

THE UNIVERSITY OF MANITOBA

A STUDY OF RELATIVE LEVELS OF MORALE AND
ADJUSTMENT BETWEEN SUPPLEMENTED AND NON-SUPPLEMENTED
WELFARE RECIPIENTS IN THE CITY OF WINNIPEG WELFARE
DEPARTMENT.

BEING A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL
PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SOCIAL WORK.



by

Russell Simmonds
WINNIPEG, MANITOBA
APRIL, 1969

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this thesis was to study some aspects of the relationship between people caught up in a public assistance situation and their relative levels of morale and adjustment.

The area of the study also encompassed an examination of factors in the public assistance situation which may be obstructive in terms of the individual seeking out and holding employment.

The study was based on data obtained from face to face interviews with one hundred and twenty people, all of whom are in receipt of full or partial assistance from the City of Winnipeg Welfare Department.

Findings indicated that the role of work appears not to be a significant determinant in the morale and adjustment of people in a welfare situation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	ii
LIST OF TABLES	iv
CHAPTER	
I. INTRODUCTION AND REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE . .	1
II. METHOD	16
III. ANALYSIS	20
IV. CONCLUSIONS	36
BIBLIOGRAPHY	38
APPENDIX A. Minnesota Survey of Opinion (Short Form)	39
APPENDIX B.	43

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
I. Distribution of Morale Scores: Supplemental and Non-Supplemental	23
IA. Distribution of Adjustment Scores: Supplemental and Non-Supplemental	24
II. Frequency Distribution of Clients' Opinion of Their Own Health: In Percentages.	27
III. Average Morale and Adjustment Scores in Terms of Health	28
IV. Distribution of School Grade Completed: In Percentages	29
V. Educational Factor Expressed in Terms of Morale and Adjustment	29
VI. Comparison of Age Distribution in Percentages: Supplemented and Non-Supplemented Welfare Recipients	30
VII. Age Factor Expressed in Terms of Morale and Adjustment	30
VIII. Ethnic Factor Expressed in Terms of Morale and Adjustment	32
IX. Comparison of Distribution of the Sexes Between the Supplemented and Non-Supplemented Groups in Percentages	33
X. Sex Factor Expressed in Terms of Morale and Adjustment	33
XI. Duration of Welfare Experience: In Percentages .	34
XII. Duration of Welfare Experience Expressed as a Factor in Terms of Morale and Adjustment	34

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION AND REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

"Work mastery in any culture is the backbone of identity formation".¹

This study is directed towards an examination of the significance of work for long-term clients of a public welfare agency. The study is based on the premise that values associated with work are pervasive; that the impact of these values will be felt as keenly by members of the so-called "sub-culture" which makes up a public welfare population as they would be by members of any other stratum of society. Specifically, the rationale for this study is as follows. Certain vital life roles lend strength and support to identity; in this culture, for many, work is one of the more significant of these roles. The suggestion, therefore, is that this shall apply to people in receipt of public assistance as well as to other groups in society.

This study will attempt to determine the effects in terms of morale and adjustment, which the existence or non-existence of this role has upon people caught up in a public welfare situation.

¹Erik H. Erikson, *Identity and the Life Cycle*, (New York: International Universities Press, 1959), p. 163.

The focus of this study is upon one aspect of a serious social problem. There are elements associated with public assistance which tend to induce an anomic condition in the lives of the people being served. Certain characteristics, particularly the fact that limited budgets tend to exclude much social activity, in addition to the social stigma attached to the welfare situation, cause many clients to fail to participate fully in their society. Such obstacles discourage the development of the viable roles which facilitate a dynamic interaction between the individual and the community; personal growth is thus thwarted.

That the problem is a social work responsibility is clear: it is necessary that the type of isolation engendered by the public assistance situation be examined, that cause and effect be explored and that remedies be sought out.

The study was carried out in the City of Winnipeg Welfare Department, covering a period of time which extended from November, 1968 to April, 1969. The population examined is finite; it consists of the resident case load of the department, which numbered 2025 cases as of March 1, 1969. For purposes of this study, the population was divided into two subgroups: those who receive a full assistance budget from the department's social assistance programme, and those who receive a portion of the standard grant as a supplement to their income from full-time employment.

Using the incidental sampling method, which involves using the most convenient and available sample, samples were drawn from these two groups for purposes of testing the following hypothesis: that clients involved in the Winnipeg City Welfare Supplementation Programme will demonstrate a higher level of morale and adjustment than shall clients who are in receipt of a full social assistance budget offered as part of the regular programme of that department.

For purposes of this study, "morale" and "adjustment" refers to a general variable composed of the following specific dimensions: attitudes towards personal inferiority, family, law, conservatism and education. It can be seen that morale and adjustment is a global concept involving both social attitudes (the individual's position on controversial social problems or the degree to which existing social institutions are approved.) and personality adjustment (the individual's psychological reaction to a wide variety of specific situations, self estimates, or the tendency to assume certain roles in the interaction process).²

"Supplementation programme" refers to the procedure initiated in 1966 whereby the City of Winnipeg Welfare Department grants assistance in the form of cash, as a supplement to income derived from full-time employment, to individuals whose financial situation (involving such variables as income, size of family and debts) is considered such as to place them below

² Delbert C. Miller, Handbook of Research Design and Social Measurement, (New York: D. McKay Co. Inc., 1964), p. 151.

the level of the grant which they would normally receive as recipients of the regular social assistance programme which that department offers.

"Higher level" is, for purposes of this study, operationally defined as a higher score on the main research instrument; The Short Form of the Minnesota Survey of Opinions. "Social assistance" is here defined as aid, in either cash or kind, which the City of Winnipeg Welfare Department provides for its clients.

Several assumptions were necessary to this study. Implicit in the hypothesis is the assumption that attitude change is induced by situational factors associated with the programmes described. It was necessary to assume a period of time appropriate to this attitude change taking place; it was decided that a six month exposure to the programme in question would suffice.

It was necessary to assume that frankness and cooperation could be attained by assuring the group that their replies would be held in complete confidence and that their opinions were valued. To underline the confidential aspect of the questionnaire, each client was told that his survey would be discarded if he placed his name upon it. This was done.

The basic premise that work shall prove a vital life role for many on public assistance, and that the lack of this role will be reflected in a lower level of morale and adjustment, led to the consideration of an area of exploration: an examination of factors which may prove to be significant

hindrances to employment for clients in the welfare situation. Experience and a review of the literature led to the selection of certain factors which seem frequently to have proven obstacles to welfare clients accepting employment. Questions designed to solicit information regarding various concrete factors such as health, age and lack of education were incorporated into a questionnaire and administered to clients along with the basic research instrument. A copy of the questionnaire may be found in Appendix B.

A review of current literature and relevant studies demonstrates an increasing awareness, reflected in the broadening scope of this material, concerning the relationship of man to his work. The fact that the concept of a Guaranteed Annual Income has been gaining wide acceptance seems to have lent impetus to this trend. One of the major proponents of this scheme, Robert Theobald, has isolated the crux of this issue:

"It now seems certain that it will be possible to abolish the necessity for toil long before people are ready to relinquish the psychological prop given by the feeling that one's toil provides self worth".³

Nicol states that the supplementation principle is one of several models of guaranteed annual income programmes receiving serious consideration at the present time.⁴

³Robert Theobald, "The Post Industrial World", Canadian Welfare, September - October 1967, p. 10.

⁴Helen Nicol, "Guaranteed Income Maintenance: Another Look at the Debate", Welfare in Review, June - July, 1967, p.p. 1-11.

She suggests that one of the major arguments against this scheme is the danger that supplementary payments to low-wage earners might tend to subsidize marginal employers as well as the employees, thus freezing the low-income structure.⁵

This argument has been advanced by many critics, who look to the Speenhamland experience as a case in point.

The Speenhamland experiment with wage supplementation appears to be the only recorded attempt at implementation of such a scheme. Introduced by the magistrates of Berkshire at Speenhamland in 1795, the experiment was directed towards amelioration of the conditions induced by enclosure, the long war with France, and the social dislocation which accompanied industrialization. Essentially, the scheme was designed as follows: When earnings were insufficient to meet the minimum requirements for subsistence, the difference between wages and needs would be paid out of the poor rate. Payment would be calculated on the price of the gallon loaf of bread and the amount of such bread deemed necessary in order to ensure the survival of the labourer and his family.⁶ Speizman contends that wherever the system prevails, "there is a redundancy of labourers and as a result wages were very low and workers were forced to go to the parish for subsistence. Hence, the workers lost the hope of improving their lot by their own effort".⁷

⁵Helen Nicol, "Guaranteed Income Maintenance: Another Look at the Debate", Welfare in Review, June-July, 1967, pp. 1-11.

⁶Milton D. Speizman, "Speenhamland: An Experiment in Guaranteed Income", Social Service Review, March 1966, p. 45.

⁷Ibid.

Speizman believes the Speenhamland supplementation system failed as an income maintenance scheme.

De Schweinitz agrees: the effect of the programme was to lower the standard of wages and of living for the labourer, to destroy the initiative and hope with which he approached his work, and, if anything, to increase the number of those who were either forced or resigned to acceptance of outdoor relief.⁸

However, there is opposition to this point of view. Elder maintains that much of the adverse criticism regarding the Speenhamland experience reflects not the system itself, but the values of the critics. He contends that an examination of a critique of Speenhamland produced by the Webbs, contains many implicit assumptions: that manual workers won't exert themselves if they feel secure, that keeping an immoral person from starving causes the immorality.⁹

Elder feels that the real significance of Speenhamland was that it provided financial relief according to need, as determined by the cost of living.

⁸Karl de Schweinitz, Englands Road to Social Security (New York: A. S. Barnes & Company), 1961, p.

⁹Walter Elder, Speenhamland Previsited, Social Service Review, September, 1964, p.300.

The Speenhamland experience appears to have relevance in the present situation. Speenhamland was an alternative to a minimum wage. Karl de Schweinitz suggests:

"An employer who paid under the scale could send his hitherto independent employee to an overseer for a relief grant to meet the deficiency in wages".¹⁰

Today, adequately protected by minimum wage laws, this may not be the case.

The premise upon which this study is based assumes that useful work provides a viable role which shall be reflected in a higher level of morale and adjustment. In view of this, it would appear that underemployment, that is, either intermittent work or steady work with low wages, or both, is a more desirable alternative than no work role at all; with the corollary that underemployment will be couched in economic security (supplementation).

The premise parallels views expressed by Myers. He is of the opinion that the welfare situation involves a dearth of viable roles; a situation which tends to demoralize the client.

"The people who receive this kind of assistance know quite well that they are not necessary, and money for nothing means we do not expect anything in return".¹¹

¹⁰Karl de Schweinitz, England's Road to Social Security (New York: G. S. Barnes and Company, 1961, p.

¹¹Gerard Myers, "Relief Go Home", Canadian Welfare, January - February, 1967, p. 24.

His suggestions for a remedial focus regarding this situation involves the precepts of role theory: "every person needs a useful role in the community, or a broadly accepted reason for idleness, in order to achieve or maintain mental and social health. A useful role does not necessarily mean only work, but usefulness is commonly expressed in terms of a money wage, or a wage related benefit of some kind, and for this reason the job concept lends itself readily to role planning."¹²

Perlman's latest work has much in common with Myer's views in this area.¹³ She contends that while no role, regardless of significance, is a substitute for personal identity, the engagement of self in some vital life role may offer an "identity facsimile".¹⁴

She stresses the reciprocal nature of role and identity: "role performance and identity are in a continuous cause-effect interplay, the one authenticating the person's sense of selfhood, the other forcing the person to involve himself in love and work tasks with confidence and ability".¹⁵ Work she views as one of the significant life roles: contending that work accrues to the personality development of the individual in several ways;

¹²Gerard Myers, "Winnipeg Experiments", Canadian Welfare, September - October, 1967, p. 20.

¹³Helen Perlman, Persona, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968), p.p. 36-86.

¹⁴Ibid, p.180.

¹⁵Ibid, p.182.

by providing security of a place or position in the social system, by validating the roles of husband and father; "a universal role prescription in western society is that husband and father work".¹⁶

She contends that work supports the integrative and executive function of personality through providing focus and the regularity and structure induced by time specificity.¹⁷

Erikson views work or industry in terms of a sense of mastery over things. He views task-mastery as an essential element in the normal, healthy development of the individual. He contends that the incorporation by the individual of a sense of industry represents a successful resolution of the fourth stage of development, "Industry Versus Inferiority", which occurs about age six."¹⁸

In his discussion of teen-agers, he underlines the importance which the work-role has for the developing personality; he contends that the essence of the problem of identity diffusion lies in the individuals inability to settle on an occupational identity.¹⁹

¹⁶Ibid, p.63.

¹⁷Ibid, p.73.

¹⁸Erik H. Erikson, Identity and the Life Cycle, (New York: International Universities Press, Inc., 1959) p.p. 82-88.

¹⁹Ibid, p.92.

RELEVANT STUDIES

There appear to be a limited number of studies pertinent to our examination of the relationship between employment and morale and adjustment. Bradburn and Caplovitz have examined the relationship between happiness and employment status.²⁰ Bradburn was able to demonstrate that the concept of happiness was determined by a balance between "two almost completely unrelated dimensions: positive feelings and negative feelings".²¹ Their instrumentation could measure their positive and negative feelings, and hence, happiness.²² The underlying assumption of their study is that a dimension exists which can be called happiness, subjective adjustment, or mental health, and that individuals may be meaningfully described as being high or low on such a dimension.²³

Of 2006 respondents, 33 per cent of the unemployed males (73 men) report that they are "not too happy", as opposed to only 12 per cent of the currently employed. (520 men).

Of the women who identify themselves with the work force, those who are unemployed but looking for work tend to report that they are "not too happy" about as frequently as do the men studied. However, a different situation appears to exist among women who do not consider themselves to be in

²⁰Norman M. Bradburn and David Caplovitz, Reports on Happiness, (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co., 1965) p.p. 13-15.

²¹Ibid, p. VIII.

²²Ibid, p. VIII.

²³Ibid, p.p. 13-15.

the labour market. Women such as full-time housewives demonstrate little difference in reported happiness when compared to women who are currently employed.²⁴ Thus, this study would seem to indicate that the centrality of the role in the individual's role network is a significant variable in any assessment of the relationship between work and well-being.

Cavan has reviewed a series of studies which examine the impact of unemployment on family adjustment. One aspect of her review is focused on "lower-lower class families. This group, which included, respectively, an examination of twelve long-term welfare recipients in Chicago; a study of six mobile families in Ohio; and an examination of migratory workers carried out by Kathaway in 1934 pointed to the following: that the permanently or seasonally unemployed accept their position as normal, adjust person and status roles, and integrate relief agencies or public donors into the family".²⁵

Cavan's contention that there is acceptance of their position relative to unemployment contradicts our basic premise; that welfare recipients shall reflect unemployment by demonstrating a lower level of morale and adjustment.

A review of current literature concerned with factors which hinder employment among people in receipt of financial aid

²⁴Ibid, p.p. 13-15.

²⁵Ruth S. Cavan, "Unemployment, Crisis of the Common Man," Marriage and Family Living, May, 1959, p.p. 144-145.

reveals that though certain discrete elements will loom large in the individual situation, dependency in general appears to be multi-causal.²⁶

G. W. Carter contends that many studies have demonstrated that there is no lack of aspiration among clients towards jobs; rather, that there are obstacles in the social and economic areas which tend to preclude regularized gainful employment. She points out the interrelationship of economic and social factors; the material situation for example, has a direct bearing on job potential. If there is a single family head, there are fewer choices open to that person if crisis hits: how many "options for action" does a working mother, solely responsible for a family, have when faced with a break-down in child care arrangements, or the sudden absence of maintenance support from an alcoholic husband?²⁷

Further, child care arrangements, so necessary to the female head's employment, tend to be tenuous. They often consist of arrangements with relatives or friends who know the same unstable life-experience as the working mother herself. In the same vein, the number and the ages of the children are significant in terms of the mother's employment potential.

²⁶Robert C. Stone and Frederick Stamp, "Characteristics Associated With Receipt or Non-Receipt of Financial Aid from Welfare Agencies", Welfare in Review, July, 1965, p.p. 1-11.

²⁷Genevieve W. Carter, "The Employment Potential of A.F.D.C. Mothers", Welfare in Review, July, 1968, p.p. 1-11.

The younger the children, the greater the difficulty of providing stable child care arrangements.

The multi-causal nature of dependency is underlined by the interrelationship between employment, kinship and the health factor. Poor health is considered to be one of the most significant barriers to employment among welfare recipients. In one study of 600 families on aid and 600 families not on assistance, 28.3% of the long-term assistance group cited poor health as an important obstacles to work, as opposed to 8.4% of the families not in receipt of assistance, but from the same general economic level.²⁸ Because of a lack of funds necessary to enlist private medical services, such as home nursing, many family heads, faced with the illness of a spouse, have little recourse other than caring for the afflicted themselves, a situation which often involves quitting a job and going on assistance.

Carter notes that there is an inverse ratio between length of time on welfare and the family with which the individual acquires a job. She contends that a bimodal distribution exists with long term welfare users at one end and intermittent users at the others. The latter group retains links with the labour force, avenues of entry to jobs which the former group lack.²⁹ This is supported by the work of Stone and Stamp,

²⁸Robert C. Stone and Frederick Stamp, "Characteristics Associated With Receipt or Non-Receipt of Financial Aid From Welfare Agencies", p. 5.

²⁹G. W. Carter, "The Employment Potential of A.F.D.C. Mothers", Welfare in Review, July, 1968, p.p. c - 7.

who find that long-term recipients of aid use a different rank order of resources to enter the job market than do their non-welfare counterparts.³⁰ The former group uses employment services in the following order: employment agency, want ads, and friends; whereas the non-welfare group ranked friends, past and present employees, and union membership as being of the greatest help.

³⁰Robert C. Stone and Frederick Stamp, "Characteristics Associated with Receipt or Non-Receipt of Financial Aid From Welfare Agencies", p.p. 9-10.

CHAPTER II

METHOD

Primarily, the study is concerned with the relative levels of morale and adjustment demonstrated by two subgroups of the City of Winnipeg Welfare Department; those clients involved in the supplementation programme, and those in receipt of a complete welfare budget as part of the regular programme offered by that department.

It was assumed, for purposes of this study, that the two subgroups were uniform in all characteristics save one; the factor of employment. Consequently, for purposes of this study, the sample drawn from the regular welfare programme was considered a control group; the sample drawn from the supplemental programme was considered to be an experimental group. The significant variable was assumed to be the factor of employment.

It was decided considering the limitation of time and other factors, that the most convenient method of collecting data was to rely upon incidental sampling. Clients who happened to be in the City Welfare Department for interviews or material needs were approached and asked to participate in the study: the only criteria for selection being that the individual was the head of a family, and that he had been in receipt of aid for a period of not less than six months. All supplemental clients are family heads; thus this became an important characteristic to consider when matching the groups.

Several factors affected the size of the sample. The limitations of time, the difficulties in contacting supplemental clients (all of whom were working) and the lack of interviewers were all relevant factors. Further, it was necessary to draw samples for our control and experimental groups of a size sufficient to attain what is considered by statisticians to be a minimum level of significance. For the type of study generally carried on in the realm of social work, a five per cent level of significance is considered acceptable.³¹ This means that sample results will be considered acceptable and the hypothesis confirmed if the results could be attributed to chance only five times in one hundred.

The schedule employed in this study was developed at the University of Minnesota by Edward A. Rundquist and Raymond F. Sletto.³² It is known as the Short Form of the Minnesota Scale of General Adjustment and Morale. It is a Likert-type scale containing thirty one of the most discriminating items found in the seven scales which comprise the Long Form of the same instrument. The seven scales include: morale scale, general adjustment scale, law scale, inferiority scale, family scale, conservation scale and education scale.³³

³¹Harris K. Goldstein, Research Standards and Methods for Social Workers, (New Orleans: Hauser Press, 1903), p. 114

³²Edward A. Rundquist and Raymond F. Sletto, Personality in Depression, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1936)

³³Delbert C. Miller, Handbook of Research Design and Social Measurement, (New York: David McKay Co. Inc., 1964), p. 152.

The schedule will be explained in greater detail in the chapter concerned with the analysis of data.

The schedule was administered to one hundred and twenty people. Six other individuals who were approached failed to take the survey because they were illiterate. Four others refused to be a part of the survey for personal reasons.

Two interviewers administered the schedule. In order to ensure a consistent approach, a printed set of instructions were handed to each client and read aloud while the client read his copy. One of the interviewers was a welfare worker in the City Welfare Department, responsible for the supplementation programme. This person interviewed fourteen of the clients involved in the study, all of whom were receiving supplementation from the department. A possible bias in the supplementation sample may have resulted from that worker's position; it is conceivable that certain clients may have felt it necessary to demonstrate positive attitudes to this worker. Though we feel this is unlikely, we must accept the possibility as a limitation on our study.

The remaining one hundred and four clients were interviewed by a student from the School of Social Work at the University of Manitoba. Every interview was handled in exactly the same fashion; the instructions were read aloud, points on procedure (such as the necessity for answering every question) were explained, and the person was left to complete the survey. To stress the aspect of confidentiality, each client was told

that if he were to write his name on the instrument, it would be invalidated; only one individual did this. His schedule was destroyed and replaced with another client's response.

A review of the literature (Chapter I) and the student's experience had indicated that certain factors may be of particular significance in determining employment or unemployment. As a result of this, a questionnaire was formulated to determine significant trends which might provide answers for further exploration. The elements which appeared to be most pertinent in terms of blocks to employment included the following: age, health, education, dependents, lack of day-care facilities, ethnic origin and length of time on welfare. These factors were incorporated into our questionnaire.

In addition to examining these elements in terms of blocks to employment, several were studied in relation to their significance as determining factors regarding morale and adjustment. Factors examined as possibly significant variables included: age, sex, the duration of welfare experience, health, ethnic origin and education. These elements were studied with a view to further research of any particular factor or factors proved to be significant in terms of morale and adjustment.

Because of time limitations we were able to administer the questionnaire to only fifty per cent of our control group (fifty clients). One hundred per cent of the supplemental group (twenty clients) received the questionnaire.

Copies of both the schedule and the questionnaire may be found in the Appendix, listed respectively, Appendix A and Appendix B.

CHAPTER III

ANALYSIS

At the outset of this study it was proposed that the factor of employment would prove a significant variable in a consideration of two groups of welfare clients: a supplemented (fully employed) group, and a group of clients in receipt of the regular welfare budget.

In setting up an ex-post factor experimental design, certain problems inherent in the setting induced a number of limitations in the study.

It was not possible to obtain an experimental group of sufficient size to meet a five per cent level of confidence in confirming or refuting the hypothesis. This group is fully employed; consequently, interviews were difficult to arrange. Finally, twenty units were obtained for the experimental group; too small a sample to keep the results within the limits of permissible error agreed upon. This must be regarded as a limitation in terms of consideration of the study results.

Another limitation involves the proportions of occurrences of various important characteristics.³³ The significant variable, employment, is itself dependent upon a host of factors. Any of these elements, which includes such factors

³³Harris K. Goldstein, Research Standards and Methods for Social Workers, (New Orleans: The Hauser Press, 1963), p. 159.

as age, sex, the duration of welfare experience, health, ethnic origin and education may be significant variables in terms of morale and adjustment. Our inability to match these important characteristics within our control and experimental groups must be regarded as a limitation on our study.³⁴

Another limitation involved the instrument which we administered. The Short Form of the Minnesota Survey of Morale and Adjustment is a Likert scale. The Likert technique allows each item in the instrument to be a scale in itself. It is scored by giving the response at one end of the scale an arbitrary weight of "one", the next phrase "two", and so on up to five. Using the "principle of interval consistency" the assignment of weight is determined by the consistency demonstrated in assigning values from item to item. This allows for an objective check of the consistency of values assigned each item in terms of the design as a whole.³⁵

Final selection of items for the scales involved was arrived at by tabulating the discriminative value of each item. This was done by obtaining the difference between the average scores on each item for the upper and lower quartile of a group consisting of seventy-two men and one hundred and twelve women, (upper and lower quartile referring to their position in terms of "high" and "low" attitudes related to morale and

³⁴Ibid, p. 159.

³⁵Edward A. Rundquist, Personality in the Depression, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Press, 1936) p.p. 4 - 6.

adjustment. Instrument reliability which refers to the consistency with which an instrument measures phenomena from one time to another had been determined for this survey instrument to be in the "high eighties".³⁶ Statiticians consider this to be a high level of reliability. Yet our experience would seem to indicate that there are elements in this schedule which severely limit the universality of its application. Certain statements require a fairly sophisticated level of reading ability. Many of the people to whom the survey was administered, particularly in the control group, are semi-literate. Some commented on having experienced difficulty in understanding the meaning of certain statements. Over 10% of the control group indicated that they had guessed at the meaning of statements five, nine, eleven and fifteen. (See Appendix A) This would suggest a possible bias in our sample from the true level of morale and adjustment; the skew being caused by a lack of comprehension. We accept this as a limitation on our study.

The data from the one hundred and twenty schedules is condensed in this chapter in the form of nominal scale classification tables. Each table shows a comparative analysis of the level of morale and of adjustment of the supplemental and non-supplemental welfare groups.

The first major step in the analysis consisted of grouping the control and experimental groups into a table which was calibrated in terms of scores on the morale dimension, and then registering the respective percentages located in each

interval. This is presented in Table I. Following this, the control and experimental groups were examined in terms of scores on the adjustment dimension and presented in Table IA in the manner described above.

TABLE I

<u>DISTRIBUTION OF MORALE SCORES: SUPPLEMENTAL AND NON-SUPPLEMENTAL</u>		
<u>SCORE</u>	<u>REGULAR WELFARE</u>	<u>SUPPLEMENTAL GROUP</u>
<u>20 - 29</u>	1%	0
<u>30 - 39</u>	3%	5%
<u>40 - 49</u>	12%	5%
<u>50 - 59</u>	25%	30%
<u>60 - 69</u>	47%	40%
<u>70 - 79</u>	10%	10%
<u>80 - 89</u>	2%	10%
<u>TOTAL</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>

TABLE I A

<u>DISTRIBUTION OF ADJUSTMENT SCORES: SUPPLEMENTAL AND NON-SUPPLEMENTAL</u>		
<u>SCORE</u>	<u>REGULAR WELFARE</u>	<u>SUPPLEMENTAL GROUP</u>
<u>20 - 29</u>	6%	5%
<u>30 - 39</u>	23%	25%
<u>40 - 49</u>	34%	35%
<u>50 - 59</u>	34%	30%
<u>60 - 69</u>	3%	5%
<u>70 - 79</u>	∅	
<u>80 - 89</u>	∅	
<u>TOTAL</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>

Tables I and IA, representing the frequency distribution of the samples in terms of the dimensions of morale and adjustment, tend to refute out hypothesis. The results demonstrate no significant difference between the experimental and control groups in either dimension.

The role of work appears not to be a significant factor in determining the morale and adjustment of those who find themselves in a public assistance situation. There appears to be a rejection of prevailing middle-class values associated with the work ethic.

The fact that a role considered by society to be of particular importance is of so little consequence in terms of the morale and adjustment of people in a welfare situation would seem to indicate a healthy form of ego defense. Experience reveals that a large number of those who find themselves in the public assistance milieu lack either the capacity or the opportunity to function in a work role. For these people, to ascribe strongly to the values associated with work would be ego-dystonic; rejection of the "impossible" or "unreachable" role in favour of more attainable role activity would be ego-syntonic.

A secondary area of concern in this study was the examination of factors which might prove to be significant obstacles to employment. The questionnaire (see Appendix B) was designed for this purpose.

The questionnaire is divided into areas related to the factors which experience and a review of current literature have indicated may represent hindrances to employment for those people caught up in a public assistance situation.

The following elements were examined in the questionnaire.

Racial Origin: experience indicates that among welfare recipients in Winnipeg, those clients of Indian descent appear to experience special difficulty in securing employment.

Education: a review of the current literature reveals a correlation between unemployment and low education.

Health: welfare recipients characteristically look to the "marginal economy" when seeking employment (see Chapter I). The type of employment found in this area typically involves

physical effort; good health would appear, generally, to be a fundamental requirement.

Age: the physical demands of much of the employment open to public assistance clients would appear to discriminate against the old in favour of the young.

Dependents: the current literature suggests that the lack of adequate day-care facilities is a major obstacle in preventing female family heads from participation in the area of employment.

Duration of welfare experience: there appears to be an inverse ratio between success at obtaining employment and the length of the period for which the client has been dependent upon public assistance.

Using the questionnaire as a basis, we were able to examine the significance of elements which might serve to inhibit employment.

The most significant factor, in comparing the two groups, centered around the area of health. The supplemental group is, on the whole, in much better physical condition than is the regular welfare group. Table II presents a comparison of the two groups in terms of this element.

TABLE II

FREQUENCY DISTRIBUTION OF CLIENTS' OPINION OF THEIR OWN HEALTH: IN PERCENTAGES

<u>SUPPLEMENTAL GROUP</u>	<u>GOOD HEALTH</u> 90%	<u>BAD HEALTH</u> 10%
<u>REGULAR WELFARE GROUP</u>	<u>GOOD HEALTH</u> 52%	<u>BAD HEALTH</u> 48%

The majority of the supplemented group see themselves as healthy, as opposed to almost half of the regular welfare group who see themselves as ill.

Certain factors were selected for study in terms of their possible significance for morale and adjustment. The selection is arbitrary; it is based solely on past observations of client behaviour. Elements examined included the factors of health, duration of welfare experience, sex, age, education, ethnicity.

An examination of the health factor in terms of morale and adjustment revealed no significant difference existing in this dimension. This factor was studied by comparing the average scores for morale and adjustment between the "good health" group and the "bad health" group respectively.

TABLE III

AVERAGE MORALE AND ADJUSTMENT SCORES IN
TERMS OF HEALTH

HEALTH	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
GOOD	59.20	44.38
BAD	58.94	45.11

Those claiming good health demonstrate a slightly higher average score in terms of morale, but the difference does not appear to be significant.

It is interesting to note that those claiming bad health demonstrate a slightly higher score in terms of adjustment. A possible explanation for this is that in a welfare situation, the negative effect of poor health is countered by the positive influence illness exerts in terms of providing a rationale for being in a welfare situation; it is conceivable that the ability to justify one's welfare existence through illness results in a better adjusted individual.

An examination of the supplemented and regular welfare groups in terms of educational levels revealed some noteworthy results. The distribution for the regular welfare group was more dispersed than for the supplemental group; the regular welfare group claimed a higher incidence in terms of grades completed.

TABLE IV

DISTRIBUTION OF SCHOOL GRADE COMPLETED: IN PERCENTAGES

GRADE	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
SUPPLEMENTED GROUP	-	5%	10%	10%	30%	30%	15%			
REGULAR GROUP	8%	6%	12%	10%	20%	16%	8%	16%	-	4%

Forty-four per cent of the clients in the regular welfare programme claim an educational level of grade eight or above as opposed to the supplementation group; sixty per cent of whom have either grade seven or grade eight.

The study revealed no significant relationship between education and morale and adjustment. A comparison of those claiming a grade eight education or better against those with grade seven or less in terms of the respective levels of morale and adjustment yielded the following.

TABLE V

EDUCATIONAL FACTOR EXPRESSED IN TERMS OF MORALE AND ADJUSTMENT

GRADE	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
Grade 8 and above	59.20	45.09
Grade 7 and below	58.87	44.74

The average level of morale and adjustment is slightly higher for the "grade eight and above" group; however, the results do not appear to be significant.

A comparative study of age yielded interesting results. The regular welfare clients dominated the area between twenty and twenty-nine years; the supplemental group was evenly distributed between twenty and thirty.

TABLE VI

COMPARISON OF AGE DISTRIBUTION IN PERCENTAGES:
SUPPLEMENTED AND NON-SUPPLEMENTED WELFARE RECIPIENTS

AGE	REGULAR	SUPPLEMENTED
10 - 19	2%	0
20 - 29	48%	35%
30 - 39	14%	35%
40 - 49	18%	20%
50 - 59	14%	10%
60 - 69	4%	0
<u>TOTAL</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>

Age variation was not a significant factor in determining morale and adjustment. A comparison of the average levels of morale and adjustment for the age intervals 20 - 29 and 30 - 39 yielded the following.

TABLE VII

AGE FACTOR EXPRESSED IN TERMS OF
MORALE AND ADJUSTMENT

AGE	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
20 - 29	58.90	44.70
30 - 39	59.18	45.10

The younger group demonstrated a higher level of both morale and adjustment; however, it does not appear to be a significant difference.

Considering the large number of regular welfare recipients in the twenty to twenty nine age bracket, we assumed that a significant factor in terms of obstructing employment for these people, would be the large number of dependents they possessed who were under school age. However, we discovered that both groups had the same incidence of children under six: 70%. The significant difference between the two groups appeared to be in the success with which the supplemented group achieved stable babysitting arrangements.

All of the supplemented group, a total of twenty families, had been able to effect adequate child care arrangements. In the regular welfare group, the heads of sixteen families, fifteen of whom were women, indicated a preference for employment as opposed to remaining in the home: the lack of suitable and stable day-care arrangements thwarted them. The lack of babysitting facilities forced 32% of the regular welfare group to remain in a welfare situation.

For one race, ethnicity proved to be a significant obstacle to employment. Though Whites were represented, in terms of ethnic background, in both groups, people of Indian descent appeared only in the regular welfare group. They comprised 26% of this group; a total of thirteen individuals.

The Metis population presented a problem in terms of categorization. It was decided that whatever the respondent claimed as his ethnic origin would be accepted; thus, while some who appeared to be Metis called themselves French or Scottish, others stated that they were Indian. They were categorized accordingly.

A comparison of the average scores in terms of morale and adjustment between White and Indian groups revealed little significant difference in their respective scores in terms of morale: however, adjustment was markedly different.

TABLE VIII

ETHNIC FACTOR EXPRESSED IN TERMS OF MORALE
AND ADJUSTMENT

RACE	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
INDIAN	59.38	46.53
WHITE	59.35	44.63

The comparatively high level of adjustment demonstrated by the Indian group appears to be significant. Elements in Indian culture would seem to facilitate adjustment to the welfare situation. This is an area for further exploration.

The sex factor did not appear to be an important element in consideration of blocks to employment. Both sexes were almost equally represented in each group; regular and supplemented.

TABLE IX

COMPARISON OF DISTRIBUTION OF THE SEXES BETWEEN THE SUPPLEMENTED AND NON-SUPPLEMENTED GROUPS IN PERCENTAGES

SEX	SUPPLEMENTED GROUP	REGULAR GROUP
MALE	40%	45%
FEMALE	60%	55%

However, the element of sex appeared to be a significant variable in terms of relative levels of morale and adjustment within the groups examined.

TABLE X

SEX FACTOR EXPRESSED IN TERMS OF MORALE AND ADJUSTMENT

SEX	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
MALE	59.90	45.45
FEMALE	58.18	44.35

The male group demonstrated a markedly higher level of both morale and adjustment.

This would seem to suggest that there are elements present in the male situation, and absent in the female situation which contribute significantly to a relatively high male level of morale and adjustment.

The length of time the individual had been exposed to the welfare situation yielded interesting results as well.

There appeared to be no significant difference between the supplemented and the regular welfare group in terms of duration of welfare experience. Both groups were about equally divided between those who had been in receipt of aid for one year or less and those who had a longer experience.

TABLE XI

DURATION OF WELFARE EXPERIENCE:
IN PERCENTAGES

DURATION	SUPPLEMENTED GROUP	REGULAR WELFARE GROUP
ONE YEAR OR LESS	45%	56%
MORE THAN ONE YEAR	55%	44%

The duration of the welfare experience appears to be a significant determinant in terms of morale and adjustment.

TABLE XII

DURATION OF WELFARE EXPERIENCE EXPRESSED AS A FACTOR
IN TERMS OF MORALE AND ADJUSTMENT

DURATION	MORALE	ADJUSTMENT
ONE YEAR AND LESS	60.14	44.53
OVER ONE YEAR	58.14	45.28

Note that while morale appears to be significantly higher for the group relatively new to the welfare situation

when compared to those with more than a year's experience; the converse appears to hold true for adjustment. It would seem that the longer one is exposed to welfare, the higher shall be the level of adjustment demonstrated: this suggests avenues for further exploration.

CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSIONS

The study results appear to refute our basic premise. The middle-class ethos appears not to prevail in the welfare milieu: work does not appear to be a significant factor in terms of the morale and adjustment demonstrated by individuals in a welfare situation.

Rather, the study results would seem to indicate that other factors are more pertinent in determining the relative level of these characteristics.

The relationship between the duration of welfare experience and morale appears to be an inverse ratio; the longer on aid, the lower the morale, would seem to be the rule indicated by the data gathered.

Conversely, the longer on aid, the more positive appears to be the level of adjustment. The relationship is possibly significant and worthy of further exploration.

The significance of the sex factor in terms of the relative level of morale and adjustment was also noted. There appears to be elements unique to the male experience in the welfare situation which lend themselves to comparatively higher levels of morale and adjustment relative to the opposite sex. This fact presents avenues for further study.

The adjustment of people of Indian descent appeared more positive than did the adjustment of the White group involved in the samples drawn. This too, suggests an area for further study.

The second portion of the study was directed towards an exploration of factors which might prove obstructive to employment. The study revealed two elements to be of special significance: these factors are a lack of adequate day care facilities and health.

The results of this study appears to corroborate the findings of others who have examined work roles among the lower-lower class. Cavan's review of studies in this area indicates that the permanently or seasonally unemployed substitute other life roles for work; pre-empting the job in favour of other activity.³⁷

Exploration of the significance of other roles for people in a public assistance situation warrants consideration.

³⁷ Ruth Cavan, "Unemployment: Crisis of the Common Man", Marriage and Family Living", May 1959, p. 144

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS

- Bradburn, Norman M. and Caplovitz D. Reports on Happiness. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1965.
- De Schweinitz, Karl. England's Road to Social Security. New York: G. S. Barnes and Company, 1961.
- Erikson, Erik H. Identity and the Life Cycle. New York: International Universities Press, 1961.
- Goldstein, Harris K. Research Standards and Methods for Social Workers. New Orleans: Hauser Press, 1963.
- Miller, Delbert C. Handbook of Research Design and Social Measurement. New York: D. McKay Company Inc., 1964.
- Perlman, Helen. Persona. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968.
- Rundquist, Edward A. Personality in the Depression. Minneapolis, Minnesota Press, 1936.

PERIODICALS

- Carter, Genevieve W. "The Employment Potential of A.F.D.C. Mothers", Welfare in Review, July 1968, pp. 1-11.
- Cavan, Ruth S. "Unemployment, Crisis of the Common Man", Marriage and Family Living, May 1959, pp. 141-147.
- Elder, Walter. "Speenhamland Revisited", Social Service Review, September 1964, pp. 294-302.
- Myers, Gerard. "Relief Go Home", Canadian Welfare, January - February, 1967. pp. 20-27.
- Myers, Gerard. "Winnipeg Experiments", Canadian Welfare, September - October 1967. pp. 19-23.
- Nicol, Helen O. "Guaranteed Income Maintenance: Another Look at the Debate", Welfare in Review, June - July 1967, pp 1-11.
- Speizman, Milton D. "Speenhamland: An Experiment in Guaranteed Income", Social Service Review, March 1966, pp. 44-55.
- Stone, Robert C. and Stamp, Frederick, "Characteristics Associated With Receipt or Non-Receipt of Financial Aid From Welfare Agencies", Welfare in Review, July 1965, pp. 1-11.
- Theobald, Robert. "The Post Industrial World", Canadian Welfare, September - October 1967, pp. 4-11.

APPENDIX B

APPENDIX B

RACIAL ORIGIN: Indian Metis Other _____

The reason and the date of the original application for public welfare from the City of Winnipeg or any other source.

EDUCATION

"What school grade were you in When you left school?" _____

" Grade completed _____ None

"Trade or training you possess?" _____

"Other skill (truck driver, fish filleting, etc.)?" _____

If schooling is limited, why? _____

Is the client aware of upgrading and vocational training opportunities? Yes No

What is the attitude expressed towards these programmes? (state if now attending)

What is his category of employment in terms of his present level of training?

Unskilled (general labor) Semi-skilled Skilled

Present occupation _____

HEALTH

Age _____

Does the client believe he is in good health? Yes No

If NO is his condition; in his opinion:

- Temporary Illness Permanent Illness
- Temporary Injury Permanent Injury
- Evident Mental or Psychological Problem

Does the client feel he is physically capable of employment? Yes No

If NO, Why? _____

APPENDIX A

APPENDIX A

MINNESOTA SURVEY OF OPINION (SHORT FORM)

E.A. Rundquist and R.F. Sletto, Institute of Child Welfare,
University of Minnesota

The following pages contain a number of statements about which there is no general agreement. People differ widely in the way they feel about each item. There are no right answers. The purpose of the survey is to see how different groups feel about each item. We should like your honest opinion on each of these statements.

READ EACH ITEM CAREFULLY AND UNDERLINE QUICKLY THE PHRASE THAT BEST EXPRESSES YOUR FEELING ABOUT THE STATEMENT. Whenever possible, let your own personal experience determine your answer. Do not spend much time on any item. If in doubt, underline the phrase that seem most nearly to express your present feeling about the statement. WORK RAPIDLY. Be sure to answer every item.

1. TIMES ARE GETTING BETTER.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵
2. ANY MAN WITH ABILITY AND WILLINGNESS
TO WORK HARD HAS A GOOD CHANCE OF
BEING SUCCESSFUL.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly Disagree⁵
3. IT IS DIFFICULT TO SAY THE RIGHT
THING AT THE RIGHT TIME.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹
4. MOST PEOPLE CAN BE TRUSTED.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵
5. HIGH SCHOOLS ARE TOO IMPRACTICAL.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹
6. A PERSON CAN PLAN HIS FUTURE SO THAT
EVERYTHING WILL COME OUT ALL RIGHT IN
THE LONG RUN.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

7. NO ONE CARES MUCH WHAT HAPPENS TO YOU.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

8. SUCCESS IS MORE DEPENDENT ON LUCK THAN
ON REAL ABILITY.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

9. IF OUR ECONOMIC SYSTEM WERE JUST,
THERE WOULD BE MUCH LESS CRIME.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

10. A MAN DOES NOT HAVE TO PRETEND HE IS
SMARTER THAN HE REALLY IS TO "GET BY."
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

11. LAWS ARE SO OFTEN MADE FOR THE BENEFIT
OF SMALL SELFISH GROUPS THAT A MAN
CANNOT RESPECT THE LAW.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

12. ONE SELDOM WORRIES SO MUCH AS TO BECOME
VERY MISERABLE.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

13. THE FUTURE LOOKS VERY BLACK.
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

14. REAL FRIENDS ARE AS EASY TO FIND AS
EVER.
Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

15. POVERTY IS CHIEFLY A RESULT OF INJUSTICE
IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF WEALTH,
Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

16. IT IS DIFFICULT TO THINK CLEARLY THESE DAYS.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

17. THERE IS LITTLE CHANCE FOR ADVANCE-
MENT IN INDUSTRY AND BUSINESS UNLESS
A MAN HAS UNFAIR PULL.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

18. IT DOES NOT TAKE LONG TO GET OVER
FEELING GLOOMY.

Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

19. THE YOUNG MAN OF TODAY CAN EXPECT
MUCH OF THE FUTURE.

Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

20. IT IS GREAT TO BE LIVING IN THESE
EXCITING TIMES.

Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly agree⁵

21. LIFE IS JUST ONE WORRY AFTER AN-
OTHER.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

22. THE DAY IS NOT LONG ENOUGH TO DO ONE'S
WORK WELL AND HAVE ANY TIME FOR FUN.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

23. A MAN CAN LEARN MORE BY WORKING FOUR
YEARS THAN BY GOING TO HIGH SCHOOL.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

24. THIS GENERATION WILL PROBABLY NEVER
SEE SUCH HARD TIMES AGAIN.

Strongly agree¹ Agree² Undecided³
Disagree⁴ Strongly disagree⁵

25. ONE CANNOT FIND AS MUCH UNDERSTANDING
AT HOME AS ELSEWHERE.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

26. THESE DAYS ONE IS INCLINED TO GIVE UP
HOPE OF AMOUNTING TO SOMETHING.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

27. EDUCATION IS OF NO HELP IN GETTING A
JOB TODAY.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

28. THERE IS REALLY NO POINT IN LIVING.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

29. MOST PEOPLE JUST PRETEND THAT THEY
LIKE YOU.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

30. THE FUTURE IS TOO UNCERTAIN FOR A
PERSON TO PLAN ON MARRYING.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

31. LIFE IS JUST A SERIES OF DISAPPOINT-
MENTS.

Strongly agree⁵ Agree⁴ Undecided³
Disagree² Strongly disagree¹

GA Na Mu

Ma + Mu = Total Morale Score