations are consistent with the literature as well as my research, noting the high percentage of Indigenous women who are exploited in the sex industry.

While this is not a quantitative study of the demographics of the sex industry, it is clear from the interviews that the majority of survivors in and around Manitoba have Indigenous or Metis ancestry. Some of my interviewees see sexual exploitation as largely an Indigenous issue. However, there are also a growing number of newcomers from around the world that are also potentially being exploited by sexual predators. As Jennifer Richardson, Manitoba's Street Reach Coordinator, notes there is room for more research on these additional populations that are potentially affected by sex trafficking and exploitation.

JENNIFER RICHARDSON: I know a lot of the research says that 90 percent of people being exploited are Indigenous. I don't think that's true. I think it's a flaw in the current research, and in, you know, past research, where researchers are accessing the most easily accessible people, you know, which are people who are on the street. Those are the people you can find, those are the people who often are interfacing with the services, right?

When you start to look at more indoor exploitation, you don't see that group of people accessing as readily services. And researchers can't seem to track them or find them as well. And so, again, that side of exploitation which is more so, right?

I mean, so you look at street exploitation now versus ten years ago, it has dropped significantly. Everybody's on-line now.

Ms. Richardson makes a significant observation about the nature of the sex industry and that the

overall percentage of sex industry participants that are Indigenous or Metis is likely lower than what is currently believed. While there is room for research on who is affected and how, it is still clear that a large percentage of people at risk of involvement and those who are already participating in the sex industry are Indigenous. The growing invisibility of the sex industry is an area for further research.

6.3 Urban migration and pipeline of rural people trafficked into the city

My research highlights the social challenges associated with Indigenous people who are raised in isolated rural reserves and then move into larger urban centers. This phenomenon was explored in some previous studies (see Norris et al., 2000; Norris, Kerr & Nault, 1995). My respondents bring to light some of the specific difficulties that occur with respect to Indigenous children's vulnerability to sex trafficking and exploitation. Lack of opportunities in the rural environment seems to be a critical dynamic affecting later youth victimization by sex traffickers. For example, several of my interviewees described how many rural communities do not have high schools. Consequently, upon reaching their teen years many youth leave their families and community to pursue high school in larger urban centers.

Gabriel Simard is an RCMP provincial Human Trafficking Coordinator. He describes how predators go out of their way to identify and target youth, sometimes grooming them before they even leave the reserve because they know the youth will soon be forced to leave their community and normal support structures so that they will be vulnerable. Constable Simard described his role with the RCMP, travelling to rural communities to educate people on justice issues.

GABRIEL SIMARD: A person comes from Red Sucker Lake to Winnipeg, you know, they get lured into that lifestyle. That's a form right there of exploitation and human trafficking.

A lot of their kids, after Grade 8, have to move to Brandon, Dauphin, and Winnipeg. So for that I explained [in my safety meetings with rural communities], you know, if you have children that are moving on, make sure they're educated and understand that if a person's, you know, buying them clothes, taking them for expensive dinners, be a little leery of—because a normal person shouldn't be doing this.

And when we explain it in a sense that, "Tell your kid to be on the guard if they're getting things that an adult shouldn't be giving them unless it's a close family member, parent, then something could be going very wrong, or could be misleading."

And so, for that question, I think, just being able to relate and having someone who's from the community explain, "This is how it could look." It could very well happen in the communities.

Numerous study participants outlined this problem of vulnerability that Mr. Simard mentions.

Indigenous youth have intersectional challenges that make them more vulnerable to exploitation than mainstream youth who travel for school. For one thing, they can feel out of place moving into a primarily white community where they are now seen and treated as a visible minority. Second, they often have less support in the city, and even encounter language barriers on top of inevitable homesickness. Third, they may have mental health or substance abuse issues, stemming from the transgenerational trauma described earlier (Volkan, 1997). Fourth, traffickers often target them, knowing that many of these children are entirely vulnerable, alienated and lost.

Sheldon Beaton of the RCMP EPPS (Exploited Persons Pro-active Strategy) Team and Karen Harper, Community Liaison with the Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs (AMC), also reiterated the same concerns as Mr. Simard about girls having to relocate for school.

SHELDON BEATON: There's a big draw to the city from rural areas to come to the city. Some people will come for school and because they don't have say Grade 10, 11, 12 in their home community.

And they get in with the wrong crowd. And, again, obviously drugs and alcohol are huge. Even from the human trafficking training, people will meet that boyfriend or girlfriend, and they get them hooked on stuff—and now, "You owe me money!" And how else are they going to pay me kind of thing.

I find now with the invention of iPhones, everybody's got a phone and sexting. And compared when I grew up, there was none of that, you know? I don't know if I grew up in a sheltered life or not, but I grew up in a small town.

It's what's at peoples' fingertips these days. Like you can Google anything, and you can see anything. Like your kids talk all the time. And even with the back page ads you can

order anything online. If you want a girl to come to your house or go to a hotel, it's like pornography. It is right out there. And watching that at an early age, which I'm sure kids are nowadays compared to the generation I was in.

Similarly, Karen Harper (AMC) described how youth are forced to go into larger urban centers for high school and they and their parents need better awareness of the dangers that await them.

KAREN HARPER: It takes a bit, too, to meet first of all, and then to build that trust and that relationship with someone.

I think, again, we talked about a critical event is having to leave the community to come and further your education. So that would be a top one for sure.

So what could be done to prevent it?

Well, having the tools for them, having the understanding and the awareness and not only for the youth but for the parents as well, and beyond into the community again. That's our goal. My goal for our circle is to protect sacred lives.

A big dream—we need more safe houses. Again, whether they're traditional or faith-based, because there is both. And having that in—like we have four shelters in Manitoba—one south and three up north. And the challenges are there. So they're calling for help as well.

In her role as Community Liaison, Ms. Harper is trying to correct this gap by talking to people living on reserves and in rural communities.

Kaitlin is a survivor. She describes how many rural girls are vulnerable to being taken advantage of when they come into the city.

KAITLIN: You know, if someone would have come up to me when I was in high school, and would have said, "Hey, you know, what if you go on the street and smoke crack and that and showed me a picture before and after of a girl"—I probably would have been, like, "Okay ya you know what?" I would have probably looked at my friend, and said, "You know what? You're not my friend. Fuck off."

There are a lot of girls that come in from the reserve, and they're naïve. They don't know how the city is. They come in, and right away they get sucked in.

I've had a couple of friends who went missing and murdered all because of one girl that got them started. The one girl that got me started got them started. And all of a sudden they are gone.

I'm proud to say that, I've never introduced anyone, never got anyone hooked on crack.

Kaitlin's story is similar to my other contributors, including Trevor Bragnalo who worked for years in Thompson as an RCMP officer, and on the RCMP's counter exploitation team in

Thompson, Manitoba. Mr. Bragnalo describes how pimps prey upon vulnerable girls such as Kaitlin's friends when they come to the city.

TREVOR BRAGNALO: I found the girls that I dealt with in the North, a lot of them came from southern communities and they're put into group homes in Thompson.

And Thompson's like the big city in the North. And there's a big mine there. A lot of money in town from people working at the mine making a hundred thousand dollars a year.

Plus, these girls come from very small communities, like, Oxford House, Split Lake, Pukatawagan, etcetera, where it's essentially a northern reserve.

There is nothing there. There's a Northern Store. There may or may not be, like, a hockey rink or a rec area. And there's nothing. There's no movie theatre. It's very isolated.

And the girls come to Thompson, and it's almost like, "Oh man!" It's like party central.

Well, a lot of times, the girls are seized by CFS or by another child and family service organization, brought into Thompson—kids living' in group homes. And sometimes in those group homes, there are the girls who've been there longer than the new girls coming in. And those girls are loosely involved in the drug and sex trade subculture where they're consenting to it and they know that it's an easy way to make money or to acquire clothing because they're not really offered an allowance.

And yeah they get to Thompson and it's just—well, it's a party.

And I find that the one girl, the girls coming in, would be groomed by the other girl or girls at the group home. And then they're dragged into this sexual exploitation type of behaviour.

One girl I recall dealing with would walk into bars and offer to give men blowjobs to buy her a beer.

Or, another woman will meet her, I guess, john, essentially. And he would buy her, like, clothing, and, give her money just to buy food or even just—they would make food. She'd come over and hang out. And they'd be like his little friend.

And then the night usually ended up, like, she'd say "Like, whatever, I just gave him a blowjob. Like, who cares?"

And that was the attitude—that it was just totally fine that a 14-year-old or 15-year-old youth was giving these 40-year-old men blowjobs. And they had no problem with that.

And the whole root cause of it was, I found, that they had no one to look up to. They had no parents. They're isolated in Thompson. They have no friends. They've been taken out of the only community they've grown up in their whole life. They don't know anybody.

Mr. Bragnalo's story highlights the dynamics of predation and exactly how youth become vulnerable when they move to urban areas. He also described how youth are targeted and groomed in the group homes that are supposed to protect them.

Former Justice Minister Andrew Swan also highlights specifically the challenge of Indigenous youth having to relocate from their homes to urban centers for school.

ANDREW SWAN: I guess I, like you, I'm just shocked to hear consistently and regularly everybody saying that sexual exploitation often begins for kids as young as 12 or 13 or 14. And, is there a turning point? I don't know that there is.

I think it may be more the trauma most of those kids have already suffered. The conditions they've lived in—whether it's in a big city, whether it's in a First Nation. I don't know that there's a single thing that happens.

One of the things that I have always been concerned about is young people who leave their community to go to school because their community schooling goes to Grade 8 or 9, which puts them 13, 14 years old. I know there's always been the concern that that makes those kids very vulnerable.

And they go to Brandon or Winnipeg to try to complete high school and may be in with family or friends or acquaintances that don't have their best interest in mind. But that's more of a systemic thing.

Mr. Swan notes, as mentioned by several participants, that family members do not always have the child's best interests in mind. Perhaps there is room for greater awareness building in this area for people like Karen Harper (AMC) and Gabriel Simard (RCMP) to advise parents to be careful about whom they send their daughters to live with while attending school in the city.

Kelly Dennison (WPS Inspector) also describes some of the ways that trafficking differs between regions across Canada, and some of the unique dynamics existing in Manitoba.

KELLY DENNISON: Manitoba is unique in this issue because a lot of our girls that are—if you want to call trafficked into Winnipeg—they come from Thompson, northern Manitoba. They come from almost an impoverished area outside the core, the greater Winnipeg area, for example where I see that differs from a lot of the other major centers.

I've had a chance to work with Toronto. I've travelled around a bit and worked with sexual exploitation teams in the country. What they see and what we see is different.

Now the end result is the same. Somebody is being exploited. Somebody's being trafficked. That's the same.

But in York regional or [the Greater Toronto Area], you're seeing a girl from Holland. And in Winnipeg, you're seeing a girl from Thompson. So the end result's the same. But we're not seeing girls trafficked from European bloc countries and from around like they would be in those major centers.

Mr. Dennison observes that it is difficult to recognize or identify the trafficking of children, even for law enforcement or social workers, when people are moving from rural areas to urban centers for school and end up being exploited.

Country wide and international trafficking of young people also does occur in Manitoba

(Taylor, 2015). For example, Sethi (2007) has written that there is a sex trafficking route between Saskatoon, Regina and Winnipeg as "One girl said she would go to sleep in Winnipeg and wake up in Regina" (see Sethi, 2007 cited in Taylor, 2015). This type of movement between Canadian cities was outlined in my participants' stories. The majority of my participants observed, however, that people who are trafficked in Manitoba are usually from Manitoba.

Gilbert Fredette, a First Nations councilor from Norway House Cree Nation said, "We take it upon ourselves to go to school and talk to the youth and say this is what child exploitation is, these are the warning signs, these are the triggers" (Taylor, 2015, p. 1). This is very similar to some of the initiatives described by my research participants. Karen Harper (AMC), Gabriel Simard (RCMP) and Rebecca Cook (MB Child Exploitation Program Coordinator) all described how they travel to rural communities to raise awareness of the dangers inherent in the city for Indigenous women. My research participants highlighted the importance of these initiatives. My interviewees stressed that we need much more of these constructive intervention processes. My research highlights that targeting rural youth is a growing problem despite the efforts of many devoted professionals. My findings indicate a need for more resources to build awareness within rural and urban First Nations and Metis communities, to improve safety when they are required to travel or move to larger urban centres.

6.4 Are programs and services culturally sensitive?

My participants presented a wide range of perspectives on the question of whether existing programming that seeks to address the trafficking of Indigenous youth is culturally sensitive. The observations ranged from a feeling that existing programming is very culturally sensitive, or even overly so, to the other end of the spectrum, that it is inappropriate or sadly

lacking. This section presents some representative views that were brought out through my interviews, along with some interesting ideas on cultural sensitivity and programming.

Kim Trossell works with sex industry survivors at the Dream Catcher program at Clinic Community Health. She describes how cultural sensitivity in her agency has come a long way in recent years, yet she feels that it must still improve.

KIM TROSSELL: Culturally sensitive? Considering people don't even acknowledge the fact that a lot of the sex trade, especially here in Manitoba, is a direct result of colonization and long-term effects of that. So if people can't even come to the table and agree on that, that is an issue. It's hard for them to be culturally sensitive.

I mean our agency in itself made huge changes since Dream Catcher became a part of the programming here. You know, we now have a space that is considered culturally friendly, where we have smudging available for all clients, not just clients of our program but Indigenous within our agency. So there has been a huge movement within our own agency.

I don't know as far as the outside world and being culturally sensitive. I don't think that that is even a reality. You know, 80 percent of our street population in the street sex trade is of Indigenous decent. That was identified over 12, 15 years ago.

But it's still working toward a language that is appropriate, and practicing and, like, the ceremonies that we've attended. Our elders have talked to us about the importance of bringing the teachings back to the Indigenous community that was stripped of these things, originally. So just rebuilding what was taken away, creating space for it to happen is so essential.

Ms. Trossell finds that over 80 percent of people in the sex industry are Indigenous youth and it is crucial to be more culturally sensitive in terms of understanding the emotional trauma that many carry as a result of colonial impacts, despite great strides having been achieved in that area. She raises the point that after many years, appropriate language around cultural sensitivity has still not been defined. Perhaps this points to the difficulties involved in defining what is culturally appropriate or sensitive programming.

Similarly to Kim Trossell, Wendy Sheirich highlights that over 70 percent of sex trafficking survivors in Manitoba are Indigenous, and the composition of services for people recovering from sex industry participation should be a funding priority of the Provincial

Government.

WENDY SHEIRICH: Manitoba has instituted probably 100 strategies and programs. Just about every sector has been pulled in. Manitoba is a leader in Canada on this issue. People come to Manitoba to ask us because we are the experts.

We've been focused on rescue and support for victims, and that is very comprehensive—helping people exit the sex trade.

But there has been no approach to the demand side. We need to focus on that.

That has been left to law enforcement and that doesn't work.

We know the majority of victims of sexual exploitation trafficking and prostitution are Indigenous. So there has been a lot of progress and strides in recent years in this area.

I set targets when I was the sexual exploitation program manager to make 70 percent of government funded programs Indigenous to reflect the percentage of victims. After 10 years, that was accomplished. When it's an Indigenous program offering the service, it is typically more culturally appropriate.

Not the case in adults. Most of the programs are non-Indigenous.

So many studies on that topic—helping experiential people exit the sex-trade—they tell us it takes an average of seven attempts to leave.

The main reasons people successfully leave is finding spirituality, or getting pregnant, or having a close-to-death experience, or found a mentor. There is usually some concrete reason they got out.

However, Diane Redsky (*Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*) finds that Indigenous organizations receive less funding than non-Indigenous organizations, and feels that Indigenous sex industry survivors are shortchanged. She offered some interesting perspective, outlining her research finding that Indigenous organizations are funded less for the same level of services.

DIANE REDSKY: It depends on which organizations are delivering the service. So, I would say that Indigenous organizations need to be supported to develop the resources for Indigenous people.

And we know, on the issue, particularly in Winnipeg and in Manitoba, that the majority of the sexually exploited youth and women are Indigenous. And so Indigenous organizations need to be supported to do so.

Does that happen now? Not 100 percent.

I would say that we have a ways to go with that—particularly in the children-in-care sector.

We actually did some research when I first got back in March to analyze the per diem rate of level fours.

So there's five levels, one to five for kids. "Five" is sort of the most high risk, you know. "One" is low risk. So we have a few level-four facilities.

And so we compared that with non-Indigenous organizations. So we compared apples and apples on the per diem rate and then we put them in order of who gets the most money and who gets the least amount of money. When that list came out, comparing

apples to apples, the three bottom organizations were the Indigenous organizations.

And so that is not a surprise that on any given day a non-Indigenous organization gets 44 dollars a day less than a non-Indigenous.

While Wendy Sheirich describes how a great deal more of Provincial resources are now directed into Indigenous focused programming, Diane Redsky points out several problems. For one, Indigenous girls are often placed into non-Indigenous programs and they don't fit into them. She also highlights that lower dollar values are dedicated to programming for Indigenous people. She further noted the challenges for NGO funding. For example, research by Phillips and Levasseur (2004) and Creary and Byrne (2014) found that accountability requirements are so onerous for some small NGOs that they are forced out of business due to government bookkeeping and accountability demands. Thus, bureaucratic processes are resulting in disparity and barriers for the vulnerable youth.

Michael Richardson (Marymound) points out that culturally sensitive treatments for sex industry survivors often do not coexist with other effective programming, so the elements are piecemeal in the system. He describes the disjointed system of resources as follows.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: We work from a stage-of-change perspective to help understand and help us identify where kids are, when they're ready to change, and if they're ready to change, and what we can do to help them change.

Working from understanding their hierarchy of needs would also help us understand kids, help us understand why kids are drawn to the offenders. The offenders have something to offer through clothing, shelter, belonging. So having those understandings help us to create strategies in working with young people better.

I think once you start working with the young people in care, in general, I think people recognize that being culturally sensitive is important. Obviously some places are more culturally appropriate than others. Where I think we all push to, we all recognize that it's important for kids to have, to identify with their culture.

It's interesting, though, because no one really has the one stop shop kind of thing. We have some organizations that are really good and work with exploitation and are not very good to work with the cultural piece. And we have some organizations that work very well with the cultural piece but not very well with the exploitation piece.

Ms. Richardson points out that effective counter exploitation work often does not occur in every

organization that has effective cultural programming seemingly due to a lack of coordination and because organizations have different mandates and priorities.

Some of my participants underlined the need for greater focus on newcomer communities and non-Indigenous people as well as the Indigenous survivors of the sex industry. Jennifer Richardson (Street Reach) described earlier how past research has lacked a focus on easily accessible, visible subjects while many are hidden from view in the sex industry. For example, she noted that sex trade workers at the street level are easy to observe. However, sex transactions through the Internet and massage parlours are often much more difficult to find. These hidden places are where newcomers and non-Indigenous people are trafficked. It is a two-tiered system with Indigenous girls prostituted on the streets and white girls mostly on the Internet.

Further, on the topic of diversity, Friedereke Von Aweden (Klinic) mentioned that she wonders if non-Indigenous women feel supported. She observes that programs are oriented more to being sensitive to the cultural requirements of Indigenous women, and there appears to be very little accommodation to non-Indigenous women. Von Aweden wonders if non-Indigenous women are lost in the system.

FRIEDEREKE VON AWEDEN: At TERF there is a large cultural component. And given that maybe 85 percent of participants are Indigenous, there is a large component with it.

I do wonder about women that come from other cultures, whether they feel equally supported in their own cultures.

Ms. Von Aweden is one of several respondents who pointed out that the growing newcomer population also need resources attention.

Joy Smith also commented that Indigenous programming is strong and we now need a focus on supporting non-Indigenous sex industry survivors as well.

JOY SMITH: Well, I don't think they have been culturally sensitive, to be honest.

And I think it is improving.

I think it has to be culturally sensitive, not only to Indigenous, but to others as well.

The culturally sensitive piece now I think is being addressed at the Indigenous level. But, there are a lot of different ethnic groups that are trafficked throughout Manitoba and throughout Canada.

And I think the culturally sensitive is particularly peculiar to the Indigenous population because that's of paramount importance to that population. Our population is so big here in the Indigenous circles, and they need to know what their roots are. They need to take pride. They need to know the wonderful work that the leaders have done. You know, there's a lot around the cultural aspect that needs to be enhanced.

But I think there's a good start on it now and it's high time it happened.

Ms. Smith pointed out that there are numerous cultural groups in Manitoba and Canada, in addition to Indigenous groups and that more cultural sensitivity is required in programming for both Indigenous and non-Indigenous people.

Two survivors I interviewed, Marie and Grace also describe how they feel that there are resources for Indigenous survivors, but insufficient programming for non-Indigenous people.

This is what Marie had to say on the issue:

MARIE: I think if we really want to address it we have to make partnerships with service agencies and housing authorities so we can create housing to take these people out of these areas where it's easy to access drugs.

I can walk down Main Street and get any drug I want. So if you have people living in the developments, it makes it that much easier to be an addict and that much harder to leave, right? Because it's all constantly around you.

I think that they're culturally sensitive in terms of Indigenous people. I think that that's changing. Smudging is allowed. And we do a lot of ceremony in terms of we have an elder that comes to our drop-in every day.

But there's not a lot of multicultural acceptance. There are not a lot of people who are trained on newcomers and how what works and how they may be exploited in the city when they first come. No one's studying that yet because they're such private people.

So for Indigenous people, yeah, I think that it's culturally sensitive. For every other culture, no.

Grace also expressed the view that the Province could do more for non-Indigenous people.

GRACE: Now some are for Indigenous, but the population is huge in Indigenous.

But we could do more for other cultures. I wouldn't know how to support an African American or I wouldn't know how to support an Asian because it looks totally different. So I don't know if there's any resources available from that culturally sensitive perspective.

This was a huge topic of the forum that we just had in Toronto.

I feel like there's a break between police officers and front-line workers. The

community is taught to be fearful of police, but I know there are good ones.

Demand needs to be attacked, people need to be brutally educated. If I had it my way I like to cut their balls off, but I'd get in trouble for that.

Both Marie and Grace said they wouldn't know how to support a non-Indigenous survivor.

Another survivor, Ashley who is white, told me that she was badly beaten by three Indigenous girls while attending a program that was oriented toward supporting Indigenous survivors. She described that experience as follows.

ASHLEY: The practices of service agencies I find to be culturally sensitive.

Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata's Centre has some great services I'm sure you know. First and Homes, for sexually exploited youth and women, has some good programs, and they also have the Sexually Exploited Youth Community Coalition and the Experiential Advisory Committee, which puts on awareness campaigns and conferences for youth serving agencies. The Experiential Advocacy Committee is a great way to empower survivors by including them in the business-type meetings and having them actively involved with the work of organizations.

I was in the [—] program when I was a youth. It was more Indigenous Indigenous girls and I was White, and I didn't really feel like I fit in in a way.

Like my mom's Jewish and my dad's Christian, and I never really grew up in a religion. I'm a Christian now.

I was also jumped there by three of them, girls in the program. They beat me up really bad. The support worker had to take me to the hospital. I was 15.

Ashley mentioned that this was the only program offered to her by her social worker, so she really didn't have a choice, except running away from the program placement. Some of the other research participants similarly highlighted that some clients are forced into cultural programming when they are not ready for it. For example, an Indigenous girl who is raised in a Christian home might not wish to participate in traditional Indigenous healing practices while others might benefit greatly from it.

Daphne Penrose is the Acting Executive Director of Winnipeg CFS. She described how it is important to have options available for a child, and that just because s/he is born into or comes from one cultural background or another does not mean s/he will benefit from programming that incorporates that culture. She described the importance of considering the identity, positionality

and wishes of any particular survivor as follows.

DAPHNE PENROSE: I think that when a child comes into care or a child is exploited and intervention services are needed, I think that allowing a child to find their own way and making sure that different culturally responsive systems are present is appropriate because just because a child is from Somalia doesn't mean that they want to connect back to their Somalian culture. Just because a child is First Nations doesn't mean they want to connect to that culture.

They may eventually, and you'll want to make it available to them.

But my perception of what their culture is may be very different from what their perception self-identity and culture is. And I can't prescribe that and neither can anybody else, neither should anybody else.

We need to allow these victims to heal, [to] reach out and have things available, culturally appropriate services available to them, without forcing it on them because they've had enough forced on them.

This observation by Ms. Penrose is critical in programming for diverse populations, agreeing with Ms. Irvin-Ross that not every Indigenous person is ready for cultural programming at the time they are admitted into treatment.

Ms. Irvin-Ross's also highlights that people need choices over the type of programs they enter.

KERRI IRVIN-ROSS: Do we need more services that are culturally sensitive? Yes, I do believe that we do and I think that the mainstream is becoming more and more aware of it.

I once had someone say to me that, you know five years ago when we started talking about culturally sensitive, a group of people just started putting the medicine wheel or the eagle feather on their letterhead. And that was not culturally sensitive. We were looking for actions.

So, I think that there are many examples. I think that we do have a lot more work to do. And it's a challenge, though, because I was just speaking with a service provider earlier today that talked about that they are a very culturally sensitive program, but they are having to acknowledge that not every Indigenous person wants to participate at that particular intake time—that sometimes there has to be a healing and understanding that develop to practice the cultural ways and the traditional ways.

So I think we need a system that provides a variety of services and that is culturally sensitive because, for the most part, we are talking about Indigenous people so Indigenous lead organizations that employ Indigenous people, that have Indigenous boards that follow traditional ways, are crucial, but making sure that we also have other alternatives if people want them to seem important.

Ms. Irvin-Ross states that not all Indigenous programs are authentic or effective.

Sheldon Beaton of the RCMP EPPS described one survivor's story in great detail. He pointed out that the young woman was Indigenous, yet she did not identify as Indigenous and preferred to not participate in Indigenous focused programming.

SHELDON BEATON: I believe there's a lot of various agencies out there that have to deal with different cultures. And I've learned a lot over the three years I was down here—different cultures and how people see it.

I'm not sure what the answer is.

I know I spoke to one girl once, she grew up Indigenous, but she didn't associate with it. So she said she did not like all these agencies because it was too cultural.

But that's for one person, and, again, you can't just group everyone into one. What's good for one isn't good for the others, I guess.

I found pretty much, I think, every agency was open to different cultures and stuff. A lot of it was. I noticed, too, with funding, like, if certain agencies would get funding through different aspects of whatever, through government, I guess, right. But I think pretty much everything was culturally sound.

I don't know if there's an answer for that. It's hard. I really don't think there is an answer for that because everyone's different.

Mr. Beaton stresses that everyone is different and that we should be careful not to essentialize or generalize survivors into categories without careful assessment, such as asking them how they wish to identify and, as Kerri Irvin-Ross and Daphne Penrose both stressed, giving people choices.

Some participants, such as WPS Sergeant Cam MacKid, stress that there is sometimes too much focus on culture and not enough on immediate action.

CAM MACKID: They're almost overly culturally sensitive. There's no shortage of cultural sensitivity across the board. No matter what issue we're dealing with and wherever we're speaking, it's the Indigenous concern, and there's no shortage of that. And it almost permeates through every conversation we have to the point.

Our Missing Persons Unit goes to this sexually exploited youth training, which I believe it's an entire week, and we send all our people on it. And it's not really about sexually exploited youth, it's about cultural awareness of Indigenous issues. So, yeah, if anything I think, it's gone a little bit too far. And our employees come back from that course, and there's some value to it, but we feel we totally understand the historical issues. It's been well laid out.

But at some point, I think as policemen, we're more wanting to deal with the here and now and how can we help this person right now. It is certainly relevant, their background, but to have guys lecture our guys for several days about racist policemen, it doesn't help them. It makes them leave with a bad feeling.

I don't think cultural awareness is an issue at all. I think we're well aware of the culture issues. And there are a lot of resources out there that are Indigenous-based. Actually the vast majority have been focused on Indigenous issues, and rightfully so, and that's the metric we're dealing with.

Mr. MacKid highlights that sometimes there is an overemphasis on cultural sensitivity, and he raises the idea that we should be careful not to overburden practitioners with too much cultural training. If people are overwhelmed with cultural sensitivity training, they may feel defensive or numb to it; plus it may distract them from the work of assisting women in immediate danger.

Most of my study participants expressed that we, as a society, have come a long way in the past 20 years and that while much progress was made we still have a lot of work to do. For example, Kelly Dennison (WPS Inspector) describes how cultural sensitivity has improved in policing over recent decades.

KELLY DENNISON: Our counter exploitation team now is doing that on a daily basis and talking to these girls.

Now the jury's still out on how well that's working.

I can tell you when I'm hearing stories about young girls that have been taken and have been involved in this program or that program. You can't help but applaud your officers for being involved in stuff like that. That's what it's all about.

The rate at which they go back I don't know. I would love to know that better. I would love to know how we could be more successful at that. I wish I had an answer for you. I don't. I don't know how we could do it better.

But its changed. It's changed over time.

But, like I said, the one thing that's never changed in my whole time was that the focus was on the wellbeing of the people that were involved. I guess the general public and the people that were really involved may have viewed [our work with girls in the sex trade] differently at the time because they see us as the bad guys, showing up with handcuffs and arrests for people who were being exploited. And, yeah, we did that.

But the intent was not to charge, to arrest. The intent was to get them involved in a system that could provide help for them. I think we're being more successful now doing that without having to use the system. Pretty long-winded answer. I think we're getting better at it now, cultural sensitivity.

I can tell you my opinion. We weren't culturally sensitive 20 years ago. It didn't matter what ethnicity. It didn't matter where you came from. If you're a Winnipeg girl or a Thompson girl, it didn't matter. A girl in the sex trade is a girl in the sex trade.

I think we're getting better at it now.

For me I would like to see agencies that can assist in the whole cultural sensitivity piece.

I think we can be sensitive to a point. A police officer can be sensitive to a point but we're more sensitive with the situation than we are with their ethnicity. It's not that we don't understand or we don't want to understand, but there's a volume that we're dealing with.

I think it would be nice to see agencies out there that would really take command of the whole cultural ethnicity piece and try to weave that in the whole exploited persons part. I do think that's something that's lacking.

Mr. Dennison supports the position described by Mr. MacKid that sometimes too much emphasis is placed on the police, when there is a broad spectrum of other services, such as social workers that can address these necessities. Overall, Mr. Dennison highlights much positive progress over the past decade and that roles and responsibilities of partnering agencies need to be better defined.

Kelly Holmes is Executive Director of *Resource Assistance for Youth* (RAY). She describes an interesting idea, proposing that there should be a cultural hub that all agencies could access to provide a range of services from elders to cultural training.

KELLY HOLMES: We could always improve on being culturally sensitive. There's so much to know and I feel like, I've been around for a long time, 35 years, and all working on the streets with marginalized communities, and I'm still learning about cultural stuff. And I think I always will learn, there's so much to know. But could we do it in a more organized way?

I tend to have the reputation of getting shit done. That's sort of my claim to fame.

And if I were in charge, I would have The Thunderbird House being used and funded more readily. So Thunderbird House becomes sort of the education hub for all of us non-Indigenous types where schools can access it, police can access it, you know, a number of the unrelated sector communities can access it.

We can attend sweat lodges. We can do ceremonies. We can understand our colonial history. And it's done in more of an education setting. We can jump onto training. We can have trainers coming out to our agencies, and those kinds of things. We can just readily access anything that we need in terms of understanding Metis, Indigenous, Indigenous, Inuit people, and in a different way.

We need baseline requirements for all front-line service providers. And just in terms of cultural sensitivity, colonial history, and awareness, what our cultural differences are. How do we incorporate that into our language in the way that we work? And what are the baseline kind of understandings that you need in order to effectively deal with any kind of person of colour.

I think that that's critical. So, yeah, standardized training. And there should be, like, a reading expectation on higher, in those kinds of situations.

This is a groundbreaking proposal by Ms. Holmes, that agencies and individuals that want cultural resources, training, and advice, could access it through the shared resource hub. She suggested that elders could travel to different agencies providing teaching and healing circles, suggesting that this could be a place to offer standardized culturally oriented services.

Gabriel Simard (RCMP) builds on the idea that the Indigenous community is made up of numerous groups with different cultures and language, so "Indigenous" could mean a lot of different things to different groups.

GABRIEL SIMARD: I would make sure if I went, say to a group, at community, say there's a group of 20, I would ask, you know, should we do a prayer before we start? Should we do a smudge?

And it all depends on the community. Because a lot of the communities, whether they're First Nation, especially First Nation, they, some are still practicing Christianity, where they may take offence to smudging, whereas some communities have gone back to more traditional and do smudging ceremonies.

So we'll ask—myself as well as the partners that I have attended with—whether they're AMC, even WPS. When I worked with Edith Turner from WPS, when she was in the cultural diversity unit, the Child Protection Branch, *Ma Mawi*, they would ask, right? And if the community was good with having a smudge, we'd start with a smudge.

Interpreters, for example—when we went to Little Grand Rapids, Pauingassi—I would do my presentation, I would talk, then I would have to stop. We had an interpreter with us from South East Tribal Council who would do it in Ojibway, because our audience didn't speak a word of English. And, Little Grand Rapids there was a little more English understood. But Pauingassi, probably out of, I think there was about 15 people, probably 12 could only speak Ojibway, and the rest were both Ojibway and English.

So, yeah, and the that's the big thing is making sure the person can understand. Because the thing some people forget, especially with First Nation people, they'll nod and you'll think they're understanding when, in fact, they're not because they don't want to offend you.

Mr. Simard points out the challenges in providing culturally specific programming for young

Indigenous and immigrant youth and how it is important to not make assumptions about people's identity. In a room full of people who appear Indigenous, possibly even those from the same community, people could identify themselves in a lot of different ways, depending on factors such as how they were raised, their experiences and their education.

Leslie Spillett, Executive Director of *Ka Ni Kanichihk*, notes that the whole paradigm of service delivery is wrong. Ms. Spillett notes that rather than providing culturally appropriate services, the funding that goes to large service providers should go directly to the Indigenous community so they can control their own services in their own way. She describes how practitioners and service providers might prescribe better than they listen.

LESLIE SPILLETT: Everybody knows what's best for us. Everybody thinks that they have some kind of a solution for us and it's based on a very dominant culture and belief of what is, of what that fix is.

But really they're failing that fix unless you think that you know.

What you see is their best attempts. So, I just think that the only way to really have an impact—and I totally believe this, researchers have shown that too—is that Indigenous people have to have control. We have to have control over our own lives, we have to have agency. We have to take all that power that's been displaced and build back our own capacities, using our own methodologies and using our own ways of understanding who we are and where we came from, and really understanding the picture of how we landed here. I think that you would have really different outcomes in the long term.

This colonial prescriptive attitude that people may have a tendency to filter reality through should be avoided. As Leslie Spillett explains, such an attitude could be perceived as an overbearing attempt at further assimilation, rather than meeting survivors where they are at emotionally and offering them the support that they need.

6.5 Key findings

The following nine salient and significant findings emerged from analysis of my interviews with respect to the violent reality that Canadian Indigenous women and children live with daily, and

how culturally sensitive the system of resources is to them.

First, most trafficking survivors in Manitoba are Indigenous. The majority of sex industry survivors in Manitoba are of Indigenous descent. Violence against Indigenous women and children is central in the issue of sex trafficking and exploitation in Manitoba. My interviewees suggest that the vast majority of sexually exploited youth in Manitoba are Indigenous. While previous studies reported it as closer to 70 percent (see Cook & Courchene, 2006), my respondents report the percentage might be even higher.

Second, Indigenous Manitobans are largely marginalized. My interviews reveal that poverty and the lack of educational and employment opportunities are more salient among Indigenous people. Much research has documented the systemic marginalization and impoverishment of Indigenous women in Canada (Mandel, 2016; Ham, 2014). While it is no surprise that Indigenous women are inordinately overrepresented in Canada's sex industry, the degree of disparity and disproportionate marginalization and victimization against Indigenous people should be shocking to all people. My research finds that a key to eradicating sex trafficking and exploitation in the sex industry lies in improving standards of living and reducing disparity among our most disadvantaged and penurious populations through improved income levels and better access to education and employment.

Third, the rural to urban trafficking pipeline must be interrupted. There is a trafficking pipeline of young girls and women from rural reserves into urban centers. A real and immediate threat to the safety of Indigenous youth in Manitoba is the perils they encounter when they move into larger urban centers for education and employment opportunities. Commonly this hazard is caused by the need to travel away from family and community for schooling. Some practitioners are trying to raise awareness among Indigenous youth and their families to make them more

resistant to sexual predators, yet this is a threat that is still growing and must be addressed in Manitoba.

Fourth, cultural programming needs improvement. Cultural sensitivity training often does not coexist with other effective treatment resources. My research participants expressed mixed opinions about whether existing addiction, medical, educational, and other counseling programs offered to sex industry survivors are culturally sensitive. Most agreed that overall cultural appropriateness in the system at large has improved over the past decade. Some participants said that there is a great deal of cultural sensitivity and some even opined that there is too much. Others described some agencies as having a false visage, for example putting a medicine wheel on their stationery solely to gain funding without having any real substance in the services they provide to Indigenous people.

Most study participants felt that there are pockets of good cultural programming, yet it is sporadic and not always available in the right programs. For example, my study has highlighted that survivors often have addictions and multiple layered issues that all need to be addressed simultaneously. Some addictions services are better suited for specific people for various reasons. Some of those addictions programs, according to my interviewees, have better cultural services as a core component of what they offer compared to other programs. Therefore, the cultural nuances in other programs often do not line up. One possible solution could be creation of a cultural hub, as envisioned by Kelly Homes, whereby a full range of cultural services can be delivered ensuring quality and inclusion of various Indigenous cultural resources.

Fifth, people need to fit with the right cultural programming. People are often forced into cultural programs based upon a professional agency person's assumptions. An interesting research finding was that people are often not matched with the appropriate cultural

programming as part of their survivor oriented trauma care. For example, survivors and practitioners advised me that a youth who looks Indigenous in appearance might have been raised Christian and might not wish to have anything to do with traditional healing. Or, that a child might later wish to have traditional healing and it should be made available to her/him when s/he is ready for it. This flexibility of choices and the ability for service recipients (the survivors) to move from one program to another is currently lacking and could be improved.

Another interesting finding was the diversity that exists within the Metis and Indigenous communities. There are multiple languages, cultures and intra-group traditions among the various Indigenous groups in Manitoba. For example, Gabriel Simard (RCMP) described how, in his work travelling to rural reserves in Manitoba's Interlake, he pays careful attention to the languages each community speaks and their spiritual background connections. He stressed that the same community can have within it people with multiple languages and religious beliefs, some are Christian (Catholic or Protestant) and others non-Christian. Moreover, there are numerous different paths, some are more orthodox and others are more relaxed within the traditional Indigenous ways. Several of my participants described an "Indigenous" resource pool that could be tailored to fit individual wishes of people from different Indigenous backgrounds.

Sixth, Indigenous programming needs improvement. There are not enough resources for non-Indigenous diverse groups. Several participants highlighted that there is a lot of programming for Indigenous people, and almost nothing for people from other non-mainstream cultures, including newcomers to Manitoba from different countries. Newcomer populations are growing in Manitoba, and across Canada, and inclusive constructive programming is needed for those who succumb to the sex industry. This issue is becoming more salient as new information emerges about the growing Internet based sex industry that is migrating from the street. It seems

critical that we are prepared to intervene and assist newcomers and non-Indigenous sex industry survivors. If service providers relax when opportunities arise to intervene early and build trust, then it is likely that trust will be set back or lost and our chance of assisting these sex industry survivors will be diminished.

Seventh, more systemic flexibility is needed. People need choices in their treatments, so that appropriate treatment resources are accessible to them when they are required. My participants described the current state of the system of resources in Manitoba as diverse, fragmented, and inflexible. They observed that there should be greater flexibility in the system with regards to cultural sensitivity and other programming dynamics, so that people get the services they need when they need them. My research participants emphasized that sex industry survivors need to have some choice and a sense of control over what programs they participate in. This provision of choice is often lacking in the current treatment resource system. For example, Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount) mentioned that sometimes people are restricted to services within Marymount or counseling programs within MacDonald Youth Services but the two generally do not mix well together. This problem should be addressed so that survivors can access an appropriate placement within one system while also accessing needed resources within other agencies. NGOs compete with each other for limited resources within a fixed pie.

Eighth, Indigenous people need more control over their own healing. Indigenous people need more control over their participation in programs and healing. Some Indigenous practitioners and leaders that I interviewed expressed a sense of paternalistic control by government agencies specific to funding. For example, Chief Ron Evans pointed out that people living in Winnipeg do not have to have the Mayor co-sign for a mortgage, yet people living on his reserve are required to have the Band Chief and Council co-sign for one. Similarly, Leslie

Spillett made the point that Indigenous people should have more control over how services are provided in Indigenous communities. For example, she argues that the funding that supports core services such as the police and social services should go directly to the Indigenous community, rather than having those agencies tell Indigenous people how they can serve them.

Moreover, my participants also accentuated the fact that survivors must be involved in all levels of planning and development of survivor oriented intervention and prevention programming. For example, Cook and Courchene (2006) have highlighted the importance of looking for answers to Indigenous issues in the Indigenous community because they will truly understand how Canada's colonial history impacts them and how survivor oriented intervention and prevention programming can assist sex industry survivors. My research finds that it is critical to include survivors in designing their own support systems. This is consistent with Lederach's teaching that the best solutions to social problems likely come from the grassroots in an affected community because people who understand local cultures, epistemologies and cosmologies are critical in devising sustainable systems that actually work (Lederach, 1997).

Ninth, a cultural hub could improve coordination of diversity resources. Kelly Holmes, suggested a unique social innovation, namely to create a cultural hub to service all agencies. My participants identified that sources of cultural resources are only available sporadically, depending on the knowledge and experience of the person who is looking for them. For example, one social worker might be aware of some elders but not know the treatment programs that are available to young people, while another social worker might be cognizant of effective programs but not be informed of where to access elders. As a solution to this issue, Ms. Holmes proposes to create a cultural hub that all agencies could access to acquire thorough cultural knowledge and resources, including elders and teachers who could be deployed to the agencies as needed.

6.6 Conclusion

The overall consensus of most of my participants was that much work has been done to make programs culturally sensitive over the past two decades, yet more efforts must be applied. A greater focus is needed on culturally appropriate programming for newcomer groups. Also, most interview participants reported a need for increased culturally appropriate resources to be provided for people of Metis and Indigenous descent that should also be pertinent to the right sub-groups within the diverse Indigenous community.

This research contributes insights into Indigenous and Metis perspectives and the choices that must be created for people trying to avoid or exit the sex industry. Indigenous and Metis people should be engaged in developing future services and treatments and service agencies require greater flexibility, so that people can choose and access elements when they are ready for them. My research also confirms the theory that trauma is passed forward transgenerationally as young Indigenous people cope with the impacts of colonialism (see Volkan, 1997).

Chief Ron Evans described persisting social ills on the reserves and how they are tied to poverty. These observations are consistent with Galtung (1996) who stressed that self-reliance and resilience are significant determinants of one's ability to escape structural violence. Galtung (1996) argued that the first step to gaining autonomy is self-reliance (cited in Jeong, 2000). It is clear from my interviews that young people are in jeopardy of being trafficked in the sex industry, not only due to being born a female, but also because they are born Indigenous or born into poverty.

Chapter 7 - Awareness and Education

7.1 Introduction

Most of my respondents stressed that education is a key need in reducing sexual exploitation and sex trafficking of young Indigenous girls. In a word search of this theme from my respondents' interviews, the word "education" was used 154 times; "awareness" was used 121 times, and "training" was used 69 times. More significantly, the participants were adamant and used strong language to emphasize the importance of education at all levels to raise awareness of the extent to which sex trafficking goes on in Manitoba and how to prevent it.

My participants identified the obligation to create more public awareness and education about sex trafficking and sexual exploitation for four main groups including (1) children, to make them aware of the dangers (2) the public, to affect the discourse around sex trafficking (3) the purchasers of sex, to make them aware of the hurt they cause to survivors, and (4) practitioners as people who are in a position to recognize the signs of sex trafficking and intervene to prevent it. My research participants often focused their comments on the areas that they are most involved in. For example, some of the survivors stated that they wished they had received awareness training to prevent their involvement in the sex industry. Practitioners often advised me that they need better training.

7.2 They need to talk about this stuff in schools

Participants highlighted the need for greater education of youth to make them aware of predators and how some people are not true friends, especially when drugs, alcohol, and promiscuity are involved. Survivors' voices on this subject are particularly impactful. Following are comments of

two sex industry survivors, Ashley and Kaitlin. They describe how they wish they had received some education that could have prevented them from being victimized.

ASHLEY: I think a lot of youth who are vulnerable to being exploited—like maybe in those teenage years, when you’re looking for that need to belong and to be accepted and to be a part of something—I think awareness is a huge thing. They need to be informed at every age about this issue.

I think the police have come a long way in terms of viewing girls as victims. I think the law that was passed criminalizing the buyers of sex is a good one if the police are enforcing it. Like the buyers need to be criminalized, not the girls.

And the police need to do more outreach so that you could feel safe to come forward because maybe they don’t know that they’re not going to get in trouble, like they’re going to be offered services.

They should be teaching about sex trafficking in schools, like have the Joy Smith Foundation School Program in all the schools.

Ashley emphasizes the need for people to be informed at every age of the threat of being groomed and trafficked in the sex industry.

Kaitlin talks about the need for better training for teachers and parents to know the warning signs to watch for and how to intervene. She describes how she had no one she could talk to and no one knew how to intervene to assist her.

KAITLIN: There is Sage House. But you only learn about that when you are on the street. It would have been helpful to hear about that in high school. I had a probation officer, but I was afraid to tell her anything cause I was afraid she would send me to jail.

They need to talk about this stuff in schools. In my school, they never had any of that. So, when my friends were like, “Hey, let’s go party and drink in the West End. Don’t worry, my friends will take care of us.” And I thought, “Okay.”

And when we went in this house there was all these guys dressed in vests and I knew something was going to happen, but I was scared.

Kaitlin claims that awareness education could have saved her from being exploited and on the street turning tricks.

Joy Smith’s interview was consistent with Kaitlin’s accounts, stressing that children need early education and awareness of the dangers of sex trafficking and prostitution.

JOY SMITH: The critical event is being lured.

They need education. They need to not listen to these predators that are going to make a lot of money off of them. And, you know, telling about the wonderful future, and all the money and all the love they're going to have.

They need to be educated about what really happens, and that's why the [Joy Smith Foundation] has a School Program that has—we're incorporating in River East School Division right now, and in River East Collegiate. And we did a presentation at one of the schools from Brandon. And, what that does, it does more than talk about human trafficking right now. It starts about the history of human trafficking in Canada.

In addition to Ms. Smith's comment, Emma, a senior Crown Prosecutor highlights the key importance of education in preventing sex trafficking and exploitation.

EMMA: Well, we know the average age of entry is 13 years old. There are a number of factors—poverty and marginalization is key.

And education in the community is key. Education in schools would make children aware. And education for women would make them aware of programs and resources that are available. Many exploited youth have been in group home settings, not feeling supported.

Again, counseling, culturally sensitive supports and resources, and a huge injection of supports.

At the end of the day it's the manner of delivery of those services and the relationship with police, letting them know they are cared for and that they are important as individuals.

We know from Snow Night that they are often surprised to hear about donations, that people cared enough about them to do that.

Snow Night is a special night that is put on at Salvation Army in Winnipeg every year for people to have a chance to get in off the street and escape the harsh reality of the sex industry.

Claudia Ponce-Joly agrees with Emma and Joy Smith, stressing that education and awareness should start early, when children first start becoming vulnerable to external influences.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: In my view, children and youth need constant and ongoing options because we're not 100 percent clear which option will work for which child at what time.

I think that some of the youth that I've worked with—and some unfortunately and tragically lost their lives through sexual exploitation—different approaches would have worked for them at different times. And I think the key is to address and work with opportunity and pull them back through options, and sometimes I would say even stronger strategies, or simply they have to occur as young as possible.

When young people are starting to become vulnerable that is when the strategy should start. And it could be information and education. Just as young people are educated

on safety and health, they should be educated on what kind of risks are in our communities, unfortunately, what kind of people may be attempting to have contact with them. And this should be part of education in my view, and especially for children that are vulnerable, involved in the child welfare system, or in corrections or any other kind.

Ms. Ponce-Joly makes the point that the education should start when children are in their formative years, so that the awareness process becomes natural and normal, alongside health and social education. Survivors, practitioners, political and community leaders stressed that education and awareness must be stepped up earlier for children in schools.

People from the North and rural communities coming into the city are particularly vulnerable to sexual predators. For example, Gabriel Simard (RCMP) spent five years travelling to First Nations communities and reserves throughout Manitoba, to educate people about the dangers that might await their children in the city as well as outlining the indicators of sex trafficking and exploitation. He notes that education and awareness are extremely important for youth in rural communities and reserves, especially where they're transplanted out of necessity to attend high school in the city.

GABRIEL SIMARD: If you have children that are moving on, make sure they're educated and understand that if a person's buying them clothes, taking them for expensive dinners, be a little leery because a normal person shouldn't be doing this, you know.

And when we explain it in a sense that, "Tell your kid to be on the guard if they're getting things that an adult shouldn't be giving them, unless it's a close family member, parent, then something could be going very wrong, or could be misleading.

And so for that question I think, just being able to relate and having someone who's from the community explain this is how it could look, it could very well happen in the communities.

[Question: Maybe we should just list the communities you've been to if you don't mind.]

Sure OK. Yah, I just gave a vague list. I know there's a bit more. But some of them are Red Sucker Lake, which is in Northern Manitoba, Saint Theresa Point, God's Lake Narrows, Little Grand Rapids, Pauingassi, Grand Rapids, which is on the other side of Lake Winnipeg, Sagkeeng First Nation as well as Hollow Water, Brokenhead Ojibway Nation, Rolling River First Nation. That was a short list I gave. But just off the top of my head some of the others I was out to and where else have I been—I've been to Long Plain, Tataskweyak Cree Nation, Dakota Tipi, Dakota Plains.

And that's the thing, fortunately, with the role I was in, I was doing a lot of travelling

in the community. So, if I was doing other business, I took the time to explain this.

For example, when I was in Rolling River, I was talking about prescription drugs. But at the same time, I was about to explain how a person could be exploited, could be trafficked because of those drugs. So I was fortunate enough to, to have that audience, and be able to hear other information on this topic.

[Question: So just an extension of that question, how pervasive do you think the problem is of people from the North being trafficked into Winnipeg?]

I think, ah, with that question, what I was trying to get at with my response I provided is it is happening so much. And what I mean by that is there's so many youth coming from these communities, especially now if you look at somewhere like Southeast College.

Mr. Simard notes that it is very helpful that he is from the community as people trust him and know that he understands their culture and history.

Jennifer Richardson points out that parents need greater awareness about the indicators of how children are groomed by pimps. She emphasizes the need for more awareness training for children, and a greater vigilance among parents and teachers, and society at large. While a lot of awareness programs are currently in place, Richardson notes that we need to give a lot more attention to what we are teaching our children about the people they are meeting through the Internet, and parents need to be aware of the indicators that their kids are being approached or groomed by predators.

JENNIFER RICHARDSON: We could be doing a much better job at utilizing prevention resources or teaching younger kids, and all kids the kind of the dangers, or what are traffickers doing. How are they recruiting?

If some guy starts talking to you on-line on Facebook and is paying all this attention to you, that should be a cue to let an adult know. Just those types of things that, again, we would as adults be leery of, but children, because everyone's a friend on the internet, and their brains just aren't cooked enough to figure out what's coming around the corner. You know, they just don't have that ability even developmentally yet.

So, I think we need to do a better job of teaching kids that information in schools. Parents, of course, are leery. And it's the last thing that a parent wants to ever think is going on with their child, even if their child is using drugs or drinking lots, or going missing all the time. Or all of a sudden, you know, they've got stuff and [parents]'re saying, "Well where'd you get that from?"

"Well oh I got it from my friend." Well, after they say that ten times, parents still aren't checking in to that and that always shocks me.

So, again, I think, if there was more information—general public information for

parents and information specific to kids out there—. We have some in Manitoba, but I don't think it's enough. We need more.

The majority of participants I interviewed indicate the need for parents and the community to provide greater awareness for youth in their formative and vulnerable years. This need is growing as the environment is changing. For example, some participants, including Jennifer Richardson, also highlight the growing threat of social media and the Internet.

7.3 The johns don't realize the pain they are causing

My participants talked about the need to “go after” the sex market, stressing that the overarching strategy of countering sexual exploitation and sex trafficking should involve pursuing the pimps and predators and the purchasers of sex with fines, jail sentences, and other forms of dissuasive punishments. A smaller but still significant number of my research participants stressed the need for more education for boys and men to make them aware of the damage caused to young women who are forced to participate in the sex industry. For example, Hennes Doltze works directly with men who have been charged criminally with offences related to purchasing sex and are diverted from the courts to “John School” at the Salvation Army, where a program is in place to re-socialize and reeducate the johns.

Mr. Doltze understands the sex purchaser side of the equation, perhaps better than any other person I interviewed. Men attending his program are charged with offences related to purchasing sex, and once they participate in the “John School” their charges are dropped. While the men participate unwillingly, often feeling shame and embarrassment in having to show up there, Mr. Doltze has found that they still have “aha” moments and say they learned a lot from the process despite initial participation under duress.

In the following, Mr. Doltze outlines how the program works and how he feels it is effective at deterring sex-purchasing behaviour.

HENNES DOLTZE: So I'm a social worker here with the Salvation Army. And I work with men who have been charged for prostitution-related offences. So I work with the offenders on that end, and I've been doing this for about two years now.

The program is primarily an education and awareness program, educating men around the effects that prostitution has on the community, on the people that are being exploited and also on the men themselves. So, that's the main focus of the program.

We have a committee who is overseeing the program. and we've been running this program since 1998, I believe, so 17-18 years now. And it's been, in our point of view, a very successful program in helping to reduce the demands of prostitution and sexual exploitation.

The program that we offer is, as I said, an educational and awareness program where we talk about the different effects of prostitution.

So, we have a Crown Attorney speak at our seminar. We have Winnipeg Police Services speaking of the law enforcement aspect. We have nurses who talk about health risks that are involved and the personal effects and the trauma that are created for a lot of the women, and it's predominately women. There are some men who are being sexually exploited, but in to regards to the numbers I believe it's primarily its women and transgender persons.

So it's really about making people aware that this is not some—, is not a victimless crime where people are just in there for no reason but that it's actually harmful to a lot of the people involved and communities.

Mr. Doltze highlights that education about the physical and psychological damage that purchasing sex can do to survivors, and how many of these young women are doing it for survival, is important for the offenders and is an important future deterrent in conjunction with enforcement. Based on the insights from these interviews, one of the key recommendations is to raise public awareness about enlightening would-be sex purchasers on the damage it perpetuates on young women.

Mr. Doltze's impressions are mirrored by evaluation of similar programs that have run in the United States for many years. For example, Shively, Kuck, Jailbert, and Kling et al. (2008) evaluated First Offender Prostitution Programs (aka john schools) across the United States and found that they are generally effective in changing men's attitudes about the sex industry, and

they generally reduce recidivism. One effective john school model started in San Francisco was duplicated in 12 states. Eligible arrestees have a choice of paying to attend a one day class, or face prosecution. Over the past 12 years this program has generated \$3.1 million after covering the cost of the programs, and the bulk of the profit goes to survivor support programs. The authors of this program evaluation also wrote (*ibid.*),

In addition to San Francisco, we have identified 47 U.S. cities and counties that have offered broad-spectrum education programs for men arrested for soliciting in lieu of, or in addition to, criminal penalties. Of those 47 sites, 39 have programs that are still operating. An additional 11 john education programs were identified that are restricted to health topics.

My research participants stressed the need for greater emphasis on reducing the demand for the sex industry. This calls for a balance of enforcement matched with treatment and education to reduce the customer's appetite for purchasing sex. The effectiveness of these programs is illustrated in the aforementioned programs.

McIntyre, Clark, Lewis and Reynolds (2015) propose building on the "john school" model and improving it to account for the increasing use of the Internet (p. 5/6). They describe the need for greater emphasis on the demand, as follows.

For years, prevention efforts have looked at the supply side of the economic equation – unsuccessfully. There has been and likely always will be an endless supply of new workers entering the sex trade. However, with recent research studies providing data to better understand consumers, it would appear to make sense to explore prevention models that focus on the demand side of the equation.

McIntyre et al. (2015) stress that men learn this behavior at a young age, therefore prevention strategies such as education must target boys and young men, not only to teach them about the damage caused by participating in the sex industry, but also about women's basic rights and dignity. With advancing technology and ever increasing use of social media, these researchers recommend prevention programs delivered through social media to men all of ages, "to spell out

the realities of the trade as well as the risks and personal impacts associated with being a consumer in an effort to reduce demand” (ibid.).

7.4 Bringing sex trafficking out of the shadows into the light

The need for more resources and effort to inform and influence public awareness campaigns was a significant and prevalent theme throughout most of my interviews. For example, Rose, a senior prosecutor, stressed that awareness campaigns should focus on raising public awareness of the damage caused to young girls and women in the sex industry.

ROSE: We are getting better, but these cases need buy-in from numerous agencies. And that doesn’t always happen because there’s a feeling at the grassroots level, I think, that it is a waste of time.

So, my office has been really reaching out to victims at the grassroots level to build bridges with them. And I think it is working.

I think it goes back to the formative years of most children’s lives, both people who could wind up being offenders and victims. If we could—and I don’t have a magic answer to that—but I think we, as a society, need to be intervening.

And that doesn’t mean taking kids away from their families. But it means strengthening their families early on.

You know some of the campaigns about having sex with children. You know what that’s about.

And I think more education in the area of the impact to these children would be really helpful because there are still in society so many myths and misunderstandings about victims and particularly victims working in the sex trade.

I think better education, continuing education in that area about how they truly are victims would be really helpful.

But I don’t have a real lot of really concrete answers on that.

Rose points out that public campaigns are effective and need to be increased to continue raising awareness among the public that children are not willingly participating in the sex industry; rather, they are being victimized and exploited by the minions operating in it.

Joy Smith (Joy Smith Foundation) agreed with Rose, and emphasizes that public awareness programs need to be coordinated across the country.

JOY SMITH: The barrier in my organization is the lack of knowledge in the general public

about human trafficking. That's a barrier.

And you know, as I said, I don't get a cent from my foundation, but I'm exhausted getting that message out there. And I think that more people have to pick up the message.

The next thing is to implant a public awareness program across this country that prevents this because Manitoba cannot be isolated from the rest of Canada. That's not the way human trafficking works. They have routes, you know.

We have a route from Winnipeg to Sault Ste. Marie down into the States. That's one route. Another route is through Saskatchewan, Calgary. And Montreal, that's another route.

And we need to collaborate and also cross borders. Collaborate with those routes to intercept those routes.

You know what? And people have to be aware that the predators are not stupid people. You think we use social media? They use it ten-fold.

Consequently, Mrs. Smith describes how human trafficking routes across the country and sex trafficking awareness campaigns should raise public awareness about them.

Sergeant Cam MacKid (WPS) also agrees with this approach. He described the work conducted by his fellow Counter-Exploitation Unit members, speaking in numerous venues and making presentations to raise awareness about the dangers of sex trafficking. As Mr. MacKid points out, the impact of sex trafficking on our youth is immeasurable, yet it seems clear that multi-modal and multi-level collaborated and coordinated interventions with public campaigns, and ongoing advocacy by people working in the area are a must.

CAM MACKID: Our public awareness. We're trying to get the word out there that these are victims of life's circumstances. They've been raised in broken households characterized by violence, sexual abuse, addictions, that sort of thing.

We try to get that message out there, and we do that in a number of ways. We speak at the university and community forums on a regular basis. We go to the Salvation Army for different campaigns that try to focus on the exploitation and the victimization. The hope in doing that is that the demand side of the situation, the johns that seek to exploit these women, maybe view it differently and may reconsider their choices.

I think, to some extent, I'd like to think—it's hard to measure—but I'd like to think it has some effect. For lack of a better word, the casual user of sexual services—the john that once a week comes into these areas to exploit women without really realizing that is exploitation—they may think it's a transaction.

The true predators I don't think we're going to affect with our campaigns so the programs we utilize, the next level, would be the street level sweeps, which we still do quite regularly

This type of public awareness raising work described by Mr. MacKid is ongoing and was also described by my respondents from numerous service sectors. They all stressed that more public awareness is needed, as many people in society at large are unaware of the dark underbelly and what is actually happening in our communities.

Dianna Bussey, the Justice Liaison for Salvation Army in Winnipeg, also underscored that public awareness is key. She suggested that more funding and resources should be invested in campaigns to raise public conscience about children and women who are exploited.

DIANNA BUSSEY: I'm a huge advocate for the Nordic model. Prostitution is a form of violence against women predominantly, violence against people generally. And getting that out there. And I think if the public is meaningfully engaged in that, they will come to that realization that's going to cost money, right?

A huge public awareness campaign. So, that would be the first thing, and just bringing that awareness to people. To really take a look at how it works.

And for those who are caught up in it, both the buyers and the sellers, that there would be the resources and the supports in place for them to be able to exit.

Then also exit into something meaningful as well. For those who are selling sex. it should not have to be an option of a way of making a living, right? And unfortunately it seems to be the case, if a woman is in dire straits, if a woman is having trouble, if a woman is in poverty that's the go to and shouldn't be that way.

And then it seems that on the flip side that there needs to be supports for men. We have a hard time when men are really looking for help, it's not easy to get that help.

Gabriel Simard (RCMP) also expands on Ms. Bussey's call for more public awareness promotions, indicating that careful consideration must be given to how those campaigns are designed. He observes that some rural communities do not have Internet or cell phone service, and in-person presentations are often the only real option for educating people in rural communities. It is important that careful consideration be given to developing messages that reach the desired audiences through public awareness campaigns. Gabriel Simard points out that the information is well received in rural communities where he has spoken.

GABRIEL SIMARD: I've found the work that I did was very good because you can share stories. Some things you just can't get from a piece of paper. You need someone telling you, explaining stories. This is what it could look like.

I think what's beneficial in my case is I come from a First Nation community myself, which is Hollow Water, and I use the explanation that when I was 18 years old, I moved to Winnipeg.

And when I look back on things that were in 1996, '97, I was a vulnerable person because I wanted to make friends. The city was new to me. I didn't know any people. I'm a small community person. You know, you're a little more trusting. You know, you meet someone you think, "Okay, this person is genuine," when it could be a trap, that they're trying to make a friend.

And so when I explain it in that sense. I think it really helped communities. So, I find that part of it was very important. And just being from the community, you know, I would tell them, "You know, I grew up on a First Nation community. I spent my first 18 years there."

There the people—my audiences, especially in the First Nations communities, remote and non-remote First Nations communities—were able to understand, "Okay, he knows what he's talking about. He knows what we've lived through, how we've grown up, and then we have to move to another community"—especially for the communities that don't have high schools. A lot of their kids, after Grade 8 have to move to Brandon, Dauphin, Winnipeg.

Mr. Simard notes that the lack of Internet and cell phone service in some rural communities should be a critical government consideration in providing those technologies in local communities as well as investing in adequate resources that inform public awareness.

Rebecca Cook the coordinator of the Manitoba Child Exploitation Program. She also expanded on this discussion, stressing the importance of having input from survivors, as some campaigns can trigger and retraumatize them. In the following selection from her interview, Cook provides examples of ongoing campaigns, such as those designed to raise awareness about sex tourism and the increased sex industry activity around major sporting events. She also described the politics around some of these issues, including concerns about showing disturbing aspects of society, such as the fact that the sex industry exists to service tourists.

REBECCA COOK: We have a public awareness campaigns partnership with the Canadian Center for Child Protection, "Stop Sex with Kids"—very prominent, historically prominent campaign. The word "sex" in it, you know, was groundbreaking.

Even to this day we formed a Manitoba sporting event safety working group to address the potential for child sex tourism trafficking during the Grey Cup. We had approached certain airlines where you would go get your luggage, and asked them to put up a sign. At the beginning they were right for it, at the end the word "sex"—"Buying sex

is not a sport”—was just so—. Like they wouldn't entertain it. They wanted to have this picture that when people were getting off the plane visiting Winnipeg that it was a family community environment. So, there's still some businesses who lack that perception.

Our strategy itself is unique. It's got certain principles which makes us unique by having the voices of survivors or experiential folks right at the table right from the beginning with any initiative that gets developed right from the colour on walls in your program to public awareness campaigns, everything, and then also engaging youth in engaging the Indigenous community.

Ms. Cook stresses that experiential survivors need to be at the table consulting or participating in the design of public awareness programs to ensure that they are accurate and that they are not further traumatizing survivors.

In addition to Cook's description of some existing counter exploitation programs, Rosemarie Gjerek (Klinic) eloquently summed up the issue, stressing that greater awareness of the deeper elements of the problem of sex trafficking and sexual exploitation needs to be made more available to the public. She contends that the root causes of poverty and children's vulnerability to sex trafficking need to be addressed. Ms. Gjerek describes trafficking as an assault on a person's basic human dignity.

ROSEMARIE GJEREK: When we look at how do we raise little girls and how do we raise little boys, when we look at a society for the most part that actually condones a certain level of sexual assault and sexual exploitation. When we look at the impact of pornography, these are not benign things. These are the way people learn about sex or how I think what people are looking for or needing.

I think we have to start respecting women and respecting men and boys and girls and again take it on a global level. When we look at sexual violence and trafficking, these are crimes of war. These are commodities they are commerce so when we start to address this, there's a lot of money in this. There's a lot of money and that's the driving force here.

So why people become involved is often related to poverty, is related to feeling you don't have other choices, is related to being groomed, being exploited as a child and thinking this is what you need to do to survive. So some of it is survival, you know. There's so many reasons and for us the important thing is being able to recognize it when it is happening around us how do we intervene, not being people who purchase children, not being people who purchase women.

Ms. Gjerek forcefully describes trafficking and the selling of human beings as an act of war on humanity. These are only a few representative samples of the themes that arose around the role

of education as possibly the most salient idea raised through this research and simplest intervention strategy to reduce the trafficking of young people for sexual exploitation.

There is a strong consensus among most of my interviewees that more public awareness is required in combatting sex trafficking and exploitation. Claudia Ponce-Joly notes that the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and the Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls Inquiry that started in the fall of 2016 will raise public awareness around the sex industry.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: In my view, again I think money alone cannot solve this type of issue, because I think that the reason it exists, there is an aspect in human nature where people may harm each other and if that wasn't true there wouldn't be violence and abuse in our world. But I view things that if someone were able to provide all the money in the world, that wouldn't necessarily fix the situation in terms of the sex trade and human trafficking. I believe that what's needed is far deeper and more difficult to reach and by simply having the funding for it, I believe that for true and lasting change society has to change.

I think that issue has to become an issue that is important to every Canadian. The issue has to become mainstream and I believe the inquiry's helping do that. But I don't believe that people necessarily outside of police and child welfare and health practitioners, I don't believe people are comfortable with the topic. And there's a bit of denial that mainstream society is working through. The more educated and aware that mainstream society is the more that mainstream society becomes an ally, the more success there will be in combating the sex trade and human trafficking.

Ms. Ponce-Joly highlights that money alone cannot reduce exploitation; what is needed is a broader acknowledgement and understanding of the problem.

Christy Dzikowicz, Executive Director of the Canadian Center for Child Protection, highlighted that the average citizen prefers to not know about the sex industry and victimized women and children, perhaps because people do not want to acknowledge that this dark underbelly of society exists. However, they do have great empathy and there are great opportunities to engage citizens in combatting social injustice when these issues are forced into the light.

In the following story, Ms. Dzikowicz stresses that the average citizen has empathy for

victimized children, even if they prefer not to hear about it.

CHRISTY DZIKOWICZ: Once a child is in that scenario of being exploited and involved in that sort of high risk life, it needs to be a huge collective effort by all organizations by all healthy and well adults in our society to say we're not going to be ok with letting a kid fall between the cracks.

And I think separate from just the mandated organizations, or just the non-profit or charitable organizations or grassroots agencies—we need to rely on people, in society as well. We need to continue it to engage all healthy and well adults to say we do have a population of kids who require our attention and care.

So, we can speak to the value of public awareness and public engagement and I don't think we can't say enough about that. It is knowing that we have the vast majority of people actually really care about kids. The optimistic side that we always feel here is there are very few adults that sit on the fence going, I'm not sure whether a child is being exploited or not. People generally do, its helping people understand what role they play.

We're all very quick to say well why didn't the police rescue the child or why didn't this happen and why didn't this happen? And of course systems need to be accountable because of the mandated agencies, but I really have a hard time believing we've done a good enough job engaging the public to the point that when they see a 15-year old so and so is missing, even for them to say ok so that means on my drive home from work, I'm going to have my eyes peeled if I go to the mall, if I'm at Portage Place I'm going to keep my eyes open and take a really good look and if I see that kid I'm going to call the police.

I really don't think people do. At most people right now are looking at the picture going oh that's sad, that kid is missing again. I think that's on us, I think that's on all of us because I don't think we've done a really proactive enough of a job of telling the public these are kids who are vulnerable, these are kids that for a whole variety of reasons that are not their fault are more vulnerable than many of our children.

My research participants raised a fairly strong and consistent theme that there has been a great deal of denial and apathy among the general public with regards to the sexual exploitation of children. They also raise the idea that there is huge potential to improve public awareness, and that is beginning to be tapped into, and that service providers' awareness and acknowledgement of the trafficking and exploitation that goes on within the sex industry is also continuing to develop.

Some of my interviewees said no one seems to care, as long as it is not affecting their loved ones directly. Anupriya Sethi found in her research on trafficking that “Society doesn't care about missing and murdered Indigenous women” (Taylor, 2015). She notes, “It's only

recently that people have started talking about human trafficking taking place within Canada” (ibid.). Consistent with my research participants’ stories, Sethi highlights the indifference that many members of the public have toward the exploitation of children. She said, “There is a lot of ignorance and misunderstanding. It's poverty, it's cyclical, it's happening in the Indigenous community” (Taylor, 2015).

MLA Andrew Swan, formerly Manitoba’s Attorney General, describes how people often don’t care unless it’s happening in their own back yard.

ANDREW SWAN: Again, as we move towards marketing and getting the word out that buying sex is illegal—as well as “Here’s why it’s a good thing that buying sex is illegal, and here’s how buying sex hurts communities”—there’s still a lot more work to be done on that. There’s still a segment of people who just see it as the way it is.

People will tell you, “It’s the world’s oldest profession and nobody’s ever gotten rid of it. So why are you spending all this time and money?”

Some people will say, “This is just a cash grab. You’re just going after these poor guys.”

I think one of the difficulties has been that nobody really wants to talk about it. And, that was certainly my experience as Justice Minister that my colleagues across the country just looked the other way when this was out there.

I had to have some discussions within my own caucus to make sure people were comfortable with us sticking our neck out and saying that the federal government ought to move in the direction of these European countries with tremendous standards of living and high levels of equality, which I didn’t think was going to be a hard sell.

Mr. Swan highlights that many people are disinterested about the sexual exploitation of young people, and that people deliberately do not want to bring attention to the fact that the sex industry is operating in their neighbourhood because it could affect property values and business interests.

Wendy Sheirich, Manitoba’s Counter Exploitation Program Coordinator (ret.), agrees with Mr. Swan about the way society tends to hide and does not want to discuss the sex industry. She also noted that we, as a society and as practitioners, tend to focus almost entirely on the survivors, not paying attention to the perpetrators, the pimps, and the purchasers of sex.

WENDY SHEIRICH: What I see happening across the board is a culture of silence in which we tend to not talk about who is purchasing sex or exploiting. We just focus on the

survivors. I think the whole area of demand is glossed over. We need to talk about that.

The intake forms for most of these programs do not ask a question about who was purchasing sex. We have access to hundreds of people who have been in the sex trade and no one asks them who is buying the sex. In the last few years we've started tracking them more, through the forms we fill out.

Well, I'd like to say in terms of some ideas about dealing with demand, so what I think is happening right now across the board, that I see happening with our stakeholders and just with everybody in general like the mass public, is that there is a conspiracy of silence. I'd say it is a culture of silence, in that we tend to just sort of not talk about those that are purchasing sex or participating in the sex industry or sexually exploiting or trafficking or whatever. We just sort of focus on the survivors.

So, I think then that the whole area of demand is just sort of glossed over, and we have no mechanism to do anything. And I think purely just by talking about it and asking other people to talk about it—

So, for example, with all of the services we now have in place for experiential people, when they're being offered to go into the TERF program, or into the Little Sisters program, or Hands of Mother Earth, or whatever, look at the intake form.

How many questions are asked about who exploited them, where it took place, what are their thoughts about all of these people? Most of the time you will find that none of those questions are asked. Now why would that be?

I mean there's really—next to those that are the actual purchasers of sexual services themselves, the next group of people that are going to know about them are the providers of sexual services.

We have instant access to those people. They are with us. They are among us. On my Facebook page, I probably have 50 of them. In the TERF program, there's 100 of them a year. In Little Sisters, we've got hundreds. We don't ask them, "Who bought sex from you?" They could tell us all kinds of information. We don't ask them. That's just one little thing.

This perspective by Ms. Sheirich reveals that society turns a blind eye to the issue. There are "john schools," and john charges that go to court, and a great deal of advocacy and programming that occurs around sex trafficking and exploitation; however, most people are not aware of the extent of the sexual exploitation of children in Canadian society. Ms. Sheirich points out that there is a great deal more that could be done to root out offenders. For example, she points out that the intake processes for most treatment programs do not ask survivors who is trafficking them.

Daphne Penrose, Acting Executive Director of Winnipeg Child and Family Services, agrees with Ms. Sheirich about the lack of acknowledgement and provided an explicit

description of the public denial that generally exists about the sex industry. She also highlights how society tends to turn a blind eye to the offenders, focusing instead on the victims.

DAPHNE PENROSE: The general population doesn't want to know that their neighbour might be accessing child porn or that their other neighbour might be buying sex from kids on the Internet or that their other neighbour is actually having sex with his niece or his daughter. The general public doesn't want to know that.

And this subject is so incredibly tough to get people to become motivated because it's so much easier to just make like it doesn't happen. It's dirty. It's the mole on everybody's back that they would rather just not look at or see, right? They don't want to acknowledge or have to take ownership over the fact that men in our community, men in our city, men in our area are looking at kids and wanting to have sex with them and buying them. And that's a tough thing for the average citizen to acknowledge.

And if folks knew the rate at which it was happening, they'd be astounded.

Acknowledgement, according to Ms. Penrose and Ms. Sheirich, as well as others I interviewed for this research, seems to be key in making constructive change to address the sex industry.

Many people do not even acknowledge that a problem exists, unless a friend or loved one has been trafficked. For example, WPS Inspector Kelly Dennison worked for many years in counter exploitation and currently oversees that unit; he talked to me about how things have improved but still have a long way to go.

KELLY DENNISON: Well, I think we're getting there. We're on the road to an acknowledgment of what it really is. And I've only seen that in the last couple years.

The public has actually started to acknowledge that people involved in the sex trade are actually being exploited. To me that's the first step. We have to acknowledge what it really is. And it's exploitation.

From that, once we acknowledge and everybody understands what it is that's actually occurring, then an emphasis has to be placed on the importance of dealing with the individuals that are involved in the sex trade and being exploited.

And that may come in the form of funding. I think there's a number of social agencies out there that have a great mandate and no money, that have a great working relationship and no resources.

An important goal of this research is to affect the public discourse, as opportunities flow from first breaking the culture of silence and acknowledging that there is a problem.

7.5 I was working with exploited kids and didn't know it

My participants pointed out that more training is required for people who are in a position to make a difference. For example, Daphne Penrose worked as a front line social worker for 20 years. She reports working with children in the past and never realized they were exploited. She didn't know back then to ask why girls who ran away from her group home came back with new clothes and jewelry.

DAPHNE PENROSE: My background and knowledge in work around the sex trade actually happened before I knew I was working in that area. So, I started doing front-line protection 20-odd years ago.

And I had many young girls that would go missing for periods of time. And I did not understand that the risk indicators I was seeing were related to sexual exploitation. So, for a very long time I was working with kids who were in the sex trade or being exploited and I didn't even know it. I didn't identify it as that.

It was only when I got to Street Reach that I started going, "Oh my, all these kids I worked with, I didn't even realize they were being exploited." I just saw them as missing and didn't ask or know about what was happening when they were out there.

You know, they were at their friend's place, found them at their Mom's place—never asking the question, Was Mom exploiting them? Was this friend exploiting them? What was that looking like? How are they eating for free? Nobody does that.

So, for me that was a huge moment in my shift around how many kids are being exploited that we don't know about. I think—, I know we are only tapping into a very small fraction of the kids that are actually being exploited.

Education is the number one issue that we have, educating people on the frequency the magnitude the impact, what it looks like.

I need to get staff educated more about sexual exploitation.

I need to start looking at how we specialize. How do we make sure that those kids are getting their needs addressed? How do we tap into Street Reach?

There's no way that you can have a caseload of 30 to 35 kids and families and have one exploited child with those needs, who is running every single day, who's using every single day, who is being tricked every single day. There's no way for a worker to respond effectively to that child's needs and still be able to respond to the other demands on their caseload.

Ms. Penrose's story highlights the need for more counter exploitation training for practitioners.

Several practitioners as well as survivors I interviewed stressed how important training is for service providers because it provides them with the tools they need to work on such a complex issue. The survivors described how foster parents, group home staff, social workers and

police could have intervened to assist them if they had only recognized what was going on and taken appropriate steps. For example, one participant, Lynn (WPS) who now works with survivors, described her experience in the following manner.

LYNN: Over the last few years, a lot of things have changed. And I think we've changed for the better.

Like us, specifically, we have the team that does a lot more of the liaising with the girls and that bridgework. And I think we need more of that for sure.

But the problem is that you're not going to find a lot of police officers that want to do that. That's not so much policing, but that's what we need in our service.

I think we definitely need more training. That's usually the case with everything. But sexual exploitation is such a broad yet specific subject that, you know, I've been here three years and I'm still learning things.

How to help them understanding the dynamics of the people who are involved in it? I think it comes down to very distinct training for dealing with the people involved in it you know.

Expanding on Lynn's description of the need for specific training on counter exploitation, another survivor, Grace, noted how resources and police and other service agency awareness have improved in the past decade. However, she also acknowledged that we still have a long way to go.

GRACE: Like education, I think, is totally key.

I was exploited. So, I ended up in the streets in say 2000. There wasn't a lot there for us. When I was being exploited, there was the women's clinic in Graham that I went to get checked for STDs often, but I was lucky. There was a van who came driving around and gave me Twinrix vaccinations, Hep C. That's pretty much all that was available.

I've seen a lot of change. Staff wouldn't know how to talk to you back then. Now, so many staff are calling it, "Oh where'd the money come from?" and "Where were you all night?"

That's huge. They are trained now to talk about it.

Several survivors emphasized, as did Lynn and Grace, that better counter exploitation training among service agency staff could have prevented their victimization.

For example, another survivor, Ashley, describes how other girls who were placed with her in a counter-exploitation treatment program groomed her for further exploitation. They taught her how to make more money in the sex industry.

ASHLEY: I think my parents tried. I think they didn't understand what was going on with me. I think to them it might have looked like teenage rebellion. But it was addiction and everything I just talked about.

But when my parents did find out, and one of the other girl's parents, we went to a program for youths who had been exploited. But I still don't remember anyone actually sitting down and discussing with me about exploitation.

At that point, I just knew I was at a school with other girls like me at the time who were working on the streets. And so I learned how to do things and make more money there, working in a massage parlour. So, going to that program wasn't helpful for me.

I ended up running away and going back to my predator and to the drugs. Like I could see that being a good program. Like I still know of it today, and I know it does help a lot of people. But for me at that point and that time it didn't help.

Ashley points out that training in counter exploitation and intervention in the human trafficking and the sex industry should make staff aware of the dangers of placing people with similar problems together in one space.

Another survivor, Julia, also describes how there were occasions when police and social workers could have intervened and grabbed her up and taken her away from a volatile milieu for her own protection. In some cases they placed her in care as a runaway and just did not have the tools to help her escape from her hell. Julia also works with exploited and high risk youth. This is how she expressed her own personal experience of being trafficked.

JULIA: I think that a lot of people probably knew what was going on. Again, just kind of seen me as a bad kid, or delinquent kid. And probably didn't really know what to do.

You know that happens now, right? Workers, they're like, "Oh, I don't know what to do with this kid," you know? "They keep running away. They keep doing this. They keep doing that."

But is there a point in time where people could have grabbed me up? Yeah, tons probably. I remember having contact with lots of social workers that just let me walk away.

And yeah, I walked right around the corner and, you know, the guy who was trafficking me was right there. He was the one pursuing me, telling me, you know, leave, leave, leave, leave, leave.

So, to everybody else, it would look like that's what was going on. Tons of times police officers pulled up to me or, you know, see me coming out of a strip club, you know. I was thirteen. Did I really look like I was 18? Probably not *[laughs]*.

Lots of times I was picked up in different parts of the country and flown back. But they were always right here to come get me. So the minute they'd stick me somewhere, you know, it wasn't hard to track me down, right? So were there times, yeah, are there times now that we probably miss the boat for kids? Yeah. It's hard to keep up.

Those guys who are abusing kids in that way, they're thinking about that all the time and that's all they're doing. So they have so much time to think about every which way they can to access kids and make kids vulnerable, and we don't.

Like, we don't have that much time. We're not given that many resources.

So even people that have lots of experience—, and you know, like I said, things change, you know. So, again, five years ago, we just had to go down one track, right. You know, 10 years ago, that was the only place going on, you know.

And now, there's a new website every single day, with new code words every single day. So, to keep up to that, it just takes a huge amount of human resources, right, that we're never, ever given, unfortunately.

It is disturbing to think that many youth could be saved, if only professionals they had contact with, as Julia points out, had recognized the signs of exploitation and had taken some action.

My participants described Sexually Exploited Youth training that is available as effective, yet they stressed that it should be provided more widely. Trevor Bagnalo (WPS Constable) describes how specialized training can help service providers by teaching them the signs of sexual exploitation to watch out for, as well as how to approach and intervene with exploited youth.

TREVOR BRAGNALO: When I was on the sexually exploited youth team [in Thompson Manitoba], we'd essentially meet I think it was once a month or twice a month.

There were police. And there was multiple, there was, like, different school liaisons. There was CFS. So, you had pretty much a room of 15 to 20 people that'd meet twice a month and find out issues.

Like, "Okay, what do you know? What do I know, as the police, what's going on?" And we took some sexually exploited youth training that was put on by CFS in Thompson. It was 6 days. And as a police officer I found that excellent.

Now, when I'm on the front-line I can identify girls who I think are being sexually exploited. I had all the training.

And then when I came on assignment to Stonewall there was an incident where we had a car parked in a parking lot in Little Mountain Park and it was dark and there was a male in the car with a young female. And he's like, "This is my friend. We've known forever."

Only you talk to the girl alone, "Oh no, I just met him the other day."

And the way she was dressed and the way she was acting, I asked her right out, "How long you been doing' tricks and trades for?"

And her total demeanour changed, and she's like, "Yeah I been doing it for a year, year and a half."

And it's like, "hmm, alright then." And I find that type of training allowed me to identify that issue whereas if I was never in that type of 6-day course I would never have

even known to ask those questions or identify that.

Mr. Bragnalo describes how the multi-sectoral case management groups in Thompson Manitoba worked well, from his perspective.

Jay Rogers is Deputy Minister of Manitoba's Department of Families. At the time of this interview he was Executive Director of Marymount. Mr. Rogers agrees with Bragnalo's position, underling that effective training exists but it must be provided more widely through service organizations and schools so that teachers, social workers and other service providers do not miss opportunities to recognize and intervene early with at risk youth.

JAY ROGERS: I think there's got to be a better way of just informing the public and informing service providers how everybody works, because we all have the same objective but we just seem to want to fight over philosophical reasons sometimes.

I think that within our organization we're trying to make sure all of our staff take the SEY [Sexually Exploited Youth] training. I think that's a good thing. I think a lot of organizations should do that.

I think that there also needs to be broader education around this issue in schools and healthcare system and other service providers. And it doesn't have to be intensive training. Welfare trainers or youth care practitioners should get basic awareness training, I think would be important.

Mr. Rogers emphasized the need for all frontline social workers to have specialized training in the area of sex trafficking and exploitation. He also mentioned that specialized counter exploitation training should be offered in the University of Manitoba's Faculty of Social Work.

Some agencies are making concerted efforts to do as Mr. Rogers recommends, providing counter exploitation training for frontline staff. For example, Karen Harper (AMC) describes how the AMC is trying to provide awareness and counter exploitation training in the Northern reserves and rural communities. Ms. Harper describes their program explaining their intention to expose the training to people from multiple sectors in the hopes they will take it back to their respective organizations.

KAREN HARPER: We look specific to our First Nations communities' strategies, approaches are only happening now in 2016.

This project that we're working on, as I said, partnering with the Province and bringing the awareness and education to our First Nations community and frontline support workers so that they have something concrete and tangible to develop a plan of protection for their women and girls.

I hope that the effect of this will move them forward to continue to work on that, whoever the participants will be at the workshops—to take that back and that's encouragement to them to take it back and get your different areas, CFS, community justice workers, your law-enforcement, a teacher education representative, your health people, your whole gambit.

And have everyone work together. That's how I see this moving forward.

Ms. Harper stresses that agency workers' awareness of sex trafficking and exploitation must be multidisciplinary for a multi-sectorial safety net to grow among the broad spectrum of service providers.

The last word on the need for more counter exploitation training goes to Jane Runner (ED TERF) because she has been in this struggle for more than 20 years. Ms. Runner highlights that it is easy for practitioners to miss the indicators of a child who is being exploited, and that specialized training should continue for people who might recognize the signs of trafficking and sexual exploitation and intervene appropriately.

JANE RUNNER: But it's just being able, you know, so if you're an educator, you're in a school and one of your kids all of a sudden behaviours change, there's a difference, they seem more shy or withdrawn or something, right? You know that's when people have got to step in and start exploring, you know? "Okay, what's going on for that kid?"

And that's where we miss the boat because schools are so busy. But that's where they see a lot of kids, right, or in daycares, you know drop-in centres, wherever. That's where you have the ability to maybe help stop it. So when it comes to preventing it, the more aware everybody is, right? In a community, that if they see something, you don't let it go, right?

So it's education and being able to understand and see it for what's probably going on, cause a lot of people miss it, right? If you don't know it, if you're not enmeshed in this and know kind of what's going on, people miss it. Or, if you're too busy and overwhelmed, like a lot of teachers in schools, they're busy and they've got maybe 10 kids acting out in their room, and the little quiet one's getting missed.

So, preventing it is just going to take a lot more work and resources to get in supporting families, educating people who work with kids to be able to identify it and know what the indicators are. And you've taken the SEY training. We talk a lot about the

indicators there and what people can look for.

Ms. Runner observes that schools are key to accessing and intervening with youth who are vulnerable to exploitation or already are being groomed for the sex industry or are exploited by pimps and sexual predators. Teachers and school staff have access to and are with the children for much of each day, so they should receive specialized counter exploitation training to be able to watch for signs of exploitation.

7.6 Key findings

The following eight salient and significant findings flow from the data around awareness and counter exploitation education and training for the general public and frontline service providers and those with access to children who have opportunities to intervene in and prevent sex trafficking and the exploitation of women and children.

First, greater awareness is required for all involved. More education on the dangers of sexual exploitation is required for younger children. Survivors, practitioners, political and community leaders I interviewed stressed that education and awareness about the dangers of looming predators and sexual exploitation must be stepped up for children in schools. My respondents stressed that the information must be provided more widely in the community. This recommendation connects with my other research participants' observations that (1) children are being trafficked at increasingly younger ages, and (2) people who have the most exposure to young people, parents and teachers need more training with regards to recognizing the signs of sex trafficking and exploitation and how to intervene. My respondents stress that education programs need to be developed and delivered universally for multiple age groups starting with younger children in elementary school and through middle and high school. Some of my

respondents suggested that educational programs currently offered by the Joy Smith Foundation and the Canadian Center for Child Protection should be expanded.

Second, consider the efficacy of public awareness campaigns. A strong theme identified by my interviewees was the need for more public awareness about the extent and dangers of sex trafficking and exploitation, through any and all means available. Some effective past marketing campaigns were mentioned, such as “Stop Sex With Kids.” My respondents stressed that information about survivor oriented trauma and addictions programs and resources that are available should be included more in this public messaging. My participants pointed out that often there is the lack of knowledge about the resources available and this results in sex industry survivors not being fully engaged with the services available to them.

The majority of my respondents strongly stressed the need for more public awareness campaigns. The efficacy of such programs is difficult to measure. It is possible that people feel that such campaigns are more effective than they really are. Ayers et al. talked about the difficulty of measuring the effectiveness of public awareness campaigns because “traditional evaluations are unfeasible” (Ayers, 2016, p. 1). They performed a groundbreaking evaluation of a national yearly anti-smoking campaign that has been run for many years, examining Internet activity. They analyzed news articles and activity in Google and Wikipedia searches, Twitter and Facebook postings and government funded information phone-in lines, monitoring this activity before during and after the yearly campaign. They found significant increases in cessation related activity. This of course only speaks to increased searches by the public but not to the end result of stopping smoking.

I wasn’t able to find a volume of research to indicate the direct effectiveness of public awareness campaigns on the specific issue of sex trafficking and exploitation. One problem with

such campaigns likely lies in their efforts to persuade very different groups of people. One has to ask, is the “Stop Sex With Kids” campaign attempting to dissuade the purchasers (the johns), or make sex industry survivors more aware and resistant, or are they targeting the public to be aware and report instances of sex trafficking? One might argue that campaigns targeting the general public are ‘preaching to the converted’ as the average citizen might not agree with sex trafficking but may feel that are not in a position to address it. At the same time one might guess that they do not affect the johns and trafficked persons.

Historically some campaigns in Canada have targeted large sporting events, where sexual exploitation is believed by many to increase substantially. Some researchers, however, have characterized this belief as an urban myth, arguing that prostitution may increase, but not human trafficking and exploitation (Ham, 2011). Ham (2011) states, “we are concerned that valuable resources and public momentum are being channeled towards a false link between sporting events and trafficking for prostitution, resources that are needed elsewhere” (p. 1).

Research on the efficacy of public awareness campaigns targeting other issues, such as raising awareness around health issues has proven such programs to be relatively effective. For example, medically it is conventional knowledge that the sooner one gets to the hospital after having a stroke, the better one’s prognosis is; so, campaigns have sought to raise awareness of recognition of stroke symptoms (Trobbiani et al., 2013). Trobbiani et al. (2013) studied the efficacy of stroke awareness campaigns in multiple countries, including Canada and found that generally awareness was greater after the media campaigns (p. 28). The relevance of raising awareness to the problem of sex trafficking is another question that is not answered. In other research on the effectiveness of media campaigns in raising traffic to suicide help lines, Jenner et al. (2010) found that “there is growing public health literature that suggests that mediated

campaigns can be an effective tool for raising audience awareness” (p. 394)

There is also a question of what the real goal of campaigns is and if they are accurate. For instance, Rebecca Cook and others who I interviewed stressed strongly that survivors should be involved in designing the content of public campaigns, to ensure accuracy of the information and to ensure they are not offensive to certain groups. De Sahlit et al. (2014) have researched the content of Non-Government Organization websites and have found that Federal government objectives are echoed in the websites of NGOs that are funded with federal money and are, therefore, influenced by them. The authors argue that alternative narratives and media strategies are required to more fully capture the true nature of the sex trafficking problem.

Czarnecki, Vichinsky, Ellis and Perl (2010) studied the efficacy of using mass media messages to deter smoking behaviour. They found that “use of mass media is an effective method for informing smokers about cessation services and that enrollment could be improved by modifying public messages to address barriers as well as expanding outreach to specific demographic groups” (p. 332). This finding has implications for mass media around the issue of sexual exploitation. The messages may be more effectively directed at specific groups; for example, the johns, or potential victims.

Other research has identified that public awareness campaigns in the modern day must focus in the social media to be effective (Allaguia & Breslowb, 2015; Valentini & Kruckeberg, 2012). French, Wellings and Weatherburn (2014) had less positive results in their study of the effectiveness of media campaigns aimed at reducing high risk sexual behavior among men. They stated that, “the limitations of mass media in imparting skills in effecting behaviour change should be recognized, and campaigns supplemented by additional components may be better-suited to achieving these goals” (p. 17). More research is needed specifically on the efficacy of

mass media campaigns aimed at deterring sex trafficking and exploitation behavior.

Third, survivors must be included strategizing and planning. My research participants underlined that survivors should be involved at all levels of strategizing, planning and programming. Rebecca Cook made an important point that experiential survivors need to be at the table consulting and participating in the design of public awareness programs to ensure they are accurate and also to ensure that they do not further traumatize survivors. She has found that even those small details such as colour schemes as well as the actual direct content in movies and posters depicting violence in the sex industry can inadvertently trigger and traumatize survivors. MLA Swan and MLA Mackintosh also emphasize that the business community must be more involved and engaged in counter exploitation strategies.

Fourth, service providers need training to work with sex industry survivors. Some survivors told gripping stories about how they could have been saved from being trafficked and exploited if someone in their care circle would have recognized the signs of sex trafficking and exploitation and known how to intervene to protect them. Some practitioners observed that they were working around sex trafficking victims for years and did not know what was happening because they did not recognize the signs. This is a critical point because an exploited youth often has exposure to a small circle of caregivers and if none of them has training in recognizing the signs of exploitation the child may slip through the cracks and opportunities to intervene and assist that young person could be lost. In other cases, the exploited young woman might not have a circle of caregivers at all, for instance if they are actively being trafficked. In this scenario, they also likely have sporadic contact with social workers, medical staff and the police and if those practitioners do not recognize the signs, they cannot act.

Some of my research participants advised that there is effective counter exploitation

training available for those who work with sexually exploited youth. However, my interviewees highlighted that the training should be made much more available and to many more service providers across multiple sectors including social work, policing, the medical field, education, government, and NGO sectors.

Fifth, the system needs more doctors and specialists. More counter exploitation training is needed for professional service providers, such as doctors, other medical personnel and psychologists as well as better accessibility for survivors to those services. Some practitioners described how they didn't know who to call or what resources are available to them even when they do recognize that a youth is being trafficked. This could be improved mainly through better communication, and some flexibility on the part of specialized addictions and trauma counselors and medical practitioners. This type of training should also extend to advocates such as housing and welfare officers so that they all understand the intersectional challenges that sex industry survivors face and that they need to address routine things like making appointments differently. This ties in with another research finding, namely that sex industry survivors often have unique challenges with routine tasks such as simply arriving for a set appointment with a service provider.

The creation of a better communication pipeline could raise awareness among service providers about what resources exist and are available to them. More flexibility in the system might make services available on the days of the week and times of day when they are most needed by survivors. For example, while current service agencies are open during banker's hours, from nine to five, more survivors on the streets would clearly access them if they were open later at night. Some of the survivors I interviewed also advised me that some good resources become less available to survivors because of the agencies' reduced hours of operation.

Some of these services that are effective should be expanded with increased funding from the government.

Sixth, johns need to be made aware of the harms they cause. My participants highlighted that men need to be made more aware of the physical and psychological damage that they cause to survivors when they purchase sex. They were unanimous on the general philosophy of prosecuting and deterring johns, pimps and traffickers, and viewing the sex sellers as victims in the industry. However, the respondents reported mixed views on how this should be accomplished. Some felt stiffer punishments are in order as a deterrent and others felt that placing a greater emphasis on educating johns is more effective. Limited research on the market drivers of the sex industry (the johns) has found that they generally are aware that they are causing some harm to the survivors by purchasing sex (see McIntyre, 2012). However, more research is required to determine what balance of punishment and education is most effective as a deterrent to johns and pimps.

Seventh, education must be delivered in a way that people can receive it. Care must be given to a sincere understanding of the target audience and how messages about protecting children against the dangers of sex trafficking can effectively be delivered to them. Some rural communities and reserves that are at greatest peril and are in need of a public awareness campaign, and education about sex trafficking and exploitation, have no Internet or cell phone service. Therefore, billboards in Winnipeg and social media based campaigns might miss much of the target audience. Here again, research is required on the efficacy of public awareness campaigns.

Eighth, people in contact with high risk youth need more training. Counter exploitation training should be available for parents, educators, and caregivers who might have exposure to

vulnerable youth. A substantial number of my participants stressed that children are groomed and trafficked right under the nose of caring parents and teachers who fail to recognize the signs that might indicate that a child is being groomed for sex trafficking or in fact is being trafficked and exploited. Jennifer Richardson (Street Reach) reported she has found that many parents are naïve about their children's involvement and exploitation in the sex industry. My participants emphasized an obligation for parents, other caregivers, teachers, and other school staff to be trained in counter exploitation. This training could include how to recognize the signs that a child is possibly being abused and exploited, how to intervene and what resources and service providers are available in the community that could be called on in cases where trafficking and exploitation are suspected. This training should be focused on caregivers of children of all ages because children of increasingly younger ages are being targeted for sexual exploitation by predators and pimps.

7.7 Conclusion

Education was perhaps the most significant theme that arose from the interviews. There is a need for all children to be educated, and it is a challenge and a responsibility that is shared by society at large. In particular, teachers, parents, social workers, police, and all who have contact and exposure to children need to be educated about the early signs of exploitation and how to prevent sex trafficking and exploitation and how to intervene effectively when it does happen. That message must effectively reach all corners of society, from the clients to the survivors, to the multi-disciplinary practitioners who work with victims and offenders in the sex industry.

A continually changing environment, for example the burgeoning Internet and social media platforms that exponentially increase connectivity among young people that can make them

vulnerable to predators trolling the Internet compounds it. The only way to truly meet these challenges is additional and improved training that reaches more practitioners and also evolves with ever changing demands. While much work has been done in this area, the consensus is that we as a society need to expand our investments and efforts in the area of education and training to raise people's awareness about sex trafficking and exploitation and to train those who are in a position to take action. This research hopefully will increase people's perspectives on how to effectively address this need.

Chapter 8 - The Laws

8.1 Introduction

Laws serve multiple purposes. They can provide a framework that law enforcement and supporting agencies can work from. They can encapsulate the intent and priority that society wishes, through the language, focus and weight they are given. The laws can affect the way resources are developed and deployed in various agencies. For example, the laws directly impact the way police, youth-care, and health organizations as well as governments prioritize their budgets and resources. In addition, the laws can provide a framework for the public discourse, which is critical to building momentum and harnessing collective impact work in collaborative approaches. For these reasons my participants were asked about their impressions of the effectiveness and impact of the laws on addressing sex trafficking and sexual exploitation.

The laws may not be reducing human trafficking. For example, Kaye, Winterdyk, and Quarterman (2014) wrote about the problems associated with the prosecution of human trafficking offences in Canada, due to the misunderstanding about how the laws can be used. Despite new legislation introduced in 2005, only a handful of cases have been prosecuted (Kaye, Winterdyk & Quarterman, 2014; Perrin, 2010). Kaye, Winterdyk and Quarterman (2014) attribute the limited use of anti-human trafficking legislation to vagueness in definitions within it. In the following, they describe the importance of developing approaches that include more than just enforcement; “While the criminal justice system remains an important aspect of any response model, the present research points to the need to move beyond a strict criminal justice framework when responding to the trafficking of human beings” (p. 36). They point to moving beyond criminal law, prosecutions and criminal courts, so that the entire community can be

engaged around the issue.

Broad systemic political goals could be addressed within a larger framework, such as Diamond and McDonald's (1996) multi-track diplomacy model. The model engages the following significant tracks that are needed in making change on major issues: government diplomacy, skilled citizens, private business, media, activists and other significant societal sectors (Diamond & McDonald, 1996; Byrne & Keashly, 2000). This chapter explores the respondents' perceptions about the impact of the laws on sex trafficking and exploitation, and the legal system.

One of the survivors I interviewed, Christie, summed up changes in the laws as basically not affecting anything. She summed up her perspective on this issue as follows.

CHRISTIE: Over the years, and historically, any laws that were put in place never really did much to change it, right? It always moved it around, as I recall.

I think we are doing better now, though. Like, historically it hasn't done much.

The new laws that Canada brought in place, they're not going to do anything. Trafficking hasn't done anything. Like all those laws haven't really done anything.

I think the best that we've done is use our Manitoba legislation to try and get at it. I think that has worked better than anything else I've seen.

I was trafficked in the 80s, or I was pimped, same thing, right?

So, yeah, sometimes people get too hung up on all that stuff.

Let's just focus in on somebody's there hurting somebody else. And let's just have laws that are simple, that help you to charge people who are hurting somebody else—whether young or old, whatever.

Christie highlights her doubts about whether the new laws will have any substantial effect on sex trafficking, in light of her own observations.

8.2 Global trafficking and the relevance of international laws

Perhaps the strongest statement on the relevance of international laws on sex trafficking and sexual exploitation in Manitoba is that they were rarely mentioned by any of my study participants, even after they were prompted with questions about the effect of laws on the sex industry. Anna Janzen's (WPS Constable) comments were representative of my participants

regarding their perception and experiences around trafficking as a global problem that also occurs in Manitoba.

ANNA JANZEN: Well, what I think about prostitution—we all know that that’s the oldest profession in the world—and prostitution from a policing, legal standpoint is a communication of a sex act for money or goods of some sort.

When I think of prostitution, I usually think of it as being an adult person doing this, and that there’s some sort of consent, and that it is illegal in the sense of the communication aspect. Sexual exploitation is to me the sexual abuse, and the exposure of sexuality, illegal sexuality to children and youth, sex acts, or a child performing a sex act on somebody whether they know it is a sex act or not, on an adult person or even a teenager or another child in exchange for food or money or gifts or just necessities of, like, shelter.

And human trafficking, I think, of more—even though I believe it’s a more global issue—when I think of human trafficking, I think of people being sold across international borders for labour or for sexual purposes, and it’s illegal.

Like the person selling them, there’s some sense of fear involved. But it’s not just—, I know that it’s not just globally and across international borders. I know human trafficking occurs here in our city and from city to city and even house to house in the city.

Ms. Janzen highlights that trafficking can occur within the city or it can even involve moving people from house-to-house within the same neighbourhood. This is an important point, as many social workers and police officers do not recognize trafficking when they see it.

Sex trafficking is indeed an international problem and some international legislations and mandates, such as the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons (United Nations, 2014; UNESCO, 2014) are intended to address the problem internationally. However, the challenge in enforcing these protocols and treaties seems jurisdictional and is restricted by local police officers’ knowledge and experience, and their ability to apply them on the ground. My research participants rarely mentioned these international laws, indicating that there is probably room for a lot more public awareness of, and practitioner training surrounding international laws and how they might be applied.

8.3 People's perceptions of Canadian laws

The study participants were asked to describe the effect of national laws on sex trafficking and the exploitation of young people. My study participants were overwhelmingly in favour of the general approach of not charging and prosecuting people selling sex; rather, they advocated for prosecuting the sex purchasers, namely the johns. In the following excerpt, Joy Smith talks about her lead role in changing Canadian laws.

JOY SMITH: Well, I made Canadian history by passing two laws.

Bill C-268—mandatory minimums for traffickers of children aged 18 and under—it's embedded in the Criminal Code now.

And police have to be trained that it's a tool for them. It's there—a lot of them don't know about it. Also, judges have to be trained. And crowns and litigators, attorneys have to be trained on that issue.

Also, the second bill was Bill C-310, which reaches the long arm of Canadian law into other countries when Canadian citizens or permanent residents of Canada go abroad and exploit or traffic persons. We can now, if we find them, bring them back to Canada to be tried in Canada.

So, those were two very important laws.

I wrote the original National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking. It was called "Connecting the Dots." And I presented that to the Government, and now they've formalized the National Action Plan, which "Connecting the Dots" was the blueprint for.

Ms. Smith discussed Canadian federal laws as they were enacted; however, there is work to be done on how those laws are enforced.

The biggest change, which was consistently raised by my participants as positive, is the shift in Canada over the past decade from treating people selling sex in the sex industry as criminals, to viewing them as victims of exploitation. Marie, a survivor, summed up that position succinctly in her interview in the following manner.

MARIE: A 14-year-old with an older man is still child abuse even if it's within the age of consent.

There should be stiffer punishment for perpetrators. And it should be, I think, once we know the kids are exploiting themselves, there should be a process of getting them out of the city and getting them into treatment—treatment that will heal them from the trauma of being sexually exploited because it's just like molestation.

It changes the way that you think. It changes the way that you see yourself in society.

It changes the way that you think that people see you. So, it's a whole breakdown of who you are on the inside. And that I think it takes a lot longer to recover from than the actual work. It's the damage that's done to your thoughts and your mind and your spirit.

So, for me I'd like to see them all go to a camp or have specialized programming for kids that have been sexually exploited. I think that it would be nice to have a global network of transition housing and a global network of service providers throughout the country because some of our ladies are transient and they are going from province to province, right? So, I think it would be helpful to know that if they leave Manitoba and, say, go to BC for some reason, they can let us know that they are alive and well. It might even lower the list of missing and murdered women. So, that would be my goal is to see a Canada-wide service that provides first-, second-, and third-stage housing.

Marie points out that regardless of what one calls it, it is wrong for an adult to have sex with a child and any laws that apply should be used to prosecute the person, not only anti-trafficking laws.

Gord Perrier (Deputy Chief of the WPS) expands on this point. He makes the assertion that trafficking laws might not always be the best legal tool for use against trafficking. He describes how many existing laws in the Criminal Code of Canada could be applied in human trafficking situations.

GORD PERRIER: I'm going to plug Joy Smith's human trafficking law that you know got examined by parliament and their groups and NGOs and Senate. That was really good because there's nuances within the laws that enable police to do things particular to the offence, like they took their ID, or they took their shoes, or they took their clothes.

So, it's those actions that are elements of the offence that are encapsulated in the law. And if that is done in a consistent basis then that's really what should occur when it comes to laws.

I think Canada has comprehensive laws to deal with all these things. Some of them may be imperfect. Prostitution's probably one of them.

But procuring and kidnapping, forcible confinement, sexual assault, sexual exploitation, and all the myriad of sexual offences that go along with that, I think, are comprehensive, and I don't think that there's any big gaping holes there.

Mr. Perrier makes an interesting point that maybe law enforcement should be more client centered and use the tools available to protect young women, rather than building cases around trafficking laws that do not always fit every scenario well. For example, as Mr. Perrier points out, perhaps kidnapping or sexual assault charges would be easier to prosecute in some cases.

Regardless of the laws, the attitude in policing has also shifted and the police across Canada now generally view sex industry survivors as victims rather than as perpetrators. Darryl Ramkissoon (WPS Sergeant) also concisely described the shift in police enforcement practices to target pimps and johns rather than the prostitutes.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: Before, we used to arrest girls and bring them to agencies and it was kind of hit and miss if they got resources.

Now we're working with these agencies trying to full circle help these girls. We now work more collaboratively than 10 years ago. Time will tell. Winnipeg is one of the few places left that still has street level prostitution. The only other ones are Edmonton, Saskatoon, Regina, but Winnipeg has the largest. Hopefully people like you doing studies like this will show if it is working.

Mr. Ramkissoon describes the basic shift in approach that has occurred amongst the police, yet he does point out that not all agencies are of the same mind, indicating the need for flexibility in the legislation so that police agencies in different jurisdictions can respond according to local challenges. Mr. Ramkissoon notes that we need laws that allow the police the intervention tools needed to protect vulnerable women.

In addition, Gene Bowers, a WPS Inspector with over 15 years of experience working around the sex industry, was a principal architect of the current WPS counter exploitation model. Mr. Bowers builds on Mr. Ramkissoon's point about the need for laws as a tool for police to use to help people in trouble. Mr. Bowers further described the old methods of arresting people to force them into programs as the best tools available at the time, yet he felt that they were not the best choice in preventing the sexual exploitation of young women. Mr. Bowers described how jailing survivors was historically used as a last resort that allowed the police to get them off the street, at least for a few days.

GENE BOWERS: There were over a 1,000 women we arrested in the last decade. And although arresting them, it did save some of their lives because they weren't on the street. They were able to get off the street. Being in jail is a bad place to stay, but a place of safety for them.

A lot of the girls that I ran into—and I hate the word they use “girls,”—but women involved in the sex trade, often they would be on the streets for two weeks without eating, sleeping, just all the basics that people take for granted.

And jail was one place maybe they could sort of get that needed break, food, nourishment, rest kind of thing. So, in that respect, I think it saves lives, but it really never got down to a lot of the issues that brought them there to begin with.

Mr. Bowers talked about how the old police interventions were adversarial and pushed the sex industry out from the city’s core into different neighbourhoods, yet it didn’t solve the issue or make things safer for the survivors. So, he participated in changing the approach the police were taking to not arresting sexually exploited young women and instead encouraging them to seek help from the police rather than running away from them.

Andrew Swan (MLA) described the challenges in the debate and awareness around the laws with respect to prosecuting the johns and the pimps rather than the young survivors.

ANDREW SWAN: Well we got new criminal code provisions in Canada, which, for the first time in our country’s history, have made it illegal to buy sex, full stop.

And, again, this has been the evolution from sweeping it under the carpet, right? As long as you’re not communicating for the purposes of prostitution, you’re okay.

Now we’re on the outset, I think, to being able to change attitudes. And, what these new laws will do is open the door to more focus on the demand-side. And if you deal with the demand-side of changing johns’ behaviour, changing the way all of us perceive prostitution and sexual exploitation, that is the only long-term way that we’re ever actually going to get it to decrease.

Similarly, a large proportion of my participants stressed that there is a need to focus attention on deterrence against the purchasers of sex.

Emma, a senior prosecutor with MB Prosecutions, called for more enforcement to be enacted against pimps and johns. She also stressed that it also takes resources and effort to prosecute offenders.

EMMA: In the early days, it was common to charge the prostitutes. Over the years we recognized it is more beneficial to have the people supported.

In recent years there is recognition of that across society those strategies still need a significant injection of resources.

We still need more focus on prosecuting the perpetrators. Victims are often scripted,

oppressed, influenced by family members, so they are under pressure for basic survival. Emma and the other prosecutors and the police I interviewed expressed similar opinions that it is clearly preferable not to arrest young women for selling sex, recognizing that they are victims of exploitation and not criminals.

However, some in this justice group stressed that the power to arrest survivors is sometimes the only tool available to assist people to get them away from the pimps. For example, Lynn, a WPS constable, does not agree with the new laws. She expresses the position that many in law enforcement stress, that the laws are often the only tools that can effectively bring women into treatment, even if it is against their will.

LYNN: I think that it's hard because you have to walk the line of being a police officer and treating them as victims and sort of understanding what they're going through. But we also have to uphold the law. I think it's a difficult position for police to be in, but I mean we have to follow the laws that are currently laid out to us.

Derek Carlson described arresting survivors to get them into programs as the better of two evils. He explains how getting these young women into various treatment programs gets them away from pimps and gives them a chance to get out of the sex industry.

DEREK CARLSON: The laws prevent us from keeping the girls off the street...It's unfortunate we can't intervene with the law in place, to pull them back and use their discretion saying this is your time out, you're being arrested, and put them in remand so they can detox and maybe get some resources in there to help them. Or address the problems that were left for months, because we don't have the legal authority to yank them in and force them.

So, I think that's a crucial step that was taken away from us. So without that system in place we're just kind of there to make sure they're not being pimped, exploited, forced into the trade. And it's really hard because the year and a half I was out doing that I hadn't had any person step forward and say yeah you know I'm being human trafficked, I'm being exploited, pimped out.

Mr. Carlson notes the difficulty with investigating these crimes. Unlike other crimes, pimping has no clear victim to provide evidence of a crime because survivors rarely come forward, for a variety of reasons; so, the police must investigate without victim statement evidence.

Shannon McCorry (Project Devote) stressed how the changes in the laws are generally good, focusing on the purchasers rather than the victims of sex trafficking, yet she has mixed feelings about the inability of the police to arrest survivors.

SHANNON MCCORRY: I thought about this because I have mixed feelings on the laws that are changed around prostitution and around that sort of thing because, I think, that previous to the laws changing and that, we had a program through the Salvation Army—it was called the prostitution diversion program, which I’m sure you’re aware of. And one of the things that happened is when a woman was charged part of sometimes what she could do to have those charges stayed was to participate in this camp.

I think for some of these women, being forced to kind of go to this camp is—lots of people think is not necessarily fair—but it gave them three days to be off the street, even three days to be fed, three days where they could focus and kind of they knew they had to stay there so they could focus, they could be safe and a variety of different things.

And I think now that those laws have changed and there is nothing kind of cooking. There’s no hope to get them to attend now because there’s the way that the laws work. So, I’m going kind of torn about that because I think that I’m not actually sure what the right answer is.

Ms. McCorry discusses the usefulness of having intervention tools to force people with severe addictions problems into detox programs. She also argued that a more effective approach is to offer survivors better programming with a coordinated intervention strategy.

Some participants argue that the laws still need adjusting in order to more effectively prosecute the perpetrators rather than the survivors. For instance, Diane Redsky of *Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*, points out how the laws should be changed in favour of empowering young survivors. She underlines how the current laws require a woman to proclaim that she is afraid of her trafficker before the police can intervene on her behalf. This element of the offence is very difficult to prove if women are deliberately manipulated into believing that their trafficker/pimp loves them.

Ms. Redsky highlights that many police agencies and officers do not know how to or are not applying the new laws to protect young women being exploited by pimps. She also stresses that some changes are needed to enforce trafficking legislation that strictly holds the perpetrators

accountable. Ms. Redsky points out that the Toronto Police Service made 345 trafficking arrests while in other regions of the country including Manitoba there have been very few (see Table 3). She stresses that the police and prosecutors must work around the need for cooperative witness evidence, and the laws should be adjusted to rely less on the victims to provide witness testimony at criminal court trials for trafficking.

DIANE REDSKY: We have some issues with the human trafficking legislation that are really critical.

One, the biggest problems with the human trafficking legislation, besides the training of police on how to use it, is that it requires a woman to be in fear of her safety. And that is—so traffickers already know that—so they just went, “I won’t make her scared, I will manipulate her into thinking I love her instead.”

So these women are in love with their traffickers. So they’re not scared and they’re not coming forward and there’s no incentive for them to come to participate in a justice system that she gets nothing out of.

So we need to make some changes to the human trafficking legislation so that it’s easier for law enforcement to apply that law.

You know, a lot of “Be here. Be here and tell your story” over and over again. So we need to make some changes to the human trafficking legislation so that it’s easier for law enforcement to apply that law.

That is my understanding—the number one barrier for police officers is that “I don’t have a cooperative witness, so I’m like it’s going to go nowhere. No Crown is going to pick that up.”

And so, what we should be doing and what I’m actually working on with the counter-sexual exploitation unit here, are two things.

One is we’re bringing in Matthew Taylor who was one of the authors of the human trafficking legislation and the other woman is Nicole—Nicole something—and she is the author of the Bill C-36 legislation. And so those two have actually offered to come to Winnipeg to train law enforcement on applying the law and what they’re learning so far, you know, about the law.

And the other thing that we could do here for law enforcement is hook them up with other law enforcement agencies who are having success. Like Toronto’s at 345 arrests just in the last year. And human trafficking, they’re going for—, well they’re charging for all of it, but human trafficking and prostitution-related offences. But within one year they got like 345 arrests that are going through. Peel region has the most convictions of sex trafficking.

And so, some of it is a capacity issue that if we could create a better training system between law enforcement and crown attorneys as well, and judges, eventually then, you’re knowing how to apply it. And law enforcement has been, in those jurisdictions in Peel and Toronto, have been really good at navigating around that fear/safety. They’ve figured out some way to not have a cooperative witness. And so those are some best practices I think we can take a look at.

Ms. Redsky points out how the laws should be changed. For instance, she underscores how the current laws require a woman to report to the police that she is afraid of her trafficker. This element of the offence is very difficult to prove with unwilling witnesses who are often trying to protect their abusers.

Jennifer Richardson (Street Reach) suggests the laws could be adjusted to better facilitate resources from multiple sectors working together. For instance, she argues that child welfare agencies should be mandated with investigating sex trafficking and exploitation.

JENNIFER RICHARDSON: I would change the laws, for sure.

I would make child welfare be responsible to also investigate offenders—and in every province because in some provinces they don't have the ability within the legal framework right now to do that. So, I would change that.

I would give police more power to investigate in different ways, and not just, you know, be largely relying on the victim to come forward. Because lots of times everyone knows what's going on but they can't get that traumatized person to say what's going on. Or they might say, it but they won't say it to the police, right? They'll say it to their worker. So there again, you know, well "Okay, if you don't say it to the police, we can't, you know—. So, I would change the laws with respect to that.

I would make sure there was an all-encompassing strategy. I know people are against secure resources, and I'm not saying I support secure resources, I wish we didn't have a need for secure resources. But, to me, when kids are not choosing to be exploited and we have these offenders who are accessing them readily in the community, and every time they walk out the door of a non-secure facility's caregiving—inside they're being taken cared for—but the minute they walk out that door those offenders can access those kids immediately, and they do. And they're drawing them out of those resources lots of times. Then we have a problem, right.

Ms. Richardson also raised the point, as did Ms. Redsky, that police and prosecutions are dependent on victims coming forward as witnesses if they are to hold pimps accountable for their behaviour. This is a fundamental challenge in sex trafficking cases in which victims are often complicit and entrenched in the sex industry culture and are either afraid or are unwilling to talk to authorities. Ms. Richardson also describes the continuum of services that are needed for supporting sex trafficking prosecutions.

Most police participants pointed out that they support the new direction of the laws, not charging women engaged in selling sex, and going after the purchasers. However, some also expressed concerns about having no legal authority to force survivors into effective programs when it is required. Most of the social workers stressed the same concerns, yet they also expressed the view that the law should not be used as a tool to oppress sex trafficking victims by forcing them into programs. Some survivors did say that when the police arrested them that it saved them from dying from a drug overdose or being murdered by a pimp or a john. This is a tough challenge for law enforcement officials that will need further research and continued resolve by justice agencies.

Claudia Ponce-Joly contends that the laws and their enforcement are a critical piece of the justice system, yet they do not operate in isolation from the constellation of other intervention systems including social work, health care, and Indigenous healing circles. For example, Ms. Ponce-Joly highlights the need for multi-sectoral partnerships that must come together in a coordinated plan to protect these women on the streets.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: I believe the laws and law enforcement do have one of the greatest roles in this. But some would say is a battle against sexual exploiters and traffickers and child abusers. Law enforcement can, well, first of all, child welfare community organizations need the partnership of law enforcement and vice versa. Now, law enforcement will provide deterrence and the courts will provide prosecution. However, I don't believe that services to victims alone will solve the issue.

There has to be a deterrence factor in our society. People do need to know that if you abuse a child through sexual exploitation that the police will be involved and will follow the laws and there may be a cause and effect that involves charges or investigation or a court proceeding. I believe that this is improving much, especially if everyone becomes more and more educated on how to deal with this issue and how to work with people involved in the sex trade.

Ms. Ponce-Joly raises a theme that strings together throughout this thesis, namely that the police and prosecutors play an important role, as do social workers and community based organizations in ensuring the safety of these young women, and that partnerships between all of these elements

are key in a viable anti-trafficking strategy.

Saturation was reached in my research, as all of my participants agreed with the new directions that Canadian Criminal law has taken, focusing more on prosecuting organized criminals and the purchasers of the sex industry as a deterrent. However, some question the actual deterrent effect and whether it is more effective to punish johns more harshly, or to educate them better on the impacts of their activities on the women who are providing sex. The value and impact of humiliating offenders through media exposure and forced attendance at diversion programs is also an area for potential further research.

8.4 Attack the market

My participants were overwhelmingly in favour of the general approach of not charging and prosecuting people selling sex, and instead focusing their attention on prosecuting the purchasers and the traffickers. A majority focused more on how the laws are enforced and how police resources are used to tackle the sex industry. The biggest change that was consistently highlighted by the respondents as positive is the shift in Canada over the past decade from treating people selling sex as criminals to actually treating them as victims. Darryl Ramkissoon (WPS Sergeant) describes the shift in police practices in the following manner.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: Strategy back in the 90s was to arrest both prostitutes and johns, with a goal of getting the girls into programs. It was the same girls all the time. It takes many attempts to get them into programs and for them to get out of the sex trade. Now, we don't arrest, just trying to get them into programs.

Yes, 90 percent now agree to our approach. When we changed the strategy—not arresting them—some agencies required a court order to get girls into programming. Now it is much better. Before, we used to arrest girls and bring them to agencies, and it was kind of hit and miss if they got resources.

Now we're working with these agencies trying to full circle help these girls. We now work more collaboratively than 10 years ago. Time will tell. Winnipeg is one of the few places left that still has street-level prostitution. The only other ones are Edmonton, Saskatoon, Regina, but Winnipeg has the largest. Hopefully people like you doing studies

like this will show if it is working.

Sergeant Ramkissoon highlights, as did several of my study participants, the need for flexibility in the legislation so that police agencies in different jurisdictions can respond according to unique local challenges. For example, Mr. Ramkissoon stresses that the new laws prosecuting sex purchasers are a step in the right direction. However, he also argued that we need new intervention tools to use for the protection of survivors, and many participants, such as Derek Carlson (WPS) also stresses the need for harsher penalties and deterrence of the sex purchasers.

Derek Carlson notes that the courts should impose stronger penalties on johns and that there is a real need to do much more in the area of prevention.

DEREK CARLSON: If we could really set an example with sentencing, I think that could change a lot of future problems. The sexual abuse of kids—, if we as a society, say that's unacceptable for family to be raping their daughters and getting them to be mentally unstable, getting them into drugs, getting them into the sex trade, if we kind of just threw a book at them, as society, I'm sure that could prevent that fall back.

So change the laws, that's probably the biggest one and then throw the book at anyone involved and that kind of sentencing.

I had 50 some charges on a male that's gone for child porn in the past. And we did six months on him. And there's like so many victims. It's, like, why was he even out in the first place to victimize all these girls?

So again, if the laws were changing for stricter sentencing that could've prevented the fall back.

The other thing we could talk about, too, if money was no object, if you get a girl, a victim of sexual assault early on, you make sure she has full medical help.

Mr. Carlson also makes a recommendation to provide more resources for victims of sexual assault, to help prevent them from falling back into the sex industry (if they were in it).

Rosemarie Gjerek also talks about the need for the police to use pre-existing charges, such as sexual assault and forcible confinement that have been in Canada's Criminal Code for a long time for prosecution of offenders. She points out that there have been very few prosecutions for the offence of trafficking juveniles.

ROSEMARIE GJEREK: It's not as simple as just, "Give us this information and we'll

catch them.”

We know how, even from the legal perspective, the onus of responsibility is on proving trafficking.

I was at a conference in Ontario and listening to some research pros present on trafficking. And their thesis is that we are putting too much attention on trafficking because—they were looking at the evidence and the evidence that was being presented—if they looked at court cases the number cases brought to trial and actual number of convictions is very, very low, which I thought was insane.

It’s like saying we know sexual assaults happen, we know the number of assaults that actually get reported, the ones that get to court, to trial. The ones that get to court and result in a conviction are a very small proportion. So then do we say that sexual assault doesn’t happen?

Ms. Gjerek notes that just because there are low conviction rates does not mean that the trafficking offences are not occurring in real time.

Most police participants in this study indicated that they believe in the new legal direction, not charging women engaged in selling sex, and going after the purchaser. However, most police officers I interviewed reported major reservations about losing the ability to apprehend and bring sex industry survivors to safety, even against their will when they are in the grips of social influences and drug addictions that impair their ability to care for themselves. They expressed concerns that they lost the legal authority to force survivors into effective health, detox and counseling programs. Some social workers stressed the same concerns, yet they expressed the point that the law should not be used as a tool to further oppress sex trafficking victims by forcing them into these programs. Some survivors did indicate that they were saved from death when the police took them off of the streets.

Most contributors agreed with the changes in the Criminal Code that is prosecuting pimps and johns as a deterrent to close down the exploitation of young people by these predators. However, some questioned the actual deterrent effect of targeting the predators and punishing them more harshly. Some feel that rather than harsher penalties or public shaming, it is far more effective to educate them appropriately regarding the impacts of their activities on the women

who are providing sex. Perhaps the most effective approach would be, as Rosemarie Gjerek of Klinic points out, to teach young boys in their formative years about how to respect women.

8.5 Helping people who don't want help

There is general agreement among most of my participants and within law enforcement agencies in general that the police should focus on investigating and prosecuting the johns, and support victimized people to escape the oppression of the sex industry. There are some differences in opinion about how this should be achieved. More generally there are also varied opinions on where police resources should be targeted and if it is police role to be doing anything other than law enforcement and criminal investigations. Others view the police as having a broader public safety mandate that extends far beyond just law enforcement. There are differing opinions among police officers, even among those who specialize in counter exploitation about the most effective approach to address sex trafficking and exploitation of young people.

Some in law enforcement argue that the police need the power to arrest sex sellers in order to provide needed supports and resources through the justice system—to assist them to exit the sex industry. A detective from the Peel Regional Police Service (PRPS) boasted (personal communication in a meeting with the Public Safety and Justice Ministers in March 2014) that the PRPS hasn't charged a sex seller in seven years. Other police officers across the country say that they need laws that empower them to arrest survivors in order to force them into "prostitution" diversion programs. This has been done in multiple regions across Canada, including Winnipeg for about the past 10 years. Survivors are charged with offences and then the charges are dropped once they participate in survivor oriented diversion programs.

Others stress that the laws should not be used to coerce women into help that they do not

want. For example, Senator Vernon White suggested (personal communication, March 2014) that if the police are saying that they need to be able to arrest sex sellers to help them, then perhaps provincial legislation should be designed to allow police to get survivors the assistance they need, by force if necessary, without adding criminal records to the young people to exacerbate their problems. Perhaps people being trafficked and exploited in the sex industry could be apprehended for their own safety, much like the situation where people with mental health issues are apprehended under the provincial *Mental Health Act* (2016), they could be forced into getting assistance without burdening them with criminal records.

Ashley, a survivor of sex trafficking stressed that the police need to do more outreach to build trust with sex industry survivors so that they feel confident that they aren't going to be arrested or acquire other troubles as a result of approaching the police for help.

ASHLEY: I think the police have come a long way in terms of viewing girls as victims.

I think the law that was passed criminalizing the buyers of sex is a good one if the police are enforcing it. Like, the buyers need to be criminalized, not the girls.

And the police need to do more outreach so that you could feel safe to come forward because maybe [the girls] don't know that they're not going to get in trouble, like they're going to be offered services.

They should be teaching about sex trafficking in schools, like have the Joy Smith Foundation School Program in all the schools.

If money was no object, the best thing that could be done is to have more voluntary long-term rehabilitation centres for women and girls who have been exploited, where they can learn life skills, boundaries, healthier relationships, and learn how to believe in themselves again.

Ashley and several of my study participants pointed out that survivors often do not reach out to the police for help, out of fear they will get in trouble.

Andrea Scott (WPS Constable) suggested that regardless of the laws, the police must refocus their efforts on supporting victims of sex trafficking any way that they can.

ANDREA SCOTT: I think the biggest change is—and I don't know a ton about it—but just the ability now to not arrest the females because we're re-victimizing them, and I agree with that to a certain extent.

But I also think if we had the opportunity to still arrest them, we remove them from the situation and get them somewhere safe, even if it is in jail, where they can sober up, get off the drugs and clean up, and have an environment that's safe that potentially they would speak to us. So, I think that it hasn't helped us as police officers that law.

But I mean we have to deal with that law so we have to put more focus on the johns, which I think that's kind of one of the biggest effects I've seen in the last year.

I don't think that we could get that back now that that's a law. But I think that we need to work with these women however we can get them away from the situation. We can't put them in jail anymore, but certainly having more proactive approaches to getting them out of the situation and working with them, whether it's through rehab or however we can.

Ms. Scott said that more proactive interactive approaches are required to help survivors especially as law revisions removed the police's ability to arrest and bring survivors to safety.

Wendy Sheirich and Daphne Penrose both underline the need for enhanced collaboration between all of the agencies including the police. She says the police mindset has changed dramatically in recent years.

WENDY SHEIRICH: Police are major players. Back in the early 90s we did not have many partners—so many complaints against the police and RCMP, although some were more sensitive.

Now there has been a huge change, more collaboration and mutual understanding now. The whole mindset has changed dramatically.

The police are doing a great job now, working collaboratively, and they are adopting the Bedford decision, understanding women in the sex trade are victims.

I think the police are doing a great job now and just need to continue doing what we're doing and working in a collaborative kind of way.

The money issue is a barrier because the demand for services for experiential people exceeds the funding that is out there—although I think collaboration and make better use of resources that exist.

Most people I am involved with are not looking at the demand side. We need to look at that more.

Ms. Sheirich likes the new police approach and said that it should continue with more collaboration.

Daphne Penrose supports Ms. Sheirich's position that the police are major players and that they should be included in coordinating an integrative sex trafficking intervention system.

DAPHNE PENROSE: I think the police should be participating in the coordination of

services at every level.

And I think that the laws that are present need to be enforced for offenders and people who purchase sex from children. The police have a big job to do—just like CFS and just like our NGOs have a big job to do—to sit back and listen to figure out how to build our responses and to continuously improve our responses because whatever it is you develop in the front-end to be coordinated, it's only going to work if there's a desire to continuously improve the resources that you provide. And that as you sit back and you listen, you listen to what can be helpful, you listen to how you could do better, and when you think you've got the answer it's time to get out of the business.

Ms. Penrose stressed that the police, social work, health care, educational institutions and NGOs need to be better coordinated in their efforts to get young women off of the streets and hold perpetrators accountable. And at the same time, they also need to listen more to the survivors' stories to understand how to best assist them.

Lynn (WPS Constable) described how the police now focus on bridge building by listening to multiple community voices to establish relationships with sex trafficking survivors.

LYNN: I don't agree with the new laws. I think that they are difficult because sometimes the only way to help somebody, I mean to keep them safe, even for a night, is to arrest them.

I talked to girls before that have said, "I just got tired of being arrested so that's what caused me to leave the sex trade," because they want to move on with their life but they keeping getting breached and stuff like that.

I think that it's hard because you have to walk the line of being a police officer and treating them as victims and sort of understanding what they're going through. But we also have to uphold the law. I think it's a difficult position for police to be in, but I mean we have to follow the laws that are currently laid out to us.

Over the last few years a lot of things have changed and I think we've changed for the better. Like us specifically, we have the team that does a lot more of the like liaising with the girls and sort of that bridgework. And I think we need more of that for sure.

But the problem is that you're not going to find a lot of police officers that want to do that. That's not so much policing but that's what we need in our service.

Lynn spoke about the fact that the WPS now has a counter exploitation team and that it is more effective for liaising and bridge building with the community.

Liz Kaulk (RCMP EPPS) also voiced her opinion about how the RCMP counter exploitation team that she was a part of (the EPPS) is focused on building trust. She and other

police officers I interviewed discussed the importance of resource deployment and how these issues require specialty units. Ms. Kaulk stressed the need for specialized officers focused on trust building in the community.

LIZ KAULK: No matter what police agency you're working for, you are challenged by the lack of resources in different areas or the lack of trust. And we work together as much as we can, but you know policy is changing all across the country in different places at different times.

So different provinces are doing different things than we are. And police are so short on manpower, and they have huge workloads already, so this needs almost a focus. It needs to be like the teams that are being built now, I guess, that were never there before.

I would love to see, for lack of a better word, not "crisis teams" but "trafficking teams" or something where it could be integrated teams—with different police forces with representation, and when something happens, that we could go there and actually deal from beginning to end with that situation, even the victim management part is from beginning to end because it just seems to pass through so many hands and it's difficult then to figure it out, what have we missed and what can we do better.

Ms. Kaulk's point about having specialized teams is significant in the policing context, as she stressed how under-resourced they are generally in policing and how difficult but necessary it is to dedicate resources to addressing one specific issue, such as the sex industry.

Rosemarie Gjerek echoed Lynn and Liz Kaulk on the importance of having specialized teams. She outlined her impressions of the work the police do around the sexually exploited women her staff works with.

ROSEMARIE GJEREK: I have to say that I have met some incredible people who work in the exploitation unit. And the work that they are doing is incredible.

And certainly through the partnership with family services and the child welfare system and the reaching out—

I think, first of all, understanding the impact of the work on us, the service providers, but also, I think, what I've seen is even the laws changing so that the act of prostitution is now decriminalized, so that you're not going after the individual but rather the buyer. Even that has been such a long eventful change because now you can be that resource, you can be that support, you can offer information, "Here's a card. Here's a number you can call."

I think that's gone a long way to build some of those bridges and, I think—and I'm not saying completely across the board—but certainly knowing that even the police are looking out for you, like that's changed.

Right now in Manitoba and Winnipeg, we don't have a lot of front-line outreach, especially for adults. For children, I mean, that unit exists, and looking for kids that are

working on the street, that's there, but not for adult women who are again especially vulnerable.

So, I think that contact has been really important, having the RCMP, you know, lining up to give a DNA sample because knowing that might happen to you and wanting to have so that your family will know if your body is found.

Ms. Gjerek understands that the specialized teams tend to be more effective and sensitive to the issues because they are immersed in the local context. Her comments are consistent as well with

Ms. Irvin-Ross, who articulated the new police attitude with regards to the sex industry. Here is what Keri Irvin-Ross said on the issue.

KERI IRVIN-ROSS: I'm not an expert in the laws and the law enforcement. I keep trying to understand what the new laws mean, but it doesn't stick in my mind. So what I'll talk about are just practical—about how police have and continued to work with vulnerable populations, whether it's through partnerships that they have with not for profit organizations or even if it's for the people that officers that are in the patrol cars that stop and talk to the vulnerable people and know who the women and men are on the street, and predators knowing that there is a presence around them. I think that police are only one part of that solution as I said.

I think child welfare has a key role to play.

I think employment and education all of that—it's a collective response that we have to work on.

Well, I think it goes again to that ability to collaborate and have true partnerships. I think sometimes policies get in our way. And I don't know if I can tell exactly one. Well, I can tell you a housing policy that I am familiar with. If I am leaving a situation and I need to find a house, but I don't have a reference, I can't get access to a house. And we know that a safe place to live is one of those abilities or one of those keys of exiting the sex trade.

So I think that our challenge is working together and identifying what are some of those policies that are barriers and trying to adapt them in order to meet the needs of people.

I think the opportunities are just that, that we have the ability to change those policies and also a willingness for the most part of working with a non-profit with it is the police services, whether it is the Winnipeg police or RCMP—that there is a true interest.

And for all of these larger systems one of my challenges is the length of time it takes to get stuff done in the conversation. But I feel that, you know, Block by Block is an example of one of those ideas that we can identify barriers and challenges and try and work our way around it, and also help us enhance partnership.

So there's a lot of work to do and that can be very overwhelming whether you're working on the front line or you're the policymaker. That pressure of "We need to do something." But what is that something?" It can paralyze people sometimes. And I think that's another challenge. We have the innovation part, like, if we are doing something innovative, how do we better support that, and how do we better develop more champions?

Keri Irvin-Ross was Minister of Child and Family Services at the time of this interview, and Andrew Swan (MLA and former Attorney General) was well placed to comment further on the province's response to the sex industry and the new laws.

MLA Swan comments below on police resource deployment, trust building and support rather than the prosecution of survivors. He also describes the frustration that he has heard from police officers over losing their ability to apprehend survivors for their own safety.

ANDREW SWAN: My personal view is that the police have struggled this first year because the young women and men who are out there know that they are not committing a criminal act unless they are in one of the exclusions of being too close to a school or whatever it may be.

So I think the police are struggling with that a little bit because it has always been easier when you're doing a sweep to wind up getting the people off the street. They're much easier to find. They're much easier to catch. And, if you're under pressure to be seen to be doing something, that's a great way to get your numbers up, to be able to report to the community that you've been active. But it's actually isn't the most helpful way.

I believe the City of Winnipeg Police Service is on the right track. I know that there's some struggle right now to decide how to best deal with this.

One of the issues that we knew was going to be a challenge was the connection between what the police are doing and what the agencies are doing.

One of the concerns that's been expressed is that it's now harder to get someone who's being exploited to go to the Prostitution Diversion Program. It used to be held over their head like a sort of Damocles sword. "You're going to be charged unless you want to go into the program."

Salvation Army says, "Nope. They are still getting people coming."

I think the police are disappointed they don't kind of have that to hang over somebody's head. Somebody can just walk away. I think there's going to have to be ongoing work to make the police realize that it's not a failure on their part if they're not able to convince somebody, that somebody's will to change what they're doing isn't immediate, it may require several steps.

But that overall the idea of not criminalizing victims is the right thing to do.

Mr. Swan's comments provide a unique insight into the world of politics on multiple levels. He expresses his opinion that the police are on the right track. He feels that the police should continue to build trust with sex industry survivors and strive to support and assist them.

The WPS Counter Exploitation Unit statistics regarding their contacts with sex industry survivors, along with charges laid with respect to exploitation and trafficking, are illustrated in

Table 3. In 2015, three massage parlors were operating in Downtown Winnipeg, with a total of 41 employees identified as “massagists”, during a one-year period when the Counter Exploitation Unit conducted raids. Counter Exploitation Unit members report having about 765 interactions with sex industry workers between November 2013 and the time this research was conducted. Since 2013, they have identified 211 sex industry survivors operating in Winnipeg (see Table 3). These police contacts do not include the unmeasured number of Uniformed Patrol contacts in operation in the inner city and the North End. The numbers also do not include the high numbers of sex workers who are known to be operating now through social media and the Internet. These numbers are not known, and are a topic for future research. The various charges laid eventually tell a story or inform policy, once they are resolved in court (see Table 3).

Most participants I interviewed expressed that they are happy with the current police tactics in Manitoba. Most described their perceptions of the police as having changed their approaches dramatically over the past decade as the police are now working to support women on exiting the sex industry rather than prosecuting them. Although, it is important to point out that the police perspective on historic practices of arresting sex workers was intended to assist them. Some participants emphasized that the police need to work harder to collaborate with the other relevant sectors around protecting and supporting women in the sex industry.

8.6 Intelligence - we need to ask the right questions

The theme of police intelligence gathering came up several times during my research. My interviewees expressed the fact that the current practice of police counter exploitation detectives making regular contact with people selling sex is wise because eventually they may gain trust with young people that allows them to come forward with evidence that can be used against

traffickers, pimps, and johns. Others stressed that the police need to gather the right information, which they sometimes are not doing, and share it so that the right arm knows what the left arm is doing.

Rejeanne Caron (WPS Constable) affirms that the police are now focused largely on forming relationships and building trust with sex industry workers. In the following extract from Ms. Caron's interview, she stressed the need to build relationships with young prostitutes so that they will share intelligence that the police can potentially act upon.

REJEANNE CARON: I think, as I mentioned before, not to revictimize the victims. I think that's a critical piece of it.

And working with [victims] to gather intelligence, to understand who are the predators.

And then, from there, creating— whether its projects or initiatives—because those girls are a plethora of information. So, really, it's working with them closely, and engaging them in understanding what's out there. And go from there.

And then, of course, directing them as best to the right service agencies.

And us, as a service, dealing with a lot of the agencies. To work with each other— whether we identify somebody and pick up a phone and say, "I've got a girl that you may want to meet," depending on who the resources are, and work collectively with each other.

In addition, Anna Janzen (WPS Constable) agrees with Ms. Caron's point, also stressing that frontline general patrol police officers need more training in how to spot sex industry activities, how to react swiftly to protect young prostitutes, and the importance of gathering intelligence.

Ms. Janzen stresses the point that general patrol officers come across sex industry survivors regularly in the course of their duties and miss opportunities to gather and submit intelligence that could be useful to other investigators.

ANNA JANZEN: I would say intel, intel, intel. That's what the police should be doing.

It's so many times it's uniform officers—and I'm guilty of it myself—but we would come across somebody—because we're busy, the call queue is piling up—. If you see someone get into a car, if you don't have time to pull them over then, put an intel [(intelligence report)]. "I saw this suspect and sex trade worker get in this car at this time." And you may be on a call to a robbery, but just jot it down in the notebook. I just think the more intelligence the police can get gather on this, the better.

And, like I said, treating people with respect, goes miles.

I found that, like, those barriers, sometimes, between police and different social agencies—, just that police face a lot of scrutiny over the media when there's something wrong, but we're never thanked for all the times that we've brought missing people home, or if we've checked on the wellbeing of someone that we know was an exploited person.

It's just the bad stuff. And there are those negative barriers because we're so negatively scrutinized by the media, and sometimes by social agencies on misinformation. And it doesn't help solve anything. And it doesn't help fix anything. And it's a barrier. It causes conflict, right?

How can that be overcome? I don't know. Just better communication—but opportunities.

Ms. Janzen's point about treating people with respect connects with all of the interviews in this study. Every participant expressed in various ways that the key to helping survivors is being non-judgmental and treating them with dignity and respect. For example, Ms. Janzen and Ms. Caron both mentioned in different ways that it all comes down to trust building.

A senior prosecutor, Rose, stressed the point that criminal cases against purchasers for trafficking and purchasing sex are difficult and that the police need to work very hard to build trust with sex industry survivors so that witnesses will come forward with valuable information so that they can prosecute pimps and johns.

ROSE: I think policing in Manitoba has moved in a really important way, focusing on the people buying the services. I think that's the right move.

The penalties are there but there needs to be creative investigations.

We also need follow-up. I don't see many victims coming to the police and making police reports. Police need to be seeking them out, identifying them, and giving them the opportunity and then following up.

They are tough cases and the victims' vulnerability is what makes them tough. They come with a lot of baggage that we have to deal with in court.

We are getting better. But these cases need buy-in from numerous agencies, and that doesn't always happen because there's a feeling at the grassroots level, I think, that it is a waste of time. So my office has been really reaching out to victims at the grassroots level to build bridges with them. And I think it is working.

Another senior Manitoba prosecutor, Emma, built on Rose's point accentuating that often police miss opportunities to gather intelligence by not asking the right questions. Emma (MB Public Prosecutions) describes below how the police often have people in custody for other reasons and

fail to explore or ask them about sex trafficking, missing golden opportunities to prosecute perpetrators.

EMMA: I think we always need to keep our lines of communication open. We try to keep lines open with the police and other support agencies, but we can always do better.

We could enhance this by reaching out more. We are trying to do that with community prosecutors, but would like to see those efforts enhanced.

Police and the courts can only play a limited role. If we as a society put more resources into a multitude of avenues—including police, education, life skills, ensuring that people who continue to be exploited have a sense that there are other options.

The police, the organized crime, they don't even ask about the women. I've seen the interviews. When have informants, when we have people that are talking, it's like all they care about is drugs and guns. A lot of people have felt betrayed by the police so they don't come forward.

Emma stressed that the police must ask the right questions, gather the right evidence and share intelligence between agencies and across jurisdictions. Her comment about feeling betrayed goes to the need for the police to build trust with the victims of the sex industry. This can be challenging when survivors were arrested numerous times in the past and see the police as an enforcement bully, due to the historical practices of the police to arrest them, whether they want help or not.

For example, Emma stressed that on top of trust building the police need to focus their resources on the investigation of crimes related to sex trafficking. Emma said more emphasis should be placed on developing undercover investigations and also in gathering information on sex trafficking activity at every opportunity.

EMMA: Laws are important to maintain the expectations and standards of acceptable behaviour. Laws need to be enforced and support exploited persons.

Laws tend to reflect society's acceptance of the need for social change. We do see law enforcement as important. Police strategies have changed, offering exploited persons' support.

It would be helpful if there were more effort put into undercover operations.

There is often poor communication across jurisdictions, so it would be helpful if there was a Western alliance of officers that were working in this field that people could connect with would support officers working in this field.

In terms of law enforcement, we know that some exploitation is organized and occurs

in organized crime. When people are willing to share with the police about guns and drugs and organized crime and murders, we assume that they could also disclose about exploitation, but it doesn't occur.

It would be helpful if support agencies asked questions and gathered information to share with the police.

Joy Smith built on Emma's point about providing resources for investigations, pointing out that the police need to develop greater cross border intelligence gathering and sharing capacity through agencies such as INTERPOL. Ms. Smith talked about sharing information internationally, and how the police need to explore more intelligence gathering capacity to develop greater awareness across police agencies.

JOY SMITH: The question is Why aren't the police forces aware of what is going on? What has prevented them up until this time?

I was at a meeting the other day, and they were talking about—, there was a common thinking, "Oh, there's not much trafficking from the U.S."

They live in la-la land. There is a lot of trafficking, major trafficking is between the U.S. and Canada, Canada and the US, and the police don't know that.

So what component is missing?

I would say probably between the border patrols not asking the right questions, not seeing the red flags, because at the border, when the trafficker victims come across, they come across with their boyfriends. There can even be a man and a woman in the car saying, "Oh, we're going across to do shopping."

But that's how they got into Canada. That's how Mia got into Canada. And then they disappear. And there's no resources to find them. I mean, she was found seven years later.

So I think there needs to be some intelligence around—Why is this not happening at our borders and with our police forces? There's a disconnect there. And I think the disconnect, from what I can tell, as soon as you have someone in a unit they're transferred over to God knows where, to do something else. And you have that history of intellect and expertise, and it's just gone. And I think that's a downfall in the police force.

And then you have the stars who want to be everything to everybody and the egos as big as all the outdoors.

So I think looking at police officers, one has to be that for a police officer to become a police officer, I think, they have to be community-minded and demonstrate that.

And I think the ego has to go. You see it in the political field. And you see it in NGOs. And I think that absolutely has to go. It really does, to make a difference, from what I can tell.

And then you have the bitter people that try to sabotage everything that's going on.

So those are the elements, the exterior elements, outside influences on not knowing about human trafficking in Canada, in my opinion.

Ms. Smith speaks about the police developing expertise by being stationed in other jurisdictions

and countries in local anti-trafficking units, and that officers should be allowed to stay in positions longer for continued development of their skills and expertise in this complex area. Ms. Smith highlights an important point about the attitude of stakeholders, and that no one person is the ultimate expert in this complex area. Much teamwork and efficiency is lost from the system when people refuse to work in teams, collaborate, and learn from each other.

My research participants talked about the need for the police to be the eyes and ears of the anti-trafficking and exploitation system. The police can compile the right evidence for successful prosecutions, as well as gathering the right intelligence and sharing it more effectively. This requires the police to be vigilant and aware of opportunities, through specialized training, to build trust with potential ‘informants’ and to gather vital information for prosecuting organized crime networks and sharing it more effectively with other agencies. Some of my participants generally felt that the current police approach of relationship building and intelligence gathering is the right thing to do. They highlighted that there is much room for improvement in the information that the police gather and how it is shared and used.

8.7 Key findings

The following nine salient and significant findings emerged from this analysis of my interviewee’s perceptions and experiences with regards to anti-trafficking laws and enforcement around the sex industry.

First, survivors should not be criminalized. My research participants argued that survivors are victims, and not perpetrators. They said that they all view sex industry survivors as victims, rather than as perpetrators as they have been widely viewed and treated by the criminal justice system in the past. This finding is significant, in particular among police practitioners, as

it has called for a complete change in the philosophy and approach of policing in the Province. In Manitoba, new intervention approaches incorporate this new view, and the survivors and practitioners I interviewed said universally that they appreciate the new approaches in law enforcement.

The majority of my participants agree with the new changes to the laws, with some exceptions suggesting that adjustments need to be made. For example, a significant number of police officers still feel the need for laws that would allow them to arrest survivors in order to get them into addictions and counseling programs for their own good. However, those officers uniformly viewed the law purely as a means to help survivors, and not as an outlet to prosecute them.

My other participants expressed the point that arresting and forcing survivors into programming does more damage than good for several reasons. First, people are sometimes unable to gain full benefits of counseling under duress. If young survivors are charged criminally it can add to the already significant barriers that these intersectionally challenged young women face. For example, if someone has a criminal record it adds a barrier to finding employment or to crossing borders to go on vacation or for work or to attend college. Attending programs at specific times can also be difficult when one has child care issues and transportation challenges on top of the PTSD and severe psychological trauma and addictions issues that many of these young women struggle with daily.

Second, greater deterrence is needed. My respondents indicated that it is necessary to deter sex purchasers more. The majority of interviewees strongly emphasized the need for the justice system to focus on investigating and prosecuting the sex purchasers and traffickers, and not the sex sellers. My participants described how johns are not likely to attend john schools,

which are humiliating for them, unless they do so under duress. My participants, including Hennes Doltze, who runs the john school at the Salvation Army, strongly articulated the value of educating johns and making them aware of the psychological and physical damage that they cause to many sex industry survivors. Among my participants there were strong voices on either side of this debate, some arguing that humiliation and harsher penalties do more damage than good, and others arguing that harsher penalties are required as a deterrent for men who prey on young women. There are significant arguments on either side of this debate. Several of my participants described how there seems to be a willful blindness across society, including among practitioners who work within different components of the sex industry, over the john's role in the problem. Some of my participants observed that no one seems to want to gather intelligence and prosecute johns.

Third, global laws and proclamations often do not translate to the ground level. Some of my interviewees suggested that the police and local agencies in Manitoba do not draw upon international laws and global anti-trafficking programs to buttress their work and support survivors. Most of my research participants didn't bring up national tribunals or UN proclamations, let alone national programs when discussing the impact of the anti-trafficking laws on the sex industry. Local practitioners and survivors do not substantially draw upon these guiding global authorities and international laws to supplement and support local, national and global efforts to stop the violation of young people trafficked in the sex industry. This finding has significant implications for national programs that might be lost in the ether without a strategy to drive them into the hands of frontline practitioners in local contexts.

Fourth, people aren't aware of the degree of exploitation going on. My respondents pointed out that there is a complete lack of awareness about international trafficking in the city.

Several participants highlighted in their stories that even law enforcement are largely unaware of the extent of international and national trafficking of young people that is underway in Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada and globally. They suggested that increased awareness, training and education are required for practitioners from multiple sectors and disciplines that might recognize and intervene in cross-border trafficking. Multi-modal and multi-level training should be delivered on these issues for the judiciary, political leaders, prosecutors, social workers, and the police. These groups should all be represented at the training sessions in order to foster a multi-modal learning environment and multi-sector team building.

Fifth, existing laws could be used more effectively. My interviewees were of the opinion that provincial agencies could use existing laws that are easier to prosecute as well as having stiffer penalties in their arsenals. Several participants pointed out the low numbers of successful sex trafficking prosecutions, stressing that legal and political authorities must consider using existing laws such as kidnapping and rape, which are often more straight forward to gather evidence for prosecuting sex traffickers and pimps.

Sixth, police should focus on trust-building. My interviewees indicated that they supported the police approach to build trust and support sex industry survivors. My research participants universally expressed their appreciation and support for the current police approach of having police officers on the streets seeking to build relationships and trust with sex industry survivors in order to help them in any way that they can. This major paradigm shift in policing has opened up many possibilities. Some police leaders outlined the challenges of deploying scarce overall resources in this specific area, especially when one considers that the demands put on policing from other sectors, such as child welfare, are continually increasing. Placing more resources into counter exploitation necessarily requires re-deploying officers from other areas

that are also critical. However, there was universal support for having some police resources deployed in this way.

Seventh, practitioners need to be more aware and vigilant of the signs of trafficking. My respondents were adamant that front line practitioners including social workers and the police, should be more vigilant for the tell-tale signs of sex trafficking and ask more questions of the young women they meet daily on the streets. Several participants, in particular the prosecutors and politicians, stressed that investigating sex trafficking is still not a top priority for many police officers in their day-to-day work. They stressed that trafficking and gathering evidence of trafficking should be a higher priority for all police officers, and that more counter exploitation training is required in this area.

Police and social workers are the ones who are most likely to encounter perpetrators and sex industry survivors and, therefore, are in the best position to intervene and take action to stop victimization. My respondents stressed that police and social workers are also most likely to come in contact with survivors when they are at their most vulnerable and in crisis. Therefore, they should be trained and prepared to act appropriately when these windows of opportunity present themselves. Several of my respondents stressed further that investigators who are in contact with suspects of organized crime are in the best position to take advantage and gather vital intelligence. They need training to recognize and take advantage of these opportunities.

Eighth, we need to consider how to deliver survivors the supports they need. My interviewees had mixed opinions about forcing women into addictions and counseling programs. This is an area that demands an in-depth policy analysis and further research so that a solution may evolve beyond just having the police use force to assist young sex industry survivors when they are high on drugs and need assistance rather than prosecuting them. Police officers

specializing in counter exploitation, as well as survivors and other front line practitioners fully understand the oppressive aspects of the sex industry, and my research participants universally view the survivors as victims of disparity, oppression and violent predation. At the same time, some police officers stress that sometimes apprehension is the only tool available to assist them in helping survivors. Several survivors also articulated that the only reason that they are alive is because they were arrested and taken into custody by the police.

One unique suggestion came to my attention during my preliminary research on this topic. I visited Ottawa and met Senator Vern White, a Canadian Senator who was previously Chief of the Ottawa Police Service. He suggested that one possibility for addressing this problem could be the implementation of an Act that would allow police and social workers to force trafficking survivors into treatment, but with none of the repercussions that criminal charges have on these young women. This is currently done in Manitoba with the *Intoxicated Persons Detention Act* (2016), which gives police the authority to detain intoxicated persons temporarily for their own safety, so they do not freeze to death or get hit by a car. This is not a criminal charge arrest, but rather is a temporary detention that does not create a criminal record for people. Perhaps the law could give social workers and the police, as Senator Vern White pointed out, the authority to forcefully apprehend sex industry survivors for their own good, while not charging them criminally and, therefore, avoiding some of the negative effects of being arrested for a crime. The solution might involve finding a way to assist someone, for example when they are high on drugs and need assistance to dry out, by force if necessary, yet in a constructive and compassionate way that there is no prosecution.

In Manitoba, children (anyone under 18-years of age) who are found in dangerous places, such as working the street in the sex industry can be apprehended by social workers or police

officers under authority of the *Child and Family Services Act* (2016, section 52). This is done on a routine basis. For example, a police officer apprehending a child would then contact the on call social worker at the CFS triage center, the All Nations Coordinated Network (ANCOR) for direction on where to deliver the child. No such authority exists to apprehend adults, so in finding a woman in the sex industry on her 18th birthday, the police have no authority to do anything with her, unless she asks for assistance. Perhaps as Senator White mentioned, there is an opportunity for pioneering practices to be developed, giving police officers the authority to bring a suspected sex trafficking victim to a designated place for expert assessment of vulnerability, addictions, and counter exploitation counseling, as well as referral to appropriate programs.

At this juncture the need for greater availability and accessibility of resources for sex industry survivors is critical. A resource hub could potentially serve this function. For instance, a sex industry survivor might decide at that moment that she wants assistance to exit the sex industry. If the required addictions and trauma counseling is not available, a golden opportunity might be lost for a survivor to put her life on a different trajectory. This resource hub could also provide centralized resources, 24/7 to coordinate sex industry oriented resources locally, regionally, nationally and internationally. My respondents and previous research on trafficking have highlighted the need for greater coordination of resources (Dandurand, 2017).

Ninth, practitioners need the authority to do their work effectively. My respondents contended that the police and social workers' authority could be adjusted to empower them and enhance their roles when assisting sex industry survivors. One participant in particular made an unique suggestion that police and social workers both need expanded authorities that include adjustments to the laws specific to their duties supporting sex industry survivors. For example,

currently the CFS Act (2016, section 52) allows for a mandated social worker to enter a premise, by force if necessary, for the protection of a child. A social worker can call the police to assist in the protection of the minor. Perhaps, as some of my respondents suggest, such Acts could be adjusted to empower police officers with that authority as well, so they would not have to call and wait for a social worker to arrive in an emergency. Conversely, social workers do not have the investigative powers of the police, such as obtaining search warrants to gather evidence. Some of my respondents suggest that the creation of an interagency Counter-Trafficking Unit in Manitoba would improve the current system. Such a unit would bring together professionals from multiple disciplines and authorities for a multi-sectorial collaborative effort, drawing on the best resources, training and expertise from all of the disciplines. It would also help in overcoming communication barriers that my participants highlighted; simply by having people from different agencies working together so they build trust, and talk and work more freely together.

8.8 Conclusion

In 2014, MP Joy Smith successfully had new laws enacted making the purchasing of sex illegal. The laws are one potential tool for service providers to draw on, yet it must be stressed that the laws are not the end-all and be-all in conflict intervention strategies to address any social problem. In fact, a theme that emerges from this research is that we need to focus much more on prevention, identifying risk factors and intervening early to prevent children from being caught up in the sex industry. If the need for enforcement has been reached, it is almost too late for victims caught up in the sex industry.

Future research and intervention strategies should focus on the social determinants of

crime. My study participants emphasized that we (in society) need to focus on preventing young people from becoming vulnerable and alienated, easy prey to be victimized by pimps and johns. Future research may reinforce the need for stakeholders to concentrate on building individual and community level resilience that makes people and communities resistant to various forms of victimization, including sexual exploitation.

Cho (2012) concluded, after a study of human trafficking trends in 150 different countries, that legalizing sex selling correlated with increased human trafficking. We need to understand the causal relationships between changes in the laws and their impact on sexual exploitation and human trafficking so that strategies can be well informed and intelligence led. At a forum in Winnipeg on sex trafficking and exploitation, Swedish sex trafficking expert Gunilla Ekberg described how legalized brothel districts in Amsterdam are now closed as a result of recent audits that found they were dominated by organized crime groups trafficking women who aren't there of their own free will (presentation at the University of Winnipeg, 6 June, 2016). She outlined how laws don't necessarily translate into action and can in fact create more problems for victims of the sex industry. At the same forum, Diane Redsky said that despite the new laws and intervention approaches, the problem of sexual exploitation and sex trafficking is continuing to worsen in Canada (Grabish, 2016). Ms. Redsky said that adolescent girls as young as nine are now being bought and sold in the sex industry in Manitoba (Personal communication, June 6, 2016).

My research participants' observations seem to support the Badgely Report's findings, as dated as they are, regarding the laws, except in one area. The Badgely Committee stipulated that (1) specific legislation should be aimed at customers and (2) the sexual procurement of youth prostitution should be an indictable offence (Badgely, 1984). However, my interviewees strongly

disagreed with the Badgely recommendation that young prostitutes need to be criminalized for their own protection through enactment of specific offences. The Fraser Committee report also emphasized that existing Canadian laws around prostitution, “operated in a way which victimizes and dehumanizes the prostitute,” recommending that government develop “long-term programs to address the social and economic conditions faced by women involved in prostitution” (Fraser, 1985, p. 525). This is the same language and emphasis that was expressed in the Supreme Court Bedford decision, highlighting that young women are exploited and victimized in the sex industry (Canada vs. Bedford, 2013).

It is interesting to note that it took until 2013 for Canadian laws to be challenged in the Supreme Court. It is also important to observe that it took a constitutional challenge to change the laws, rather than these necessary changes evolving naturally through democratic parliamentary processes. This seems to speak to the complacency and denial by the public over the existence of the sex industry, which in turn means that little action is occurring at the political level to protect these young women. It seems that see, hear, and speak no evil (Lau, 2012) is the mantra behind public apathy to this serious problem afflicting young women and children in Manitoba.

With respect to arresting children and women, my research participants universally agree with the critics of Badgely (Appleford, 1986; Brock, 1998; Lowman et al., 1986) that criminal charges are counter-productive for the welfare of children. However, it still leaves open the debate about how sex industry survivors can best be protected and supported, and how their knowledge can be included in the overall integrated and holistic strategy to combat sex traffickers. Several police officers I interviewed for this study emphasized that arresting women in the sex industry to force them into addictions and assorted other counseling services might be

the lesser of two evils.

My study participants generally felt that the police should be out building trust with young people on the streets as well as local agencies and NGOs to gather intelligence, not only for more effective prosecutions, but also for better early interventions to support people that want assistance to exit the sex industry. My interviewees felt that there is room for improvement, in particular how intelligence is gathered, shared and used within and between agencies. Most of my respondents didn't express strong opinions on whether the laws affect the sex industry or not, especially international laws and norms of human decency. Most stressed that what is important is not so much what the laws say, but how the police, the judiciary and partnering social agencies use them. The majority did agree that the current approach in Canada, since the Supreme Court Bedford case, is and should be to treat sex sellers as victims and the purchasers and traffickers as the real culprits who should be prosecuted to the full extent of the law.

On the topic of the efficacy of Canada's new laws around sex trafficking and exploitation, Schwartz (2014) has written that "don't expect court challenges or big changes in enforcement any time soon." He goes on to say that the Harper government's Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act did not immediately affect police approaches to the sex industry, nor do they currently affect the sex industry as activities such as the advertisement of escorts continues in platforms such as Backpages.com. Lawyer and Osgoode Hall law professor Alan Young states that the sex industry "can pretty much continue to do what they do by running ads for independent sex workers" (Schwartz, 2014). Professor Young is the lawyer who appealed to the Supreme Court of Canada to the change in laws. He said, "it's really bizarre to say that a sex worker can advertise and then when someone answers that ad, they become a criminal" (Schwartz, 2014, p. 1).

University of Ottawa criminologist Michael Kempa has said that the police have some discretion about how they apply and prioritize enforcement of the laws (ibid.). My respondents reinforced this view. Initiatives such as Project Return in Winnipeg (Prest, 2016), and Canada wide Operation Northern Spotlight (Winnipeg Free Press, 2016), involved new approaches focusing on the enforcement of the laws over the johns and viewing prostitutes as victims rather than as criminals. In Northern Spotlight, 32 people were charged with 78 offences across Canada, and 16 minors found working in the sex industry were brought to safety (ibid.). While some of these charges were newly created offences, the general approach of targeting johns rather than sex industry survivors for enforcement had begun across Canada, as my police respondents described, a decade before. At this point, in 2017, the overall effect of the new laws, or of enforcement in general on sex trafficking and the sex industry is still difficult to judge. Table 3 outlines charges laid by the WPS by the end of 2016 and the outcomes that were known by that time. Future research on the outcomes may shed more light on the affect and efficacy of laws designed to reduce sex trafficking.

Chapter 9 - Getting Out is Harder than it Looks

9.1 Introduction

It became clear early on in this study that one of the great challenges in addressing sex trafficking and exploitation in Manitoba is in the complexity of the issue and the trauma that survivors endure. It is a unique trauma, compounded by the fact that survivors are coerced and entrenched into the sex industry sub-culture and, consequently, service providers have the unique challenge of trying to help people that don't want to be helped. The survivors' challenges are frequently exacerbated by severe substance abuse issues and the fact that traffickers often arrange for survivors to have no home or support system when and if they do try to escape.

My interviewees described the layered challenges that survivors struggle with, including substance abuse, childhood trauma, post trauma stress, and other mental health issues that are exacerbated by the daily trials of violence they encounter in the sex industry. The following is a portion of the interview I had with Kaitlin, a sex trafficking survivor. She describes the process of how she became involved in being sexually exploited and how she tried to get out.

KAITLIN: I was 12. I hung around with girls who were doing it, an older crowd of girls.

They struggled in addiction, but I can say, honestly, I kind of think I grew up around it.

My mother was a prostitute. And I remember growing up in a house with a bunch of prostitutes. So I kind of think that has something to do with it.

My mother was an IV-user so I grew up around that. And I think that's why it was so easy to go into addiction.

I was 12 years old when I first did my first hit of crack, and I was hooked.

And by the time I was 13, I was already out on the street.

It was probably mostly to do with gangs and drug dealers.

I believe now that I'm older that I was lured by this older crowd of girls because I was young, and there was more money. I was lured into this.

I remember I was hanging out with this girl, and next thing I knew I was in this house in the West End. And this guy was, "Here, want some crack?"

And I said, "No." They kind of tricked me into it. I thought it was like weed, or whatever they told me it was, and I did it. And after I was hooked.

By the second night I remember the guy telling me, “Well, you owe me so much money, and if you don’t get it, I’m going to kill you.”

So I had to go out and work.

He said I owed him about two grand, but I don’t remember smoking that much. I think I only smoked a couple of pieces because I was really scared and I didn’t know what to do.

And I thought this girl, she was my best friend, she was doing it, too. I thought she was my friend. And I thought she cared about me and I told her I wanted to go home. I didn’t want be here anymore. And she just said, “Well, you can’t go anywhere. You have to stay here or else they’ll hurt you.”

So I stayed. Stupid me, I stayed.

From that I think, after, I was going home once a month just to say hi to my Mom. And she was still doing crack. But I would just go home and get clothes or whatever and then leave.

By the time I was 14, I was pretty much homeless and living at a crack shack and on the street. That’s all I lived for is crack.

You know, sleep two days, I’d sleep at a john’s place for a night, someone that I trusted. I’d go spend a night there and he’d take care of me, feed me, shower, buy me clothes. Then I’d say, “Okay, I’m going.”

I’d be gone for a couple of days, and same thing over and over right up until I was 17 when I was pregnant with my oldest. I went home pregnant.

I still used. I don’t like to admit it, but I used off and on through my pregnancy. When I stopped—I did stop for two months when I had him—I left my son with my mom, and I just went back on the street and the prostitution.

I was going from area to area, different areas all the time. North End. Central. Point Douglas. Main. Higgins. I don’t know why I did that. As soon as I get too comfortable with people, I didn’t want anyone to know who I was. And soon as someone started getting close to me, I would move to a different area and find a different group of girls to smoke crack with and shoot with.

That went on heavy till I was 17, and then I slowly stopped. By 18, I was pregnant again with my son. Their fathers were all drug dealers and gang members. For me, it was just someone to take care of me, and I would have to work the street to get high. I could just have my baby and get high. I did that. The relationships didn’t work out. And I was back on the street.

Kaitlin’s story also was similar to others that I heard while conducting this research. Here Kaitlin talks about the psychological challenges that accompany efforts to escape the sex industry.

KAITLIN: When I came to [—], I was still seeing a couple of them and I was open with my social worker. I was telling her, like, “Ya.”

I learned in addiction, from going to these treatments and that you have to be honest. If you lie, it’s just going to keep you in there. So I told her, “Ya, I’m still seeing this guy” and that.

And she said, “Well, the only way you’re going to help yourself is if you completely stop.”

Once she said that I started to notice that I still felt dirty and cheap. Even though he's a friend and that, I still felt gross. And you know had hot showers and all that. I used to feel gross, but I wasn't using.

And I know why I was using so much. It was to hide that pain, to hide that feeling.

Kaitlin tells a typical story that most of us would prefer to not hear; yet tragically, it is the modern-day context of a very old problem. She highlights how people target and manipulate children to groom them into the sex industry, and the significant role that substance abuse typically plays in this process. This chapter explores the unique challenges that survivors face escaping the sex industry.

9.2 Trauma and hope: I don't think I wanted to escape

Trauma and PTSD are part of everyday life for survivors of the sex industry. Most struggle with complex multi-layered issues that call for individualized treatments and supports. In this section, some of these trauma conditions are mentioned along with the specific phenomenon of hope, which is a key component in any formula for overcoming these tragic life experiences.

Grace, a survivor, described the trauma she endured in the sex industry and how she didn't really want to leave because she was so entrenched in that culture.

GRACE: It started out to have food and clothes because I was in Child and Family Services.

But the more you have to perform those, the more you work—no its not work—the more that you are abused, the harder the pain. So it started with crack, and then it went to meth, right?

So it's like you can't—when you are that age—you need to be able to kind of provide your way so maybe I would show up to a flop house, I guess you would call it, where like a whole bunch of kids hang out with money. But I'd show up with drugs, and they would be like I was taken care of and fed and clothed because there was a group of us.

There was one time this fucking asshole—sorry, pardon my language—he was going to save me, and he took me—I was maybe 13 maybe 14—and he took me to St. James off the street. And he's, like, “Oh, let's get better, blah, blah, blah.”

And then it was like three weeks later. I got sober for three weeks. Then he asked me to go and work. So I went and worked, and I made about \$300 and I got groceries.

But I don't want to do that sober. So a couple of days after that I headed back to our core of Winnipeg and, ya, it's mostly for drugs to survive, right?

Grace mentioned how post traumatic stress has impacted her. The survivors I interviewed all described their intersectional challenges, explaining how difficult it is to escape life on the street.

My participants believe that it is critical that people working with survivors maintain a non-judgmental attitude that doesn't cause them guilt and shame. If these feelings are elevated for young people, it can cause them to regress and fall back into the problems they are trying to overcome. For example, RCMP Deputy Commissioner Kevin Brosseau said that if people feel good or bad about themselves, it becomes a self-fulfilling prophecy; therefore, people trying to assist survivors must be non-judgmental and supportive.

KEVIN BROUSSEAU: It becomes a self-perpetuating and self-fulfilling prophecy. If you feel bad about yourself, you're going to continue. If you continue to be told you are—, you're less of a person because you happen to be a street worker or you happen to be a sex trade worker, you know? It's often the case.

And you'll hear sometimes—, you'll read in the paper that somebody's gone missing or somebody's been murdered. And the third line will be that person worked on the street. And it's almost, like, "Okay, they're either being blamed for the situation they're in. Or, they're being thought less of because of the manner in which they've been exploited or the lifestyle choices they've made along the way."

So, I think, to me, resource-intensive, culturally appropriate supports, and quickly, would be really important so that engagement that happens—either in, you know, the areas that are commonly understood where this type of activity occurs, or you know, with those who are known to be engaged therein, would be able to deploy and be able to be there in a trusting, caring environment where a person is able to be removed.

It may require that an actual physical removal—almost like a child apprehension power—and then the supports are there. And those supports aren't just for a day, but those supports stay there and are ongoing.

You know, short response and help may be fine for a night, but then what about the next day? What about the next week? What about the next month? It has to stay there and be able to provide someone with the opportunities they need to be able to see an alternative to the world that they find themselves in.

Mr. Brosseau notes that for survivors who wish to exit the sex industry, they should be wrapped in a blanket of vital resources in a safe and nurturing environment.

Some participants noted that a significant component of determining survivors' needs, and

being client centered, includes deep listening to their often-painful stories. For example, Jennifer Richardson (Street Reach) said, “I hear once a week from experiential people that they don’t feel very heard.” An “aha” moment occurred for me as a researcher while completing the field interviews. I realized that several participants, Sada Fenton, Dianna Bussey, Jane Runner and Jennifer Richardson all said “meet them where they are at”, and at that point, a light bulb went off for me. They understood that we need to meet girls where they’re at in the moment they are seeking assistance, because circumstances are always changing. My participants also stressed, that everyone is different.

For example, Daphne Penrose (Executive Director of Winnipeg CFS) asserts that there is no single approach that works intervening with exploited youth. She emphasized that there is no “one-size-fits-all approach” because every person is so different.

DAPHNE PENROSE: What needs to happen is the coordinated response so that folks can access different resources depending on where they’re at. If you ask somebody who has a 10-point-a-day meth addiction about what’s going to help that person exit the sex trade—nothing until they get sober, nothing until somebody intervenes with them.

Ms. Penrose notes that every survivor is unique and there has to be a vast array of available resources for him/her to access.

Jane Runner (Executive Director of TERF) also points out that nothing happens for women trying to escape the sex industry until their basic human needs are met. This theme overlaps with the need for safe houses, whereby women can feel safe and access the resources they need. Here is what she states about providing for young sex industry survivors’ basic needs.

JANE RUNNER: So it’s education and being able to understand and see it for what’s probably going on, cause a lot of people miss it, right?

If you don’t know it, if you’re not enmeshed in this and know kind of what’s going on, people miss it. Or, if you’re too busy and overwhelmed, like a lot of teachers in schools, they’re busy and they’ve got maybe 10 kids acting out in their room, and the little quiet one’s getting missed.

So, preventing it is just going to take a lot more work and resources to get in

supporting families, educating people who work with kids to be able to identify it and know what the indicators are. And you've taken the [Sexually Exploited Youth] training. We talk a lot about the indicators there and what people can look for. Its education, and

The main thing—and again when you're looking at people's basic needs we always refer to Maslow's Hierarchy of needs—and the main thing people need right away is stability, like, with food, shelter, clothing, like, just the basic needs. That they feel safe and secure.

And once that's in place for people, they have a better opportunity to then try and get to programming, get to school, go to counseling, you know, whatever they're needing to do.

So, having a good stable home environment, or good stable foster parent, you know, whatever it is that can help somebody feel secure and safe.

Ms. Runner's comments about providing for young people's basic needs and safety are consistent with my other research participants' experiences. The following comment by Krista Dudek describes how the same problems tend to persist for decades, despite pockets of good programming operating over the same period of time.

Krista Dudek is a WPS Sergeant with extensive experience working in the Sex Crimes Unit. She says that services are generally ineffective in getting people out of the sex industry; however, programs like the Prostitution Diversion Program at Salvation Army do offer them a reprieve from the street if only for a few days at a time. Sergeant Dudek described some of the persisting problems that she encounters when she tries to assist young survivors trying to escape from the sex industry as follows.

KRISTA DUDEK: I know we have different organizations out there. I mean there's Sage house.

The Salvation Army's there. Well, when I was in Morals it was called "prostitution camp." I know it's going to be called something else now.

There's the diversion program for the johns. I mean those have existed since I was in Morals so this is back in 1999. And has it gotten better? I don't think so.

I'm not saying that what they were doing is bad. You know, I was able to participate in quite a few of the camps, and when you see the girls when they're not on drugs and they're in a safe place like the camp, you can see that they're all relaxed, they're all laughing, they're all having fun.

And that was the one thing that Ms. [—] and I always would comment on. And it's, like—, it's too bad they're actually having fun and it's only three days and your basically thrown back into their reality.

Ultimately, despite all of the problems in the existing anti-trafficking programs and systems, Ms. Dudek stresses that we need tenacity to hold out a lifeline for those young individuals who reach out for one, from time to time. This requires flexibility in the availability of resources and support because every person's needs are different.

Additionally, Michael Richardson (Marymount) notes that people need something important to quit the sex industry for. They need hope.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: I would say people try and exit an average of seven times. I would say it would be fewer times if there were some resources on the other side—housing opportunities, education opportunities, mentorship opportunities, job opportunities, all those things that help people exit the sex trade.

Until we can make them feel safe—

I think, sometimes people want to leave or want to get out of the sex trade, but there's nothing on the other side that they can see promising them a better life and all of that. And we are responding quicker for them to exit.

When we talk about people exiting the sex trade, and all that entails—giving up their offender or their pimp or what have you, I bet, there's not enough safe houses or we can't keep them safe. There's no commitment to keep them safe because it costs money. And then there's no witness protection for exploitation. And that's a strong one because the sex trade operates on fear and the manipulation. And the people that's involved in it, they are they're fearful. So I think protection would be a way to help people feel safe, but also help them exit. And I think the police can provide some of that.

Mr. Richardson describes a bleak reality, that many survivors see nothing for them outside of the sex industry.

9.2.1 *Exiting takes a critical event*

Reflecting on the stories related to me by all of my participants, it is clear that survivors of the sex industry do not simply wake up one day and find that they are out of the nightmare. They most often experience a crisis or a critical event that encourages them to seek help and want it desperately, or they are lucky enough to have a significant person influencing them and supporting them to quit. Even then, it is difficult and most people relapse numerous times in their journey out, and some never make it out at all. Many who finally do successfully escape the sex

industry, dedicate their lives to assisting others.

The survivors described a gut wrenching long-term battle with substance abuse, and historical and new trauma and numerous attempts to escape and multiple relapses. Several of the survivors I interviewed described how they did not finally escape for good until they became pregnant or they saw a friend die or get murdered.

For example, one survivor, Paige, was trafficked all over Canada for over 20 years. She described the critical events that finally led to her opportunity to escape the sex industry.

PAIGE: When we talk about this, I always think, “What’s personal to me? What happened for me? How did I get out?”

I said, and different times, “it was the police that saved my life.” Had I not been scooped and my warrant be put out there for arrest in other provinces, I may have died where I was. I was brought back on a warrant. I was a witness in a murder trial, and I really believe my life was spared.

But, for me, I didn’t do anything.

People came to me. It was almost, like, I am a believer. I believe there is a force greater than myself and I really believe that when I was escorted back from [—] to Winnipeg and east to [—], I had no-where to go.

So I went to 180 Henry. And it was there at 180 Henry—. I had charges on me out of [—]. I was there and met [—] at Booth Center. And that began the healing journey for me.

It got me into the prostitution diversion program. So I didn’t even know where I was going. I really did not even know what kind of camp I was going to, because another girl was going. From that camp I was introduced to so many different programs here in Winnipeg, such as TERF, Dream Catchers, Sage House, all of these programs. And they were all little stepping stones for me.

Paige describes the various programs as stepping-stones, further illustrating that a wide array of choices must be available to young people trying to escape the sex industry because everyone’s needs are different and continually changing along with their personal circumstances. Paige also outlined those critical events that basically forced her to change her life.

Some people just become spent, after years of abuse and injuries, often damaged by severe substance abuse; they become unsellable. Kaitlin is one of the survivors I interviewed; she describes in the following passage from her interview- how she progressed from the street to

‘working’ indoors, and then eventually regressed back to survival sex when traffickers were no longer able to sell her.

KAITLIN: My sons went and lived with my Mom. She took care of them.

She got clean. So she had my sons.

The prostitution, I kept going, I think after I was 17, 18. I was slowly doing it off the street. I was working in massage parlors.

I met a guy who picked me up off the street, and he said, “You don’t have to do this on the street anymore.”

I guess I had a fat lip because I was getting beat up, you know, from bad dates and stuff like that. And he said, “You need somewhere safe to make some money and that.”

And I said, “Ya.” And he owned a massage parlour on Logan at McPhillips. And I worked there until I was 19, and then I went back on the street.

I remember he fired me because my addiction got so bad, and I wasn’t taking care of myself.

Nobody wanted me anymore so I went back on the street.

Kaitlin’s story is similar to many in that she self-medicated severely with street drugs in order to placate the negative feelings caused by selling herself in the sex industry.

Friedereke Von Aweden (Klinic) notes that critical events in the lives of young sex sellers often precede their ‘getting out.’ She stresses the significance of the person’s environment and the relapse that survivors often experience when they re-enter their old triggering milieu.

FRIEDEREKE VON AWEDEN: When I see people making amazing changes, sometimes it is with pregnancies there they feel like they are responsible to their fetus. Lots of lifestyle changes happen. I think with pregnancy, they are great lifestyle changes, but it’s often not enough to keep a mother with her baby.

Sometimes critical news like a new diagnosis of HIV or HEP C, I think, is important.

Losing a friend to an overdose.

But nothing easy, nothing quick.

Wide access to treatment programs. With treatment programs, I see so many women work so hard and do so well in treatment programs. And when they release into the old environment they lose all the ground that they made.

Respondents describe how various events could jar women into wanting their escape.

Diane Redsky (*Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*) summarizes the need for an effective anti-trafficking and sexual exploitation system to be client centered, flexible and adaptive. She also stressed that counseling and addiction resources must be available to survivors when they need

them. Ms. Redsky noted that these women walk a fine line, always on the verge of relapse into addictions and/or the sex industry and that they require a safety net that doesn't currently exist.

DIANE REDSKY: In terms of what some consistent things that we've heard is that, first, women don't have a safe place to go. And if there was a safe house or a safe center or a place to go that is nonjudgmental, that will maybe—. "I'm thinking about it but I'm not sure." That's what needs to be there that we don't have.

What they rely often times on right now is other women who have exited. And they hang out in their house. And that's always not a good idea because there's a woman trying to rebuild her life. So we don't have a safety net.

Another thing that women will talk about is that I need addictions [counselling]. I need to deal with my addictions first and foremost. Like, "I want detox right now, and I want to do it this second."

And then you get into waiting lists. And then you get into a process. And then you have to be drug-free for two weeks before you can get into this program and that program.

And it's not realistic for women who are, like, "Now. I want now." And we don't have a system that can respond to "now." And that's part to the problem.

Ms. Redsky notes that resources, such as addictions treatment, must be available immediately, without wait lists when a person finally decides that s/he wants out of the sex industry.

My interviewees repeated that no one wants to be out selling herself on a street corner. For example, WPS Constable Anna Janzen describes the cycle that many women struggle with, almost always including a roller coaster of substance abuse and addictions. She has found that 99 percent of people who are out selling sex on the street wish they were doing something else; they are doing it for survival.

ANNA JANZEN: Anyone that I've dealt with in the sex trade, all want to get out and there's not one person I've ever met that wants to be standing on that corner for 20 dollars or a rock of crack cocaine or whatever their doing.

They're all out there because they need to be out there. And even with the kids, they want to be out there or they don't want to but they're out there because they would rather be getting paid than being home getting abused and not getting paid.

Its reality. An awful thing, but I just think, from a policing perspective, I found even if it's for one day, if I can tell a girl to get off the street for one day and be compassionate and nonjudgmental—like, I've never walked in their shoes I don't know. What they're doing out there, it definitely is wrong, and they're out there doing something illegal, they're going to be using drugs and selling themselves, but if you can be nonjudgmental and compassionate and just treat someone like a human being instead of being

disrespectful or abusing them even more with your language or your position or whatever, that can do wonders.

Here again, Ms. Janzen highlights the critical importance of service providers, including police and social workers, being non-judgmental and caring about the survivors' safety and well-being.

Another survivor, Elizabeth says the damage is permanent and that one can have setbacks even decades after leaving the sex industry. Here is Elizabeth's comment about the reality that the survivor is always in jeopardy of a relapse and tumbling back into life of addictions and selling sex on the street.

ELIZABETH: I'm experiential, identify as experiential today, even though I exited over 20 years ago. I'm still experiential. I'm no further away from that curb than any of the other women that are out there.

Just because it's been 20 years—. The triggers are still real for me today. The work that I do is extremely rewarding, but it's also hugely triggering. And anytime financial insecurity hits, stinky thinking does too. Yeah, it's easy to go back to that frame of thinking.

I used to start my story by saying I was 21 years old and I left a relationship. I was violently raped. And then I started working in the sex trade.

But over the last few years, I started recognizing the fact that I was groomed for the sex trade long before that. And I actually turned my first trick when I was 18. And I had been primed for it for a number of years prior. And just the people that I associated with and people that I considered to be normal everyday people were folks that were either in a place of exploitation or drug dealing or some kind of criminal activity. But at that point in my life, I thought it was normal life.

Elizabeth's insight has significant implications for developing sustainable resilience training for survivors. They need effective responses for when they feel triggered, to avoid relapse. A large number of survivor/practitioners work in support roles assisting young people to escape the sex industry. People working in NGOs and agencies that employ experiential survivors should be very cognizant of the dangers that exist for these people to be triggered to their past traumas. All of these government and non-government agencies should be aware that their employees could be suffering from triggering experiences as a result of their work. Trauma programs for dealing with PTSD and triggering experiences could save people from relapses.

Bill Fogg, WPS Superintendent (ret.) perhaps sums up best, in the following passage, the challenges that survivors face while attempting to escape the sex industry.

BILL FOGG: I think the biggest thing, and it sounds really generic, is viable alternatives. People don't—, I don't believe people enter the sex trade because they want to, especially in a place like Manitoba and Winnipeg.

And I think you know it may be different for different people, but addictions are certainly one of the big problems.

I think once you stabilize the addictions, what you find is that there's some underlying trauma and mental health that has probably driven the addictions in the first place. So you need to be able to get at the root of those things and be able to provide support.

So if you give those kids an opportunity to live some place safe, and stable, in a realistic environment. It can't be a sterile environment because they're really not programmed to be able to walk into "Father Knows Best" 1950s environment. I think that what they need to have is that opportunity. They need to have the hope and believe there's another way for them. I think that has to be, to some degree, tailored to the individuals.

Mr. Fogg's analysis is also encapsulated in the interviews of the survivors and other participants.

Survivors first require that their basic needs taken care of, in a safe secure environment; then they need support coupled with hope for the future.

9.2.2 Heal thyself: The journey from your mind to your heart

One finding of this research was the disproportionately high number of sex industry survivors working in agencies and programs oriented to assisting survivors of the sex industry. As the interviews progressed it became abundantly clear to me that survivors who flee the sex industry often feel indebted to the people who helped them get away, and they feel compassion for those still trying to extricate themselves from this brutal and violent culture. Helping others is also one way that the person can take some value from their horrific experiences in the sex industry. For example, one survivor, Paige, comments on how survivors work to support other survivors. She made the observation that it is meaningful for survivors who are striving to escape the sex industry to see other experiential survivors who have successfully transitioned out. Therefore,

experiential people play a critical role supporting other survivors.

PAIGE: Based on my 12 years' direct experience of being trafficked and having previously participated in programs with staff who were not experiential and those who were, I preferred to talk with professionals who had similar experiences as me because I knew they really understood what I was going through and genuinely wanted to help. When a survivor is working at an agency that meets the needs of those who have previously been trafficked, victimized by predators, it can make a big difference in the lives of the women they work with because [the women] see someone who has gone through what they had and found a way out.

From my own personal experience, currently working with other survivors, I've had the opportunity to be the role model to women who went through the same things I did. One woman said to me, "If you can do it, I know I can too." This is why it is so important for survivors to work with other survivors. And it is important for survivors to have an input in the decision-making processes at front line organizations.

The way I look at it now, at a professional point of view and also personal, everyone's different.

Some of us come from very, very, very bad childhoods. We don't believe in ourselves. We have no education. We're stupid. We don't like ourselves.

Others have, well most of us, have been sexually assaulted, sexually abused some way. We're all traumatized.

Meet them where they're at. They're stuck, you know?

What I have lived, I would not understand, I really wouldn't understand it. I've struggled around addiction. I hitchhiked to Vancouver for the first time when I was 15. So I was in and out and that was where it was, first turning out in Vancouver and that was years ago.

I've always thought so less of myself. Really, looking back, I did not love myself, you know. I did not believe myself.

I would go to escort group twice a day because I didn't know where else to go. I didn't have my own place. Now, I've gone to rehabs. I've gone through anger, residential, and I relapsed. And I've gone through another residential and relapsed. Where am I going to go now?

And one of my counselors said, "You go back to AA because you know what you got to do." And she said, "You go everyday." So I went twice a day. I thought I didn't even know how to get there twice a week and I ended up going twice a day for about six months. But my mind was so closed, partly from, I think, the drugs partly from maybe the abuse, partly from just having never learned.

I did not know, when they talk a lot about recovery stuff, they said, "Surrender." Well how do I surrender? I don't even know.

They would talk about God. I didn't know who the hell God was. If there was God, I wouldn't have had to go through what I went through.

And it was just through continuing to go there and do what I had to do, and just suited up and showed up, that I started hearing things.

And I started hurting. And I realized that all my life, Bob, I would go from person to person.

I come from a family where two of my sisters have become Christians and they live a

Christian lifestyle. And so I would go to them and get them to explain to me who God was. Or, I would go to pastors or talk to people because I want what I saw people having in meetings and so on. There was a turning point where I realized I didn't even have to know who this God is, I just have to know that he's there. And that's how it works for me.

Once I started to see some of these things and even feel them, I connected the dots. I always say that the longest journey you'll ever walk, the longest road you'll ever walk is from your mind to your heart. When you can connect those two things because we have so much knowledge. We can know things, but if they're not connected to a feeling in your heart, for me, it just didn't make sense.

So meet someone where they're at. It's not going to be for everyone the way it was for me, so I know when a girl comes in to see me she might not be where I'm at or gone through what I've gone through or might not even be near as mad. So I just basically say, when people ask what I do at work, I just love girls. It sounds fun, I just love them. And I have that opportunity to love them with material stuff because we get a lot of donations.

Paige stresses that she loves the survivors she supports. Her story illustrates how her life experience and passion benefits others who are trying to escape the sex industry.

Paige, and two other survivors, Elizabeth and Grace, described their experiences of transitioning out of the sex industry and becoming counseling and supporting practitioners helping others who are going through similar exiting processes. Elizabeth, a survivor/practitioner, has worked for 20 years helping others as a support worker. She said the following.

ELIZABETH: Okay, I myself am a former sex trade worker.

I transitioned out of the sex trade over 20 years ago. I was involved in both street level as well as indoor trade. I worked for pimps. I worked independently. I worked for escorts, a massage parlor, and I was trafficked across Canada.

I put two pimps in jail for living off the avails, prostitution and conspiracy, and murder, and I started my healing journey [—] years ago in a program called “[—].” And I stuck around long enough that they hired me. And I've been working in the field now for many years as a peer support worker.

I'd like to say it's all a choice, but I feel that there's a lot of survival sex that's in the sex trade as well. Some folks feel that they've made the choice, and don't realize the amount of involvement that they actually get into. As somebody who chooses to identify as a victim of exploitation, I usually identify more as a victim of exploitation although some people I know identify as survivors of exploitation and I have identified myself on occasion in that frame.

Trafficking—now the language in itself is interesting and debatable because I still remember back in the day when it was okay to be called a “ho” and you certainly don't use that language today unless you want to insult somebody—but trafficking I used to consider

it a road trip with my pimp. And now I know that human trafficking is representative of various levels, but as far as the sex trade goes, it is against your will.

Similarly, Grace, another survivor/practitioner, describes a sense of giving back to the program that helped her. Here is what Grace reported about her experience.

GRACE: It's kind of funny because I never talked about it, but it was like I needed to talk about it to get into this program, because it's for experiential women.

It's an oxymoron because it's like exploiting my experience to get to the next level, but things are so much different. I don't even have to identify in my workplace as being experiential anymore because I have the credentials. Like I always had the ability to have a different lifestyle, but I never had the opportunity presented to me to make it different.

And so it's been a journey since 2010 when I finished this program. And I went on into second year and people actually wanted to listen to what I had to say and incorporated my opinions and ideas into working with children in care themselves.

You know I used to access [a shelter] when I was on the streets, when I got tired, because you just go for days and days and days, and then you just crash and you'd need somewhere to go. And I would go there.

It's kind of nice to see that [shelter] has been there transitionally, and now I work for them. That's kind of like how it went.

Paige, like Grace and Elizabeth was drawn towards helping others. Paige made a lot of interesting points about her work with sex industry survivors. She says having "lived the experience" she knows what it was like to stand on a corner selling sex, and being able to relate to the value that she brings to helping others. Here's how Paige describes working with survivors.

PAIGE: I come to the table working in the field, here with sexually exploited women and transgendered females, as a result of lived experiences of my own.

With a past of addiction, which my addiction took me down to the point of being homeless, I often say that when I got well or began to get well, I was almost emotionless—and no place to go. And that was pretty much the way it was for me.

So having lived experience was knowing what it was like to stand on a corner, if you will, jump in a stranger's car only with one thought in mind and that is to pay in cash to supply a habit.

Looking back now, I also see those periods in my life where I was able to pull it together. It took a number of times but I was able to go back to school. And able to maintain and get my grade ten. And then I did the GED and got my grade 12. And jumped back in and took a nursing program. And was able to work as a nurse for a little while, and was able to maintain sobriety on my own.

I wasn't happy, but I was sober. So I had successful periods, but I would always end

up back up there somehow. So even back then I always knew I wanted to work with women. I did not realize then I would be involved in the sex trade. I still feel it is women who are involved in the sex trade that I am involved with. But I feel that I would be there for any women with pain. I know who I am, wanting to help people, yeah.

Paige was able to even go through nursing school and stay sober for many years, yet she was not happy. After hearing Paige, Grace and Elizabeth's stories, I understood that no one can know what these women experience, or what it takes to escape the sex industry. Therefore, they are a priceless resource for service agencies and people who are reaching out for help.

Furthermore, Diane Redsky, of *Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*, describes how important it is to include survivors' voices in programming, working in the field, and advocating around sex trafficking and exploitation issues. She emphasizes that survivors' voices should be amplified.

DIANE REDSKY: Building on certain resources is one thing, but one of our main priorities is increasing the voices of experiential women. We're all past sharing the horror stories.

Now we're so far advanced in this province that now we're looking at real exit strategies for women, which we actually don't have here. We don't do that really well. For women who want to exit, it's still an uphill battle for them. And we can do things well and keep them safe when they're under 18. But once they get 18 and over, there's almost nothing available. So the coalition—, that's another one of our key priorities is we're not expanding our mandate to adults, both men and women.

It depends on which organizations are delivering the service. So I would say that Indigenous organizations need to be supported to develop the resources for Indigenous people. And we know on that issue, particularly in Winnipeg and in Manitoba, that the majority of the sexually exploited youth and women are Indigenous women and so Indigenous organizations need to be supported to do so.

Does that happen now? Not 100 percent. I would say that we have a ways to go with that particularly in the youth children in care sector.

Diane Redsky talks about the significance of survivor led organizations and other advocacy groups in Manitoba, and the importance of engaging survivors in developing strategies. She points out that effective exit strategies for survivors are not established anywhere in Canada.

Like Paige, Grace and Elizabeth, another survivor, Julia, describes how some people wind up working with survivors despite their best efforts to avoid it. Here are Julia's comments on

how she avoided the work and then seemed to gravitate back toward it.

JULIA: When I first went into social work, I went to work with addictions, and I didn't want to work with exploited people. I just wanted to stay away from that. And it just ended up everywhere I went, I ended up being the person that ended up with those kids, or those women.

I think, unfortunately, a lot of exploited people, or people that are trying to exit now, the only legitimate thing they can do is work with kids or other adult women. And not all of them want to, but they don't have any other real avenues to gain employment any other way.

And that's sad because then they sometimes end up doing this work and they're not ready, or they end up relapsing, or things end up happening because it's too close, it's too much for them to cope with. If there's other opportunities for them to choose, then they might not [do this]. I've just seen a lot of people relapse. And they've said, "I don't want to do this work. I didn't really want to work with kids but there were no other jobs."

Julia goes on to say that she was drawn into the helping industry. Others, however, are guided into it, perhaps because it was an opportunity that was available to them.

The *Ndinawe* Childcare Certificate Program with Red River Community College is one such opportunity, as it offers job training for sex industry survivors. Cathy Danby runs this program. In the following passage, she described it as a great opportunity that can open doors for survivors by offering them training with support mechanisms built in.

CATHY DENBY: The Child and Youth Care Program is a one-year certificate program for folks who've exited the trade. They've got some healing time behind them. They're ready to give back and they want to work with children and youth.

So they come in for a year and they learn the exact same program as the Notre Dame campus Child and Youth Care program. There's no difference in the curriculum.

What the difference is that there's more supports here. We have a counselor. We have an income assistance person.

We have one worker with Income Assistance who looks after this program and just cuts out all the red tape and bullshit that they have to deal with when they're on Income Assistance. It's great. she understands who they are, where they're coming from. she gets the program. So that knocks out all kinds of issues.

So once they finish here, they can ladder into a second year of the program at the college, on the main campus if they want. And at White Wolf, Speaking, we offer more of an outreach. So if people want to come in they can talk about anything, anything sexually, to do with sexuality. We work very closely with the Indigenous Family Centre next door so there's a lot of the North End community that goes through there. And we're great neighbours with one another.

So we try to support one another. So I'll go do educational pieces on everything from parenting to condom demonstrations to, you know, cultural things, making drums, yeah. And then, so then when we had the Sacred Lives program, that was awesome because we were able to use alumni from the Red River Ndinawe program and help train them as well as get them working on doing prevention programs for children.

So they were able to take their academic skills and their lived experience and develop some prevention stuff. They did lots of focus groups with the youth because there's Ndinawe, the youth centre, the safe house. And we place our students also in these places, in these agencies.

So they, yeah, they're really—, they're able to pick up on the kid that's exploited because they've lived it, right? So yeah the door's also open for anybody who wants to come in for information on anything to do with sexuality or sex education through White Wolf Speaking.

One downside of the *Ndinawe* program is that it trains people solely for one job vocation and not all women aspire to be a childcare worker. However, the program is very successful for many and offers a great model that could potentially be expanded upon for people to participate in other trades and skills development as well as university programs.

Ed Riglin (RCMP Sergeant) has devoted most of his career to counter exploitation. He was also involved in establishing the Joy Smith Foundation, which is focused on reducing or eliminating sex trafficking in Canada. He points out that some agencies today are established because of survivors working with survivors. He highlights that numerous agencies oriented around advocacy and assisting survivors to leave the sex industry were established in recent years because of the high number of survivors that are available to work in them.

ED RIGLIN: Of late, I would say that a lot more NGOs have popped up, primarily driven from girls that have come out of the sex trade, the human trafficking trade, sexual exploitation, have evolved from there, have come out there, and have tried to get other girls to come out. I would say this is a relatively new thing that has come out around sexual exploitation.

From a criminal aspect, I think, you can look at it by simply looking at the dated criminal codes in your research from what it used to look like in 1988 to what it used to look like in 2000.

You have to look at it 30 years ago. My view is that we are at the forefront of starting to evolve both with policing and society with NGOs, social services. All of these areas are starting to become more aware, more educated. We're on the front end of this.

Mr. Riglin points out that some survivor-centered NGOs are driven by survivors with lived experience of having previously worked in the sex industry. He also provides valuable context, contending that we are just now on the edge of making real change in Canada around counter-exploitation work.

There is a consensus among those I interviewed that the survivor's perspective is important and that they do great work to empower other survivors. Former Executive Director of Manitoba's Child Protection Branch, Claudia Ponce-Joly, emphasizes the important role that experiential survivors of the sex industry play as practitioners assisting young women on the streets, as they are very aware of the dangers as well as their basic human essentials.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: I also think that one of the most successful approaches and strategies in place today that's growing is experiential workers, people who have exited the sex trade. They successfully are being empowered to tell their stories, to share their knowledge and to reach out to those who may be at risk or are entrenched. I believe that the information that they're providing is also helpful for all kinds of research, learning and investigative approaches. But I believe giving those women and men a voice helps empower others in addressing and combating sexual exploitation, and even at times being able to recognize it and step out of it.

Those experiential workers I believe are a key strength and strategy that are in place today. I think it also serves and has a deterrent for those who are exploiting others, for them to share. People who were once victims become ambassadors of hope and change, powerful and in that capacity I believe will help deter others.

Ms. Ponce-Joly's description of the role for survivors in the helping professions is profound and inspiring, as are the stories of the survivors I interviewed.

There is room for research into whether experiential survivors are more effective than non-experiential practitioners at supporting survivors of the sex industry. However, there is little question that they are a valuable resource that is appreciated by the clients that they serve. A second question that should be researched is the impact that doing this type of work has on survivors who now work as practitioners assisting survivors. Several of the survivor/practitioners I interviewed stated that working day in and day out on the very tough issues that these young

women encounter, is very difficult for them, often triggering emotions that they must cope with.

9.3 Meet survivors where they are at

Sada Fenton is the manager of the Prostitution Diversion Program at the Salvation Army. She notes that it is important to recognize that survivors' situations are continually changing.

SADA FENTON: I think basically for me, right now working in the field I'm working, it's just meeting girls where they're at and being there and just encouraging them, believing in them when they're unable to believe in themselves. We can't do it for them, but we sure encourage them to do it. Give them hope.

The police are doing a really good job right now for the sex trade right now I really think having Curt and Claire and having that relationship is wonderful. Yeah, just to continue, not to see them as less than someone that's working in a lawyer's office or girls standing on the corner in the north end. They're really equal.

Jane Runner agrees with Ms. Fenton's point that service providers must meet each survivor where she is at in her life to provide hope, and each person's experience is radically different.

A large number of my interviewees emphasized that services must be client centered as everyone has different requirements at particular points in time. Here is what Jane Runner says about being client centered.

JANE RUNNER: I think people need to work where kids are at. The approaches that we use here [TERF, New Directions] that I think are really effective is really being person-centered. So that's really supporting the person to drive their own bus. Not for us to be directive and tell them what to do.

And to make sure that we are working from their cultural lens, not our own.

So whatever it means to them, on how they want to move from there, and other strategies and working from harm reduction perspective, working from the stages of change.

Again, that's the biggest thing in being able to assess where somebody's at if you're working with them. And again, not working in a different stage than they're at because then you're just going to be banging your head against the wall. We've learned that quite well here in this program with our "youngins."

Additionally, Kim Trossell of the Dream Catcher program at Klinik, notes that programs must be client centered, focusing on the unique requirements of each individual.

KIM TROSSELL: Number one, I wish and I hope that one day it will be a reality that all services will be client-centered and [client-]focused rather than the need of the government to create funding and hoops for people to be jumping through. I think it's extremely important that people are treated as individuals, that the amount of trauma that has been experienced out there has an opportunity for healing.

I think that the biggest piece was getting everybody to play nice, not competing against [each other for] funding, but working together to collaborate so that we're not repeating the same—, or reinventing the wheel, that the needs of the clients are met. It doesn't matter who's getting the funding for that. It's collaborating together as a community, working together to be able to provide this support for the women.

Moreover, Dianna Bussey (Salvation Army) stresses that every survivor is an individual with different needs, and services must really engage and meet them where they are at in the process of trying to transition out of the sex industry.

DIANNA BUSSEY: So by the time we are seeing them, they usually have been involved in the sex trade or in sexual exploitation, prostitution for a long time, and so they're kind of at the end. So our approach on that is to meet somebody where they're at.

They know we, on a daily basis, will have women, mainly women—they can be transgender or we have met men as well—who will come in here. They are looking for just a safe place to sit or somebody to talk to, but they might also be looking for addiction treatment or looking for a home, a shelter, information, help in that way.

And then we have, in the past, when the laws were different, we were operating diversion programs, if somebody had a charge in relation to their exploitation, then we were willing to help them getting rid of that charge and be an advocate for them and hopefully give them some information and get them out of the city for a few days.

We called it a program, but really it was about building relationships and just helping somebody out for three days at the very least. And hopefully they could then enter into a relationship with some other service providers that could be helpful to them.

Ms. Bussey points out that the work is more about building relationships than running an anti-trafficking program. Similarly, several of my respondents noted that providing services is more about building good individual relationships.

Several service providers talked about the challenges of having only a short period of time to work with survivors due to the structure of their programs, and in trying to connect them with effective long-term, flexible resources. For example, Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount), stresses the importance of providing critical resources for young women who are desperately in need.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: There's always an initial crisis where someone out there is brought to the Crisis Stabilization Unit, which is a short stay of three to five days. And I think what would need to happen, though, is that either they stay there longer or there is some sort of plan as to where they go afterwards, where they stay with us until a new placement [in the Child Welfare System] is found, and one that actually addresses the sexual exploitation and the root causes of that and what's going on with that child rather than, "Okay, your five days are up, and now you're going to this shelter."

In the last year, I can only think of one girl that was on an extended stay due to a sexual exploitation disclosure that came out. And even that was just a seven-day stay. And then they had found her a rural placement, which I definitely think does help, but in the end the kids just got to find a way to come back to Winnipeg.

So in the end it's almost backwards in itself because it's not helping the child. It's just moving them physically and not addressing the true issues.

Ms. Jarosiewicz expresses how they work with a child in crisis for a few days, often with little or no input in the longer-term intervention plan. She also underlined the lack of coordination between service providers as problematic because often the best resources for multiple issues that a youth may be facing might reside in different agencies and they often are not coordinated for the client.

A message that comes through loud and clear throughout all of the interviews was the compassion that practitioners generally feel for the sex industry survivors they work with. They repeatedly acknowledged from every perspective that being client centered means thinking of survivors as valuable human beings, loving them, and treating them as individuals with dignity and value. For example, Trevor Bragnalo shows his compassion and how much he cares about these children who he has tried to help over the years.

TREVOR BRAGNALO: It is unfortunate, because a lot of these girls are really great people, you know. You talk to them, they're smart. They're funny. They're intelligent. They joke around.

And then it's this other side, you know. They get slowly pulled into it. And it gets to that point almost of no return, where the addiction, the crack addictions—. And, yeah, you could put girls into a treatment facility, but after the treatment facility there has to be supports on the outside where they can go and be safe, away from that group that they originally had contact with. But then again, those are their friends, and they, a lot of times you know what, they get dragged back in. But if you could just save one, that'd be great, you know.

You know, the government somehow needs to understand that “Yes, prostitution is wrong. But it needs to be cleaned up.”

How do you clean it up?

You know what? You legalize it. You put it in a certain area. You have, like, essentially, a brothel, but you’d have it controlled. You have a business license. You run it, here, it’s cleaned up. You have health care workers on scene. You have counsellors on scene. You know what? You could essentially have men, or women, or whatever. It’d be legalized prostitution. You’d come and go from this facility anonymously, whatever you want, but you’d have to provide information, like your driver’s license or something to prove that you’re not some—, you’re not going to kill somebody and come back down and “Who done it?”

Mr. Bragnalo describes how every client is important and valuable, and how he took a compassionate approach to assisting them.

Patricia Haberman (Rose Hall, Marymount) is another example of a compassionate service provider who really cares about the young people who cross her door every day. Here is what Ms. Haberman says about her “little girls” as she calls them who she works diligently with to see them through hard times.

PATRICIA HABERMAN: I love 100 percent what I do. I love all the sassy little girls in my home, in my group home.

I’m trying to say to my staff, and this is what I say to you and my team, “This week we do what we can do on a daily basis.”

I walk in every morning, and the first thing I say, I say, “Good morning.” And then I say, “Who’s in their bed?” Not “Who’s not here?” It’s “Who’s in their bed?”

If they didn’t go to school four days this week, did they once? All right. We give them a high five on that one because they’ve had enough people telling them that they’re pieces of shit and they’re tired of life. They don’t need us telling them that they’re failing, too. That’s from my standpoint. Yeah, we need to hug them and love them, and tell them to keep coming home and we’ll feed them.

[Bob: Is there a moment when you, that you can recall that you dedicated yourself to this work?]

Two and a half years ago, when my university professor—You probably even know Mitch Bourbonniere. He’s the Bear Clan. Oh, I should talk about the Bear Clan too—he was my university professor.

And he does work with young women and men. He does education with the young men on how to treat a lady, and he asked me if I would be a part of his action therapy team. And I said I would be absolutely honored.

So he is my hero, my mentor. He gave me, for lack of a better term, he gave me my wings to fly in this profession. And that was the moment when he said, “You need your own team Patricia.” So here I am.

Ms. Haberman was passionate as she described the spirit and potential of the survivors in her group to make a difference in the world. The same compassion for others also came through in Kevin Brosseau's interview as he discussed why it is important to be non-judgmental with survivors.

9.3.1 Supporters are important

My respondents stressed that relationships are very important. Very rarely does someone say s/he escaped the sex industry as a result of so and so program or agency. More often they report they were able to free themselves as a result of the support of a certain supporter whether s/he is from a program, an NGO, a social worker background or a police officer.

Rejeanne Caron is a WPS Constable who has worked extensively with sexually exploited women. She underlines how many sex industry survivors "fall off the wagon" multiple times in their struggle to escape the substance abuse and other negative factors that draw them continually back into that life. She emphasized, like most participants, that practitioners and supporters must be non-judgmental and tenacious in supporting the youth so that they can pick up and try again each time they fail. Here is how Ms. Caron described one survivor she worked with.

REJEANNE CARON: I think the supports, having the supports there, and realizing that you're going to fall off the wagon 100 times, and having people there to help you to get back on.

I've seen it happen where I had a young girl who was sexually assaulted over a period of 7 hours. And we go to court, and she had to write a victim impact statement. This girl was, I didn't know her level of education, was absolutely brilliant, what she wrote. And I told her you should get your Grade 12. You're a very smart girl. And that sort of planted a seed, like, "You can do this."

Through a period of, like, two years in my time in the Sex Crimes Unit, she fell off, I'd pick her up off the street. She was, you know, full of drugs. But I kept trying and kept trying. And about a year after I left the Sex Crimes Unit, she called me. And she was so happy to say she did get her grade twelve and that she had been clean. So I think to just keep at it and knowing there are people there and people care and there are resources there.

Ms. Caron makes the critical point that the advocate's tenacity and non-judgmental support could sometimes be the key to helping people to escape the sex industry.

Similarly, Leslie Spillett, Executive Director of *Ka Ni Kanichihk*, explains why she doesn't label people.

LESLIE SPILLETT: I don't differentiate, Bob, between you're a sex trade worker and you're this and you're that. That is not how I conceptualize people. They're my people. They're my relatives. They're my kin. These are my family members.

These are the remnants of great nations that have survived here. And we are—, we might be a little bit bruised and weary, but we have survived several centuries now, of pretty sustained attack on us.

And so I celebrate our survival through the people that I relate to. So, in my mind, I never see a sex trade worker. They're my relatives, and that is a very different way of relating to people. It's within a very much more culturally safe or culturally appropriate way in many ways than to categorize people by how oppression has impacted their lives.

So that's kind of how I see this. And, in that capacity, I know women that have had no choice, no choice—be it by what they understood and it comes down to where they are. How can you condemn somebody? And sometimes I give this so much thought—that people have done what they had to do to survive.

And sometimes, because we are so outside the system that wouldn't respect us in terms of the economies, I see survivors. I know that they call themselves "survivors." and I know there's no big debate over.

So if you want to stop the sex trade, you have to go back and start figuring out the structure, and dealing with the structural conditions that hold that in place.

I mean we have the United Nations that have the Declaration of Rights for Indigenous People. We have the [Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples], their rights, human rights, Indigenous rights. They're going to cost, because Canada's growing rich off of our resources and our removal from those resources.

There has to be some deep structural changes made and also social changes. But I think that if we don't change the structure, the social conditions just continue to replicate themselves and you—. Really, if those structural changes don't happen significantly, then again it's just people are going to pay a price, our people paying the price for it.

So I know that people want to take that bad girl and fix her, but I see she's not broken. Those are big things. That's kind of how I see this bigger picture working. Prostitution is intentional, the marginalization of Indigenous women, that's intentional to me, it's not an "oops." Or, it's not "Oh, what's wrong with them. They can't do this and that and the other thing." Those are intentional—that is, the poverty, structured poverty is intentional. It's not an accident.

Ms. Spillett points out that labeling people tends to limit people's view of the whole person. The larger context that Spillett describes views survivors as victims of the structural poverty they

were born into. Yet, despite being victims they are often labelled and blamed for the conditions they live in. For example, prostitutes are often viewed as perpetrators rather than as victims.

Inspector Kelly Dennison (WPS) spoke about people exiting the sex industry, noting that people need help to leave it. He makes the point that one does not wake up one day and say they want to become a prostitute; nor does one wake up one day and say “OK I am out.”

KELLY DENNISON: Well, they need help. Exiting the sex trade, to me, I liken it to somebody who’s an alcoholic, or drug addicted, or a lot of other situations they find themselves in. They don’t have the ability, once they’ve gotten to that point, whether they’ve been exploited to that point or not.

To get out of that vicious circle, they need some interventions. Someone needs to step in, offer a helping hand and give them a different path, show them a better way, experiential people, any individuals that have been there.

You don’t wake up one morning to be a prostitute. And you don’t wake up one morning to not be one anymore either. Someone, somewhere, has to step in and provide whatever it is that individual needs—whether it’s getting them into some sort of addictions therapy, whether it’s finding them housing or shelter, just getting them set up financially somehow, so that they can eat and feed themselves.

They’re not going to get out of it on their own.

Mr. Dennison calls attention to how a significant person must step in and provide the survivor with the type of support s/he requires. Kerri Irvin-Ross (Former MLA and CFS Minister) also emphasizes how there must be someone with the tenacity to stay with it, to provide the mentorship for the youth who needs it.

She explains how she has heard stories from survivors, in which they stressed that someone believed in them, giving them courage to leave the sex industry.

KERRI IRVIN-ROSS: I’ll talk about how police have continued to work with vulnerable populations, whether it’s through partnerships that they have with not for profit organizations or even if it’s for the people that officers that are in the patrol cars stop and talk to, the vulnerable people and know who the women and men are on the street, and perpetrators and predators knowing that there is a presence around them.

I think that police are only one part of that solution.

I think child welfare has a key to play.

I think employment and education. All of that it’s a collective response that we have to work on.

It might not have been the first time that that person had tapped them on the shoulder, it might have been the 20th time, but people saw something in them and didn't give up.

So, I think it's about relationships.

I think it's about ensuring safety because, you know, it's very important, and that ability to stabilize, and employment and education, and that there's a way out.

Kerri Irvin-Ross observes that the re-socialization of young women leaving the sex industry is required and that entails providing them with extensive resources and support systems.

9.4 The need for an adaptive system

A strong theme that arose from the data was the inflexibility in the system to meet the unique and changing demands of each individual. My research participants maintained that every individual is different and survivor oriented programming, if it is to be effective, must be adaptive to changing client needs. This might mean adaptability within programs, or it might mean having the flexibility within the system to move people easily between programs or for the person to be able to access multiple programs simultaneously. For example, Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymound) talked about the need for long-term wrap around approaches, as follows.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: I think longer term programming, more wrap-around services. A lot of programs are shorter term, go for a few days then you go back out, and it's quick to lose them to their previous lifestyle. So I think that programs need to be longer and more in depth at the root causes of what's going on.

What I see a lot from girls who have come to the crisis stabilization unit, rather than having the root issue as to why they're in the sex trade be addressed, they get put into rural placements which doesn't change the situation. It doesn't change how they feel about themselves, what they've gone through. So, I think there needs to be longer programming which addresses their self-esteem, self-worth, housing, all the kind of things that lead to somebody being vulnerable.

Ms. Jarosiewicz concentrates on the point that programs should get at the root causes of each individual's needs and this takes time. Some of my interviewees also noted that not only must the system be flexible, survivors must also be actively involved in making decisions on the

treatments they participate in. For example, Sheldon Beaton (RCMP EPPS) and Friedereke Von Aweden (Klinic) both mention the need to meet people where they are emotionally located.

Sheldon Beaton describes “Snow Night” at the Salvation Army, and how it allows people a reprieve from the street if only for a night. He stressed that multiple resources need to be available in situations like this, so that something useful might appeal to different survivors, depending on their requirements and where they are at.

SHELDON BEATON: Snow Night is a perfect example of how the Salvation Army—. It’s one night a year where they try to get—, the last few years I’ve been involved, there’s been about 80 to 100 people come for the night. And there’s prizes for people and pampering and that so that’s a draw, too.

But at least there’s one night to get off the street. And the resources are there whether people want to take them or not. It is hard because you’re battling with mental health issues, post-traumatic stress, traumas from back and to whenever, past sexual assaults. So it’s not like someone wants help with just one thing. I’ve always said you come and need a one-stop shop for everything.

If someone with an addiction—, if they want to—, they only stop if they want to stop. Anything from smoking or drinking to drugs, you can try and you can say it’s there, but if you are again with probation orders, if someone is forced to do rehab—.

Like, I talked one young girl once where she wanted help but she didn’t want to be forced by a court order to go there. So we actually liaise with the Crown and they said we are going to set her up, get her the help. And we did, but she thought it would be too much of a burden on her to be ordered there. She thought if she went on her own free will it would be better.

Mr. Beaton articulates the need for a one-stop shop for young sex industry survivors in one location where they have access to multiple services at the same time. This idea came up repeatedly in my interviews.

Friederike Von Aweden also notes that multiple agencies should be working together to provide the right resources for survivors.

FRIEDERIKE VON AWEDEN: I sometimes hear especially the youth telling me that you have to be cautious of social workers. You have to be cautious of some other programs with how they make choices that are deemed not appropriate by other organizations. That aspect is not appealing to them.

So if a 15-year-old wants to get pregnant, it would probably help her more to have someone work with her in those choices than someone direct her.

The other thing that I think works is the combination of several disciplines working together. So when I work at TERF I don't have to do a lot of the social work. That's all done by people that know best how to help women with resources with choices with personal safety plans on so I feel like I can just direct my care at whatever women want in terms of medical care.

The other thing that I think is really helpful is that even though sometimes we get information given that is highly disturbing and learning the fact that I guess we never pass on any information or specifics where women's partners could get incarcerated or something like that.

Ms. Von Aweden opines that women need a sense that they are in control of the direction they are taking. It is not effective to direct resources onto them if they are not part of the decision process. She is the only contributor that stressed the importance of making opportunities available for survivors to obtain all of the benefits from participating in various sports.

FRIEDERIKE VON AWEDEN: We under capitalize on women's athletics, women that are sexually exploited on their athletic abilities.

If we had more women involved in physical activities, I think that it would help their mental health. It would help their anxiety. It would help their risk for diabetes. It would probably make them stronger on the streets, and less at risk for drugs.

Introducing sports at a young age, specifically for Indigenous kids, would be huge. Making it appealing, making them realize how much potential they have because I think there's a lot of genetic potential. Yeah, I think we're not doing a great job with engaging First Nations physical activity or making it appealing.

Ms. Von Aweden highlights all of the benefits of sports and education, which should be made available with flexible hours so that survivors can take advantage of them on their own terms.

Michael Richardson (program manager at Marymound) notes some of the challenges faced by service agencies around funding. He finds, for example, that there are effective survivor oriented programs that struggle continuously to be funded by government, and he wonders why this is the case.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: Marymound is a unique organization. We have a full wrap-around service here. A kid can come to us and have services right until they're 21 years old. We have unlimited opportunities. We have specialized homes for at risk kids, kids that are involved in exploitation. We have an addictions facility. We have a crisis facility. We have an assessment and stabilization facility. We have a sexual abuse program. We have a

school. We have a number of resources here. We have behavior specialists. We have a number of opportunities to engage the population.

Some of the barriers are funding. Marymount starts every year off in the negative and that's based on the funding models that are passed down from the Province of Manitoba. The funding models are outdated, which affects the service that you can provide.

We have, when you think of 680 kids. It's a constant fight of trying to get the funding or all these hoops that you got to jump through. There's so much criteria in order to get money to actually provide the service. But then a kid dies and then you're screwed. So to be in this work is a risk to provide services. It's a risk.

Mr. Richardson astutely observes that the funding models used by government are outdated and cause important programs to start each year underfunded. Like other of my research respondents, Mr. Richardson points out that effective services exist and that we need more support and funding for those that work, such as the Marymount programs.

My research participants consistently reinforced the idea that the system must be flexible and adaptable, and one size does not fit all when it comes to the complex issues surrounding how young people are victimized by the sex industry. Survivors must have a say in their own treatment and this requires policy makers and practitioners to listen and be sensitive to their desires. My participants also stressed that services must go out of their way to be flexible in how they protect each client. We know from the participants' stories that services are not well coordinated and that survivors and practitioners often don't know all of the programs that exist or how to access them.

Leslie Spillett provided some profound and important insights into the context that this social phenomenon of sexual exploitation occurs in, highlighting the importance of seeing survivors first as human beings with dignity and value. I described earlier how my interview participants and previous research have all stressed the damage that labels can cause for survivors. For example, Amahazion (2014) notes that the literature as well as society at large,

tends to label sex industry survivors as deviants, and this does not help them. Ms. Spillett also highlights, as did Chief Ron Evans and numerous others interviewed for this research, that poverty is at the root of the lack of girls and women's lack of resilience that makes them vulnerable to succumbing to survival sex.

9.5 Key findings

The following seven prominent findings emerged from my analysis of my respondent's experiences and perceptions of what they described as the multiple and multi-layered challenges that individuals face in attempting to escape the sex industry.

First, survivor's want to help others. My respondents noted that a significant number of survivors become helpers to others trapped in the sex industry. A significant percentage of people who work as practitioners, assisting and supporting sex industry survivors, are themselves experiential survivors of sex trafficking. Survivors reported that becoming a helper and a support system to others seeking to leave the sex industry is one way of taking value from their own horrific experiences. Others reported that despite their best efforts and intentions to avoid having anything to do with the sex industry, they gravitated back into helping roles working with survivors. Survivors in particular stressed the value that people who have been trafficked can bring to assisting those young women entrapped in the sex industry.

Numerous experts I interviewed also stressed the importance of involving survivors in developing programming and child advocacy such as public awareness campaigns and trauma counseling. This is important for the credibility and effectiveness of programs, and also that they are effective and don't traumatize survivors further. Survivors who are stabilized and working in survivor-oriented agencies are well positioned to play a pivotal role in program development to

ensure that the survivors' voices are incorporated into anti-trafficking and forced prostitution programs.

Second, intervention and supports must be flexible. My interviewees emphasized that there is no one size fits all intervention and prevention approach as every survivor typically has multiple layers of issues that have compounded over a period of years and need to be dealt with. A large number of my research participants highlighted that we must guard against the tendency to essentialize or label survivors because they all have different experiences and backgrounds, and they all have different needs. This finding has important implications for developing services and programming. For example, my interviewees stressed that survivors are challenged with multiple complex issues including unresolved childhood abuse, severe addictions, trauma and post traumatic stress related to their more recent experiences. They all need different therapy approaches based on their individual characteristics.

Several of my interviewees related that severe substance abuse and addiction problems probably need to be addressed before other counseling and resources can be effective. Others might need an entirely different combination of resources. As Dianna Bussey (Salvation Army) and Sada Fenton (Salvation Army) and others said, we must "meet them where they are at" seeing every person as an individual and never succumbing to the tendency to think of them as all the same (see Wilson, 2008).

We also must consider this issue in relation to the potential tendency to view people from one cultural background as the same. My interviews revealed that sometimes a person who looks Indigenous is placed into survivor oriented programming that is centered on traditional Indigenous healing practices, when they were in fact raised in a Christian household and have no interest, at that particular time, in participating in such programming. For these reasons, my

contributors stressed that people must be treated as unique individuals. They should also have a voice in what treatment or supports they may wish to pursue. Several of my participants also stressed that not only must every individual's needs be addressed as unique, the system must be flexible so that they can change and seek different resources as their needs change.

My research participants also emphasized that most individuals attribute their success in exiting the sex industry to having a relationship with an individual rather than with a program. As several interviewees stated, most people never say they succeeded because of a program. Normally they say it was because of a specific person who tapped them on the shoulder and stayed with them, picking them up repeatedly and non-judgmentally when they inevitably fell off the wagon several times on their road to recovery. Perhaps survivor-oriented programs could be developed around this paradigm, matching survivors with individuals who could fill this multi-tasking mentorship and support role.

Third, survivors have multiple challenges and need flexible responses. My respondents argued that survivors are intersectionally challenged and require multi-layered support. A sex industry survivor is also, in most cases, a victim of childhood abuse, a severely addicted substance abuser and also possibly developmentally delayed, all the while potentially being criminally harassed by traffickers. All of these interrelated challenges require different types of support systems and the overall intervention must be coordinated expertly if it is to be effective. All of my participants emphasized the importance of having multi-modal and multi-level intervention and prevention approaches for survivors.

The coordination of all of the processes has implications for service delivery as many experiential survivors have difficulty completing seemingly simple everyday tasks. One cannot just make a doctor's appointment for these survivors and expect them to show up. As one

respondent pointed out, how can we expect these young women to show up at a medical appointment or pick up a prescription if they are homeless and do not even know what day of the week it is? If supporters do not take this intersectionality and complexity into account when dealing with sex industry survivors, they are setting them up to fail. This seemingly simple observation actually points to major structural issues that challenge a lot of people in society. How can we expect people to successfully complete training programs and keep jobs when appointments with doctors, social workers and government offices are most often set for people during their working hours, between 9 and 5PM. Why do almost all doctors keep banker's hours when it might be more convenient to provide services in the evenings? For many survivors these simple but significant challenges are compounded by childcare needs.

Fourth, escaping the sex industry is difficult. My interviewees observed that it takes most survivors repeated efforts to get out of the sex industry. For example, Kelly Dennison (WPS Inspector) recognized that a survivor doesn't wake up one day and say, "OK I'm out." It normally takes a long concerted effort to do so. Jennifer Richardson made the point that these young people get entrenched into the culture of the sex industry and that it takes time and effort for them to get out of it, and they need assistance to do so. The practitioners emphasized that to be a caring and effective helper in this field one has to be non-judgmental and just keep assisting people, even if they fall off of the wagon 20 times or more.

Based on these findings, survivor-oriented programs should be designed to provide a sense of belonging that survivors can return to if and when they relapse. One can speculate that part of the reason why most survivors suffer multiple setbacks before successfully exiting the sex industry is because treatments failed to account for complex and multi-layered challenges for each individual. The programs weren't structured in a way that allowed for survivors to obtain

the services they needed when they needed them.

My interviewees opined that most survivors walk a tightrope, only a remission trigger away from relapse, even 20 years after exiting the sex industry. They also note that when survivors work with survivors it can act as a retraumatization trigger for them. Therefore, the anti-trafficking business is dangerous for survivors to work in. Moreover, Rebecca Cook (MB Government's Child Exploitation program coordinator) mentioned that when public awareness campaigns also reach survivors it could be triggering for them. Diane Redsky and others emphasized that it is critical that survivors be involved in the oversight and design of survivor-oriented programs to ensure that they are accurate and effective, and that they are not traumatizing for survivors.

The importance of survivor input is also related to Leslie Spillett's (*Ka Ni Kanichihk*) point about how colonial programming is imposed paternalistically on Indigenous people rather than allowing them to guide and do their own healing in their own way. My participants also talked about bureaucratic constraints, challenges with government funding models and accountability requirements, and the feeling that anti-trafficking strategies are influenced too much by bureaucratic structures. This is the legacy of colonialist arrogance that Ms. Spillett described.

Fifth, relationships are critical. My interviewees highlighted that people and not programs make the difference in their eventual recovery. A significant number of my participants articulated that survivors rarely talk about how a treatment program or agency saved them; typically they name a person within an agency who made all the difference for them. Relationships are critical. My study participants pointed out that having a key person or mentor is often the recipe for a survivor successfully escaping the sex industry. Trust is critical for relationships to be effective. My respondents emphasize the importance of building trust with a

police officer, or a parent or a social worker that is trying to assist them. If the survivor does not trust the caregiver, then she is unlikely to be able to take full advantage of the assistance that is offered to her.

Sixth, escaping takes a critical event. My respondents were cognizant that it often takes a critical event to move the survivor to get out of the sex industry. A significant number of survivors and practitioners I interviewed highlighted that despite numerous attempts to escape the sex industry, many people are not successful until a critical event or crisis occurs to spur them on to make substantial changes in their lives. Of course, “critical” is a subjective term, yet the events described to me by survivors would be horrific for the average person to experience and cognitively process.

Most of the survivors I interviewed have experienced being beaten, tortured and raped, and many have friends and acquaintances that were murdered while engaged in similar activities. This finding has implications for anti-trafficking and sexual exploitation treatment programming in that it could cue the government’s implementation of special resources when survivors are observed by one of the intervening agencies as having a critical event unfold in their lives. A tragedy could be an opportunity for the intervening agencies to assist the person to commit to leaving the sex industry for good.

Seventh, resources must be accessible at the times when they are needed. My interviewees repeated the theme that resources are often not available at the time of day and day of the week when they are needed most. This is a significant problem with relatively simple solutions. Practitioners I interviewed observed that often when a survivor finally decides she wants assistance to leave the sex industry she needs certain resources that are often connected with her severe substance abuse problems, trauma counselling and other services. Then she finds

out that the services are closed at night, when her needs are most prevalent. Or she finds out that there is a wait list of days or weeks until she can get into the particular program that she requires access to. It is then explained to her that she has to be sober to get into a substance abuse program.

While I understand the rationale behind demonstrating the will power to remain sober for a period before receiving addictions counseling, the logic compares to the requirement that someone lose 50 pounds before being admitted to a weight loss program. Some people with severe addictions problems don't stand a chance of remaining sober for several weeks without serious help. Some survivors advised me that they are only alive because they were arrested and put in jail, where they started to come down from the street drugs they were self-medicating with. Having a person ask for help and then be told they have to wait seems like a tragic loss of an opportunity that could potentially save or lose a life. None of this bureaucratic inertia works for survivors with addiction problems. Prevention and intervention programs must be tailored to fit intersectionally challenged women and children, "meeting them where they are at," or they are a waste of time and taxpayer's dollars.

9.6 Conclusion

This chapter outlines the challenges faced by survivors struggling to escape the sex industry. The most salient finding is that even simple daily tasks are difficult for intersectionally challenged survivors. Every person is different and survivors all have different requirements, so each case must be taken on its own facts and merits. Ensuring that the right people are involved in intervention and prevention can make all the difference for survivors trying to escape the sex industry. Resources in the system must also be flexible and accessible for survivors. This might

be achieved by having experiential survivors involved at all levels of treatment development, from the design to the implementation.

Chapter 10- Challenges and Opportunities

“All the flowers might die, the grass might die but the thistle will live; that explains women.”
(Paige, a sex trafficking survivor)

10.1 Introduction

This chapter is dedicated to some of the specific ideas that my research participants identified around the spectrum of services and resources related to counter exploitation and sex trafficking. My contributors made numerous suggestions regarding areas that could be improved, including safe houses, more facilities for at risk youth, better coordination between existing resources and better collaboration between agencies. Here, I explore these challenges and opportunities to prevent and intervene more effectively in the sex industry.

10.2 Virtuous circles of collaboration

A number of my interviewees strongly suggested that better effectiveness could be achieved through improved cross sector collaboration, and that no one agency can be effective on its own. Political leaders and senior bureaucrats are often well placed to see how all the elements of the system fit and work together. For example, Kerri Irvin-Ross (Former MLA and CFS Minister) describes how some initiatives look more collaborative on paper than they really are.

KERRI IRVIN-ROSS: You can look at a number of initiatives that on paper look very collaborative and cooperative, but in practice, we’re not practicing it.

And I think that we need to use our resources that we have, our limited resources, and coordinate them better and make sure that we’re making a solid attempt to provide that safety net for people.

And I think that, with the initiatives we’re making around poverty reduction, the mental pieces, the supports that we’re working really hard to implement in family services around the complex kids—and those, I would say, would be our high risk kids to be sexually exploited—the better we get at serving that population, I think the fewer opportunities the predators will find victims. And that really would be my ultimate goal.

Ms. Irvin-Ross points out that collaboration among agencies is needed, on paper and in action.

Similarly, Joy Smith (former MP) stresses that the next thing we need across Canada is improved strategy and collaboration around counter exploitation and trafficking. She notes that across Canada she has not seen the kind of teamwork that is needed, in any of the provinces or territories.

JOY SMITH: Well, no matter what anybody says, the two things, education is our greatest weapon and the collaboration between all the entities. We have to get out of the silos and go into a concerted effort. And there's been no program that I've seen in this country and, you know, I've written lots of programs. I've written the National Action Plan, I've done everything. But you know this is the next thing that provinces have to do.

Ms. Smith stresses that there are a lot of programs, yet agencies still continue to operate in silos.

Furthermore, Kevin Brosseau (RCMP Deputy Commissioner) articulates that organizations must have "skin in the game," working together collaboratively while providing the frontline workers the tools they need to do their work. Here he elaborates on what is required to fight exploitation.

KEVIN BROSSEAU: You know, Bob, I think there's a lot of room within the current structures of policing to be able to improve the work. It needs a redirection or a re-profiling of some of the resources. We have to ensure that we're there, that we can be trusted, and that these aren't just words, but that those who are being exploited, those who are vulnerable can turn to the police. And the police will be able to be there.

But I don't want my guys and gals out there, young people in uniform, to be without the tools for them to be able to help those who need help. They need to be able to turn to agencies and supports that can then really step in and say, "We've got it."

This person will then be provided the opportunities that they need to be able to grow and continue to do all the things they want to do in life. To me that's a big thing. And, I think we've reached the point where there's much clarity in the law, maybe not to the extent that some want to, but taking the purchaser out of the equation is a really important piece.

The law in Canada's evolved quite extensively over the last few years due to much of the work of some great advocates, including some of those who we've talked about before. But, again, it will take a concerted effort and an all-of-government approach as well as those community leaders to all step up and say, "We've all got skin in the game here. This is about protecting our children. How do we all work collaboratively and together to be able to make sure that end goal is achieved?"

Mr. Brosseau notes that government departments must work collaboratively with community-

based agencies for better effectiveness, and that trust building is critical so that agencies and service providers earn the trust of sex industry survivors.

One survivor, Elizabeth, provides an example of how collaboration can create an effective paradigm shift in treatment delivery. She describes how one of the greatest challenges historically has been getting agencies to work together and to stop fighting each other over funding.

ELIZABETH: I'm going to use programs from New Directions as an example. When I participated in the program in [——] it was then called training employment resources for females. They figured they could take women from the sex trade and in a period of six months give us enough life skills and work skills to get us to exit the sex trade into the mainstream. Realizing that that's not a reality that most people can do, even in six years, never mind six months. The focus became Transitioned Education Resources for Females [TERF] instead. So, it evolved to the needs of the clients versus the needs of the government who was funding the program.

I think that the biggest piece was getting everybody to play nice, not competing against [each other for] funding, but working together to collaborate so that we're not repeating the same—, or reinventing the wheel, that the needs of the clients are met. It doesn't matter who's getting the funding for that. It's collaborating together as a community, working together to be able to provide this support for the women.

Elizabeth describes inter-agency collaboration between government and NGOs that allow for a shift to a more client-centered approach, meeting the needs of the clients as opposed to the convenience of the government.

Additionally, Dianna Bussey (Salvation Army) suggests that Manitoban agencies actually collaborate and work quite well together, and the creation of a “communications hub” would help agencies work better together. Here is what Ms. Bussey says about collaboration in Manitoba.

DIANNA BUSSEY: Money. So I think that's that and I don't just say everything comes back to resources and capacities, and so there is a fair bit—less in other places. I think that's why Manitoba and Winnipeg does such a good job.

We're such a tight knit community. There's really not the turf wars on things. Like, if somebody gets money to run a program, we're all like cheering them on—“Way to go!” And we are collaborative. And we really realize that this can't be tackled by one entity or

two entities. It has to be a group effort.

But it still takes time to collaborate and it still takes effort so even just the coordination of it people are doing stuff off the side of their desks, and after a while you can't really do anymore of that, right?

And so I think some kind of a communication hub would be helpful, some place that gathers all of the stuff together to be able to help with some of those responsibilities, I think, in helping each other communicate with each other, so I think that would be helpful because that's a barrier and I think that the organizations and the community is very willing with that.

Ms. Bussey articulates that financial resources could facilitate creation of a communications hub.

Ed Riglin (RCMP Sergeant) also suggests that it is critical to create a communications hub for all of the different sectors such as health, education, social work and police to meet, exchange information and create coordinated approaches to community problems.

ED RIGLIN: If money wasn't an object then we could set up places that girls could come to and feel safe, and a better environment, better than the johns and the handlers give.

We would be better ahead if we actually had money, here in Winnipeg, if we actually set up in a table like this boardroom here.

We meet up every week between all of our agencies, here is our high risk places; this is what happened this week; this is our patrolling units we were sent to this house 15 times.

There's ten kids in there, they're all doing their thing, we need to get out there and we devise an approach and do it together, everything.

One of the key issues in here that I haven't mentioned much but leads with all of these questions is there has to be the mental health component, a HUB or a joint unit if you want to call it that attacks these issues.

In addition, Liz Kaulk (RCMP EPPS) stresses the idea that more effective intervention and prevention teams could be built through collaboration, to eliminate wasted efficiency.

The communications hub suggested by Mr. Riglin and Ms. Bussey could potentially fill these interagency gaps. Ms. Kaulk notes how multi-disciplinary teams might work.

LIZ KAULK: I would love to see, for lack of a better word, not crisis teams but trafficking teams, or something where it could be integrated teams with different police forces with representation and when something happens that we could go there and actually deal from beginning to end with that situation.

Even the victim management part is from beginning to end, because it just seems to pass through so many hands.

And it's difficult then to figure it out, what have we missed and what can we do better__.

So that team of people would be great in almost any region not just one team for Manitoba, Manitoba is huge, there is lots going on all over, it needs to be like regions of teams and maybe it's not their full-time duty—

But it's something that is their responsibility to know what to do, and to help when they're called like an earth team or something.

Ms. Kaulk calls for multi-sectoral specialized teams that could respond more effectively to sexual exploitation cases.

Ms. Bussey stresses that private business partners could play a larger role in the collaboration around intervention and prevention of the sex industry. This is what she had to say on the issue.

DIANNA BUSSEY: I think wanting to see departments more than any other issue, with the human trafficking piece—it can't just live in one government department or one organization.

I think that it is something that can go across not only NGO's but the corporate world as well, and it is something that everybody can get aboard on.

It's not a tough sell but it's kind of how to manage that whole thing and manage the communication of it all, so I think that would also be something, a strategy or approach could include something.

I think that there is a way for the corporate world to get involved, whether they're Crown corporations or not, right? Just the business community is willing so I wanted to include that and then to hear from people who have certainly been there and dealing with that.

I think one of the areas is when we're trying to hear from those who have survived or for those who come forward there's a big disconnect with who's able to come forward and talk about, and who's not. And there's a huge respect for anybody who's able to talk about kind of what their experience has been.

But we also need to do that and realize that not anybody's story is the same and they're so unique and I think there's a whole group of, I know there's a whole group of people out there, they will never talk about it and part of that is because of the, kind of the shame that is a part of their lives that they left behind.

Further, Gord Mackintosh (former MLA) suggests that some work has gone on in the private sector, yet it has not been integrated with government efforts. He mentions, "We've seen engagement, a welcoming engagement from the Manitoba Hotels Association for hotel workers to watch out for what's happening." This makes sense as hotel staff are often in a position to see sex trafficking going on in the institutions they work in.

Jane Runner (TERF, New Directions) also notes the importance of learning from each other and not letting politics get in the way of partnering between agencies in all sectors.

JANE RUNNER: I think we've done a lot of work, especially in Manitoba in groups coming together and educating with one another.

So, working with the police, probation, social workers, and that does take a lot of work because you're all coming from different approaches and training on how you have to deal with the issue.

But, I think there's been a lot of work done in Manitoba where there have been great partnerships in dealing with the issue. And then, as we talked earlier about VICE even changing to counter exploitation, that whole shift; that works.

The biggest thing is building relationships. So whether it's with people in the community, with families, with people you work with, it's all about relationships. I could go on and on and on.

Everybody needs to work together on this issue, you can't segregate it, you just can't. It is effective when people work together. It's ineffective when people let politics get in the way, or differences, or if people have their own agendas.

So I think it takes that multi-spectrum approach with all agencies on board, in a collaborative way.

Ms. Runner's comments are consistent with my other interviewees regarding the need for more inter-agency collaboration.

My respondents described how units within agencies often work in isolation. One way that this manifests is when the agencies defer responsibility to others. For example, Michael Richardson (Marymount) points out that funding is a barrier when there is a lack of clarity over who holds responsibility for sexually exploited youth. He asserts how some youth fall into the cracks as agencies deflect responsibility.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: We had a kid who needs clinical services but child welfare said that it's a health problem; the health system should be paying for it.

We've got kids that are screwing up in school, in care, and don't graduate from high school because they're not school ready.

But we continue to try to put them in the school environment. But when you try to get them school ready then who's going to pay for it? Education says it's child welfare and child welfare says it's education.

Under law parents have to get their own children ready and to me that's regarding responsibilities. We have a system in place for kids to access clinical services but this is that system doesn't work for kids.

In the meantime, while we're fighting over who pays for it, kids are dying, kids still need medications, kids still need diagnosis, kids are suffering because of who wants to pay for it.

Mr. Richardson describes a game of hot potato in which everyone refuses to own the problem and troubled youth are the victims. He stresses that when a child is placed in group homes those group homes and the system take on the responsibility of parents to get them prepared for school, and this sometimes doesn't happen.

Shannon McCorry (Project Devote) has also observed this behavior. She stresses that the problem also involves multiple agencies competing with one another for limited funds, and that more attention must be given to the larger integrated picture when determining who gets funded to provide services.

SHANNON MCCORRY: I can talk a bit about barriers that I see between organizations, because there are different organizations out there doing different things. Sometimes it almost feels like, from a person who is sitting back and looking at all these resources, like sometimes they're competing with one another, and they're not necessarily working together.

I think that if we look at all these different things that are out there that we could potentially do all kinds of work together to provide a more comprehensive service to victims of sexual exploitation. I mean not everybody wants to go to this organization or not everybody wants to go to that organization, but this organization offers this and that organization offers that.

Sometimes when you look at funding as well, people are competing for funding because that's what people do. And that's what adds to the competition between different organizations as everybody's competing for funding—.

So they're looking at trying to come up with unique ways of doing things and the funders might say well this agency is doing this so we're not going to fund you for that, so another agency might not get funding but not everybody's going to fit into that agency structure or their mission statement or might not feel comfortable going there.

So I think those competing kinds of things, we can really miss the actual work and doing the work. So I think that if we maybe looked at that as a whole and then looked at maybe how again we change some funding structures and that sort of thing that can work within sexual exploitation and can also work in other areas as well.

Ms. McCorry opines that no agency offers everything and that better coordination between organizations could allow better service, and funding should be given to those that work well

with others.

Additionally, Hennes Doltze (Salvation Army) describes how the whole system might work better together in the following manner.

HENNES DOLTZE: I think a major concern is the fragmentation of services—

There's a lot of good services in the city and they do amazing work, but sometimes they struggle because it crosses over to so many areas. You have the housing unit, EIA [Employment Income Assistance] for financial support, you have trauma care, which comes from a different agency.

And I think the struggle is the fragmentation. It's hard sometimes to have this one stop shop where people can get the help they need on different levels to cover all of their needs.

So, what should be done going forward, I think, is to streamline the services and truly collaborate with each other and cut down on certain red tape that prevents people from getting the services they need when they need it.

I think that would be something with full coordination that can be achieved in the future, I would say. And that's I think where all of the agencies have to put more effort in, not that they already do but even more so a manageable level.

Mr. Doltze makes the key point that improved coordination could offer survivors better access to services and could allow those services to work better together as a system ending the duplication of efforts.

Further, Derek Carlson (WPS) comments on how philosophical differences of opinion can create a competitive environment where the ideas of the biggest bully at the table sometimes dominate the others in a process of group think.

DEREK CARLSON: There's still some barriers I guess with the organizations and the RCMP. We've been trying to break those barriers and go to these meetings and talk.

I've had some good discussions with people and at the end of the day we laugh because we have different opinions and then we leave the meeting and then we laugh that we will never I guess see that same level.

So I don't know what will change that. It's just they have their image of police and what they need to do as social groups and we have our opinions.

The biggest one is, this was brought up with the meeting with Peter McKay with social agencies like Sage House, strongly opposed for us to ever arresting a girl.

And then I addressed the Minister and told him we need that tool to save the girls and it's going to be a small percentage that we try to use that law to kick them off the streets. But it's just the social agencies they're just so strongly opposed, saying it's a violation of their rights, they're being victimized, but those social groups do not see what we see as

police, and I think that's the biggest key in why we're going to have that organizational difference in opinions. Because they don't see what we see.

They don't encounter what we encounter and they don't know that part.

They just see the little bubble in their building and talk to the girls that want to talk, but not talk to the girls that don't want to talk. So that's a barrier.

While Mr. Carlson mentions the relationship between agencies, WPS Inspector Kelly Dennison describes the difficult balance of resourcing multiple work groups within one organization, such as in policing. He also highlights in the following passage how interagency cooperation operates differently in other regions.

KELLY DENNISON: Well again, in law enforcement there is going to be barriers no matter what, whether you're dealing with exploitation or with another area of policing. At my level now, Bob, I have to deal with our budgets divisionally. I see how much money we have. I see the allocation of manpower, and obviously I would love to put another six people on counter exploitation tomorrow. But to do that it comes at a cost of something else. I think we have to be able to balance.

There's a balance that a police service has to undertake to ensure that we're effective in all areas, rather than extremely successful in one area and failing in another area.

Again. I saw this more out in Toronto and areas like that, I saw them GTA [Greater Toronto Area] and North York and all of them, they have a ton of those units all working together for the same goal.

Here in Winnipeg we're almost like an island. Because the bulk of our population and the bulk of exploitation goes on within the confines of the perimeter highway. Now I'm not suggesting sexual exploitation is not happening outside of the perimeter highway; we all know it is. But not to the extent that it's happening inside the perimeter.

So where do you go for policing? We have the RCMP obviously. The RCMP absolutely have an interest in this area. And they're doing their best, but they're having bigger problems with man power and where do they come from, where do you get people from? I think they have a couple people working on this out in D division. Two people is, well that's nice, not really sure what two people can accomplish. When you're dealing with hundreds of people being exploited in Winnipeg, two people, that's a lot of drops of water.

Mr. Dennison notes the difficult task that police leaders have in prioritizing limited resources.

Ed Riglin (RCMP Sergeant) articulates how more emphasis in policing should be placed on creating joint agency task forces to reduce working in isolation. This could potentially overcome the barriers to coordination that were highlighted by Mr. Carlson and Mr. Dennison and other interviewees. He describes how a coordination hub could work, emphasizing that

multiple sectors must be onboard, and driven by a diverse team of partners, not just the dominant ones.

ED RIGLIN: I'll be straight out on this one. Our senior managers have to sit down and put together joint forces operations.

From my experience working with the joint forces Integrated Child Exploitation unit was probably the strongest I've ever seen as far as having an effect on the targets. We were knocking down so many doors that we had to be slowed down at some point because we were exhausting ourselves a little bit.

I don't think that we and society has put enough push on this, because whether people like to admit it or not police is political as a mayor or councilor or any politics that has to do with resources. That has to do with your funding, it has to do with all of those types of things. It is not a bottomless pit, so understanding that the pie is only so big, but we can certainly slice it a little different.

So putting things together different, and each organization putting in one or two or three bodies into it, that should help the senior managements' bottom line of what they have to work with in the budget but still providing wide and diverse expertise within a joint unit. I think things like what Prince Albert has done and Brandon are just on the cusp are doing with their HUB programs where they sit around the table once a week and meet about high risk runaways, youth, problem addresses, drinking addresses, those types of things, all sitting around the table once a week and devising a plan to approach those things is the future.

It's a good vision, and they got it off to a good start and I'm hoping that type of HUB policing where we use all of our agencies sitting at the table together devising a plan, not only that but approaching the house or the targets, the people that we're going to address jointly, not just the cops knocking on the door or the social worker, going there as a team and we stay at it.

Those things will be effective because the main barrier that we have now is the silo in which we govern ourselves operationally from a policing perspective. I would imagine in social services it's not much different.

So we need to get some understanding and some education out there to our frontline about what privacy is and how privacy legislation works and where privacy legislation is superseded. For example, I'll use a simple example, people don't realize that the child and family services, that are provincial here in this province, has a clause in Section 87 that actually says it supersedes the privacy or any of that, anything. It says right in there that one act supersedes another, so legislation is there.

It's just the people that are maybe driving the bus on the case just don't understand how the laws can be used and what can be used or what it means.

Having good managers that are good and knowledgeable in their area and experienced, that's another way of doing it.

Right now with the silo way that we do, especially in our profession in policing, we're moving the right way and people can see that, but I don't think we're quite there yet.

Mr. Riglin suggests that coordination hubs could improve collaborative planning and teamwork

between people from multiple service sectors.

Some other participants, such as Christina Miller (WPS Detective) note that agencies and units often work in isolation and sometimes against each other's interests due to a lack of communication. Here is what Ms. Miller says about communication and working together.

CHRISTINA MILLER: I think, just like most police units, whether it's gang, homicide, you know, general investigations or sex crimes, the biggest barrier is communication.

We don't often share information because we want to hold it close because of mistrust, and so communication between other agencies, and within our own agency as well.

Like, I work in RCMP and if I don't go out of my way to go to 41 [Division 41 is comprised of numerous units oriented around vulnerable persons, such as Child Abuse and Sex Crimes] I lose touch with the whole unit and what's going on there.

And ViCLAS is really good that way because it's a national database and it doesn't matter if they're convicted or pardoned, we can put it on.

It can be any kind of suspicious behavior and that came about because of Paul Bernardo and lack of communication in Ontario where he was offending in neighbouring communities and nobody knew about it. Bernardo had the same MO [Motus Operendi; Latin for behavior patterns], he hadn't even switched it up. He was peeping in windows, picking up girls, doing the same things, nobody knew about it. And if they had entered it in a database they would have gone 'bing bing bing,' same description, same vehicle, same MO and same kind of sexual tendencies.

So communication, internationally and locally is a huge, huge obstacle that we have, not just in sex crimes investigation, but in general.

And maybe part of that is ego too, like 'I want to solve this; I want to do it,' but, sharing information we need to do more of; we could do better at that.

Ms. Miller recognizes that if she doesn't make an effort and walk over to a workgroup in the WPS, then she is simply out of touch with her colleagues. Making the effort to physically go and meet someone working in another unit could be a key to working smart rather than in isolation.

My study participants raised numerous issues, challenges and opportunities related to the general theme of multiple agencies working in isolation from each other. This occurs from lack of contact and effective communication and sometimes from competition over perceived scarce resources. Sometimes "group think" (Janis, 1982) can occur when the biggest bully gets his/her way, or sometimes even when a person is just competing to be recognized as the expert. All of

these challenges are, perhaps, overcome through creating an organizational culture that is warm, inclusive and collaborative where diversity of opinion is valued.

Overall, the consensus among my interviewees calls for greater collaboration, whether it be forging new teams and sharing resources, or bringing parties around the same table and widening it to include a broader range of participants to share valuable information and work together.

10.3 Transience and coordinating a piece-meal system

One of the challenges of intervening in the sex industry is the migratory, transient nature of the victims and also, in some cases, the johns. Many survivors are of no fixed address and johns often participate in buying while they are travelling, making it very difficult for law enforcement and other service providers to interact with survivors and johns. The challenges are exacerbated by the piecemeal nature of the system, and the transient behavior of people participating in the sex industry, which demands greater coordination among partner agencies.

Several of my interviewees noted that the system of resources available to sex trafficking survivors is miniscule and it is the clients who suffer. For example, Jay Rogers (Deputy Minister, Manitoba Department of Families) suggests that the needs of women and children should be considered first and foremost when coordinating resources to assist them.

JAY ROGERS: I think that my experience with this is that there seems to be a fair number of resources devoted to this issue but the responses seem to have been somewhat piecemeal over the years.

I don't think that there is a coordinated, coherent strategy to respond to this issue—.

I do think there are some resources that could be added to the system.

I think we need to look at Street Reach and how they're doing and I think Street Reach is working. But I think we need to be able to demonstrate that, so it would be good to have some evidence on the work that they do and the girls that they've helped.

I also think that we probably could use some more safe homes for girls who are victimized by human trafficking.

Mr. Rogers talked about a lack of coordination between existing services, and also that there are loopholes and pieces missing in the system and existing resources could be better utilized.

Similarly, Daphne Penrose (Executive Director of Winnipeg CFS) states that resource systems need better coordination, especially at the provincial level.

DAPHNE PENROSE: I think that right now we're beginning to look at strategies.

I don't think we're anywhere near strategies that are as effective as we could get to.

I believe that the strategy, the interventions that are offered at different NGOs and at the provincial level are effective, but they lack structure; they lack purpose; they lack objectives to fill a need that could be folded on top of each other to create a robust response to sexual exploitation.

And I don't need your job and you don't need my job.

How can my job work with your job to help that child because the focus has become not on the exploited victim—

It becomes you're not doing it as well as I can do it. And if you just give me the resources I need I can do so much better, instead of saying I see what you're doing, I'm not sure I would do it that way but I see what you're doing and here's what I can offer to the problem, and there's none of that going on right now.

Unfortunately, everybody's wearing their ego into the room every time and losing are the kids.

Ms. Penrose contends that there are too many experts, and it fails everyone when some people feel they are right and that everyone else is wrong about how to approach these complex issues.

Several of my interviewees further described how the clients/youth get lost in the bureaucracy, shuffled between agencies, and that people working within various offices, often, only know their own organization's mandate, so they are unable to coordinate with others to find the most effective response for sexually exploited youth. For example, Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount) describes how children become lost between agencies because of inefficiency, lack of knowledge, and communication.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: I think when it comes to working between organizations, if we could do it that would be great.

There's tons of different programs and I think there's a lack of everybody knowing what's out there and how can we work together to provide the best service for the youth or the women.

At the same time though the organizations, they're fighting for the same resources a lot of the times. So there's a lack of cohesion between organizations. I've heard a lot too, oh you're at Macdonalds [MacDonald Youth Services], you're not eligible for services here [Marymound]. I see that often.

For me personally being on the crisis unit, we get kids for a short period of time, three to five days, so that's definitely a barrier in itself.

A lot of times we get information about a girl if she's made a disclosure that she's being sexually exploited then we pass it onto the police, or social worker and everyone involved then don't really know what goes on after that so it would be nice to be able to see what is going to happen rather than just moving her to a new place. That was pretty much everything we had, in terms of opportunities.

There's a lot of services out there we just need to work together and it would be nice if there was almost a centralized list or at least knowledge of the programs that are out there and what we can do for the kids.

Ms. Jarosiewicz highlights that many workers do not know all of the services readily available to them. Second, she mentions that practitioners are sometimes biased and don't wish to work with certain other agencies. It seems there is much need for training to make practitioners aware of treatment resources that they could draw on for their clients. Further, she argues that there is a real need for overall coordination of an intervention strategy that triages the cases in order to make the system more client centered rather than piecemeal.

For example, Diane Redsky, (*Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre*) notes the need for higher-level coordination, including public awareness, regulation and coordination of a safety net of service agencies for high risk youth.

DIANE REDSKY: Well, like Manitoba has a provincial strategy to work within.

We have a provincial department called the Sexual Exploitation Unit, and in a perfect world, when there's good people that work there, that work with community, it was really strong.

It's a little sidetracked right now but we'll get it back on track.

So when that's going well, then there's lots of coordination at the community level and at the government level and it's all kind of a working machine. And that works as long as that's working well.

I would say the best thing that could happen is if we actually pulled off a simul, I can't say that word properly, a whole bunch of things happening at the same time where we're doing public education, we're going after the demand and we have the service safety net.

I believe that if we can make drinking and driving not cool, smoking not cool, like in

my generation, we can make buying women for sex not cool.

It just, it takes a combination of laws, public education and awareness, stories, prevention programs. It was a whole concerted effort of everybody and that's what we hope our coordination centre will play a role in.

Even at the local level, let's pick some communities that are like, "nobody's buying sex in here, our boys are not wanting it and our girls are not putting up with it," and you know, "we're a community that does not have sexually exploited women."

The other thing is that I've always hoped, and I tell every media reporter person one of these days I wish somebody would do follow the money. That would be another dream of mine.

Let's really put a spotlight on the sex industry and identify everybody in the industry who profits off the sexual exploitation of women.

There's cabs, there's hotels and just how incestuous that whole thing is.

And if we could paint that picture for people then I really do believe that they would understand that this is not an individual woman who is consenting with no free will and that these are two consenting adults.

There is just so many other people who profit from that woman's sexual exploitation and it's certainly not her alone in that. So that would be my two big wishes.

Ms. Redsky is fully aware of the need for the multi-level synchronization of services, public education and the training of personnel. Some define this type of multi-faceted harmonization around social problems as collective impact (Chrislip, 2002; Byrne & Keashly, 2000). While they are not always calling it "collective impact" they are indeed recognizing a need for greater coordination and collaboration between interrelated parts.

Several of my respondents stressed the need for more national, as well as local, coordination. For example, one survivor, Marie, noted that greater national coordination could accommodate better safe housing for survivors who are trying to escape the sex industry.

MARIE: I think once we know the kids are exploiting themselves there should be a process of getting them out of the city and getting them into treatment, treatment that will heal them from the trauma of being sexually exploited because it's just like molestation.

It changes the way that you think, it changes the way that you see yourself in society, it changes the way that you think that people see you.

So it's a whole breakdown of who you are on the inside and that I think it takes a lot longer to recover from than the actual work is the damage that's done to your thoughts and your mind and your spirit.

So, for me I'd like to see them all go to a camp or have specialized programming for kids that've been sexually exploited

I think that it would be nice to have a global network of transition housing and a

global network of service providers throughout the country.

Because some of our ladies are transient and they are going from province to province, right?

So I think it would be helpful to know that if they leave Manitoba and say go to BC for some reason, they can let us know that they are alive and well. It might even lower the list of missing and murdered women.

So, that would be my goal is to see a Canada-wide service that provides first second and third stage housing.

Similarly, Darryl Ramkissoon (WPS Sergeant) identifies the need for both provincial and national strategic coordination in anti-trafficking and sexual exploitation of children and youth.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: We almost need a central place like the Polaris Center in the USA, so if we deal in Winnipeg with a trafficking victim we can deal with counterparts in the unit where the person is from and coordinate responses—.

We need a provincial coordinator or national coordinator so these things don't fall off the table—.

We try our best and we do have communication with other vice units or human trafficking units across Canada, but when it comes down to actually providing assistance to the victim after the fact, it kind of falls off there and that's when they really need support, in order for us to get good convictions and stuff with them we need to maintain good rapport with them or else charges get stayed, they get frustrated.

Hopefully if it's not a lifestyle they somehow get drawn into it so we need to see it from start to finish.

Non-police agencies to help with the resources and help coordinate the resources more. So, like as far as the investigative part—.

I think all police agencies do a good part to that point, but to make sure it goes through the justice system and even after that, we kind of fall short of that you need resources.

I don't know if we can have a provincial coordinator or across Canada coordinator to keep track of that, because it falls off, it does ya know, fall between the cracks and stuff

Mr. Ramkissoon describes the challenges of working across different regions, and how a national coordination center might help that particular effort.

In addition, Christine Kun (WPS Detective) emphasizes that national level coordination of an effective anti-trafficking and sexual exploitation intervention strategy is required because some offenders travel nationally, or internationally, and police agencies need to be able to work together to track and prosecute them to the full extent of the law.

CHRISTINE KUN: I think in terms of policing, putting our resources in an efficient,

effective way, and coordinated way, is important, and I think that we're moving in that direction.

I think that funding that supports coordination, communication for the long term, because this isn't something that is just going to go away.

If anything that I've learned from working in ViCLAS is that we have transient people that move all over the globe and to be able to catch or track these individuals who are committing these crimes we need to be coordinated with other agencies, we need to have that communication and if we are willing to invest the money, again in a collaborative, informed way, then I think we can be very successful. But I don't know, because I don't work in that area now and it's changed possibly since when I worked there.

We have to justify a lot of that. And through electronic means we don't need to necessarily be able to fly all over the globe in order to do that. But to have a coordinated effort that goes beyond just Manitoba. We know that our offenders that are here are also committing crimes in Calgary, in BC, it's Canada-wide; it's not just Manitoba.

And although the focus is on Indigenous women it's not just Indigenous women. We have an issue with violence.

And we have an issue with domestic violence, and just how we value our communities, communities within communities, you know, people within communities value each other.

So if money was no issue, it's throwing it at the communities but also collaboration, at least Canada-wide if not North America—you know, and opportunities to learn from people in the States or to learn from other agencies, seeking out training opportunities that maybe even don't cost money.

Ms. Kun recognizes the transient nature of the sex industry and how better national coordination is required. INTERPOL could work with local police agencies to attack the global sex industry.

Joy Smith also mentioned that cross border sex trafficking happens at a much higher level than even law enforcement agencies in Canada realize.

Some of my participants pointed out that formal structures and processes, such as the acts controlling the sharing of information, hamper coordination between agencies. For example, WPS Superintendent Bill Fogg (ret.) describes how communication and compartmentalization are often both barriers to effectiveness within organizations.

BILL FOGG: Well communication's always a barrier within organizations and a barrier between organizations.

One of the biggest problems is even inside of our organizations. We're compartmentalized. So the Child Abuse Unit does child investigations. The Sex Crimes does adult sex crimes investigation. If you go back a little bit, our Morals Unit dealt with morals.

So what it depended on is the relationship between the people running those units, whether there was enough information sharing or cooperation. And we've been fortunate in the last couple of years, but generally speaking, we've had good functioning relationships.

You need to formalize those. So an example is when we brought the Morals Unit and the Missing Person Unit to become part of the Anti-Exploitation Unit. That's the kind of collaborative piece. We can afford to do more of that.

But we can also—, you know, we don't have to reorganize the organization in order to work effectively together. But you do need to formalize the systems so that process is to make sure that people know that that's what's expected, and to be able to measure what you're doing effectively. You know, were heading in that direction as a police agency. You know, the Smart Policing Initiative, that's what it's meant to be about. But we really need to grow some legs in that direction.

My study participants, in particular practitioners such as Bill Fogg, asserted the need for increased communication at all levels, internally within organizations as well as between organizations, locally, provincially, nationally and internationally.

My interviewees mentioned that providing a safety net for vulnerable youth requires greater coordination of all available resources at the government's disposal. Many young survivors face challenges of homelessness. Kelly Holmes described as follows, one innovative idea for creating underground railroads and escape paths for youth who are in danger.

KELLY HOLMES: I think underground railroads need to be set up, for a lack of a better way of putting it. I think we need an underground system for these youth to be able to flee.

It is constantly changing and moving, very much like an underground railroad.

We had one from the north for domestic violence cases. Something similar should be happening here.

I think there needs to be more 24/7 and safe spaces in every town, and multiple ones in the city, in different neighbourhoods.

I also think, based on our migration of kids coming from the north, from the south, and some of our travelers and stuff, I call it, for lack of a better way of explaining it, is just like a 911 or 311. There should be like an 811 for youth going, "I have no idea where I am, and I don't know where I'm staying tonight." And immediately there's a way for them to get picked up and taken to somewhere safe, immediately. So I feel like those kind of safety nets aren't in place.

Ms. Holmes has worked with homeless and troubled youth for over 25 years and has a lot of innovative ideas, mainly about how to make the systems of resources available to these youth more effective. She describes the importance of setting up escape routes and providing safe

places for high risk youth to live. In the following extract, Ms. Holmes suggests that an emergency phone line should be set up by the provincial government, so that practitioners and youth could call for help at any time of day or night.

KELLY HOLMES: We don't need anything new.

We've just got to get smarter at the way we're doing things.

And I feel like all of us have our burdens within our own system of why we're not doing that.

And often its time and administration that is garnered up by some intelligent person in a white ivory tower that is figuring this all out for us, and not understanding what we need to do on the street—

I don't need to be doing paperwork when there's kids bleeding in my doorway.

And I don't know what it's going to, I mean I get accountability, I get all of those things, but I think that there could be a way that we could make sure we're part of that and do the work that we're designed to do.

Ms. Holmes stresses that the anti-trafficking and sexual exploitation intervention and prevention system doesn't need new resources. Instead, there must be better coordination of resources that already exist, and vulnerable youth in the street need a lifeline to call for immediate help.

10.3.1 Aging out: Less resources for adults

My participants commented strongly with respect to the lack of resources available for adults who are caught up in the sex industry. They highlight that services that are available for youth disappear as they turn 18-years old and “age out” of the child welfare system. Jane Runner (TERF) provided the following insights on “aging out” of the child welfare system.

JANE RUNNER: There's lots of money put into child welfare, to foster beds, to all sorts of things, then as adults, you know 18 really isn't a magic number and life just continues for a lot of people with less possibilities and opportunities.

It's unfortunate that services just aren't as heavy and available for once you turn 18. And that's why CFS they are doing a lot more extension of care for the kids that are in care. So that does help.

And what we're seeing a real increase of, even since when I worked here in the 80s. A lot of the youth and adult women we worked with weren't as disabled as they are now, so things have really changed— because they have IQs below 70 and they're out on the street. And they can't make decisions, or they don't have the ability level to sort things out.

Ms. Runner highlighted that 18 is not a magic number and, in fact, means something different for

each individual, especially when one considers developmental and mental health issues that many youth suffer with.

Hennes Doltze also comments further on the substantial differences between the systems of resources available to youth as opposed to adults.

HENNES DOLTZE: I think at this point what is maybe lacking on a community wide perspective is a comprehensive anti-exploitation strategies for adults.

The strategy that was put in place for youth, Tracia's Trust, I think is very effective and has done, and has accomplished great things and I think something similar to help adults and to really have multi-faceted multi-agency strategy is needed in that way.

Like I mentioned before, the fragmentation hinders people in a lot of ways from exiting.

Funding is always an issue, I think that's, you know something that individual agencies struggle with.

For example, for more community living models or places where people can actually live, have safe housing and be given the supports that they need opportunities and a really comprehensive service that is focused on the specific population that is generally the most vulnerable.

This one stop shop support is something that hopefully can be worked on in the future.

Every agency that I know and that we work with tries their best but there's certain limitations in funding and limitations in the mandate that these agencies try to fulfill, and sometimes is a challenge to, for the individual in the organization.

Both Ms. Runner and Mr. Doltze note that there is a lot of concern and resources placed into youth care, yet once these young people turn 18 it is suddenly a very different story.

My research participants observed that increasing numbers of survivors of the sex industry struggle with mental health issues, operating psychologically and socially at younger ages than their biological years suggest. Commonly they are abused and traumatized, never having had the opportunity to just be children and grow up normally. For example, Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount) described how numerous exploited youth are developmentally delayed with respect to normal life skills.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: In the last year I can only think of one girl that was on an extended stay due to sexual exploitation disclosure that came out and even that was just a seven day stay and then they had found her a rural placement. Which I definitely think

does help but in the end the kids just got to find a way to come back to Winnipeg—.

So in the end it's almost backwards in itself because it's not helping the child as to why they are involved in this it's just moving them physically and not addressing the true issues.

I think a lot of children that I work with are developmentally a lot younger than they really are.

And unfortunately I think our system, it's just sort of ok you're 18, you're 21 now you're on your own. And a lot of the kids don't really get those services that they need.

And a lot of the times they are still unstable at 17 and still don't have a placement and still don't have any life skills and no means to get a job.

A lot of times we lose those girls to that kind of lifestyle and they end up being in gangs, and they don't make money and have no way to live.

We can create a lot more programs to help these kids to prevent them from aging into that lifestyle.

Lack of life skills noted by Ms. Jarosiewicz seems to occur along with untreated mental health issues.

Jay Rodgers (Deputy Minister of Families) advised me that most if not all of the 20 or more child welfare agencies operating in Manitoba have legal provisions to continue providing services after a client turns 18. However, most of those agencies choose not to use that authority (personal communication, 14 June, 2016). Additionally, Michael Richardson (Marymount) observes that it is untenable that youth are made to jump through a number of insurmountable bureaucratic hoops in order to gain an extension of resources once they turn 18-years old.

MICHAEL RICHARDSON: In child welfare the kids can get an extension of care till they're 21, but in order to get that extended they have to jump through a number of hoops.

And we're asking kids that are highly addicted with low cognitive function issues to jump through hoops in order to continue to be in services, and that's, to me that's backwards in a way.

You can't get an extension in care for a kid that's exploited, but we know that we need to be involved with kids that are exploited a little bit longer because they missed out on life, and want to build a life.

We find kids right at the end of their time in the child welfare system, just starting to realize the opportunity and before they exit the system they don't get the proper [education] scales, or the proper mental health services that they need.

We've missed the transition period to actually have a kid for those services. I think the continuum of services need to start looking at, I don't know what the answer is but it just seems like we're constantly we're a day late.

Mr. Richardson points out that youth addictions counseling and other services must be provided on a continuum. He also notes that it is asking the impossible for youth with all kinds of problems to navigate bureaucratic obstacles in order to have their child welfare benefits continued past the age of 18. Mr. Richardson said, “Well sometimes I feel that there is no real commitment to these kids, they’re just, I don’t think that there is enough commitment to understanding the issue.”

Several of my participants highlighted that a major barrier for youth occurs when they turn 18-years of age. It is clear from the interviews that adults face similar challenges as youth with trauma and substance abuse issues, as well as even worse structural challenges accessing services. This is an important issue, as the number of exploited and trafficked people with mental health challenges seems to be increasing.

10.3.2 Knowledge of resources and program availability

Several of my contributors pointed out that a particular challenge for front line service providers is the fact that no one knows all of the relevant resources that are available. Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount) underlines the need for more knowledge about what resources exist.

CHELSEA JAROSIEWICZ: We think we’re kind of on the right track with the SEY [Sexually Exploited Youth] coalition.

With that being said, I mean within Marymount there’s only three or four people that go to that, and the discussions normally get shared, so I’m thinking my staff most of them probably don’t even know that this Coalition exists.

I don’t know what resources are out there.

We’re working with a girl and she’s telling us that she is sexually exploited and I think the staff need to know where can we help send this girl, what phone numbers can we give her and offer her in that moment.

I kind of get that too from managers and people that go there.

Yeah, I think if there could be some sort of, I don’t know if it’s a database or a program online.

And I know there’s a few that just give us different phone numbers that can offer different programs and actually specify ages and any kind of things that offer qualifications that the girls need to have in order to go there—.

But I think it would be really good to have that information for the frontline staff who has a lack of training and knowledge, especially with these sort of deep issues that sort of only come with experience.

So I think that would be really important there is definitely some people who have the awareness of these programs but there is also people who don't.

Kirt Chapko (WPS) mentions multiple similar issues. He stresses, as follows, that practitioners need a central contact location that they can call for immediate assistance.

KIRT CHAPKO: One of the things that I always tell a lot of the people we deal with and a lot of the organizations is, I think as a service we need to, I guess connect more with resources that are available.

I always tell people that, if people ask what my partner and I do, like other agencies or what-not, and we say, well we're on the street and this is what we do and we try and talk to girls.

But I always say that we, the Winnipeg Police, don't offer any resources, we don't have anything, and that's fine.

I'm not saying the police should get into the resource end of what happens. But what we do is we advise, and try and put them in touch with the different organizations that can provide them with the resources that they need.

I think we need to form possibly better relationships with certain organizations that can cater to the needs of the people we deal with.

Mr. Chapko notes that practitioners don't need to own the resources; however, they do need to know where to find them. Improving service providers' awareness about existing resources can only benefit all of the existing programs.

Some of my research participants also talked about resources that are sometimes not available at the time when they are needed. For example, Kaitlin, a survivor, talked about a great program that was only available to her for limited hours during the day.

KAITLIN: There is Sage house, that does help, but maybe they could do a lot more, cause they're only open in the daytime and all the action happens at night.

And there are girls who have no place to sleep.

They have improved a bit, never used to smudge now they do, I noticed a lot of my friends go to sweats and get connected with their inner selves, I have not been doing that but when I do I feel better.

A lot of girls if they see a cop they run, they are scared.

Not all cops are assholes. Officer Phil used to harass the shit out of me in a good way and then walk me home.

I don't know, more programs, more treatment centres, more centres that have

counselling therapy, making people more aware of addictions.

I know if I wasn't addicted to crack I wouldn't have gone out there and did that. If I had been more aware, no one told me, I grew up seeing my mom do that so I thought it was normal, make people more aware.

Kaitlin makes an important observation that echoes some other participants of this study; that services are not available at night when they are needed.

Similarly, Liz Pilcher, WPS Superintendent, also notes the challenges of not having resources available when they are needed. She suggests that the system requires a place where practitioners can call at all hours of the day or night to access information and services.

LIZ PICHER: I think resources; we spoke about this a bit earlier that even our Counter Exploitation Team—there is a lack of resources where they can actually you know, pin point some area to go to or call 24/7.

I know that there is some programming out west and we had one case where we had to get some temporary funding because we didn't have the funding to send somebody to an addictions place to help women in the sex trade, to exit it.

So I think what would be access to local resources, access to funding and access to resources that would be readily available to help people exit.

I know there's a lack of housing and just sort of a system where we can refer somebody and they can actually help somebody exit the sex trade.

We do know that a lot of our sex trade workers are addicted. Some of them, very few are in it for survival where they have families.

We did have a recent case though where this lady thought that the only way that she could make ends meet was going to work the streets again, she connected to our Sexual Exploitation Unit who actually took her to an Indigenous resource center who helped her out because she had no money for rent or food. Although those are rare cases, most of them are drug addicted.

I think that would really assist if we could do something with housing, addictions and mental health issues.

Ms. Pilcher also points out that the need for access similarly extends to other regions in the Province.

Friedereke Von Aweden (Klinic) stresses that these intersectionally challenged survivors often have difficulty in accessing the most basic services. She explains that often these seemingly simple tasks are difficult to complete due to personal issues and challenges such as transportation and childcare. I found this when I conducted my field research. Appointments

were missed and rescheduled and some interviews were never completed. Ms. Von Aweden explained these challenges as follows.

FRIEDEREKE VON AWEDEN: I'm just looking at the medical piece, the one thing that is the biggest barrier to women accessing care is that their lives are so chaotic that it's impossible for them to make an appointment, so appointments don't work.

You have to place yourself in their path and you have to offer services in a safe environment so that women accessing a walk-in clinic can be hopeful, but it is not always sensitive to their needs.

Becoming a client of the primary care clinic where you have to have a home, a phone in order to make appointments does not work for women involved in the sex trade or being sexually exploited with addictions.

Even for me sometimes at work if I ask someone to just get medications from the pharmacy down the road it does not happen because for variety of reasons it's a big barrier.

So, comprehensive services under one roof is helpful, placing services in situations where women already are—.

I do think that very small incentives like women getting meals, women getting bus tickets, at TERF its almost seems like some of the supporters are grooming women in order to reconnect with TERF if they've fallen off so if someone calls someone to go out for lunch they actually re-engage again. I think those are all helpful, broader perspective in harm reduction.

I think what helps, TERF is working closely with this supports or for Dream Catchers having close ties with Mandy and Kim is very helpful, having their insight is helpful, sometimes PHIA doesn't help but and I feel like it's always a slippery slope.

Ms. Von Aweden's observations illustrate the survivors' intersectional challenges that are constructed within a paternalistic, colonial framework; attend this office at this time or lose the benefits. Instead, services must be tailored to the clients' basic human needs.

In addition, Kelly Holmes (RAY) describes that jails are often used where other more appropriate resources are not available. She did rationalize that homeless youth often benefit from being detained for a few days in jail as at least they will eat and sleep. However, there's no plan in place upon their release.

KELLY HOLMES: I think we've done some good work there under Street Reach.

Stop going down the wrong road, it's going into criminalization which is further sort of incapacitating our efforts.

We've done 24/7, that's good. Harm reduction is good—.

Where I see opportunities that we're not, we in community see it because we're savvy around what's existing in terms of resources, and we build on that, and we do it in a quiet

way that's under, sort of, not wraps, but we don't have any way to market what we know. Marketing is not a part of our funding structure.

For example, there's a like, the ER right now has what's called EDVIP, which is the Emergency Department Violence Intervention Program. And so, I mean, we should have that in every ER. That's a real opportunity to network and work together and make sure that kids have everything from bed utility in the hospitals that are saturated and overburdened to getting kids to where they need to be. It's a part of our safety net, it's a part of the giant weave we're trying to do in a safety net.

I think we have a real opportunity with justice. I've seen kids that are completely out of control, mental health wise, with a few weeks, or couple months in remand they're in great shape. They've eaten, they've slept, they've had medical attention.

How come, how can't we plan better so that we're planning their exit? So we're not exiting them into homelessness. So that we're not exiting them into vulnerability or back into the drug scene, or back into being exploited.

So exit planning, I think, is a real opportunity we all have.

And I think it's not just the justice system, it's child welfare, it's addictions places as well.

I think we have another opportunity to map, to do some mapping around our services and our expertise. We do this organically at the community level. I know who to call about gangs. They know who to call about homelessness. I know who to call about cultural stuff. You know what I mean? We all know what each other's bringing to the table.

Unfortunately, no one at the police headquarters has the same level of knowledge which I think would be hugely helpful from any new cadet, all the way up to the long-in-the-tooth sergeant, you know, that needs to go, where the hell do I stick this kid, I've been driving around all night, I have nowhere to put them.

Ms. Holmes notes that people in the justice system often do not have the same level of knowledge about child welfare and addictions resources that are available and who the other practitioners in the community are. It seems that there are disconnects between systems. Perhaps this indicates an opportunity for training and information sharing between people in all of these other systems.

Kelly Holmes pointed out the need for better coordination of effective addictions, anti-gang and safe housing resources that already exist. Additionally, Mandy Fraser (Klinic) also stressed that the government must expand existing resources so that there are more outreach and frontline workers on the street physically assisting vulnerable people.

MANDY FRASER: Well I also think things like Street Connections, like having the van go out.

I think that there's some experiential women involved in that kind of work. But definitely like community members, you know, who are plain clothed and accessible and just real people who have maybe you know, been street involved in some capacity.

I think that's important. And yeah, just handing out tangible, like physical things that can save lives and protect against, you know STIs and communicable infection and stuff like that.

So, more resources need to be put into that, because I know that frontline workers burn out a lot, again because you're working with life and death, you know?

Sometimes services are not available to the survivors due to impediments within organizational structures, such as long wait times, and sometimes due to the fact that people aren't aware of what programs exist or how to access them. These are all issues that could be addressed in a coordinated overall strategy.

10.4 It's a rock and a hard place: There are no shelters

A prevalent theme that emerged from these interviews was the need to provide more safe housing for people in the sex industry for safe refuge and to access services. For example, Marie is a survivor who summed up these needs as follows.

MARIE: I guess just that I think people need to realize when it comes to CFS, not that CFS is always bad, you know what I mean, there's times when kids in care really needed to be removed from the home, but if you're talking about kids that are running away from their group home because they don't want to stay there because they could be getting bullied by other kids in the group home so they run away and they become exploited. That's no reason to lock up a kid in a 10-day facility. Cause what happens they just let them loose and it's a revolving door.

There's no fixing their broken souls, so they just keep getting more damaged, more damaged and every time they get locked up or every time that they're on the street that's another chance for someone to turn them into a crack head, another chance for someone to shoot them up, or rape or whatever—.

And I think CFS needs to acknowledge the fact that their practices are creating a second generation of homeless and sexually exploited youth.

Forty six percent become homeless within six months of aging out and what happens? They do survival sex, right? They enter the sex trade.

It's a rock and a hard place, there's no shelters for women who just want to exit, there's only shelters for domestic violence, which is well needed right?

But there needs to be transitional housing, there needs to be a place for these women to go, especially if they're transient cause then they're going to do survival sex. They're

going to do whatever it takes to have a warm place to stay, especially in the winter.

Marie mentioned that survivors engage in selling sex as a means of surviving day-to-day, and lack of housing can drive them quickly into survival sex just to get in out of the cold.

Most of my respondents also commented about the importance of creating more safe houses for survivors trying to quit the sex industry. For example, Darryl Ramkissoon (WPS) talked about not being able to find emergency shelters for women when it is needed.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: Based on my experience, poverty makes them more prone to be exploited.

We have a huge problem with child poverty and it makes them vulnerable; eliminating that would help prevent exploitation.

We need more resources out there; we need an immediate safe house.

The laws we had before were dated and striking them down created an opportunity.

The theme across Canada was to legalize it but that only helps part of the problem. They also need protection.

I told the Prime Minister and Peter Mackay that Winnipeg is unique. We need laws to protect vulnerable people. We need some laws to deal with street level prostitution.

I was in favour of having some legislation giving power to police to get sex trade workers into programs. Luckily the new legislation allows for some enforcement and it is up to police agencies how they use that.

Mr. Ramkissoon highlights the fact that the police need powers to apprehend vulnerable people in need of protection and bring them to safety. This is a theme that came up repeatedly among my participants, particularly in the police sector.

Similarly, Jane Runner (ED TERF) described how safe housing could empower survivors so that they can leave the pimps behind, get control of their lives, and leave the sex industry.

JANE RUNNER: When you talk about sexual exploitation, I tend to focus in on youth.

Oh absolutely, we need more; housing's crap here in the city.

So, two things: good, supportive, safe housing and transitional housing for adult women and you know, we still have Sage House, unfortunately their building didn't fall up to code so they had to go over to the Vineyard and borrow some space there. But if they had the ability to be 24 hour, I think that would be very supportive for the adult population.

I have adult programming here, so it's not just youth. We have a classroom for adults; that's more day programming, but I think it's the housing issue that's kind of the biggest thing, cause again people need to feel safe and secure in a home that people aren't going to come in and do whatever.

Ms. Runner points out that survivors need safe housing before they can move ahead and benefit from participation in programs like schools.

Joy Smith (former MP) also advocated for providing more safe houses for survivors wishing to escape the sex industry. Here is a comment made by Joy Smith on the topic.

JOY SMITH: To have safe houses and places where they can go and where they can become rehabilitated. That's one thing. And where they can get the services they need.

The next thing, is to implant a public awareness program across this country that prevents this, because Manitoba cannot be isolated from the rest of Canada. That's not the way human trafficking works.

They have routes, you know. We have a route from Winnipeg to Sault Ste. Marie, down into the States. That's one route. Another route is through Saskatchewan, Calgary and Montreal - that's another route.

And we need to collaborate and also cross borders, collaborate to intercept those routes.

You know what, and people have to be aware that the predators are not stupid people. You think we use social media?

Ms. Smith stresses that Manitoba is not isolated from the rest of Canada, and national coordination is needed to intervene to shut down trafficking networks that cross Canada. She also stressed the need to provide more safe houses where survivors can be rehabilitated.

Ashley, who is a survivor, also noted the importance of providing safe houses that are long-term and fully resourced.

ASHLEY: If money was no object the best thing that could be done is to have more voluntary long-term rehabilitation centres for women and girls who have been exploited, where they can learn life skills, boundaries, healthier relationships and learn how to believe in themselves again.

It can take a long time to learn from the trauma and they need reliable support.

I'm part of something right now, the North End Women's Centre on Selkirk Avenue. They have several second stage transition houses, and they are in the midst of doing their proposal for the government of Manitoba for five-year funding or exactly that, and I'm on their advisory board for that, and did my proposal letter to be on it. So hopefully that will come out— my impact statement, because I was in the group and it was really a life saver for me.

And I was in that relapse prevention program group and that is where I learned all those things like life skills, and boundaries, what values were, what morals are. I was still 15 in my education, right?

A safe place for these women to live so that they can start to rebuild their lives so that they could have someone to support them and to plant the seeds and to believe in them so that they could believe in themselves and you know show them that they can do new things and be a safe place for them to live like offer a one year or two-year program, right? Until they're on their feet.

This is a positive finding relayed by Ashley of the importance of having survivors' input in program development.

Moreover, Patricia Haberman (Marymount) has found that if safe housing is not available to survivors they often wind up going to unsafe places. She describes an innovative idea of having block parent type places that high risk youth could go to.

PATRICIA HABERMAN: I had two young ladies in my house that they go to the same sort of address as their street family.

But we know that these are not places of safety for them and they are at high risk in these places. But there they feed them, they'll give them cigarettes, drugs, it's all part of the exploitation thing.

So if we can have buildings everywhere with neon signs, this is your safe place. The Block Parents, things like that, that the girls know if they're in danger we can't come pick them up, they can just walk to the Block Parents signs and just say please let me in and phone the police.

Safe places for these kids to go; I think a lot of times; I can give you a perfect example; this just happened this past week. One young lady was waiting to get into treatment, so we're trying to keep her occupied every day, and she still has the window open she still wants to go so we're like ok we're showing her its beautiful and it's this and it's that and she took up the other night and she knew if she came home that Street Reach would pick her up and take her to HRV CSU [High Risk Victims Crisis Stabilization Unit at Marymount will hold them for 3 days]—.

So she went to her street family's house, because then she won't get locked up so that says a lot, they don't want to get locked up but they want some place safe to go— and I get that.

This call for more safe refuge was a powerful theme that arose constantly in the interviews.

Survivors and practitioners from all corners of the multi-disciplinary counter exploitation and anti-trafficking system are all calling for the need for government to provide more safe housing for young girls on the street. Ms. Haberman's description of the survival mode that many of the young ladies are operating in is an eye-opener because it forces one to understand that people are

going to sleep somewhere, and if safe housing is not available, there are predators out there who are more than happy to provide it for them.

Karen Harper (Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs) noted that more safe houses and programming are required for young people fleeing the sex trade, yet within those environments it is the people and relationships that are most important. Ms. Harper describes a story shared with her by a survivor that echoes the stories provided by most of my study participants.

KAREN HARPER: We had a survivor travel with us and willing to share her personal story. One of the things that she said is it's not the programs that change people, it's the relationships that change people, and that has just stayed with me very much so.

It is so true because that's who we've been, we've been raised within our family circle, the community circle, and so I've been encouraging them that we all have a role to play in that of the responsibility of protecting our women, girls, youth.

And again any kind of tools that are out there that would help them with that, a big dream, we need more safe houses.

Again, whether they're traditional or faith based because there is both, we have four shelters in Manitoba, one south and three up north.

I think a home setting filled with staff that are trained in different aspects of counseling, your medical health, support people, kind of same concept of a big sister, big brother home, volunteers. Just very welcoming because I think we know it takes quite a while to build any kind of trust.

Ms. Harper described the ideal safe house as a fully resourced home with medical services, counseling, spiritual healing components, and people to support the survivors.

My research participants talked about the need for the government to provide safer refuge and transitional housing for survivors in order to furnish them with a structure and a safe place, so they can take advantage of all of the resources and programming that is available to them. For example, Hennes Doltze (Salvation Army) notes that safe housing is the first basic requirement before other basic human needs can be addressed (see Burton, 1980, and Maslow's hierarchy of needs, Maslow, 1954). He stresses that survivors need a safe place, and it also has to involve non-judgmental support and a range of other services including trauma and spiritual care. It must

be a place that creates a routine for people because, as Mr. Doltze points out, without a routine it is too easy to relapse into previous self-destructive behavior patterns.

HENNES DOLTZE: A lot of the people struggle to find safe housing. It's supportive and non-judgmental relationships they need, just in order to be able to access other services.

A lot of it is trauma care and even spiritual care for the healing that needs to take place, because I think that the people that are involved in the sex trade, there is a lot of baggage that they carry and they struggle from day-to-day.

I think they need to find the safe space to heal, but also in the end to deal with addiction issues and then to have a different meaning in life, which generally I would say comes in and reverts to employment and educational training.

So if somebody doesn't have, you know a regular routine or structure, it's easy to fall back into the previous lifestyle, so finding something that gives them meaning either maybe training or education or employment.

It gives an alternative structure that was previous lacking on top of all the other things that I mentioned, the housing, the counseling, trauma care and preferably as I indicated they all come from one place where they don't have to go through three or four or five or even more different agencies to receive the services.

Like several of the other respondents, Mr. Doltze reports that people need a safe environment in secure housing before they can access other services.

In addition, Ed Riglin (RCMP Sergeant) underlined that it is vital for the government to provide safe housing and counseling resources for young women if they are to have any chance of escaping the sex industry for good. Here is what Sergeant Riglin had to say on the issue.

ED RIGLIN: I think the biggest thing to do is have a better investment and places where these girls can go to become safe.

We need to have the houses and the services in place for all these girls who want to get out. They can come in where they can feel safe, where their handlers aren't going to be able to access.

And again, a joint forces approach, a joint agencies approach to dealing with these girls. We've got to remember not to throw the baby out with the bath water with these girls. If they leave 11 times and come back 11 times that's a good thing.

Once they got into it, they're into it. Now we got a different thing to look at as we need to make as inviting as it was to leave, enjoying their handler and all those good things that they promised and how good life would be.

We've got to offer that to those girls that we can offer a better life and we have a better place for you and a safe place for you, you can be loved, we'll help you get to school, get you an education, work with your family, work with you, get your addictions addressed and we'll go at it that way. But it has to be done now, that's from a policing aspect.

A lot of changes are moving that way, towards this that you got to stop popping the girls for the crime and pop the ones that are using the service, its supply and demand.

If we target our johns from a policing point of view, we target our johns and our handlers and the girls will see that someone is on their side and maybe they will want us to handle them versus their handlers. We have to meet it at a street level.

Mr. Riglin expands on the idea of safe housing, stressing that survivors need to build trust with caregivers and in doing so they may feel the confidence to leave their traffickers, but they first must be in safe secure housing.

Jay Rogers (DM Families) also strongly recommends that the government creates safe housing where survivors could be kept away from predators and supported for up to 12 to 15 months.

JAY ROGERS: I think going back to what we were just talking about, one of the things is you got to create is that sense that there is something better that's healthier for them, that's going to be, better for them in the long term.

But there's got to be a way ensuring their safety if they're going to be leaving the sex trade because going back to our earlier question, about prostitution, exploitation and trafficking well I don't know.

I'm guessing most of the women would fall under the latter two categories that they just can't leave when they want, so there's got to be a safe way to do that.

That's why I think we probably need some more safe homes, where the location is kept secret and there's opportunities to work with these girls and young women for 12-15 months, just to help them transition away from the lifestyle and create some sort of sense of hope to move onto something better.

Mr. Rogers stresses that stays of one year or more are required to help some survivors transition out of a multi-functional care facility. This is a far cry from the three days in the Crisis Stabilization Unit described by Chelsea Jarosiewicz as way too short of time to fully assist traumatized and hurting young woman.

Cathy Denby (*Ndinawe*) further noted that safe houses could be set up in rural locales as a means of keeping survivors safe from predators and away from the triggering influences of their urban milieus that are associated with their exploitation and addictions problems.

CATHY DENBY: Lots of resources, safe places to be for long periods of time to recover

from addiction and safety, safety away from the gang, from different players, from gangs. I mean, it's all kind of interconnected, right, especially with youth.

There's such interconnectedness with gangs and exploitation and drugs; they all go hand in hand.

I would see it, that having a detox component to it, certainly you know, where they can be monitored medically, and just get their strength up, you know, meeting those basic needs.

A lot of the times when they're coming out and coming off stuff, they haven't eaten for a long time; they, yeah they need medical treatment, right?

A place where there's security, so people can't get at them. You know. A lot of the times they've got hits on them or they've been so threatened that they can't even see themselves getting out, right?

So this place I think would have to be really stocked with good resources that meets their physical, their emotional, their mental and their spiritual needs.

The majority of my participants believed that women exiting the sex industry need security, a routine, and a safe place to stay before they can take full advantage of therapy programs.

10.4.1 Secure or open youth facilities

There is an ongoing debate over how youth facilities should be structured. Some feel that youth are not mature enough or capable of making an informed choice to stay in facilities that are created for them. Consequently, the facilities must be secure and able to hold them for their own good, to prevent them from returning to their traffickers, to the street, and putting themselves in harm's way. Others feel that any kind of secure setting is counter-productive and damaging to young people as it is a recreation of the oppressive residential school structure.

There are a small number of facilities in Winnipeg that can hold a high risk youth for three to seven days maximum.

Most of the police officers I interviewed expressed a view that forced detention is a necessary evil as these kids need protection from the predators and their pimps. For example, Cam MacKid (WPS Sergeant) argues that the seven-day detention that is currently available in Manitoba is not long enough to stabilize a youth in crisis and connect them with required resources to keep them safe.

CAM MACKID: We've got several different facilities in the city, but what we really need is for instance in Alberta, they've got the Act out there; I believe its 25 days. If someone is even suspected to be involved in exploitation, a youth that is, they can be taken into custody and in a locked facility for 25 days for their own protection.

We don't have that here and there's a real political push against it for obvious reasons it doesn't play well here, but it's something we desperately need.

We have that new unit on Sherbrook, I believe it's seven days. Well intended, but they don't really offer services there, it's just basically a place to keep them safe for short term.

Seven days isn't enough, anyone you know in addictions will tell you that it's not enough to get them off whatever they're on, to make a place to maybe look at some further treatment.

It's just seven days isn't cutting it. We've had some talks about the Alberta model, and there's just not the political will heard to suggest something like that, were kids are going to be taken, largely Indigenous kids and put into a secure facility for that length of time, which is unfortunate because that's something that we desperately need. I guess that's probably the big thing

Mr. MacKid outlines the existence of a seemingly effective model in Alberta where the law allows for 25 days of forceful detention when young people are in danger and being exploited.

Andrea Scott (WPS) further highlights oppositional views that exist on whether youth facilities should be secure or not. She notes that conflict often gets in the way of providing the best services for youth.

ANDREA SCOTT: I guess I kind of touched on that with us not being able to arrest the girls anymore.

I think the laws of going after the johns are definitely helpful, but I don't think you're ever going to eliminate that human need, ever. I don't think it's ever going to go away.

But I think we just have to educate people and be proactive and educate the girls more and be proactive with meeting them.

And I know a lot of members of counter exploitation are out meeting the girls, you know, putting a face to an officer that they would feel comfortable calling that they might not have had before.

You know I think that there's political barriers, there's money, we've always had the issue of people not wanting to lock kids up.

So people have different opinions on that, but I think it's something we need to push forward, something we need to prove that maybe a locked facility or treatment facility that allows the girls to stay longer can be more beneficial and effective, and we really need to show them some results as to how long it takes to treat certain addictions and stuff like that. There's definitely politics involved that are hard to deal with sometimes.

Ms. Scott mentions that more data is required to support an argument for the creation of more secure facilities.

Some of my interviewees maintained that facilities should be secure by location, set up in a rural environment so that young survivors cannot easily leave; however, the other side of that argument is that rural placements will separate young people from their social networks and they will just run away anyhow. The majority of my interviewees, with hundreds of years of collective experience, weighed in on this issue advocating for unlocked facilities. Although I must stress that there was a strong sentiment among the police respondents wanting secure places to keep survivors safe.

Here is what Ashley, a survivor, said about the importance of building good relationships between young women and the interviewing agencies rather than locking them up.

ASHLEY: I'm learning about what the government is doing and I think they've come a really long way in terms of making resources available.

And I know that Street Reach has a lot of good things, although, I have mixed feelings about their current approach in terms of them forcibly removing like restraining and locking these girls up. I think in the end they would just get out and run away back. I think that taking the time to build the relationship and using a strength based approach with them would be more effective, and having a safe house but have it so that it's voluntary, make it feel like it's their choice to be there.

I think a lot of youth who are vulnerable to being exploited, like maybe in those teenage years when you're looking for that need to belong and to be accepted and to be a part of something and I think awareness is a huge thing. They need to be informed at every age about this issue.

Ashley contends that a strength-based approach that is inclusive and is more effective than incarcerating and institutionalizing young survivors.

Likewise, Diane Redsky maintains that locking up abused youth is only a short-term stopgap measure that can do more damage than good in the long-term.

DIANE REDSKY: Right now we're struggling with Tracia's Trust as a community, where there's some differences of opinion on whether you do a secure care model which means you lock up kids, or you don't, that there's an alternative approach.

And so we're kind of doing a push-and-pull, currently right now, where we see the community believe that it's ineffective to lock up sexually exploited youth because they're victims of child abuse and we don't treat any victims like that, why should they be any different?

And that alternative ways such as secure by location is a way better investment in the long-term, because the current system with Street Reach is a quick fix for everybody else except the young girl herself.

We're creating long term damage and further traumatizing and victimizing her under the guise of child protection, which it will be a process which we will figure out and we will answer and everybody will get right back on track at some point but that's a current challenge of ours and what's important is that, in terms of going forward what the coalition, and this is the sexually exploited youth community coalition—.

We have a strategic plan and within that plan there's you know, building on certain resources is one thing, but one of our main priorities is increasing the voices of experiential women.

Ms. Redsky states that the best approach that keeps youth contained is when they are geographically isolated at a secure location as they are away from pimps and off the streets. The other side of this argument is that this approach separates the youth from their social networks and support systems. This could in fact be a requirement of the providers if the young person's entire social network is a gang or a trafficker that is exploiting her.

The feeling among police officers generally is that secure facilities are needed in order to protect exploited youth from running away and putting themselves in danger. Among people working in NGOs, on the other hand, the general feeling is that secure facilities are oppressive and can cause more damage than good to the survivors. My respondents noted that more resources should be provided for high risk youth, with a focus on trust building and developing relationships to encourage survivors to leave the sex industry.

This appears to be a somewhat intractable conflict, as the views of my interviewees seem to be so oppositional. However, there is some middle ground to be found with solutions. For example providing at placements can reduce the youth's opportunities to run away. Jay Rogers (DM Department of Families, Executive Director of Marymount at the time of this interview)

further describes the challenges of finding common ground between both sides of the debate.

JAY ROGERS: I would share the view that we want to not to criminalize these girls and young women, but at the same time we've got to do everything we need to do to keep them safe.

We get criticized here, at Marymount, because we have secure facilities so our CSU, or the LSS unit, it is new, conflict based health unit.

We have the ability to sort of control behaviors of kids. I think for some of these kids and young women that's necessary for the time just to get them stabilized and starting to put them onto something better, so it gets bounced with philosophical argument.

We don't want to criminalize these kids; we don't want to lock them up for any longer than they need to be but do we need semi-secure facilities?

And do we need the police to be involved? For sure, I think it's maybe, there's got to be a better way of just informing the public and informing service providers how everybody works, because we all have the same objective, but we just seem to want to fight over philosophical reasons sometimes.

Mr. Rogers notes the difficulty in finding common ground between secure versus unlocked settings. It is an area where mediation and conflict resolution processes could potentially be used to assist both groups to find some form of resolution wherein all of the parties' needs are met.

10.4.2 Dream Catcher Village

Most of my research participants felt that more safe housing is required with a provision of better resources for young sex industry survivors. For example, Kim Trossell is the manager of the Dream Catcher Program at Klinik Community Health. She works with survivors leaving the sex industry. She envisions a safe house that is more like a village, fully resourced and long-term, where survivors would receive a continuum of resources in an inclusive and supportive space to support each other. Here is how Kim Trossell describes this inventive idea.

KIM TROSSELL: The Dream Catcher Village would be created. That's my dream, which would include a center hub for community services and programming and the outside would be transitional homes and treatment centers and everything within almost like a city reserve I guess you would say.

So it would be a one stop shop, trauma treatment, addiction treatment, all in one reunification of families, working together in that sense.

Funding is the number one issue that stands in the way of all of that; yeah we need to create a sustainable system.

Our needs are specialized.

Services are in existence; addiction treatment is in existence but not specialized for our needs. When women access services for addiction treatment they're sexually assaulted within the treatment centers, either by other participants in the programs or by the facilitators themselves in the programs because once it's identified that a woman is a sex trade worker, a label and stigma has been attached, so for her to access mainstream services it's not conducive for her healing.

It prevented me for years from accessing services because it was always thought, oh well you need to deal with your addiction before you can deal with your trauma, well no it's one, I'm one person, I'm a whole being, you need to treat me as a whole being and treat all the parts of me.

So having it under one roof is crucial, so that the specialized services are all together where women aren't fragmented and sent to one agency for one service and across the city for another.

Even getting on a bus to access those services can create social anxiety for folks. Triggers getting on a bus, people don't realize if somebody is homeless how are they supposed to keep track of the date and time of an appointment that is two weeks down the line if they don't even know the day of the week today, because they don't even have a safe place to live. It's multiple issues.

Ms. Trossell describes how the Dream Catcher Village could bring all the necessary medical, counseling and other resources together under one roof and this might naturally resolve some of the challenges that survivors face with everyday tasks.

Mandy Fraser (Klinic) works as a counselor alongside Kim Trossell at Dream Catchers. She describes how survivors are often homeless, and have never been on welfare assistance, and that they need transitional housing with all the amenities built in because they are personally unable to manage their own affairs adequately. She elaborates on the Dream Catcher Village concept in the following manner.

MANDY FRASER: Women need somewhere to go if they're exiting.

If they've been homeless their whole lives, never been on assistance, you know, where are they going to go?

So we need, like transition housing, or second stage housing, much like battered women's shelters, somewhere to go immediately and then second stage for women who are stabilizing.

I know Kim has talked about this fantasy world, like having just somewhere where there's kitchen, laundry, somewhere that's a home, a one stop shop with counselors and elders and child care, somewhere that's family friendly, addictions support, all of that good stuff under one roof.

And I would say that in whatever form it takes, letting the women who are out there

selling themselves know that we care about them and that they matter. And they're important because they've got the message, whether directly or indirectly, that they're disposable, you know, that they're going to be found in a garbage bag in the river or at a truck stop, dismembered and brutalized and that nobody gives a shit about them.

Ms. Fraser also stresses that the broad spectrum of medical, counseling, government advocacy and other resources required by these young women should be coordinated in one spot.

Moreover, Paige, a survivor, describes below how a safe house could be set up here, built on the successful model of a one-stop shop that exists in Las Vegas, Nevada.

PAIGE: It would be a house of women who are wanting to get well and I believe that the women would run the house and would need to manage.

But I don't think it needs to be staffed. I think the women would need to be accountable to one another because they're all adults.

We would bring them; we would start off with two women and then in a month or two or three. I'm not sure how it would work.

We would bring in two more and the two older ones would be accountable and if say that third person ends up smoking crack in the bathroom, she's not going to be walking because they're all going to want to be clean so she's going to have to do a report and do a time out. And maybe she could then just be able to live there and there would be karma.

Where I get this from is there's a house down in Nevada called Thistle Farms and it's definitely worth checking it out. This woman who started out, and she's brought tons of women through there, it's a home and they all live together.

Thistle Farms is what it's called, they made body products and everything now and they sell it online and all the stuff is what keeps the house running.

It's all made from the thistle plant, and if you study a thistle it is one of the strongest plants there are, and down in Nevada I think it is. Or wherever it was, it says "down on track let's go over here down by the railroad tracks here.

Even though it's dirty, it's heavy in weeds you might see some thistles. All the flowers might die, the grass might die but the thistle will live. That explains women."

It's a home and after they do a couple years there then they go off into the plant and they work or they go off on their own and they build their lives.

Paige suggests that a similar type of safe house could be created and run by the survivors, with seniors mentoring the younger women. Thistle Farms is a large manufacturing company run by sex industry survivors who are employed to produce body care products.

Marie is a survivor. She described how a facility might be location secure if it was placed in the countryside, like a camp, similar to the Dream Catcher Village idea.

MARIE: Well they should not be locking up kids for being sexually exploited.

A 14-year-old with an older man is still child abuse even if it's within the age of consent.

There should be stiffer punishment for perpetrators, and it should be I think once we know the kids are exploiting themselves there should be a process of getting them out of the city and getting them into treatment, treatment that will heal them from the trauma of being sexually exploited—.

Because it's just like molestation, it changes the way that you think; it changes the way that you see yourself in society. It changes the way that you think that people see you, so it's a whole breakdown of who you are on the inside.

And that I think is what takes a lot longer to recover from than the actual work, the damage that's done to your thoughts and your mind and your spirit.

So, for me I'd like to see them all go to a camp or have specialized programming for kids that've been sexually exploited.

This socially original concept of creating a healing community village highlights types of facilities and resources that might be effective for survivors.

10.5 The growing threat and opportunity of advancing technology

Several of my research participants mentioned how advancing technology is both a modern-day challenge and a simultaneous opportunity. The Internet has connected organized criminals, such as traffickers and pimps, while it has also become the new marketplace for the sex industry. The advancement in technology also connects law enforcement agencies locally, nationally and globally. It creates and plethora of opportunities for them for intervention and enforcement against those pimps, traffickers and johns who are breaking the law and abusing young women. Technological advances also present more effective platforms for counter exploitation, education and information sharing.

For example, Darryl Ramkissoon (WPS Sergeant) has observed that much of the sex industry is moving off of the street and online, and that is where new investigative resources are essential. Mr. Ramkissoon describes this new digital terrain as follows.

DARRYL RAMKISSOON: We're falling behind with technology; sex trade has gone online and we're seeing it more and more, which is probably contributing to less amount of people, girls we're seeing on the street.

I'd like to say that we're helping them get off the street but we know some of them have gone online, so as far as keeping up with technology, it is expensive; that's the kind of resources we need to combat and even with human trafficking now it's all online now.

Between agencies it's difficult, especially, not with our local prostitution but with human trafficking stuff.

There's a recent investigation, well one from last year, Edmonton and one with human trafficking from international one, and just coordinating the different agencies I saw how difficult it was for them with the RCMP, it's difficult to keep stuff like that, the information from probably, you have different timelines, you have different time zones, different shift it's hard to keep that all together.

We try our best and we do have communication with other vice units or human trafficking units across Canada but when it comes down to actually providing assistance to the victim after the fact, it kind of falls off there and that's when they really need support, after were dealing with them.

In order for us to get good convictions and stuff with them we need to maintain good report with them or else charges get stayed, they get frustrated, hopefully if it's not a lifestyle they somehow get drawn into it so we need to see it from start to finish.

Mr. Ramkissoon notes that the Internet is making the sex industry invisible. Several of my participants recognized that the Internet and social media are a growing risk factor for upcoming generations of youth, who are bombarded and exposed to the Internet with little control over the content. It is important for government to intervene with school programs to educate young people to the dangers lurking on the Internet as sexual predators troll sites looking for innocent naïve victims.

Christina Miller (WPS Detective) described the Internet as playing a role in normalizing sexual behaviour among young children. Here, she describes how predators can lure young people into the sex industry using social media.

CHRISTINA MILLER: With social media and the influx of access to porn, sexual behaviour has become normalized.

And it could start, you know in Grade four when you're sending a pic to a friend. Or, you know, if you send him this pic he might be your boyfriend. It's crazy how people hide behind their phones and texts, they can be who they want to be. They can be brave, and they can be a 60-year-old posing as a 12-year-old.

So, it's scary to me. The access that kids have to material, and to sharing material and I don't know how we can put any kind of controls on that, other than telling their parents to get their heads out of the sandbox.

And teachers, having stricter procedures for what they're doing in school and access to cell phones and stuff within the classroom.

And parents need to just realize that their little Johnny is capable of doing this. Its curiosity, it may not have ill intentions to start but that one picture can go viral and lead to teen suicides and bullying and we've seen it across the country.

Ms. Miller notes that social media is a growing threat because it provides a platform for predators to mask their identity and trick victims into being exploited.

Trevor Bragnalo (WPS Constable) describes how the RCMP thought the sex industry stopped in Thompson until it realized it had just gone online.

TREVOR BRAGNALO: It's done through cellphones, texting, Snapchat, like, Twitter I don't even know what there is now, Periscope, like, you go on Craigslist and probably find tons, and that's where it is.

Or that's where prostitution and sexual exploitation is going, it's going online. You can't fight it anymore. You can't fight online.

You're anonymous unless you somehow change laws where providers have to provide subscription information. That's a whole different battle.

But with the girls, I don't know how you can combat that online.

In Thompson for a while I recall people are like "oh yeah, there's no prostitution issues here." And for a while I believed that, I was like, "yeah I don't think there is." Like the police involvement, the files, talking to group home workers and you looked at it and you're like oh wait, these girls always disappear. Where are they going tonight?

And then we actually followed them, we conducted surveillance on these 14-year-old girls, where would they go, why are they coming downtown for the TI [Thompson Inn]?

Holy shit, this is what's going on it is a huge issue, it's the dirty underbelly.

Rosemarie Gjerek (Klinic) expands on Bragnalo's comments, noting how increased access to pornography and violence through the Internet is affecting gender roles and sexuality and the values that children are learning in modern society. Ms. Gjerek notes these disturbing trends in contemporary Canada in the following way.

ROSEMARIE GJEREK: It's about teaching, healthy relationships, think about where kids are at. Even supports for families that are experiencing problems, I think messages that we teach little boys, how do we grow up to be a man that is respectful?

We have some very conflicting messages, what is it to be attractive, everything from how to look, and whatever.

We have the same messages for boys in terms of how to be a man and what that means.

I think the most profound messages was listening to a group of young boys, just talk about that, what it means to be a man.

I think you have to address pornography, and the level of violent pornography. The fact that anyone can access on your computer or on your phone, and learn these really wrong messages about human sexuality.

I don't think we can discredit or discount the impact that that has and when you look at that expectation that all kids are doing, because you see it.

The prevalence of those messages is pretty profound. The impact of social media, the impact of media, music and having to have opportunities to talk about that and understand that.

So you open up a magazine and see is that how I am supposed to look like that? But on so many levels.

But I think a lot of it is about education, outreach and all of us as service providers being educated also in terms of absolutely recognizing and looking and knowing, being able to look for this.

How many times have we heard of this, children talking about how many times they tried to disclose or tell and we as adults couldn't hear.

So I think it's about the education and preparation, as service providers is also integral to this process.

Ms. Gjerek contends that because young people today have increased access to the Internet and social media platforms, they need Internet awareness and education that much earlier. It seems clear that technology is one of the most pressing challenges that must be tackled by government and the police going forward into the future. A more insidious threat is that it allows people and agencies to claim that sexual exploitation has evaporated because we don't see it in the street.

Several of my respondents mentioned "Back Pages" or "Craig's List", and they didn't really provide ways that law enforcement agencies should intervene to tackle this issue. Several of the NGO workers in my sample mentioned that the Internet is a growing platform for trafficking and the exploitation of young women. Most of the police officers that I interviewed expressed that government and the general public must focus more on controlling the Internet.

Grant (2016) wrote, some American business initiatives are taking advantage of the perceived lag in Canadian Law enforcement tackling Internet based sexual exploitation and

trafficking. Sarah Jakiel, Chief Programs Officer for Polaris, says, "It's fair to say that Canada is a number of years behind the U.S." Additionally, Claudia Ponce-Joly notes that the agencies that work with youth need to have technology experts assisting them.

CLAUDIA PONCE-JOLY: When young people are starting to become vulnerable that is when the strategy should start and it could be information and education.

Just as young people are educated on safety and health, they should be educated on what kind of risks are in our communities, unfortunately, what kind of people may be attempting to have contact with them.

This should be part of education in my view and especially for children that are vulnerable, involved in the child welfare system or in corrections or any other kind. It's something they should be prepared for because they will encounter some form of it.

Much of it may be online or through friends that they already trust, but much will be encountering through texting, Facebook and many other kinds of technology based approaches.

I think that would be my first strategy that I would place prevention and education at the youngest age possible.

And I do believe that those strategies are occurring but for those of us that are helping those strategies to be developed we have to be keeping in mind that we're not necessarily at the cutting edge of technology, and I think that law enforcement, child welfare and helping organizations need to have people employed with them that are on the cutting edge of technology that can help keep us ahead or at least help keep us up to date so that we can help educate and help combat the luring.

In terms of technology, there's the recent article in papers yesterday and today that I think it's, refusing to unlock phones for the FBI, so there's a bit of a battle about law enforcement not being able to gain access to information that they need for an investigation because they are simply not able to deal with the technology issue. I think that will become more and more pronounced as technology becomes more advanced.

Regulators and support practitioners clearly must be cognizant and savvy in the current technology if they are to keep up with organized criminals who have the resources, drive and flexibility to take advantage of it. She noted that the whole spectrum of agencies must have people who are competent in using the current technology.

10.6 Key findings

The following eight salient and significant findings emerged inductively from this analysis of my participants' comments about the challenges and opportunities that exist for intervening in and

interrupting the sex industry.

First, the system needs more collaboration. My respondents contended that there is room for much greater collaboration between stakeholder agencies in Manitoba. My contributors characterized the system as comprising of fragmented pieces, some of which are effective, yet they only address a small part of any individual survivor's needs. No one agency addresses everything effectively. Therefore, a better integration of services would be more effective in addressing the survivors' needs.

The complex, intersectional and multi-layered challenges that survivors face were outlined earlier, and it is clear that numerous resources must be strategically brought to bear around the wishes and needs of survivors. My respondents stressed that most of the effective resources that exist are not available at the time of day or night when they are most likely to be needed, and some should be adjusted in order to mesh more effectively with the range of other services that could partner on these issues. This means bringing the stakeholders together to share information and resources and collaborate around making all elements of the system work more effectively together. Some of this collaboration, where differing and conflicting opinions exist, might be facilitated with expert third party mediation and effective conflict transformation processes.

Another related finding is the difficulty that sex industry survivors are doing what others might deem routine daily tasks. Structural issues such as complex bureaucratic requirements sometimes create unnecessary challenges for youth. Michael Richardson (Marymount) mentions that it is unreasonable to expect someone with intersectional challenges to deal with the bureaucratic minutia that are currently required by service agencies in order for them to receive continuing services after the age of 18. The government should appoint advocates to walk people through these processes and get them the services they need. Some collaboration could also

resolve these challenges. For instance, a process could be put in place that brings the trauma and addictions program managers into system hub meetings to alleviate bureaucratic red tape for survivors who are sometimes holding onto emotional stability by a thread.

Second, no one agency can stand alone. My respondents noted that many organizations work in isolation, without effective joint coordination of their activities. My interviewees described how many organizations have effective programs that might be more collectively efficient if they were simply better coordinated. They noted the importance of changing policies and meeting in the middle in order to make better use of existing programs to create win-win scenarios for everyone. In some cases there are structural challenges to be overcome in coordination. For example, there are policies that create bureaucratic barriers or prevent a client from accessing the required resources that are housed in different agencies. In other cases, lack of coordination, as Chelsea Jarosiewicz (Marymount) mentioned, could simply result from a lack of knowledge about the resources that are available in the community. My findings with respect to the need for greater coordination and collaboration seem to call for a greater emphasis on system meetings that bring all of the stakeholders together around common tables.

My interviewees advocated for creating regional coordinators with a hands-on operational approach to coordinating data, investigations and treatment programming. Some of my participants made specific recommendations for improved provincial, national and international coordination of data and resources intervening with the sex industry, resources and programs that are available in each region, better strategic operational coordination, criminal intelligence and synchronization of complex organized crime investigations. Manitoba's current provincial Counter Exploitation Program Coordinator is fulfilling more of an education role for the public, which is also critical. Also needed is more of an operations center that actively coordinates

resources and the overall intervention strategy. A national counter-trafficking center is being established to coordinate a strategy nationally, yet its effectiveness is yet to be seen.

My respondents observed that underground railroads and a better safety net should be established to assist young women exiting the sex industry. The provincial government could create a hotline that is connected to a safety net of resources for practitioners and survivors to call at any time of day or night. The creation of an underground railroad by the network of agencies that could potentially partner together around counter exploitation and intervention could provide pathways for survivors to escape their traffickers and predators. It could furnish a safety net that does not currently exist.

Third, better communication can improve collaboration. My respondents surmised that poor inter-agency communication is often at the root of the inability of multiple agencies to collaborate with each other. Several of my research participants highlight that a lot of inefficiency in the system could be improved through better inter and intra-agency communication. Improved communication could raise the agency professionals' awareness about program availability and resources, and could also work towards removing apprehension between agencies with seemingly intractable philosophical differences of opinion over what should be done for these women. Tragically, some survivors are left in the cold due to lack of understanding among practitioners about available resources.

A number of my research participants strongly emphasized that practitioners and survivors must all trust each other in order to work effectively together and achieve common goals. Improved communication is at the root of this trust and it might allow for people from different disciplines and agencies as well as survivors to all understand each other's positions. Here again, PACS tools such as sustained dialogue (Saunders, 2003), ARIA (Rothman & Olson, 2001) and

story based peace building approaches (Senehi, 2002, 2009) might facilitate better communication and working together among front line agencies.

My participants stressed that services should be client centered and should be provided in the best interest of the survivors and not for the convenience of the related agencies. For example, a theme that came up time and time again in the interviews was the actual times at which services are available to clients. If survivors are involved in the Child Care Program at *Ndinewe* during the day, then medical, trauma and addictions counseling and government services such as housing and welfare should be offered in the evening or on weekends, so that survivors don't miss school or work for appointments.

My interviewees also stressed that some inefficiency results from agencies' lack of knowledge of the resources available to survivors. Some of my participants underlined that most professional people in the system of survivor-oriented programs simply are not aware of all of the resources that are available for their clients. This could be remedied by applying a greater focus on asset mapping and training practitioners about the resources readily accessible to them. The provincial and federal governments could provide more comprehensive information in public awareness campaigns and websites about the resources at one's disposal to assist young people to leave the sex industry.

Fourth, aging out of the system is a problem. My interviewees asserted that individuals don't change on the day they turn 18-years of age. They stressed that we currently have a problem wherein people "age out" of the child welfare system, magically being deemed by service agencies to need less resources on the day they turn 18-years old. Jay Rogers (DM Families) pointed out that most agencies have the authority to continue resources for individuals beyond 18-years of age, yet they choose not to do so. This is a challenge that might be remedied

when agency executives gain better awareness of the intersectional challenges that sexually exploited youth and survivors are struggling with.

My respondents asserted that better resources must be provided for adults seeking to exit the sex industry. There is a dearth of available survivor oriented resources to service adults. This challenge is tied into the issue of aging out, yet it is different because it impacts adults of all ages. People may struggle for years or decades, attempting to escape the sex industry, having numerous relapses, and may need access to various addictions counseling and other survivor oriented resources well into their fifties and sixties.

Fifth, more safe houses are needed. My respondents put forward an interesting point about creating safe housing for survivors, such as the Dream Catcher Village. The Province's lack of sufficient safe houses to protect young women trying to exit the sex industry was a significant and continuously repeated finding of this research. Several of my participants noted that there are safe houses for domestic violence victims, but not yet for sex industry survivors. Several made compelling arguments for the creation of a fully resourced long-term residential facility that could see survivors get out of the sex industry.

Sixth, more youth facilities are needed. My respondents declared that it is critical that the Province creates both secure and open facilities for youth in Manitoba. My research seems to indicate that young people are often lost in the debate between these two opposing philosophies, namely the need to create secured rather than open facilities to house young sex industry survivors during crisis and subsequent treatments. It could be that there is room to include both types of service depending on the needs of each individual survivor. Better collaboration between agencies is also required in order to find systemic efficiencies.

This could result in better flexibility with regards to using available resources. For

example, it would then be possible to detain a youth for a period of time until she is stable and then move the person into a more appropriate and less secure setting. My participants stressed that the current three to seven days of secure custody that is available in Manitoba is not nearly long enough to assist young women recovering from a crisis. Some need one year or more in order to recover from severe addictions, stabilize and acclimatize back into normal behaviour patterns.

Seventh, we need a greater focus on technology. My interviewees agreed that all of the agencies need to keep up with rapidly ever-changing technology. A significant finding is that we, in law enforcement and social services, are lagging behind organized crime in the use of the Internet and related social media technology. My interviewees described worrisome observations about the sex industry becoming invisible and impossible to regulate or intervene in. This is disturbing because it becomes increasingly challenging for practitioners to protect survivors and support them. It is also disconcerting because invisibility drives the oppression and violence of the sex industry underground and further from public view.

10.7 Conclusion

This chapter was devoted to themes that arose during the interviews about specific challenges that survivors and practitioners face and how they might be remedied. My participants made numerous suggestions for areas that could be improved, including broad issues that can translate into policy such as focusing on building relationships and trust, to more specific resource issues such as fulfilling the need for more safe houses and transitional housing for young survivors. Yet, even these specific issues such as the type of safe houses that should be provided are laden with conflict about how they should be structured and run. For instance, there is an ongoing

debate about whether facilities for high risk exploited youth should be locked or open, with powerful arguments on either side. This particular issue seems the most divisive among the agencies.

On the other hand there was great consensus amongst almost all of the parties I interviewed on other issues. Everyone, for example, expressed the need for better collaboration at every level over creating and utilizing resources around counter exploitation and prevention, and increased coordination of existing resources. They generally reported that much of the sex industry is moving into the Internet and law enforcement and partnering agencies should keep up with this technology. My police respondents agreed that there is a need to focus on keeping up with technological advancements and that organized crime is already way ahead of the curve.

The issue of youths “aging out” of the child welfare system was identified by several participants and potential solutions were identified. The child welfare agencies actually have the authority to continue child welfare resources for youth that are in their care, for up to 25-years of age, however constrictive bureaucratic red tape must be reduced. Some education and change of policy/practices such as the Dream Catcher Village example seem to have a great deal of merit by bringing multiple resources into a safe place, with a mix of experiential practitioners to assist survivors. Some interviewees suggested creating a safe house with resources located in a geographically secure place in the countryside. This might partially address the concerns raised about placing youth in locked up facilities.

Chapter 11 – Overall Key Findings and Recommendations

11.1 Introduction

This exploratory case study shares insights and stories of experts, stakeholders and survivors about sex trafficking and sexual exploitation in Manitoba, and how we, as a society, can better address this growing social scourge. The visions of this reality are disturbing, yet at the same time hopeful for the future. It is auspicious because it sheds light on the fact that people who are oppressed in the sex industry have hopes and dreams, just like the rest of us, and they deserve to experience the same basic human rights as everybody else. It is promising as well because it exposes the compassion and respect for humanity that resides among the people working in the broad range of front line services to restore and protect the human dignity of some of society's most marginalized and vulnerable people.

This final chapter outlines the most significant findings as well as recommendations that flow from the data. Separate sections are dedicated to contributions to the PACS field, as well as issues for potential future research. As a key goal of this research is also praxis, and identifying practical recommendations, a section is dedicated to the topic of community building, momentum and change.

11.2 Overall key findings and new knowledge

The stories I gathered, present resounding consensus on some issues, while others were mixed, and in some cases revealed strongly disparate views. For example, respondents had diametrically opposed positions about whether facilities for housing high risk youth should be secure or open. On this issue, as well as the other topics that found strong consensus among our interviewees, I

found saturation, wherein I believe no further new ideas would come forth, no matter how many more interviews I completed. Insights were gained and are outlined here.

My respondents explored the difficult question of whether “prostitution” is a legitimate career choice, or whether participation in the sex industry occurs more as a result of coercion, threats and manipulation by pimps and traffickers. People have taken different positions, some arguing that anyone selling their body for money is a victim, and others taking the position that women have agency over their own bodies and should be free to choose that life if they so wish to do so. I anticipated that there would be a large number of my interviewee subjects, possibly equal numbers, arguing either side of this voluntariness debate. However, I found that there is a strong feeling that the sex industry is not a legitimate career choice, and that very few young people ever look in the mirror and aspire to one day become a prostitute. My respondents emphatically underlined that people wind up in the sex industry as a result of lack of resistance to predators manipulating, coercing and threatening them. This lack of resilience flows from oppressed living conditions, often with a history of childhood physical, sexual and emotional abuse, impoverishment and a lack of economic and educational opportunities. In short, it results from a lack of hope. These observations all present a bleak and tragic picture of the human condition that survivors endure.

Youth are recruited and groomed into the sex industry often at the tender age of 13-years old or younger, targeted by predators who are experts in the psychology of vulnerability and human frailty. The youth become deeply emotionally entrenched in the sex industry sub-culture by the time they reach adulthood. The sex industry sub-culture is so pervasive that young women often succumb to a form of Stockholm syndrome, which is a phenomenon in which hostages eventually fall in love with their captors (Westcott, 2013). Consequently, as part of this

entrenchment, survivors often refuse to work with authorities, and are convinced that selling sex is a career choice and that the man who beats her when she fails to earn enough money to turn over is actually her friend and lover. Service providers such as police, social workers and treatment staff, therefore have the unique challenge of striving to help people who don't want to be helped.

Sex industry survivors are victims of structural violence (Foucault, 2010; Burton, 1997; Galtung, 1996). These youth often start in life as victims of childhood sexual abuse, leading to substance abuse and severe behavioral problems, and they often end up becoming wards of the state. These conditions often develop in the context of poverty and the lack of opportunities as these young people have little resilience to resist pimps who are predatory experts at spotting and exploiting people who are vulnerable (Lowman, 1987; Brock, 1998). For example, Cullen-DuPont (2009) wrote about how traffickers identify children and women who are desperate to escape lives of poverty by luring them into the sex industry with lies such as the promises of legitimate work. My research confirms these observations by Cullen-DuPont (2009) and others, including Farley (2003) who writes that women and children in the sex industry are most often trapped in violent exploitative relationships, suffering brutal violence as part of their normal daily experience.

The risks for Indigenous youth are even higher in correlation with “transgenerational traumas” (Volkan, 1997) compounded by poor living conditions in relation to mainstream Canada (also see Lauwers, 2012; Galley, 2009; Goar, 2006; CBC, 2011/2008; Cook & Courchene, 2006). The dangers for Indigenous youth are further exacerbated by structural issues, such as having to leave their home communities for schooling in larger urban centers, where organized criminal predators are always looking for new recruits to enslave in the sex industry.

A finding of this research was the structural challenges that sex industry survivors face, performing what many would consider basic tasks. My respondents highlight how simply asking a survivor to attend a doctor's appointment or to pick up a prescription can be a substantial barrier, due to multiple everyday coping challenges that some struggle with. These new insights should have implications for building survivor oriented treatments as well as program and policy development.

The general conclusions of this study are consistent with previous findings about the struggles that sex industry survivors experience with trauma and PTSD, negative self-images, and the fear of being discovered and labelled (Wong, Holroyd & Bingham, 2011; Gorry, Roen, & Reilly, 2010; Sanders, 2004). This often contributes to self-medicating and numbing through substance abuse, and risk-taking behaviour such as inconsistent condom use, which increases their likelihood of contracting sexually transmitted diseases and AIDS (Lau et al., 2010; Hong et al., 2007). A smaller body of research has highlighted the survival skills and positive psychological coping mechanisms that sex industry survivors develop in the face of unspeakable degradation and humiliation, psychological and physical torture that accompanies their sex industry activities (see Choudhury, 2010; Aspinwall & Tedeschi, 2010; Wood & Tarrier, 2010; Sossou et al., 2008; Kong, 2006). My respondents also described the vulnerability and lack of resilience that led to their becoming entrapped in servitude of the sex industry, often as young children. However, they also displayed extreme courage and tenacity in overcoming some of the most oppressive degradations that humanity has to offer. The survivors I interviewed are much like the thistle that thrives in the harsh desert conditions, where the other flowers and vegetation have shriveled up and died (see Paige's comments in Chapter 10).

My respondents described youth vulnerability and it became clear why children in care of

the state are particularly vulnerable. This is not an indictment of the child welfare system, which has substantial challenges in Manitoba, with over 10,000 children in care, the highest number per capita of any of Canada's provinces and territories (Puxley, 2014). Chief Ron Evans made it clear that this points to governments' responsibilities to help to reduce poverty among Indigenous people and provide better educational and employment opportunities for them. At the same time, the high numbers of children in care calls for more action from front line service providers including social workers, police and the broad spectrum of caregivers to intervene earlier and prevent sex industry recruitment.

Additionally, my participants highlighted the need for a paradigm shift in child welfare, suggesting that too often the child is removed from the family home and all their support systems, rather than the offending adult. My respondents stressed that too often the child is taken to a group or foster home, rather than having the resources brought into the home to assist the family. Some of my respondents, who have many years of experience both as clients and as practitioners in the child welfare system, stressed that they should do what is best for the child, not what is most convenient for service agencies.

My respondents made it abundantly clear that interventions should include more training and education for practitioners, so that they are fully aware that they are working with sexually exploited youth and know exactly what to do for them. We need more awareness training for teachers and parents who are in a position to see the signs of trafficking and intervene, and education for children at all levels to understand and resist the dangers of sexual predators who troll the social media and shopping malls for victims. Previous research has been fairly clear on how troubled youth are sexually exploited. However, the literature on effective interventions and clinical care is lacking (Richardson, 2015; Berckamns et al., 2012). Hopefully, some of the

practical recommendations that resulted from my research fill in some of those gaps.

My research provides insights into how organized the criminal activity of sex trafficking and exploitation is in Manitoba and in the rest of Canada (Richardson, 2015; CWF, 2014). Much of the previous literature has noted the organized crime components, yet in contrast my research provides a more first-hand perspective on how it operates on the ground in terms of targeting, grooming and trafficking our children. These insights make it clear how calculating, brutal and oppressive the tactics of traffickers are in grooming and enslaving children in sex industry servitude.

My participants expressed a near unanimous expression of the need to provide more anti-sex trafficking education and awareness for people at all levels, including greater public awareness to combat the broad societal apathy that exists over this issue. My participants emphasized the need for greater awareness and education for the general public, including campaigns in schools, targeting younger audiences, and in the community to teach children how to recognize and avoid being groomed into the sex industry by predators, and to teach johns the psychological and physical damage that their sex purchasing behavior causes to children. Earlier in the thesis I outlined some research around the efficacy of mass media campaigns in curbing behaviour. In short, previous research specifically on the effectiveness of public media campaigns on the sex industry is lacking.

Another finding was the need for more specialized anti-trafficking training for the broad spectrum of service agencies that have contact with sexually exploited people. Some professional social workers and police officers observed that in past cases they could have intervened early in the process, if they had recognized the signs of the child being trafficked and had known how to react. These observations were driven home by powerful survivor stories describing how they

were trafficked and exploited while adults all around them did nothing to assist, presumably because they did not recognize what was going on or know how to address the issue. It is clear that more training is needed for people who work with sex industry survivors, as well as those who come in contact with them.

My interviewees were unanimous in supporting new trust building approaches with young sex industry survivors that are currently being taken by the police and the justice system, in light of recent changes in the laws. Across the board, they supported viewing sex industry survivors as victims who should not be criminalized. However, there is still debate, in particular over whether the police should have the ability to apprehend survivors in order to assist people who often cannot assist themselves, by forcing them into counseling and drug rehabilitation programming. A large number of the police respondents felt they still need the ability to apprehend survivors and that has been taken away, so their ability to assist vulnerable people has been hampered by the laws. Some survivors stated the only reason they were able to escape the sex industry, and in some cases to remain alive, was because the police had arrested them and placed them in jail or in a program they needed at the time in order to forcefully extricate and protect themselves from the far-reaching grasp of the sex industry subculture, as well as the accompanying substance abuse and intersectional life challenges. Some middle ground might be found so that social workers, police and other service providers can walk with survivors and support them, even when they aren't reaching out for assistance.

Most of my interviewees were not so much interested in the type of laws that exist; rather, they were more interested in how the laws are used. Most felt that there should be stiffer penalties for sex purchasers that would act as a deterrent, and that the police and the justice system should be going after customers, traffickers and pimps aggressively. Almost none of the

participants commented on the impacts of international treaties or even national programs. They are interested in what is available locally, at their fingertips and how it impacts them directly. There was a strong voice among police officers and prosecutors that I interviewed, calling for a better sharing and use of intelligence in the prosecution of sex industry offenders.

My participants described the myriad of challenges that survivors face in trying to escape the sex industry, noting that many women struggle for their whole lives to stay free, constantly on the edge of being triggered into relapse and old trauma patterns even 20 years after exiting the sex industry. Several of my respondents highlighted that it takes most survivors seven relapses or more before finally escaping the sex industry for good. Supporters and caregivers must be non-judgmental, compassionate, and understand that setbacks are to be expected. A significant number of survivors leave the sex industry and then work in helping professions, assisting other women to escape and to remain free of the sex industry.

A strong theme was raised around the need for flexibility in the system. Everyone is different and their requirements shift, so we need to “meet them where they are at”, as several respondents noted. Sex industry intervention and prevention must be flexible and adaptive in order to respond effectively to the unique and changing needs of each individual. This requires collaboration and coordination amongst all of the partnering agencies to make better collective use of existing resources in a focused, holistic and targeted fashion.

My participants asserted that many agencies, programs and resources exist, each with their own strengths and focus, yet they often operate in isolation from each other. Much more efficiency could be achieved by coordinating it all together. Survivors are often lost, struggling to gain support among numerous disconnected organizations that are strangled by bureaucracy.

Practitioners reported that some programs are not available when they are needed. They

either close at 5PM each day, when all the action happens at night, or have long wait lists. They are inaccessible to the young women when they are needed. A person who has a severe addiction problem, who is told to wait two weeks might as well be told to wait two years. These services need to be more client-centered with immediate access, and not tailored for the convenience of the agency.

These systemic inefficiencies often arise over organizations deferring or refusing responsibility for extreme risk, high liability sexually exploited youth, leaving clients lost, like children with fighting parents, between agencies that don't want to take responsibility for them. One example is the conflict mentioned by Michael Richardson, wherein when it comes time to pay for assisting youth in care to become school ready, the education system says it is a child welfare responsibility and, conversely, the child welfare system says it is an education system problem.

We cannot address and resolve these conflicts and collaborate unless we understand them and this can be achieved through the use of conflict analysis tools. Byrne and Senehi (2009) describe how conflicts that occur in different contexts, and at the interpersonal, intergroup, organizational or even international levels are often due to incompatible goals. They also point out that analyzing conflicts requires an understanding of how they originated and progressed as well as the characteristics and values of the parties or groups involved in them. There are shared goals that these agencies could identify with together. For example, what would happen if funding was tied to the requirement that vulnerable youth have positive outcomes, and that agencies that do not play well together will not meet funding requirements? This type of approach might address conflicts as described by my respondent, Shannon McCorry, when she stated, "Sometimes it almost feels like, from a person who is sitting back and looking at all these

resources, like sometimes they're competing with one another, and they're not necessarily working together." She suggested that government should look at the whole picture and fund programs in such a way as to ensure the all the required services are offered. It should look at the big picture.

It seems very clear from my research that potential solutions can be found within the community. This finding connects with the lessons from Lederach (1995), who stresses that deep-rooted problems in the community are often understood and resolved by people in the grassroots who understand the nuances of local culture. Moreover, McNiff and Whitehead (2005) emphasized the importance of the practitioner's hands-on insights in research.

The practitioners I interviewed, some who are also sex industry survivors, provided rich insights about what could be done to intervene to assist these young survivors. They are in the trenches, invested and working on these issues, and are sometimes in conflict with their own organizations as well as practitioners in the other agencies who are, ironically, usually working as well to help survivors. For example, Daphne Penrose pointed out that too often the youth are lost between agencies as a result of individuals "wearing their ego into the room," thinking they are the expert and more capable than others to provide services. Joy Smith also expressed the same concern more strongly when she highlighted that some people "have egos as big as all outdoors." I look at these dynamics as conflicts that could be overcome through more effective collaboration. PACS conflict resolution tools could be useful for resolving these conflicts and challenges, helping people to overcome challenges within and between their organizations, and in finding better systemic responses for sex industry survivors.

Reducing conflict requires an understanding of the conflicted parties' goals, intervention styles and problem-solving strategies (Byrne & Senehi, 2009; Sandole, 2003). My respondents

identified several seemingly incompatible goals and the root causes that lie at the heart of these systemic inefficiencies. For example, I outlined the debate between several parties over whether youth facilities should be secure or open. Parties on both sides of this argument appear entrenched, with no apparent middle ground (see Kriesberg, 1998; Deutsch & Coleman, 2000; Boulding, 2000). Others identified the potential for finding a compromise, making survivors geographically secure by placing them in facilities in the countryside. These conflicted parties could possibly reach this shared space by participating together in a conflict transformation process. An effective consultation process could ensure input and engagement of the community, and mediation tools as outlined earlier could potentially assist in overcoming any disagreements that occur in the process. I know from personal experience that severe conflict can occur during community consultation. I participated in the consultation that the Manitoba Child Protection Branch conducted during development of the Street Reach program in 2008. During those meetings voices were raised, feelings were hurt and tears were shed; some people walked out on meetings and later refused to participate. A mediation process, such as those that were outlined earlier could potentially make such processes much more effective and less painful. Such mediation processes could include PACS tools such as sustained dialogue (Saunders, 2003) and Rothman and Olson's ARIA model (Rothman & Olson, 2001) that was outlined earlier in sections 3.3 through 3.6.

The analytical social cube, identified by Byrne, Carter and Senehi (2003) could be used to analyze and understand the interrelatedness of numerous factors fueling conflicts in terms of (1) history, (2) religion, (3) demographics, (4) political institutions and non-institutional behavior, (5) economics, and (6) psychocultural factors. For example, I described the ongoing debate about secure versus open facilities for youth. Marymount has some of the only secure facilities in the

Province (the Crisis Stabilization Unit) and would like to work more closely with the Indigenous organizations to provide better services for more young female survivors. However, Marymount was founded by the Catholic Health Corporation, and was originally run by the Catholic Order of the Grey Nuns.

Some people in the Indigenous community view Marymount as closely associated with the residential school era, which creates a challenge for generating new partnerships. Understanding this troubled history, as well as the psychocultural issues at the heart of these conflicts, through the use of the social analytical cube (Byrne, Carter & Senehi, 2003), can allow for multiple underlying interrelated causes to be identified. The Catholic Health Corporation has evolved so that in the present day it is mainly lay and non-sectorial in its service delivery approach. If people who are opposed to church run institutions were to understand this new context better, they might be more inclined to take advantage of the services offered.

My interviewees also identified political goals, including achieving more resources to combat sex trafficking and sexual exploitation of young women, and finding ways to collaborate and share information and resources better. These large systemic political goals seem well suited to be addressed through a version of Diamond and McDonald's nine-track diplomacy intervention model (Diamond & McDonald, 1996; Byrne & Keashly, 2000). This model may be ideal for making change that facilitates the fluid flow of bringing all of the agencies together in a coordinated effort to end sex trafficking and sexual exploitation of young women in Manitoba.

The people I interviewed were involved with or actually working for a number of different organizations in the Province, each with its own unique organizational culture. The significance of organizational culture is often underrepresented in the literature on sexual exploitation, yet understanding and respecting culture may be the key to finding common ground (Engle Merry,

2009; Avruch, 1998). Understanding the culture of organizations is not only important in analyzing and finding out the root causes of conflicts, as pointed out earlier, it is also critical in resolving conflict and bringing about social change (Trice & Beyer, 1993).

Thus, I asked for input from people in this study from a broad range of service sectors, with fundamentally different mandates and cultures including elected government officials, senior bureaucrats in government, police, crown prosecutors, health care professionals, educators, advocates, Indigenous leaders, and sex industry survivors. Understanding the perspectives of people from these varied positions and their identities helps to shed light on the root causes of inefficiency and conflict. It also helps in making organizational change, which many agencies are naturally resistant to (Cameron & Green, 2004; Schein, 1985).

The collective impact model is designed to address problems such as this, bringing a broad range of actors together to affect social change (Chrislip, 2002). It has been applied in other jurisdictions to tackle the sex industry. For example, Kaye, Winterdyk and Quarterman (2014, abstract) examined over 50 agencies involved in work around human trafficking and found that “while a criminal justice framework is important for addressing human trafficking, local strategies will benefit from an emphasis on cross-sector collaboration that emphasizes the rights of the trafficked persons above the needs of law enforcement.” They revealed in their findings opportunities to bring agencies together around the sex industry problem.

Lederach (2005) also stressed that local problems need local solutions. The findings of this research illustrate that reducing sex trafficking and exploitation in the sex industry is a very complex and multifaceted problem that calls for an amalgamation of numerous local intervention and prevention tools to address it. A collective impact intervention strategy can work by utilizing conflict resolution tools to analyze the root causes and address interpersonal and interagency

conflicts. Then, the interest groups and actors could be brought together to make political change and affect overall systemic coordination and change utilizing a multi-track diplomacy intervention model as suggested by Diamond and McDonald (1996).

11.3 Recommendations for a multi-track peacebuilding intervention strategy

“A little knowledge that acts is worth infinitely more than knowledge that is idle”
(Gibran, 2011).

Ten salient recommendations arise from this research that are supportive of a multi-track peace building and intervention strategy that engages multiple elements of society in a holistic program to interrupt the oppression of vulnerable women and children in the sex industry. Cook and Courchene (2006) outlined their “vision for the future” providing a list of the general categories of what they found should be addressed in Manitoba around reducing sexual exploitation (p. 4). Cook and Courchene’s vision for the future included the list of eleven broad recommendations. My research participants identified all of these priorities as well as more detailed descriptions of how some of them might be met. Following are my findings relative to Cook and Courchene’s 11 recommendations that describe the following list of strategic directions, as “What the Communities Need and Want” (Cook & Courchene, 2006, p. 4).

1. Adequate funding.
2. Treatment programs.
3. Education and awareness.
4. Outreach resources and prevention programs.
5. Professional counselors and psychologists.
6. Housing and homelessness initiatives.
7. Stronger punishments for perpetrators.
8. Community policing.
9. Partnerships between communities and police.
10. Better networking and collaboration between agencies and communities.
11. Stronger support systems for communities and outside resources.

First, provide adequate funding. In Manitoba, funding for counter-exploitation is

relatively robust. Tracia's Trust has a \$10 million per year budget, plus a lot of police, social work and program money invested. However, there is room for more targeted funding, for instance, my respondents stressed that the private sector has not been adequately engaged. They expressed a strong need for more training, for front line practitioners and there are some costs to setting up coordination hubs that were suggested. Below are several recommendations to consider:

- Multi-track intervention could bring together multiple elements of society around the issues and create opportunities for the private business sector to engage more.
- Collective impact round tables should be established, including survivor voices to create a change in the public discourse.
- We need increased focus on collaboration and coordination that reduce inefficiency within the existing systems of resources.

We might find a shared vision to reduce violence and oppression through these peacebuilding tools as well as putting a value on reduced disparity and improved social justice for some of our most oppressed citizens, namely survivors of the sex industry.

Second, improve treatment programs. Several of my study participants indicated that more training and research is required toward establishing effective intervention and treatment programs and improving accessibility of those that currently exist. These services are often inaccessible to people when they need them because they are closed at night or have waiting lists that are sometimes weeks long. Some services are also inaccessible due to the fact that people don't know they exist or how to access them. This exploratory case study highlights the intersectional challenges of survivors of all ages in the sex industry, as well as the structural issues they face. Anti-trafficking and counter sexual exploitation related programs, including treatments for addictions and trauma, and job readiness programs need to be client centered, designed around the needs of the service users, rather than for the ease of service providers.

Several recommendations are listed below:

- Increase anti-trafficking training for practitioners in awareness and service delivery skills, as well as sensitivity to issues such as the structural problems described above.
- Greater coordination and collaboration is required among agencies to wrap a holistic protective blanket of services around survivors of all ages, and also to work collectively on prevention as well as intervention processes.
- A triage should be created for a one-stop shop that practitioners can call and find resources at any time from one central location.
- Make addictions, trauma and other survivor oriented treatments more accessible and needs based. These programs must be open 24/7 or close to it, with no lengthy wait times for services that are needed urgently.

If agencies work together to streamline and create more client-centered treatment programming it could reduce the level of suffering that these women face and perhaps reduce relapses back into addiction and the sex industry. Reducing relapses and making treatment more effective equates to reduced costs to the system. Experiential survivors should also be at the table designing improvements in these intervention processes.

Third, enhance education and awareness. A strong theme emanating from this research was the need to educate and make the public, youth and purchasers of sex aware of the dangers and the pitfalls that young women face on the streets in Manitoba, as well as increasing training for anti-trafficking and service provider practitioners. Existing successful campaigns and programs must be expanded upon. Here are several recommendations to consider.

- Improved and increased training should be developed and delivered for all practitioners and people such as teachers and parents who have contact with young people that are higher risk of exploitation. For example, youth who have a history of having been sexually assaulted and are now placed in group homes, those who have relationship issues should be surrounded by social workers and caregivers who are trained to recognize the signs of exploitation and how to intervene.
- In-school programs for all ages need to be increased in order to raise awareness and build children's resistance to exploitation at early ages. These programs, in particular, are needed for teachers and caregivers in order for them to recognize the signs of exploitation

and how to intervene.

- Public awareness campaigns might need to be increased in order to affect the public discourse around sex trafficking and exploitation, as well as young survivors' basic human rights. This was highly recommended by my respondents. However, more research is required on the efficacy of such campaigns before major funding is applied.

Survivors should be involved in designing training and awareness campaigns, primarily to ensure that the messaging does not retraumatize survivors. Consideration should be given to how Indigenous communities in rural areas can be exposed to educational materials. For example, some of the highest risk communities that need the awareness materials, such as rural reserves in Northern Manitoba, have no Internet or even cell phone coverage. Messages in the broader campaigns must be delivered in person, by hand and word of mouth.

Fourth, deliver more outreach resources and prevention programs. Training and awareness campaigns must reach into families and schools, to parents and teachers who have the most exposure to children and are most likely in a position to recognize and intervene to prevent trafficking. The training should also be provided for medical staff in hospitals and any other adult groups that have exposure to children. Below are several recommendations to consider:

- Workshops could be developed, utilizing trained mediators and techniques such as sustained dialogue and ARIA, where agencies boards and directors feel that collaboration between agencies around police, social service agencies, and CFS could be improved.
- More practitioners within all of the relevant service agencies should receive sexually exploited youth intervention and prevention training.
- More research is required into early childhood intervention, to assess early warning signs of sexual assault and abuse, to design appropriate and effective interventions (see section 3.2.1).

This training must inform parents, teachers, police, social workers and medical staff so that they are aware of early signs of abuse, how to intervene and where to call for resources when needed.

Fifth, train and hire more specialized counselors and psychologists. Numerous

practitioners interviewed for this study discussed the complex multi-layered, intersectional challenges that sex industry survivors struggle with. It became clear to me that more expert resources are required to work with survivors who are dealing with complex issues including trauma and PTSD, addictions and mental health issues. Many practitioners working with survivors are themselves survivors with extensive personal experience, and who serve as role models providing support and guidance for other survivors. However, many survivors need clinical highly trained support, and these resources must be available immediately when they are required and not after lengthy waits for appointments. The following recommendations could potentially address these shortfalls:

- The government should provide more advanced training for counselors, psychologists, social workers and medical staff.
- The Province should provide more advanced trauma specialists and make them accessible to survivors.

It became clear during this research that sex industry survivors face numerous unique challenges and they need specialized assistance and various supports. Assisting survivors with complex multi-layered problems associated with the experience of being enslaved in the sex industry could become a training stream in the universities and colleges that could be expanded in the psychology, psychiatry and social work fields in Manitoba.

Sixth, focus on housing and homelessness initiatives. The government must provide new safe houses and fully resourced transitional housing for sex industry survivors. My contributors emphasized that there are too few safe houses for sex industry survivors, yet victims of domestic violence have direct access to them. This need for safe houses and transitional housing is a key finding. Below are several potential recommendations:

- The government must provide multiple treatments and services for survivors in safe housing, with input from survivors in their design.

- Government should consider creating the Dream Catcher Village.
- Government should consider developing a program designating places of safe refuge and community safety nets.

Seventh, implement stronger interventions for perpetrators. Most of my interviewees argued that we, as a society, should be targeting and attempting to diminish the demand side, or the market drivers for the sex industry by holding the traffickers, pimps and johns more accountable. They expressed a variety of ideas about how to do this. For example, some feel that stiffer penalties would act as a deterrent, while others feel that harsh court sentences are not effective and that more education for johns is the answer. Below are several recommendations:

- We (society) should implement a multi-track intervention process to engage the political aspect of laws and courts, bringing community stakeholders from multiple perspectives together to respond better to sex industry market drivers.
- More research is needed into the benefits and/or the diminishing returns of prosecutions and punishments on sex purchasers.
- More research is necessary to explore the drivers and interventions of people purchasing sex. For example, in section 7.3 I reviewed the current state of research in this area, however more is needed in the Canadian context, in particular in light of the new changes in the laws.
- More early childhood education can teach young boys about sexuality and about not objectifying girls.

The last point about education for young children could be incorporated into the recommended early childhood counter exploitation awareness training for all young children in schools.

Eighth, augment community oriented policing. My respondents noted that community oriented policing approaches are best. Several recommendations are listed here:

- It is important to ensure the use of multi-track intervention, collective impact approaches and ever increasing collaboration and coordination so that community oriented policing remains a priority for the police and communities they partner with.
- Government should implement collective impact round tables and service hubs, including

the police.

Continuous attention and the use of conflict resolution and transformational processes should be applied to ensure that the boundaries between the agencies are continually negotiated and conflicts are not allowed to fester.

Ninth, facilitate better networking and collaboration between agencies and communities. Collaboration and coordination were key needs identified in the interviews, both between and within organizations to reduce overlap and interagency gaps and to improve communication. Below are several recommendations that could be considered:

- The stakeholders should come together and develop safety nets for survivors.
- PACS tools, such as ARIA and sustained dialogue, and collective impact approaches could be employed to improve collaboration and coordination between agencies and units within organizations.
- The provincial and national governments should create triage hubs and should coordinate safe centers and make them accessible to survivors.

Collaboration and coordination between all of the agencies involved in working with and supporting sex industry survivors is critical. Services often operate in isolation due in part to structural or bureaucratic impediments, and sometimes practitioners are not even aware that certain services exist. In some cases these problems could be resolved through simple improved communication. In other cases change is required to make the services more united. Change management processes within organizations should be well thought out and managers in partnering agencies should plan to mitigate organizational change resistance and the impact that change has on employees through thorough planning (Allison, 1999; Schein, 1985, cited in Cameron & Green 2004; Jeong; 2000).

Tenth, develop stronger support systems for communities and outside resources. My research participants argued that there is a need for central coordination at the local provincial

and federal levels. Below is a recommendation to consider:

- Governments should create centralized hubs, for one-stop shopping at the local provincial, federal and international levels.

Some participants discussed a number of initiatives that are underway, however, their effectiveness cannot yet be determined.

The fundamental challenge, it seems to me, is to move the focus of responsibility for these serious social issues into the center, between all of the stakeholders. Right now there is competition, both on financial grounds wherein agencies are fighting for perceived scarce resources, and on philosophical grounds, wherein there are fundamental differences of opinion that create barriers to collaboration. Often times these conflicts could be resolved through better communication and sharing, and through using PACS intervention and prevention peacebuilding tools. Finding closure in some cases requires a paradigm shift among partnering agencies.

Several broad recommendations emerged from the findings. For example, several of my participants talked about the need to engage the private corporate sector more in the conversation and in strategies around preventing sexual exploitation. Gord Mackintosh (former MLA) opined about the role that the private sector plays, in sex trafficking and exploitation, providing hotel rooms, taxis and the Internet. It is clear, from the interviews that the private sector has a significant role to play. Mackintosh did highlight in his interview that strides were accomplished to bring the hotel industry on board in the crusade against the pimps and johns, yet there is room for much more partnership on this issue.

A significant and growing feature of the sex industry is the Internet. It seems that researching and placing resources into technology is paramount in anti-trafficking agencies and police efforts to keep up with organized crime and to protect survivors. My research participants

mentioned the importance of developing specialized teams that could tackle online luring and exploitation, and be a centralized resource around the sex industry.

A centralized hub of culturally appropriate resources is something that all of the agencies could draw upon. This idea might reduce gaps by making resources available to every agency, rather than the ineffective random nature of the current system of available resources. It is a model that is worth investigating.

The main broad recommendation that emerged from this research is the need for greater all-community engagement, coordination and collaboration. Collective impact approaches and PACS intervention and prevention methods offer some useful tools. The greatest movement, it seems is through changing the public discourse. Agencies in government and non-government sectors, should all strive to develop partnerships and collaborate more with client-centered approaches. Table 5 outlines the findings of this research in point form, with accompanying recommendations (see Table 5).

11.4 Community building and change

My participants strongly emphasized that we need to find ways to affect the public narrative, reduce society wide apathy and indifference, and move the social agenda forward on reducing sexual exploitation of children and youth in the sex industry. Informing the public through strategic marketing has been successful in recent decades on issues such as impaired driving, seatbelt use, linking smoking to lung cancer, mothers against drunk drivers, the current campaign to reduce distracted driving and to reduce gun violence against African American males in America's inner cities (Proththrow-Stith & Spivak, 2004). Many are in denial of global warming despite a massive and undeniable body of scientific evidence proving otherwise. The sex

industry is similar in that the public is generally in denial, caught up in willful blindness or apathy unless it is happening to their loved ones or in their own backyard.

The time for change around the sex industry is now, with growing public awareness and a social movement in Canada around the sex industry and the Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Children Inquiry that started in September of 2016. Perhaps we can cause social change by affecting the public discourse. Conditions are right in Canada, and there has been much movement around the issue of sex trafficking and exploitation over the past two decades.

11.5 Future research

Sex trafficking and exploitation are social and economic as well as political problems that are affected by social dynamics. It is an issue that crosses multiple service sectors, and can be looked at through different lenses from economic, legal and political to the psychological, social, and cultural. Throughout this study I've identified numerous topics for potential future research. People's awareness of the issue is growing and this problem is now beginning to change, so the opportunities and the need for further research are significant. Some of the broad topic areas for future research are described in this section.

First, more research is required into prevention and early childhood abuse as an indicator of later sex industry involvement. Previous literature indicates strong correlations between early childhood sexual abuse and trauma, and later involvement in the sex industry (McIntyre, 2012). This research confirms that early childhood abuse and early teenage promiscuity and substance abuse tend to correlate with later vulnerability. There is room for much more research to potentially create early warning systems and supports that could prevent these issues from manifesting into continuing trauma and victimization of people that have been abused as

children. Research could examine how police services and child welfare agencies could create better supports, interventions and follow-up for youth who are identified as having been subjected to sexual abuse and trauma.

Second, research is required into the impacts of recent changes in the provincial and national laws. There are a rather low number of convictions for trafficking and pimping in Canada. Thus, there is much room for research on the impacts of changes to Canada's law and affected strategies. Several of my contributors mentioned that sometimes we might be using the wrong tools for the job of prosecuting johns and pimps. For example, some mentioned that in cases where there is insufficient evidence for convictions under the human trafficking laws, there might be ample evidence of longstanding crimes such as forcible confinement, sexual assault and other related charges. More research could reveal which of these laws are most effective and how they may be adjusted for more expedient prosecutions.

Third, research is required to explore the invisible sex industry that has taken to the Internet and social media, and changing online technology to cope with it. Previous literature highlighted the need for more research on the less visible aspects of the sex industry (Cook & Courchene, 2006). While experts said in their interviews that they are aware of a growing massive use of social media and the Internet in the sex industry, it is still largely an uncharted territory for law enforcement agencies. Children and women are selling themselves in this emerging digital domain, and that may also be impacting our growing newcomer communities, whose innocent children are lured by predators into selling their bodies online.

My respondents identified how current systems and agencies are lagging behind in technological competence compared to the more nimble organized crime syndicates that do not face the same law enforcement constraints of operating within the law, jurisdictions, limited

budgets, and bureaucratic constraints. Research is needed to analyze the role that technology plays in the sex industry, as well as how law enforcement and partner agencies can keep up with those changes. The social media itself provides the police with a massive opportunity to tackle the sex industry, yet organized criminals may be using it to its fullest advantage; this needs to be reversed.

Fourth, research on the demand side of the market in terms of the traffickers, pimps, and the purchasers of sex is sadly lacking. Sex purchasers recognize the potential harms caused through sexual exploitation, yet research in this area is rather limited. McIntyre (2012) wrote that she realized during her research with survivors that, “If we were ever going to successfully disrupt and adjust the supply of young persons involved in the sexual exploitation field we needed to address the demand” (p. 64). New research must examine both the supply and the demand side of the equation, and what effect evolving laws and intervention and prevention strategies are having on the sex industry.

Deterrence is also an important element in any crime reduction strategy (Linden, 2012). This policy is crucial, especially now that the political landscape has changed, and in Canada we are generally treating the sellers of sex as victims and the purchasers as the driving force in the market. Unfortunately, the demand side was out of the scope of this thesis. However, most of my participants commented on the purchasers (the johns) who must become the focus of future strategies to eliminate the sex industry. Some said that if the traffickers, pimps, and the johns were removed, there would be no market and the problem would stop. Of course, it is not that simple. The question of “criminalizing” or educating the purchasers of sex, or having some kind of effective balance between education and punishments is an issue for further research.

Fifth, mental health issues and their impacts on survivors is a phenomenon mentioned by

several of my research subjects. The mental health of exploited youth and women survivors is an important correlate of their vulnerability to exploitation, and demands interdisciplinary research in its own right. There is room for much research on mental health challenges faced by sex industry survivors and special considerations in preventing and reducing sexual exploitation, and also in how the system might best assist sex industry survivors with mental health challenges to exit the sex industry. Laws and the courts should also be considered in conjunction with mental health issues because raping or trafficking a developmentally delayed young girl is a common occurrence in the sex industry, and is a particularly despicable danger to the community that should be considered as such in the courts.

Sixth, research to date on effective interventions with sexually exploited youth is also sorely lacking (see Richardson, 2015; Canadian Press, 2014; Berckamns et al., 2012). My research has noted the need for better training and education for frontline service professionals across the board. There is space for research on prevention, youth and adult interventions, holistic intervention resource strategies as well as systemic issues that allow this plague on humanity to persist. There is also room for research on the effectiveness and impacts of sex industry survivors working in the field as they support other experiential survivors. It may be part of their journey of healing; however, it can also be triggering and traumatic for them. Several of the survivor-practitioners interviewed for this research stated outright that it is difficult work for them as events or stories often trigger them to regress into depression and distress. So what is the impact of doing this type of work for survivors now working as practitioners, as well as their effectiveness in the field compared to non-experiential practitioners?

Overall, my impression is that the sex industry is a continuously changing social

phenomenon that is just now being discovered by researchers. It is tragic that there is so much that is unknown, while the impacts of the sex industry on society and the survivors are so high. However, it is also a great opportunity for meaningful research and to make lasting contributions to end this violence against children, young women and Indigenous people, balance human rights and improve social justice for an oppressed group of people living on the margins of our community.

11.6 Concluding comment

Survivor's guilt is a real and persistent danger for peacekeepers and community builders. It was not an issue for me until I learned of the phenomenon through my graduate studies in PACS; then it made sense. The more compassionate one is, the more sensitive and aware one is to issues of disparity and the pain and suffering of others, the more exposed one is to taking on their pain. Peacebuilders, soldiers, police officers and police support staff, nurses, doctors, paramedics and other emergency services personnel know this instinctively, and have to guard against becoming jaundiced and insensitive as a defense mechanism in response to the humanity they are exposed to. Yet, they must be open to emotional connections with people who are suffering in order to assist them. In fact, bottling these feelings up, day-in-and-day-out, to get their job done professionally and efficiently, these traumas are often suppressed until they find another release, sometimes in the form of PTSD, substance abuse and depression.

My colleagues and I in policing walk this tightrope, much like the survivors I interviewed who are drawn into the helping professions despite knowing the dangers of it triggering their own relapse into depression, alcohol and drug abuse as well as the treacherous allure of the sex industry sub-culture. Yet, I wanted to contribute to the knowledge and practices that might be a

lifeline for struggling sex industry survivors. I knew from my 30 years plus experience in law enforcement, and in particular through my work with exploited people that the difference between a life saved and a life ruined can be as simple as someone picking up a phone and calling a colleague in another agency for help, or taking the time to listen for two minutes and learn how one can assist someone in need. Working in law enforcement, we become acutely aware of how fragile a life is, and that for someone performing survival sex, her life can be changed by not getting in that next car with a john, or by a police officer or a social worker taking notice and doing something in a seemingly innocuous situation when they have contact with a child who is in danger.

Hearing these stories from survivors and helpers was both a depressing and inspiring voyage for me. The unfairness of life's lottery that places some people in desperate, abused circumstances is bound to be disheartening; however, hearing about their resilience and tenacity to overcome unbelievable degradation and pain is inspiring. The stories of professional practitioners from all sectors and their dedication to the vulnerable were also incredibly heartening. Many are devoted to helping at great personal costs to themselves. In some cases they could be doing other less stressful and disturbing work for more money, yet they remain true to their compassion for these most vulnerable survivors.

This exploratory case study gathered the experiences and perceptions of a wide range of stakeholders engaged in fighting the significant social scourge of the sex industry in Manitoba. Their narratives and stories were presented in a prominent way, utilizing their own words at every opportunity. In a way, this thesis is written as a narrative of the participants' stories interlaced with connecting thoughts, organizing those ideas into a structure that would make some sense of such a complex and multi-faceted social phenomenon.

Conducting the interviews and writing this thesis was an emotional journey for me as the passion and pain that these participants have all experienced, including the survivors, practitioners, administrators, police officers, social workers, advocates and leaders bleeds through in every quote. The survivors' stories in particular are excruciatingly honest and gave me an idea of the hell they've gone through every day. However, one cannot really understand and feel that kind of anguish unless one has walked in those shoes.

This thesis has highlighted the stories of those who work hard to make a difference in the lives of those who suffer so much because of the greed and abuse of others. My participants' powerful and engaging stories shed light on a dark subject, hopefully contributing, even if in a small way, to the ultimate elimination of sex slavery, trafficking by sexual predators, and sexual exploitation of young people in Canada. This thesis is dedicated to these brave, warm hearted and talented people who survive and go to work every day to reduce disparity and victimization, improve social justice and make a difference in the lives of our most vulnerable citizens, our children.

By taking the time to read this thesis, you have shown an interest and commitment to improving the lives of vulnerable people in our communities, and as such, like Ulysses in the *Odyssey* (Homer, 1909) you are a hero in your story. We all have something to contribute, whether as a survivor acting as a role model and mentor for others seeking the same path, or as a practitioner striving to do what we can for our fellow human beings. Equally significant are the unsung heroes, the average citizens who decide to speak up about social injustice and for people who have less voice in the system. There is a role for all of us to play and in that way each of us is the hero in our own story.

References:

- Allison, G. (1999). *Essence of Decision: Explaining the Cuban Missile Crisis*. New York, NY: Pearson.
- Allaguia, I. & H. Breslowb. (2015). "Social media for public relations: Lessons from four effective cases." Northwestern University in Qatar, P.O. Box 34102, Doha, Qatar.
- Amahazion, F. (2014). "Global Anti-Sex Trafficking: State Variance in Implementation of Protectionist Policies." *Human Rights Quarterly*, 36, 1, (February), 176-09.
- Appleford, B. (1986). "Response of the Canadian Psychological Association to the Badgley and Fraser reports," In J. Lowman, M. Jackson, T. Palys, and S. Gavigan (Eds.), *Regulating sex: An anthology of commentaries on the findings and recommendations of the Badgley and Fraser reports*. Burnaby, BC: Simon Fraser University. 51-73.
- Aspinwall, L. G. & R.G. Tedeschi. (2010). "The value of positive psychology for health psychology: Progress and pitfalls in examining the relation of positive phenomena to health." *Annals of Behavioral Medicine*, 39, 1, 4-15.
- Augsburger, D. (1992) *Conflict Mediation Across Cultures*. Louisville, Kentucky: John Knox Press.
- Avruch, K. (1998). *Culture and Conflict Resolution*. Washington: USIP Press.
- Ayers JW, JL. Westmaas, EC. Leas, A. Benton, Y. Chen, M. Dredze, BM. Althouse. (2016). "Leveraging Big Data to Improve Health Awareness Campaigns: A Novel Evaluation of the Great American Smokeout." *JMIR Public Health Surveill* 2(1):16.
- Badgley, C. (1984). "Committee on Sexual Offences Against Children and Youth: Sexual offences against children." Ottawa: Department of Supply and Services.

- Bales, K. (2004). *Disposable People; new slavery in the global economy*. San Francisco, CA: University of California Press.
- Bales, K. (2000a). *Disposable people: New slavery in the global economy*. San Francisco, CA: University of California Press.
- Bales, K. (2000b). "Expendable people: Slavery in the age of globalization." *Journal of International Affairs*, 53, 2, 461-85.
- Barry K. (1995). *The Prostitution of Sexuality. The Global Exploitation*. New York and London: New York University Press.
- Becker, G. (1995). "The economics of crime." *Cross Sections*, (fall) 8-15.
- Becker, G.(1968) Crime and punishment: An economic approach. *Journal of Political Economy*, 3, 169-17.
- Bell, S. (1994). *Reading, Writing & Rewriting the Prostitute Body*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Berckamns, I., M. Velasco, B. Tapia & G. Loots. (2012). "A systemic review: A quest for effective interventions for children and adolescents in street situations." *Children and Youth Services Review*, 34 (3) 1259-72.
- Bishop, A. (1994). *Becoming an Ally: Breaking the Cycle of Oppression in People*. Winnipeg: Fernwood Publishing.
- Bittle, S. (2002). "Youth Involvement in Prostitution: Literature Review and Annotated Bibliography." Canada, Research and Statistics Division (April)
http://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/cj-jp/yj-jj/rr01_13/toc-tdm.html.
- Blaze Baum, K. (2016, 7 April). "Justice 'uneven' in cases of missing, murdered Indigenous women: minister." Toronto: *Globe and Mail*.

- Blumer, H. (1969). *Symbolic Interactionism: Perspective and Method*. New York, NY: Prentice Hall.
- Bogdan, R. & S. Biklen. (2006). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theories and Methods 5th Ed.* New York, NY: Pearson.
- Bonokoski, M. (2012, 14 October). "Police recognizing PTSD scourge." *Winnipeg Sun*.
- Boulding, E. (2000). *Cultures of Peace: The Hidden Side of History*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.
- Broadbent Institute. (2014). "The Wealth Gap: Perceptions and Misconceptions in Canada." The Broadbent Institute.
- Brock, D. (1998). *Making work, making trouble: Prostitution as a social problem*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Burton, J. (1997). *Violence explained: The sources of conflict, violence and crime and their prevention*. Manchester, ENG: Manchester University Press.
- Burton, J. (1990). *Conflict: Resolution and Provention*. St Martin's Press.
- Buttigieg, F. (2014). "Human Trafficking, Other Forms of Exploitation and Prevention Policies." Government of Canada's National Crime Prevention Center (NCPC).
- Byrne, S. & L. Keashly. (2000). "Working with ethno-political conflict: A multi-modal and multi-level approach to conflict intervention." *International Peacekeeping*, 7 (1), 97-120.
- Byrne, S. & J. Senehi. (2012). *Violence: Analysis, Intervention, and Prevention*. Athens, OH: Ohio: University Press.
- Byrne, S., D. Sandole, I. Sandole & J. Senehi. (2009). *Handbook in Conflict Analysis and Resolution*. Oxford: Routledge.

- Byrne, S. & J. Senehi. (2009). "Conflict analysis and resolution as a multi-discipline: A work in progress." In Sandole, D. J., S. Byrne, I. Sandole-Staroste & J. Senehi. *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Byrne, S, N. Carter & J. Senehi. (2003). "Social Cubism and Social Conflict: Analysis and Resolution." *Journal of International and Comparative Law*, 8, 3, 725-40.
- Byrne, S. & N. Carter. (1996). "Social Cubism: Six Social Forces of Ethnoterritorial Politics in Northern Ireland and Quebec." *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 3, 2, 52–72.
- Cameron, E. & M. Green. (2004). *Making Sense of Change Management: A Complete Guide to the Models, Tools and Techniques of Organizational Change*. Sterling, VA: Kogan Page.
- Canada (2015). "Bill C-36 Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act." <http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Publication.aspx?Language=E&Mode=1&DocId=6646338&File=33#3>.
- Canada vs. Bedford. (2013). Supreme Court of Canada. <http://scc-csc.lexum.com/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/13389/index.do>.
- Canada, Department of Justice. (2014). YCJA. webpage, www.justice.gc.ca/eng/cj-jp/yj-jj/ycja-1sjpa/back-hist.html.
- Canadian Press. (2014, 17 December). "Manitoba Children's Advocate says her office notified of 166 child deaths." *Canadian Press*.
- Canadian Press. (2014, 30 June). "Guaranteed \$20K income for all Canadians endorsed by academics Advocates enjoy resurgence of plan to ease poverty." *Canadian Press*.
- Canadian Women's Foundation. (2014). "Stories and Strategies to end Sex Trafficking in Canada." <http://www.canadianwomen.org/sites/canadianwomen.org/files//CWF Trafficking Report Donor-EN-web.pdf>.

- Carter-Visscher, R. M., A. E. Naugle, K. M. Bell & M. K. Suvak. (2007). "Ethics of asking trauma-related questions and exposing participants to arousal-inducing stimuli." *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 8, 3, 27–55.
- Carreiro, D. (2016, 2 May) "Veteran Winnipeg police officer researches child sex trade for solutions: Officer 'passionate' his research of sex trade survivors will help stop exploitation," *CBC News*.
- CBC. (2014a, 17 August). "Tina Fontaine, 15, found in bag in Red River." *CBC News*.
- CBC.(2014b, 12 November). "Rinelle Harper's family says they were not consulted about justice rally." *CBC News*.
- CBC. (2013, 20 December). "Supreme Court strikes down Canada's prostitution laws." *CBC News*.
- CBC. (2011). "A timeline of residential schools: the Truth and Reconciliation Commission." <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/story/2008/05/16/f-timeline-residential-schools.html>.
- CBC. (2008, 16 May). "Residential Schools: Aggressive assimilation." *CBC News*.
- Cederborg, A. C. & M. E. Lamb. (2008). "Interviewing alleged victims with intellectual disabilities." *Journal of Intellectual Disability Research*, 52, 49–58.
- Cho, Seo-Young.(2012). "Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking? Poverty, Equity, and Growth in Developing and Transition Countries: Statistical Methods and Empirical Analysis No. 96." *Courant Research Center*, 20.
- Choudhury, S. M. (2010). "As prostitutes, we control our bodies: Perceptions of health and body in the lives of establishment-based female sex workers in Tijuana, Mexico." *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 12, 6, 677–89.

- Charmaz, K. (2005). "Grounded theory in the 21st century: Applications for advancing social justice studies." In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications. 507-35.
- Chrislip, D. D. (2002). *The Collaborative Leadership Fieldbook: A guide for citizens and civic leaders*. Sanfransico: Jossey-Bass.
- Christmas, R. (2016a). "Perceptions On Confronting Sexual Exploitation in Canada: An Introduction to New Primary Research." *The Journal of Community Safety and Well Being*, 1, 2, (8 August).
- Christmas, R. (2016b). "Confronting sex trafficking and exploitation in Canada." *Multi-Briefs*, (9 February).
- Christmas, R. (2014). "Multi-Track Diplomacy and Canada's Indigenous Peoples." *Peace Research: The Canadian Journal of Peace and Conflict Studies*, 44, 2 and 45, 1.
- Christmas, R. (2013). *Canadian Policing in the 21st Century: A Frontline Officer on Challenges and Changes*. Montreal, QB: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Christmas, R. (2012). "The People are the Police: Building trust with Indigenous communities in contemporary Canadian society." *Canadian Public Administration*, 55, 3, (September), 451-70.
- Christmas, R. & C. Ponce-Joly. (2015). "Multi-Disciplinary Collaboration- An Essential Tool and Skill of Responsible Public Service in High Risk Service Provision." *Justice Reports*, 30, 2 (June).
- CISC. (2008). "Organized Crime and Domestic Trafficking in Persons, Strategic Intelligence Brief." www.unicef.ca/sites/default/files/imce_uploads/DISCOVER/OUR%20WORK/CHILD%20SURVIVAL.sib_web_en.pdf.

- Clawson, H. J., N. Dutch, A. Solomon & G. Goldblatt. (2009). *Human trafficking into and within the United States: A review of the literature*. Washington: Department of Health and Human Services.
- Collins, P. H. (2009). "Emerging intersections- Building knowledge and transforming institutions." In B. T. Hill and R. E. Zambrana (Eds.), *Emerging intersections: Race, class, and gender in theory, policy, and practice*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University.
- Cook, R. & D. Courchene. (2006). "Preventing and eradicating the abuse of our children and youth: Regional team development." The Manitoba Association of Friendship Centers.
- Cool, J. (2004). "Prostitution in Canada: An Overview." Library of Parliament.
- Comack, E., L. Dean, L. Morrisette & J. Silver. (2009). "If you want to change violence in the 'hood, you have to change the 'hood: Violence and street gangs in Winnipeg's inner city." Winnipeg: Canadian Center for Policy Alternatives.
- Council of Canadian Academies. (2014). "Policing Canada in the 21st Century: New Policing for New Challenges." Ottawa: The Expert Panel on the Future of Canadian Policing Models, Council of Canadian Academies.
- Creswell, J. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Cullen-DuPont, K. (2009). *Global Issues: Human Trafficking*. New York, NY: Infobase Publishing.
- Czarnecki, K.D., L.E. Vichinsky, JA. Ellis & SB. Perl. (2010). "Media Campaign Effectiveness in Promoting a Smoking-Cessation Program." *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 38 (3S) S333–S342.

Davies, J. L. & T. R. Gurr. (1998). *Preventive Measures: Building Risk Assessment and Crisis Early Warning Systems*. New York, NY: Rowman & Littlefield.

Dehn, K. (2009, 11 November). "Police change tactics to help chronic runaways." *CTV News*.

De Shalit, A., R. Heynen, E. Van der Meulen. (2014). "Human Trafficking and Media Myths: Federal Funding, Communication." *Canadian Journal of Communication*. 39, 3. p. 385.

Delacoste P. & P. Alexander. (1987). *Sex Work: Writing by women in the sex industry*. Pittsburgh, PA: Cleis Press.

Denzin, N.K & Y.S. Lincoln. (2005) *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*, (3rd ed.), London, ENG: Sage.

DeRiviere, L. (2005). "An Examination of the Fiscal Impact from Youth Involvement in the Sex Trade: The Case for Evaluating Priorities in Prevention." *Canadian Public Policy*, XXXL, 2.

Department of Justice Canada. (2014). "Bill C-36, An Act to amend the Criminal Code in response to the Supreme Court of Canada decision in Attorney General of Canada vs. Bedford and to make consequential amendments to other Acts (Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act) <http://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/otherautre/protect/protect.pdf>.

Dandurand, Y. (2017). "Human Trafficking and Police Governance." *Police Practice and Research*, vol. 18, no. 3, 322–336

Deutsch, M. & P. Coleman. (2000). *The Handbook of Conflict Resolution: Theory and Practice*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass.

Diamond, L. & J. McDonald (1996). *Multi Track Diplomacy: A Systems Approach to Peace*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.

- Doezema, J. (1998). "Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary vs. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights Resistance, and Redefinition*. K. Kempadoo & Doezema, eds. New York, NY: Routledge, 34-51.
- Druckman, D. (2005). *Doing Research: Methods of Inquiry for Conflict Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Eckberg, G. (2004). "The Swedish Law That Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services: Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings. Violence Against Women." *Violence Against Women*, 10,10, 14.
- Engle Merry, S. (2009). *Gender Violence: A Cultural Introduction*. London, ENG: Blackwell.
- Englander, E. K. (2006). *Understanding Violence*. US: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Estes, R. & N. Weiner. (2001). *The commercial sexual exploitation of children in the US., Canada and Mexico*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Fanon, F. (2008). *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York, United States: Grove Press.
- Fanon, F. (2001). *The Wretched of the Earth*. London, United Kingdom: Penguin Books.
- Farley, M. (2003). *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*. Binghamton, NY: Haworth.
- Farley, M. A., J. Cotton, S. Lynne, F. Zumbeck, M. Spiwak, D. Reyes, Alvarez & U. Senzgin. (2003). "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: An Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder." *Journal of Trauma Practice*, 2, 35.
- Feingold, D. A. (2010). "Trafficking in numbers: The social construction of human trafficking data." In P. Andreas & K. M. Greenhill (Eds.), *Sex, drugs, and body counts: The politics of numbers in global crime and conflict*, 46–74. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University.

- Ferguson, R. A. (2005). "Racing Homonormativity: Citizenship, Sociology, and Gay Identity." In *Black Queer Studies: A Critical Anthology*, P. E. Johnson & M. Henderson. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Ferris, S. (2015). *Street Sex Work and Canadian Cities*. Alberta: University of Alberta Press.
- Foucault, M. (2010). "Truth and Power." In *The Foucault Reader*. New York, NY: Vintage Books, 51-76.
- Frankl, V.E. (1959). *Man's Search for Meaning*. New York, NY: Pocket Books, Simon and Shuster Inc.
- Fraser, P. (1985). "Report of the Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution." Minister of Supply and Services Canada, Ottawa.
<https://www.ncjrs.gov/App/Publications/abstract.aspx?ID=131616>.
- Freeze, C. & I. Bailey. (2011, 10 November). "Female RCMP officer delivers damning indictment of her employer." *Globe and Mail*.
- French, R., K. Wellings, P. Weatherburn. (2014). "An exploratory review of HIV prevention mass media campaigns targeting men who have sex with men." BioMed Central Ltd. *BMC Public Health* 14:616.
- Friesen, J. (2014, 5 December). "Winnipeg police told to stress protection of Indigenous women." *The Globe and Mail*.
- Fundación Solidaridad Democrática. (1988). "La prostitución de las mujeres." Madrid: Instituto de la mujer.
- Galley, V. (2009). "Reconciliation and the revitalization of Indigenous languages." In *Response, Responsibility and Renewal: Canada's Truth and Reconciliation Journey*. Ottawa, ON: Indigenous Healing Foundation.

- Galtung, J. (1996). *Peace by Peaceful Means: Peace and Conflict, Development and Civilization*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Gibran, K. (2011). *The Treasured Writings of Kahlil Gibran*. New York, NY: Open Road Integrated Media.
- Gillis, C. & K. Macqueen. (2011, 28 November). "A Royal Canadian disgrace." *Macleans*.
- Giroday, G. (2010, 7 May). "Trafficking in city targeted: Smith organizes awareness march." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Giroday, G. (2009, 21 November). "Police want tougher law on harbouring minors." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Gladwell, M. (2002). *The Tipping Point*. New York, NY: Back Bay.
- Glaser, B. (1992). *Basics of Grounded Theory Analysis: Emergence vs. Forcing*. Mill Valley, CA: Sociology Press.
- Glaser, B. G. & A. L. Strauss. (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. New York, NY: Aldine De Gruyter.
- Goar, C. (2006). "UN's criticism of Canada's record on human rights, poverty is ignored." *CCPA Monitor*, 8, 38 (February).
- Gorry, J., Roen, K. & J. Reilly. (2010). "Selling your self? The psychological impact of street sex work and factors affecting support seeking." *Health & Social Care in the Community*, 18, 5, 492–99.
- Grabish, A. (2016, 7 June). "It's getting worse': Winnipeg girls as young as 9 being lured into sex trade: Expert, Community forum on sex-trafficking hears details hard to hear." *Metro News Winnipeg*.

Grace, D. (2014). "Intersectionality-informed Mixed Method Research: A Primer Publisher."

The Institute for Intersectionality Research & Policy, (April).

Grant, T. (2016, 10 February). "The Trafficked: How sex trafficking works in Canada." *Globe and Mail*.

Grant, T. (2016, 23 February). "U.S. groups to offer tech expertise to help thwart traffickers." *Globe and Mail*.

Green, I. & J. White. (2007). "Canada's Public Service in the 21st Century: Discussion Paper." www.ppforum.ca/common/assets/publications/en/public_service_21st_century_en.pdf.

Greene, J. M., S. T. Ennett & C.L. Ringwalt. (1999). "Prevalence and correlates of survival sex among runaway and homeless youth." *American Journal of PublicHealth*, 89, 1406–09.

Guy, J. (2008). "Report of the Provincial Court of Manitoba on the Fatality Inquiries Act Inquest into the suicide of Tracia Owen." (16 January). http://www.manitobacourts.mb.ca/site/assets/files/1051/tracia_owen.pdf

Halek, K., M. Murdock & L. Fortier. (2005). "Spontaneous reports of emotional upset and health care utilization among veterans with posttraumatic stress disorder after receiving a potentially upsetting survey." *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 75, 1, 142– 51.

Hallett, B., N. Thornton & D. Stewart. (2006). "Indigenous People in Manitoba." Manitoba Indigenous Affairs Secretariat, Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada.

Ham, J. (2014). "Hope, healing, and the legacy of Helen Betty Osborne: a case study exploring cross-cultural peacebuilding in Northern Manitoba." Masters thesis, University of Manitoba.

- Ham, J. (2011). "What's the Cost of a Rumour? A guide to sorting out the myths and the facts about sporting events and trafficking." Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW). www.gaatw.org.
- Ham, J. & A. Gerard. (2014). "Strategic in/visibility: Does agency make sex workers invisible?" *Criminology & Criminal Justice*, 14, 3, 298–13
- Hamilton, A.C. & M. Sinclair. (1991). "Report of the Indigenous Justice Inquiry of Manitoba: The justice system and Indigenous people." Winnipeg, MB: Queen's Printer.
- Hankivsky, O. (2011). *Health Inequities in Canada: Intersectional Frameworks and Practices*. Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.
- Heckman, J., S. H. Moon, R. Pinto, P. A. Savelyev & A. Q. Yavitz (2010). "The rate of return to the High Scope Perry Preschool Program." *Journal of Public Economics*, 94,1-2, 114–28.
- Hedges, C. (2002). "Missing you already: A guide to the investigation of missing persons." http://research.org.uk/search_papers/hedges_missing_you_already.pdf.
- Highway of Tears website. (2016). <http://www.highwayoftears.ca/>.
- Holroyd, E. A., W. C. Wong, A. Gray & D. C. Ling. (2008). "Environmental health and safety of Chinese sex workers: A cross-sectional study." *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 45, 6, 932–41.
- Homer. (1909). *The Odyssey, translated by S.H. Butcher and A. Lang. Vol. XXII. The Harvard Classics*. New York: P.F. Collier & Son.
- Hong, Y., X. Li, X. Fang & R. Zhao. (2007). "Correlates of suicidal ideation and attempt among female sex workers in China." *Health Care for Women International*, 28, 5, 490–05.
- Hooks, B. (2000). *Feminist Theory from Margin to Center*. Cambridge, MA: South End Press.

- Hughes, D. (2003). "The driving force of sex trafficking." *Vital Speeches of the Day*, 69, 6, 182-83.
- Hughes, D. (2002). "Trafficking for sexual exploitation: The case of the Russian Federation." Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for Migration.
- Hunting, G. (2014). "Intersectionality-informed Qualitative Research: A Primer." *The Institute for Intersectionality Research & Policy*. Public Health Agency of Canada.
- Janis, I. L. (1982). *Groupthink: psychological studies of policy decisions and fiascoes*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Jenner, E., T. Evans, MPH. Williams, M. Matthews-Sterling, JK. Butts, L. Woodward, MA. Jenner. (2010). "Awareness Effects of a Youth Suicide Prevention Media Campaign in Louisiana." *Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior*, vol. 40, iss. 4 August, p. 394-06.
- Jeong, H. W. (1995/2000). *Peace and Conflict Studies: An Introduction*. Burlington, VT, US: Ashgate.
- Jootun, D., G. McGhee & G. R. Marland. (2009). "Reflexivity: Promoting rigour in qualitative research." *Nursing Standard*, 23, 42-6.
- Jorm, A. F., C. M. Kelly & A. J. Morgan. (2007). "Participant distress in psychiatric research: A systematic review." *Psychological Medicine*, 37, 917-26.
- Kaestle, C. E. (2012). "Selling and buying sex: A longitudinal study of risk and protective factors in adolescence." *Prevention Science*, 13, 314-22.
- Karnieli-Miller, O., R. Strier & L. Pessach. (2009). "Power relations in qualitative research." *Qualitative Health Research*, 19, 2, 279-89.

- Kaye, J., J. Winterdyk & L. Quarterman. (2014). "Beyond Criminal Justice: A Case Study of Responding to Human Trafficking in Canada." *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice*, (January).
- Kelly, L., M. Coy & R. Davenport. (2009). "Shifting Sands: A Comparison of Prostitution Regimes Across Nine Countries." *Child & Women Abuse Studies Unit*, London Metropolitan University, 40-3.
- Kempadoo K. & J. Doezema. (1998). *Global sex workers: Rights, resistance, and redefinition*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Kennedy, D., A. Braga, A. Piehl & E. Waring. (2001). *Reducing Gun Violence: Boston Gun Project's Operation Ceasefire*. Washington, DC: National Institute of Justice.
- Kirkup, K. (2014, 8 December). "Stop criminalizing sex work." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Klatt, T., D. Cavnerb & V. Eganc. (2014). "Rationalising predictors of child sexual exploitation and sex-trading." *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 38, 252–60.
- Klowak, M. (2016, 14 March). "Woman in Winnipeg is afraid she will be next MMIW: Shelters won't take her since she is not a victim of domestic violence." *CBC News*.
- Klaine, E. (1999). "Prostitution of Children and Child-Sex Tourism: An Analysis of Domestic and International Responses." National Center for Missing & Exploited Children, US Department of Justice.
- Klueber, S. A. (2003). "Trafficking in human beings: Law Enforcement response." Unpublished master's thesis, University of Louisville.
- Kong, T. S. K. (2006). "What it feels like for a whore: The body politics of women performing erotic labour in Hong Kong." *Gender, Work & Organization*, 13, 5, 409–34.

- Kriesberg, L. (1998). *Constructive Conflicts: From Escalation to Resolution*. Lanham, MA: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Lal, J. (1999). "Situating Locations: The Politics of Self, Identity, and 'Other' in Living and Writing the Text." In Hesse-Biber, S., C. Gilmartin & R. Lydenbert. *Feminist Approaches to Theory and Methodology: An Interdisciplinary Reader*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press. 100-37.
- Lalor, K. & R. McElvaney. (2010). "Child sexual abuse, links to later sexual exploitation/high-risk sexual behavior, and prevention/treatment programs." *Trauma, Violence & Abuse*, 11, 159–77.
- Lanning, K. (2001). "Criminal Justice Responses to the Prostitution of Children." http://www.sapsac.co.za/crim_just_report.pdf.
- Lau, D.C. (2012). *In The Analects*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press. 2002.
- Lau, J. T., H.Y. Tsui, S.P. Ho, E. Wong & X. Yang. (2010). "Prevalence of psychological problems and relationships with condom use and HIV prevention behaviors among Chinese female sex workers in Hong Kong." *AIDS Care*, 22, 6, 659–68.
- Lauwers, B. (2012). Presentation for the First Nations Managers and Practitioners Conference (unpublished) in Montreal, Canada (24 April).
- Lavoie, F., C. Thibodeau, M. Gagné & M. Hébert. (2010). "Buying and selling sex in Québec adolescents: A study of risk and protective factors." *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 39, 1147–60.
- Lawson, H. (2004). "The logic of collaboration in education and the human services." *Journal of Interprofessional Care*, 18, 3, (August).

- Lederach, J. P. (2005). *The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Lederach, J. P. (1997). *Building Peace: Sustainable Reconciliation in Divided Societies*. Washington, D.C.: United States Institute of Peace Press.
- Lederach, J. (1995-6). *Preparing for Peace: Conflict Transformation Across Cultures*. New York, NY: Syracuse University Press.
- Lee, M. (2011). *Trafficking and Global Crime Control*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Leech, B. L. (2002), "Asking Questions: Techniques for Semistructured Interviews." *Political Science & Politics*, 35, 4, 665–8.
- Legerski, J. P. & S. L. Bunnell. (2010). "The Risks, Benefits and Ethics of Trauma Focused Research Participation." *Ethics & Behavior*, 20, 6, 429-42.
- Leo, C. (2007). "Deep federalism: What do we have to do in order to protect community difference in national policy." blog.uwinnipeg.ca/ChristopherLeo/archives/2007/01/deep_federalism.html.
- Levy, J. & P. Jakobsson. (2013). "Abolitionist Feminism as Patriarchal Control: Swedish Understandings of Prostitution and Trafficking." *Dialectical Anthropology*, 37, 2 333-40.
- Linden, R. (2012). *Criminology: a Canadian perspective 7th ed*. Toronto, ON: Nelson Education Ltd.
- Lowman, J. (2000) "Violence and the Outlaw Status of (Street) Prostitution in Canada." *Violence Against Women*, 6, 9 (September), 987-1011.

- Lowman, J., M. Jackson, T. Palys & S. Gavigan. (1986). *Regulating sex: An anthology of commentaries on the findings and recommendations of the Badgley and Fraser reports*. Burnaby, BC: Simon Fraser University. 51-73.
- Lowman, J. (1987). "Taking young prostitutes seriously." *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 24, 1, 99-116.
- Lowman, J. (1986). "You can do it, but don't do it here: Some comments on proposals for the reform of Canadian prostitution law." In Lowman, J., M. Jackson, T. Palys & S. Gavigan (Eds.). *Regulating sex: An anthology of commentaries on the findings and recommendations of the Badgley and Fraser reports*. Burnaby, BC, Canada: Simon Fraser University.
- Lowry, C. & S. Littlejohn. (2003). "Dialogue and the Discourse of Peacebuilding in Maluku, Indonesia." *Conflict*, 23, 4, 409-26.
- Lozano, S. (2010). "Theoretical reading on 'Trafficking' in Women for the purpose of Sexual Exploitation in Prostitution: Case of study: Colombia." Masters thesis, Central European University. *Desafíos*, Bogotá, 23, 1, 217-57.
- Macleod, J. (1995). *Ain't No Makin' It: Aspirations and Attainments in a Low-Income Neighborhood*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Mac Ginty, R. & A. Williams. (2009). *Conflict and development*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Mandel, C. (2016, 8 March) "Indigenous girls face tough hurdles, new report on women in Canada states." *National Observer*.
- Manitoba Family Services and Housing. (2008). "Tracia's Trust, Front Line Voices: Manitobans Working Together to End Child Sexual Exploitation."
<http://www.gov.mb.ca/fs/traciastrust/>.

- Maslow, A. H. (1954). *Motivation and Personality*. New York, NY: Harper and Row.
- Matyok, T, S., J. Senehi & S. Byrne (2011). *Critical Issues in Peace and Conflict Studies: Theory, Practice and Pedagogy*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- McCall, L. (2005). "The Complexity of Intersectionality." *Signs*, 30, 3, 1771–1800.
- McCracken, M. & C. Michell. (2006). "Literature Review of Post-Secondary Education Skills Training and Aboriginal People in Manitoba." Canadian Center for Policy Alternatives, Manitoba.
- McIntyre, S. (2012). "Buyer Beware: A study into the demand side of the sexual exploitation industry." (November). <http://www.hindsightgroup.com/Resources>.
- McIntyre, S., D. Clark, N. Lewis & T. Reynolds. (2015). "The Role of Technology in Human Trafficking: A White Paper prepared for Microsoft." http://www.hindsightgroup.com/Resources/Human%20Trafficking%20White%20Paper_R_evised%20Draft.pdf
- Mcniff, J. & J. Whitehead. (2005). *All You Need to Know About Action Research*. London, ENG: Sage Publications.
- Meyers, D. T. (2014). "Feminism and Sex Trafficking: Rethinking Some Aspects of Autonomy and Paternalism." *Ethic Theory Moral Practice*, 17, 427–41.
- Mizus, M., M. Moody, C. Privado & C.A. Douglas. (2003). "Germany, U.S. receive most sex-trafficked women." *Off Our Backs*, 33, 7-8, 4.
- Morris, J. S. (2009). "The Truth About Interviewing Elites." *Politics*, 29, 3, 209–17.
- Muftic, L. & M. Finn. (2013). "Health Outcomes Among Women Trafficked for Sex in the United States: A Closer Look." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 28, 9, 1859-85.

Murray A. (1998). "Debt-Bondage and Trafficking. Don't believe the Hype." In Kempadoo K. & J. Doezema. *Global Sex Workers: Rights Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York, NY: Routledge. 52-64.

Native Women's Association of Canada. (2010). "Sisters in spirit: 2010 research findings."

<https://nwac.ca/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/2010-What-Their-Stories-Tell-Us-Research-Findings-SIS-Initiative.pdf>

Nebbitt, V., T. Tirmazi, M. Lombe, Q. Cryer-Coupet & S. French. (2013). "Correlates of the Sex Trade among African-American Youth Living in Urban Public Housing: Assessing the Role of Parental Incarceration and Parental Substance Use." *Journal of Urban Health: Bulletin of the New York Academy of Medicine*, 91, 2.

Nelson, J. (2014, 20 May). "Modern-day slavery generates billions: UN report." *Globe and Mail*.

Norris M.J., D. Beavon, E. Guimond & M. Cooke. (2000). "Migration and residential mobility of Canada's Aboriginal groups: An analysis of census data." Communication presented at the Population Association of America (PAA) meeting, San Francisco, CA.

Norris, M.J., D. Kerr & F. Nault. (1995). "Summary Report on Projections of the Population with Aboriginal Identity, Canada, 1991-2016." Population Projections Section, Demography Division, Statistics Canada, prepared for the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation.

Northrup, T. A. (1989). "The Dynamic of Identity in Personal and Social Conflict." In Kriesberg, L., T. Northrup & S. Thorson. *Intractable Conflicts and Their Transformation*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press. 55-82.

O'Brien, E, S. Hayes, B. Carpenter. (2013). *The Politics of Sex Trafficking: A Moral Geography*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

- Oppal, W. (2012). "Forsaken: The Report of the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry." Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication, British Columbia.
<http://www.bcsolutions.gov.bc.ca/opc/>.
- Ostroff, J. (2015, 4 July). "Manitoba First Nation's Solution To Foster Care Crisis: Remove Parents, Not Kids." *The Huffington Post Canada*.
- Outshoorn, J. (2004). *The politics of prostitution. Women's Movement, Democratic and the Globalisation of sex Commerce*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Pal, L. (2006). *Beyond Policy Analysis: Public Issue Management in Turbulent Times*. 3rd Ed. Toronto, ON : Nelson, Thompson Canada.
- Palys, T. S. & C. Atchison. (2008). *Research decisions: Quantitative and Qualitative Perspectives*. Toronto, ON: Thomson Nelson.
- Paperney, A. M. (2009, 27 August). "Latest deaths of native women may be linked to crack-for-sex case." *Globe and Mail*.
- Park, R. E. & E. W. Burgess. (1921). *An Introduction to the Science of Sociology*. Chicago, MI: University of Chicago Press.
- Parrot, A. & N. Cummings. (2008). *Sexual Enslavement of Girls and Women Worldwide*. Toronto, ON: Praeger Publishing.
- Patton, M. (1980). *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Paul, A. (2012, 23 June). "First Nations suicides reflect youth despair." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Perrin, B.(2010). *Invisible Chains: Canada's Underground World of Human Trafficking*. Toronto, ON: Penguin.

- Phillips, L. (1996). "Difference, Indifference and Making a Difference: Reflexivity in the Time of Cholera." In *Ethnographic Feminisms: Essays in Anthropology*, Edited by Cole, S. & L. Phillips. Ottawa, ON: Carleton University Press. 22-36.
- Phillips, S. & K. Levasseur, (2004). "The snakes and ladders of accountability: Contradictions between contracting and collaboration for Canada's voluntary sector." *Canadian Public Administration*, 47, 4, 451-74.
- Prest, A. (2016, 29 July). Four arrested for purchasing sex services. *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Prothrow-Stith, D. & H. Spivak. (2004). *Murder is No Accident*. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley and Sons.
- Puxley, C. (2014, 18 November). "Manitoba wants fewer kids in care put up in hotels." *The Canadian Press*.
- Rabson, M. (2013, 9 May). "Census 2011, City has highest Indigenous population, First Nations, Métis numbers growing rapidly." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- RCMP. (2014). "Human Trafficking National Co-ordination Center. Statistics: Human Trafficking in Canada" (March) <http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/ht-tp/index-eng.htm>.
- RCMP. (2013). "Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women: A National Operational Overview." <http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/pubs/mmaw-faapd-eng.pdf>.
- Reimer L., C. Schmitz, E. Janke, A. Askerov, B. Strahl & T. Matyók. (2015). *Transformative Change: An Introduction to Peace and Conflict Studies*. Lanham, MD: Lexington.
- Rice, B. "Relationships with Human and Non-Human Species and How They Apply toward Peacebuilding and Leadership in Indigenous Societies." In Matyok, T, S., J. Senehi & S. Byrne (2011). *Critical Issues in Peace and Conflict Studies: Theory, Practice and Pedagogy*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, p. 199.

- Richardson, J. (2015). Unpublished thesis proposal in progress, researching clinical interventions for sexually exploited youth, for her Master of Social Work, University of Manitoba.
- Ripsman, N. & J. Blanchard. (2003). "Qualitative research on economic interdependence and conflict: Overcoming methodological hurdles." In Mansfield. E. D. & B. Pollins (Eds.), *Economic interdependence and international Conflict*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press. 310-23.
- Robertson, M. & A. Sgoutas. (2012). "Thinking beyond the Category of Sexual Identity: At the Intersection of Sexuality and Human-Trafficking Policy." *Politics and Gender*, 8, 3.
- Rogers, J. & U. A. Kelly. (2011). "Feminist intersectionality: Bringing social justice to health disparities research." *Nursing Ethics*, 18, 3, 397-07.
- Roe-Sepowitz, D. E., K. E. Hickle, M. Loubert & T. Egan. (2011). "Adult prostitution recidivism: Risk factors and impact of a diversion program." *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation*, 50, 272–85.
- Rössler, W., U. Koch, C. Lauber, A. K. Hass, M. Altwegg, V. Ajdacic-Gross & K. Landolt. (2010). "The mental health of female sex workers." *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 122, 2, 143–52.
- Rothman, J. & M. L. Olson. (2001). "From Interests to Identities: Towards a New Emphasis in Interactive Conflict Resolution." *Journal of Peace Research*, 38, 3, 289-05.
- Rothman, J. & M. L. Olson. (1997). *Resolving Identity-Based Conflict in Nations, Organizations and Communities*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Rothman, J. & M. L. Olson. (1992). *From Confrontation to Cooperation: Resolving Ethnic and Regional Conflict*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

- Rugaber, C. S. & J. Boak. (2014, 27 January). "Wealth gap: A guide to what it is, why it matters". *AP News*.
- Runeson B. & J. Beskow. (1991). "Reactions of survivors of suicide victims to interviews." *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 83, 169–73.
- Said, E. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York, NY: Random House.
- Sancton, A. (2002). "Provincial and local public administration." In Dunn, C. *The Handbook of Canadian Public Administration*. Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press. 249-62.
- Sanders, T. (2004). "A continuum of risk? The management of health, physical and emotional risks by female sex workers." *Sociology of Health & Illness*, 26, 5, 557-74.
- Sandole, D., S. Byrne, I. Sandole-Staroste & J. Senehi. (2009). *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution*. New York, NY: Routledge Publishing.
- Sandole, D. (2003). "A typology." In Cheldelin, S., D. Druckman & L. Fast. *Conflict: From Analysis to Intervention*. New York, NY: Continuum International.
- Sansfaçon, D. (1984). "Prostitution in Canada: A research review report, working paper #10." Ottawa, ON: Department of Justice, Canada.
- Saunders, H. (2003). "Sustained Dialogue in Managing Intractable Conflict." *Negotiation Journal*, 19, 1, 85-95.
- Schauer, E. & E. Wheaton. (2006). "Sex Trafficking into the United States: A Literature Review." *Criminal Justice Review*, 31, 2 (June).
- Schein, E.H. (1985). *Organizational Culture and Leadership: A Dynamic View*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

- Schloenhardt, A. (1999). *Organised crime and the business of migrant trafficking: An economic analysis*. Paper presentation at the Australian Institute of Criminology, AIC Occasional Seminar, Canberra (November).
- Schwartz, D. (2014). "New prostitution laws unlikely to be challenged soon, legal experts say Police unlikely to launch clampdowns given tight resources, province's review." CBC News (Posted 12 December).
- Senehi, J. (2009). "Building Peace: Storytelling to Transform Conflicts Constructively." In *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution*. Sandole, D., J.D., S. Byrne, I. Sandole-Staroste & J. Senehi. New York, NY: Routledge Publishing. 201-15.
- Sethi, A. (2007). "Domestic Sex Trafficking of Aboriginal Girls in Canada: Issues and Implications." *First Peoples Child & Family Review*, 3, 3, 57-71.
- Shively, M., S. Kuck Jalbert, R. Kling, W. Rhodes, P. Finn, C. Flygare, L. Tierney, D. Hunt, D. Squires, C. Dyou & K. Wheeler. (2008). "Final Report on the Evaluation of the First Offender Prostitution Program." Office of Research and Evaluation National Institute of Justice 810 Seventh St., N.W. Washington.
- Simeon, R. (2002). "Federalism and intergovernmental relations." In Dunn, C. *The Handbook of Canadian Public Administration*. Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press. 204-23.
- Siskin, A. & L. Sun Wyler. (2010). *Trafficking in Persons: Policies and issues for Congress*. Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service (December).
- Smith, H. (2014). *Walking Prey: How America's Youth are Vulnerable to Sex Slavery*. New York, NY: Palgrave McMillan.
- Smith, J. (2014a). "The Tipping Point: Tackling the Demand for Prostituted/Trafficked Women and Youth." http://www.joysmith.ca/main.asp?fxoid=FXMenu,5&cat_ID=27&sub_ID=94.

- Smith, J. (2014b). "Connecting the Dots: A Proposal for a National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking" http://ncwba.org/wpcontent/uploads/2014/01/Combating_Sex_Trafficking-SmithNational_action_plan.pdf
- Smith, J. (2014c). Constituency website. http://www.joysmith.ca/main.asp?fxoid=FXMenu,5&cat_ID=27&sub_ID=94
- Smith, J. (2013). "Two Private Member's Bills that made Canadian History." *Canadian Parliamentary Review* (Spring).
- Sossou, M. A., C. D. Craig, H. Ogren & M. Schnak. (2008). "A qualitative study of resilience factors of Bosnian refugee women resettled in the southern United States." *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work*, 17, 4, 365–85.
- Stittle, M. (2007, 20 July). "Project Kare: How a missing women's task force works." *CTV News*.
- Stoney, C. & K.A.H. Graham. (2009). "Federal- municipal relations in Canada: The changing organizational landscape." *Canadian Public Administration*, 52, 3, 371–94.
- Taylor, J. (2015, 12 March). "Domestic trafficking an issue for aboriginal women and girls, says Canadian author 'Society doesn't care about missing and murdered indigenous women' says Anupriya Sethi." *CBC News*.
- Tickner, A. J. (2006). "On the Frontlines or Sidelines of Knowledge and Power? Feminist Practices of Responsible Scholarship." *International Studies Review*, 8, 3 (September), 383-95.
- Tindal, R. & S.N. Tindal. (2004). *Local Government in Canada*. 6th ed. Scarborough, ON: Nelson, Thomson.
- Totten, M. (2009). "Aboriginal youth and violent gang involvement in Canada: Quality prevention strategies." *IPC Review*, (3 March), 135–56.

- Trice, H M. & J. Beyer. (1993). *The Cultures of Work Organizations*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Trobbiani, K., K. Freeman, M. Arango, E. Lalor, D. Jenkinson & A. G. Thrift. (2013). “Comparison of stroke warning sign campaigns in Australia, England, and Canada.” *International Journal of Stroke*, World Stroke Organization. 28 vol 8, October, 28–31.
- Tuhawai-Smith, L. (1999). *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*. New York, NY: Zed Books.
- Tunney, M. (2016, 3 August). “Marion Buller, B.C. First Nations judge, to lead MMIW inquiry Federal government officially launches inquiry, names 5-member commission led by Buller.” *CBC News*.
- Tuso, H. (2013). Culture, Nature, and Gender lecture, seminar in Culture and Conflict, fall term, Arthur V. Mauro Center, University of Manitoba.
- Unesco. (2014). The Slave Route webpage. <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/dialogue/the-slave-route/modern-forms-of-slavery/>.
- UNODC. (2014). “Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2014.” United Nations www.unodc.org/documents/dataandanalysis/glotip/GLOTIP_2014_full_report.df.
- United Nations. (2014). “Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children.” United Nations Treaty Collection, https://treaties.un.org/pages/viewdetails.aspx?src=ind&mtdsg_no=xviii-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en.
- United Nations. (1979). “The 1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women.” www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/text/econvention.htm#intro.

- United States, Department of State. (2014). "Trafficking in Persons Report." Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (June) www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2014/?utm_source=NEW+RESOURCE:+Trafficking+in+Persons+R.
- Valentine, D. (2007). *Imagining Transgender: An Ethnography of a Category*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Valentini, C. & Kruckeberg, D. (2012). "New media versus social media: a conceptualization of their meanings, uses, and implications for public relations." In S. Duhe (Ed.), *New Media and Public Relations*. New York: Peter Lang. 3-12.
- Vanwesenbeeck, I. (2005). "Burnout among female indoor sex workers." *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 34, 6, 627–39.
- Venkatraman, B. A. (2003). "Human trafficking: A guide to detecting, investigating, and punishing modern-day slavery." *The Police Chief*, 70, 12, 1-8.
- Vidal-Ortiz, S. (2006). "Sexuality Discussions in Santeria: A Case Study of Religion and Sexuality Negotiation." *Journal of NSRC*. 3, 3, 52–66.
- Volkan, V.D. (1997). *Bloodlines: From Ethnic Pride to Ethnic Terrorism*. New York, NY: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- Weisberg, D.K. (1985). *Children of the night: A study of adolescent prostitution*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- Welch, M. A. (2014, 24 January). "New database lists 824 murdered, missing native women in Canada." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Westcott, K. (2013, 22 August). "What is Stockholm syndrome?" *BBC News Magazine*.
- Wheaton E., E. Schauer & T. Galli. (2010). "Economics of Human Trafficking." *International Migration*, 48, 4.

- Whittemore, R., Chase, S. K. & Mandle, C. L. (2001). "Validity in qualitative research." *Qualitative Health Research*, 11, 4, 522-37.
- Wiberg, H. (2005). "Peace Research: Past, Present, Future." *Revista Critica de Ciencias Sociais*, 71, 21-42.
- Wilson, S. (2008). *Research is Ceremony: Indigenous Research Methods*. Halifax, NS: Fernwood Publishing.
- Winterdyk, J. & P. Reichel. (2010). "Human trafficking: Issues and perspectives." *European Journal of Criminology*, 7, 1, 5-10.
- Winnipeg Free Press (2016, 20 October). "Five charged in Winnipeg as part of nationwide sex-trade sweep." *Winnipeg Free Press*.
- Winnipeg Sun. (2016, 29 July). "Johns busted, at-risk youths sent to safe spaces by cops." *Winnipeg Sun*.
- Wiseman, J. (1970). *Stations of the Lost: The Treatment of Skid Row Alcoholics*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.
- Wong, W. C., E. Holroyd & A. Bingham. (2011). "Stigma and sex work from the perspective of female sex workers in Hong Kong." *Sociology of Health & Illness*, 33, 1, 50-65.
- Wong, W. C., Wun, Y. T., Chan, K. W. & Y. Liu. (2008). "Silent killer of the night: A feasibility study of an out-reach well-women clinic for cervical cancer screening in female sex workers in Hong Kong." *International Journal of Gynecological Cancer*, 18, 1, 110-15.
- Wood, A. M. & N. Tarrier. (2010). "Positive clinical psychology: A new vision and strategy for integrated research and practice." *Clinical Psychology Review*, 30, 7, 819-29.

- Wrede, K. & R. B. Stiftung. (2013). “Anuradha Koirala – The woman who fights human trafficking in Nepal and beyond.” Human Dignity Forum website, <http://www.human-dignity-forum.org/2013/04/anuradha-koirala-the-woman-who-fights-human-trafficking-in-nepal-and-beyond/>.
- Younging, G. (2009). “Inherited history, international law, and the UN Declaration.” In Younging, G. J. Dewar & M. DeGagné, *Response, Responsibility and Renewal: Canada’s Truth and Reconciliation Journey*. ON: Aboriginal Healing Foundation (30 December).
- Yuen, W., W. Wong, E. Holroyd & C. Tang. (2014). “Resilience in Work-Related Stress Among Female Sex Workers in Hong Kong.” *Qualitative Health Research*, 24, 9, 1232–41.
- Zimmerman, C., M. Hossain & C. Watts. (2011). “Human trafficking and health: A conceptual model to inform policy, intervention and research.” *Social Science & Medicine*, 73, 327-35.

Appendices:**Appendix A: Service Provider Consent Form**

1

UNIVERSITY
OF MANITOBA**Informed consent for service providers****Study Title:** *Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada***Primary researcher:** Robert (Bob) Christmas, PhD Candidate, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, University of Manitoba, Telephone: [REDACTED]
Email: [REDACTED]**Research supervisor:** Dr. Sean Byrne, Professor, Peace and Conflict Studies, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, St. Paul's College, 70 Dysart Road, University of Manitoba, R3T 2N2, Telephone: [REDACTED]
Email: [REDACTED]

This consent form, a copy of which I will leave with you for your records, is only part of the process of informed consent. It should give you a basic idea of what the research is about and what your participation will involve. If you consent to be interviewed, it should take about one hour of your time. If you would like more detail about anything mentioned here, or need information that is not included, feel free to ask. Please take the time to read this carefully and to understand that this interview is voluntary.

Project Description:

This research seeks to learn from women with previous lived experience in the sex trade, their supporters and relevant service providers, what is needed to prevent or reduce sexual exploitation and human trafficking. The ultimate goal is to publish and share insights that will contribute to reduced sexual exploitation in Canada.

About the researcher:

I am currently a serving police officer with the Winnipeg Police Service, and also a PhD candidate at the University of Manitoba. As a sworn police officer I am compelled by law to act on information regarding the commission of crimes. Therefore, if you tell me about criminal activity that you have been involved in, I will stop you and advise you not to continue.

Confidentiality:

I will keep any information about your identity gathered in this research strictly confidential, unless you specifically authorize me to identify and/or quote you in my final reports and any literature that is written as a result of this research. If you are referred to in my thesis, or other venues, it would be written in such a way as to protect your identity and your real name or position would never be used, unless you specifically authorize it. Your interview will be recorded and analyzed as part of the study unless you decline to have it recorded. All written and recorded digital files will be kept in a safe and your consent form will be stored separately from the recorded interview. Only I will have access to your personal identity information and all of the information will be destroyed by the end of December, 2016.

Results of this research:

Within one year of the interview, I will provide you with a brief on the project (if you wish), outlining my general findings and progress. Results from this research will be described in my final written thesis, and likely in other publications and at professional meetings and conferences. At your request, I will also notify you about any publications that arise from this research.

Risks and Benefits:

The community may benefit if the findings of this research help in the improvement of practices and policies with respect to sexual exploitation and human trafficking. If your experience was traumatic, there is a possibility that reliving it through this interview may cause emotional reactions. If this does occur, please tell me and we can stop the interview at any time. A list of free service providers are provided at the end of this document, and you may access them at any time if you do experience any form of distress or wish emotional support at any time. I will not report the results of your interview or if you declined or consented to participate in an interview to anyone.

Participation is voluntary and you may withdraw at any time:

Participation in this research is voluntary, you may stop at any time during or after the interview by simply stating that you wish to not participate further. If you wish to withdraw from participating after the interview is done, you may call my private cell phone or leave an e-mail at the contacts on this form at anytime up to three months after the interview. If you do decline to participate, your interview material, whether it was recorded or written, and the consent form would be destroyed.

Consent:

Your signature on this form, or your verbal consent, indicates that you have understood to your satisfaction the information regarding this research project and that you agree to participate. In no way does this waive your legal rights or release the researchers or the University of Manitoba from its legal and professional responsibilities. If you would like more clarification at any point, or even a verbal report on the status of the project, please feel free to contact me at any time at the previously noted e-mails. You could also contact my academic advisor, Dr. Sean Byrne (as above) or the University of Manitoba Joint Faculty Research Ethics Board at (204) 474-7122.

This research has been approved by the University of Manitoba Research Ethics Board. If you have any concerns or complaints about this project you may contact them at [redacted] or e-mail at: [redacted]

Please answer the following questions with a check mark in the YES or NO box:

- | | YES | NO |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| I have read or had read to me the details of this consent form | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Have your questions have been addressed? | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Do you agree to participate in this study? | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

- | | YES | NO |
|--|-----|-----|
| Do you agree to have the interview audio-recorded? | () | () |
| Do you want the information to remain confidential? | () | () |
| Do you agree to have the findings (which may include quotations) from this project published or presented in a manner that does not reveal your identity? | () | () |
| Do you wish to be identified and quoted, and not remain anonymous in the study? | () | () |
| Do you agree to be contacted by phone or e-mail if further information is required after the interview | () | () |
| Do you wish to receive a summary of the findings? | () | () |

If YES, please provide an e-mail address or instructions how you would like to receive the summary:

Do you wish to receive a notification of any publications resulting from this study (my thesis, journal articles etc)? () ()

If YES, please provide an e-mail address or instructions how you would like to receive the notifications:

Participant's name (printed)_____

Participant's Signature _____

If done verbally- explain why:_____

Researcher's Signature _____

Date/Time:_____

Place:_____

Contacts for local mental health service providers

Crisis Response Centre, Winnipeg Regional Health Authority

The Crisis Response Centre is open 24 hours a day, seven days a week, and is located at 817 Bannatyne Avenue, at the corner of Tecumseh. The centre offers walk-in assessment and treatment for those in mental crisis, along with referrals to other mental health services. The centre is also home to the Mobile Crisis Service for adults. The Crisis Response Centre is designed for adults who are experiencing:

- Personal distress risk of harm associated with crisis, including suicide.
- Symptoms of a mental health condition that requires assessment and treatment.
- Circumstances that require de-escalation to prevent relapses.
- Mental health problems that, if dealt with, may prevent hospitalization.
- Emotional trauma, where assessment, crisis intervention and links to longer-term services can be made.
- Difficulty obtaining ongoing services after a crisis.
- Difficulty obtaining help after hours when mental health service providers are unavailable.

To access this team, call 204-940-1781 (24/7) or walk into 817 Bannatyne Avenue.

Klinic

Klinic Community Health provides a full range of health related services from medical care to counseling and education. Klinic's head office is located in the core area of Winnipeg at 870 Portage Avenue. Services at this site are staffed twenty-four hours a day, three hundred and sixty-five days per year.

To access this team, call (204) 786-8686 (24/7), walk into 870 Portage Avenue or access at through the Internet at any time through: www.Klinic.mb.ca

Thrive Counseling

Provides counseling support for depression, anxiety/stress, PTSD and relationship issues. This service charges \$80 per visit and fees may be covered by insurance or tax deductible.

200-254 Edmonton Street, Winnipeg, MB R3C3Y4, 1-204-774-4184

Website: www.thrivewinnipeg.com

Appendix B: Survivor Consent Form

1



UNIVERSITY
OF MANITOBA

Informed consent for experiential subjects

Study Title: *Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada*

Primary researcher: Robert (Bob) Christmas, PhD Candidate, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, University of Manitoba, Telephone: [REDACTED]
Email: [REDACTED]

Research supervisor: Dr. Sean Byrne, Professor, Peace and Conflict Studies, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, St. Paul's College, 70 Dysart Road, University of Manitoba, R3T 2N2, Telephone: [REDACTED]
Email: [REDACTED]

This consent form, a copy of which I will leave with you for your records, is only part of the process of informed consent. It should give you a basic idea of what the research is about and what your participation will involve. If you consent to be interviewed, it should take about one hour of your time. If you would like more detail about anything mentioned here, or need information that is not included, feel free to ask. Please take the time to read this carefully and to understand that this interview is voluntary.

Project Description:

This research seeks to learn from women with previous lived experience in the sex trade, their supporters and relevant service providers, what is needed to prevent or reduce sexual exploitation and human trafficking. The ultimate goal is to publish and share insights that will contribute to reduced sexual exploitation in Canada.

About the researcher:

I am a currently a serving police officer with the Winnipeg Police Service, and also a PhD candidate at the University of Manitoba. As a sworn police officer I am compelled by law to act on information regarding the commission of crimes. Therefore, if you tell me about criminal activity that you have been involved in, I will stop you and advise you not to continue.

Confidentiality:

I will keep any information about your identity gathered in this research strictly confidential. If you are referred to in my thesis, or literature, it would be written in such a way as to protect your identity and your real name or position would never be used. All digitally recorded or written files will be kept in a safe and your consent form will be stored separately from the recorded interview. Only I will have access to your personal identity information and all of the information will be destroyed by the end of December, 2016.

Results of this research:

Within one year of the interview, I will provide you with a brief on the project (if you wish), outlining my general findings and progress. Results from this research will be described in my final written thesis, and likely in other publications and at professional meetings and conferences. At your request, I will also notify you about any publications that arise from this research.

Risks and Benefits:

The community may benefit if the findings of this research help in the improvement of practices and policies with respect to sexual exploitation and human trafficking. If your experience was traumatic, there is a possibility that reliving it through this interview may cause emotional reactions. If this does occur, please tell me and we can stop the interview at any time. A list of free service providers are provided at the end of this document, and you may access them at any time if you do experience any form of distress or wish emotional support at any time. I will not report the results of your interview or if you declined or consented to participate in an interview to anyone.

Participation is voluntary and you may withdraw at any time:

Participation in this research is voluntary, you may stop at any time during or after the interview by simply stating that you wish to not participate further. If you wish to withdraw from participating after the interview is done, you may call my private cell phone or leave an e-mail at the contacts on this form at anytime up to three months after the interview. If you do decline to participate, your interview material, whether it was recorded or written, and the consent form would be destroyed.

Consent:

Your signature on this form, or your verbal consent, indicates that you have understood to your satisfaction the information regarding this research project and that you agree to participate. In no way does this waive your legal rights or release the researchers or the University of Manitoba from its legal and professional responsibilities. If you would like more clarification at any point, or even a verbal report on the status of the project, please feel free to contact me at any time at the previously noted e-mails. You could also contact my academic advisor, Dr. Sean Byrne (as above) or the University of Manitoba Joint Faculty Research Ethics Board.

This research has been approved by the University of Manitoba Research Ethics Board. If you have any concerns or complaints about this project you may contact them at [redacted] or e-mail at: [redacted]

Please answer the following questions with a check mark in the YES or NO box:

- | | YES | NO |
|--|-----|-----|
| I have read or had read to me the details of this consent form | () | () |
| Have your questions have been addressed? | () | () |
| Do you agree to participate in this study? | () | () |

3

Do you agree to have the interview audio-recorded? YES NO
() ()

Do you agree to be contacted by phone or e-mail if further information is required after the interview () ()

Do you wish to receive a summary of the findings? () ()

If YES, please provide an e-mail address or instructions how you would like to receive the summary:

Do you wish to receive a notification of any publications resulting from this study (my thesis, journal articles etc)? () ()

If YES, please provide an e-mail address or instructions how you would like to receive the notifications:

Participant's name (printed) _____

Participant's Signature _____

If done verbally- explain why: _____

Researcher's Signature _____

Date/Time: _____

Place: _____

Contacts for local mental health service providers

Crisis Response Centre, Winnipeg Regional Health Authority

The Crisis Response Centre is open 24 hours a day, seven days a week, and is located at 817 Bannatyne Avenue, at the corner of Tecumseh. The centre offers walk-in assessment and treatment for those in mental crisis, along with referrals to other mental health services. The centre is also home to the Mobile Crisis Service for adults. The Crisis Response Centre is designed for adults who are experiencing:

- Personal distress risk of harm associated with crisis, including suicide.
- Symptoms of a mental health condition that requires assessment and treatment.
- Circumstances that require de-escalation to prevent relapses.
- Mental health problems that, if dealt with, may prevent hospitalization.
- Emotional trauma, where assessment, crisis intervention and links to longer-term services can be made.
- Difficulty obtaining ongoing services after a crisis.
- Difficulty obtaining help after hours when mental health service providers are unavailable.

To access this team, call 204-940-1781 (24/7) or walk into 817 Bannatyne Avenue.

Klinic

Klinic Community Health provides a full range of health related services from medical care to counseling and education. Klinic's head office is located in the core area of Winnipeg at 870 Portage Avenue. Services at this site are staffed twenty-four hours a day, three hundred and sixty-five days per year.

To access this team, call (204) 786-8686 (24/7), walk into 870 Portage Avenue or access at through the Internet at any time through: www.Klinic.mb.ca

Thrive Counseling

Provides counseling support for depression, anxiety/stress, and PTSD and relationship issues.

This service charges \$80 per visit and fees may be covered by insurance or tax deductible.

200-254 Edmonton Street, Winnipeg, MB R3C3Y4, 1-204-774-4184

Website: www.thrivewinnipeg.com

Appendix C: Service Provider Interview Script

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Chrismas) 1

Interview # _____

Questions for service workers (police, social work, NGOs):

Subject name: _____

Subject position: _____

Place of interview: _____

Time and date: _____

Reason this subject contacted: _____

Consent protocol gone through and subject agrees to voluntary interview YES () NO ()
If "NO" terminate interview and note circumstances and if subject wishes to be contacted again.

Preliminary comments:

This will be recorded if you are still OK with that (turn on the recorder). If NO, then record longhand.

Thank-you for participating in this study. Remember that your participation in this research is purely voluntary and you may stop at any time. You may choose to not answer any question, stop the interview or withdraw from the study at any time either during or after the interview by telling me. If you wish to withdraw later, you can contact me by phone or e-mail and your information and the interview will be destroyed. If you do choose to stop the interview, we can talk about whether you wish to proceed at another time or if you want to withdraw from the study altogether. If you withdraw, you can decide if you want the information you gave me so far to be used in the study or to have it removed. Do you understand? (pause to receive acknowledgement).

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 2

Interview questions:

I am interested in understanding what might be done to reduce sexual exploitation and human trafficking in Canada and what might prevent people from being sexually exploited or help them to get out of the sex trade. I have a series of questions to start with, but in the end I want to hear all that you wish to offer.

1. Please describe your background and involvement in work around the sex trade.
2. Please describe one at a time, what do the terms prostitution, sexual exploitation and human trafficking mean to you and do they differ?
3. What strategies and approaches exist or have existed around sexual exploitation; how have they become more or less effective, and what should be done going forward?
4. Have practices of service agencies been culturally sensitive, and how could this be changed or improved?
5. Is there a critical event or turning point for youth when they enter the sex trade, what could be done to prevent it?
6. What could help people exit the sex trade?
7. What affect do the laws and law enforcement have on the sex trade and what should the police be doing?
8. What barriers or opportunities exist within your organization and between organizations, for doing the best job with sexual exploitation and how could this be improved?
9. If anything was possible and money was not object, what is the best thing that could happen in Canada around the sex trade and human trafficking?
10. Is there anything else you would like to add?

Concluding comments:

Thank you for sharing this with me. I will be transcribing and analyzing this interview, along with all the others. I have given you my contact information and I would be happy to hear from you if you have any comments or questions about this research. Please feel free to contact me anytime.

Appendix D: Survivor’s Interview Script

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 1

Interview # _____

Questions for survivors with lived experience:

Subject name: _____

Subject position: _____

Place of interview: _____

Time and date: _____

Reason this subject contacted: _____

**Consent protocol gone through and subject agrees to voluntary interview YES () NO ()
If “NO” terminate interview and note circumstances and if subject wishes to be contacted
again in the future.**

Preliminary comments:

This will be recorded if you are still OK with that (turn on the recorder). If NO, then record longhand.

Thank-you for participating in this study. Remember that your participation in this research is purely voluntary and you may stop at any time. You may choose to not answer any question, stop the interview or withdraw from the study at any time either during or after the interview by telling me. If you wish to withdraw later, you can contact me by phone or e-mail and your information and the interview will be destroyed. If you do choose to stop the interview, we can talk about whether you wish to proceed at another time or if you want to withdraw from the study altogether. If you withdraw, you can decide if you want the information you gave me so far to be used in the study or to have it removed. Do you understand? (pause to receive acknowledgement).

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 2

Interview questions:

I am interested in understanding what might be done to reduce sexual exploitation and human trafficking in Canada and what might prevent people from being sexually exploited or help them to get out of the sex trade. I have a series of questions to start with, but in the end I want to hear all that you wish to offer.

1. Please describe your background in the sextrade.
2. Please describe one at a time, what do the terms prostitution, sexual exploitation and human trafficking mean to you and do they differ?
3. Please describe your experiences and if there a critical moment or event when you entered the sex trade?
4. Is there anything any service agency worker or any other person, or yourself, could have done to prevent you entering the sex trade or to help you leave it?
5. Is there a critical event or turning point for youth when they enter the sex trade, and what do you think could prevent youth from entering the sex trade or being trafficked?
6. What strategies and approaches exist or have existed around sexual exploitation; how have they become more or less effective?
7. Have practices of service agencies been culturally sensitive, and how could this be changed or improved?
8. What affect do you think the laws and law enforcement have on the sex trade, what should the police be doing?
9. If anything was possible and money was no object, what is the best thing that could happen in Canada around the sex trade and human trafficking?
10. Is there anything else you would like to add?

Concluding comments:

Thank you for sharing this with me. I will be transcribing and analyzing this interview, along with all the others. I have given you my contact information and I would be happy to hear from you if you have any comments or questions about this research. Please fell free to contact me anytime.

Appendix E: Participant Referral Letter

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 1



UNIVERSITY
OF MANITOBA

Research referral/recruitment letter

To whom it may concern, this letter is intended to ask if you are interested in potentially being interviewed with respect to a research project being conducted through the University of Manitoba. The research project is titled, ***Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada***, and is seeking to gather information that will ultimately form recommendations to reduce sexual exploitation. You have been given this sheet because you are someone who is believed to have been in the sex trade at one time, and/or has knowledge about the sex trade and services that work around it. The primary researcher, Bob Christmas, is currently a candidate for a PhD in Peace and Conflict Studies at the University of Manitoba. Bob lives in Winnipeg and is also currently a serving officer with the Winnipeg Police Service. If you are interested in meeting Bob or talking by telephone to discuss the research project, he can be reached at the following contacts: Email: [REDACTED]

If you are interested in participating in the research, the interview would take about one hour and would be done at an appropriate time and place that is best for you. There is no obligation and should you choose to participate in an interview you would be able to stop at any time before, during or after the interview. At your request your interview could also be destroyed and it would be as though it never happened. If you are interviewed, you would first go through a detailed informed consent form with Bob, outlining all of your rights and how anonymity and confidentiality would be protected and you would be provided with a copy.

This is what the interview would be about

The following are the types of questions you would be asked, should you wish to be interviewed: Please describe what do the terms prostitution, sexual exploitation and human trafficking mean to you; is there a critical moment or event when people enter the sex trade?; what could service agencies or workers do to prevent people from entering the sex trade or help them get out?; are existing strategies and laws effective and are they culturally sensitive? You would also have the choice add any information you feel would be helpful and also would be free to not answer any of the questions.

Risks and Benefits:

You and the community *may* benefit *if* the findings of this research help in the improvement of practices and policies with respect to sexual exploitation and human trafficking. There is a risk that describing experiences that were traumatic or emotionally stressful for you may cause you to feel traumatized. Before the interview, Bob would caution you about this, with the consent form he will go through with you. Bob is not a professional health care provider, so he would provide you with the contact information and ways to gain free counseling resources in Winnipeg, in the event that you do feel an adverse reaction to being interviewed. Also, Bob is currently a sworn police officer. Therefore, if you tell Bob about criminal activity you have been involved in he may caution you not to describe it further. If you were to implicate others in criminal behavior the information you provide in this interview would not be used for investigative purposes or as evidence against others. If you wished to make a complaint, you would be put in touch with a police officer to provide whatever information you wish.

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 2

Confidentiality:

All information about your identity gathered in this research will be kept strictly confidential unless you specifically wish to be quoted in the thesis and any literature that is written as a result of this research. All written and recorded digital files will be kept in a secure location and will later be destroyed.

Results of this research:

Within one year of the interview you would be provided with a written brief (if you wish to receive it), outlining the general findings and progress of the research project. Results from this research will be described in the final written thesis, other publications and at conferences or professional meetings. At your request, you could also be notified about any publications that arise from this research.

If you wish to participate in being interviewed for this research, please contact Bob at the below e-mail or phone number. If you have questions or concerns, please feel free to contact Bob, or his academic supervisor, Dr. Sean Byrne, or the University of Manitoba Ethics Review Board at the below contacts.

Contact information:

University of Manitoba

This research has been approved by the **Joint Faculty Ethics Review Board** of the University of Manitoba; you have any concerns or complaints about this project you may contact them at (204)

[REDACTED]

Supervisor

You could also contact research supervisor, Dr. Sean Byrne, Professor, Peace and Conflict Studies, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, St. Paul's College, 70 Dysart Road, University of Manitoba, R3T 2N2, phone: [REDACTED]

Primary researcher

The primary researcher for this project is Robert (Bob) Christmas, PhD Candidate, Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, University of Manitoba, Telephone: [REDACTED] Email:

[REDACTED]

Appendix F: Transcriptionist Agreement

Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada (Robert W. Christmas) 1



Transcriber confidentiality agreement

Transcriptionist

I (printed), _____, agree to maintain full confidentiality in regards to any and all audio files and documentation received from Robert Christmas related to his research study titled "Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada."

Furthermore, I agree:

1. To hold in strictest confidence the identification of any individual that may be revealed during the transcription of audiotaped interviews, or in any associated documents.
2. To not make copies of any audiotapes or computerized titles of the transcribed interviews texts, unless specifically requested to do so by the researcher, Bob Christmas.

I am aware that I can be held legally responsible for any breach of this confidentiality agreement, and for any harm incurred by individuals if I disclose identifiable information contained in the audiotapes and/or files to which I will have access.

Transcriber's signature _____

Witness name (printed) _____

Witness signature _____

Date _____

Appendix G: Ethics Board Approval Certificate



Research Ethics and Compliance
Office of the Vice-President (Research and International)

Human Ethics
208-194 Dafoe Road
Winnipeg, MB
Canada R3T 2N2
Phone +204-474-7122
Fax +204-269-7173

APPROVAL CERTIFICATE

November 18, 2015

TO: Robert William Christmas (Advisor S. Byrne)
Principal Investigators [Redacted]

FROM: Lorna Guse, Chair
Joint-Faculty Research Ethics Board (JFREB)

Re: Protocol #J2015:125
"Perceptions on confronting sexual exploitation in Canada"

Please be advised that your above-referenced protocol has received human ethics approval by the **Joint-Faculty Research Ethics Board**, which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement (2). **This approval is valid for one year only.**

Any significant changes of the protocol and/or informed consent form should be reported to the Human Ethics Secretariat in advance of implementation of such changes.

Please note:

- If you have funds pending human ethics approval, please mail/e-mail/fax (261-0325) a copy of this Approval (identifying the related UM Project Number) to the Research Grants Officer in ORS in order to initiate fund setup. (How to find your UM Project Number: <http://umanitoba.ca/research/ors/mrt-faq.html#pr0>)
- if you have received multi-year funding for this research, responsibility lies with you to apply for and obtain Renewal Approval at the expiry of the initial one-year approval; otherwise the account will be locked.

The Research Quality Management Office may request to review research documentation from this project to demonstrate compliance with this approved protocol and the University of Manitoba *Ethics of Research Involving Humans*.

The Research Ethics Board requests a final report for your study (available at: http://umanitoba.ca/research/orec/ethics/human_ethics_REB_forms_guidelines.html) **in order to be in compliance with Tri-Council Guidelines.**

Appendix H: Two Year Missing Persons Plan

<p>Name SS-6 High risk youth intervention strategy</p>	<p>Description Internal audits have revealed that the WPS invests 30,000 person-hours in 5,000 missing person investigations each year. About 3,000 are children in the care of child welfare agencies, some with over 150 police contacts and as many child welfare agency involvements. Research, experts across North America, and our Manitoba experience has revealed that these youth, when on the run, are at high risk to be criminalized, initiated into gangs and substance abuse, victimized and exploited. Recognizing that no single agency can tackle these overarching social issues, the WPS has embarked on an innovative, new, multi-disciplinary, collaborative, strategy with networks of stakeholders, to identify and intervene with high risk youth in Winnipeg. Some of the partners:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MB Child Protection Branch (regulating child welfare agencies) • MB Justice (harboring and exploitation charges) • Child protection agencies (more than 20) • Other Police agencies (locally to internationally) • Aboriginal agencies (AMC, Southern Chiefs, NWAC, Mother of Red nations, Métis Federation) • NGO's (Child Find, Sage House, Rossbrook House, Ndniaaway , outreach networks) • Group Homes (Marymount, Knowles, BNL) • Political (Minister of Family Services & Housing) • Media (emergent messages and positive stories) • Internally (Missing Persons, Vice, Uniform) 	<p>Pertinent details Collaboration & partnerships:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Working with a wide range of child welfare agencies and the Provincial regulatory bodies to improve efficiency and effectiveness of the whole system, fixing systemic failures and policy gaps to protect children better. <p>Saving and improving lives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This strategy identifies “fringe” youth that historically have fallen into policy gaps between the mandated child protection agencies. The WPS is collaborating with numerous agencies to help these youth. <p>Prevention rather than reacting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historically child welfare and police disciplines operated in isolation. Now, we are focussed on identifying and intervening with high risk youth before they become a chronic drain to the system and tragically victimized. <p>Intelligence-led long term strategy:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The vision is clear, improving efficiency and effectiveness of the multi-agency system, saving and improving lives, and improving interagency and community resilience through engagement and involvement. <p>Savings to the system:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We are identifying root causes and intervening before troubled youths consume massive resources. This strategy should result in massive long-term savings to the policing, justice, and health systems. 	<p>Costs Costs: This initiative is cost-effective, resulting in improved service and reduced overall drain on police resources. Currently, the initiative is led by the Missing Persons Unit, which consists of 5 Constables and three civilian staff - coordinated by one Sergeant. The MP Unit currently handles half of the total 30,000 officer-hours managed annually by the WPS on missing person calls. Partners: MB Family Service & Housing had recently added \$10 M, annualized, for secure facilities for high risk youth, and 5 additional outreach workers specifically to support this initiative with high risk and exploited youth. The Province has called this project “Street Reach.” Challenges: This initiative is labour intensive while maintaining all traditional mandates.</p>
---	--	--	---

Appendix I: Briefing Note on Harboursing Initiative

WINNIPEG POLICE SERVICE
Advisory Note for the
Commander of Division #41



Issue: Harboursing of runaway youth in Winnipeg

Background:

Approximately half of the Winnipeg Police Service's (WPS) 4,000 yearly missing person reports are actually 'run away' from lawful Child and Family Services (CFS) placements of various types. Responsibility crosses the WPS mandate for general public safety and the social services' responsibility for child welfare. In recent years the WPS requirement under the CFS Act, to assist and support social workers, has evolved to a more substantial role of searching for runaway youths. This is due in part to changing social conditions in Canada wherein gang involvement, illicit street drugs, exploitation through the sex-trade, and vulnerability of 'runaway' youth are now perceived as significant risk factors that require increased police support to the social agencies. Social service agencies generally cite a lack of resources for this aspect of their mandate, despite consensus within most agencies that this is a serious emerging social problem.

The recent addition of sworn members to the centralized WPS 'Missing Persons Unit' (MPU) has facilitated a higher degree of expertise, and centralized coordination of resources, and has allowed it to manage 70 to 90 emergency cases at all times. Many of those cases would otherwise be a burden to Uniform Operations. The current MPU mandate also includes complex international and inter-provincial abductions, long term (cold case) missing persons, and emergent cases wherein missing people are deemed vulnerable due to mental health issues, threats of suicide, old or young age, illness, and environmental threats such as Manitoba's extreme weather.

Over the past year, I have worked with the Child Protection Branch, in (re) establishing the 'multi-system high risk youth committee', specifically to address group home issues. As a result, clear direction has been given to Manitoba's group home staff, to use the discretion provided under the CFS Act, before drawing on police resources by making premature missing person reports. The committee has contributed in a variety of ways, including: managing individual problem cases, policy for provincial 'outreach' workers, improved communication and understanding between stakeholder agencies, and input into provincial programs. The committee continues to meet.

Harboursing:

Many 'runaway youth' are repeatedly recovered at places that CFS workers have deemed to be inappropriate or dangerous. In such cases a policy has been implemented by CFS to serve a warning letter advising people that they may be charged under Section 52 (c) of the CFS Act, 'Interference with children in care.' This was enacted to deter 'harbouring' of runaways from their lawful placements, and reads as follows: "Any person (c) who detains or harbours a child who is in the care of an agency or treatment centre and who is absent from the premises in which that child is placed without authority... is guilty of an offence and is liable on summary conviction to a fine of not more than \$50,000, or imprisonment for a term of not more than 24 months, or both" (Sec. 52 CFS Act). This charge has not yet been laid in the City of Winnipeg. Consequently, the public does not fear from being served a warning letter, social workers are expressing a lack of confidence in the usefulness of the CFS Act, and the resources of the WPS, CFS, and a wide range of smaller social service agencies continue to be wasted by repeatedly recovering children that are harboured from their lawful placements. Colleagues in the Child Protection Branch have expressed great interest, up to the Ministerial level, in making use of the CFS Act for suppression of 'harbouring.' I have agreed to cooperate and pursue an interagency strategy to increase public awareness and deterrence of harbouring runaways.

Immediate strategy:

Meetings are planned for the fall of 2008, for discussion between the stakeholder agencies: WPS, MB Child Protection Branch, Public Prosecutions, and others. I have suggested to the stakeholders that a 'bottom up' approach may be more effective than high level meetings of numerous stakeholders that may result in an overwhelming complexity of issues that will be counterproductive to implementation of a process. The stakeholders agree with my suggestion to select and prosecute a suitable case in order 'kick start' the process, to clarify the elements that are required for successful prosecutions, and to identify systemic areas for improvement between the social service agencies and the police. A current case appears to have the elements for a successful prosecution. In this case a social worker can testify that she personally served a subject with a harbouring letter, and the runaway child in question (a CFS ward) has been repeatedly removed from the address in question by the WPS officers, all within the past month. Prosecutor, Terry McComb, was briefed on July 24th, 2008, and she provided direction on the elements that need more work, namely: a statement from the social worker on how the harbouring letter was served and further background of the involved child and the harbouring suspect. We have an appointment for Wednesday July 30th, 2008, for approval of a charge. One social worker who is the primary witness is cooperating fully with the investigation. A second social worker cited confidentiality concerns in providing client information to WPS detectives. Ms. Ash-Ponce was consulted and is reassuring and directing this social worker to cooperate fully with the WPS investigation. Following the crown consultation meeting it is anticipated that the first WPS charge of 'harbouring' will be laid.

Future strategy:

Once the elements that are required for successful prosecutions are clarified, social workers will be directed by the Child Protection Branch to provide a report on those elements, along with the harbouring letters that are faxed to the WPS, MPU. A process will be developed to flag harbouring subjects and the CFS reports in Niche. In this way police crews will have all the information required to lay a charges at 'onview' offences at any time, with no further investigation required. Ultimately, this can be achieved through a WPS routine order outlining the process, the appropriate wording, and designated court for an offence notice. Implementation of this process, including several prosecutions, should occur over the next six months. The stakeholders plan a media campaign on several issues, including messaging regarding this initiative. We are also exploring, with the Crown and WPS Morals unit, the potential of charging 'johns' with harbouring under the CFS act, as a potential deterrent to exploitation of children in the sex-trade.

Challenges:

A previous case that was submitted for crown opinion by the WPS, MPU, was returned declining to proceed with prosecution, suggesting a range of other remedies, and requiring a large amount of work. In the current discussion with Terry McComb, it is postulated that Section 52 and other similar sections of the CFS Act are ineffective if they require extensive investigation in order to lay issue an offence notice. She agreed, and is willing to discuss proceeding. People involved in higher levels within the Justice Department, and the Government of Manitoba, are interested in this particular issue. Ms. Ash-Ponce advises that similar charges are regularly pursued in other jurisdictions, and the RCMP have had about six prosecutions for harbouring.

Impact:

Implementation of these initiatives will improve public confidence through the positive media that is anticipated. It will demonstrate our effective interagency cooperation in addressing serious social problem. It will also provide the police with an effective recourse for circumstances that fall short of thresholds for criminal charges in child welfare cases. No significant costs are anticipated. Operationally, the overall resource drain caused by runaways should be reduced. There is no negative operational issue for two reasons: 1- if found to be ineffective for any reason, charges can simply not be laid, and 2- a policy for processing these charges by the WPS members at large would not be implemented until all the issues are worked out by the Missing Persons Unit.

Contact person: Bob Christmas, Sergeant, WPS Missing Persons Unit Cell [REDACTED]

Appendix J: List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives

Compiled with the assistance of Dr. Karlee Sapoznik Evans, Specialist, Tracia's Trust: Manitoba's Strategy to Prevent Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking.

-- AGENCY -- PROGRAM -- STATUS	DESCRIPTION
Ndinawe Ndinawe Youth Shelter Ongoing	Ndinawe Youth Shelter is a residential safe home that provides accessible, 24-hour shelter and basic necessities for children and youth who are “at risk” of being on the street, are runaways, or are presently living on the street (maximum capacity of 16 beds), averaging 35 youth and 400 bed-nights per month.
Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre Honoring the Spirit of Our Little Sisters Ongoing	Known as “Little Sisters” it is a 6 bed safe group care home for female and transgender youth, between the ages of 13 to 17 years old, subjected to and at risk for continued sexual exploitation. The program has been operating since 2003, developed by woman with lived experience in response to a need for specialized placements for sexually exploited youth. Programming includes weekly meetings, sharing circles, PASS (Positive Adolescent Support), teaching regarding the realities of sexual exploitation, life skills, cultural teachings and ceremonies. Once the youth is ready, advocacy for education becomes a part of their care plan, and the TERF day program helps transition youth into education.
Marymount Rose Hall Ongoing	This is a 6 bed group care home, established in 2003, for Level 4 (at-risk) girls, ages 13 to 17, who have experienced significant childhood sexual abuse and have been identified as transitioning into sexual exploitation. All staff attending Marymount Resiliency training on Strength Based Practice, Trauma, Attachment and Connections as well as the 6 day Provincial Sexual Exploited Youth (SEY) Training. Rose Hall has a clinician staff to work with the girls through the issues they are presenting with (addictions, trauma, attachment, etc.)
New Directions TERF Youth Program Ongoing	TERF Youth program focuses on specialized treatment for 15 females and transgendered females under the age of 18 and have who have been sexually exploited. In operation since 1986, TERF is the longest operating program in the Province working with this population. Half of TERF staff have lived experience and the program uses multiple models of treatment from cultural based teachings, western psychotherapies as well as access to ceremonies.

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 2 of 11
<p>Child Protection Branch</p> <p>Sexual Exploitation Regional Teams</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>A Regional Team is a committee of various multi-system stakeholders whose goal is to provide services in an integrated manner to address the issue of sexual exploitation in Manitoba. Development continues with 12 regional teams across the province. Evaluation and strategic planning are in process.</p>	
<p>New Directions & Child Protection Branch</p> <p>SEY Training</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p><i>Understanding & Working with Child & Youth Who Have Been Sexually Exploited</i> is a training curriculum, available since 2005, for child and family services system workers, and for those working with children and youth affected by sexual exploitation. The SEY 6-day training continues with three Winnipeg and two rural course yearly (based on requests). More than fifty-four sessions have been held for Social Workers, Child and Youth Care Workers, Law Enforcement, Educators, Probations, Justice, etc., with rural sessions in: Thompson, Brandon, Dauphin, The Pas, Pine Falls and Selkirk.</p>	
<p>MFS</p> <p>Increased Penalties for Child Protection (2005)</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Legislation was amended to increase penalties under <i>The Child and Family Services Act</i> related to causing a child to be in need of protection, sexual exploitation and interference of a child in care. Street Reach (STR) consistently uses this legislation and has been successful in getting convictions of offender under this legislation. For example, one offender was sentenced to a year in custody under Sec. 52 of the CFS Act.</p>	
<p>Manitoba Justice</p> <p>Protocol for Child Victim Supports</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Development of a protocol for Child Victim Support Services to assist sexually exploited youth through the court process.</p>	
<p>Child Protection Branch</p> <p>Provincial Strategy Coordinator</p> <p>Ongoing (position currently vacant)</p>	<p>Announced in 2002 as a component of phase 1 of Tracia’s Trust, the Provincial Strategy Coordinator coordinates existing services for high risk children and youth. The Sexual Exploitation Unit (SEU) Manager manages the Tracia’s Trust Provincial Strategy.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 3 of 11
<p>Family Services and Manitoba Justice</p> <p>Neighbourhood Solutions booklet (2002)</p> <p>Completed</p>	<p>Create and distribute a neighbourhood renewal kit to assist communities to address sexual exploitation and abuse. Implemented and distributed a booklet called “Neighbourhood Solutions.” The booklet can still be accessed online on the Manitoba Justice Website at: http://www.gov.mb.ca/justice/safe/neighbourhoodsolutions.pdf</p>	
<p>Macdonald Youth Services (MYS)</p> <p>MYS Youth Resource Centre/Shelter</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The MYS Youth Resource shelter provides services to children, youth and families throughout Manitoba to grow and heal through safe, caring, respectful and collaborative relationships. The program provides support to approximately 1,200 youth aged 12 to 20 years old yearly. It provides approximately 1,200 safe overnights to 500 different youth aged 12 to 17 years old, with 8 safe overnight beds and a youth resource centre with resources for youth 24 hours a day. Length of stay in the shelter beds continues to be short-term with most youth staying a maximum of three nights at a time.</p>	
<p>Ndinawe/Red River Community College</p> <p>Ndinawe Child and Youth Care Training</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The Youth Care Worker Training Program is a community-based, accredited training program for experiential adults to gain skills and knowledge to work in the youth care field. Since inception in 2007, there have been approximately 100 graduates; some have gone on to continue their studies and at least 50% are working in the field full time. The program received funding for 5-years from the Canadian Women’s Foundation to support their alumni group who meet weekly.</p>	
<p>Child Protection Branch (WPG)</p> <p>Street Reach(STR)</p> <p>(1 manager & 2 outreach & 1 admin support)</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Street Reach provides a rapid coordinated response by child welfare, police and community outreach agencies for high risk child victims who are at risk of sexual exploitation. STR also responds to any missing child that is located so that they can be returned to safety. Six STR Workers are hired through non-governmental organizations (NGO). In 2014/15 there were 1675 encounters; 504 returns (of runaways); 1112 relationship contacts; 2856 address checks; and 287 different youth had contact (173 SEY and 114 non-SEY). In addition STR had 171 encounters with offenders (96 different offenders). In 2014/15 Street Reach experienced a 396% increase in <i>accepted</i> referrals; this does not include children who were referred but were not assessed as exploited; 14 High Risk Victim (HRV) children (1st priority); 20 children (2nd priority) on assessment consideration group; 7 monitored; and 65 pending assessments. STR services are currently on hold pending staffing resources to operate. In 2014/2015 STR completed two rural projects with RCMP (4 to 5 days in length) which resulted in 5 arrests under the <i>Child Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking Act</i> and two arrests under Criminal Code offences (sexual interference and procuring). STR worked with the Crowns and RCMP and gained two convictions; three are still pending in the courts.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 4 of 11
<p>New Directions</p> <p>TERF Mentor Program</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>TERF Mentor Program provides intense one-on-one mentoring support, systems advocacy, and case management for up to an additional 20 sexually exploited female and transgendered individuals under the age of 20. In September 2015, New Directions/TERF gained status as an Independent School.</p>	
<p>All Nations Coordinated Response Network (ANCR)</p> <p>ANCR Investigation Specialists</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Two sexual exploitation investigation specialists work in partnership with the Winnipeg Police Service and the Street Reach Winnipeg team to provide a multi-system coordinated response to a specifically targeted group of children. The two investigators are housed at ANCR and continue to work with Street Reach and WPS in respect to at-risk and sexually exploited youth and/or alleged sexual exploitation offenders.</p>	
<p>Addictions Foundation of Manitoba Youth Division</p> <p>AFM Youth Outreach Workers</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>AFM provides a half time outreach worker that specifically supports children and youth in care that are at risk of sexual exploitation. The worker provides addiction counselling services and counselling support to kids that are in care of CFS, and the TERF Youth Mentorship day program.</p>	
<p>Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre</p> <p>Hands of Mother Earth (HOME)</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>HOME is a 6-bed rural healing lodge for female and transgender sexually exploited youth, aged 13 to 17. Typically, the children at HOME are also experiencing significant addiction issues as well. In operation since 2011, based on a community response and the voice of our youth that a rural traditional healing lodge for sexually exploited youth was needed HOME is located one hour out of Winnipeg on sacred land formerly owned by Elder Mae Louise Campbell. Home is based on the value/strength based model of care, traditional healing is the main basis of treatment and being connected to mother earth, away from the triggers of the city environment are key within this model. Programming includes life skills, realities of sexual exploitation, Positive Adolescent Support (PASS), cultural teachings and ceremonies, access to elders, activities and recreation.</p>	
<p>Ka Ni Kanichihk Inc.</p> <p>Restoring the Sacred (RTS)</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Restoring the Sacred (RTS) is a youth-to-youth peer mentorship program designed to prevent victimization and provide supportive services to indigenous youth relocated to Winnipeg to attend school. The target group for the program is 15 to 20 Indigenous youth aged 14 to 21. The RTS program began in 2005 working with indigenous youth transitioning from rural communities.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 5 of 11
<p>BlueThunderbird Inc. KiMaMina (Annabella) Ongoing</p>	<p>Ki Ma Mina (Annabella) is a 3-bed transition (foster) home for female sexually exploited youth and young adults.</p>	
<p>New Directions TERF Youth Transition Home Ongoing</p>	<p>Since 2012, the TERF transition home, a 6-bed independent group care facility for sexually exploited youth who are wards of the Child and Family Services system and whose case have been extended beyond the age of majority, has operated out of New Directions. It is designed for individuals who could eventually move into independent living.</p>	
<p>New Directions Lodge Teachings Ongoing</p>	<p>The Kappapako Miikiwaap Lodge Teachings is a culturally sensitive curriculum written by Elder Myra Laramee focusing on preventing the sexual exploitation of children and youth. In 2006, the curriculum was revised for front line persons who work with children and youth. Training is offered through New Directions. There has been more than 21 groups of learners, 3 rural sessions in Thompson and 18 sessions in Winnipeg.</p>	
<p>MB Justice Mandatory Reporting of Child Pornography Ongoing</p>	<p>On April 15, 2009, legislative amendments to <i>The Child and Family Services Act</i> were proclaimed by the Province of Manitoba requiring the mandatory reporting of child pornography by all Manitobans to Cybertip.ca. <i>The Child and Family Services Act</i> was amended to include child pornography in the definition of child abuse.</p>	
<p>Canadian Centre for Child Protection (CCCP) Cybertip.ca Ongoing</p>	<p>Cybertip.ca is the national tip line for reporting the online sexual exploitation of children. It is a core program of the Canadian Centre for Child Protection, and has been operational since September 2002. The mandatory reporting of child pornography legislation was the first legislation of its kind in Canada. Between 2009 and 2016, over 2,000 reports were submitted by individuals within Manitoba and classified as child pornography. The majority of reports pertained to websites and were sent to both law enforcement and Child Welfare.</p>	
<p>Any CFS agency Support from Street Reach, CPB, if needed Implemented</p>	<p>Section 52 of <i>The Child and Family Services Act</i> specifies that anyone who is interfering with a child who is in care can be charged under provincial legislation. There have been at least 7 convictions in relation to section 52 that were completed by the StreetReach team. In 2014/2015 a man who had a long standing history of exploiting children was convicted under Section 52 of the CFS Act and received a yearlong custody sentence.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 6 of 11
<p>MB Justice/CPB Worker Recruitment Protection Act Implemented</p>	<p>Canada’s first talent industry law to protect children from sexual exploitation, including exploitative modelling, the <i>Manitoba Worker Recruitment and Protection Act</i> came into force on March 31, 2009. It requires licensing of child talent agencies. This Act also includes the protection of foreign workers vulnerable to trafficking.</p>	
<p>MB Justice Prosecution Coordinator Ongoing</p>	<p>A specialized prosecution coordinator to strengthen case outcomes was announced in 2008.</p>	
<p>Canadian Centre for Child Protection Commit to Kids Ongoing</p>	<p>Since 2007, the Commit to Kids abuse prevention program offers a comprehensive child protection kit created to help organizations reduce the risk of sexual abuse by improving recruitment of staff and volunteers, creating child protection policies, and identifying and responding to potential abuse. The Commit to Kids program was expanded to Group Care and Foster Care programs within Manitoba.</p>	
<p>CPB Snowflake Place Ongoing</p>	<p>Snowflake Place, Child Advocacy Center (CAC) opened in 2013, enabling multi-system collaboration and to foster best practices in child abuse investigations, to ensure that victims receive effective, sensitive, and immediate support in a setting that puts their needs first.</p>	
<p>Multiple Reality Check Campaign Completed</p>	<p>A multi-lingual campaign translated into nine languages directed at predators about their impact; booklets and posters were prepared by Winnipeg Police Service, Manitoba Justice and the Salvation Army and were distributed in summer of 2009. In 2015, an additional run was completed to update materials with the current Canadian prostitution laws. Funding was provided for the update of both the reality check booklet and nine languages poster by the City of Winnipeg, Status of Women Manitoba and the Salvation Army.</p>	
<p>CPB Under the Radar Completed</p>	<p>The project <i>Under the Radar</i> was to coordinate and enhance resources for sexually exploited males. Dr. Sue McIntyre released a report entitled “Under the Radar: the Sexual Exploitation of Young Men” and was funded to conduct training in Winnipeg on the sexual exploitation of males (2008). This project is now complete. The research can still be accessed on the Tracia’s Trust website http://www.gov.mb.ca/fs/traciustrust/pubs.html</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 7 of 11
<p>Child Protection Branch</p> <p>Sexual Exploitation Unit (SEU)</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The Sexual Exploitation Unit (SEU) is housed at the Child Protection Branch and coordinates a provincial, multi-jurisdictional response to child and adult sexual exploitation through Tracia’s Trust, Manitoba’s Strategy to Prevent Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking. The unit provides expert advice on policy and program issues, coordination on the delivery of training, provincial regional team coordination, managing Street Reach, and oversight with respect to specialized programs and services.</p>	
<p>CPB</p> <p>Tracia’s Trust Provincial Task Force</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Previously known as the Multi-Jurisdictional Implementation Team (MIT) the Tracia’s Trust Provincial Task Force has both government and community stakeholder representation. It meets to provide advice, consultation and multi-sector coordination of initiatives contained in the provincial strategy.</p>	
<p>MB Justice/CPB</p> <p><i>The Child Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking Act</i></p> <p>Implemented-Ongoing</p>	<p>This Act was proclaimed in 2012 as Canada’s first law to allow victims of human trafficking and sexual exploitation to obtain protection orders against those who exploit them and to sue their abusers. There have been approximately 30 applications for orders under the Act. There have been two convictions under the Act, where StreetReach provided evidence to the RCMP. Training on how to apply for these orders remains a need.</p>	
<p>MB Justice</p> <p>Special Prosecutors</p> <p>Completed-Ongoing</p>	<p>Two specialized Crown Attorneys were designated in 2015 to coordinate and prosecute cases of sexual exploitation/sex trafficking.</p>	
<p>MB Justice</p> <p>Criminal Property Forfeiture Legislation</p> <p>Completed- Ongoing</p>	<p>The Criminal Property Forfeiture Branch has broadened its mandate to consider seeking forfeiture of property where exploitation occurs. To date, two cases have been resolved involving child exploitation where assets were seized and one case is still within the courts.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 8 of 11
<p>MB Justice</p> <p>Victims Bill of Rights</p> <p>Completed- Ongoing</p>	<p>The Victim’s Bill of Rights was expanded to give victims of trafficking offences the right to case information including negotiations, and the right to present victim-impact statements</p>	
<p>MB Justice</p> <p>Prosecution Policy</p> <p>Completed- Ongoing</p>	<p>The prosecution policy respecting children exploited through prostitution was expanded to include consideration of human trafficking charges to underscore that these offenders should be dealt with severely by the courts. This builds on existing prosecution policies that recognize that children exploited through sexual exploitation are victims.</p>	
<p>MB Health</p> <p>Health care extended to survivors</p> <p>Implemented</p>	<p>Social services and provincial care for emergency and primary health care was extended to people who are trafficked and are in Canada but outside of immigration laws.</p>	
<p>EIA</p> <p>EIA priority assistance</p> <p>Completed- Ongoing</p>	<p>Employment and Income Assistance (EIA) has offered priority assistance to those affected by human trafficking. At least six victims of human trafficking have applied for and are receiving assistance.</p>	
<p>MB Housing</p> <p>Supportive polices for HT victims</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Manitoba Housing will implement supportive polices to house people who have been victimized by human trafficking.</p>	
<p>CPB</p> <p>Manitoba Code of Conduct</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>A travel and tourism code of conduct is in the works to engage the private sector in the fight against human trafficking and sex tourism.</p> <p>A Manitoba Specific Code of Conduct Advisory Committee was formed in October 2014, including: Manitoba Tourism and Trade, Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries, Manitoba Hydro, Manitoba Gaming Authority, the Manitoba Hotel Association, Mark Hecht (Canadian expert of Codes) and a trafficking survivor.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 9 of 11
<p>Klinic Trafficking Hotline Incomplete</p>	<p>Klinic operates a 24/7 crisis hotline to assist victims of human trafficking. Klinic counselors assess risk, provide crisis intervention and refer callers to support systems. Klinic is working closely with the Trafficked Persons Response Team to assist in enhancing safety for callers and in securing other resources and supports as required including emergency shelter, food, financial assistance, trauma informed counseling, police support and other services. To date the hotline has received very few calls (dozens) on the line with a range of issues including information/resource calls, calls from survivors of trafficking and calls from concerned family/friends.</p>	
<p>CPB Human Trafficking Awareness Day Complete- Ongoing</p>	<p>As of March 2014, there is a <i>Manitoba Human Trafficking Awareness Day</i> held annually on the Thursday of the second full week in March, during the Stop Child Sexual Exploitation Awareness Week.</p>	
<p>Project Neecheewam Inc./StreetReach/Youth Crisis Stabilization System (YCSS) <i>Strong Heart</i> – High Risk Victims’ Crisis Stabilization Unit (HRV CSU) Ongoing</p>	<p>As of October 9, 2014, Project Neecheewam Inc., a not-for-profit group care facility, has hosted a six-bed Crisis Stabilization Unit (CSU) for girls who are sexually exploited and in need of stabilization. The unit is a short-term placement, for female youth ages 12 to 17 years with a maximum stay of 10 days. Referrals to the unit are made through Street Reach, ANCR or the Winnipeg Police Service. The average stay in the CSU is 3 days and the maximum stay is 10 days with youth returning safely to placement with continued follow-up and ongoing safety planning.</p>	
<p>Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs End the Silence Strategy/Pathway to Hope Initiative Completed in 2012/13</p>	<p>An “End the Silence” strategy was announced to strengthen community action on incest. The Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs (AMC) delivered the Alaskan Pathway to Hope: Healing Child Sexual Abuse Training in Winnipeg (February 2013) to over 30 participants representing various Manitoba First Nation communities.</p>	
<p>CCCP Kids in the Know Ongoing</p>	<p>Kids in the Know is the Canadian Centre for Child Protection’s (CCCP) interactive personal safety education program designed for use in schools to empower children and reduce their risk of victimization.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 10 of 11
<p>Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs (AMC)</p> <p>Our Circle to Protect Sacred Lives</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>This is a workshop linking several First Nations communities with resources on sexual exploitation and human trafficking.</p> <p>AMC has completed phase 1 and parts of phase 2 of the project. Phase 1 included 32 First Nation communities, hosting training sessions in Thompson, Red Sucker Lake First Nations, St. Theresa’s Point First Nations, Brandon and Dauphin. A phase 3 is in the works.</p>	
<p>Canadian Centre for Child Protection</p> <p>Tea Tree Tells</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>This child abuse prevention kit is designed for children from 4 to 6 years of age, intended to help parents, teachers and educators learn more about protecting children from sexual abuse. CCCP continues to distribute Tea Tree Tells to various schools and CFS workers across Manitoba.</p>	
<p>New Directions</p> <p>TERF Adult Program</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The TERF Adult Program focuses on adult women and transgender individuals who have been exploited through the sex industry. It uses a combination of approaches, including healing and professional development for adults 18 and over. A partnership with Winnipeg Adult Education Center to provide 2 credits has been formed.</p>	
<p>Mount Carmel Clinic</p> <p>Sage House</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Sage House Is a health, outreach and resource centre that provides a wide variety of services to street-involved women. It provides support, resources and advocacy regarding education, addictions treatment, EIA, housing, child and family services, justice and harm reduction.</p>	
<p>Winnipeg Regional Health Authority</p> <p>Street Connections</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Street Connections is an outreach program provided by the Winnipeg Regional Health Authority (WHRA), focussed on “preventing harm and promoting health” with at risk populations – people involved with drugs, the sex trade and street life. Street Connections sends out a monthly newsletter to various frontline organizations sending safe messages to those who utilize their services.</p>	
<p>Klinic Community Health</p> <p>Dream Catchers</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p><i>Dream Catchers</i>, operated by Klinic, provides safe and therapeutic services for women and transgender individuals transitioning away from the sex industry. Dream Catchers continues to meet and work with adults who are at various stages of transition out of the sex industry or who have been victims of sexual exploitation.</p>	

List of Manitoba Counter-Exploitation Initiatives		page 11 of 11
Salvation Army Prostitution Offender Program (POP) Ongoing	Salvation Army Correctional and Justice Services administers the Prostitution Offender Program (also known as John School) for those who have been charged with soliciting (18+). Day long workshops are delivered to participants who are first time offenders caught attempting to illegally purchase sex.	
Salvation Army Trafficked Persons Response Team Ongoing	The Trafficked Persons Response Team chaired by Salvation Army includes police, border services, labour and immigration staff, and service providers. This team responds to the needs of victims of human trafficking, particularly adults.	
Winnipeg Police Service Counter-Exploitation Unit Ongoing	In 2016/17 the Counter-Exploitation Unit was expanded by bringing the Missing Persons Unit under the same command structure to allow units with overlapping mandates to communicate more effectively together. These units are both proactive and reactive, with mandates to investigate missing persons, trafficking, exploitation related offences etc., and they are also proactive gathering intelligence and establishing relationships, informing preventive work and community partnerships.	
RCMP/WPS Project Devote Ongoing	Project Devote was established around 2010 to coordinate RCMP and WPS resources to re-examine over 100 unsolved cold cases files. In 2012, they moved to an investigative phase.	
RCMP EPPS Ongoing	Attached with Project Devote, the Exploited Persons Pro-active Strategy (EPPS), is comprised of two RCMP Officers working to establish relationships with sex trade workers, to gather intelligence and inform proactive strategies.	

Tables:

Table 1: Missing Persons Audit

WPS Missing Persons calls-for-service audit, October to December 2008

Page 8 of 8

**MISSING PERSON UNIT – QUARTERLY AUDIT
OCTOBER / NOVEMBER / DECEMBER – 2008**

1,371 PERSONS REPORTED MISSING

**PERCENTAGES OF
MISSING PERSONS REPORTED PER CATEGORY**

1st	Youths (12-17 years of age)	74.76 %
2nd	Adults (18-54 years of age)	15.83 %
3rd	Children (11 years and under)	6.27 %
4th	Elderly (55 years and over)	3.14 %

** Approx. 3/4's of all Missing Persons reported are Youths (Age range of 12 – 17)*

**PERCENTAGES OF
MISSING PERSONS REPORTED PER LOCATION**

1st	Group Homes	47.4 %
2nd	Family Residences	33.7 %
3rd	Foster Homes	12.5 %
4th	Hospitals / Institutions	6.4 %

** Approx. 1/2 of all Missing Persons are reported missing from Group homes*

Table 2: Categorical Breakdown of Participants

PARTICIPANTS INTERVIEWED	
EXPERIENTIAL/SURVIVORS:	8
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Working with survivors: 6 (2 Government, 2 NGO) • Survivors: 2 	
POLICE:	24
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Winnipeg Police: 15 • WPS seconded to RCMP: 3 • RCMP: 6 	
PROSECUTORS:	2
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Senior MB Prosecutors: 2 	
SOCIAL WORK:	22
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mandated Government agencies: 5 • Non-Government Organizations: 16 	
POLITICAL LEADERS:	6
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Federal: 1 (MP) • Provincial: 3 (MLA) • First Nations: 2 (Grand Chief and political staff) 	
TOTAL INTERVIEWS:	61

Table 3: WPS Survivor Contacts and charges laid

These numbers were provided by the WPS Counter Exploitation Unit:

Counter Exploitation Unit Survivor Contacts	
Interactions with people in the sex industry in the street (since 2013)	765
People identified in the sex industry in Winnipeg (since 2013)	211
Voluntary DNA samples obtained from at risk persons (Project ID) since 2004	163
“John” interventions (Deter/ID Sex-Trade Consumers) since 2015	25

In 2015, the 3 massage parlors that still operate in Downtown Winnipeg, had a total of 41 employees identified as masseuses during a one year period when the Counter Exploitation Unit conducted raids.

Criminal Code Charges Page 1 of 2	Start Date	Charges laid as of 2017 01 30	Results
279.01 Trafficking in person	2005 11 25	11	Pending =8 Stayed = 2 Dismissed = 1
279.011 Trafficking of a Person Under 18 yrs	2010 06 29	4	Conviction = 1 Pending = 2 Dismissed = 1
279.02(1) Material Benefit trafficking of person	2005 11 25	7	Pending = 6 Discharged = 1

Criminal Code Charges Page 2 of 2	Start Date	Charges laid as of 2017 01 30	Results
279.03(1) Withholding or destroying documents- Trafficking	2005 11 25	2	Pending = 1 Stayed = 1
286.1(1)Obtaining Sexual Services	2014 11 25	47	Conviction = 13 Pending = 15 Stayed = 8 Diverted = 9 No proceedings = 2
286.1(2) Obtaining Sexual Services Under 18	2014 11 25	17	Conviction = 2 Pending = 15
Material Benefit from Sexual Services 286.2(1)	2014 11 25	2	Pending = 2
Material Benefit from Sexual Services 286.2(2)under 18 yrs	2014 11 25	6	Convicted = 1 Pending = 1 Stayed = 4
286.3(1) Procuring	2014 11 25	2	Pending = 2
286.3(2) Procuring under 18 yrs	2014 11 25	15	Conviction = 3 Pending = 8 Stayed = 3 Dismissed = 1
286.4 Advertising Sexual Services	2014 11 25	8	Pending = 8

Table 4: Boston Gun Project assumptions and realities

Boston Gun Project assumptions and realities	
Common assumptions:	Actual findings:
Communities need prescriptive solutions to problems	Answers exist in communities; people need empowerment to implement them
Limited time/resources are best used replicating a program or “best practices”	No single program or practice can solve complex social problems
Problems evolve over a long period of time can be solved in three to five years	Complex social problems took decades to develop, take a long time to fix
Punitive, after the fact, strategies are effective prevention approaches	Punishing youth doesn’t fix their problems; they need intervention & support
Violence is an inevitable aspect of human nature	Violence is not inevitable; it results from a combination of factors can be changed
Poverty causes violence	While poverty often correlates with violence it does not in itself cause violence

FROM: Prothrow-Stith, D. & H. Spivak. (2004). *Murder is No Accident*. San Francisco, CA, US: John Wiley and Sons.

Table 5: Overall key empirical Findings

Overall Key Empirical Findings	
(with sections they're drawn from) Page 1 of 5	
Vulnerability and the sex industry:	Recommendations:
Survivors are victims, not perpetrators (8.7) No child chooses willingly to enter the sex industry (5.8) Children are targeted for trafficking and exploitation at younger ages (5.8)	Research the efficacy of public awareness campaigns Focus on education for younger youth in elementary school
Childhood sexual assault and abuse correlates with later sex industry involvement (5.8)	Create early warning systems based on cases of child abuse
Children seek the love they are missing in their families, in the sex industry (5.8)	Include child needs for love and belonging in training for service providers
Getting out takes a critical event (9.5)	Include in practitioner training that crisis events are opportunities for intervention
Everyone has different needs (9.5) Getting out takes many attempts (9.5)	Include in practitioner training that exiting often takes many tries. Non-judgmental support is crucial
Survivors are one trigger from relapse (9.5) Many survivors become helpers (9.5)	Ongoing trauma support is needed for survivor-practitioners
Indigenous needs:	Recommendations:
The majority of sex industry survivors in Manitoba are of Indigenous descent (6.5)	Continue focus on resources and programs for First Nations, Metis, and Inuit people
Poverty and lacking opportunities are more salient among Indigenous peoples (6.5)	Governments should consider supporting minimum incomes, improved standards of living conditions for Indigenous people
There is a trafficking pipeline from rural reserves into urban centers (6.5)	More education, support and safety for youth coming into large urban centers for school or any reason

Key Empirical Findings and Recommendations		Page 2 of 5
Intersectionality and prevention:	Recommendations:	
<p>Indigenous people need more control over their healing resources (6.5)</p> <p>There are not enough resources for non-Indigenous diverse groups (6.5)</p>	<p>More input from community members on funding and resource development and deployment</p>	
<p>Survivors are intersectionally challenged and need multi-layered support (9.5)</p>	<p>Practitioner training must recognize and address intersectional challenges</p>	
<p>Vulnerable youth are often lost between services (5.8)</p> <p>Many exploited youth suffer mental health issues (5.8)</p> <p>Children in care are at higher risk of exploitation (5.8)</p>	<p>Focus on coordination and collaboration of services</p> <p>Research mental health among exploited youth</p> <p>Mandatory training and policies for youth workers regarding identifying and intervening in exploitation as well as mental health issues</p>	
<p>Need more early investment in families, violence prevention & child welfare (5.8)</p> <p>Lacking opportunities due to poverty, leads youth to vulnerability to exploitation (5.8)</p>	<p>Government should focus on investing in early childhood and family resilience and wellbeing</p>	
Collaboration and coordination:	Recommendations:	
<p>There is much room for collaboration between stakeholder agencies (10.5)</p> <p>Many organizations work in isolation, lacking coordination (10.5)</p>	<p>Government make collaboration a funding requirement</p>	
<p>Poor communication is at the root of much inefficiency (10.5)</p>	<p>Improve information sharing about available programming</p>	
<p>Some inefficiency results from opposing philosophies (10.5)</p>	<p>Conflict analysis and mediation for improved inter-agency collaboration</p>	
<p>Need regional coordinators (10.5)</p>	<p>Establish more operational provincial and federal coordination hubs</p>	

Key Empirical Findings and Recommendations		Page 3 of 5
New resources:	Recommendations:	
The cultural hub innovation (6.5)	Consider creating a cultural hub	
Need safe housing: Dream Catcher Village (10.5) Need better resources for adults (10.5)	Consider developing a large community safe house; the “Dream Catcher Village	
Need to keep up with technology (10.5)	Increase focus on technology infrastructure and skills development for police and partner agencies to keep up with organized crime	
Need underground railroads and a better safety net (10.5)	Develop a safety net for at risk youth	
Training and education:	Recommendations:	
Culturally sensitivity training often does not coexist with other effective resources (6.5)	More intense consideration of cultural aspects in all programming	
People are forced into cultural programs based on the color of their skin (6.5) People need choices, so programming is there when they are ready for it (6.5)	Increase sensitivity to women and youths’ choice about cultural programming	
Need more public awareness campaigning (7.6) Need more awareness campaigns targeting purchasers of sex (7.6)	Government explore the efficacy of increased funding for public awareness campaigns, and ensure a funding requirement of sex industry survivor input in messaging	
Education must be delivered so it can be received (7.6) Survivors must be included in designing public awareness campaigns (7.6) Need more training for service providers (7.6) Need more training for specialists (7.6) Need more training for parents and educators (7.6)	Increase training for practitioners, specialists, teachers and parents; anyone who had contact with children. Ensure input from people with lived experience in the development of training	

Key Empirical Findings and Recommendations		Page 4 of 5
Policy:	Recommendations:	
<p>International laws and global programs are surreal in the local context (8.7)</p> <p>Police and other practitioners need to ask more questions (8.7)</p>	<p>Increase focus in training and awareness at all levels on federal resources and laws</p> <p>Training for practitioners on specialized trafficking investigations</p>	
<p>Awareness of international trafficking is lacking (8.7)</p>	<p>Training for practitioners and awareness for the public on the scope of the problem</p>	
<p>Mixed opinions on forcing treatment on people (8.7)</p> <p>People like the new police approach of trust building and support (8.7)</p>	<p>More research into the existing laws and programs around supporting survivors</p>	
<p>Need to deter sex purchasers (8.7)</p>	<p>Increase police awareness and priority on investigating sex trafficking</p>	
<p>We could use existing laws that are easier to prosecute and have stiffer penalties (8.7)</p>	<p>Consider focusing on enforcement of established laws where new ones are difficult or not as useful</p>	
<p>Authorities for police and social workers could be adjusted (8.7)</p>	<p>Government consider police and social worker authorities for investigating sex trafficking and possibly adjust same</p>	
More of what is already effective:	Recommendations:	
<p>More education is required for children at younger levels in schools (7.6)</p>	<p>Early childhood awareness programs appropriate for all age levels</p>	
<p>People don't change the day they turn 18 (10.5)</p>	<p>Policy for all child welfare agencies to consider and utilize existing service continuation for youth aging out of the system</p>	
<p>The resources must be accessible when needed (9.5)</p>	<p>Reduce waiting lists and ensure services are available at the time of day when they are needed; make services client centered and not tailored to the convenience of agencies</p>	

Key Empirical Findings and Recommendations		Page 5 of 5
More of what is already effective:	Recommendations:	
Need both secure and open youth facilities (10.5)	Mediation to improve collaboration	
There is no one size fits all approach (9.5) People make the difference, not programs (9.5)	More survivor input in programming development and steering Consider mentorship in treatment development	

Illustrations:

Illustration 1 Photo 1 from MMIW march

Numerous marches and gatherings have been staged to raise public awareness.



(Photo by R. Christmas on May 25th, 2009)

Illustration 2 Photo 2 from MMIW march



(Photos taken by Robert Christmas on May 25th, 2009)